

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)2802/11-12  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/1/10

**Panel on Welfare Services**

**Subcommittee on Retirement Protection**

**Minutes of the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 8 May 2012, at 2:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Chairman)  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

**Members absent** : Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

**Public officers attending** : Item I

Mrs Polly CHAN  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
(Welfare) 4

Miss Emmy WONG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services  
and the Treasury (Financial Services) 3

Mr John LAM  
Senior Statistician (Census & Demographic Statistics)  
Census and Statistics Department

Mr CHAN Yiu-ming  
Statistician (Special Duties)  
Social Welfare Department

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Betty MA  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Maisie LAM  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

---

Action

**I. Meeting with the Administration**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1903/10-11(01), CB(2)2350/10-11(01), CB(2)2511/10-11(01) to (02), CB(2)1685/11-12(03), CB(2)1814/11-12(01) and CB(2)1890/11-12(01) to (03)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Chairman advised that the Research Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat had updated the research report entitled "Retirement Protection System in Selected Places" which was issued to members on 7 May 2012.

3. Members noted that the Administration had provided the latest position of the Administration's studies and measures related to the retirement protection system in Hong Kong, and a consolidated response to deputations' requests for the provision of statistical information relating to retirement protection.

4. Members expressed grave dissatisfaction at the refusal of the Central Policy Unit ("CPU") to make available any findings of its studies on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong to facilitate the discussion of the Subcommittee on the subject. The Administration advised that CPU was continuing its work in refining its study. This included, among others, conducting a territory-wide household survey in February 2012 to understand the latest economic situation of the elderly in Hong Kong and

Action

their retirement plans. The initial results of the survey were expected to be available by the end of 2012 at the earliest. When taking forward its study on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong, CPU would make reference to the deliberations of the Subcommittee and the retirement protection models proposed by the deputations. Upon completion of its work on refining the studies, CPU would submit the overall study findings and recommendations to the Administration for review and consideration of the way forward.

5. Members did not subscribe to the Administration's explanation. They considered the unduly long time taken for the CPU study was unacceptable. The Subcommittee passed the following motion moved by Mr WONG Sing-chi and seconded by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan -

"本小組委員會譴責中央政策組漠視立法會研究全民退休保障工作，一直拒絕提交其所進行的任何有關研究，以利公眾討論。"

(Translation)

"That this Subcommittee condemns CPU for ignoring the Legislative Council's efforts in studying the subject of universal retirement protection and being reluctant to provide findings of any relevant studies that it has conducted so far, so as to facilitate public discussion."

6. Members considered the draft report of the Subcommittee prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat, and agreed to make the following amendments to the draft report -

- (a) to include the discussion made at this meeting, which included, among others, the passage of the above motion, in the report; and
- (b) to revise the second sentence of paragraph 63(b) as follows: "The next Government should accord top priority to setting immediately set up a dedicated task force to study the subject matter, with a view to drawing up a concrete timetable for the launch of an extensive public consultation on the options and implementation details without further delay, and formulating concrete execution plans in the first year of tenure".

7. The Chairman advised that subject to any further views from members on the draft report by 5:00 pm on 10 May 2012, the

Action

Subcommittee would submit the revised report incorporating the above amendments to the Panel on Welfare Services on 14 May 2012 and seek the support of the Panel and the agreement of the House Committee for priority allocation of a debate slot to the Chairman of the Subcommittee under House Rule 14A(h) for moving a motion on the Subcommittee's report at the Council meeting on 6 June 2012.

*(Post-meeting note: The revised report of the Subcommittee was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1953/11-12 on 9 May 2012.)*

**II. Any other business**

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 3:01 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
19 September 2012

**Proceedings of the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Retirement Protection  
on Tuesday, 8 May 2012, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Meeting with the Administration</i>			
000210 - 000422	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000423 - 000914	Administration Chairman	Briefing by the Administration on its response to issues raised by members at previous meetings [LC Paper No. CB(2)1890/11-12(01)].	
000915 - 001342	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan's enquiry on whether the incumbent Administration had commenced the preparatory work to put in place measures to progressively reduce the proportion of accrued benefits attributed to employer's contribution in the Mandatory Provident Fund ("MPF") account that could be applied by the employer to offset long-service or severance payments as pledged in the Chief Executive-elect's Manifesto; and his request to make public the studies on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong conducted by the Central Policy Unit ("CPU").</p> <p>The Administration's responses -</p> <p>(a) the incumbent Administration would focus on its work on hand at the moment, which included, among others, to secure the passage of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) (No.2) Bill 2011 for regulating MPF intermediaries in the current legislative session, and to work on the proposed amendments to the relevant subsidiary legislation to improve the levy mechanism for the MPF Compensation Fund; and</p> <p>(b) CPU was refining its studies on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong in the light of the latest developments and the results of the territory-wide household survey on the latest economic situation of the elderly and their retirement plans which were expected to be available by the end of 2012. That said, the Administration had briefed the Subcommittee vide LC Paper No. CB(2)2350/10-11(01) the initial findings of the studies, which indicated that the three pillars under the current retirement protection model in Hong Kong were complementary to one another.</p>	
001343 - 001844	Chairman Administration	The Administration's explanation in response to the Chairman that its 30-year population projection would be updated every two to three years taking into account information on latest changes of the population profiles and the relevant Government policies. This would	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		provide a more accurate projection than conducting a projection covering a span of 60 years as suggested by some deputations.	
001845 - 002113	Mr WONG Sing-chi Chairman	Mr WONG Sing-chi's expression of dissatisfaction with CPU's refusal to provide any findings of its studies on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong to facilitate the Subcommittee's discussion on the subject.	
002114 - 002629	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Mr WONG Sing-chi	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan's proposed amendments to paragraph 63(b) of the draft report of the Subcommittee.	
002630 - 002801	Chairman	The seeking of the support of the Panel and the agreement of the House Committee for priority allocation of a debate slot to the Chairman of the Subcommittee under House Rule 14A(h) for moving a motion on the Subcommittee's report at a Council meeting as set out in paragraph 64 of the draft report of the Subcommittee.	
002802 - 002857	Chairman	Handling the motion moved by Mr WONG Sing-chi and seconded by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan.	
002858 - 003027	Chairman	Updates on the research report entitled "Retirement Protection System in Selected Places" prepared by the Research Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat.	
003028 - 003225	Chairman Mr WONG Sing-chi	Reporting the deliberations of the Subcommittee to the Panel on Welfare Services on 14 May 2012.	
<i>Agenda item II – Any other business</i>			
003226 - 003303	Chairman	Concluding remarks	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
19 September 2012