

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 9

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 30 November 2011 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Prisons (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 25.11.2011)	166/2011

### **Other Papers**

- No. 35 - Hong Kong Tourism Board Annual Report 2010/11  
(published on 24.11.2011)
- No. 36 - Annual Report 2010 to the Chief Executive by The Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance (together with a statement under section 49(4) of the Interception of Communications and Surveillance Ordinance)  
(published on 28.11.2011)

Report No. 4/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments  
(published on 24.11.2011)

### **Questions**

1. Dr Hon David LI asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon Vincent FANG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Hon Paul TSE declared that he was the person in charge of a travel agency. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

6. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### First Reading

#### Mediation Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### Mediation Bill

The Secretary for Justice moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

While the Secretary for Justice was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:14 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Members' Motions**

### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

**Resolved** that the Securities and Futures (Professional Investor) (Amendment) Rules 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 135 of 2011 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 October 2011, be amended as set out in the Schedule.

## Schedule

### Amendment to Securities and Futures (Professional Investor) (Amendment) Rules 2011

#### 1. Section 3 amended (section 3 amended (persons prescribed as professional investors))

After section 3(3) —

#### **Add**

“(3A) Section 3(b) —

#### **Repeal**

“within 12 months before the relevant date;”

#### **Substitute**

“within 12 months before the relevant date,  
and meeting the following requirements —

- (iii) whose expertise and investment products trading experience and knowledge have been assessed as, in light of the nature of the transactions or services envisaged, providing assurance that the individual is capable of making an investment decision on his own with understanding of the risks involved;
- (iv) having traded not less than 40 transactions per annum; and
- (v) having traded actively in the relevant market for at least 2 years; ”. ”.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Securities and Futures (Professional Investor) (Amendment) Rules 2011, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Seven Members and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the motion.

At 3:02 pm, while Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon KAM Nai-wai replied.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion put.

Hon KAM Nai-wai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

While the division bell was ringing, Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG declared that she was a member of the Process Review Panel of the Securities and Futures Commission.

Given that the timer failed to function, the President suspended the meeting at 3:29 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 3:34 pm.

The President ordered that the division be held immediately.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, two were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan stated that he had voted against the motion but the display panel indicated that he had abstained from voting. The President ordered that the voting record be amended accordingly.

Comprehensively reviewing and perfecting the Work Incentive Transport Subsidy Scheme

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That travelling expenses are an important item of daily expenses borne by the vast number of employees and job-seekers in Hong Kong; the Government announced last year the idea of the Work Incentive Transport Subsidy Scheme ('WITSS') and started to receive applications in October this year, but there are still voices in society calling for further review and improvement of WITSS, so that more low-income workers and grass-root people may benefit from WITSS; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) immediately review afresh all the details of WITSS, including simplifying and improving its application procedure, as well as re-assessing and announcing the latest number of people who will benefit from WITSS, instead of waiting for a year to conduct a mid-term review;
- (b) relax the eligibility criteria of WITSS, adopt a dual-track approach for each unit of application and relax the income and asset limits, so as to achieve the purposes of subsidizing low-income grass-root employees and promoting employment;
- (c) review the amount of monthly allowance per person under WITSS, and consider raising the amount having regard to actual living circumstances; and
- (d) study including the Job Search Allowance provided under the former Transport Support Scheme in WITSS, and refrain from tightening the eligibility requirements for applicants for the Job Search Allowance and from lowering the ceiling of reimbursement.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LI Fung-ying, Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon IP Kwok-him and Hon Miriam LAU, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Sixteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon LI Fung-ying moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion:

To delete "travelling expenses are an important item of daily expenses borne by the vast number of employees and job-seekers in Hong Kong" after "That" and substitute with "the fares of public transport in Hong Kong are high, constituting a heavy burden on the grassroots"; to delete "the idea of" after "last year"; to add "the application requirements are harsh, and" after "this year, but"; and to delete "adopt a dual-track approach for each unit of application and relax the income and asset limits" after "criteria of WITSS," and substitute with "abolish the requirement regarding applicants' household asset test, and replace it with applicants' remunerations as the vetting and approval criteria".

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 15 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 20 abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; to delete “; the Government” after “Hong Kong” and substitute with “, the Government thus”; to delete “and” after “unit of application” and substitute with “;”; to add “including specifying the exclusion of the cash value of insurance policies, severance payments and long service payments, etc., from asset calculation, and consider calculating applicants’ total assets and incomes on the basis of their household expenditure patterns,” after “asset limits,”; to delete “and” after “circumstances,”; and to add “; (e) to introduce employment and livelihood protection and activate the assistance mechanism of the Community Care Fund, so as to assist grass-root workers who fall outside government labour and welfare protection in obtaining wage subsidies and basic livelihood protection, including offering subsidy support to people with monthly personal incomes below \$6,500 who are ineligible for WITSS on a household basis; and (f) to formulate a comprehensive review mechanism for the regular and comprehensive review of WITSS-related matters and periodic adjustments” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming’s amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon IP Wai-ming’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon IP Kwok-him to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon IP Kwok-him moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming:

To add “; and (g) in the long run, study replacing WITSS by a ‘maintenance grant scheme for low-income families’, so as to enable more families whose incomes are on the low side but who are ineligible for Comprehensive Social Security Assistance to receive maintenance grant” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Kwok-him’s amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon IP Wai-ming’s and Hon IP Kwok-him’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Miriam LAU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon IP Kwok-him:

To add “; and (h) in respect of the eligibility criteria of WITSS, rationalize the unreasonable arrangement of small discrepancies in household income limits among families with two or more members” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU’s amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon IP Kwok-him proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Sing-chi replied.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon IP Kwok-him and Hon Miriam LAU put and agreed to.

### Establishing an independent statutory Office of the Health Service Ombudsman

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as medical incidents in public and private health services have occurred frequently in recent years, but there is a current lack of a uniform, credible and highly transparent mechanism for handling health service complaints from members of the public, causing the public to feel helpless, this Council urges the Administration to, without violating the principle of professional autonomy, establish an independent statutory Office of the Health Service Ombudsman to receive complaints concerning public and private health services from the public, investigate and conciliate complaints as well as handle compensation matters under a uniform mechanism, also inform complainants of the investigation outcome within a reasonable time frame and regularly announce to the community the situation regarding handling of medical complaints, so as to ensure that complaints targeting at health service are properly handled and transparency in the handling of complaints is enhanced, and thereby improving the quality of health service.

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Paul CHAN and Hon CHAN Hak-kan, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Hak-kan was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:35 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight Members and Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:55 pm, while Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE declared that he was a member of the Hospital Authority Board, and he was a nurse himself. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "with the increasing needs and pressure of public and private health services in Hong Kong,"; to add "; in this connection" after "to feel helpless"; to delete "receive complaints concerning public and private health services from the public, investigate and conciliate complaints as well as handle compensation matters under a uniform mechanism, also inform complainants of the investigation outcome within a reasonable time frame and regularly announce to the community the situation regarding handling of medical complaints, so as to" after "Service Ombudsman to"; to delete "and" after "complaints is enhanced,"; and to add "; the functions of the Office should include: (a) to centralize the receipt of public complaints against all public and private health service providers registered in Hong Kong; (b) to conduct investigations into the complaints received, with statutory powers to request the relevant parties to provide related information, such as medical files and internal investigation reports, for facilitating investigations, and inform the complainants and the parties under complaint of the investigation results within a reasonable time frame; (c) to assist complainants in obtaining independent professional advice on their cases; (d) to assist the two sides in communicating with each other on an equal footing, and to

conduct conciliation and handle compensation matters with their mutual consent; (e) to provide complainants in need with information about further actions on ascertaining liability through judicial means as well as professional liability proceedings and investigation, and offer reasonable assistance to complainants for instituting such procedures; (f) to regularly announce to the public the statistics on complaint cases and the handling of medical complaints, so as to enable the public to know the trend of complaints about health services; and (g) to promote civic education to enable the public to understand the causes of medical incidents and complaints, so as to deepen public awareness of health service risks, and prompt health service providers to improve the quality of health services” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Paul CHAN to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou:

To add “; at the same time, the Administration should review the composition of the Medical Council of Hong Kong, consider introducing the participation of more independent lay members of credibility to enhance the strength of public monitoring and safeguarding public interest, and consider raising the proportion of lay member participation in handling complaint cases regarding misconduct in a professional respect, so as to further ensure that the investigation into and the handling methods and procedures for such cases are fair, just and impartial” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN’s amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s and Hon Paul CHAN’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Hak-kan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following further amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Paul CHAN:

To add “; the Administration should also study establishing an emergency financial assistance mechanism for medical incidents modelled on the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Scheme, so as to offer timely assistance to families with financial difficulties arising from medical incidents” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment to Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Paul CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Andrew CHENG replied.

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Paul CHAN and Hon CHAN Hak-kan put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 7 December 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:38 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
Legislative Council

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

13 February 2012

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 30/11/2011  
 時間 TIME: 03:40:11 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 修訂《2011年證券及期貨（專業投資者）（修訂）規則》的擬議決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION TO AMEND THE SECURITIES AND FUTURES (PROFESSIONAL INVESTOR)  
 (AMENDMENT) RULES 2011

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	2	12	
反對 No	18	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 30/11/2011  
 時間 TIME: 06:55:31 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 李鳳英議員對黃成智議員的「全面檢討及完善'鼓勵就業交通津貼計劃」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LI FUNG-YING TO HON WONG SING-CHI'S MOTION ON "COMPREHENSIVELY  
 REVIEWING AND PERFECTING THE WORK INCENTIVE TRANSPORT SUBSIDY SCHEME"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	15	27	
投票 Vote	15	26	
贊成 Yes	8	6	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	6	20	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES