

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)771/11-12
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/10

Panel on Welfare Services

**Subcommittee on Improving Barrier Free Access
and Facilities for Persons with Disabilities**

**Minutes of the third meeting
held on Friday, 11 November 2011, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon WONG Sing-chi (Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Member attending : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Public Officers attending : Item II

Mr Stephen SUI Wai-keung
Commissioner for Rehabilitation
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr HUI Chiu-kin
Chief Property Services Manager 1
Architectural Services Department

Mr LEE Man-ho
Chief Transport Officer/Disabled Transport and Projects
Transport Department

Mr Albert LEE Wai-bun
Chief Traffic Engineer/Kowloon
Transport Department

Mr Roger LEE Ping-kwan
Chief Highway Engineer/Bridges & Structures
Highways Department

Mr LEUNG Kim-cheong
Senior Engineer (Special Duties)
Highways Department

Mr Allan WONG
Chief Manager/Management (Kwai Chung)
Housing Department

Mr Danny CHENG
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/Research & Development
Housing Department

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr LAM Woon-kwong
Chairperson

Clerk in attendance : Miss Betty MA
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in attendance : Miss Karen LAI
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Members agreed that there was no need to re-elect a chairman for the 2011-2012 session and that election of a deputy chairman was not required.

II. Meeting with the Administration

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)488/10-11(03), CB(2)1618/10-11(01), CB(2)2495/10-11(01), CB(2)211/11-12(01) and CB(2)265/11-12(01)]

Progress of the retrofitting programme

3. Members noted the Government's follow-up action as at 30 September 2011 on the Equal Opportunities Commission's Formal Investigation Report on Accessibility in Publicly Accessible Premises ("the EOC Report") as detailed in the Administration's papers [LC Paper No. CB(2)211/11-12(01)].

4. Chairperson of EOC considered that while the retrofitting works on some of the 3 700 premises and facilities covered under the major retrofitting programme had commenced, it accounted for only 15% of the programme. Concern was raised as to whether the major retrofitting programme could be completed by June 2012 as scheduled. Members raised similar concerns and took the view that the Administration should expedite the work progress of the retrofitting programme and ensure its completion by the scheduled date.

5. The Administration advised that to accelerate the retrofitting programme, five additional contractors had been engaged in October 2011 to carry out the retrofitting programme. It was expected that the site preparation for the premises and facilities concerned could largely be completed by the end of 2011, and the retrofitting works would then commence in full swing. The Administration assured members that it remained the Administration's target to complete the Class A items under the retrofitting programme by June 2012 as scheduled.

6. Members agreed that the Subcommittee would hold a meeting tentatively scheduled for February 2012 to gauge views from District Councils ("DCs") on the Administration's retrofitting works on government premises and facilities in their respective districts. The Legislative Council Secretariat would write to invite DCs to deliberate on the subject, and

Action

invitation of views would be sent to DCs in due course.

- EOC 7. At the request of Ms Emily LAU, Chairperson of EOC agreed to provide the Subcommittee with information on the principle of universal design for accessibility, with a view to creating a barrier free environment for the community.

Provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems

8. Members were advised that the Administration had put in place an assessment system for the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems, as detailed in Annex D of the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)265/11-12(01)]. Based on the assessment result and having regard to the resources available, the Administration took forward the feasibility studies for the top 10 ranked proposals. The feasibility studies of five proposals had been completed and the studies of the remaining five proposals were ongoing. After completing the feasibility studies, the Administration would work on the pre-construction works and procedures, with a view to publishing a notice in the Gazette to consult the public on the initial design and the alignment arrangement of specific proposals. The Administration further advised that the lower ranked proposals (i.e. proposals ranked 11 to 18) would be taken forward after the feasibility studies of the top 10 proposals were on track for implementation.

- Admin 9. The Administration was requested to provide -

- (a) the expected completion dates of the feasibility studies for the five outstanding proposals by December 2011; and
- (b) details of the pre-construction works and procedures together with the relevant timetable in respect of the five proposals with the feasibility studies completed by January 2012.

10. Members considered that the crux of the problem was inadequate manpower and resources allocated for the project. They took the view that the Government should allocate more resources to expedite the implementation of all the hillside escalator and elevator proposals. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following motion -

"That this Subcommittee urges the Administration to set aside funds in the Budget for the next financial year for completion of the remaining proposals not yet arranged for feasibility studies for the Provision of Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems." (Translation)

Action

11. The Chairman put the motion to vote. All the members present at the meeting voted for the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

TD

12. As regards Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung's request for the Transport Department ("TD") to revisit his earlier proposal of providing an escalator/elevator connecting the Kwai Fong Estate and the Kwai Fong Mass Transit Railway station, members noted that TD would follow up the matter direct with Mr LEUNG after the meeting.

III. Any other business

13. Members agreed that the next meeting would tentatively be scheduled for February 2012. Members would be informed of the meeting date in due course.

14. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 January 2012

**Proceedings of the third meeting of the
Subcommittee on Improving Barrier Free Access
and Facilities for Persons with Disabilities
on Friday, 11 November 2011, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)</i>			
000354 - 000417	Chairman	Election of Chairman	
<i>Agenda item II – Meeting with the Administration</i>			
000418 - 000603	Chairman Ms Emily LAU	Opening remarks	
000604 - 003125	Chairman Administration Ms Emily LAU	Briefings by the Administration on the progress report of the Government's follow-up action on the Equal Opportunities Commission's Formal Investigation Report on Accessibility in Publicly Accessible Premises ("the EOC Report") as at 30 September 2011. [LC Paper No. CB(2)211/11-12(01)]	
003126 - 003511	Equal Opportunities Commission Chairman Administration Ms Emily LAU	<p>Remarks of Chairperson of EOC that -</p> <p>(a) expressed appreciation of the Administration's efforts in enhancing the transparency of its follow-up action on the EOC Report and the appointment of Access Co-ordinators ("ACs") and Access Officers ("AOs") in Government's bureaux/departments for co-ordinating accessibility issues and handling public enquiries on barrier free facilities; and</p> <p>(b) while the retrofitting works on some of the 3 700 premises and facilities covered under the major retrofitting programme ("the retrofitting programme") had commenced, it accounted for only 15% of the programme. Concern was raised whether the major retrofitting programme could be completed by June 2012 as scheduled.</p> <p>Response of the Administration that -</p> <p>(a) while the funding for these works projects could only be available after April 2011, the Administration had been committed to carrying out the improvement works expeditiously;</p> <p>(b) five additional contractors had been engaged</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>since October 2011 to expedite the retrofitting programme;</p> <p>(c) after the completion of site preparation for the premises/facilities concerned by the end of 2011, the improvement works would commence in full swing. The complexity of improvement works for most of Class A items was categorized as low level of complexity; and</p> <p>(d) the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") remained confident that the retrofitting programme could largely be completed as scheduled.</p>	
003512 - 004750	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Chairman Ms Emily LAU Administration</p>	<p>Views of Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung that -</p> <p>(a) whether the expected completion date of the individual items under the retrofitting programme could be further advanced;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should take into account the needs of the elderly and persons with disabilities ("PWDs") and revisit his earlier proposal of providing an escalator/elevator connecting the Kwai Fong Estate and the Kwai Fong Mass Transit Railway station; and</p> <p>(c) progress of top 10 items under the hillside escalator and elevator project as well as ways to deal with proposals ranked 11 to 18 and new proposals.</p> <p>Response of the Administration that -</p> <p>(a) it was expected that site preparation for the premises and facilities would largely be completed by the end of 2011, such that works for the remaining items could commence early next year;</p> <p>(b) priority of proposals on hillside escalator link and elevator systems were determined according to the evaluation criteria adopted under the established assessment system. The proposed elevator system for Kwai Fong Estate was not included in the list of proposed hillside escalator links and elevator systems requests. The Transport Department ("TD") would follow up the matter direct with Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung after the meeting.</p>	<p>TD to follow up</p>
004751 - 005612	<p>Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Chairman</p>	<p>Concerns of Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Administration	<p>(a) the Subcommittee might consider following up the barrier free access and facilities of non-governmental organizations ("NGOs"), schools and residential care homes on Government subventions;</p> <p>(b) the role of the Government in ensuring the provision of barrier free facilities in the above premises under the management of subvented organisations and what assistance (e.g. consultancy advice and funding support) would be rendered to them in this regard; and</p> <p>(c) assistance offered by Government departments in resolving the accessibility issues encountered by PWDs in the community.</p> <p>Reply of the Administration -</p> <p>(a) same as other premises and public venues, subvented NGOs/schools/residential care homes should comply with the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) and Disability Discrimination Ordinance (Cap. 487) for the provision of barrier free access and facilities for PWDs. All buildings which had undergone major alterations after 1997 and newly constructed buildings should comply with the design requirements stipulated in the Design Manual: Barrier-Free Access 2008;</p> <p>(b) subvented NGOs and residential care homes could apply for the Lotteries Fund for renovation projects including enhancement of barrier free access and facilities within the premises under their management. For those premises and common areas and facilities under the management of the Housing Department ("HD") and the Government, it would be covered under the Administration's retrofitting programme or taken up by HD or the Government. Schools could apply for funding under the purview of the Education Bureau to carry out renovation and improvement works items including barrier free facilities;</p> <p>(c) advice on accessibility issues would be provided to users of premises under the management of ArchSD and HD as appropriate. For non-government premises, apart from seeking advice from professionals of their own project consultants, professional advice from the Environmental Advisory Service, which is under the Labour and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Welfare Bureau ("LWB") subvention, could also be sought; and</p> <p>(d) the Government had been committed to improving the accessibility of the community. Since April 2011, ACs/AOs had been appointed in bureaux/departments in enhancing the accessibility of government premises and facilities and raising the awareness on barrier free environment. They would also be responsible for resolving accessibility issues in the premises/facilities under their management.</p> <p>Advice of EOC that it had received sporadic complaint cases relating to the accessibility issues in NGOs. Organizations on Government subventions should seek assistance from the relevant bureaux/departments.</p>	
005613 - 010332	Mr TAM Yiu-chung Chairman Administration	<p>Concerns of Mr TAM Yiu-chung on the slow progress of the retrofitting programme and his enquiry on the improvement works to those premises/facilities where retrofitting works were considered infeasible after site survey.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that it targeted to carry out the retrofitting works to 90% of 3 700 premises/facilities by June 2012. Some premises/facilities would not be retrofitted because of imminent plan of decommissioning or disposal, and being incorporated under another works or renovation projects. The Administration would keep in view the need for improving the accessibility of other government premises and facilities not covered by the retrofitting programme. Where required, improvement works could be funded under ArchSD's regular maintenance programmes.</p> <p>Concern of Mr TAM Yiu-chung about the feasibility of providing an elevator/escalator linking the bus stops outside the entrance/exit of the Cross Harbour Tunnel and the pedestrian bridge leading to the Hung Hom station to facilitate the accessibility of people with physical limitations.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that an elevator system was provided in the vicinity of the venue cited by Mr TAM.</p>	
010333 - 011117	Ms Emily LAU Chairman Administration Equal Opportunities	<p>Views of Ms Emily LAU that -</p> <p>(a) the Administration should expedite the work progress of the retrofitting programme and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Commission	<p>ensure its completion by June 2012 and EOC would help monitor the work progress of the retrofitting programme;</p> <p>(b) whether more contractors could be engaged to further speed up the progress of the retrofitting works; and</p> <p>(c) whether the provision of one way escalator, instead of a pair of escalators, were in compliance with the barrier free access requirements.</p> <p>Advice of the Administration that -</p> <p>(a) lead time was required for the site survey, feasibility study and site preparation as far as the retrofitting programme was concerned. Should these preparatory work be completed before the end of 2011, ArchSD was confident that the retrofitting works could largely be completed by June 2012; and</p> <p>(b) the provision of one way escalator link and staircases as backup was considered acceptable.</p> <p>Advice of EOC -</p> <p>(a) to enhance the accessibility of users of wheelchairs, elevator systems, instead of escalator links, should be provided as far as practicable. Owing to physical constraints, the provision of one way escalator link together with staircases was considered acceptable; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration could consider making reference to overseas experience on the provision of stair lifts at escalator links to accommodate the needs of wheelchair users.</p>	
011118 - 011915	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman Administration Equal Opportunities Commission	<p>Views of Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung -</p> <p>(a) the Administration should allocate more funding to conduct the feasibility studies for the remaining proposals of hillside escalators/elevators projects expeditiously;</p> <p>(b) whether the priority ranking of the remaining proposals (i.e. ranked 11 to 18) would be changed if new proposals were added; and</p> <p>(c) whether EOC would conduct a survey on the compliant level of the provision of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>escalator/elevator systems in publicly accessible premises.</p> <p>The Chairman's advice that issues relating to the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems would be dealt with under the latter part of the meeting.</p> <p>EOC's reiteration of its stance on the provision of escalators and elevators to facilitate the accessibility of people with physical limitations. EOC would make recommendations for the Government's consideration as appropriate.</p>	
011916 - 012302	Chairman Administration	<p>Views of the Chairman that as the new term of District Councils ("DCs") would commence in January 2012, the Subcommittee might consider inviting DCs to give their views on the provision of barrier free facilities in their respective districts at the next meeting to be held in early 2012.</p> <p>The Chairman's enquiry on whether the Administration had provided individual DCs with the relevant information relating to the barrier free access and facilities in their respective districts and through what channels DCs could express their views.</p> <p>Reply of the Administration that the quarterly progress reports in respect of the Government's follow-up action on the EOC Report were available on the website of LWB and relevant notification letters had been sent to the secretariats of 18 DCs for reference. Views from DCs were welcome.</p>	
012303 - 013012	Administration Chairman	<p>Briefings by the Administration on the assessment system for the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems.</p> <p>[Annex D of the LC Paper No. CB(2)265/11-12(01)]</p>	
013013 - 013643	Ms Emily LAU Chairman Administration	<p>Views of Ms Emily LAU that -</p> <p>(a) in taking forward the new hillside escalator and elevator systems, the Administration should consider providing a pair of escalators and elevator systems as the standard design as well as exploring the possibility of introducing escalator systems equipped with stair lifts to accommodate the needs of wheelchair users;</p> <p>(b) the Subcommittee should hold a meeting in February 2012 to gauge DCs' views on the Administration's retrofitting works on premises and facilities in their respective</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>districts. The Administration should provide the relevant information to DCs for discussion; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration should consider engaging more contractors to expedite the retrofitting programme.</p> <p>EOC's reiteration of its stance on the provision of escalators and elevators to facilitate the accessibility of people with physical limitations. The Government should adopt the principle of universal design to create a barrier free environment for the community, particularly in large-scale public facilities such as the West Kowloon Cultural District Project.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that the quarterly progress reports on the Government's follow-up action on the EOC Report were available on the website of LWB. DCs had been notified of the arrangements, and views of DCs on the provision of barrier free facilities in their respective districts were welcome.</p> <p>The Chairman's advice that the Legislative Council Secretariat should write to DCs and invite them to deliberate on the subject and attend a future meeting of the Subcommittee.</p> <p>The Administration's further advice that since October 2011, five additional contractors, each comprised at least 10 teams of professionals, had been engaged to take forward the preparation work of the retrofitting programme. Workshops had been organized, with participants from the Hong Kong Council of Social Service, to collect views on the users' requirements, with a view to finalizing the site preparation as early as possible. It was expected that a larger proportion of the retrofitting works of some 3 000 retrofitting items would commence by the end of 2011.</p>	<p>Clerk</p>
013644 - 013943	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung urged the Administration to -</p> <p>(a) allocate more resources for the hillside escalator and elevator projects so that all the proposals could be implemented in one go;</p> <p>(b) seek advice from EOC on ways to deal with those hillside escalator/elevator projects with site constraints and explain to the public about the hindering factors; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) ensure that the major retrofitting programme would be completed by 30 June 2012.	
013944 - 015817	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung's concern about the objectivity of the assessment system on the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems and way forward to deal with new proposals. Mr LEUNG's request for the Government to allocate more resources for the hillside escalator/elevator projects.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that -</p> <p>(a) the ranking of the top 10 proposals was determined based on a set of objectives and transparent evaluation criteria including the ranking system. During the assessment process, views of district stakeholders had been consulted and fully taken into account;</p> <p>(b) based on the availability of manpower and resources, it took forward the top 10 ranked proposals for feasibility studies. The feasibility studies of five proposals had been completed and the studies of the remaining five proposals were ongoing. After completing the feasibility studies, the Administration would work on the pre-construction works and procedures, with a view to publishing a notice in the Gazette to consult the public on the initial design and the alignment arrangement of specific proposals. The Administration would follow up the proposals ranked 11 to 18 once the implementation of the top 10 was on track. It would also assign priority for new proposals (although not many cases were envisaged) with scores higher than any of the proposals ranked 11 to 18; and</p> <p>(c) the relative priority and scores of the remaining eight proposals would not be affected even though new requests might have been added to the list of proposals.</p> <p>Views of Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung that the crux of the problem was inadequate resources allocated for the project. The Administration should set aside funding in the 2012-2013 financial year for the proposals ranked 11 to 18.</p> <p>At the request of the Chairman, the Administration would provide the following information -</p> <p>(a) the expected completion dates of the</p>	Admin

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>feasibility studies for the five outstanding proposals by December 2011; and</p> <p>(b) details of the pre-construction works and procedures together with the relevant timetable in respect of the five proposals with the feasibility studies completed by January 2012.</p>	
015818 - 020030	Ms Emily LAU Chairman Equal Opportunities Commission Administration	<p>Views of Ms Emily LAU that the Democratic Party would request the Government to set aside funding for the proposals ranked 11 to 18 in the hillside escalator links and elevator systems project when it was consulted by the Financial Secretary on the forthcoming Budget; and</p> <p>At the request of Ms Emily LAU, Chairperson of EOC agreed to provide members with information on the principle of the universal design for accessibility.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that Government departments had been adopting the universal design principles as far as practicable in enhancing the accessibility of government premises and facilities.</p>	EOC
020031 - 020132	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Ms Emily LAU	Motion moved by Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung was carried.	Admin
<i>Agenda item III – Any other business</i>			
020133 - 020201	Chairman	Date and discussion item of the next meeting	