

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)454/15-16

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/HS/1/12

**Subcommittee on Poverty**

**Minutes of the thirty-fourth meeting  
held on Tuesday, 17 November 2015, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Hon KWOK Wai-keung

Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Members absent** : Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

**Public Officers : Item I  
attending**

Ms Doris HO, JP  
Head, Policy and Project Coordination Unit  
Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms IP Ling-bik  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Education  
Commission & Planning)  
Education Bureau

Mr Charles HUI, JP  
Assistant Commissioner (Employment Services)  
Labour Department

Dr MA Chi  
Deputy Executive Director (Training Services)  
Employees Retraining Board

Mr CHENG Kwan-yam  
Chief Executive Officer (3)  
Home Affairs Department

**Attendance by : Item I  
invitation**

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr Anthony WONG  
Business Director (Policy Research and Advocacy)

Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for  
Workers (Kowloon)

---

Mr LI Ka-shu  
Program Officer

The Hong Kong Ethnic Minority Concern Group on Equal  
Access to Government Services

---

Miss Sairah Abbas  
Assistant Program Officer

A.I.M. Group

Mr Shoaib Hussain  
Assistant Program Officer

Oxfam Hong Kong

Ms WONG Shek-hung  
Hong Kong Programme Manager

Ms Lynn LAW

EM Equal Access Core Group

Miss Shrestha Natasha

Cleaning Workers' Union

Mr CHAN Tsz-kit  
Organizer

Nepalese Workers' Group

Miss Prasanti Gurung  
Representative

Hong Kong Unison Limited

Ms Phyllis CHEUNG  
Executive Director

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr Raymond HO Wing-keung  
Senior Equal Opportunities Officer (Ethnic Minorities Unit)

Mr POON Wing-lok

Society for Cultural Integration

Ms Payal Biswas  
Member

EM Employment Concern Group

Miss BUT Ngan-ping

關注葵涌少數族裔人士聯盟

Mr Minhas Rashad  
Commission Member

關注葵涌少數族裔貧窮聯盟

Miss Noel LEUNG  
Commission Member

關注葵涌少數族裔青年上流聯盟

Mr Ron FONG  
Commission Member

Ms NARGIS

ToKwaWan Ekta Housing Concern Group

Miss Mohammed Fariha  
Member

Parents Concern Group

Miss Ansah Malik  
Member

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Kay CHU  
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Ms Ada TANG  
Clerical Assistant (2) 4

---

Action

**I. Poverty problems of ethnic minorities**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)255/15-16(01) to (05), CB(2)281/15-16(01), CB(2)285/15-16(01) and CB(2)342/15-16(01)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

**II. Any other business**

2. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:07 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
11 December 2015

**Proceedings of the thirty-fourth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Poverty  
on Tuesday, 17 November 2015 at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda item I – Poverty problems of ethnic minorities</i>			
000816 - 001154	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001155 - 002238	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)281/15-16(01) and CB(2)342/15-16(01)]	
002239 - 002552	Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)255/15-16(03)]	
002553 - 002909	The Hong Kong Ethnic Minority Concern Group on Equal Access to Government Services	Presentation of views	
002910 - 003219	A.I.M. Group	Presentation of views	
003220 - 003543	Oxfam Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)255/15-16(04)]	
003544 - 003856	Ms Lynn LAW	Presentation of views	
003857 - 004226	EM Equal Access Core Group	Presentation of views	
004227 - 004508	Cleaning Workers' Union	Presentation of views	
004509 - 004706	Nepalese Workers' Group	Presentation of views	
004707 - 005014	Hong Kong Unison Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)255/15-16(05)]	
005015 - 005340	Equal Opportunities Commission	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)285/15-16(01)]	
005341 - 005808	Mr POON Wing-lok	Presentation of views	
005809 - 010102	Society for Cultural Integration	Presentation of views	
010103 - 010435	EM Employment Concern Group	Presentation of views	
010436 - 010749	關注葵涌少數族裔人士聯盟	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
010750 - 011054	關注葵涌少數族裔貧窮聯盟	Presentation of views	
011055 - 011405	關注葵涌少數族裔青年上流聯盟	Presentation of views	
011406 - 011629	Ms NARGIS	Presentation of views	
011630 - 011947	ToKwaWan Ekta Housing Concern Group	Presentation of views	
011948 - 012340	Parents Concern Group	Presentation of views	
012341 - 014550	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin	<p>In response to the major views and concerns of deputations, the Administration gave a succinct briefing on its paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)255/15-16(01)] and supplemented that –</p> <p>(a) the analysis of the 2011 Population Census conducted by the Census and Statistics Department revealed that the ethnic minority ("EM") community was facing the problems of working poverty and inter-generational poverty. To address the aforesaid problems, apart from continuing to enhance support measures for EM students, the Administration would launch the Low-income Working Family Allowance ("LIFA") in the second quarter of 2016, which would also benefit the working poor families of EMs. The Administration would distribute promotional materials in different EM languages and collaborate with non-governmental organizations to promote the LIFA Scheme to the EM community;</p> <p><i>Employment support measures for EMs</i></p> <p>(b) in the first nine months of 2015, about 1% of the job seekers registered for employment services of the Labour Department ("LD") were EMs of South Asian origins. This figure was commensurate with the EM population of South Asian origins which constituted around 0.9% of the whole population in Hong Kong according to the 2011 Population Census;</p> <p>(c) posters were displayed at conspicuous places at the LD job centres and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>interpretation service forms translated into different EM languages were distributed to walk-in EM job seekers to promote the provision of interpretation service for EMs. In the first 10 months of 2015, out of the over 1 300 EM job seekers visiting LD job centres and introduced the interpretation service, 14 of them requested and received the service;</p> <p>(d) employers who would like to place job vacancies with LD were required to complete and sign an application form, which set out reminders and declarations at three different sections to remind the employers to give consideration to the genuine occupational needs when specifying the language requirements and take note of the importance of compliance with anti-discrimination ordinances;</p> <p>(e) outcome of the first two batches of trainees engaged under the pilot "Employment Services Ambassador Programme for Ethnic Minorities" ("ESAP") indicated that the six-month on-the-job training was effective in facilitating the employment of young EM trainees in the open market. Noting some suggestions of extending the training period to 12 months or employing them on a long-term basis, the Administration considered that these suggestions would reduce the number of EMs that could be engaged under ESAP;</p> <p>(f) dedicated employment services for EM job seekers were provided through special counters in LD's 13 job centres throughout the territory and should be able to better serve EM job seekers than a single outlet;</p> <p>(g) various government departments, such as LD, the Social Welfare Department and the Home Affairs Department, had employed EMs to better serve the EM community. The Administration would continue to explore more job opportunities for EMs;</p> <p>(h) the Youth College under the Vocational Training Council provided some 20 training programmes dedicated for EMs, and would continue doing so;</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p><i>Support measures for EM students</i></p> <p>(i) the Administration would start the evaluation of the effectiveness of various support measures for non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students, including the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Learning Framework") implemented since the 2014-2015 school year, according to the research framework;</p> <p>(j) the Committee on Free Kindergarten Education released a report in mid-2015, which recommended, inter alia, the provision of an additional funding comparable to the salary of a kindergarten teacher for kindergartens admitting eight or more NCS students to enhance the support for these students;</p> <p>(k) an application by Oxfam Hong Kong for the Social Innovation and Entrepreneurship Development Fund had been recently approved for implementing a pilot programme on helping needy kindergarten students from EM;</p> <p>(l) the Education Bureau ("EDB") had issued guidelines on admission of students to all kindergartens and distributed leaflets (with translation into major EM languages) on kindergartens admission arrangements to parents of EM students;</p> <p>(m) EDB would explore with tertiary institutions which were funded by the University Grants Committee the feasibility of relaxing the Chinese language requirement of admission of EMs. The Special Needs Groups Task Force ("SNGTF") under the Commission on Poverty would follow up the matter; and</p> <p>(n) the Student Finance Office provided leaflets in different EM languages on its financial assistance schemes, notwithstanding that application forms of the schemes were only available in Chinese and English as the forms had to be completed in either Chinese or English.</p> <p>The meeting time was extended for 15 minutes beyond the appointed ending time by the Chairman.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
014551 - 015041	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Admin	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen asked if the Administration –</p> <p>(a) would consider providing long-term contract employment for EMs under ESAP, and provide relevant figures to quantify the effectiveness of ESAP;</p> <p>(b) would designate a bureau/department ("B/D") to coordinate the promotion work of EM-related policies and measures;</p> <p>(c) considered it desirable to have only 23 B/Ds covered by the scope of the application of the Administrative Guidelines on Promotion of Racial Equality which were issued by the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau in 2010; and</p> <p>(d) would announce the guidelines issued by the Civil Service Bureau to B/Ds regarding EM-related employment measures, and review the employment situation of EMs for civil service posts annually.</p> <p>In response to (a), the Administration advised that ESAP, which was piloted in September 2014, had recruited a total of 48 trainees in three batches, with the third batch still undergoing on-the-job training. Amongst the 32 trainees of the first two batches, 17 of them intended to work and were able to secure employment, while the rest did not want to find a job upon completion of training because of family/health reasons or pursuing further study.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's query about the number of EMs appointed to the civil service, the Administration advised that the majority of civil servants from EM were recruited by the disciplined services. From April to October 2015, the Police Force had employed six EMs as Police Constables. The Correctional Services Department had hired a total of seven EMs since 2011.</p>	
015042 - 015252	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han	Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau should send representatives to attend the meeting to discuss how to facilitate the employment of EMs. In addition, she agreed to deputations' suggestion of setting up an employment	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		services division for EMs, and expressed concerns about issues relating to education for and difficulties encountered by EMs. She invited several deputations to give further views on the aforesaid issues.	
015253 - 015313	Chairman Oxfam Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
015314 - 015416	Chairman EM Employment Concern Group	Presentation of views	
015417 - 015428	Chairman Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views	
015429 - 015548	Chairman 關注葵涌少數族裔人士聯盟	Presentation of views	
015549 - 015958	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu Admin	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu agreed to set up an employment services division for EMs. He requested LD to relay the suggestion to the Labour and Welfare Bureau for consideration.</p> <p>Mr TANG also expressed concern about issues relating to education for EM children. He said that some EM families from Tung Chung had to arrange their children for studying in Chai Wan or Tuen Mun, while an English school under the Direct Subsidy Scheme ("DSS") in Tung Chung refused to admit EM students as the EM households were poor. He asked if the Administration would facilitate EM students to go to school in Tung Chung where they were living.</p> <p>The Administration undertook to look into the student admission of the aforesaid DSS school, while stressing that DSS schools had the right to set their own admission criteria in compliance with the relevant laws. Nonetheless, all schools were not required to accord priority to admit students from the district where the schools was located.</p>	
015959 - 020207	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che opined that special counters in all LD job centres dedicated to providing employment support services for EM job seekers did not make significant improvement to the employment of EMs. He invited deputations to give views on the services of these special counters.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
020208 - 020305	Chairman Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views	
020306 - 020407	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che A.I.M. Group	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Noting that deputations considered the services of special counters in LD job centres ineffective, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che requested the Administration to improve the aforesaid services or consider setting up an employment services division for EMs.</p>	
020408 - 020828	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Equal Opportunities Commission	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan opined that the existing policies on education and employment contributed to the poverty problems of EMs. Noting that the problem of unequal pay for equal work brought about many working EMs in poverty, Mr LEE asked if the Equal Opportunities Commission ("EOC") had conducted studies in this regard and would take steps to address the problem.</p> <p>EOC responded that the results of some of its surveys indicated that there was race discrimination in pay in Hong Kong. To promote the message of equal opportunities in employment, EOC would continue to organize talks for small and medium enterprises. In addition, any employees who felt being discriminated against were encouraged to lodge complaints to EOC so as to raise public awareness of issues related to anti-discrimination.</p>	
020829 - 021251	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung was of the view that the Administration should formulate policies according to the proportion of the EM population to ensure that EMs could have equal opportunities vis-à-vis local people in receiving education and securing employment. He suggested that EDB should impose conditions on applications for school registration with an aim to facilitate admission of EM students to schools.	
021252 - 021753	Chairman Mr WONG Yuk-man	<p>Mr WONG Yuk-man held the views that –</p> <p>(a) it was not practical to expect that the Learning Framework could enable EMs to bridge over to mainstream Chinese Language classes. The Administration should provide EMs with tailor-made Chinese language programmes to address the special needs of EMs;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) various EM-related measures could only benefit a small number of EMs. Regarding ESAP, he considered that the six-month pilot period was too short and the publicity was insufficient; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration should provide evaluation reports on the effectiveness of EM-related measures.</p>	
021754 - 021957	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG	Dr Priscilla LEUNG said that many EM students aspired to be treated as local people. She held the view that in addition to the provision of assistance for EMs, the Administration should formulate policies on facilitating EMs to make contributions in different industries and aspects.	
021958 - 022335	Chairman Admin	<p>The Administration agreed that various EM-related measures could be enhanced, and undertook that SNGTF would examine and follow up issues below:</p> <p>(a) EM students' admission to kindergartens and tertiary institutions;</p> <p>(b) strengthening of employment support for EMs and the suggestion of setting up an employment services division for EMs;</p> <p>(c) enhancement of Chinese language programmes for working EMs to improve their career prospect;</p> <p>(d) review of the Chinese language proficiency requirements of Government jobs; and</p> <p>(e) more integrated Administration's efforts in providing assistance for EMs.</p> <p>Regarding (e) above, the Chairman was of the view that a cross-B/Ds task force comprised of high-level government officials should be established. Noting that the Administration would release later this year the survey report on Households with School Children of South Asian Ethnicities, the Chairman said that the Subcommittee might revisit the subject of poverty problems of EMs in future.</p>	