

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)194/13-14

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/HS/1/12

**Subcommittee on Poverty**

**Minutes of the eighth meeting  
held on Friday, 24 May 2013, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon WONG Yuk-man  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon Charles Peter MOK  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon TANG Ka-piu

**Members absent** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

**Public Officers : Item II  
attending**

Mrs Carrie LAM, GBS, JP  
Chief Secretary for Administration

Mr Patrick NIP, JP  
Director of Social Welfare

Ms Grace FOO, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (1)

Mrs Angelina CHEUNG  
Deputy Secretary for Education (6)

Ms Candy LAU  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs  
(Community Care Fund)

Dr LAW Chi-kwong, SBS, JP  
Chairperson, Community Care Fund  
Task Force under the Commission on Poverty

**Clerk in  
attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in  
attendance** : Ms Catherina YU  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 4

Ms Ivy CHENG  
Research Officer (2) 2

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

---

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

**I. Proposed overseas duty visit**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1036/12-13(01) and IN16/12-13]

2. Members agreed that, instead of conducting a duty visit to Finland and Sweden, the Subcommittee should visit Taiwan and Japan to study their experience in alleviating poverty, particularly elderly poverty and working poverty.

**II. Proposed additional injection of \$15 billion into the Community Care Fund**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1154/12-13(01) to (02)]

3. Members supported in principle the submission of the proposal to inject an additional \$15 billion into the Community Care Fund ("CCF") to the Finance Committee. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to provide the evaluation reports of the assistance programmes under CCF.

*(Post meeting note: the Chinese version and English version of nine of the evaluation reports of the assistance programmes under CCF were provided to members on 20 June and 6 August 2013 respectively (LC Paper No. CB(2)1437/12-13(01)).*

**III. Discussion on the draft report on "Poverty line" to be submitted by the Subcommittee**

[LC Paper No. CB(2)1154/12-13(03)]

4. Members agreed that –
- (a) the phrase "及是否將公屋福利納入為政策介入後的住戶收入" should be removed from paragraph 29(d) of the draft report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1154/12-13(03)); and
  - (b) the draft report, upon revision as per (a) above, should be forwarded to the House Committee for information and then to the Commission on Poverty ("CoP") for consideration and response. In the meantime, CoP should be informed of the Subcommittee's recommendations made in the report.

**IV. Any other business**

[LC Paper No. CB(2)1183/12-13(01)]

Action

5. Members agreed that the Subcommittee should discuss the subjects of "Student financial assistance schemes for needy students of various education levels" and "Support for persons with disabilities and ethnic minorities" at the next meeting scheduled for 17 June 2013. Members also agreed that an additional meeting should be held in July 2013 to discuss and receive deputations' views on the subject of "Support for low-income working households which are not on Comprehensive Social Security Allowance".

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:37 am.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
31 October 2013

**Proceedings of the eighth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Poverty  
on Friday, 24 May 2013, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda item I – Proposed overseas duty visit</i>			
000210 - 001225	Chairman Mr WONG Yuk-man Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Mr TAM Yiu-chung Dr Fernando CHEUNG	Members' concurrence that instead of conducting a duty visit to Finland and Sweden, the Subcommittee should visit Taiwan and Japan to study their experience in alleviating poverty, particularly elderly poverty and working poverty. The Chairman's request for the Secretariat to provide a paper on the proposed duty visit for members' further discussion.	Secretariat
<i>Agenda item II – Proposed additional injection of \$15 billion into the Community Care Fund</i>			
001226 - 002414	Chairman Administration CCF Task Force	The Chairman's reminder for members to declare interests in the matter under discussion, if any, according to Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure concerning personal pecuniary interest to be disclosed.  Briefing by the Administration and the CCF Task Force on the proposed injection of an additional \$15 billion into the Community Care Fund ("CCF").	
002415 - 003001	Mr KWOK Wai-keung Chairman Administration	Mr KWOK Wai-keung's concern and view that –  (a) the one-off subsidy provided to Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") households under the "Subsidy for CSSA recipients living in rented private housing" programme might not bring about substantial assistance to the recipients given the high rental of private housing; and  (b) rent allowance should be provided to those who were on the waiting list of public rental housing ("PRH").  The Administration's response that –  (a) topping up the difference between the rental payable by CSSA households living in private housing by way of increasing the maximum rent allowance under the CSSA Scheme or providing rent allowance to those on the waiting list for PRH might trigger an increase in the rental level in private housing.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>As a result, the recipients of this rent allowance might not benefit from the assistance in the end. Furthermore, the eligibility of those on the waiting list for PRH would only be subject to assessment later;</p> <p>(b) the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") and the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") had been requested to conduct an in-depth study on the maximum rent allowance under the CSSA Scheme and submit proposals in this regard to the Retirement Protection and Social Security Task Force ("the Task Force") under the Commission on Poverty ("CoP") for consideration; and</p> <p>(c) CCF would launch the programme to provide subsidy to those who are inadequately housed again later in the year.</p> <p>In response to Mr KWOK's enquiry on how the amount of one-off subsidy for CSSA households living in private housing was determined, the Administration explained that the provision of a one-off subsidy was a flexible approach to provide immediate financial assistance to the eligible CSSA households. Adopting a scientific approach to determine the subsidy level would discount the flexibility.</p>	
003002 - 003725	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chairman Administration	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's view that –</p> <p>(a) the measures launched by CCF failed to target at the needs of the needy. The Administration should collect useful data to evaluate their needs and formulate effective policies to meet these needs; and</p> <p>(b) CoP should enhance its transparency and make public its work on policy formulation.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) CCF's assistance programmes had been effective in assisting its target beneficiaries. The proposed additional injection into CCF would allow the assistance programmes which were proven effective to continue before they were incorporated into the Government's regular assistance programme;</p> <p>(b) CoP would set the poverty line by adopting the concept of relative poverty with reference to the median household income and collect</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>data on specific groups under the poverty line, such as their household and economic situation and their distribution. The compilation of the relevant data was expected to be completed by the end of 2013; and</p> <p>(c) it would not be suitable to release information on issues which were being deliberated by CoP as its dissemination might cause unnecessary misunderstanding and undue expectation by the public. Suitable information had been uploaded onto CoP's website.</p>	
003726 - 004945	Mr TAM Yiu-chung Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Administration	<p>In response to Mr TAM Yiu-chung's enquiry on whether only investment returns generated from the seed capital of CCF could be used for running its assistance programmes, the Administration stated that the capital could be used to fund CCF programmes when necessary. The CCF Task Force was considering placing part of the \$15-billion additional injection with the Hong Kong Monetary Authority so as to ensure sufficient cash flow to fund certain assistance programmes.</p> <p>Views of Mr TAM Yiu-chung and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen that the Elderly Dental Assistance Programme ("the EDA Programme") should be relaxed so that more elderly could benefit.</p> <p>The Administration's response that as CCF was set up to provide assistance to people facing economic difficulties, it had to be prudent in using the fund. As such, it should not provide dental assistance to all elders regardless of their financial situation. Nevertheless, the direction was to expand the coverage of the EDA Programme progressively to benefit more elders with financial difficulties.</p> <p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiry on the amount of pledged donations which had yet to be received.</p> <p>The Administration's response that CCF was not set up on a matching basis. The amount of donations pledged was about \$1.8 billion and some donations were made by yearly instalments over three years. As at end April 2013, the actual amount of donations received was around \$1.255 billion. The Administration was confident that CCF would receive all the pledged donations by the end of the 2013-2014 financial year.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
004946 - 005636	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Chairman Administration CCF Task Force	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG's suggestion that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) dental vouchers be provided for the elderly; and</li> <li>(b) the financial problems faced by the middle-class people who were unemployed were often undermined. CCF should provide assistance, including rent allowance, for them to tide over the difficult situation.</li> </ul> <p>The response of the Administration and the CCF Task Force that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) alleviation measures might be considered for the middle-class people provided that they met the financial assessment criteria; and</li> <li>(b) the main reasons for the low usage of the EDA Programme were due to the fact that only about 200 dentists had participated in the EDA Programme and the serious manpower shortage of non-governmental organization ("NGO") home services teams to provide escorting services for elderly persons to seek dental consultations. The CCF Task Force would collect views on extending the dental services to different groups of elderly persons but careful deliberations had to be made as the number of elderly persons who needed such service was many.</li> </ul>	
005637 - 010356	Dr KWOK Ka-ki Chairman Administration	<p>Dr KWOK Ka-ki's view and concern that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) additional injection into CCF was required because the Government had failed in some of its long-term policies;</li> <li>(b) it was unacceptable that the administrative cost incurred in the EDA Programme was higher than the amount of disbursements to beneficiaries; and</li> <li>(c) although the Administration was requested to deal with the provision of public dental service for low-income earners 10 odd years ago, nothing had been done so far.</li> </ul> <p>The response of the Administration and the CCF Task Force that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) various trust funds were established to complement the Government's initiatives and</li> </ul>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>had their merits, given their flexibility and their involvement of the community in the use of funds, thereby reflecting the needs of the community; and</p> <p>(b) the administrative cost for a CCF's programme was targeted to be within 5% of the estimated disbursement of subsidy for the programme. For the EDA Programme, since the actual number of beneficiaries was far below the estimation, the administrative cost was proportionally high. The CCF Task Force would strive to enhance the EDA Programme to benefit more elders and lower such proportion.</p>	
010357 - 011018	Mr TANG Ka-piu Chairman Administration	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu's view that –</p> <p>(a) rent allowance should be provided on a regular basis for the needy households living in private housing;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should assist the "N have-nots" (i.e. people who could not benefit from the Budget's relief measures; generally referred to those who did not own any properties, live in PRH or receive CSSA) who were inadequately housed; and</p> <p>(c) assistance provided for persons suffering from dementia should be strengthened.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) it was the Government's objective to incorporate those measures which were proven effective into its regular assistance and service programmes. The schedule for regularizing these programmes would be determined after thorough and careful policy deliberations;</p> <p>(b) the housing needs of the "N have-nots" who were inadequately housed should ultimately be addressed through the provision of PRH. CCF would assist these persons before they were allocated a PRH flat; and</p> <p>(c) support for specific groups such as persons suffering from dementia could be considered.</p>	
011019 - 011731	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Chairman	Miss CHAN Yuen-han's view that CCF should try to accommodate the needs of the community	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Administration	<p>as far as possible and her concern about whether the "N have-nots" would be benefited from the proposed additional injection into CCF.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) the CCF Task Force had invited views from NGOs and members of the public on the assistance programmes to be considered; and</p> <p>(b) the CCF Task Force would explore ways to assist those "N have-nots".</p>	
011732 - 012232	Mr CHAN Kin-por Chairman Administration CCF Task Force	<p>Mr CHAN Kin-por's view that CCF should launch more programmes to encourage the needy to become self-reliant and solicit support from the welfare sector for the smooth implementation of the CCF's assistance programmes. His enquiry about the assistance to be provided to the "N have-nots" who were inadequately housed under the existing welfare system.</p> <p>The response of the Administration and the CCF Task Force that –</p> <p>(a) CCF would make reference to the experience gained from helping the "N have-nots" in considering complementary policies; and</p> <p>(b) some members of the CCF Task Force were from the welfare sector. The welfare organizations and service users would also be involved in the discussion of certain assistance programmes. Their views would be taken into account in the implementation and regularization of these programmes.</p>	
012233 - 012908	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's view that –</p> <p>(a) provision of dental services to all elderly should be considered; and</p> <p>(b) rental control should be imposed to facilitate the introduction of rent allowance for those needy households living in private housing, thereby alleviating the pressure on the supply of PRH.</p> <p>The Administration's reiteration that rent allowance might not be able to help alleviate the financial burden of the underprivileged as it might trigger an increase in the rental level for private housing. Imposing rental control might make it more difficult for a low-income family to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		rent a flat given that the supply of these flats could not meet the demand. CCF would continue the programmes which provided subsidy to low-income tenants in leased private housing if necessary.	
012909 - 013458	Mr Ronny TONG Chairman Administration	<p>Mr Ronny TONG' s concern and view that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) whether CCF had any plan to appeal for new donations from the business sector and, if yes, the target donations;</li> <li>(b) for better monitoring, CCF should be incorporated into Schedule 1 of the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap. 201); and</li> <li>(c) Legislative Council Members should be briefed on CCF's operation periodically so as to strengthen the monitoring of the fund.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Government had no plan to appeal for donations from the business and other sectors at this stage for CCF but donations would be welcomed;</li> <li>(b) the business sector had taken forward a number of poverty alleviation initiatives. CoP's Societal Engagement Task Force would collate the relevant information and make it available to the public;</li> <li>(c) CCF was a trust fund established under the Secretary for Home Affairs Incorporation Ordinance (Cap. 1044) with the Secretary for Home Affairs Incorporated ("SHAI") as its trustee. The statement of accounts of CCF would be audited by the Director of Audit and incorporated into the financial report of SHAI for tabling at the Legislative Council annually. As some government departments were entrusted to implement CCF's programmes and the persons who handled the fund were public officers, they would abide by regulatory regimes applicable to public officers. As to whether CCF should be incorporated into Schedule 1 of Cap 201, the advice of the Department of Justice had to be sought; and</li> <li>(d) to address members' concern about the monitoring of CCF, the Subcommittee or the</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>relevant Panels would be consulted prior to launching brand-new programmes which were pilot in nature and the funding provision of which was expected to exceed a certain amount.</p>	
013459 - 014146	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung's view that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the subject of rental control should be open to discussion by the public;</li> <li>(b) CCF should consider providing support for the family members of the chronically ill, e.g. by providing allowance for them to hire carers, to ease their pressure; and</li> <li>(c) wide public consultation should be conducted on whether dental services should be extended to cover more elderly persons. The Administration should also address the problems regarding dental services for the non-elderly.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) CCF was considering the expansion of the existing coverage of the EDA Programme to benefit more elderly persons, taking into account the progress of implementation and the experience gained. The financial commitment for the programme could be increased if required; and</li> <li>(b) a pilot scheme of providing allowance to the carers of the elderly with financial needs would be explored. The Administration would study whether non-working individuals who took care of their elderly family members at home should also be covered by the pilot scheme.</li> </ul>	
014147 - 014819	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman's view that the assistance programmes which had been run for three years or more should be incorporated into the Government's regular assistance and service programmes. The Administration should report to the Subcommittee on the reasons for not being able to do so.</p> <p>The Administration's concurrence that effective CCF measures should be incorporated into the Government's regular assistance and service programmes. These measures would continue prior to their regularisation. The Administration</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>intended to regularize effective CCF measures as far as practicable subject to availability of resources. If any effective CCF programmes could not be regularized as anticipated, resources constraints would likely be the reason.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry about when the Subcommittee would receive the first half-yearly briefing on the financial position of CCF and the implementation progress of its programmes, the Administration suggested that the first briefing might be conducted six months after July 2013.</p>	
014820 - 015106	Mr Frankie YICK Chairman Administration	<p>Mr Frankie YICK's view that –</p> <p>(a) dental services for the elderly should become a regular programme rather than a pilot programme under CCF. The Administration should also consider providing cataract treatment services for the elderly on a regular basis; and</p> <p>(b) CCF should accord priority to providing assistance for the "N have-nots" and be innovative in its assistance programmes.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the proposed injection of an additional \$15 billion into CCF, if approved, would facilitate the continuation of the assistance for the "N have-nots". CCF would continue to explore new initiatives to help the needy.</p>	
015107 - 015413	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chairman Administration	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's view and concern that –</p> <p>(a) given the very small number of beneficiaries of the EDA Programme, the Administration should relax the eligibility criteria to benefit more elderly. Provision of dental services for persons with disabilities ("PWDs") should also be considered;</p> <p>(b) the "Subsidy for low-income persons who are inadequately housed" programme should also cover the "N have-nots" living in sub-divided flats in industrial buildings as they were the most needy; and</p> <p>(c) the age requirement under the "Subsidy for the severely disabled persons aged below 60 from families with financial difficulties who are non-CSSA recipients, requiring constant attendance and living in the community"</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>program should be waived. The subsidies for this programme and that for the "Provision of special subsidy to persons with severe physical disabilities for renting respiratory support medical equipment" programme were insufficient to cover the relevant expenses. The Administration should critically consider increasing the subsidies of these programmes.</p> <p>The Administration's response that –</p> <p>(a) the problem of shortage of dentists should first be resolved before relaxing the eligibility criteria of the current EDA Programme. Providing dental services for PWDs could only be considered at a later stage. The target beneficiaries of dental services should be restricted to people with financial difficulties;</p> <p>(b) a working group was studying how the support for severely disabled persons could be strengthened; and</p> <p>(c) the Buildings Department ("BD") was taking enforcement actions with a view to eliminating sub-divided flats in industrial buildings. CCF would provide relocation allowance for eligible residents of sub-divided units in industrial buildings who would have to move out as a result of BD's enforcement action.</p> <p>At the request of the Chairman and Dr Fernando CHEUNG, the Administration and the CCF Task Force undertook to provide the evaluation reports of the assistance programmes under CCF to the Subcommittee.</p>	Admin (paragraph 3 of the minutes)
015414 - 015806	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Chairman Administration CCF Task Force	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's suggestion that representatives of the CCF Task Force should be invited to attend meetings of the Panel on Welfare Services ("the WS Panel") to have a better understanding of the views of members and deputations.</p> <p>The Administration's response that officers attending meetings of WS Panel were ex-officio members of the CCF Task Force. They would convey views relevant to CCF to the CCF Secretariat. In addition, members were welcome to give their views direct to the Chief Secretary for the Administration, the Chairperson or the Secretariat of the CCF Task Force.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		The CCF Task Force's response that in addition to public consultation exercises, the CCF Task Force had frequent contacts with the welfare sector and concern groups to collect their views.	
015807 - 020008	Chairman	The Subcommittee's support in principle for the submission of the funding proposal to the Finance Committee for consideration.  Extension of meeting time for fifteen minutes beyond the appointed ending time.	
<i>Agenda item III – Discussion on the draft report on "Poverty line" to be submitted by the Subcommittee</i>			
020009 - 020318	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chairman	The Subcommittee's concurrence that –  (a) the phrase "及是否將公屋福利納入為政策介入後的住戶收入" should be removed from paragraph 29(d) of the draft report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1154/12-13(03)); and  (b) the draft report, upon revision as per (a) above, should be forwarded to the House Committee for information and then to CoP for consideration and response. In the meantime, CoP should be informed of the Subcommittee's recommendations made in the report.	
<i>Agenda item IV – Any other business</i>			
020319 - 020805	Chairman	Subjects to be discussed at the meetings in June and July 2013.	