立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1085/11-12 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/3/08/1

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday, 17 January 2012, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present: Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)

Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

Hon LEE Wing-tat

Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH Hon CHAN Hak-kan Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP Hon Tanya CHAN

Member absent : Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Public officers attending

: For item I

Dr Kitty POON

Under Secretary for the Environment

Mr MOK Wai-chuen

Assistant Director (Air Policy)

Environmental Protection Department

Mr Edmond HO

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Mobile

Source Control)

Environmental Protection Department

Mr Sunny FU Senior Engineer Traffic Engineering (Hong Kong) Division Transport Department

Mr David CHAN Senior Engineer Priority Railway Division Transport Department

Mr Ronnie MAK Senior Estate Surveyor/HQ1 (Headquarters Section) Lands Department

Mr Joseph CHAN Senior Engineer/Gas Standards Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

For item II

Dr Kitty POON
Under Secretary for the Environment

Mr MOK Wai-chuen Assistant Director (Air Policy) Environmental Protection Department

Mr Edmond HO
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Mobile Source Control)
Environmental Protection Department

Attendance by invitation

: Individual

Mr Jacky LIM

The Kowloon Taxi Owners Association Ltd

Mr YUM Tai-ping

Tai Wo Motors Ltd

Mr Aaron NG

Hong Kong Kowloon Taxi & Lorry Owners' Association Ltd

Mr WONG Po-keung Chairman

N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association

Mr WONG Wing-chung Chairman

Motor Transport Workers General Union

Mr LOW Shih-cheng Taxi Driver Branch

Individual

Mr Martin OEI Political Commentator

<u>United Friendship Taxi Owners & Drivers Association</u> Ltd

Mr LAU Seck-hai

Individual

Mr CHAN Man-kin

Taxi Drivers & Operators Association

Mr NG Yip-pui General Secretary

CTOD Association Company Ltd

Mr Thomson CHONG Chairman

Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group

Mr LAI Ming-hung Chairman **Clerk in attendance:** Miss Becky YU

Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in attendance : Mrs Mary TANG

Senior Council Secretary (1)1

Miss Jacqueline CHUNG Council Secretary (1)1

I. Measures to improve liquefied petroleum gas refilling services

Meeting with deputations

The Chairman invited views from the following deputations -

- (a) Mr Jacky LIM LC Paper No. CB(1) 868/11-12(01) (Chinese version only)
- (b) The Kowloon Taxi Owners Association Ltd
- (c) Tai Wo Motors Ltd
- (d) Hong Kong Kowloon Taxi & Lorry Owners' Association Ltd
- (e) N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association
- (f) Motor Transport Workers General Union
- (g) Mr Martin OEI LC Paper No. CB(1) 933/11-12(01) (Chinese version only)
- (h) United Friendship Taxi Owners & Drivers Association Ltd LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(01) (Chinese version only)
- (i) Mr CHAN Man-kin
- (j) Taxi Drivers & Operators Association
- (k) CTOD Association Company Ltd
- (1) Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group LC Paper No. CB(1) 868/11-12(02) (Chinese version only) LC Paper No. CB(1) 933/11-12(02) (Chinese version only)

2. <u>Members</u> also noted the following submissions from deputations not attending the meeting -

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(02) — Submission from Kamalie Ltd (Chinese version only);

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(03) — Submission from Hong Kong Taxi Owners' Association Ltd (Chinese version only);

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(04) — Submission from Association for the Rights of Liberty Taxi Drivers (Chinese version only);

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(05) — Submission from Designing Hong Kong;

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(06) — Submission from 楊小壁地區服務社 (Chinese version only);

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(07) — Submission from ExxonMobil Hong Kong Ltd (English version only); and

LC Paper No. CB(1) 933/11-12(03) — Submission from Association for the Rights of Taxi Drivers (Chinese version only)

Meeting with the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(08) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 24 November 2011

LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(09) — Administration's response to CB(1) 846/11-12(08))

Relevant paper

LC Paper No. CB(1) 394/11-12(02) — Administration's paper on a proposal (issued for the meeting on 24 November 2011) — Administration's paper on a proposal to expand the liquefied petroleum gas filling network

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached in **Annex**).

- 4. The <u>Administration</u> was requested to -
 - (a) advise the incentives/subsidies which the Administration had provided to dedicated liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) filling stations, and whether the service providers had fulfilled their obligations in relation to these incentives/subsidies;
 - (b) advise whether there was a cap on LPG supply for each dedicated LPG filling station;
 - (c) advise the terms in the contract for dedicated LPG filling station in relation to service provision, particularly those which could facilitate the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) to monitor the services of LPG filling stations, and the feasibility of including an additional requirement in the contract specifying the utility rate of LPG filling nozzles. In this connection, EMSD should conduct surveys on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles at popular dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations during rush hours over the next three months, and compare the findings with the information gathered from service providers for the past three months. To also advise whether EMSD could mandate the provision of information by service providers under the contract;
 - (d) advise the EMSD's hotline through which the transport trades could lodge complaints against malpractices of dedicated LPG filling stations, particularly on shutting down of LPG filling nozzles, and the actions to be taken by EMSD upon receipt of complaints as well as the consequences of the service providers if the complaints were substantiated. To also provide statistics/details of past complaint cases;
 - (d) advise whether the Administration had further plans to increase the number of LPG nozzles in the Hong Kong Island to facilitate an even distribution of LPG nozzles across the territory;
 - (e) advise the feasibility of applying a uniform LPG price across the board to both dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and
 - (g) provide a paper comparing all the relevant information on the emission performance between LPG and Euro V/VI vehicles.

II. Any other business

Retrofitting of separate air-conditioning system for vehicles while engines are switched off

- (LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(10) List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 6 January 2012
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(11) Administration's response to CB(1) 846/11-12(10)
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(12) Supplementary information provided by Hong Kong Productivity Council regarding the Automatic Engine Idle-stop and Supplementary Air-conditioning System (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 877/11-12(01) Supplementary information provided by The Hong Kong Polytechnic University regarding the Solar Powered Air-conditioning System for Vehicles (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 831/11-12(01) Submission from N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association (LC Paper No. CB(1) 831/11-12(01)) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 933/11-12(04) Hong Kong Productivity Council's response to submission from N. W.

 Area Taxi Drivers & Operators

 Association (LC Paper No. CB(1) 831/11-12(01)) (Chinese version only)
- 5. <u>Members</u> agreed that the next meeting would be held on Tuesday, 21 February 2012, at 8:30 am to discuss the following -
 - (a) Retrofitting of separate air-conditioning system for vehicles while engines are switched off; and
 - (b) Measures to improve liquefied petroleum gas refilling services.

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:35 am.

Council Business Division 1 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 21 March 2012

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

Proceedings of the meeting on Tuesday, 17 January 2012, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required | | |
|-------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|--|--|
| Agenda Item I - M | Agenda Item I - Measures to improve liquefied petroleum gas refilling services | | | | |
| 000602 - 000728 | Chairman | Opening remarks | | | |
| 000729 - 001215 | Mr Jacky LIM | Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 868/11-12(01)) - (a) strongly criticized the Administration's proposal to set up a new LPG filling station near to the Tai Po Industrial Estate, given its close proximity to facilities with high risk of fire, including Tai Po Towngas Plant and Hong Kong Oxygen & Acetylene Company Limited; (b) the proposal of setting up a non-dedicated LPG filling station at Tin Wan would give rise to traffic problems as Tin Wan Praya Road was the only access to Wah | | | |
| | | Kwai Estate; (c) the proposed non-dedicated LPG filling station at Fung Mat Road would further aggregate the problem of traffic congestion in the area, given that there were already long queues of taxis and public light buses (PLBs) at the dedicated LPG filling station at the junction of Connaught Road West and Water Street at the time of shift-changing; (d) the setting up of three additional non-dedicated LPG filling stations was unable to meet the demand of some 18 000 LPG taxis and 2 300 LPG PLBs generating 40 000 vehicle trips for refilling, given a minimum of two times per day each vehicle; | | | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | (e) to resolve the problem of inadequate LPG filling facilities, consideration should be given to re-introducing diesel taxis to Hong Kong through legislative amendments. | |
| 001216 - 001446 | Mr YUM Tai-ping, The Kowloon Taxi Owners Association Ltd | (a) long queues at dedicated LPG filling stations due to the difference in price of LPG between dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and(b) the Administration should waive | |
| | | the land premium for LPG filling nozzles provided at non-dedicated LPG filling stations, and require the operators to adopt the same LPG price as dedicated LPG filling stations. | |
| 001447 - 001614 | Mr Aaron NG, Tai Wo Motors Ltd | (a) to bridge the price difference between dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations, consideration should be given to providing incentives (such as tax concessions) to operators of non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (b) the Administration should consider the feasibility of re-introducing diesel taxi to Hong Kong as the emission performance of new diesel vehicles was comparable to that of petrol vehicles as a result of technological advancement. | |
| 001615 - 002131 | Mr WONG Po-keung, Hong Kong Kowloon Taxi & Lorry Owners' Association Ltd | Expression of views - (a) concern about the uneven distribution of LPG filling facilities across the territory, particularly in Hong Kong Island. To this end, consideration should be given to identifying suitable sites for dedicated LPG filling stations in Sheung Wan, Aberdeen, and North | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | Point (near to Taikoo Shing), as well as increasing the number of LPG filling nozzles at existing non-dedicated LPG filling stations, including the one at Wong Nai Chung Gap Road; | |
| | | (b) safety issues in relation to provision of dedicated LPG filling stations could be addressed through close monitoring and control of service providers by the Administration; | |
| | | (c) efforts should be made to avoid disruption of LPG supply due to revalidation work of underground LPG tanks; | |
| | | (d) the price of LPG at non-dedicated LPG filling stations would come down with the provision of more LPG filling facilities due to market competition; and | |
| | | (e) diesel taxis might not be feasible given that both the capital and fuel costs of diesel taxis were higher than that of LPG ones. | |
| 002132 - 002702 | Mr WONG Wing-chung, N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association | Expression of views - Measures to improve LPG refilling services | |
| | | (a) consideration should be given to including a provision in the contracts upon re-tendering of existing sites of non-dedicated LPG filling stations requiring operators to adopt the same LPG price as dedicated LPG filling stations; | |
| | | (b) long queues at dedicated LPG filling stations might be attributed to the failure of operators to optimize their resources such as staff members; | |
| | | Retrofitting of separate air-conditioning (A/C) system for | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | vehicles while engines are switched off (LC Paper No. CB(1) 831/11-12(01)) (c) there were difficulties in obtaining funding from the Environment and Conservation Fund to try out the A/C system developed by the Hong Kong Productivity Council which had also declined to provide technical support; (d) the Administration should subsidize the full cost of retrofitting of separate A/C system, since it was not fair to require the transport trades to absorb the additional costs incurred from various government environmental initiatives, particularly when the | |
| | | Transport Department had declined the proposal of fare increase put forward by the taxi trade. | |
| 002703 -003140 | Mr LOW Shih-cheng Motor Transport Workers General Union (Union) | (a) despite that the taxi trade had staggered their refilling hours, the existing LPG refilling network (comprising 12 dedicated and 50 non-dedicated LPG filling stations) was far from enough to meet the demand. This was evidenced by the long queues at dedicated LPG filling station at popular locations. The limited supply of LPG at non-dedicated LPG refilling stations (such as the one at North Point) had further aggravated the problem; (b) to tackle the queuing problem, consideration should be given to providing additional dedicated LPG filling stations; (c) to bridge the difference of LPG price between dedicated and | |
| | | non-dedicated LPG refilling stations, the Administration should waive the land premium for the LPG filling nozzles provided at non-dedicated LPG filling stations. | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | It should also consider adopting a uniform LPG price across the board for both dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (d) red PLBs were denied access to dedicated LPG filling stations located in restricted areas. Consideration should be given to relaxing the restriction so that red PLBs could benefit from the lower LPG price. | |
| 003141 - 003652 | Mr Martin OEI | Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 933/11-12(01)) - | |
| | | (a) the proposed non-dedicated LPG filling station at Tin Wan (Praya Road) would obstruct the only access to Wah Kwai Estate. There were also safety concern about erosion of LPG tanks given its close proximity to the sea; | |
| | | (b) the proposed non-dedicated LPG filling station at Fung Mat Road was also not desirable as it would further aggregate the traffic congestion problem in the Western District; and | |
| | | (c) should allow re-introduction of diesel taxis and PLB given that the emission performance of Euro V diesel vehicles was comparable to that of LPG vehicles. Besides, the maneuverability of diesel vehicles was better than that of LPG vehicles which tended to stall at hilly terrain. | |
| 003653 - 004100 | Mr LAU Seck-hai, United Friendship Taxi Owners & Drivers | Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(01)) - | |
| | Association Ltd | (a) the inadequate supply and uneven geographical distribution of dedicated LPG filling stations were unable to meet the demand of the LPG taxi fleet. The problem was further aggravated as some | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | operators would shut down their LPG filling nozzles. It was worth noting that only 25% of LPG filling nozzles were operational outside peak hours at dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (b) the queuing problem was mainly due to the difference of 8-10% in LPG price between dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations. To this end, consideration should be given to imposing a uniform LPG price across the board for both dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations. | |
| 004101 - 004258 | Mr CHAN Man-kin | Expression of views - | |
| | | (a) some of the LPG filling nozzles at dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations were shut down without a reasonable excuse; | |
| | | (b) whether service providers, particularly those of dedicated LPG filling stations, were obliged to make available certain percentage of LPG filling nozzles for use at all time; and | |
| | | (c) concern about the cap on LPG supply for certain LPG filling stations. | |
| 004259 - 004414 | Mr NG Yip-pui, Taxi Drivers & Operators Association | Consideration should be given to applying a uniform LPG price to non-dedicated LPG filling stations at \$0.3/litre higher than dedicated LPG filling stations. | |
| 004415 - 004539 | Mr Thomson CHONG, CTOD Association Company Ltd | Expression of views - (a) there was only one dedicated LPG filling station in Chai Wan providing 24 LPG filling nozzles. The situation was further aggravated when some of the nozzles were shut down, resulting in a long queue during shift-changing hours; | |

| | (b) Electrical and Mechanical Services | |
|-----------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Department (EMSD) had failed to monitor the performance of service providers; and (c) there should be a channel through which the transport trades could lodge complaints against malpractices of dedicated LPG filling stations, particularly on the shutting down of LPG filling nozzles, to EMSD for follow-up action. | |
| Mr LAI Ming-hung, Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group | Expression of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(1) 868/11-12(02) and CB(1) 933/11-12(02)) - | |
| | (a) it was worth noting that at the Council meeting on 10 January 2001, the Administration stated that incentives had been provided to existing petrol filling stations suitable for retrofitting with LPG filling facilities at the outset of the LPG vehicle programme. However, these non-dedicated LPG filling stations were now reluctant to provide LPG filling services because it was more profitable to sell petrol than LPG; | |
| | (b) the demand of some 22 000 LPG taxis and PLBs for LPG re-filling could be fulfilled if all the 444 LPG filling nozzles at 12 dedicated and 50 non-dedicated LPG filling stations were full operational. To monitor the services of LPG filling stations, EMSD should compile monthly statistics on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles at dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; (c) to resolve the queuing problem, consideration could be given to applying a uniform LPG price across the board to both dedicated | |
| , | Taxi & P.L.B. Concern | (c) there should be a channel through which the transport trades could lodge complaints against malpractices of dedicated LPG filling stations, particularly on the shutting down of LPG filling nozzles, to EMSD for follow-up action. Mr LAI Ming-hung, Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group Expression of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(1) 868/11-12(02) and CB(1) 933/11-12(02)) - (a) it was worth noting that at the Council meeting on 10 January 2001, the Administration stated that incentives had been provided to existing petrol filling stations suitable for retrofitting with LPG filling facilities at the outset of the LPG vehicle programme. However, these non-dedicated LPG filling stations were now reluctant to provide LPG filling services because it was more profitable to sell petrol than LPG; (b) the demand of some 22 000 LPG taxis and PLBs for LPG re-filling could be fulfilled if all the 444 LPG filling stations were full operational. To monitor the services of LPG filling stations, EMSD should compile monthly statistics on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles at dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; (c) to resolve the queuing problem, consideration could be given to applying a uniform LPG price |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | (d) consideration should be given to re-introducing Euro V diesel taxis. | |
| 005050 - 010319 | Chairman | Administration's response - | |
| | Administration | LPG filling network (a) the 12 dedicated LPG filling stations were set up to accelerate the formation of the LPG filling network at the outset of the LPG vehicle programme; | |
| | | (b) it was difficult to identify suitable sites, particularly in urban area, for dedicated LPG filling stations given the limited land supply and the more stringent safety requirements for LPG filling facilities than petrol filling facilities; | |
| | | (c) it had been the Administration's policy to rely on non-dedicated LPG filling stations to expand the LPG filling network. To improve the overall provision of LPG filling facilities, it was proposed to require LPG filling nozzles at non-dedicated LPG filling stations (including new sites and old sites upon expiry of their current land leases) accounting for a minimum of 25% of their nozzles, subject to safety and practicability considerations. It was expected that the total number of LPG filling nozzles would be increased by 102, subject to the meeting with the above-mentioned safety and practicability considerations, if LPG filling facilities were added to petrol filling stations that were suitable to provide LPG refilling but had not been doing so, thereby increasing the total number of LPG nozzles from 444 to 546 in 2018; | |
| | | and (d) a study on the feasibility of setting up a new non-dedicated LPG filling station in Tai Po would be | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-------------|---------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | undertaken. | |
| | | LPG pricing | |
| | | (e) LPG prices at the 12 dedicated LPG filling stations were capped according to a pricing formula in their Design-Build-Operate contract with the Administration in return for no land premium being required, while LPG price at non-dedicated LPG filling stations was set having regard to the prevailing market price as these stations were operated on commercial principles; | |
| | | (f) it was believed that operators of non-dedicated LPG filling stations would set the LPG price at a more competitive level as the number of LPG filling nozzles was increased from 17% to 25% of the total number of filling nozzles at all non-dedicated LPG filling stations; | |
| | | <u>Diesel taxi</u> | |
| | | (g) the emission performance of LPG vehicles, particularly in respect of nitrogen oxides (NO _x) emission, was better than diesel vehicles. According to a vehicle emission database of the United Kingdom (UK), Euro V diesel vehicles, which were suitable for use as taxi, emitted on average five times more NO _x than LPG vehicles; | |
| | | (h) in view of the considerable gap in NO _x emission between LPG and diesel vehicles due to technological constraint, EU had allowed in its Euro V emission standards diesel vehicles to emit two times more NO _x than LPG vehicles; and | |
| | | (i) in view of the better emission performance of LPG vehicles, the Administration had no plan to re-introduce diesel taxis to Hong Kong in the meantime. Besides, | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | the sales prices of the few models of diesel private car currently available in the local market that were of comparable emission performance to their LPG counterparts were so high that they were unlikely acceptable by the taxi trade. Notwithstanding, the use of diesel taxis would be considered when their emission performance met the relevant emission standards. | |
| 010320 - 011342 | Ms Miriam LAU Administration Chairman | Ms Miriam LAU's enquiries - (a) as the Administration had provided subsidies to dedicated LPG filling stations, whether the service providers were required to fulfill certain obligations in relation to these subsidies, such as the need to achieve a specific utility rate for LPG filling nozzles and to report non-compliant cases; (b) whether there were complaints about shut down of LPG filling nozzles without a reasonable excuse at non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and (c) EMSD's hotline through which the transport trade could lodge complaints against malpractices of dedicated LPG filling stations, particularly on shutting down of LPG filling nozzles, and the actions to be taken by EMSD upon receipt of complaints as well as the consequences of the service providers if the complaints were substantiated. Chairman's enquiry on the feasibility of including an additional requirement in the contract specifying the utility rate of LPG filling nozzles. Administration's response - (a) under the 21-year Design-Build-Operate contract | The Administration to advise - (a) the feasibility of including an additional requirement in the contract specifying the utility rate of LPG filling nozzles; and (b) the EMSD's hotline through which the transport trades could lodge complaints against malpractices of dedicated LPG filling stations, particularly on shutting down of LPG filling nozzles, and the actions to be taken by EMSD upon receipt of complaints as well as the consequences of the service providers if the complaints were substantiated. |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | signed between the respective operators of dedicated LPG filling stations and the Administration, the former was required to ensure smooth operation of the dedicated LPG filling stations and provide a reasonable level of services, albeit not a fixed utility rate for LPG filling nozzles. The operators had to provide justification in the event of shutting down of LPG filling nozzles; | |
| | | (b) apart from regular meetings with service providers to review their performances, efforts would be stepped up to monitor the utility rate of LPG filling nozzles at dedicated LPG filling stations. Meanwhile, the transport trades could lodge complaints against malpractices, particularly on shutting down of LPG filling nozzles to EMSD for necessary follow-up actions; and | |
| | | (c) the information contained in item (3) of LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(09) referred to the percentage share of average daily LPG sales rather than the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles. | |
| 011343 - 011834 | Mr CHAN Kin-por Administration Chairman | Mr CHAN Kin-por's views/enquiries - (a) the Administration should endeavour to address the trade's concern on the price gap between dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations, and the problem of shutting down of LPG filling nozzles at dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations. More efforts should be made to enhance monitoring on the utility rate of LPG filling stations, and remind the service providers of their obligations; | The Administration to - (a) advise the feasibility of applying a uniform LPG price across the board for both dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and (b) provide statistics/ details of past |
| | | (b) statistics/details of past complaint cases on malpractices of operators | complaint cases. |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | of dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (c) the feasibility of applying a uniform LPG price across the board for both dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations. If not, whether a uniform LPG price at an acceptable level could be applied to non-dedicated LPG filling stations. | |
| | | Administration's response - | |
| | | (a) LPG price at dedicated LPG filling stations was subject to a pricing formula; and | |
| | | (b) it was believed that operators of non-dedicated LPG filling stations would set the LPG price at a more competitive level as the number of LPG filling nozzles was increased from 17% to 25% of the total number of filling nozzles at all non-dedicated LPG filling stations. | |
| 011835 - 012058 | Chairman Administration | Chairman's enquiry on whether non-dedicated LPG filling stations were reluctant to provide LPG filling services because it was more profitable to sell petrol than LPG, despite that they had received subsidies from the Administration for retrofitting of LPG filling facilities. | |
| | | Administration's clarification - | |
| | | (a) no incentives/subsidies had been provided to non-dedicated LPG filling stations for the installation of LPG filling facilities except that the Administration had extended the leases of 29 petrol filling stations to cover the installation cost so as to enable the LPG filling network to take shape at the beginning of the LPG vehicle programme; and | |
| | | (b) it was believed that operators of non-dedicated LPG filling stations | |

| | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | would optimize the use of LPG filling nozzles to recoup the costs of investment and maintenance. | |
| 012059 - 012900 | Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman Ms Miriam LAU | Mr KAM Nai-wai's views/enquires - (a) EMSD should conduct surveys on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles at popular dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations during rush hours over the next three months; (b) whether operators of dedicated LPG filling stations would be subject to penalty in the event of non-compliance with the contractual obligations on service provisions; and (c) how red LPG minibus could have access to dedicated LPG filling stations located in restricted areas. Ms Miriam LAU's request for relaxing the restrictions on red minibus for LPG filling purpose. Administration's response - (a) EMSD had conducted spot checks on dedicated LPG filling stations and continually reminded service providers to make available LPG filling nozzles as far as possible; and (b) Transport Department would look into the feasibility of relaxing the restrictions on red LPG minibus for LPG filling purpose, and report to the Subcommittee on the outcome in due course. | The Administration to conduct surveys on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles at popular dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations during rush hours over the next three months. |
| 012901 - 013829 | Miss Tanya CHAN Administration Chairman | Miss Tanya CHAN's views/enquiries - (a) whether EMSD could mandate the provision of information by operators under the contract, given that one operator of LPG filling station had failed to provide its sales information to the | The Administration to advise - (a) whether EMSD could mandate the provision of information by service providers |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-------------|---------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | Administration as revealed from LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(09); | under the contract; |
| | | (b) apart from surveys on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles over the next three months, EMSD should compare the findings with the information gathered from service providers for the past three months; | (b) EMSD to compare the findings from its surveys on the utility rates of LPG filling nozzles over the next three months with the |
| | | (c) whether the Administration would set up additional dedicated LPG filling stations given the uneven geographical distribution of dedicated LPG filling stations, and whether it had further plans to increase the number of LPG filling nozzles in the Hong Kong Island to facilitate an even distribution of LPG filling nozzles across the territory; and | information gathered from service providers for the past three months; and (c) whether the Administration had further plans to increase the number of LPG nozzles in the |
| | | (d) efforts should be made to ensure seamless transition in re-tendering of old sites of non-dedicated LPG filling stations upon expiry of the current land leases for continued supply of LPG, and to minimize undue disruption to LPG supply during cleansing of oil tanks. | Hong Kong Island to facilitate an even distribution of LPG nozzles across the territory. |
| | | Administration's response - | |
| | | (a) at present, there were 88 LPG filling nozzles in the Hong Kong Island, 112 in Kowloon and 244 in the New Territories; | |
| | | (b) it was difficult to identify suitable sites, particularly in urban area, for dedicated LPG filling stations given the limited land supply and the more stringent safety requirements for LPG filling facilities than petrol filling facilities. Notwithstanding, effort would be made to identify potential sites for non-dedicated LPG filling stations; | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | (c) to expand the LPG filling network, a minimum requirement for LPG filling facilities at 25% of the nozzles (subject to safety and practicability considerations) in non-dedicated LPG filling stations would be included in the tender conditions of new sites and old sites upon expiry of their current land lease; and | |
| | | (d) there would be close liaison among the Lands Department (LandsD), the Environment Bureau (ENB) and other relevant government departments in re-tendering of existing petrol-cum-LPG (PLPG) sites. Invitation for tenders would be issued before expiry of the existing PLPG with a view to awarding the contract at the earliest possible time. | |
| | | Chairman's enquiry on the reason for the Shell Hong Kong Ltd to decline the Administration's request for information. | |
| | | Administration's response that the Shell Hong Kong Ltd decided not to provide the required information after seeking legal advice. | |
| 013830 - 014214 | Mr CHAN Hak-kan Administration Chairman | Mr CHAN Hak-kan's views - (a) service providers should be urged to proper maintain and repair their LPG filling nozzles, which were essential to the smooth and safe operation of LPG filling stations; (b) in the event of breakdown of LPG | |
| | | filling nozzles, EMSD should examine the causes of breakdown, and apprise the transport trades of the situation so that they could use other LPG filling stations. | |
| | | Administration's response - (a) EMSD had monitored the | |
| | | operation of dedicated LPG filling | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | stations, conducted site visits, found out the causes of breakdown of LPG filling nozzles, and held meetings with service providers to review their services and identify areas for improvement, where appropriate. Service providers had been continually urged to complete the repair works at the earliest; and (b) The Administration would review complaint cases regarding filling stations, take appropriate measures against malpractices, and would | |
| | | look into the arrangements on dissemination of information to the transport trades. | |
| 014215 - 014442 | Chairman Administration | Chairman's enquiries - (a) whether there was a cap on LPG supply for each dedicated LPG filling station; and (b) the feasibility of imposing a minimum requirement of 25% of the nozzles for LPG filling facilities as raised by ExxonMobil Hong Kong Limited in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1) 846/11-12(07)). Administration's response - (a) for safety reasons, a cap on LPG supply had been imposed on Feoso Java Road North Point non-dedicated LPG filling station after risk assessment; and (b) the minimum requirement for LPG filling facilities at 25% of the nozzles would be subject to fulfillment of the necessary safety requirements and technical feasibility of individual sites concerned. | Administration to advise whether there was a cap on LPG supply for each dedicated LPG filling station. |
| 014443 - 014603 | Mr LAI Ming-hung, Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group | The Administration had provided incentives/subsidies (in the form of tenancy extension/waiving of land | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| | | premium) to operators of petrol filling stations which were suitable for retrofitting with LPG filling facilities. However, they had failed to fulfill their obligations in relation to these incentives/subsidies. | |
| 014604 - 014633 | CHAN Man-kin | Not convinced of the difficulties in identifying suitable sites for dedicated LPG filling stations in urban area due to safety reasons. | |
| 014634 - 014755 | Mr Jacky LIM | Expression of views – (a) the Administration's allegation that Euro V diesel vehicle emitted five times more NO _x than LPG vehicle was unfound. In fact, NO _x emission standard of Euro V diesel vehicle was three times higher than that of LPG vehicle. Consideration should be given to conducting an inquiry on Mr MOK Wai-chuen, Assistant Director (Air Policy) Environmental Protection Department for disseminating false information in accordance with the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382); and (b) the emission control system of diesel vehicles was more reliable than that of petrol and LPG vehicles. | |
| 014756 - 014901 | Mr WONG Wing-chung, N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association | (a) to bridge the price gap between dedicated and non-dedicated LPG filling stations, consideration should be given to providing the latter with incentives/subsidies for the LPG filling nozzles; and (b) LPG filling stations should be required to report on breaking/shutting down of LPG filling nozzles. | |
| 014902 - 014920 | Chairman | Extension of the meeting time by | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | 15 minutes to allow extra time for discussion. | |
| 014921 - 015105 | Mr WONG Po-keung, Hong Kong Kowloon Taxi & Lorry Owners' Association Ltd | Expression of views - (a) the existing LPG filling facilities were inadequate to meet demand. Additional LPG filling facilities should be provided, particularly in the Hong Kong Island; | |
| | | (b) there was a need to address the difference in LPG price among non-dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (c) diesel vehicles were not suitable for use as taxis given the high sales price and fuel cost. | |
| 015106 - 015210 | Mr YUM Tai-ping, The Kowloon Taxi Owners Association Ltd | The shutting down of LPG filling nozzles at dedicated LPG filling stations seemed to have improved after service providers were allowed to adjust LPG price from once every six months to once every month, keeping more in pace with the movement of international LPG prices. | |
| 015211 - 015632 | Ms Miriam LAU Chairman | (a) another meeting to be held after the Chinese New Year holidays for Administration to report on the measures to ensure the provision of reasonable services by dedicated LPG filling stations; (b) the number and location of non-dedicated LPG filling stations which had received incentives/ subsidies from the Administration for retrofitting of LPG filling facilities at the outset of the LPG vehicle programme; and the reasons for not mandating these operators to provide LPG at a | The Administration to provide a paper comparing all the relevant information on the emission performance between LPG and Euro V/VI vehicles. |
| | | concessionary price; (c) re-consideration for waiving the land premium for LPG filling nozzles at non-dedicated LPG | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | filling stations. In return, the operators should be required to keep the LPG price at the same level as dedicated LPG filling stations; and | |
| | | (d) the Administration to provide a paper comparing all the relevant information on the emission performance between LPG and Euro V/VI vehicles for members' reference. | |
| 015633 - 015729 | Chairman Administration Ms Miriam LAU | Members' agreement to hold a meeting on 21 February 2012 to discuss the following - | |
| | | (a) Retrofitting of separate air-conditioning system for vehicles while engines are switched off; and | |
| | | (b) Measures to improve liquefied petroleum gas refilling services. | |
| 015730 - 020358 | Chairman Ms Miriam LAU Administration | Chairman's request for the Administration to advise the terms in the contract for dedicated LPG filling station in relation to service provision, particularly those which could facilitate EMSD to monitor the services of LPG filling stations. Ms Miriam LAU's request for the Administration to advise the incentives/subsidies which the Administration had provided to dedicated LPG filling stations, and whether the service providers had fulfilled their obligations in relation to these incentives/subsidies. | Administration to advise - (a) the terms in the contract for dedicated LPG filling station in relation to service provision, particularly those which could facilitate EMSD to monitor the services of LPG filling stations; and (b) the incentives/subsidies which the Administration |
| | | | Administration had provided to dedicated LPG filling stations, and whether the service providers had fulfilled their obligations in |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action required |
|-------------|---------|------------|------------------------------------------|
| | | | relation to these incentives/ subsidies. |

Council Business Division 1 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 21 March 2012