

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 6

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 November 2011 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Member absent:

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
The Financial Secretary and
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Child Abduction and Custody (Parties to Convention) (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 4.11.2011)	151/2011
2. Clubs (Safety of Premises) (Exclusion) (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 4.11.2011)	152/2011

Other Papers

- No. 24 - Report by the Director of Immigration Incorporated on the administration of the Immigration Service Welfare Fund together with the Report of the Director of Audit and audited financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 3.11.2011)
- No. 25 - Secretary for Home Affairs Incorporated
Audited financial statements together with the Report of the Director of Audit for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 3.11.2011)
- No. 26 - Sir Edward Youde Memorial Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Report of the Director of Audit and the Report of the Board of Trustees for the period 1 April 2010 to 31 March 2011 (published on 3.11.2011)
- No. 27 - Consumer Council Annual Report 2010-2011 (published on 7.11.2011)

Report No. 2/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 3.11.2011)

Questions

1. Hon CHAN Kin-por asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

3. Hon Fred LI asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

4. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

6. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Fisheries Protection (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Fisheries Protection (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Food and Health moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that the Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 111 of 2011 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 6 July 2011, be amended as set out in the Schedule.

Schedule

Amendment to Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Regulation

1. Section 5 amended (register of health workers)

Section 5(4)(d), after “section 5(4)”—

Add

“(a) or (c)”.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Regulation and Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2011, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

A Member and Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che spoke on the motion.

While Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:58 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members’ Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the Securities and Futures (Professional Investor) (Amendment) Rules 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 135 of 2011, and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 October 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 30 November 2011.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Assisting the public in coping with economic fluctuations

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given the uncertain prospects of the global economy, this Council urges the Government to closely monitor the economic situation and adopt suitable and effective measures to assist people from different strata and enterprises in coping with difficulties such as inflation and employment, etc., so that they can tide over the difficult times.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Tanya CHAN, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Three Members and Hon Andrew LEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 4:06 pm, while Hon Andrew LEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Sixteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Philip WONG spoke on the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke again.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion:

To delete "given the uncertain prospects of the global economy" after "That," and substitute with "as the Hong Kong economy is closely linked to the global economy, external economic fluctuations have profound and far-reaching impact on Hong Kong, and the prospects of the global economy are uncertain at present"; and to add "; focusing on Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ('CSSA') recipients, the Government should adopt the following measure: to review the existing CSSA system, including shortening the interval of each adjustment cycle of CSSA, with special focus on rent allowance, so as to reflect more accurately the impact of price changes on CSSA recipients, and expeditiously reviewing the adequacy of the CSSA standard payment rates as well as the items to be included in the Social Security Assistance Index of Prices" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Philip WONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and two against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Assisting the public in coping with economic fluctuations" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; to ensure economic fluctuations do not impact on the employment and livelihood of local workers, the relevant measures should also include: (a) to formulate a mechanism for perfecting the management of foreign workers' employment in Hong Kong, so as to protect local workers' right of employment; (b) to advance the review of the statutory minimum wage level, so as to assist grass-root workers in coping with inflation; (c) to appoint more civil servants on permanent establishment, and improve the remunerations and grade structures of civil servants and other public officers, so as to provide a greater number of relatively stable employment opportunities; (d) to expand the various employment services, training and support schemes, and offer subsidies to students enrolled on retraining courses, so as to enhance the competitiveness of manpower resources; (e) to abolish the mechanism whereby employers' contributions under the Mandatory Provident Fund System are used to offset severance payments and long service payments, so as to protect the amounts of Mandatory Provident Funds received by employees for their retirement protection from being offset and eroded due to business closures; (f) to relieve people's housing burden by, for example, constructing more public rental housing and offering a tax allowance to households with no property for renting private residential units; (g) to increase the amount of Elderly Healthcare Vouchers to \$1,000 per year and expand their scope of application, so as to assist the elderly in coping with increasing medical expenditure; (h) to introduce a 'monthly ticket scheme for all types of transport', so as to alleviate people's burden of travelling expenses on the public; (i) to construct more public markets under the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department in new towns, thereby providing residents with more choices of inexpensive and quality daily necessities; (j) to reduce the various taxes such as the salaries tax, etc. and the various government fees and charges related to people's livelihood, provide subsidies to residential electricity accounts, and waive public rental housing rents and rates, etc., so as to alleviate inflation pressure on the public; and (k) to promote the development of the six industries with competitive edge, restructure the manufacturing industries of Hong Kong, formulate the relevant development blueprint and timetable, and proactively initiate industrial diversification, so as to mitigate the impact of the fluctuations in the financial sector on Hong Kong's economy and employment” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed and put.

Dr Hon Philip WONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and two against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Tanya CHAN to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; the specific measures should also include: (a) when necessary, to further expand the existing Special Loan Guarantee Scheme for small and medium enterprises ('SMEs'), including raising the maximum amount of loan guarantee and the guarantee ratio, so that SMEs can be granted sufficient working capital in a timely manner; (b) to closely monitor the vetting and approval of loans by banks, so as to ensure that banks have sufficient capital and liquidity for maintaining the stability of the banking system and the financial market; (c) to review the operation and funding criteria of the existing SME Export Marketing Fund, so that SMEs can develop emerging markets through various channels and lessen their reliance on traditional markets; (d) to review the existing land supply policy for alleviating the fluctuations of the property market, so as to curb the upward trend in rentals and reduce the operating costs of businesses; (e) to review the existing hawker policy, and on the premise of not affecting the business environment for small businesses in the districts, to allow business starters to carry out trading in more diverse forms in the communities, so as to reduce business operators' rentals and operating costs; and (f) to promote the development of social enterprises more proactively, so as to create more employment opportunities for local workers, and avoid the deterioration of the unemployment situation due to changes in economic conditions ” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed and put.

Dr Hon Philip WONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and two against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Dr Hon Philip WONG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon Tanya CHAN put and agreed to.

Comprehensively reviewing the Disability Allowance scheme

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That Hong Kong's existing Disability Allowance ('DA') scheme was formulated in 1973 and, after some 30 years of operation, the protection provided by the scheme has become outdated; some people with disabilities ('PWDs') (such as people with loss of one limb) are even not entitled to the allowance and not issued with the Registration Card for People with Disabilities because the scheme was inflexible, thus rendering them unable to enjoy MTR half-fare concessions for PWDs; in this connection, this Council urges the Administration to comprehensively review the DA scheme, so as to meet the needs of society today; the relevant review should include:

- (a) to review the criteria for the granting of DA, including granting an allowance proportionate to the degree of disability of the applicant;
- (b) to consider including professional social workers' 'whole-person assessment' as one of the criteria in the vetting and approval process, rather than relying solely on medical practitioners for determining applicant's eligibility or otherwise based on the degree of disability of the applicant;
- (c) to review the Medical Assessment Form and the checklist used for assessing a DA applicant's degree of disability, and clearly specify the definition of and criteria on 'visceral diseases';

- (d) to comprehensively review the definition of ‘severely disabled’ under the existing DA scheme, and relax the criteria in the First Schedule to the Employees’ Compensation Ordinance (Cap. 282 of the Laws of Hong Kong), i.e. a degree of disability broadly equivalent to a 100% loss of earning capacity, so as to strengthen the protection of PWDs; and
- (e) to comprehensively review the applicability of the various public transport concessions available at present to PWDs and the payment arrangements.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Ronny TONG, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

A Member and Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:37 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

At 8:06 pm, while the Secretary for Labour and Welfare was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; to delete “; in this connection” after “concessions for PWDs”; to delete “and” after “protection of PWDs;”; and to add “; and (f) to apply the concept of Portable Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme to DA and remove the permissible limit of absence from Hong Kong, so that eligible PWDs residing in Guangdong and Fujian can also receive DA” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon TAM Yiu-chung to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (g) to allow elderly recipients of DA to receive the Old Age Allowance at the same time” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s amendment had been passed, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou had withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s and Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Ronny TONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon TAM Yiu-chung, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (h) to include proof of disabilities as an eligibility criterion for approving compassionate rehousing to public rental housing (‘PRH’), so that PWDs can be rehoused to PRH units as early as possible and resolve their housing difficulties” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon TAM Yiu-chung proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi, Hon TAM Yiu-chung and Hon Ronny TONG put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 November 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:22 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

12 January 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 09/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:23:51 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 黃成智議員對黃宜弘議員的「協助市民應對經濟波動」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG SING-CHI TO DR HON PHILIP WONG'S MOTION ON "ASSISTING THE PUBLIC IN COPING WITH ECONOMIC FLUCTUATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	16	24	
反對 No	3	2	
棄權 Abstain	8	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 09/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:26:53 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 潘佩璆議員對黃宜弘議員就「協助市民應對經濟波動」所提，經黃成智議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON PAN PEY-CHYOU TO DR HON PHILIP WONG'S MOTION ON "ASSISTING THE
 PUBLIC IN COPING WITH ECONOMIC FLUCTUATIONS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG SING-CHI

動議人 MOVED BY: 潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	11	24	
反對 No	8	2	
棄權 Abstain	7	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 09/11/2011
時間 TIME: 06:29:17 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 陳淑莊議員對黃宜弘議員就「協助市民應對經濟波動」所提，經黃成智議員、潘佩璆議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON TANYA CHAN TO DR HON PHILIP WONG'S MOTION ON "ASSISTING THE PUBLIC IN COPING WITH ECONOMIC FLUCTUATIONS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG SING-CHI / ~~DR HON PAN PEY-CHYU~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	19	24	
反對 No	3	2	
棄權 Abstain	5	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES