

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1) 2555/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/EA/1

Panel on Environmental Affairs

**Minutes of special meeting
held on Monday, 26 March 2012, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHAN Hak-kan (Chairman)
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Tanya CHAN

Members attending : Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Members absent : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Public officers attending : Mr Edward YAU
Secretary for the Environment

Mr Albert LAM
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)

Miss Linda CHOY
Political Assistant to Secretary for the Environment

Mr Elvis AU
Assistant Director (Nature Conservation &
Infrastructure Planning)
Environmental Protection Department

Dr Ellen CHAN
Assistant Director (Environmental Infrastructure)
Environmental Protection Department

Mr Samson LAI
Assistant Director (Waste Management Policy)
Environmental Protection Department

Attendance by invitation : Session 1

Friends of the Earth (HK)

Ms Michelle AU
Deputy Environmental Affairs Manager

Greeners Action

Mr Angus HO
Executive Director

Designing Hong Kong Limited

Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress
of Hong Kong

Mr Anderson CHEUNG
Deputy Spokesperson, Environment Affairs

Green Council

Ms Linda HO
Chief Executive Officer

2gather

Mr YEUNG Hoi-wing
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Outdoors

Dr Martin Williams
Director

Green Sense

Ms HO Ka-po
Project Manager

The Hong Kong Electronic Industries Association

Dr W K LO
Chairman, The Hong Kong Electronic Industries
Association Sustainable Development Subcommittee

The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers

Ir CHAN Fuk-cheung
President

Hong Kong Construction Association

Mr Ringo YU
Chairman of Environmental Committee

Living Islands Movement

Ms Louise PRESTON
Chairman

Individual

Mr YIP Man-pan

Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Professor POON Chi-sun

Advisory Council on the Environment

Professor LAM Kwan-sing, JP
Chairman

Champway Technology Limited

Mr Teddy CHOI
Executive Director

The Chartered Institution of Water and Environmental
Management

Dr Anthony MA
Chairman

Hong Kong Professionals And Senior Executives
Association

Mr TSE Wai-chuen
President

Session 2

Individual

Mr WONG Sin-hung

Kowloon Federation of Associations

Mr CHIU Kwok-wai
Deputy Chief Executive

German Industry and Commerce Greater China, Hong
Kong

Mr Wolfgang EHMANN
Executive Director

CSS Asia Pacific Limited

Mr Tom VINCENT
Chief Operating Officer

Individual

Ms Yolanda NG

Hong Kong Climate Change Forum

Dr Otto POON
Past Chairman

Individual

Mr LI Ka-leung

Chinese General Chamber of Commerce

Mr Philip FAN
Standing Committee Member

Youth Committee of New People's Party

Mr KAM Man-fung
Chairman

Clean Air Network

Mr Patrick FUNG
Campaign Officer

Kowloon West New Dynamic

Mr LAU Kin-shing
District Officer of Sham Shui Po

Hong Kong Waste Disposal Industry Association

Mr Eddie HUI
Secretary

Clear The Air

Mr Edwin TOWN
Vice-Chairman

The French Chamber of Commerce and Industry in
Hong Kong

Mr Charles d'HAUSSY
Vice-President of the Green Business Committee

Tai A Chau Fisherman Association

Mr KWOK Cheuk-kin
Chairman

Clerk in attendance : Miss Becky YU
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in attendance : Mrs Mary TANG
Senior Council Secretary (1)1

Miss Mandy POON
Legislative Assistant (1)1

Action

I. "Reduce, Recycle and Proper Waste Management"

With the aid of a power-point, the Secretary for the Environment (SEN) briefed members on the progress of the key initiatives under the Waste Management Strategy.

(Post-meeting note: A set of the power-point presentation materials was circulated vide LC Paper No. CB(1) 1429/11-12(01) on 27 March 2012.)

Session 1 (10:45 am - 11:45 am)

*Meeting with Friends of the Earth (HK) (FoE)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1393/11-12(01))*

2. Ms Michelle AU, Deputy Environmental Affairs Manager, said that FoE was opposed to the development of the Integrated Waste Management Facilities (IWMF) before the introduction of municipal solid waste (MSW) charging to provide a direct economic disincentive to waste generation, as evidenced by the experience in South Korea where MSW was reduced by 44% after the implementation of MSW charging. According to the survey on MSW charging conducted by the Public Opinion Programme of the University of Hong Kong, about 52% of the respondents were in favour of charging by volume of waste which was in line with the "polluter pays" principle. More efforts should be made to reduce waste at source as it was more economical when compared to incineration. In accordance with a waste management study conducted in 1996, the cost for waste reduction at source was \$150 per tonne while that for incineration was \$770 per tonne. The Audit Report in 2002 also pointed out that the quantifiable management cost of MSW would have been decreased by \$700 million had the targets under the "Waste Reduction Framework Plan" issued in 1998 been fully achieved. FoE was worried that the Administration's efforts to reduce and recycle waste would become futile with the adoption of the incineration option.

Action

*Meeting with Greeners Action
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(01))*

3. Mr Angus HO, Executive Director, said that Greeners Action regretted the Administration's proposal on development of IWMF and landfill extension. Efforts to reduce waste at source should be stepped up before considering IWMF and landfill extension which would certainly undermine the past efforts made in waste reduction and recycling. Apart from expediting the implementation of producer responsibility schemes (PRS) on vehicle tyres, packaging materials, beverage containers and rechargeable batteries without further delay, MSW charging should be introduced through the mandatory use of pre-paid garbage bags. To prevent fly-tipping, public litter bins on the streets should be removed upon implementation of MSW charging, and penalty should be imposed to guard against illegal dumping and other circumventions. Recycling facilities should be set up so that refurbished items (such as used furniture as well as electrical and electronic equipment) could be re-distributed to needy persons. A long-term policy on treatment of food waste was also required.

Meeting with Designing Hong Kong Limited

4. Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN stressed the need for review of IWMF given that the proposed moving-grate incineration technology was out-dated, and that the site at Shek Kwu Chau (SKC) was selected out of a political decision. While supporting for MSW charging on a quantity basis, he was concerned about the practicability, cost-effectiveness and enforceability of the scheme. The Administration should look into the costs of different charging mechanisms, including the cost of enforcement against illegal dumping and fly-tipping before reaching a decision on MSW charging. Instead of penalizing the public for waste generation, consideration should be given to providing financial incentives to encourage waste separation and recycling of waste which should be more cost-effective to the community as a whole. To this end, the Administration should endeavour to improve the means of waste collection, as well as the monitoring and enforcement mechanisms.

Meeting with Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

5. Mr Anderson CHEUNG, Deputy Spokesperson/Environment Affairs, opined that the waste problem should be addressed in a holistic manner. The Policy Framework for the Management of Municipal Solid Waste (2005-2014) (Policy Framework), which set out a comprehensive waste management strategy to tackle the waste problem, was a move in the right direction. While the proposed MSW charging was a practical means to reduce waste at source, it alone could not solve the waste problem. The Administration should not be

complacent with the overall MSW recovery rate of 52%, and should consider expanding the programme on Source Separation of Waste to include other recyclable items such as glass bottles. Efforts should also be made to expedite the development of food waste treatment facilities, and promote environmental industry by assisting local recyclers in the collection, handling and recycling of waste.

Meeting with Green Council

6. Ms Linda HO, Chief Executive Officer, pointed out that the introduction of modern waste treatment facilities and extension of landfills could not completely resolve the waste problem in Hong Kong. Green Council considered that reduction at source and recycling were the most practical means to reduce waste. To promote waste recycling, a comprehensive green procurement policy should be put in place with the support of relevant legislation. The Administration should also commit itself to green procurement to boost the demand for recycled products on the one hand and promote waste recycling and reduction at source on the other. In this connection, the Hong Kong Green Purchasing Charter had been adopting green purchasing policies and practices, as well as supporting the use of properly labelled products made from recycled materials. To assist local recycling industries, the Administration should allocate more land to the recycling trade with a view to promoting the local recycling industry and establishing a recycling network in Hong Kong. Moreover, funding should be provided to support the development of recycling technology.

Meeting with 2gather

7. Mr YEUNG Hoi-wing, Vice-Chairman, expressed support for measures to reduce waste at source. Given that two-thirds of the 9 100 tonnes of MSW disposed of at the three landfills each day were domestic waste, of which 40% were food waste and recyclable items. It was believed that with proper separation of recyclables from the waste stream, the remaining amount of waste to be disposed of would be greatly reduced. While MSW charging was an effective economic disincentive to deter waste generation, this should not impose undue financial burden on low-income households and elderly people. As a supplementary measure to MSW charging, the Administration should reinforce source separation programme with a view to lowering the MSW charge payable by households. Publicity and enforcement should also be stepped up to prevent illegal dumping upon implementation of MSW charging. To tackle waste problem, the Administration should adopt a multi-pronged approach with adequate public consultation on the proposed measures.

*Meeting with Hong Kong Outdoors**(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(02), (03) and CB(1) 1430/11-12(01))*

8. Dr Martin Williams, Director, was strongly opposed to the development of IWWMF at SKC given the severe impact of the residue toxic ash to be produced on marine life let alone the scenery. Besides, the proposed moving-grate incineration technology was outdated with the availability of more advanced technologies such as anaerobic digestion and plasma gasification, the latter of which was a state-of-the-art technology for waste treatment with minimal emissions and no residue ash. Referring to the statement of AECOM in the US that "this technology [plasma gasification] was not only environment-friendly but ready for large-scale commercialization", Dr Williams pointed out the fact that a number of plasma arc facilities were under planning or construction in numerous locations worldwide. When compared to a conventional incineration plant, a plasma arc facility could be built at a lower capital cost within a shorter period of time. He therefore urged members to vote against the proposal on IWWMF at SKC, and request the Administration to look into the application of plasma arc technology.

Meeting with Green Sense

9. Ms HO Ka-po, Project Manager, said that Green Sense supported MSW charging as an effective economic disincentive to waste generation. With concerted efforts to reduce and recycle waste, there might not be a need for the development of IWWMF. Hence, Green Sense was not prepared to support waste incineration unless MSW charging was implemented at the same time. Besides, it would be imprudent for the Administration to jump into the decision of developing IWWMF at SKC without taking into account the cumulative impacts of IWWMF and the third runway project at Chek Lap Kok on the residents of Cheung Chau and the marine ecology, particularly the Chinese White Dolphins. Hence, Green Sense was strongly opposed to the development of IWWMF and the third runway project.

*Meeting with The Hong Kong Electronic Industries Association (HKEIA)**(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(02))*

10. Dr W K LO, Chairman, agreed that a multi-pronged approach should be adopted to tackle the waste problem. Apart from efforts to separate domestic waste and reduce packaging for products to enhance waste reduction at source, consideration should also be given to providing economic incentives to encourage waste recycling as in the case of Singapore and South Korea. The introduction of IWWMF using state-of-the-art technology was not only required to treat waste that could not be recovered or recycled but also to provide for the development of renewable energy. Both sites at SKC and Tsang Tsui Ash Lagoons (TTAL) in Tuen Mun were considered suitable for the development of

IWMF. There was also a need for timely extension of the existing three strategic landfills (the capacities of which would become saturated in the next few years) for disposal of unavoidable waste. While the quantity-based system under the proposed MSW charging scheme seemed to be a fair and effective way to reduce waste at source, this should be implemented in phases through legislation with proper enforcement regime to guard against non-compliance.

*Meeting with The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers (HKIE)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1393/11-12(02))*

11. Ir CHAN Fuk-cheung, President, said that HKIE strongly advocated and supported the adoption of comprehensive strategies to conserve the environment and save resources. Therefore, it welcomed the Administration's initiatives on green strategy and waste management. To effectively handle waste that was inevitably produced and not suitable for further reuse and recycle, a sensible mix of various waste management options was required in order to meet the social, economic and environmental conditions in both the short and long term. While supporting the development of IWMF with incineration as the core technology to treat waste, HKIE considered it necessary for the Administration to endeavour to promote the recycling industry, as well as encourage segregation, reuse and recycling of waste through education and publicity.

Meeting with Hong Kong Construction Association (HKCA)

12. Mr Ringo YU, Chairman of Environmental Committee, said that HKCA supported the Administration's proposal to resolve the imminent waste problem through waste reduction at source, introduction of IWMF, and landfill extension. Given that 25% of the some 13 800 tonnes of waste to be disposed of at the three landfills every day were construction and demolition (C&D) waste, HKCA considered that more land should be provided for sorting and recycling of C&D waste. Moreover, the construction industry should be encouraged to use environmentally responsible products and services through green procurement. There should also be comprehensive consultation on the development and operation of IWMF. Contingency plans should be worked out to cater for the breakdown and malfunction of IWMF. HKCA would welcome the chance to exchange information on green construction techniques and building costs with the Administration in the planning stage of IWMF.

*Meeting with Living Islands Movement (LIM)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(03))*

13. Ms Louise PRESTON, Chairman, said that LIM queried the basis upon which the overall recovery rate of MSW of 52% in 2010 as claimed by the Administration was arrived at. She pointed out that there were some 18 000 tonnes of MSW generated everyday, including those produced in the

normal course of business by the private sector which were not processed by government facilities. In fact, the Administration only collected about 9 000 tonnes of MSW, of which only a small percentage was recovered. LIM also questioned the rationale for choosing SKC as the site for the first IWMF when the same could be provided at TTAL at a faster pace with less cost. She was not convinced that the provision of IWMF at SKC could achieve a "balanced spatial distribution", when this ran contrary to the normal planning practice that industrial facilities should be located away from an area that was zoned for conservation and recreation. She pointed out that the Administration had put the emphasis on the shorter sea route for delivering MSW from the Island East, Island West and West Kowloon refuse transfer stations to SKC than TTAL, without revealing the need for transporting of the toxic residue from SKC to TTAL for disposal.

Meeting with Mr YIP Man-pan

14. Mr YIP Man-pan said that as a resident of Tuen Mun, he wished to speak on behalf of his fellow residents regarding the waste problems in Tuen Mun. He said that residents were strongly opposed to the provision of obnoxious facilities in Tuen Mun and the location of IWMF at TTAL. While welcoming the introduction of MSW charging as an economic disincentive to waste generation, measures should be put in place to promote waste separation and recycling at the same time. Given that the Source Separation of Domestic Waste Programme was successful in inducing behavioural changes of the public (as evidenced by the rise in the recovery rate of MSW from 16% in 2005 to 40% in 2010), more efforts should be made to promote waste separation at source by households. As regards the MSW charging options, he would support the quantity-based system because it was a fair arrangement with wide acceptance from the community. To avoid double levy, the part of Government rates for waste collection should be taken out accordingly. A review mechanism should be put in place to ascertain the effectiveness of charging scheme. Publicity efforts should also be stepped up to educate the community on the benefits of MSW charging.

*Meeting with Professor POON Chi-sun, Hong Kong Polytechnic University
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(04))*

15. Professor POON Chi-sun said that while the recovery rate of MSW had reached 52%, the daily quantity of MSW needed to be disposed of at the three landfills still stood at 9 100 tonnes. To reduce waste at source, the Administration should expedite the implementation of MSW charging and extension of PRS. Despite the high recovery rates in advanced economies like Germany, South Korea and Taiwan, they still relied largely on incineration to treat MSW that could not be recovered or recycled before final disposal. When compared with plasma gasification, moving-grate incineration was considered

the most appropriate technology for IWWMF in Hong Kong in terms of technological maturity, reliability, robustness, environmental performance and cost-effectiveness. If a second IWWMF was required, consideration could be given to using other thermal technologies when these became mature.

*Meeting with Advisory Council on the Environment (ACE)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1393/11-12(03))*

16. Professor LAM Kwan-sing, Chairman, said that ACE supported the Policy Framework which provided a holistic approach encompassing various initiatives to achieve waste avoidance and reduction at source, waste recovery and recycling, as well as bulk reduction of waste for final disposal. ACE also supported the Administration to –

- (a) raise the waste recovery target to 55% by 2015;
- (b) promote on-site food waste composting and set up large-scale Organic Waste Treatment Facilities (OWTF) for proper treatment of food waste;
- (c) extend the Environmental Levy Scheme on Plastic Shopping Bags to all retailers;
- (d) implement a new PRS on waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE);
- (e) introduce MSW charging by volume of waste using a phased approach; and
- (f) develop advanced waste treatment facilities for bulk waste treatment and disposal, and adopt the mainstream technology (i.e. moving-grate incineration) for IWWMF.

*Meeting with Champway Technology Limited
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(05))*

17. Mr Teddy CHOI, Executive Director, said that while Hong Kong had the capability to process waste cooking oil and grease trap waste to bio-diesel, the illicit practice of some recyclers to collect and export waste cooking oil to the Mainland for re-use as cooking oil had hampered the legitimate recycling business and posed a health hazard to consumers. To regulate recyclers, consideration should be given to requiring restaurateurs to register the collection of waste cooking oil so that the enforcement departments could track down illegal operations. Economic incentives, such as reduction or waiving of sewage charge and trade effluent surcharge, should be provided to encourage

compliance with the registration system by restaurateurs. For centralized control and management, waste cooking oil should only be collected and processed by licensed operators. Legislation should also be introduced to ban the export of waste cooking oil so that this could only be processed locally for conversion into clean and renewable energy.

Meeting with The Chartered Institution of Water and Environmental Management (CIWEM)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(06))

18. Dr Anthony MA, Chairman, said that CIWEM supported the adoption of a holistic approach to avoid, reduce, recycle, and dispose of waste. The current practice of relying on landfills as the only means of waste disposal was not sustainable. To reduce MSW, there was a need for early implementation of MSW charging and extension of PRS. Publicity efforts and education should also be stepped up to promote waste separation and recycling by the building industry in an attempt to reduce C&D waste. Given that waste management facilities would take years to plan and complete, the Administration should endeavour to work out the way forward which was acceptable to the community. While modern incineration technology had been proven to meet the up-to-date stringent European Union (EU) emission standards, the emission data should be made available for inspection to ease public concerns on air pollution.

Meeting with Hong Kong Professionals And Senior Executives Association (HKPASEA)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(07))

19. Mr TSE Wai-chuen, President, said that HKPASEA agreed to accord priority to waste reduction at source, which could be achieved through mandatory waste separation and phased implementation of MSW charging. Education and publicity on waste reduction and recycling, particularly food waste, should be stepped up with a view to raising the overall recovery rate of MSW. To ensure proper treatment of waste that could not be recovered or recycled, the development of IWMP and extension of landfills were considered practical and necessary. Apart from adopting modern incineration technology which met the most stringent EU emission standards with minimal environmental impacts, the Administration should also closely monitor the environmental impacts of IWMP, and disclose information on air quality for public inspection. In exchange for support for the development of IWMP, betterment should be provided to the local community taking into account similar overseas experiences as in the case of Singapore, Taiwan and Japan.

Session 2 (11:45 am - 12:45 pm)*Meeting with Mr WONG Sin-hung*

20. While supporting for MSW charging using a quantity-based system as this was favoured by more than half of the respondents in a poll, Mr WONG Sin-hung was disappointed at the slow progress in taking forward the waste charging scheme, and the lack of details on the level and collection mechanism of the levy in the Consultation Document on "Strengthening Waste Reduction: Is Waste Charging an Option?" (Consultation Document). He was also worried that the development of IWMF would reduce the incentives to reduce and recycle waste. Hence, efforts should be stepped up to further enhance waste reduction at source before introducing waste incineration. There was also a need to expand OWTF as the combined treatment capacity of about 500 tonnes per day (tpd) under the proposed two phases of OWTF was far from enough to treat the some 3 000 tonnes of food waste generated daily.

Meeting with Kowloon Federation of Associations (KFA)

21. Given that the MSW recovery rate of 52% in Hong Kong was still relatively low when compared with other cities (such as Seoul and Taipei), Mr CHIU Kwok-wai, Deputy Chief Executive, held the view that the Administration should endeavour to encourage participation of environmental groups, schools, owners' corporations and Estate Management Advisory Committees in the recycling and reduction of waste. By way of illustration, the Home Affairs Department and District Councils should organize environmental programmes in partnership with non-government organizations (NGOs) in view of their strong ties with local resident groups. Financial support from the Environment and Conservation Fund (ECF) could be sought to assist in taking forward educational, research, and other projects/activities in relation to environmental protection and nature conservation.

Meeting with German Industry and Commerce Greater China, Hong Kong (GICGC)

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(05))

22. Mr Wolfgang EHMANN, Executive Director, expressed GICGC's concern that failure to deal with the waste problem in a timely manner could be potentially harmful to Hong Kong's living and business environment. To ensure that waste was properly reduced, reused, recovered, recycled, and disposed of, efforts should be made to put in place a legal framework for waste reduction and recycling; appropriate infrastructure for source separation and collection, transport and waste treatment; and waste treatment technology with energy recovery to treat unavoidable waste. On the assumption that the development of IWMF with a capacity of 3 000 tpd would treat 30% of the total

MSW generated per day, there were still 6 000 tonnes of MSW to be disposed of at landfills every day. To dispense with the need for landfills, the recovery rate would have to be increased from the current 52% to 83% which was unlikely to be achieved in the short term. Hence, there might be a need to increase the capacity of IWMF to reduce the reliance on landfills. With the advancement in incineration technology, waste to energy could be achieved with significant reduction in greenhouse gas emissions. In concluding, he said that even under the most optimistic scenario, waste incineration and landfills were still required for treatment of unavoidable waste and disposal of the residue waste respectively.

Meeting with CSS Asia Pacific Limited

23. Mr Tom VINCENT, Chief Operating Officer, said that he did not support the use of incineration as the core technology for IWMF at SKC. An incineration plant was not only expensive to build and operate but would also produce toxic ash which required further treatment before final disposal in landfills. Besides, IWMF would not help resolve the problem of landfill exhaustion as it would only come into operation in 2018-19 after Southeast New Territories, Northeast New Territories and West New Territories Landfills would reach their capacities in 2014, 2016 and 2018 respectively. In view of the unique local situation, Mr VINCENT considered that the more suitable technology for IWMF would be plasma gasification which had been commercialized for more than 30 years. The construction of a plasma gasification facility was not only cheaper and faster but also more efficient in converting waste into energy without the residue ash.

Meeting with Ms Yolanda NG

24. While acknowledging that public awareness on environmental protection had increased as a result of the concerted efforts of the Administration and stakeholders, Ms Yolanda NG noted that the per capita MSW generation in Hong Kong remained high. To tackle the waste problem, there was a need to expedite the implementation of MSW charging and mandatory PRS in parallel with other waste management measures covering both incentives and disincentives. These included enhancing/upgrading the existing waste collection facilities (such as the three-coloured waste segregation bins) to cover recyclables other than waste paper, aluminum cans and plastic bottles. Efforts should also be made to ensure the sustainability of the local recycling industry. Given that some 3 000 tonnes of food waste were generated every day, the Administration should endeavour to promote reduction, recovery, and recycling of food waste through publicity, education and public engagement. Consideration should also be given to setting up on-site waste composting facilities at district levels to facilitate treatment of food waste.

*Meeting with Hong Kong Climate Change Forum
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(08))*

25. Dr Otto POON, Past Chairman, declared that he was in charge of an environmental engineering company with business in both the Mainland and Hong Kong. He supported the introduction of MSW charging by volume of waste which was simple, effective and in line with the "polluter pays" principle. The pre-paid garbage bag scheme in Taiwan was a successful example of MSW charging. To promote the local recycling industry, more land should be earmarked for leasing at lower price to waste recovery operations on a long-term basis. Despite efforts to reduce and recycle waste, there would still be unavoidable waste that required disposal and the reliance on landfills for such waste would not be sustainable in the long run. Hence, the most advanced technology should be adopted to considerably reduce the volume of unavoidable waste and at the same time turn waste into energy. Thermal technology (i.e. incineration) with proven track record was considered more suitable for IWMF than other technologies (such as gasification and pyrolysis) which were not mature or lacked track record for large-scale application.

Meeting with Mr LI Ka-leung

26. While supporting in principle the introduction of MSW charging, Mr LI Ka-leung stressed the need for effective enforcement actions against illegal dumping and other attempts to circumvent the system. Apart from MSW charging, suitable incentives should be provided to encourage the community to recycle waste. For instance, NGOs had been able to set up Community Recycling Centres (CRC) with funding from ECF to provide waste-exchange service in old districts. However, as the funding was granted on a time-limited basis, the Administration should consider turning the funding into recurrent one to enable the continued operation of CRC. Instead of relying solely on private recyclers, the Administration should take a proactive role in the collection and recycling of recyclables with low commercial value such as glass bottles and food waste.

*Meeting with The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce (CGCC)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(06))*

27. Mr Philip FAN, Standing Committee Member, declared that he was a non-executive director of a company which operated major waste incineration facilities in the Mainland. He said that CGCC supported the introduction of MSW charging by volume of waste (which was in line with the "polluter-pays" principle) to provide an economic disincentive to waste generation. To avoid double levy, the part of Government rates for waste collection should be taken out accordingly following the implementation of MSW charging. The MSW charge collected should be ploughed back to develop and support other

environmental protection measures. To reduce C&D waste, reference could be made to the sale of first-hand residential properties in the Mainland where flats without furnishes and fittings were sold to avoid disposal of unwanted fittings by purchasers. Despite efforts in waste reduction and recycling, waste management facilities were still required to treat unavoidable waste and relieve the pressure on landfills. However, the proposed IWMF at SKC was too costly and would take a long time to build.

*Meeting with Youth Committee of New People's Party (NPP)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(11))*

28. While supporting waste reduction at source, Mr KAM Man-fung, Chairman, said that NPP considered the efforts made by the Administration in facilitating separation of recyclables and food waste inadequate. Additional measures on waste separation (such as expansion of the three-coloured waste segregation bin scheme to cover not only waste paper, aluminum cans and plastic bottles but also other types of recyclables, including rechargeable batteries and glass bottles) should be put in place to reduce the volume of unavoidable waste before consideration was given to introducing MSW charging. Compact food waste treatment facilities should be provided at housing estates to enable collection and on-site treatment of food waste into compost for use by local farmland. It was also worth noting that Taiwan had to shut down a number of incineration plants due to insufficient waste available for incineration following the successful implementation of mandatory waste separation at source and MSW charging.

Meeting with Clean Air Network (CAN)

29. Mr Patrick FUNG, Campaign Officer, said that CAN was opposed to the development of IWMF at SKC given that the toxic chemicals to be emitted during incineration would not only endanger terrestrial and marine life in the vicinity but also affect the human food chain. While continuous monitoring system would be put in place to monitor the emissions from IWMF, this did not cover all types of air pollutants such as fine suspended particulate (PM2.5) and benzene which would have adverse effects on health. The taking of periodic measurements of dioxins and heavy metals would not be able to detect excessive emissions in a timely manner and might result in delay of remedial measures. In view of the potential health hazards to the community, he urged the Administration to take into account public health costs in deciding on the need for IWMF. A contingency plan should also be worked out to cater for the emergency situations arising from excessive emissions from waste incineration.

Meeting with Kowloon West New Dynamic (KWND)

30. While supporting the policy on waste reduction and MSW charging,

Mr LAU Kin-shing, District Officer of Sham Shui Po, said that KWND considered it necessary for the Administration to make available details of the charging scheme (including the level of fee, collection mechanism, and implementation timetable) for further public consultation. To discourage generation of large amount of waste, consideration should be given to adopting a progressive rate structure under the volume-based charging option. Adequate measures should also be put in place to reduce waste generation, promote source separation and deter fly-tipping. Before the introduction of MSW charging, there was a need to assess the cumulative impact of various levy schemes (such as PRS on plastic shopping bags, construction waste charging and Trade Effluent Surcharge) on people's livelihoods. Apart from disincentives, economic incentives should be provided to encourage waste reduction and recovery.

Meeting with Hong Kong Waste Disposal Industry Association (HKWDIA)

31. Mr Eddie HUI, Secretary, said that HKWDIA shared the views expressed by other deputations.

Meeting with Clear The Air (CTA)

32. Mr Edwin TOWN, Vice-Chairman, said that CTA was opposed to the use of the outdated moving-grate incineration technology for IWMF. Instead, consideration should be given to adopting the plasma arc gasification technology not only because it had become an international trend but also it produced no emissions or ashes. The construction of a plasma arc facility at landfills could treat both new MSW and those already buried. He also pointed out that Hong Kong still lagged behind many overseas countries in the control of air pollution as evidenced by its failure to keep up with the standards set by the World Health Organization (WHO). For instance, the new proposed Air Quality Objectives could only implemented by 2014.

*Meeting with The French Chamber of Commerce and Industry in Hong Kong (FCCIHK)
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(07))*

33. Mr Charles d'HAUSSY, Vice-President of the Green Business Committee, said that FCCIHK recognized the need for proper waste management. It supported the introduction of MSW charging to increase public awareness on waste reduction, development of waste-to-energy incineration, extension of landfills and development of OWTF Phase 2 to tackle the imminent waste problem in Hong Kong. Efforts should also be made to promote the local waste recycling industry which included expediting the implementation of the new PRS on WEEE. The Administration should endeavour to consult the public on the proposed measures.

*Meeting with Tai A Chau Fishermen Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(08))*

34. Mr KWOK Cheuk-kin, Chairman, was opposed to the development of IWMF at SKC as the waters in the vicinity were a major fishing ground for Cheung Chau fisherman. He was skeptical that SKC was chosen for political reasons rather than economic consideration given that the cost for constructing IWMF at SKC was much higher than that at TTAL.

35. Members also noted the following submissions from deputations not attending the meeting -

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(04) — Submission from Sai Yap Y S T Limited

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(09) — Submission from New Territories School Heads Association

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(10) — Submission from TRSI/Advanced Plasma Power Limited

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1385/11-12(11) — Submission from The Hong Kong Institute of Architects

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(09) — Submission from WWF Hong Kong

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(10) — Submission from Mr Marco CHU

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1430/11-12(12) — Submission from Living Lamma

Meeting with the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1369/11-12(01) — Administration's paper on "Reduce, Recycle and Proper Waste Management"

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1369/11-12(02) — Paper on management of municipal solid waste in Hong Kong prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background

36. SEN thanked deputations for their views. He noted that there was general support for the multi-pronged waste management strategy which included initiatives on waste reduction and recovery as well as waste treatment facilities. As a further step to reduce waste, the Administration would endeavour to reach a consensus on MSW charging. Despite the various measures to reduce waste, there would still be a substantial amount of waste that could not be recycled or recovered which required proper treatment. The reliance on landfills as the final depository was not sustainable in the long run. There was a need for the development of IWWMF which should adopt the most advanced technology and highest environmental standards. Besides, the Administration would be prudent in choosing the site for IWWMF.

37. The Chairman reminded members that the Panel would continue to receive deputations' views at the regular Panel meeting to be held in the same afternoon at 2:30 pm.

II. Any other business

38. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.