

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 18

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15 February 2012 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instrument</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Finland) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.2.2012)	21/2012

### **Other Papers**

No. 70 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2011 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 57)  
(February 2012 — P.A.C. Report No. 57)  
(published on 15.2.2012)

Report No. 12/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments  
(published on 9.2.2012)

### **Addresses**

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report No. 57.

**Question under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure**

The President stated that he had given permission for Hon LEE Wing-tat to ask an urgent question under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure.

Hon LEE Wing-tat asked an urgent question.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon LEE Wing-tat declared that he was a member of the Democratic Party, the political party to which Hon Albert HO, a Chief Executive candidate, belonged. He was also a subscriber of Hon Albert HO in the Election. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong declared that he was a member of the Democratic Party and a subscriber of Hon Albert HO in the Chief Executive Election. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon James TO declared that he was a subscriber of Hon Albert HO, a Chief Executive candidate. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon Jeffrey LAM declared that he was a Board Member of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority, and he knew the three potential Chief Executive candidates. One of them had submitted his application for standing in the Chief Executive Election, whilst the other two were prepared to do so. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

After the Secretary for Home Affairs had replied to Hon Jeffrey LAM's supplementary question, Mr LAM further declared that he was prepared to subscribe to the nomination of Mr Henry TANG as a candidate in the Election.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU declared that he was one of the Jury members of the West Kowloon Reclamation Concept Plan Competition. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he would subscribe to the nomination of Mr Henry TANG as a candidate in the Election. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon Emily LAU declared that she was a member of the Democratic Party as well as a member of the Election Committee for the Chief Executive Election, and she had subscribed to the nomination of Hon Albert HO as a candidate in the small-circle election. She then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Three more Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was a subscriber and supporter of Mr LEUNG Chun-ying, and was also a Board Member of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

### **Questions**

1. Dr Hon David LI asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

A Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

3. Hon Albert HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

While the Secretary for Transport and Housing was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:01 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon WONG Sing-chi asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Public Finance Ordinance**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the motion in **Appendix I** and spoke on the motion.

At 2:05 pm, while the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that there were 43 Members present, 38 were in favour of the motion, three against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

### **Members' Motions**

#### Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 12/11-12 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council on 15 February 2012 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below:

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Undesirable Medical Advertisements (Amendment) Ordinance 2005 (Commencement) Notice 2012 (L.N. 3/2012).

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the motion.

While Hon Fred LI was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:26 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

A Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion.

The President's Deputy stated that under Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, she would not put any question on the motion.

Report of the delegation of the Panel on Manpower to study the experience in the implementation of standard working hours in the Republic of Korea

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council notes the Report of the delegation of the Panel on Manpower to study the experience in the implementation of standard working hours in the Republic of Korea.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion.

A Member and Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion.

At 3:10 pm, while Hon LI Fung-ying was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six other Members and Hon IP Wai-ming spoke on the motion.

After Hon IP Wai-ming had spoken, Hon Paul TSE queried whether Hon IP Wai-ming should elucidate a point made in his speech. The President did not consider it necessary for Mr IP to make an elucidation. He added that Hon IP Wai-ming might respond to that point if he later spoke on the motion.

Thirteen more Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan replied.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion put and agreed to.

Government-led promotion of a territory-wide energy conservation campaign

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Government proposes in the Consultation Document on Hong Kong's Climate Change Strategy and Action Agenda to significantly increase, in 2020, the proportion of nuclear power generation in Hong Kong's fuel mix for power generation from 23% in 2009 to 50% and the proportion of electricity generated using natural gas from 23% to 40%, but given that the earlier nuclear power incident in Fukushima of Japan has aroused public concern about the safety of nuclear power, and replacing coal with natural gas, which is cleaner, for power generation will significantly increase power generation costs, the options for Hong Kong's fuel mix for power generation are thus further limited; besides, Hong Kong is not endowed with any energy resources, promoting energy conservation therefore becomes more important; as a matter of fact, energy conservation and enhancing energy efficiency have become a major sustainable development trend among the international community, and many countries in the world (including China) have even adopted energy conservation and emission reduction as an important state policy; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to immediately formulate afresh territory-wide energy conservation policies and objectives, take the lead in organizing a territory-wide energy conservation campaign, and adopt multi-faceted incentive measures to unite and motivate people from different strata as well as enterprises to participate in the territory-wide energy conservation campaign, so as to comprehensively enhance energy efficiency in Hong Kong.

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon Audrey EU, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Three Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:58 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:18 pm, while Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO spoke on the motion and the amendments, and declared that he was the Chairman of Guangdong Daya Bay Nuclear Plant and Lingao Nuclear Plant Safety Consultative Committee.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Kin-por spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por's motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; and to add “; besides, this Council also requests the Government to immediately shelve the aforesaid plan of significantly increasing the use of nuclear power (from 23% in 2009 to 50% in 2020) in order to allay people's worries about the use of nuclear power; at the same time, with a view to reducing energy consumption and electricity consumption by the public, this Council urges the Government to implement the following measures: (a) to study conducting electricity consumption audits for buildings on a free of charge basis and offering a series of energy conservation recommendations after such audits, so as to reduce energy consumption and electricity consumption by the public; (b) to propose in the 2012-13 Budget the provision of an electricity charge subsidy of \$1,200 to an account whose electricity consumption in a half-year period is 5% or more lower than its consumption in the corresponding period of the previous year, so as to encourage people to reduce electricity consumption; (c) to propose in the 2012-13 Budget the provision of tax allowance to people who purchase energy efficient products with Grade 1 energy label, subject to a ceiling of \$5,000; (d) to truly foster the development of a low-carbon traffic and transport system by including travelling on foot and cycling in the formulation and planning of its overall transport policy, and encourage people to travel on public transport and the mass transit system more frequently; at the same time, to formulate a long-term cycling policy, perfect bicycle management facilities (such as cycle parks) in various districts, actively expand cycle tracks, perfect the footbridge and subway networks in various districts, and install covers, escalators and lifts along district pedestrian walkways, with a view to reducing the number of

vehicles on roads and encouraging people to actively live a low-carbon life; (e) to actively develop green transportation, increase the number, usage and types of electric vehicles, and perfect the relevant infrastructural and complementary facilities, so as to reduce energy consumption, pollution and emissions; and (f) by way of financial subsidy or franchise extension, to push ahead the early phasing out and replacement by bus companies of buses with high emissions; and, on the premise of not affecting fares, introduce more electric or supercapacitor buses” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai’s amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por’s motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, five against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and five abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Government-led promotion of a territory-wide energy conservation campaign” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por’s motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; to delete “given that” after “40%, but”; to add “motivating people and enterprises to lead a low-carbon life through measures on” after “as a matter of fact,”; to delete “have” after “enhancing energy efficiency” and substitute with “has”; and to add “, including studying the introduction of incentive schemes to encourage people to purchase energy-saving products or reduce electricity consumption, further expanding

the types of products covered by the Mandatory Energy Efficiency Labelling Scheme, actively developing means of green transportation which include electric vehicles, studying the positioning of bicycles as a means of transport, and formulating relevant policies as well as expanding cycle track networks for reducing fossil fuel consumption, etc.,” after “incentive measures”.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “; the relevant incentive measures also include: (a) to implement a progressive tariff structure, with a view to reducing electricity consumption; (b) to study introducing tax measures with carrot and stick to encourage energy conservation; (c) to make it a mandatory requirement for listed companies to conduct energy audits and carbon audits; (d) to progressively expand and make it mandatory to comply with the various Building Energy Codes; (e) by drawing reference from Australia, to study the feasibility of levying a carbon tax on accounts with high electricity consumption; and (f) to enhance energy conservation in the Central Government Complex and the Legislative Council Complex, etc” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU’s amendment to Hon CHAN Kin-por’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed and put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Kin-por replied.

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 22 February 2012 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:24 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
Legislative Council

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

21 August 2012

---

**Public Finance Ordinance**

---

**Resolution**

(Under section 7(1) of the Public Finance Ordinance (Cap. 2))

---

Resolved that—

1. Authority is hereby given for a sum not exceeding \$79,594,567,000 to be charged on the general revenue for expenditure on the services of the Government in respect of the financial year commencing on 1 April 2012.
2. Subject to this Resolution, the sum so charged may be expended against the heads of expenditure as shown in the Estimates of Expenditure 2012–13 laid before the Legislative Council on 1 February 2012 or, if the Estimates are changed under the provisions of the Public Finance Ordinance (Cap. 2) as applied by section 7(2) of that Ordinance, as shown in the Estimates as so changed.
3. Expenditure in respect of any head of expenditure must not exceed the aggregate of the amounts authorized by paragraph 4 to be expended in respect of the subheads in that head of expenditure.
4. Expenditure in respect of each subhead in a head of expenditure must not exceed—
  - (a) for an Operating Account Recurrent subhead of expenditure, an amount equivalent to—
    - (i) except if the subhead is listed in Schedule 1 to this Resolution, 20% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead;

- (ii) if the subhead is listed in Schedule 1 to this Resolution, the percentage of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead that is specified in that Schedule in relation to that subhead; and
- (b) for an Operating Account Non-Recurrent subhead of expenditure or a Capital Account subhead of expenditure, an amount equivalent to—
  - (i) except if the subhead is listed in Schedule 2 to this Resolution, 100% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead;
  - (ii) if the subhead is listed in Schedule 2 to this Resolution, the amount that is specified in that Schedule in relation to that subhead,

or such other amount, not exceeding an amount equivalent to 100% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead, as may in any case be approved by the Financial Secretary.

---

Resolution of the Legislative Council

Schedule 1

3

		<b>Schedule 1</b>		[para. 4(a)]
Head of Expenditure		Subhead		Percentage of provision shown in Estimates
90	Labour Department	280	Contribution to the Occupational Safety and Health Council	30
		295	Contribution to the Occupational Deafness Compensation Board	30
106	Miscellaneous Services	284	Compensation	40
120	Pensions	026	Employees' compensation, injury, incapacity and death related payments and expenses	35
170	Social Welfare Department	157	Assistance for patients and their families	100
		176	Criminal and law enforcement injuries compensation	25
		177	Emergency relief	100
		179	Comprehensive social security assistance scheme	30
		180	Social security allowance scheme	30

Resolution of the Legislative Council

Schedule 2

4

		<b>Schedule 2</b>		[para. 4(b)]
Head of Expenditure		Subhead		Amount \$
106	Miscellaneous Services	689	Additional commitments	0
		789	Additional commitments	1,000,000,000
184	Transfers to Funds	988	Payment to the Loan Fund	0

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 15/02/2012  
 時間 TIME: 02:20:13 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 根據《公共財政條例》動議的擬議決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION UNDER THE PUBLIC FINANCE ORDINANCE

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 43  
 投票 Vote : 42  
     贊成 Yes : 38  
     反對 No : 3  
     棄權 Abstain : 1  
 結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
何俊仁	Albert HO			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG			劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO		
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi		
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 15/02/2012  
 時間 TIME: 08:18:43 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 甘乃威議員對陳健波議員的「政府牽頭推動全民節能運動」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON KAM NAI-WAI TO HON CHAN KIN-POR'S MOTION ON "GOVERNMENT-LED PROMOTION OF A TERRITORY-WIDE ENERGY CONSERVATION CAMPAIGN"

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	23	
投票 Vote	18	22	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	5	1	
棄權 Abstain	5	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 15/02/2012  
時間 TIME: 08:22:39 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對陳健波議員就「政府牽頭推動全民節能運動」所提，經甘乃威議員／陳克勤議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON CHAN KIN-POR'S MOTION ON "GOVERNMENT-LED PROMOTION OF A TERRITORY-WIDE ENERGY CONSERVATION CAMPAIGN" AS AMENDED BY HON KAM NAI-WAI / HON CHAN HAK-KAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	23	
投票 Vote	18	22	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	7	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK