

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 17

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 8 February 2012 at 11:00 am
and Thursday 9 February 2012 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyau (absent on 9.2.2012)

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Members absent:

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

On 8.2.2012

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP
Under Secretary for the Environment

On 8.2.2012 and 9.2.2012

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

On 9.2.2012

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

On 8.2.2012

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

On 8.2.2012 and 9.2.2012

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 9.2.2012

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Rating (Exemption) Order 2012 (gazetted on 3.2.2012)	14/2012
2. Revenue (Reduction of Business Registration Fees) Order 2012 (gazetted on 3.2.2012)	15/2012
3. Import and Export (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2012 (gazetted on 3.2.2012)	16/2012
4. Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 4) Order 2012 (gazetted on 3.2.2012)	17/2012
5. Communications Authority Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 3.2.2012)	18/2012

Other Papers

- No. 64 - Report by the Controller, Government Flying Service on the Administration of the Government Flying Service Welfare Fund for the year ended 31 March 2011 and the audited financial statements together with the Director of Audit's report
(published on 2.2.2012)
- No. 65 - Employees' Compensation Insurance Levies Management Board Annual Report 2010/11
(published on 2.2.2012)

- No. 66 - Employees Compensation Assistance Fund Board Annual Report 2010-2011
(published on 2.2.2012)
- No. 67 - Occupational Deafness Compensation Board Annual Report 2010/11
(published on 2.2.2012)
- No. 68 - Pneumoconiosis Compensation Fund Board Annual Report 2010
(published on 2.2.2012)
- No. 69 - Estimates
for the year ending 31 March 2013
General Revenue Account
- Consolidated Summary of Estimates
- Revenue Analysis by Head
(published on 3.2.2012)

Report No. 11/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments
(published on 1.2.2012)

Report of the Bills Committee on Adaptation of Laws (Military References) Bill 2010
(published on 3.2.2012)

Questions

1. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Hon CHAN Hak-kan asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon CHAN Kin-por asked Question 5.

While Hon CHAN Kin-por was asking his question, the President left the chair at 12:37 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2012

Electoral Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2012

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2012

Electoral Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2012

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading and spoke on the above two Bills respectively.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

Adaptation of Laws (Military References) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 14 July 2010 resumed.

Hon IP Kwok-him, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Adaptation of Laws (Military References) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

At 1:38 pm, while Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

After the address, Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that 46 Members were present, 34 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Adaptation of Laws (Military References) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

A Member spoke on the clauses.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question that clauses 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved the deletion of clause 5 and spoke on this amendment.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendment to delete clause 5 had been agreed, clause 5 was therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that Schedule 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 1 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to Schedule 1 and spoke on the amendments.

Three Members spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 1 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Security reported that

the Adaptation of Laws (Military References) Bill 2010

had passed through the Committee stage with amendments. The Bill was ordered to be set down for Third Reading under Rule 59 of the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Security moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that 47 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the motion, 10 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under section 34(4) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Cyd HO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the Places of Public Entertainment (Exemption) (Amendment) Order 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 183 of 2011, and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 11 January 2012, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 29 February 2012.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Seeking papers, books, records or documents in relation to the 2012 tariff adjustments by CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and The Hongkong Electric Company Limited

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, since the data and information behind the 2012 tariff adjustments by the two power companies have not been fully disclosed, and the details of their five-year Development Plans approved in 2008 have also not been publicized, the Panel on Economic Development be authorized under section 9(2) of the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) to exercise the powers conferred by section 9(1) of the Ordinance to order the Secretary for the Environment of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to produce all papers, books, records or documents in relation to the 2012 tariff adjustments by CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and The Hongkong Electric Company Limited respectively, including:

- (a) detailed information on the 2012 tariff adjustments by the two power companies; and
- (b) detailed information on the five-year Development Plans of the two power companies.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Vincent FANG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Vincent FANG moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To add “, but it must be ensured that the exercise of this power is in the public interest, does not interfere with normal commercial operation, and does not lead to divulging sensitive commercial information” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Fourteen Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:24 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon CHAN Kin-por spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:57 pm, while Hon CHAN Kin-por was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further division on the motion on “Seeking papers, books, records or documents in relation to the 2012 tariff adjustments by CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and The Hongkong Electric Company Limited”, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU’s motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, six were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion and five against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Reviewing the education policy for ethnic minority students

Hon Abraham SHEK moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, while the Equal Opportunities Commission ('EOC') already published 'Education for all: the Report on the Working Group on Education for Ethnic Minorities' ('the Report') in July 2011, highlighting how the mainstream education system has let down ethnic minority students who are mostly from low-income families and putting forward various recommendations to the Government on addressing their learning needs, the Government has not yet proposed any concrete measures on following up the implementation of the EOC's recommendations in the Report and offered any additional support to the 14 000 ethnic minority students in Hong Kong; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to review its education policy for ethnic minority students, so as to address their concerns, particularly the admission and assessment procedures of schools, the available choices of designated schools and mainstream schools, learning support for pre-primary ethnic minority students and provision of an alternative Chinese Curriculum and Qualification, so that ethnic minority students can enjoy equal access to quality education, which is pivotal not only to such students' pursuit of further education and employment, but also to Hong Kong maintaining its competitiveness.

Question on Hon Abraham SHEK's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon Starry LEE, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:54 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 9 February 2012.

Two Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG declared that he was the convenor of the Policy and Research Committee of the Equal Opportunities Commission as well as a member of the Working Group on Education for Ethnic Minorities. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Fourteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Paul TSE declared that he was a member of the Equal Opportunities Commission. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon Abraham SHEK's motion:

To delete “,” after “That” and substitute with “education is the key to success and the future of our next generation;”; and to add “; the relevant initiatives should include: (a) implementing a separate Chinese curriculum assessment scheme especially for ethnic minority students to help them meet the requirements of further education and vocational training; (b) providing pre-primary educational institutions with additional resources and relevant support to encourage the admission of ethnic minority students; (c) enhancing the training for teachers who teach Chinese as a second or foreign language; (d) designing suitable assessment schemes for adoption by schools to facilitate early identification of ethnic minority students' special needs, so that they can receive appropriate education; (e) launching a study to monitor the learning progress of ethnic minority students to enable the Government to review their needs and the effectiveness of their education, and establishing a database for systemic data collection and analysis, so as to facilitate the formulation of an education policy and the provision of support which meet the needs of ethnic minority students; (f) increasing intake quotas, providing a positive learning environment and adequate support to meet the demand of ethnic minority students with special educational needs; (g) enhancing the career guidance and vocational training services for ethnic minority graduates; and (h) enhancing public awareness of the importance of cultural diversities and ethnic integration, so as to create a better learning environment for ethnic minority students” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment to Hon Abraham SHEK's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Starry LEE to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Starry LEE moved the following further amendment to Hon Abraham SHEK's motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN:

To add “; and (i) developing teaching materials and providing parental education” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Starry LEE's amendment to Hon Abraham SHEK's motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Abraham SHEK replied.

Question on Hon Abraham SHEK's motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon Starry LEE put and agreed to.

Formulating an industrial policy

Hon Andrew LEUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges the SAR Government to formulate a comprehensive policy to promote high value-adding, new technology-intensive and innovative industries, so as to ensure Hong Kong's long-term economic development.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon Ronny TONG, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Fifteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew LEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion:

To add “, since the nineties of the last century, the massive northward relocation of factories created a structural problem of industrial imbalance in Hong Kong and large numbers of grass-roots and skilled workers became unemployed or underemployed due to industrial shrinkage, the unhealthy phenomenon of society relying solely on a handful of industries to support its economy has progressively emerged; in order to ease the problem concerned and develop industrial diversification,” after “That”; to add “as well as industries capable of sustainable development and creating massive employment opportunities, and at the same time, re-design the relevant manpower training, including reviewing the Apprenticeship Ordinance and extending the relevant system to various emerging industries, as well as providing land and financial facilitation and support to emerging industries” after “innovative industries”; and to add “and different employment opportunities for local workers” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon IP Wai-ming's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Ronny TONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following further amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; besides, this Council also urges the SAR Government to create a favourable environment conducive to setting up businesses, promote better employment relationship, and expeditiously study setting standard working hours and standardizing the number of general holidays for the relevant trades” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Andrew LEUNG replied.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon Ronny TONG put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 15 February 2012 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 2:20 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

28 March 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 08/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 02:46:50 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 《2010年法律適應化修改（軍事提述）條例草案》— 二讀
 ADAPTATION OF LAWS (MILITARY REFERENCES) BILL 2010 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present : 46
 投票 Vote : 45
 贊成 Yes : 34
 反對 No : 11
 棄權 Abstain : 0
 結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam			李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming		
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 08/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 03:51:31 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 《2010年法律適應化修改（軍事提述）條例草案》－三讀
 ADAPTATION OF LAWS (MILITARY REFERENCES) BILL 2010 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present : 47
 投票 Vote : 46
 贊成 Yes : 35
 反對 No : 10
 棄權 Abstain : 1
 結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam			李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 08/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 09:08:29 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 方剛議員對劉健儀議員的「索取與中華電力有限公司和香港電燈有限公司調整2012年電費相關的文據、簿冊、紀錄或文件」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON VINCENT FANG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION ON "SEEKING PAPERS, BOOKS, RECORDS OR DOCUMENTS IN RELATION TO THE 2012 TARIFF ADJUSTMENTS BY CLP POWER HONG KONG LIMITED AND THE HONGKONG ELECTRIC COMPANY LIMITED"

動議人 MOVED BY: 方剛 Vincent FANG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	9	17	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 08/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 09:16:06 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 「索取與中華電力有限公司和香港電燈有限公司調整2012年電費相關的文據、簿冊、紀錄或文件」議案
 MOTION ON "SEEKING PAPERS, BOOKS, RECORDS OR DOCUMENTS IN RELATION TO THE 2012 TARIFF
 ADJUSTMENTS BY CLP POWER HONG KONG LIMITED AND THE HONGKONG ELECTRIC COMPANY
 LIMITED"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	6	20	
反對 No	18	5	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁若彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES