

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)474/14-15

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/HS/1/12

Subcommittee on Poverty

**Minutes of the twenty-third meeting
held on Tuesday, 28 October 2014, at 10:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

Members absent : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

**Public Officers : Item I
attending**

Mr Matthew CHEUNG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms Doris HO, JP
Head, Policy and Project Coordination Unit
Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms Jane LEE
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare
(Poverty)
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms Candy LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary (Community Care Fund)
Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Byron LAM
Assistant Director, Efficiency Unit (3)
Chief Secretary for Administration's Office

**Attendance by : Item I
invitation**

New People's Party

Mr KAM Man-fung
Central Committee Member

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan
Deputy Spokesperson of Welfare Services

The Forthright Caucus

Mr LO Ho-yuen
Representative

Miss YU Cheuk-lam

葵涌貧窮人仕聯會

Mr NG Kwan-lim
Member

葵涌低收入關注組

Mr TIN Ka-shun
Member

葵涌劏房住客聯盟

Ms HE Li-zhen
Member

The Salvation Army Community Project

Mr LIU Man-king
Team Leader

Alliance for Children's Development Rights

Miss HO Yu-ying
Community Organizer

Miss LAI Wan-yiu

Mr LEE Tai-shing

Tung Chung Homemade

樊鎮澆先生

Mr FU Siu-hung

Promoting Home Made Culture Concern Group

Mr CHEUNG Chun-ming

Kong Yeah

Miss MAK Ho-ying

Tin Shui Wai Craft Platform

Ms SO Wai-yee

Promoting Localized Production Concern Group

Ms PANG Lok-yan
Social Worker

Tin Shui Wai Resident Concern About Retirement
Protection

Mr CHAN Kwok-yim

Tin Shui Wai Housewife Concern About Retirement
Protection

Miss Emily TAM

Tin Shui Wai Concern About Pension

Miss Jaye MAK

Community Development Alliance

Miss WONG Wing-chi
Social Worker

Tung Chung Community Development Alliance

楊卓淳先生

Mr Eiddle CHEUNG

Mr WONG Chi-yung

Mr CHOW Kin-wa

Mr CHAN Chun-ki

Community Craft Development Concern Group

郎自辛先生

The Alliance of Promoting Economic Development in
Tin Shui Wai

Miss CHEUNG Sau-hung

Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance

Mr KONG Kin-shing
Social Worker

Rehabilitation Alliance Hong Kong

Mr Marcus MOK Yuen-kwan
General Secretary

Miss FAN Pui-ying

Mr WONG Yun-tat, Member of Kwai Tsing District
Council

Kwai Chung Estate Grassroot Concern Group

Miss Yoyo CHAN
Organizer

Kwai Chung Community Workers Union

Miss Vincci WONG
Representative

Special Educational Needs Rights Association

Mr HO Cheuk-hin
Community Coordinator

爭取低收入家庭保障聯席

Miss YEUNG Pui-yan
Community Organizer

土瓜灣低收入居民小組

胡坤榮女士

Clerk in attendance : Mr Colin CHUI
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in attendance : Ms Catherina YU
Senior Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Kay CHU
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Work of the Commission on Poverty – review and way forward
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)117/14-15(01) to (04) and CB(2)186/14-15(01) to (02)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II. Subjects to be discussed at meetings in November and December 2014
[LC Paper No. CB(2)117/14-15(05)]

2. Members agreed that the Subcommittee should discuss the subject of "Women in Poverty" at the next meeting scheduled for Thursday, 27 November 2014 at 8:30am.

III. Any other business

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:13pm.

Action

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
16 December 2014

**Proceedings of the twenty-third meeting of the
Subcommittee on Poverty
on Tuesday, 28 October 2014, at 10:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Work of the Commission on Poverty – review and way forward</i>			
000655 - 001100	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001101 - 001414	New People's Party	Presentation of views	
001415 - 001721	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
001722 - 002013	The Forthright Caucus	Presentation of views	
002014 - 002228	Miss YU Cheuk-lam	Presentation of views	
002229 - 002624	The Salvation Army Community Project	Presentation of views	
002625 - 002950	Alliance for Children's Development Rights	Presentation of views LC Paper No. CB(2)117/14-15(04)	
002951 - 003257	Miss LAI Wan-yiu	Presentation of views	
003258 - 003620	葵涌貧窮人仕聯會	Presentation of views	
003621 - 003808	葵涌低收入關注組	Presentation of views	
003809 - 004013	葵涌劏房住客聯盟	Presentation of views	
004014 - 004355	Mr LEE Tai-shing	Presentation of views	
004356 - 004659	Tung Chung Homemade	Presentation of views	
004700 - 005011	Mr FU Siu-hung	Presentation of views	
005012 - 005318	Promoting Home Made Culture Concern Group	Presentation of views	
005319 - 005633	Kong Yeah	Presentation of views	
005634 - 005903	Tin Shui Wai Craft Platform	Presentation of views	
005904 - 010215	Promoting Localized Production Concern Group	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
010216 - 010436	Tin Shui Wai Resident Concern About Retirement Protection	Presentation of views	
010437 - 010532	Tin Shui Wai Housewife Concern About Retirement Protection	Presentation of views	
010533 - 010830	Tin Shui Wai Concern About Pension	Presentation of views	
010831 - 011130	Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
011131 - 011437	Tung Chung Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
011438 - 011705	Mr Eiddle CHEUNG	Presentation of views	
011706 - 012014	Mr CHAN Chun-ki	Presentation of views	
012015 - 012322	Mr CHOW Kin-wa	Presentation of views	
012323 - 012534	Mr WONG Chi-yung	Presentation of views	
012535 - 012831	Community Craft Development Concern Group	Presentation of views	
012832 - 013119	The Alliance of Promoting Economic Development in Tin Shui Wai	Presentation of views	
013120 - 013434	Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
013435 - 013740	Rehabilitation Alliance Hong Kong	Presentation of views LC Paper No. CB(2)186/14-15(01)	
013741 - 014410	Miss FAN Pui-ying	Presentation of views	
014111 - 014414	Mr WONG Yun-tat, Member of Kwai Tsing District Council	Presentation of views	
014415 - 014646	Kwai Chung Estate Grassroot Concern Group	Presentation of views	
014647 - 014935	Kwai Chung Community Workers Union	Presentation of views	
014936 - 015252	Special Educational Needs Rights	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Association		
015253 - 015542	爭取低收入家庭保障聯席	Presentation of views	
015543 - 015812	土瓜灣低收入居民小組	Presentation of views	
015813 - 020742	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the work progress of the Commission on Poverty ("CoP") and its six Task Forces in the past two years and the way forward.	
020743 - 021148	Mr KWOK Wai-keung Admin	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung declared that he was a social worker and said that -</p> <p>(a) in the face of the backlog of funding proposals awaiting deliberations by the Finance Committee ("FC") of the Legislative Council, it was difficult for the Administration to adjust the agenda and accord priority to the item on the Low-income Working Family Allowance ("LIFA") as all items were equally important. He hoped that the FC's efficiency of examining the items could be improved for the benefit of the society; and</p> <p>(b) the public should actively give views on the work of CoP.</p> <p>Secretary for Labour and Welfare ("SLW") appealed to FC to expedite deliberations on all funding proposals, including the funding requirements for the LIFA Scheme.</p> <p>In response to deputations' enquiry about whether there would be a retrospective payment arrangement for LIFA, SLW responded that the Administration would not normally allow new recurrent financial assistance schemes to take retrospective effect, and the Administration had no intention to allow the LIFA Scheme to take retrospective effect.</p>	
021149 - 021555	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung stressed that regarding the delay in the implementation of the LIFA Scheme, the Administration should not put the blame on the Council as -</p> <p>(a) there was no need to take forward the LIFA Scheme if the rate of the statutory minimum wage ("SMW") was sufficient to alleviate poverty; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) in any event, a lead time of 15 to 18 months was required after obtaining the FC's funding approval before launching the LIFA Scheme.	
021556 - 022024	Miss CHAN Yuen-han	Miss CHAN Yuen-han pointed out that the Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions had all along supported promoting employment as the key measure to alleviate poverty. The Administration should have new thoughts and take public views seriously to facilitate the formulation of policies on complex and controversial issues, such as universal retirement protection, and to maximize benefits brought about by implementing social welfare programmes.	
022025 - 022502	Mr TANG Ka-piu Admin	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu asked whether the Administration would consider –</p> <p>(a) relieving the financial burden of the needy by enhancing the Work-Incentive Transport Subsidy ("WITS") Scheme before launching the LIFA Scheme;</p> <p>(b) using the existing computer system for the WITS Scheme to handle the LIFA applications, so as to expedite the implementation of the LIFA Scheme; and</p> <p>(c) studying the expenditure pattern of each district and introducing new initiatives to boost community economy.</p> <p>SLW responded that –</p> <p>(a) and (b) the review of the WITS Scheme which started recently took time to complete. Setting up of a computer system for a new scheme needed reasonable time. The Administration would strive to expedite the launching of the LIFA Scheme after obtaining the funding approval; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration was very concerned about the development of new districts, such as Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung, and would continue to closely liaise with stakeholders of the districts.</p>	
022503 - 022921	Mr WONG Yuk-man	<p>Mr WONG Yuk-man commented that –</p> <p>(a) the SMW rate was not enough to maintain a subsistence living; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) the Administration should adjust the agenda of the upcoming FC meeting to expedite the implementation of the LIFA Scheme.	
022922 - 023510	Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>Deputy Chairman asked whether the Administration –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) had tried to advance the agenda items on the LIFA Scheme at FC meetings; (b) could provide a timetable on the examination of the research report on the future development of retirement protection in Hong Kong ("the research report") by CoP; and (c) would invite CoP to study how the setting of the poverty line and the LIFA Scheme could better relieve the financial burden of families with children with special educational needs or with disabilities due to high medical expenses. <p>SLW responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was not appropriate to adjust the agenda items at FC meetings as all items were livelihood-related and of equal importance; (b) CoP would hold a meeting to further discuss the research report as soon as possible and the Subcommittee on Retirement Protection under the Panel on Welfare Services ("the Panel") would invite deputations to express their views on the subject at its meeting on 15 November 2014; and (c) the poverty line was set in the light of international mainstream approaches. Besides, to take into account the full expenditure pattern of households, up-to-date expenditure data would be required which would only be available in the Household Expenditure Surveys conducted by the Census and Statistics Department ("C&SD") every five years. This would make it impossible for the Administration to update the poverty line analysis annually. Having said that, the Administration would consider the views of members and deputations in this regard. 	
023511 - 024322	Chairman Admin	The Chairman declared that he was a non-official member of CoP and commented that –	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) CoP should review the setting of the poverty line and consider drawing up two or more poverty lines;</p> <p>(b) the poverty line should be used to set specific targets for poverty reduction instead of assessing the effectiveness of poverty alleviation measures;</p> <p>(c) CoP should actively study and consider adopting sustainable options as set out in the research report to implement universal retirement protection; and</p> <p>(d) CoP should discuss the development of community economy and social enterprises as well as related policies by making reference to other countries.</p> <p>SLW replied that –</p> <p>(a) the poverty line was not a "poverty alleviation line". It would be used to assess the effectiveness of poverty alleviation measures. It also helped identify the target beneficiaries of the LIFA Scheme;</p> <p>(b) all options as set out in the research report were not sustainable in the long-run. In view of the far-reaching implication of the implementation of retirement protection, related issues should be examined carefully and thoroughly; and</p> <p>(c) the establishment of the Social Innovation and Entrepreneurship Development Fund would help promote social innovation for alleviating poverty in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The meeting time was extended for 15 minutes beyond the appointed ending time by the Chairman.</p>	
024323 - 024502	Chairman 葵涌貧窮人仕聯會	Presentation of views	
024503 - 024616	葵涌低收入關注組	Presentation of views	
024617 - 024835	Mr LEE Tai-shing	Presentation of views	
024836 - 024939	Promoting Home Made Culture Concern Group	Presentation of views	
024940 - 025109	Promoting Localized	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Production Concern Group		
025110 - 025250	Tung Chung Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
025251 - 025501	Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
025502 - 025621	Miss FAN Pui-ying	Presentation of views	
025622 - 025715	爭取低收入家庭保障聯席	Presentation of views	
025716 - 030133	Chairman Admin	<p>In response to the concerns and suggestions of the nine deputations, SLW said that –</p> <p>(a) suggestions on setting one more level of subsidy for five-or-more-person households under the “Living subsidy for non-public housing and non-CSSA households” programme would be referred to the Community Care Fund Task Force, while suggestions on providing energy allowances as well as promoting the development of community economy would be relayed to CoP for consideration;</p> <p>(b) the Administration was determined to alleviate poverty and had put in place measures, such as Old Age Living Allowance, to assist the needy. That said, more would be done to help the underprivileged; and</p> <p>(c) a new Job Centre under the Labour Department was set up at Yat Tung Shopping Centre in October 2014 to promote employment in Tung Chung district. He undertook to meet stakeholders of the district to explore more feasible measures to improve the livelihood of Tung Chung residents.</p>	
030134 - 030512	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>Deputy Chairman expressed concern about how and when the Administration would follow up with the research report. He called on the Administration to have a stance on universal retirement protection without further delay.</p> <p>SLW reiterated his response to Deputy Chairman as set out at (b) on page 5 of this Annex.</p>	
030513 - 030828	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that while source of funding was the major concern in implementing	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		universal retirement protection, the Administration should consider allocating resources for this purpose instead of setting up the "Future Fund". The Administration should actively take forward the initiatives which were considered beneficial to the community.	
030829 - 031440	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman declared that he was a member of the Alliance for Universal Pension ("AUP") and said that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) according to the research report, the option provided by AUP was sustainable in terms of funding in the long run. The Administration should examine the details and feasibility of the options as set out in the research report; (b) the Administration's reluctance to adjust the FC items implied that it attached importance to the controversial items on environmental infrastructure projects rather than the LIFA Scheme; and (c) the Administration should provide a platform to facilitate the development of community economy. <p>SLW responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was projected that the funding of the AUP's option would be completely depleted in 2050. In any event, the Administration would consider the issues of retirement protection in an open manner and time should be given to CoP to examine the research report in details; (b) as regards the poverty of persons with disabilities, C&SD conducted a thematic survey on persons with disabilities in Hong Kong in 2013. CoP would discuss the survey results once available and then look into issues in this regard; and (c) the setting of an official poverty line and deployment of \$56.9 billion (i.e. 18.5% of the total Government expenditure) to social welfare for 2014-2015 had signified the current term Government's commitment in tackling poverty and building a care and inclusive society. 	
<i>Agenda item II –Subjects to be discussed at meetings in November and December 2014</i>			
031441-031500	Chairman	Members decided on the subject to be discussed	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		at the meeting scheduled for 27 November 2014.	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
16 December 2014