

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1705/12-13

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/HS/1/12

**Subcommittee on Poverty**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting  
held on Saturday, 27 April 2013, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon WONG Yuk-man  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon Charles Peter MOK  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung

**Members absent** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP  
Hon TANG Ka-piu

**Public Officers : Item III  
attending**

Mr Mathew CHEUNG, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Jane LEE Sze-yan  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
(Poverty)

Ms Reddy NG Wai-lan, JP  
Principal Economist (5)  
Economic Analysis and Business Facilitation Unit  
Financial Secretary's Office

**Attendance by : Item III  
invitation**

Session One

Alliance for Universal Pension

Mr AU YEUNG Kwun-tong  
Organizer

Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group

Mr CHUNG Hau-ping  
Member

Chinese Grey Power

Ms LO Siu-lan  
Chairperson

Labour Rights Commune

Ms CHEUNG Man-wai  
Member

Care-taker's Concern Group

Ms CHU Moon-chun  
Member

Kwai Chung Estate Residents Rights Concern Group

Mr CHENG Biu  
Chairperson

利安邨利華樓互委會

Mr TSANG Lui-keung  
Chairman

Grassroots Development Centre

Mr NG Kin-wing  
Committee Member

Hong Kong Association for the Survivors of Women  
Abuse (Kwan Fook)

---

Ms XU Mei-qiong

Shamshuipo Community Association

Mr LAU Cheuk-kei  
Director

Oxfam Hong Kong

Mr HO Chun-kit  
Policy Officer

The Lion Rock Institute

Miss Janice FUNG Rui-xian  
Research Assistant

Academic for Universal Pension

Mr Nicholas CHAN Hok-fung  
Chairman

Miss Christina TSAO

Elderly Welfare Group

Mr LAI Ming-lai  
Member

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of  
Hong Kong

---

Mr William MA Yik-yeung  
Deputy Spokesperson of Welfare Services

Industrial Relations Institute

Miss HO Yee-yan  
Organizer

Women Workers' Cooperative

Ms LAU Yee-wan  
Member

Justice and Peace Commission of the Catholic Diocese

Miss YIP Po-lam  
Project Officer

Dr James Patrick VERE

Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's  
Livelihood

---

Mr Pius YUM Kwok-tung  
Spokesperson

Labour Party

Mr TAM Chun-yin  
General Secretary

The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour  
Unions (Social Affairs Committee)

---

Mr KONG Yat-fung  
Secretary

人手比例不乎最低工資關注組

Mr WONG Kwai-sang  
Member

New Women Arrivals League

Mr WONG Kai-hing  
Campaign Coordinator

全民退保關注組

Mr CHIU See-poon

中港低收入家庭互助網絡

Miss CHOW Wing-chi  
Organizer

關注扶貧政策小組

Ms HO Foei-lin  
Member

關注綜援改革行動組

Mr Herrick LEE Yen-hao  
Member

Session Two

N. T. Evangelical Ambassador

Mr Simon TAM  
Member

Pastoral Centre for Workers (N.T.)  
Catholic Diocese of Hongkong Diocesan

Mr YU Siu-po  
Acting Centre Supervisor

North District Employment Concern Group

Ms Venny KWOK  
Convener

Smart and Beauty Group

Mr CHOW King  
Convener

Civic Party

Mr Patrick LEUNG  
Member of Eastern District Council

The Democratic Party

Mr LO Kin-hei

New People's Party

Mr Jason WONG Tsz-leung  
Policy Officer

天水圍爭取低收入家庭權益會

Ms CHAN Siu-kuen  
Member

爭取貧窮線定立於入息中位數六成會

Miss PANG Kit-ling  
Member

Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance

Miss YEUNG Pui-yan  
Community Organizer

Ms CHOI Pik-kwan

六成會

Mr LEE Tai-shing  
Community Organizer

葵涌邨基層關注組

Miss TSUI Yee-kei

"I want low income allowance" alliance

Mr NG Kwan-lim

Tin Shui Wai Low Income Subsidy Concern Group

Miss LING Zhi-feng

Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance

Mr KONG Kin-shing  
Social Worker

Ms HO Shuk-yi

葵涌區劏房街坊關注組

Ms FUNG Kuk-ying  
Member

葵涌劏房住客聯盟

Ms HO Lai-chun  
Member

Tin Shui Wai Parents Group

Ms Carmen CHEUNG  
Representative

Ms CHAN Wa-chun

Alliance for Children Development Right

Miss LAM Man-wa  
Community Organizer

Rights of Low Income Family Concern Group

Miss CHAN Ka-yiu  
Organizer

反對閉門造車聯盟

Mr LI Ting-fung  
Member

Ms HU Kwun-wing

1<sup>st</sup> Step Association

Ms NG Yan-yee  
Centre in charge

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr Peace WONG  
Officer, Policy Research and Advocacy

Concerning Urban Housing Rights Social Workers Alliance

---

Mr LAI Kin-kwok  
Convener

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Karen LAI  
Council Secretary (2) 4

Ms Judy TING  
Council Secretary (2) 6



Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

---

**I. Proposed overseas duty visit to Finland and Sweden**  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(01)]

The Subcommittee agreed that an overseas duty visit to Finland and Sweden should be conducted from 19 to 24 August 2013 to study their experience in alleviating poverty and addressing relevant problems arising from an ageing population, and the visit should be open to non-Subcommittee Members.

**II. Subjects to be discussed at meetings in May to July 2013**  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(02)]

2. The Subcommittee agreed to the subjects to be discussed at the meetings in May to July 2013, as detailed in the paper prepared by LegCo Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(02)].

*(Post-meeting note: The meeting originally scheduled for 20 May 2013 has been re-scheduled to 24 May 2013).*

**III. Poverty line**  
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1026/12-13(01) and (02)]

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

**IV. Any other business**

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:15 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
12 August 2013

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Poverty  
on Saturday, 27 April 2013, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda item I – Proposed overseas duty visit to Finland and Sweden</i>			
000340 - 000712	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Clerk	Members' agreement that an overseas duty visit to Finland and Sweden would be conducted from 19 to 24 August 2013 to study their experience in alleviating poverty and addressing relevant problems arising from an ageing population, and the visit should be open to non-Subcommittee Members.	
<i>Agenda item II – Subjects to be discussed at meetings in May to July 2013</i>			
000713 - 000832	Chairman	Members' agreement to the subjects to be discussed at the meetings in May to July 2013, as detailed in the paper prepared by Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(02)].	
<i>Agenda item III – Poverty line</i>			
000833 - 001935	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks  Briefing by the Administration on the progress of the Commission on Poverty ("CoP")'s work in setting a poverty line.	
001936 - 002251	Alliance for Universal Pension Chairman	Views that the Old Age Living Allowance ("OALA") could not help address the problem of elderly poverty because the eligibility for OALA was subject to an assessment of income and assets, the best way forward was the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme, and the Administration should work out a timetable and road map for the scheme.	
002252 - 002552	Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1026/12-13(03)]  Views that the procedure for applying OALA was confusing and the front-line staff of the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") were not helpful in dealing with the enquiries of the applicants; and enquiry about the validity of an application for OALA if the application form did not carry the signature of a witness; and request for the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme.	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
002553 - 002728	Chinese Grey Power Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(03)]</p> <p>Views that OALA was inadequate to meet the needs of the poor elderly and the best way forward was the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme.</p>	
002729 - 003044	Labour Rights Commune Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(04)]</p> <p>Doubt about the effectiveness of setting a poverty line to address the problem of poverty; and request for the implementation of appropriate measures to help the working poor, such as the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme, removal of the "contracting out" system and increase of the hourly rate of statutory minimum wage to \$35.</p>	
003045 - 003358	Care-taker's Concern Group Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1046/12-13(01)]</p> <p>Views that CoP should make public its discussion documents to enhance the transparency of its work, and the Administration should introduce new taxation regimes such as progressive corporate profits tax and dividend tax to mitigate the situation where the wealth of Hong Kong was concentrated in the hands of a few people.</p>	
003359 - 003618	Kwai Chung Estate Residents Rights Concern Group Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1046/12-13(02)]</p> <p>Views that the requirement of the signature of a witness on the application form of OALA complicated the application procedure.</p>	
003619 - 003820	利安邨利華樓互委會 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1046/12-13(03)]</p> <p>Disappointment at the slow progress of the Administration in introducing a universal retirement protection scheme.</p>	
003821 - 004132	Grassroots Development Centre Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1046/12-13(04)]</p> <p>Request for CoP to enhance the transparency of its work by making public its discussion documents, and the Administration to introduce a universal retirement protection scheme to combat the problem of structural poverty among the elderly.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
004133 - 004414	Hong Kong Association for the Survivors of Women Abuse (Kwan Fook) Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as follows –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) in support of following the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development ("OECD") to set the poverty line at 50% of the median household income;</li> <li>(b) in its formulation of policies to alleviate poverty, the Administration should ensure equal distribution of resources between men and women; and</li> <li>(c) the Administration should provide financial support for victims of family violence to help them rebuild their homes and meet the costs of sending their children to new schools.</li> </ul>	
004415 - 004733	Shamshuipo Community Association Chairman	Enquiry about the method to be employed by the Administration to quantify public housing benefits in the calculation of household income; and request for the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme.	
004734 - 005038	Oxfam Hong Kong Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1026/12-13(05)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Oxfam Hong Kong agreed that the poverty line should be set at 50% of the median household income;</li> <li>(b) Oxfam supported the proposal that non-cash based social transfer such as education and hospital services should not be counted in the calculation of household income; and</li> <li>(c) Oxfam did not object in principle to using the market rental value of public housing as the amount of social transfer in calculating household income, and suggested that the Administration should make reference to the average market value for the past three years, and set a ceiling on the ratio of the market rental value of public housing to household income, so as to take into account the affordability of low-income families.</li> </ul>	
005039 - 005253	The Lion Rock Institute Chairman	Expressing the views that the Lion Rock Institute did not support the adoption of the concept of relative poverty and setting a poverty line on the basis of the median household income; assets should be taken into account in measuring poverty; and poverty could only be measured by objective and scientific standards such as measuring the calorie intake and living space of needy persons.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
005254 - 005540	Academic for Universal Pension Chairman	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <p>(a) it was not appropriate to include the market rental value of public housing in the calculation of household income as it might underestimate the severity of poverty;</p> <p>(b) needy elderly were being stigmatised under OALA's assessment of income and assets; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration should provide a timetable and road map for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme.</p>	
005541 - 005845	Miss Christina TSAO Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1036/12-13(05)]</p> <p>Views that the Mandatory Provident Fund System could not serve the purpose of retirement protection given that it might involve high-risk investment and was subject to economic performance; and a universal retirement protection with tripartite contributions would provide a comprehensive retirement protection to not only the working people but also the elderly and housewives who did not have income.</p>	
005846 - 010158	Elderly Welfare Group Chairman	<p>Expressing the views that the Administration had failed to find out the causes of structural poverty among elderly, the setting of a poverty line was only the first step to eliminate poverty, and the Administration should take concrete measures to combat poverty.</p>	
010159 - 010514	中港低收入家庭互助網絡 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <p>(a) the general public was not able to know the progress of the work of CoP as it did not make public its discussions and the relevant documents;</p> <p>(b) the income of the general public could hardly meet the ever increasing living costs; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration should ensure fair distribution of wealth, given that the wealth of Hong Kong was concentrated in the hands of big conglomerates and property developers.</p>	
010515 - 010758	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	<p>Presentation of views as follows –</p> <p>(a) Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong adopted an open</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Chairman	<p>attitude towards the setting of a poverty line;</p> <p>(b) there was a need for the Administration to explain to the general public as to why the setting of a poverty line did not mean that the Administration should automatically offer subsidies to individuals or families whose income was below the poverty line; and</p> <p>(c) subsidies should be provided for the working poor who were not eligible for the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") Scheme.</p>	
010759 - 011127	Industrial Relations Institute Chairman	Expressing the views that the working people were continually exploited by big conglomerates and property developers, facing high rental and rising living costs; and suggestions that the Administration should consider regulating the situation in which the wealth of Hong Kong was concentrated in the hands of a few people.	
011128 - 011431	Women Workers' Cooperative Chairman	Suggestions that the Administration should review the statutory minimum wage on an annual basis, adopt legislation to safeguard standard working hours and collective bargaining of workers, and introduce a universal retirement protection scheme.	
011432 - 011723	Justice and Peace Commission of the Catholic Diocese Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as follows –</p> <p>(a) the poverty line should be set above 50% of the median household income, given that the average CSSA payments received by one-person and six-person households already exceeded 50% of the median household income. The poverty line should instead be set at 60% and a poverty prevention line be set at 70% of the median household income to prevent high-risk families from falling into poverty;</p> <p>(b) the market rental value of public housing should not be included in the calculation of household income;</p> <p>(c) CoP should conduct consultations to solicit views of the general public; and</p> <p>(d) the functions of poverty line should be complemented by concrete policies, such as the provision of subsidies to low-income families.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
011724 - 011854	Dr James Patrick VERE Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1026/12-13(06)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the benchmarking of the poverty line against the median household income was essentially similar to benchmarking it against the income of the middle class. It would not reflect the real situation of poverty, particularly the working poor, as the income of the middle class was affected by a number of variables;</li> <li>(b) the most rigorous approach to setting a poverty line would be to use an expenditure approach, and</li> <li>(c) once consensus was reached on what essential goods and services should comprise a poverty budget, a Consumer Price Index should be developed and deployed to monitor changes in the prices of goods and services most relevant to households in poverty.</li> </ul>	
011855 - 012216	Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as follows –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the rates of CSSA should be reviewed;</li> <li>(b) the poverty line should be set above 50% of the median household income, and a poverty prevention line should also be set;</li> <li>(c) the market rental value of public housing should not be included in the calculation of household income; and</li> <li>(d) a universal retirement protection scheme should be implemented.</li> </ul>	
012217 - 012557	Labour Party Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1046/12-13(05)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the poverty line should be set on the basis of "disposable income" which included the market in-cash income and in-cash social benefits, and deducted taxes, social security contributions and housing costs;</li> <li>(b) the main poverty line should be set at 60% and two poverty lines be set at 40% and 50% of the median per capita household income to gauge the poverty situation of various groups. The poverty threshold should be calculated on the basis of the median income of each household member and should not be adjusted according to the change of number of household members; and</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) the market rental value of public housing should not be included in the calculation of household income because the high market rental of private housing would have a bearing on the quantification of public housing benefits.	
012558 - 012845	The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions (Social Affairs Committee) Chairman	Presentation of views as follows –  (a) consideration should be given to setting several poverty lines by benchmarking them against 50% of and above the median household income;  (b) the Administration should ensure education services for needy children to assist them in social mobility; and  (c) a subsistence living protection line should also be set to facilitate the provision of welfare services for low-income individuals and families.	
012846 - 013211	人手比例不乎最低工資 關注組 Chairman	Views on the problems concerning staff benefits and retirement arrangements for part-timers working at Telebet Centres of the Hong Kong Jockey Club.	
013212 - 013537	New Women Arrivals League Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(03)]  (a) it was inappropriate to set the poverty line at 50% of the median household income since the average CSSA payments received by one-person and six-person households already exceeded 50% of median household income;  (b) the seven-year residence requirement for new-arrivals should be abolished so as to allow them to receive social welfare benefits; and  (c) improvement should be made to child care services and the training courses offered by the Employees Retraining Board with a view to enabling new women arrivals to secure employment.	
013538 - 013925	全民退保關注組 Chairman	Advocating for expeditious implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme.	
013926 - 014236	關注扶貧政策小組 Chairman	Expressing the views that the poverty line should be set at 60% of the median household income, a universal retirement protection scheme should be	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		introduced, and CoP should invite representatives of various stakeholders to join its work.	
014237 - 014627	關注綜援改革行動組 Chairman	Views that the Administration should review CSSA expeditiously, and conduct a study on subsistence living necessities to work out the goods and services required by an individual or a household for a subsistence living.	
014628 - 015843	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration's response that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Administration was determined to take concrete measures to alleviate poverty;</li> <li>(b) the poverty line would be an important tool for assessing the effectiveness of poverty alleviation policies;</li> <li>(c) on the issue of retirement protection, the Social Security and Retirement Protection Task Force under the CoP had agreed to invite Professor Nelson CHOW to undertake a study to review the existing three-pillar retirement protection system in Hong Kong. The study, to be completed in around 12 months' time, would analyse the different options put forth by the community in an objective and scientific manner based on which the way forward would be considered;</li> <li>(d) the CoP and its six task forces were widely represented with members drawn from different sectors, including LegCo Members appointed on an <i>ad personam</i> basis. Noting that the views of different stakeholders were very valuable, the Administration had attended forums organized by the Hong Kong Council of Social Service and listened to views of Oxfam Hong Kong to solicit the community's views on poverty alleviation;</li> <li>(e) CoP had been uploading suitable information onto its website. However, CoP would not disclose documents concerning policy formulation and resource allocation that had yet to be finalised;</li> <li>(f) the requirement of the signature of a witness on an OALA's application form was not a new arrangement as the same was also required for completing Old Age Allowance ("OAA") application forms. The applicant should seek assistance from SWD when he or she had difficulties in finding a witness;</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(g) the practice of setting the poverty line at 50% of the median household income had been adopted internationally, e.g. OECD. Locally, the Hong Kong Council of Social Service and Oxfam Hong Kong had been estimating the size of poor population using the same 50% threshold for years, and their poverty estimates had been widely quoted and well recognized in the community; and</p> <p>(h) the setting of a poverty line did not mean that the Administration would automatically offer subsidies to individuals or households whose income was below the poverty line. On the contrary, at present, even if the household income of some groups was slightly above 50% of the median household income, they would be eligible for government subsidies subject to their being able to meet the means test of the respective assistance schemes.</p>	
015844 - 020925	Break		
020926 - 021335	N. T. Evangelical Ambassador Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as follows –</p> <p>(a) the inclusion of the market rental value of public housing in household income would not reflect the real situation of poverty, as it would on paper reduce the number of people living below the poverty line;</p> <p>(b) the quantification of public housing benefits should not be benchmarked against market rental value; and</p> <p>(c) a universal retirement protection scheme should be introduced to tackle the problem of ageing population.</p>	
021336 - 021641	Pastoral Centre for Workers (N.T.) Catholic Diocese of Hongkong Diocesan Chairman	Request for the Administration to target its poverty alleviation policies on those who genuinely needed government assistance rather than those who were well-off.	
021642 - 021843	North District Employment Concern Group Chairman	Request for the Administration to take concrete measures to address the problems faced by grassroot workers, and provide more resources to the People's Food Bank operated by St. James Settlement.	
021844 - 022153	Smart and Beauty Group Chairman	Request for the Administration to provide specific assistance to the elderly, young people and working people who lived in poverty.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
022154 - 022516	Civic Party Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(04)]</p> <p>Views that the Administration's existing poverty alleviation policies and the 24 multi-dimensional poverty indicators for monitoring the overall poverty situation were ineffective; and request for the Administration to expeditiously set a poverty line to gauge the poverty situation and formulate long-term and specific policies to alleviate poverty.</p>	
022517 - 022833	The Democratic Party Chairman	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Democratic Party considered it acceptable to set the poverty line at 50% of the median household income;</li> <li>(b) the Administration should consider disclosing the data in respect of the study of poverty line to facilitate the analysis of poverty measurement by academics and non-governmental organizations ("NGOs"); and</li> <li>(c) it was unreasonable to use market value of housing rental to quantify public housing benefits.</li> </ul>	
022834 - 023139	New People's Party Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1099/12-13(01)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the use of a certain percentage of the median household income to set the poverty line, be it 50%, 60% or 70%, would be affected by subjective judgments and political factors, thereby giving rise to controversy;</li> <li>(b) there had been controversy about the inclusion or otherwise of income taxes and social benefits in the measurement of income under the relative poverty approach;</li> <li>(c) the use of the relative poverty approach to measure poverty might overstate the extent of poverty given that it did not take asset into account; and</li> <li>(d) in using the relative poverty approach to formulate poverty alleviation policies, it was important to link personal income to the distribution of the overall income of Hong Kong, and allocate large amount of resources exceeding the rate of economic growth to alleviate poverty.</li> </ul>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
023140 - 023348	天水圍爭取低收入家庭權益會 Chairman	Views that the poverty line should be set at 60% of the median household income to reflect the real situation of poverty, and the setting of a poverty line should be complemented by concrete measures.	
023349 - 023707	爭取貧窮線定立於入息中位數六成會 Chairman	Views that it was not appropriate to draw the poverty line at 50% of the median household income, given that the average CSSA payments received by low-income families exceeded the amount of 50% of the median household income, and CoP should allow the participation of the general public in its work.	
023708 - 023958	Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance Chairman	Suggestions that the poverty line should be drawn at 60% of the median household income, a poverty prevention line should also be drawn, and complementary measures such as the low-income family subsidies should be implemented.	
023959 - 024316	Ms CHOI Pik-kwan Chairman	Requests for the provision of financial assistance for low-income families to meet the costs of extra-curricular activities for their children, and improvement of child care services to help working parents with child care problems.	
024317 - 024633	六成會 Chairman	Views that the Administration's existing policies and measures failed to combat poverty, and the income of needy families was hardly enough to meet the rising costs of basic necessities.	
024634 - 024916	葵涌邨基層關注組 Chairman	Presentation of views that –  (a) the setting of the poverty line at 50% of the median household income would underestimate the poverty problem;  (b) low-income families found it difficult to make ends meet as they spent a large portion of their income to pay for the cost of housing rental; and  (c) the Administration should consider providing extra-curricular activity subsidy and low-income family allowance for needy households.	
024917 - 025235	"I want low income allowance" alliance Chairman	Presentation of views that –  (a) it was appropriate to draw the poverty line at 60% of the median household income, considering the high living costs and inflation in Hong Kong;  (b) while setting a poverty line to gauge the	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>poverty situation, the Administration should also roll out concrete measures to tackle the poverty problem; and</p> <p>(c) it was not appropriate to include the market rental value of public housing in the calculation of household income.</p>	
025236 - 025520	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(08)]</p> <p>(a) The Hong Kong Council of Social Service initially accepted the setting of the poverty line on the basis of the median household income, as it was in line with the practice adopted by most developed countries and would help ensure that the poverty level was linked to the level of the overall development of the community;</p> <p>(b) apart from using 50% of the median household income as the poverty threshold, 40% and 60% could also be used to gauge the poverty situation from different perspectives;</p> <p>(c) the setting of the poverty line at a certain percentage of the median household income was an arbitrary practice, hence the poverty line should not be regarded as the basis of reasonable standard of living;</p> <p>(d) the objectives of setting the poverty line should be to help monitor the poverty situation, assist in formulating policy and assess the effectiveness of poverty alleviation policy. It should not be used as the eligibility threshold for various government assistance schemes; and</p> <p>(e) consideration should be given to conducting a study on subsistence living budget, with a view to objectively assessing the subsistence living necessities of people living in poverty.</p>	
025521 - 025921	Tin Shui Wai Low Income Subsidy Concern Group Chairman	<p>Expressing views that –</p> <p>(a) it was important to implement measures to combat poverty;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should address the poverty problem from the viewpoint of people living in poverty; and</p> <p>(c) market rental value of public housing should not be included in the calculation of household income.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
025922 - 030243	Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance' Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(06)]</p> <p>Request for the poverty line to be directly linked to the eligibility criteria of various means-tested assistance programmes.</p>	
030244 - 030625	Ms HO Shuk-yi Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(07)]</p> <p>Views that the Administration should face up to the financial hardship faced by persons with disabilities in meeting the costs of medical treatment and equipment, and consideration should be given to setting a subsistence living protection line.</p>	
030624 - 030858	葵涌區劏房街坊關注組 Chairman	Requests for the Administration to provide assistance to CSSA families living in sub-divided units to meet the costs of basic needs such as food, housing and health care, and set the poverty line at 60% of the median household income.	
030859 - 031027	葵涌劏房住客聯盟 Chairman	Views that CSSA families living in sub-divided units found it very difficult to make ends meet, and the poverty line should be drawn at 60% of the median household income; and enquiry about the counting of the unstable income generated from casual job in the calculation of household income.	
031028 - 031241	Tin Shui Wai Parents Group Chairman	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <p>(a) Tin Shui Wai Parents Group objected to the inclusion of market rental value of public housing in the calculation of household income;</p> <p>(b) the main poverty line should be set at 60% and a poverty prevention line set at 70% of the median household income. Of particular importance was the formulation of specific policies to combat poverty;</p> <p>(c) it was incumbent upon the Administration to provide cash subsidy for needy children to participate in extra-curricular activities to ensure equal development opportunities for these children; and</p> <p>(d) review of the various financial assistance schemes administered by the Students Financial Assistance Agency should be carried out expeditiously.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
031242 - 031459	Ms CHAN Wa-chun Chairman	Views that the Administration should ensure equal development opportunities for children from low-income families, and provision of 15-year free education and extra-curricular activity subsidy for them.	
031500 - 031823	Alliance for Children Development Right Chairman	Expression of views that –  (a) the main poverty line should be set at 60% and a poverty prevention line set at 70% of the median household income;  (b) the benefits of public housing and OAA should not be counted in the calculation of household income; and  (c) the Administration should formulate policies with a view to revamping the whole social welfare system.	
031824 - 032027	Rights of Low Income Family Concern Group Chairman	Expression of views that –  (a) the poverty line should serve as an indicator in some measure; the Administration should assist people living below the poverty line to improve their livelihood, thereby enabling them to live above the poverty line;  (b) the Administration should conduct wide public consultation on the setting of the poverty line, given that there was a strong view in the community that it should be drawn at 60% of the median household income; and  (c) the Administration should take into account household expenditure in measuring poverty by identifying the subsistence living necessities most relevant to households in poverty.	
032028 - 032353	反對閉門造車聯盟 Chairman	Expression of views that –  (a) the Administration should follow the practice of some developed countries to set several poverty lines or indicators to capture the various aspects of poverty, and the main poverty line should be set at 60% of the median household income; and  (b) representatives of the general public should be invited to participate in the work of CoP.	
032354 - 032610	Ms HU Kwun-wing Chairman	Request for the Administration to face up to the problem of high living costs, hence setting the	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		poverty line at 60% of the median household income.	
032611 - 032922	1st Step Association Chairman	Provision of information on the financial hardship faced by some tetraplegic persons in meeting the costs of medical treatment/equipment and carers, and their ineligibility for various means-tested assistance schemes because the combined income of these households exceeded the income limits set for the relevant schemes; and request for the drawing up of a subsistence living protection line.	
032923 - 033229	Concerning Urban Housing Rights Social Workers Alliance Chairman	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1065/12-13(09)]</p> <p>(a) in addition to setting a poverty line, a subsistence living protection line should also be set, given the high living expenses, especially the expenses for housing;</p> <p>(b) the data and figures in relation to the study of poverty line should be disclosed for public viewing; and</p> <p>(c) there was a genuine need for the Administration to further deliberate the controversial issues relating to the inclusion of the market rental value of public housing in the "post-social transfer household income".</p>	
033230 - 033950	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration's responses that –</p> <p>(a) it was a common practice, both internationally and locally, to set the poverty line at 50% of the median household income. OECD adopted 50% of the median household income as their headline poverty threshold. In Hong Kong, NGOs such as The Hong Kong Council of Social Service and Oxfam Hong Kong had been estimating the size of poor population for years based on 50% of median household income. Their poverty estimates had been widely quoted and well recognized in the community;</p> <p>(b) poverty alleviation was a priority of the current term Government. Prior to the setting of the poverty line, the Administration had already embarked on the implementation of OALA and the enhancement of WITS;</p> <p>(c) the poverty line would help quantify the poverty situation in Hong Kong, with</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>focused analysis of the characteristics of the various groups of people living below the poverty line;</p> <p>(d) the poverty line would also enable the quantitative assessment of the effectiveness of policy interventions;</p> <p>(e) on the hardships faced by people with disabilities, the Special Needs Groups Task Force under CoP would consider measures to assist this particular group of people; and</p> <p>(f) the Administration was reviewing the Short-term Food Assistance Service projects operated by NGOs, and planned to submit a funding proposal to the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council within the 2012-2013 legislative session.</p>	
033951 - 034549	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chairman Administration	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's views that –</p> <p>(a) although the practice of benchmarking the poverty line against 50% of the median household income had been widely adopted in Hong Kong, the Administration should ensure its appropriateness with regard to the socio-economic characteristics specific to local context;</p> <p>(b) it was unreasonable to set the poverty line at 50% of the median household income, as half of the median income of a one-person household (i.e. \$3,650) was much lower than the average CSSA payment received by the corresponding household size (i.e. \$4,351); and</p> <p>(c) CoP should disclose the data and discussion papers concerning the setting of poverty line for public viewing.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) there was a need for CoP to keep some of the information confidential when such information involved discussion and preliminary considerations; and</p> <p>(b) the setting of a poverty line did not mean that people in need but with income level above the poverty line would be deprived of the opportunity to receive welfare assistance. Poverty alleviation measures would continue to be considered based on the needs of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		different under-privileged groups. For example, the income limit for applying WITS represented about 60% to 100% of the median household income.	
034550 - 035100	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Chairman Administration	<p>Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che's views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it was incumbent upon the Administration to explain its rationale for following the practice of OECD to set the poverty line at 50% of median household income but not the practice adopted by the European Union ("EU") which set the poverty line at 60% of median household income;</li> <li>(b) consideration should be given to adopting disposable income to measure poverty; and</li> <li>(c) it was necessary to set a subsistence living protection line to ensure a basic living for households in poverty.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) setting the poverty line at 50% of the median household income was easy to understand and widely recognized in the community;</li> <li>(b) on the adoption of disposable income taking into account household expenditure to measure poverty, data of such income were not collected by the Census and Statistics Department ("C&amp;SD")'s General Household Survey. To take into account the full expenditure pattern of households, up-to-date expenditure data would be required which would only be available in the Household Expenditure Survey conducted by C&amp;SD every five years, with the next one to be conducted in 2014-2015; and</li> <li>(c) it was the understanding of CoP that the main poverty line should be drawn first. When the relevant data were available, CoP would consider carrying out further study.</li> </ul>	
035101 - 035514	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it was the responsibility of the Administration to ensure a humane living standard for Hong Kong people;</li> <li>(b) the existing policies of poverty alleviation were ineffective, and the setting of a poverty line would help gauge the poverty status of</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the population, thereby facilitating the formulation of new policies;</p> <p>(c) if disposable income was adopted to measure poverty, any person living under the poverty line was entitled to receiving social welfare assistance;</p> <p>(d) needy individuals should have equal right to social welfare assistance irrespective of the financial capability of his or her family; and</p> <p>(e) consideration should be given to following the practice adopted by EU where the poverty line was set at 60% of the median disposable income. Given the huge fiscal reserve of the Government, Hong Kong was more capable than the member states of EU to implement social welfare measures.</p>	
035515 - 040038	Mr KWOK Wai-keung Chairman Administration	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung's views that –</p> <p>(a) the residual model adopted by the Administration to implement its social welfare policies was ineffective to alleviate poverty;</p> <p>(b) several poverty lines at different percentages of the median household income should be set; and</p> <p>(c) while the focus of the Administration was the development of finance, property and tourism, consideration should be given to creating more job opportunities for grassroots workers.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) while EU adopted a benchmark at 60% of the median household income, it was important to note that this was an "at-risk-of-poverty" threshold; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration attached great importance to the job opportunities for grassroots workers.</p>	
040039 - 040222	Chairman 六成會	Views that the Administration should not set the poverty line in haste, and consideration should be given to setting it when the disposable income data to be collected in the next Household Expenditure Survey in 2014-2015 was known.	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
040223 - 040331	"I want low income allowance" alliance Chairman	View that it was inappropriate to follow the practice adopted by the Rating and Valuation Department in assessing the market rental value of public housing.	
040332 - 040415	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service Chairman	Suggestion that the Administration should study the basic living needs of various groups with a view to determining the different levels of assistance to be offered to them.	
040416 - 040521	Tin Shui Wai Low Income Subsidy Concern Group Chairman	View that the Administration should take account of the ever rising living costs in setting the poverty line.	
040522 - 040627	Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance Chairman	Request for the Administration to launch a study on the subsistence living expenditure of various groups in order to gauge their poverty status.	
040628 - 040740	Alliance for Children Development Right Chairman	Views that the Administration should attach importance to the well-being of needy children, and roll out plans and blueprints for the implementation of concrete measures to alleviate poverty.	
040741 - 040843	反對閉門造車聯盟 Chairman	Views that low-income families heavily relied on food bank services provided by NGOs, and the rate of statutory minimum wage should be raised.	
040844 - 040923	Concerning Urban Housing Rights Social Workers Alliance Chairman	Requests for the Administration to further study the inclusion of the market rental value of public housing in the calculation of household income and the relevant valuation method, and disclose the information relating to the study of poverty line for analysis by the general public.	
040924 - 041017	Ms HU Kwun-wing Chairman	Request for the Administration to provide more financial assistance to low-income families.	
041018 - 041519	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration's response that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the three major functions of the poverty line were to gauge the poverty situation, facilitate policy formulation and review policy effectiveness;</li> <li>(b) it was undesirable to postpone the setting of the poverty line until the next Household Expenditure Survey to be conducted in 2014-2015;</li> <li>(c) the market rental value of public housing was not based on the rental value of nearby private residential units, but the estimated market rental value of the specific public housing unit</li> </ul>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		assessed by the Rating and Valuation Department; and  (d) the practice adopted by the Rating and Valuation Department to assess the market rental value of public housing had also been used by the Census and Statistics Department in the 2006 Population By-census, and this practice was well recognised by both international and local academics.	
041520 - 041558	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
12 August 2013