

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2542/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on
Tuesday, 22 May 2012, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** :
- Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
 - Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
 - Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
 - Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
 - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
 - Hon WONG Sing-chi
 - Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon Tanya CHAN
 - Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Members absent** :
- Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
 - Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
 - Hon CHAN Hak-kan

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item III

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)7

Mr LEUNG Tat-fai
Chief Engineer/Railway Development 1-2
Highways Department

Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Maisie CHENG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1

Mr Fletch CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 3

Mr Henry CHAN
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr TAM Hon-choi
Government Engineer/Railway Development 2
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item III

Mr Stephen CHIK
Head of Project Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr TSANG K M
Senior Engineer-Control
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Richard KWAN
Environment Manager
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager – Projects and Property
Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item IV

Mr Ian WHITTON
Executive Director
AECOM Asia Company Limited

Mr Perran COAK
Associate Director
AECOM Asia Company Limited

Mr Fred BROWN
Managing Director
MVA Hong Kong Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Franco KWONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

- I. Confirmation of minutes**
(LC Paper No. - Minutes of meeting on 2 March
CB(1)1772/11-12 2012)

The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

2. The minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2012 were confirmed.

II. Information papers issued since last meeting

(LC CB(1)1260/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the train frequency of Tung Chung Line
LC CB(1)1449/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the provision of toilet facilities at the MTR stations of East Rail Line
LC CB(1)1710/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Progress report of the construction of the Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link
LC CB(1)1723/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the development of railway network in Kowloon East
LC CB(1)1723/11-12(02)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the train frequency of light rail route no. 505
LC CB(1)1723/11-12(03)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the train frequency of Tung Chung Line
LC CB(1)1723/11-12(04)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the construction of new railway connecting Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun
LC CB(1)1886/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the new MTR trains
LC CB(1)1886/11-12(02)	Paper	No. - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on train maintenance)

3. Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

Action

4. Members also noted the letter from Hon WONG Kwok-hing on the recent West Rail Line incident [LC Paper No. CB(1)1829/11-12] and agreed to hold a special meeting to discuss recent railway incidents as well as the contingency arrangements and maintenance work of the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL).

(Post-meeting note: the special meeting was held on 28 June 2012 at 8:30 am.)

III. Environmental measures for new railway projects

(LC Paper No. - Administration's paper entitled CB(1)1832/11-12(01) "Environmental measures for new railway projects")

5. Mr Abraham SHEK declared that he was an independent non-executive director of MTRCL.

6. With the aid of Powerpoint presentation, the Administration and MTRCL briefed members on the environmental measures for new railway projects. MTRCL explained that a number of environmentally-friendly design and measures had been put in place in the railway system in Hong Kong to enhance energy efficiency. They included energy efficiency considerations in the design of railway alignment and ventilation system, the establishment of the Comprehensive Energy Consumption Monitoring System and regenerative braking system, and the reduction in power loss resulting from power transmission, distribution and conversion.

7. Some members called for improvements to be made to reduce the noise of running trains that had long been complained about by residents of some residential housing estates in Tsuen Wan and Chai Wan. MTRCL advised that it would adopt appropriate measures to mitigate noise impact and ensure that the noise level was within the statutory limits under the Noise Control Ordinance (Cap. 400). Members also suggested that consideration should be given to constructing noise barriers where appropriate.

Admin/
MTRCL

8. At the request of the Subcommittee, the Administration/MTRCL agreed to provide –

- (a) the number of the three-coloured recycling bins placed at MTR stations and quantity of recycled materials collected in the past 12 months;

Action

- (b) information in support of the saying that energy efficiency and noise reduction could be achieved by the valley alignment design adopted by MTRCL; and
- (c) information on actions taken to follow up complaints regarding the blockage caused to the entrance of the Centre Street Market by the construction of the West Island Line.

(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information on items (a) and (c) provided by the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)2382/11-12(01)) was issued on 17 July 2012.)

IV. Public consultation on the interim study findings of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000

LC Paper No. - Administration's paper entitled
CB(1)1832/11-12(02) "Review and Update of the
Railway Development Strategy
2000"

LC Paper No. - Background brief entitled "Review
CB(1)1832/11-12(03) and Update of the Railway
Development Strategy 2000"
prepared by the Legislative
Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. - Letter dated 13 April 2012 from
CB(1)1611/11-12(01) Hon Tanya CHAN)

9. With the aid of Powerpoint presentation, the Administration briefed members on its plan to launch a three-month Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise from 20 April to 21 July 2012 with a view to gathering public opinion on long-term railway development. In this connection, a consultation document entitled "Our Future Railway" was published in April 2012. The Subcommittee noted that the consultants engaged to conduct the review and update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 initially considered that the Hong Kong-Shenzhen Western Express Line (WEL), the Northern Link (NOL) and the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan (Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan Link) were conceptual schemes which were worthy of public discussion in the public engagement for Stage 1, but it did not represent that the Administration or the consultants proposed to construct the above railways.

Action

10. Some members considered that in the course of the study, the Administration and its consultants should also take into account the findings of the Third Comprehensive Transport Study in 1999, which had looked at improvements to be made for better co-ordination of public transport services, in order to develop a balanced transport plan for Hong Kong. Some members considered that NOL should be actively explored as it could provide a more direct and convenient cross boundary railway service for residents in New Territories West. Some members further proposed that NOL should include an extension line from Kwu Tung to Ping Che/Ta Kwu Ling to meet service demand. Some members, however, expressed doubt on the patronage forecast of WEL and suggested that the consultants should conduct more in-depth study to ascertain the service demand for WEL.

V. Any other business

11. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:37 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
6 September 2012

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Tuesday, 22 May 2012, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes			
000726 – 000742	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2012.	
Agenda item II – Information papers issued since last meeting			
000743 – 000901	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
000902 – 001048	Chairman Mr WONG kwok-hing	The Subcommittee agreed to hold a special meeting to discuss the recent railway incidents as well as MTRCL's contingency arrangements and maintenance work.	
001049 – 001058	Chairman Mr Abraham SHEK	Declaration of interest by Mr Abraham SHEK.	
Agenda item III - Environmental measures for new railway projects			
001059 – 002725	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing and Powerpoint presentation by the Administration and MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)1832/11-12(01)).	
002726 – 003557	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concerns about the energy efficiency and train noise impact of the design of "railway alignment optimization" adopted by MTRCL.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the valley alignment design allowed the acceleration and deceleration of the train to be aided by its own weight, thus reducing the overall traction energy. Such design also reduced the noise of motor and brake system of running train.</p> <p>Mr WONG also raised questions concerning a complaint case being handled by the Complaints Division regarding the blockage caused to the entrance of the Centre Street Market by the construction of the West Island Line. The Administration agreed to provide supplementary information on the actions taken to follow up residents' concerns.</p>	The Admin/ MTRCL to provide information (para. 8 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003558 – 004024	Chairman Mrs Regina IP MTRCL	<p>Mrs Regina IP enquired about the measures taken to monitor and evaluate the environmental impacts arising from railway operation, such as air and noise pollution.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that for new railway projects, it was required to submit environmental impact assessment reports and obtain environmental permits under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap. 499). In compliance with the environmental permits, MTRCL would take measures to minimize environmental impacts arising from railway construction and operation. For the existing railway lines, MTRCL would closely monitor the quality of the air emitted from ventilation shafts. It would also adopt appropriate measures to mitigate noise impact and ensure that the noise level was within the statutory limits under the Noise Control Ordinance (Cap. 400) (NCO).</p>	
004025 – 004253	Chairman MTRCL	<p>Chairman commented that the measurement of "average train noise" could not truly reflect the noise nuisance caused by running trains.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that the measurement standards were prescribed under the Technical Memorandum of NCO. MTRCL assured members that it would take necessary noise abatement measures to reduce train noise.</p>	
004254 – 004714	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Albert CHAN urged MTRCL to improve the noise level of running trains that had long been complained about by residents in Tsuen Wan and Chai Wan. He also suggested that consideration should be given to constructing noise barriers where appropriate.</p> <p>In response to Chairman's enquiry, MTRCL confirmed that noise abatement measures had been introduced, such as reduction in the number of rail joints and application of lubricant.</p>	
004715 – 005335	Chairman Mr KAM Nai-wai MTRCL	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai considered that ventilation openings should be located far away from residential buildings.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that ventilation shafts would not emit polluted air. It had adopted an integrated design and carried out greening for ventilation shafts. Subject to the alignment and availability of land,</p>	The Admin/ MTRCL to provide information (para. 8 of the minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>ventilation openings would be located away from residential buildings as far as possible.</p> <p>At Mr KAM's request, MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information on the number of the tri-colour recycling bins placed at MTR stations and the quantity of waste collected in the past 12 months.</p>	
005336 – 005618	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed doubt about the energy efficiency of the valley alignment design. In response, MTRCL agreed to provide the information in support of the saying that energy efficiency and noise reduction could be achieved by the valley alignment design adopted by MTRCL.	The Admin/ MTRCL to provide information (para. 8 of minutes)
Agenda item IV - Public consultation on the interim study findings of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000			
005619 – 011300	Chairman Administration AECOM Asia Company Limited	Briefing and Powerpoint presentation by the Administration and its consultant (LC Paper No. CB(1)1832/11-12(02)).	
011301 – 011517	Chairman Administration	In response to Chairman's enquiry, the Administration advised that the review and update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 (RDS 2000) would last for 2 years. The stage one study and consultation was underway with a view to conducting transport demand forecasts and reviewing major regional railway corridors. After that, the stage two study would be taken forward to verify the technical feasibility and assess the social and economic benefits of the preferred proposals.	
011518 – 012023	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's views –</p> <p>(a) implementation of the Hong Kong–Shenzhen Western Express Line (WEL) and related highway planning should be taken forward at the same time;</p> <p>(b) he expressed support for the proposed Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan Link (TMTWL) and he believed that it would boost the residential population along the alignment; and</p> <p>(c) Northern Link (NOL) had long been awaited by the public.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration's response –</p> <p>(a) the preliminary conceptual scheme of WEL could perform three major functions, including providing air-rail inter-modal service, cross-boundary spur line service between western regions of Hong Kong and Shenzhen, and domestic spur line service connecting Northwest New Territories and northern Lantau;</p> <p>(b) regarding TMTWL, public consultation would be launched to collect views of the local community on the project proposal; and</p> <p>(c) the implementation of NOL would depend on the projected demand of cross-boundary passenger traffic and the programme of the new development areas in the New Territories.</p>	
012024 – 012735	Chairman Mr WONG Sing-chi Administration	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi expressed dissatisfaction with the long time taken in taking forward NOL which had been discussed for ten years. He urged the Administration to draw up an implementation timetable for NOL and include an extension line from Kwu Tung to Ping Che/Ta Kwu Ling into the scheme.</p> <p>The Administration advised that NOL was still a preliminary conceptual scheme without an implementation timetable. The functions of NOL were under review, such as serving the new development areas in the northern New Territories and providing cross-boundary railway service.</p>	
012736 – 013513	Chairman Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai considered that there was also a need to review the coordination of different public transport modes alongside the review and update of RDS 2000, and enquired why the latter did not cover the feasibility of engaging operators other than MTRCL to operate new railway lines, and why the review study of the railway development strategy was divided into two stages.</p> <p>The Administration explained the purpose of the review and update of RDS 2000 and the difference in the scope of study under stages one and two of the review study.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013514 – 014235	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Administration	<p>Mr Albert CHAN considered that the Administration should review the coordination of different public transport modes and how they could be better coordinated to enhance network efficiency. He also expressed concern about the criteria and planning parameters for the provision of railway stations in a district and suggested that official guidelines should be provided.</p> <p>The Administration noted Mr CHAN's view and advised that under stage two, the consultant would conduct review of provision of railway stations.</p>	
014236 – 015117	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Administration	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN enquired whether the Airport Authority Hong Kong (AAHK) was aware of the conceptual scheme of WEL in taking forward the proposal of building third runway; and whether there was a plan to develop phase II of the Hong Kong section (HKS) of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL), such as building extension to Hong Kong Island or Lo Wu.</p> <p>The Administration's response –</p> <p>(a) at this stage, the Administration had no plan to develop any extension lines of the HKS of XRL; and</p> <p>(b) through WEL establishing connection between the Hong Kong International Airport and Shenzhen Airport, air passengers arriving at Hong Kong International Airport from overseas could then take the railway to the Shenzhen Airport and transfer to a connecting domestic flight to destinations on the Mainland.</p>	
015118 – 020053	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered that the planning of WEL should take into consideration the relevant high construction cost, availability of co-location of boundary control facilities and patronage forecast.</p>	
020054 – 020706	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman considered that in the course of the study, the Administration and its consultants should also take into account the findings of the Third Comprehensive Transport Study in 1999, which had looked at improvements to be made for better co-ordination of public transport services, in order to develop a balanced transport plan for Hong Kong. The Chairman also considered that NOL should be</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		actively explored.	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
6 September 2012