

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 14

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 18 January 2012 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP  
Under Secretary for the Environment

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Undesirable Medical Advertisements (Amendment) Ordinance 2005 (Commencement) Notice 2012 (gazetted on 13.1.2012)	3/2012

### **Other Papers**

No. 59 - Hospital Authority Annual Report 2010-2011  
(published on 16.1.2012)

No. 60 - Samaritan Fund  
Financial statements together with the Report of the Director of Audit and the Report on the Samaritan Fund for the year ended 31 March 2011  
(published on 16.1.2012)

Report No. 9/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments  
(published on 11.1.2012)

### **Question under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure**

The President stated that he had given permission for Hon Mrs Regina IP to ask an urgent question under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure.

Hon Mrs Regina IP asked an urgent question.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

### **Questions**

1. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

2. Hon KAM Nai-wai asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

3. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Fred LI asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Development replied.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:19 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### Annual Report 2010 to the Chief Executive by the Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council notes the Annual Report 2010 to the Chief Executive by the Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance.

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the motion.

Four Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

At 2:34 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six other Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Hon James TO replied.

Question on Hon James TO's motion put and agreed to.

Creating a sustainable and open electricity market

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given that the Government's signing of the 10-year Scheme of Control Agreements ('SCAs') with the two power companies in 2008 has extended the monopolization of the electricity market by the two power companies and sowed the seed of misfortune that the two power companies can persistently and significantly increase tariffs to 'maximize profits' regardless of public sentiments, for the well-being of the public, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) require the two power companies to exhaust all room for tariff reduction, so as to lower the rates of tariff increase this year to the lowest levels;
- (b) immediately activate the mechanism for interim reviews, and make public the relevant information and accounts, so as to facilitate public participation;
- (c) launch a review of the two power companies' development plans in accordance with the provisions of SCAs, increase the transparency of the development plans, and require the two power companies to revise their investment plans, revalue their assets, compress costs and rationalize their accounts;
- (d) expeditiously materialize the interconnection between the networks of the two power companies and segregation of the generation sector from the network sector, and introduce third parties to bid for the supply of electricity grids;
- (e) encourage the development of distributed renewable energy power generation facilities and networks, and provide technical support and concessions for connection to electricity grids; and
- (f) adopt all measures to create a low-carbon electricity market which promotes sustainable development and operates with greater competition, openness and fairness, so as to break new grounds in the electricity market.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Fred LI, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon Starry LEE and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eighteen Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:52 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

With the permission of the President's Deputy, Hon CHAN Kam-lam elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

After Hon CHAN Kam-lam had made an elucidation and with the permission of the President's Deputy, Hon LEE Wing-tat also elucidated a point which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon CHAN Kam-lam.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had spoken, Hon CHAN Kam-lam rose and sought the permission of the President's Deputy for him to elucidate a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung. After Hon CHAN Kam-lam had explained the point, the President's Deputy stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam was provoking a debate instead of making an elucidation. The President's Deputy then ordered Hon CHAN Kam-lam to sit down.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

At 7:23 pm, while the Secretary for the Environment was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion:

To delete “,” after “That” and substitute with “at present, there are only CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and The Hongkong Electric Company Limited supplying power in Hong Kong;”; to delete “has extended” after “2008” and substitute with “is marked by inadequacies, thus extending”; to delete “sowed” after “by the two power companies and” and substitute with “sowing”; to add “(a) establish an energy management authority to explore Hong Kong's long-term energy demand, formulate and execute an energy policy, as well as monitor power companies, gas companies, liquefied petroleum gas companies and fuel supply companies; (b) review the permitted returns of the two power companies; (c) raise the transparency of the processes for the formulation of SCAs and tariff adjustments, so as to facilitate public monitoring and ensure fair and reasonable tariff adjustment rates; (d) consult the Legislative Council first when approving the annual tariff adjustments and before revising the respective five-year Development Plans of the two power companies in the future;” after “the Government to;”; to delete the original “(a)” and substitute with “(e)”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(f)”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(g)”; to delete the original “(d)” and substitute with “(h)”; to delete the original “(e)” and substitute with “(i)”; and to delete the original “(f)” and substitute with “(j)”.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Fred LI's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Miriam LAU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI:

To add “; (k) on the premise of keeping in line with public interest, not interfering with normal commercial operation, and not divulging sensitive commercial information, support the relevant motion passed by the Legislative Council House Committee for the Legislative Council to, in accordance with the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance, demand the two power companies to provide all detailed records and data relating to their 2012 tariff adjustments and the five-year Development Plans; and (l) strive to lower the existing ceiling of 9.99% on the permitted returns” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, five against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Creating a sustainable and open electricity market” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Fred LI’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon IP Wai-ming to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU’s motion as amended by Hon Fred LI:

To add “; (k) expeditiously conduct studies and consultation on a new mechanism for setting tariffs; (l) require the two power companies to expeditiously and fully implement progressive block tariffs, so as to avoid the situation of ‘lower tariffs for higher consumption’, thereby encouraging energy conservation; (m) formulate a long-term energy conservation policy and set the relevant indicators, encourage the public as well as the industrial and commercial sector to consume less power, and adopt such indicators for projecting future power consumption, so as to avoid drastic expansion of investment projects by the two power companies on the ground of continuous increase in power consumption; and (n) review the cost-effectiveness of the two power companies’ investments in environmental protection and emission reduction measures as well as the ratio of relevant investments counted for computing returns and counted as operating expenses, and to set the respective ratios of commitments for the Government, the two power companies and the public in respect of environmental protection and emission reduction projects,

so as to prevent the two power companies from continuously increasing operating expenses on the grounds of expanding environmental protection and emission reduction projects and subsequently shifting all expenses to the tariffs paid by the public” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming’s amendment to Hon Audrey EU’s motion as amended by Hon Fred LI proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and one against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon Fred LI’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Starry LEE to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Starry LEE moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU’s motion as amended by Hon Fred LI:

To add “; and (k) study the computation mode based on linking permitted returns to fixed assets” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Starry LEE’s amendment to Hon Audrey EU’s motion as amended by Hon Fred LI proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Fred LI’s and Hon Starry LEE’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Cheuk-yan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU’s motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon Starry LEE, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (l) study turning power supply into a utility operated by the public sector in the long run” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon Starry LEE proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 11 abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Audrey EU replied.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon Starry LEE put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 19 January 2012 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 7:55 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
Legislative Council

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

14 March 2012

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 18/01/2012  
 時間 TIME: 07:44:26 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 劉健儀議員對余若薇議員就「締造可持續及開放的電力市場」所提，經李華明議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON MIRIAM LAU TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "CREATING A SUSTAINABLE AND OPEN ELECTRICITY MARKET" AS AMENDED BY HON FRED LI

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	26	
投票 Vote	20	25	
贊成 Yes	7	13	
反對 No	5	8	
棄權 Abstain	8	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 18/01/2012  
 時間 TIME: 07:47:49 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 葉偉明議員對余若薇議員就「締造可持續及開放的電力市場」所提，經李華明議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON IP WAI-MING TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "CREATING A SUSTAINABLE AND OPEN ELECTRICITY MARKET" AS AMENDED BY HON FRED LI

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉偉明 IP Wai-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	26	
投票 Vote	20	25	
贊成 Yes	8	24	
反對 No	11	1	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	梁美芬 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	黃國健 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁家傑 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		梁國雄 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳淑莊 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		陳偉業 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 18/01/2012  
 時間 TIME: 07:51:28 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對余若薇議員就「締造可持續及開放的電力市場」所提，經李華明議員／~~劉健儀議員／葉偉明議員~~／李慧琼議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "CREATING A SUSTAINABLE AND OPEN ELECTRICITY MARKET" AS AMENDED BY HON FRED LI / ~~HON MIRIAM LAU / HON IP WAI-MING / HON STARRY LEE~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	26	
投票 Vote	20	25	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	9	1	
棄權 Abstain	7	11	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	