

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 19

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 22 February 2012 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Education (Amendment) Regulation 2012 (gazetted on 17.2.2012)	23/2012
2. Education (Exemption) (Private Schools Offering Non-Formal Curriculum) (Amendment) Order 2012 (gazetted on 17.2.2012)	24/2012
3. Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2012 (gazetted on 17.2.2012)	25/2012
4. Protection of Children and Juveniles (Places of Refuge) (Amendment) Order 2012 (gazetted on 17.2.2012)	26/2012
5. Guardianship of Minors (Amendment) Ordinance 2012 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 17.2.2012)	27/2012

Other Papers

- No. 71 - Report of changes made to the approved Estimates of Expenditure during the third quarter of 2011-12
Public Finance Ordinance: Section 8
(published on 17.2.2012)

No. 72 - Li Po Chun Charitable Trust Fund
Financial statements together with the Report of the
Director of Audit and Report of the Trustee on the
Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 August 2011
(published on 20.2.2012)

Report of the Bills Committee on Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011
(published on 20.2.2012)

Hon Frederick FUNG asked the President that as he had announced that he would consider running in the Chief Executive Election and certain item(s) on the Agenda of this meeting might involve the relevant area, whether he should continue to preside over the relevant item(s).

The President stated that if he considered that any item on the Agenda was related to his earlier announcement that he would seriously consider running in the Chief Executive Election and that he was unable to act, he would ask the President's Deputy to preside over that item.

Addresses

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

Questions

1. Dr Hon Margaret NG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

3. Hon Cyd HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

A Member and Hon James TO asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was replying to Hon James TO's supplementary question, the President left the chair at 12:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two more Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

5. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO declared that he was a member of the Hong Kong Baptist University's School of Chinese Medicine Advisory Committee chaired by Dr KO Wing-man and was a former Chairman of the Council of the City University of Hong Kong. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Education replied.

Hon LEE Wing-tat declared that he had subscribed to the nomination of Hon Albert HO as a candidate in the Chief Executive Election.

6. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO declared that he belonged to the engineering sector and represented 10 professions, including civil and structural engineers and geotechnical engineers. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Bill 2012

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Bill 2012

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate on the Bill - for the purpose of making an announcement for the withdrawal of the Bill

The President's Deputy stated that the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had given notice to resume the Second Reading debate on the Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011. The purpose was for making an announcement for the withdrawal of the Bill.

The President's Deputy further stated that in accordance with Rule 64(3) of the Rules of Procedure, no debate might arise on the address made by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs for making an announcement for the withdrawal of the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the withdrawal of the Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under section 34(4) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the —

- (a) Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 4 of 2012;
- (b) Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) (North Lantau and Chek Lap Kok Airport) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 5 of 2012;
- (c) Schedule of Routes (Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 6 of 2012;
- (d) Schedule of Routes (Long Win Bus Company Limited) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 7 of 2012;
- (e) Schedule of Routes (New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 8 of 2012; and
- (f) Schedule of Routes (New World First Bus Services Limited) Order 2012, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 9 of 2012,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 1 February 2012, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 21 March 2012.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Reiterating Hong Kong's core values

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That Hong Kong has always taken pride in its core values such as diversity, harmony, love for peace and kind-heartedness, etc., but a series of recent incidents involving 'doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women', self-drive tour, D&G and talks about 'locusts' and 'dogs', etc. have progressively intensified conflicts between mainlanders and Hong Kong people, and there are signs of gradual growth of China-Hong Kong confrontation and mutual animosity; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously adopt the following contingency measures, so as to eliminate the confrontational sentiments between the masses on the Mainland and in Hong Kong, and address the problems arising from the cultural differences between the two places:

- (a) to allocate additional resources for improving obstetric services, suspend the quota for 'doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women', and accord priority to addressing the needs of local pregnant women;
- (b) to step up law enforcement and enhance entry restrictions to comprehensively block the entry of 'doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women'; and
- (c) to shelve the self-drive tour plan for mainlanders' vehicles.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that seven Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the seven amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO and Hon WONG Kwok-kin, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:09 pm, while Hon WONG Kwok-kin was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Cyd HO, Hon WONG Sing-chi, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau and Hon Albert CHAN, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health, the Secretary for Security as well as the Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion.

Nineteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing, the Secretary for Security as well as the Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion:

To add “, as an international city,” after “That”; to delete “, suspend the quota for ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’, and accord priority to addressing the needs of local pregnant women;” after “improving obstetric services” and substitute with “in public hospitals, and require public hospitals to only accept advance bookings of delivery care services by local pregnant women and Hong Kong people’s mainland spouses; (b) to reduce private hospitals’ admission quota for mainland pregnant women, and request private hospitals to accord priority to local pregnant women and Hong Kong people’s mainland spouses in providing delivery care services;”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(c)”; to delete “and” after “enforcement” and substitute with “,”; to delete “to comprehensively block the entry of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’; and” after “restrictions” and substitute with “, and strengthen liaison and co-operation with various relevant mainland departments, so as to stop mainland pregnant women without advance booking of obstetric services from coming to Hong Kong to give birth; (d) focusing on the situation where the right of abode in Hong Kong enjoyed by children born in Hong Kong to ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ has led to large numbers of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ giving birth in Hong Kong, to study amending Article 24 of the Basis Law; and”; and to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(e)”.

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and four abstained (voting record

in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Reiterating Hong Kong’s core values” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion:

To add “, while” after “That”; to delete “but” after “kind-heartedness, etc.”; to delete “China-Hong Kong confrontation and” after “gradual growth of” and substitute with “confrontation,”; to add “and stigmatization” after “animosity”; to delete “adopt the following contingency measures, so as to” after “expeditiously”; to delete “on the Mainland and in Hong Kong, and” after “the masses” and substitute with “in the two places,”; to add “, foster a moderate social atmosphere of mutual respect, mutual understanding and mutual accommodation between the masses of the two sides, and adopt proactive measures in response to the recent incidents of concern to Hong Kong people, so as to ensure that while the two places integrate and interflow, local residents can still enjoy adequate and priority use of public resources and maintain their original ways of life; the relevant measures should include” after “between the two places”; to delete “, and accord priority” after “for ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’” and substitute with “to give birth in public hospitals, and limit the number of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ admitted by private hospitals to a reasonable level, so as to ensure that priority is accorded”; to add “; and to impose deterrent penalties on ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ who rush to accident and emergency departments with no advance booking, such as imposing a surcharge and forbidding their re-entry within a certain period of time, so as to ensure that no additional burden is imposed on the services of accident and emergency departments” after “local pregnant women”; to add “and overstaying” after “block the entry”; to delete “shelve” after “(c) to” and substitute with “ensure that”; to delete “plan” after “the self-drive tour” and substitute with “scheme”; and to add “to travel to Hong Kong (i.e. phase two of the trial scheme on one-off ad hoc quotas for cross-boundary private cars) is implemented only with adequate preparation and public support; at the same time, in implementing the

self-drive tour scheme for the two places, to formulate a series of measures to perfect the relevant arrangements, including requiring drivers participating in the scheme to complete driving courses, perfecting the insurance and liability arrangements for incidents under the scheme, and conducting emission tests on vehicles participating in the scheme, etc., so that members of the public on the Mainland and in Hong Kong can eventually drive between the two places without any worry” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-kin’s amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Cyd HO moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; to delete “, and accord priority to addressing the needs of local pregnant women” after “for ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’” and substitute with “before fully consulting Hong Kong people on the formulation of a population policy, so as to ensure the provision of adequate obstetric services for local pregnant women and mainland pregnant women whose spouses are Hong Kong permanent residents”; to delete “and” after “resident pregnant women’;”; and to add “; and (d) while promoting tourism visits to Hong Kong on the Mainland, to introduce Hong Kong’s social order and spirit of the rule of law to mainland residents, and promote to them Hong Kong’s experience in areas such as political participation, administrative management, economic development, social diversity as well as cultural innovation, etc” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Cyd HO’s amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; and to delete “self-drive tour plan for mainlanders' vehicles” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “trial scheme on one-off ad hoc quotas for Guangdong/Hong Kong cross-boundary private cars (the self-drive tour scheme), and fully consult the public on the scheme”.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and five abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; to delete “China-Hong Kong” after “gradual growth of”; to add “among some people” after “animosity”; to delete “on the Mainland and in Hong Kong” after “the masses” and substitute with “in the two places”; to delete “; and” after “of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’”

and substitute with “, and to impose penalties on ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ who rush to accident and emergency departments for delivery; (c) to strengthen co-operation with the Mainland for combating agencies which assist in providing falsified documents, provide falsified information, or engage in abetting and assisting mainland pregnant women in concealing their pregnancy for evading inspections at border crossings; (d) in the event that all administrative measures fail to effectively resolve the problem of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ giving birth in Hong Kong, to seek interpretation of the Basic Law by the Standing Committee of the National People’s Congress, so as to resolve the problem at root; and”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(e)”; and to delete “to shelve the self-drive tour plan for mainlanders’ vehicles” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “to expeditiously conduct a review after the implementation of the first phase of the Guangdong/Hong Kong cross-boundary self-drive scheme, and to decide whether to launch the second phase of the scheme after seeking Hong Kong people’s views and obtaining a consensus in society”.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion:

To add “all along,” after “That”; to delete “contingency” after “following”; to delete “(a) to allocate additional resources for improving obstetric services, suspend the quota for ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’, and accord priority to addressing the needs of local pregnant women; (b) to step up law enforcement and enhance entry restrictions to comprehensively block the entry of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’; and” after “places:”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(a)”; and to add “; (b)

to study amending Article 24 of the Basic Law to avoid the automatic entitlement to the right of abode in Hong Kong by Hong Kong-born children whose parents are both non-permanent Hong Kong resident Chinese citizens, so that the Government can formulate its own policy on mainlanders coming to Hong Kong for settlement; (c) to assess the demands arising from population growth in the next 30 years, project the numbers of mainland immigrants that Hong Kong can accommodate in the long run, thereby making plans for social resources; (d) to amend the Race Discrimination Ordinance to broaden the definition of ‘race’, so as to ensure that mainland Chinese coming to Hong Kong are subject to no discrimination, thus enabling the Ordinance to have a wider ambit while closely following the requirements of the relevant international convention; and (e) to enhance civic education so that the community can resolve China-Hong Kong conflicts in a rational manner” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau’s amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion:

To delete “suspend the quota for ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’” after “improving obstetric services,” and substitute with “resolve the problem of ‘doubly non-permanent resident pregnant women’ by enacting local legislation”; and to delete “to step up law enforcement and enhance entry restrictions” after “(b)” and substitute with “by amending the Immigration Ordinance (Cap. 115),”.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN’s amendment to Hon Ronny TONG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, nine against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, five against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Strengthening the support for persons suffering from dementia and their carers

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That dementia (also known as ‘腦退化症’ or ‘癡呆症’ in the Chinese rendition) is a disease suffered by many people and it has wide-ranging effects and exerts heavy caring pressure on their family members; although the Chief Executive had respectively mentioned in the Policy Addresses for 2010-11 and 2011-12 that the services for persons suffering from dementia would be improved and increased, the situation has not shown any concrete improvements; with population ageing, the number of persons suffering from dementia in Hong Kong has continued to increase, but the Government all along lacks a long-term and comprehensive policy, and the support and resources provided are not sufficient to cope with the relevant demand, thus making such persons unable to receive appropriate treatment and care; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) co-ordinate the complementarity and collaboration between healthcare and welfare services, and formulate an inter-departmental, long-term and comprehensive policy to address the problem of dementia;
- (b) provide timely diagnosis, assessment, treatment and follow-up services for persons suffering from dementia, and set up dedicated day care and support centres for such persons so as to enable those persons in need to receive appropriate care;
- (c) immediately increase the service quota of residential care homes for the elderly and day care centres for the elderly as well as extend their service hours and increase their manpower, so as to shorten the waiting time of users;
- (d) introduce a carer allowance and emotional counselling services to strengthen the financial and mental support for family members and carers of persons suffering from dementia;
- (e) when designing residential care homes, take account of users' needs and devise facilities convenient to persons suffering from dementia;
- (f) establish a database on persons suffering from dementia to facilitate more in-depth studies and statistical analyses on the conditions of such patients, and promptly assist them in receiving appropriate help when necessary;
- (g) provide training to the relevant professionals to enhance their professional knowledge of treating, diagnosing and handling, etc. persons suffering from dementia; and
- (h) enhance education for the whole community in relation to dementia with a view to detecting persons suffering from dementia in the community at an early stage, facilitating early treatment of the disease and easing patients' conditions.

While Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Dr Hon Joseph LEE and Hon Alan LEONG, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health as well as the Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

A Member and Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:21 pm, while Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five other Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU declared that he had provided architectural designs for many residential care homes, including care and attention homes for the blind, persons suffering from dementia and people with special needs, as well as homes for the elderly.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health as well as the Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; and to delete “dedicated day care and support centres for such persons” after “set up” and substitute with “and subsidize day care, assessment and support centres providing services specifically for persons suffering from dementia,”.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon Joseph LEE to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "set up care and attention homes for people suffering from dementia, design and set up dedicated and comprehensive care services and ancillary facilities for such homes, and at the same time" after "(c) immediately"; to add "and serve as a buffer" after "waiting time of users"; to add "introduce a carer empowerment programme and establish integrated community support services for strengthening carers' practical caring skills and providing appropriate support, and" after "(d)"; to delete "when designing residential care homes, take account of users' needs and devise facilities convenient to persons suffering from dementia" after "(e)" and substitute with "in establishing care and attention homes for people suffering from dementia and residential care homes for the elderly, introduce a multi-tiered care model for their environments and designs, so as to cater for different needs of persons suffering from varying degree of dementia"; and to delete "dementia with a view to" after "whole community in relation to" and substitute with "brain health and dementia so that the public may make prevention, and further strengthen the relevant primary healthcare services with a view to".

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi's and Dr Hon Joseph LEE's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi as well as Dr Hon Joseph LEE, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "(i) set up support centres for people suffering from dementia in the 18 districts to provide counselling, emotional support and referral services, etc., assist and support carers in respect of their needs for long-term care, provide health education and organize social functions and recreational activities, etc., so as to enable the patients and carers to stay in touch with the community; (j) establish outreach service teams comprising medical practitioners, community nurses and social workers, etc. to pay regular visits to patients

receiving home care as well as follow up their conditions and keep contacts with them proactively, so as to expeditiously provide appropriate assistance to patients and carers in need; and (k) set up integrated clinics with multidisciplinary services, and having regard to different needs at different times of persons suffering from dementia who also suffer from other diseases or even chronic diseases, put forward appropriate treatment proposals, so as to reduce patients' need to visit different hospital departments" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Dr Hon Joseph LEE proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi, Dr Hon Joseph LEE and Hon Alan LEONG put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 29 February 2012 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:03 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

21 August 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:02:01 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	26	
投票 Vote	22	25	
贊成 Yes	4	14	
反對 No	10	7	
棄權 Abstain	8	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:05:01 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 黃國健議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-KIN TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	26	
投票 Vote	22	25	
贊成 Yes	15	9	
反對 No	7	13	
棄權 Abstain	0	3	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:07:47 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 何秀蘭議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CYD HO TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭 Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	25	
投票 Vote	22	24	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	11	6	
棄權 Abstain	4	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:09:53 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 黃成智議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG SING-CHI TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	26	
投票 Vote	22	25	
贊成 Yes	5	14	
反對 No	13	6	
棄權 Abstain	4	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:12:08 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 陳克勤議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN HAK-KAN TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	25	
投票 Vote	22	24	
贊成 Yes	15	8	
反對 No	6	16	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-lat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:14:12 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 梁家驪議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON LEUNG KA-LAU TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	25	
投票 Vote	22	24	
贊成 Yes	6	14	
反對 No	8	6	
棄權 Abstain	8	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:16:17 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員對湯家驊議員的「重申香港核心價值」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT CHAN TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	25	
投票 Vote	22	24	
贊成 Yes	6	16	
反對 No	11	5	
棄權 Abstain	5	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kyong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kyong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
 日期 DATE: 22/02/2012
 時間 TIME: 06:18:28 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 「重申香港核心價值」議案
 MOTION ON "REITERATING HONG KONG'S CORE VALUES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	25	
投票 Vote	22	24	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	9	5	
棄權 Abstain	6	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK