

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 12

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 21 December 2011 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Members absent:

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP

The Secretary for Justice

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP

Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP

Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP

Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP

Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP

Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u> | <u>L.N. No.</u> |
|---|-----------------|
| Country Parks and Special Areas (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 16.12.2011) | 176/2011 |

Other Papers

- No. 47 - Queen Elizabeth Foundation for the Mentally Handicapped Report and Accounts 2010-2011
(published on 16.12.2011)
- No. 48 - Director of Social Welfare Incorporated
Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2011 together with the Report of the Director of Audit
(published on 19.12.2011)
- No. 49 - Social Work Training Fund
Fiftieth Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending on 31 March 2011
(published on 19.12.2011)
- No. 50 - The Sir Murray MacLehose Trust Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Report of the Director of Audit and Trustee's Report for the period of 1 April 2010 to 31 March 2011
(published on 19.12.2011)
- No. 51 - Police Welfare Fund Annual Report 2010/2011
(published on 20.12.2011)
- No. 52 - Annual Report on the Police Children's Education Trust and the Police Education and Welfare Trust 2010/2011
(published on 20.12.2011)
- No. 53 - 2010-11 Annual Report of the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, Hong Kong
(published on 21.12.2011)

- No. 54 - Grantham Scholarships Fund
Signed and audited financial statements of the Fund, together with the Auditor's Report and the Report of the Grantham Scholarships Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 August 2011
(published on 21.12.2011)
- No. 55 - Brewin Trust Fund
Audited financial statements of the Fund, together with the Auditor's Report and the Report of the Brewin Trust Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 30 June 2011
(published on 21.12.2011)
- No. 56 - Chinese Temples Fund
Signed and audited financial statements of the Fund, together with the Auditor's Report and the Report of the Chinese Temples Committee on the administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2011
(published on 21.12.2011)
- No. 57 - General Chinese Charities Fund
Signed and audited financial statements of the Fund, together with the Auditor's Report and the Report of the Chinese Temples Committee on the administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2011
(published on 21.12.2011)

Report No. 7/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments
(published on 15.12.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Enduring Powers of Attorney (Amendment) Bill 2011
(published on 16.12.2011)

Questions under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure

The President stated that he had given permission for Hon Starry LEE, Hon Fred LI, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Miriam LAU to respectively ask an urgent question under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President further stated that as the four urgent questions were all related to the increase of tariffs by the two power companies, to facilitate Members' follow up, he would first call upon the four Members to ask their urgent questions and the public officers to reply to the four questions respectively. He would then invite Hon Starry LEE, Hon Fred LI, Hon Ronny TONG, Hon Miriam LAU and other Members to ask supplementary questions to the four questions, and would appropriately adjust the time for Members to ask supplementary questions.

1. Hon Starry LEE asked urgent Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Hon Fred LI asked urgent Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

3. Hon Ronny TONG asked urgent Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Hon Miriam LAU asked urgent Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Nineteen Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

Questions

1. Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

While the Secretary for Labour and Welfare was replying to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's question, the President left the chair at 12:42 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

2. Hon CHIM Pui-chung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

3. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

4. Hon Cyd HO asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

5. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 5.

At 2:00 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was asking his question, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

6. Hon Ronny TONG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Banking (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Banking (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Enduring Powers of Attorney (Amendment) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 25 May 2011 resumed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Enduring Powers of Attorney (Amendment) Bill 2011, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Enduring Powers of Attorney (Amendment) Bill 2011.

Question that clauses 1, 4 to 8 and 11 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 3, 9, 10, 12 and 13 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Justice moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Justice spoke again.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 3, 9, 10, 12 and 13 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 3A read the first time.

The Secretary for Justice moved the Second Reading of new clause 3A and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 3A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 3A read the second time.

The Secretary for Justice moved the addition of new clause 3A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Justice reported that

the Enduring Powers of Attorney (Amendment) Bill 2011

had passed through the Committee stage with amendments. The Bill was ordered to be set down for Third Reading under Rule 59 of the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Justice moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Development moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that the Building (Minor Works) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 148 of 2011 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 2 November 2011, be amended as set out in the Schedule.

Schedule

Amendments to Building (Minor Works) (Amendment) Regulation 2011

- 1. Section 5 amended (section 31 amended (documents to be submitted on completion of class I minor works other than demolition works))**
Section 5(3)—
Repeal
“his or her opinion”
Substitute
“the opinion of the person or inspector”.

- 2. Section 6 amended (section 32 amended (documents to be submitted on completion of class I minor works that are demolition works))**
Section 6(3)—
Repeal
“his or her opinion”
Substitute
“the opinion of the person or inspector”.

3. Section 11 amended (section 52 amended (duty of authorized person on being delivered notice under section 51(1)))

Section 11(2), Chinese text—

Repeal

“他或她”

Substitute

“該人士或人員”.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Building (Inspection and Repair) Regulation, Building (Administration) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, Building (Minor Works) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, and Buildings (Amendment) Ordinance 2011 (Commencement) Notice 2011, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Expediently regulating the investment and over-the-counter trading activities of Loco London gold

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That in recent years, fraudulent investment cases involving over-the-counter ('OTC') trading of Loco London gold are increasingly rampant, and many members of the public have been deceived and victimized, with cumulative losses amounting to more than \$10 million, but there are at present no laws and statutory bodies in Hong Kong to regulate OTC trading of Loco London gold; this not only deprives victims of complaint avenues and means of recovering losses, but at the same time, results in fraud cases persisting and severe damage to Hong Kong's reputation and status as an international financial centre, because the financial firms and practitioners engaged in OTC trading of Loco London gold are of mixed standards and they make use of the vacuum created by the lack of legislative regulation to operate; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously study the enactment of legislation to

regulate OTC trading activities of Loco London gold, so as to expeditiously bring the operation of this industry back to the right and healthy track for the protection of investors' interests; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) to proactively study the formulation of specialized rules and regulations and the establishment of a statutory regulatory body, so that the trading of precious metals, including OTC trading of Loco London gold, can be brought under legislative regulation and protection;
- (b) to proactively study the introduction of a licensing system to regulate the trading bodies engaged in the aforesaid business, including imposing penalties on and instituting prosecutions against companies contravening the relevant licensing rules;
- (c) to proactively study the further expansion of the existing voluntary registration system for practitioners of the Chinese Gold and Silver Exchange Society to form a central registration system covering practitioners of the entire industry, stipulating that persons with no registration are not permitted to engage in OTC trading of the relevant precious metals, so as to regulate the professional expertise and conduct of practitioners; and while implementing a central registration system, to make reference to the experience of the Chinese Gold and Silver Exchange Society and organize training programmes on relevant professional expertise for practitioners, so as to upgrade practitioners' conduct and quality;
- (d) to assist the industry in formulating model sales documents and procedures on making investments in OTC trading of Loco London gold, including the requirement that at the time of signing an investment agreement, the salesperson must clearly explain to the investor the rights and liabilities as well as the investment risks associated with OTC trading of Loco London gold;
- (e) to request the Police to conduct in-depth investigations into fraudulent investment cases involving OTC trading of Loco London gold, set up a task force designated for follow-up work, enhance enforcement efficiency, and rigorously eradicate related fraud cases; and
- (f) to strengthen education and information on OTC trading of Loco London gold for investors, raise public understanding about the operational details and risks of OTC trading of Loco London gold, enhance public alertness, and disclose the various tactics employed in similar fraud cases.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion put and agreed to.

Improving the voter registration system to rebuild people's confidence in the electoral system

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the media have recently disclosed the discovery of many suspected vote-rigging cases after the District Council Election held on 6 November this year; besides, after every Legislative Council Election and District Council Election in the past, the Administration also received tens of thousands of returned poll cards; as there is a lack of an effective verification mechanism under the voter registration system, law-breakers may easily register as voters with falsified addresses, thus ruining the electoral system and causing voters to lose confidence, this Council urges the Administration to spare no efforts in investigating suspected vote-rigging cases, institute prosecutions against law-breakers, and comprehensively review the voter registration system, so as to ensure that before the Legislative Council Election to be held in September next year, the loopholes are plugged and people's confidence in the electoral system is rebuilt.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Ronny TONG, Dr Hon Philip WONG and Hon Albert CHAN, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:04 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:05 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion:

To add "the existing voter registration system has room for improvement, and" after "That"; and to add "including studying the adoption of the following measures: (a) to consolidate all existing laws relating to eligibility requirements for voters and voters' exercise of their voting right into a centralized, clear and easy-to-understand electoral law; (b) to require newly registered voters to provide residential address proof for verifying their declared residential addresses; (c) to add to statutory voter registers the listing of voters' particulars by residential addresses, so as to facilitate public inspection; (d) to extend the deadlines for lodging notices of objection regarding provisional registers, so as to facilitate members of the public and groups to check voters' particulars; and (e) to specify that voters must report any changes in their residential addresses to the Administration within a statutory time frame," after "review the voter registration system,".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion proposed and put.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 12 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Improving the voter registration system to rebuild people’s confidence in the electoral system” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion:

To delete “as there is a lack of an effective” after “returned poll cards;” and substitute with “in this connection, this Council considers that the Administration should further enhance the”; to delete “law-breakers may easily register” after “under the voter registration system,” and substitute with “so as to prevent law-breakers from registering”; to add “; on the other hand, the right to vote is a very important right, and under Article 26 of the Basic Law, permanent residents of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (‘HKSAR’) shall have the right to vote and the right to stand for election in accordance with law; in this connection” after “to lose confidence”; to delete “and” after “against law-breakers,”; and to delete “so as to” after “review the voter registration system,” and substitute with “and, while upholding HKSAR permanent residents’ right to vote,”.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG’s amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon Philip WONG’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Albert CHAN to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Dr Hon Philip WONG:

To add “; also, as the problem of vote-rigging is long-standing and has existed for many years, but the Government has disregarded its gravity, causing the problem of vote-rigging to worsen acutely in recent years, this Council expresses strong condemnation of Mr Stephen LAM, the former Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs and incumbent Chief Secretary for Administration, and the Registration and Electoral Office for bringing disgrace to Hong Kong through their dereliction of duty” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion as amended by Dr Hon Philip WONG proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 12 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and eight against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon KAM Nai-wai replied.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion as amended by Dr Hon Philip WONG put and agreed to.

Motion for the adjournment of the Council under Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure

The President stated that he had determined under Rule 16(6) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure that he would extend the period of the debate until all Members who wished to speak had spoken and the public officer had given his reply. The President added that each Member, including the mover of motion, might speak for up to five minutes, and the speaking time limit for the public officer making a reply was 15 minutes.

Hon Starry LEE moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue: the impact of the announcement made by CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and The Hongkong Electric Company Limited to substantially increase tariffs from 1 January next year on the general public and enterprises, as well as the Government's corresponding measures.

Question on Hon Starry LEE's motion proposed.

Twenty Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

The President stated that as the debate on the motion had exceeded one and a half hours, in accordance with Rule 16(7) of the Rules of Procedure, the motion shall not be put to vote.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 11 January 2012 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:44 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

16 February 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 21/12/2011
 時間 TIME: 09:39:45 下午 PM

Appendix I

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對甘乃威議員的「改善選民登記制度，重建市民對選舉制度的信心」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON KAM NAI-WAI'S MOTION ON "IMPROVING THE VOTER REGISTRATION SYSTEM TO REBUILD PEOPLE'S CONFIDENCE IN THE ELECTORAL SYSTEM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 12 | 23 | |
| 投票 Vote | 12 | 22 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 4 | 15 | |
| 反對 No | 2 | 1 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 6 | 6 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | |
| 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | TAM Yiu-chung | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | | 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 陳茂波 Paul CHAN | | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi | |
| 梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | |
| 葉偉明 IP Wai-ming | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 21/12/2011
 時間 TIME: 09:43:38 下午 PM

Appendix II

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員對甘乃威議員就「改善選民登記制度，重建市民對選舉制度的信心」所提，經湯家驊議員及黃宜弘議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT CHAN TO HON KAM NAI-WAI'S MOTION ON "IMPROVING THE VOTER REGISTRATION SYSTEM TO REBUILD PEOPLE'S CONFIDENCE IN THE ELECTORAL SYSTEM" AS AMENDED BY HON RONNY TONG & DR HON PHILIP WONG

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 12 | 23 | |
| 投票 Vote | 12 | 22 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 4 | 15 | |
| 反對 No | 8 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | |
| 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | | 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 反對 NO |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | 反對 NO | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 反對 NO |
| 陳茂波 Paul CHAN | | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 反對 NO | WONG Sing-chi | |
| 梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | 反對 NO |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | |
| 葉偉明 IP Wai-ming | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau | 反對 NO | 陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |

秘書 CLERK