

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1606/15-16

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/HS/1/12

**Subcommittee on Poverty**

**Minutes of the thirty-ninth meeting  
held on Monday, 11 April 2016, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
- Members absence** : Hon WONG Yuk-man  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

**Public Officers : Item I  
attending**

Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Food) 2  
Food and Health Bureau

Mr LAM Wing-hong  
Assistant Director (Operations) 2  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Miss Gloria LO Kit-wai  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Civic  
Affairs) 3  
Home Affairs Bureau

Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP  
Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)  
Home Affairs Department

**Item II**

Mr Gordon CHONG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
(Welfare) 4  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Miss Maria LAU  
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Social Security)  
Social Welfare Department

**Attendance by : Item I  
invitation**

**Oxfam Hong Kong**

Miss Rachel WONG Hiu-kam  
Policy Research Officer – Hong Kong Programme

**Captain O**

Mr LAI Wai-tong  
Member

St. James' Settlement

Ms Dora CHENG Shuke-ching  
Team Leader, Community Economy Team

Community Oriented Mutual Economy Project Committee  
Board Member

---

Mr CHEUNG Chun-pong  
Member

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms Dorothy WONG Wai-yin  
Officer (Policy Research & Advocacy)

十幾對手自家製生產計劃

Mr LEE KWOK-kuen

改善東涌居民關注組

Miss Suki CHAN

深水埗見光墟關注組

Mr LEE Tai-shing

撐・基層墟市聯盟

Miss CHIU Sin-ting

Tin Shui Wai Alliance

Mr KONG Kin-shing

Community Development Alliance

Miss WONG Wing-chi  
Social Worker

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre  
for Workers - New Territories

---

Mr Augustine YU Siu-po  
Acting Centre Supervisor

Fanling Low Income Concern Group

Ms Venny KWOK  
Member

North District Low Income Concern Group

Mr CHAN Chiu-hang  
Member

Smart & Beauty House

Miss PANG Ching-shan  
Member

Hong Kong Social Economy Alliance

Dr CHAN Fung-yi  
Convenor

Hong Kong Women Workers' Association

Ms NG Wai-yee  
社員

ECO-team

Mr LEUNG Wai-sum  
代表

Item II

Mr LEE Tai-shing

爭取低收入家庭保障聯席

Mr LEE Kwok-kuen  
Community Organiser

學童發展關注組

Mr LAU Ting-on

Alliance for Children Development Rights

Miss HO Yu-ying  
Community Organiser

Miss YU Cheuk-lam

Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance

Mr LEE Yen-hao

公平稅制改革聯盟

Mr HO Cheuk-hin  
組員

The Against Elderly Abuse of Hong Kong

Ms Locasi LEUNG Ka-chung  
Consultant (Elderly Services)

Captain O

Mr LAI Wai-tong  
Member

Neighbourhood and Workers Service Centre

Mr WONG Yun-tat  
社區主任

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre  
for Workers - New Territories

---

Mr Augustine YU Siu-po  
Acting Centre Supervisor

North District Employment Concern Group

Ms LAW Lai-ping  
Member

Fanling Low Income Concern Group

Ms Venny KWOK  
Member

Labour Party

Mr CHIU Shi-shun  
Vice-Chairman

青年關學聯

Miss LAI Wan-yiu  
Community Organiser

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Kay CHU  
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Ms Ada TANG  
Clerical Assistant (2) 4

---

Action

**I. Alleviating poverty through developing community economy and bazaars**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1209/15-16(01) to (03) and CB(2)1277/15-16(01) to (03)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Secretariat

2. At members' request, the Chairman said that the Subcommittee should write to the Chief Secretary for Administration ("CS") requesting for a review of the relevant legislation on cooperative societies, establishment of an inter-departmental platform and formulation of a policy on the development of community economy and bazaars to facilitate poverty alleviation at the district level. In addition, the Subcommittee should write to the Financial Secretary ("FS") requesting for inclusion of the specific policy on the development of community economy in the overall economic strategy for Hong Kong.

*(Post-meeting note: The Subcommittee had issued the aforesaid letters to CS and FS respectively on 18 April 2016.)*

**II. Level of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance and the basic living security**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1209/15-16(04) and CB(2)1277/15-16(04) to (05)]

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

4. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to:

- (a) provide the average monthly Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") payments of all CSSA cases in all household categories according to the following case natures, i.e. old age, illness, disability, single parenthood, unemployment, low income and others; and
- (b) advise which percentile of households the expenditure levels of which were close to the amount of the average CSSA payments of all CSSA cases in all household categories.

Action

**III. Any other business**

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:30 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
30 May 2016



**Proceedings of the thirty-ninth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Poverty  
on Monday, 11 April 2016 at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda item I –Alleviating poverty through developing community economy and bazaars</i>			
000733 - 001158	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001159 - 001516	Oxfam Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1209/15-16(03)]	
001517 - 001821	Captain O	Presentation of views	
001822 - 002149	St. James' Settlement	Presentation of views	
002150 - 002516	Community Oriented Mutual Economy Project Committee Board Member	Presentation of views	
002517 - 002835	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1277/15-16(01)]	
002836 - 003147	十幾對手自家製生產計劃	Presentation of views	
003148 - 003509	改善東涌居民關注組	Presentation of views	
003510 - 003834	深水埗見光墟關注組	Presentation of views	
003835 - 004144	撐・基層墟市聯盟	Presentation of views	
004145 - 004510	Tin Shui Wai Alliance	Presentation of views	
004511 - 004836	Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
004837 - 005138	Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers - New Territories	Presentation of views	
005139 - 005520	Fanling Low Income Concern Group	Presentation of views	
005521 - 005856	North District Low Income Concern Group	Presentation of views	
005857 - 010214	Smart & Beauty House	Presentation of views	
010215 - 010541	Hong Kong Social Economy Alliance	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
010542 - 010758	Hong Kong Women Workers' Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1277/15-16(02)]	
010759 - 011025	ECO-team	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1277/15-16(03)]	
011026 - 011735	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman summarized the views and concerns of the deputations as follows:</p> <p>(a) community groups had made many efforts in putting forward many creative ideas of developing community economy and implementing community economy projects, which helped alleviate poverty. However, the development of community economy was hindered in the absence of a specific government policy or a platform for coordination of the Administration's handling of applications for operating community economy projects;</p> <p>(b) District Councils ("DCs") could not help much in developing community economy as too many government departments were involved in handling applications for operating community economy projects; and</p> <p>(c) relevant legislation on co-operative societies was outdated.</p> <p>In response, the Administration briefed members on the latest development of its work on bazaars set out in paragraphs 5 to 7 of its paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1209/15-16(01)]. The Administration added that the proposals to set up local bazaars in four districts were received by the Food and Health Bureau in November 2015. As that fell within the period of suspension of operation of DCs, these proposals could only be discussed and followed up by the relevant DCs of the new term. As at the time of the meeting, one of the DCs had already scheduled the proposal relating to its district to be discussed, and another DC had set up a working group to follow up the issues relating to the development of bazaars in the district. The Administration hoped that it could move forward with addressing the bazaar-related issues, in the light of the experience gained.</p>	
011736 - 012117	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han	Expressing appreciation for the fruitful sharing by the deputations attending the meeting,	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Admin	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han urged the Administration to invite these deputations to meet with the Secretary for Food and Health to discuss issues relating to the development of bazaars. She requested the Administration for a written response in this regard.</p> <p>The Administration advised that Miss CHAN's suggestion and deputations' views on the development of bazaars would be relayed to the Secretary for Food and Health for consideration.</p>	
012118 - 012429	Chairman Deputy Chairman	<p>Pointing out that the setting up of several bazaars in Sham Shui Po had to overcome many hurdles and sharing successful overseas experience in facilitating the development of community economy, the Deputy Chairman said that:</p> <p>(a) District Officers should be responsible for coordinating amongst relevant government bureaux and departments to facilitate processing of applications for operating community economy projects which were supported by relevant DCs; and</p> <p>(b) he had suggested twice, in the capacity of a member of the Commission on Poverty, ("CoP") that CoP should set up a task force on the development of community economy but the suggestion was not accepted. The ex-officio members of CoP held the view that the development of community economy should be discussed from economic development perspective instead of poverty alleviation angle, and fell under the purview of the Financial Secretary ("FS"). He, however, considered that FS might not accord high priority to work in this respect.</p>	
012430 - 012819	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Admin	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed concern about the adverse impact of contracting out the management of some public markets to the private sector by the Hong Kong Housing Authority on the residents and the public market stall operators concerned. Stressing that operating bazaars would affect the livelihood of many people, he called on the Administration to consider requiring each DC to submit a bazaar proposal to facilitate the setting up of bazaars in all 18 districts.</p> <p>The Administration advised that after thorough</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		discussion and consideration, the Subcommittee on Hawker Policy under the Panel on Food and Safety and Environmental Hygiene agreed that the Administration should adopt a district-led approach in developing bazaars.	
012820 - 013713	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Deputy Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che	<p>The Chairman suggested that the Subcommittee should write to the Chief Secretary for Administration ("CS"), the Chairman of CoP, expressing members' and deputations' views on the development of community economy and bazaars and requesting CoP to respond in this regard.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-heung considered that community economy and bazaars should be developed with an aim to retain the original lifestyle of the community instead of poverty alleviation.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman reiterated his views at (b) above [time marker: 012118 - 012429].</p> <p>Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che was of the view that the Subcommittee should separately write to CS and FS expressing views of members and deputations on the development of community economy and bazaars from poverty alleviation and economic development perspectives respectively. He added that the suggestion of reviewing relevant legislation on cooperative societies should also be conveyed to CS.</p> <p>The Chairman concluded that the Subcommittee should write to CS requesting for a review of the relevant legislation on cooperative societies, establishment of an inter-departmental platform and formulation of a policy on the development of community economy and bazaars to facilitate poverty alleviation at the district level. In addition, the Subcommittee should write to FS requesting for inclusion of the specific policy on the development of community economy in the overall economic strategy for Hong Kong.</p>	Secretariat (paragraph 2 of the minutes)
<i>Agenda item II –Level of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance and the basic living security</i>			
013714 - 013808	Chairman	Opening remarks	
013809 - 014138	Mr LEE Tai-shing	Presentation of views	
014139 - 014417	爭取低收入家庭保障聯席	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
014418 - 014638	學童發展關注組	Presentation of views	
014639 - 014944	Alliance for Children Development Rights	Presentation of views	
014945 - 015151	Miss YU Cheuk-lam	Presentation of views	
015152 - 015520	Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1277/15-16(04)]	
015521 - 015853	公平稅制改革聯盟	Presentation of views	
015854 - 020207	The Against Elderly Abuse of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
020208 - 020519	Captain O	Presentation of views	
020520 - 020830	Neighbourhood and Workers Service Centre	Presentation of views	
020831 - 021138	Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers - New Territories	Presentation of views	
021139 - 021524	North District Employment Concern Group	Presentation of views	
021525 - 022047	Fanling Low Income Concern Group	Presentation of views	
022048 - 022404	Labour Party	Presentation of views	
022405 - 022725	青年關學聯	Presentation of views	
022726 - 023356	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman summarized the views and concerns of the deputations/individuals as follows:</p> <p>(a) the exiting level of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") payments was inadequate to maintain subsistence living;</p> <p>(b) given that the CSSA Scheme was last reviewed in 1996, the Administration should consider conducting a comprehensive review of the Scheme, and setting a subsistence living protection line; and</p> <p>(c) elderly persons and persons with disabilities should be allowed to apply for CSSA on an individual basis.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Government's recurrent expenditure on social security had increased from \$28.5 billion in 2012-2013 to \$40 billion in 2015-2016, about \$20 billion of which was spent on the CSSA Scheme;</li> <li>(b) in accordance with the established mechanism, the Administration had adjusted the CSSA standard payment rates on an annual basis, taking into account the movements of the Social Security Assistance Index of Prices ("SSAIP"). The Social Welfare Department would also update the weighting system of SSAIP every five years to reflect the latest expenditure pattern of CSSA households and the impact of price changes;</li> <li>(c) in the past five years, the CSSA standard payment rates had a cumulative increase of 28.7%, taking into account the 4.4% increase in 2016-2017 which was proposed in accordance with the established mechanism and would take retrospective effect from 1 February 2016 subject to the passage of the Appropriation Bill by the Legislative Council;</li> <li>(d) to improve the CSSA Scheme, the Administration had implemented targeted measures set out in paragraph 8 of its paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1209/15-16(04)], and taken one-off relief measures, such as the provision of an extra payment to social security recipients which was proposed by FS in the 2016-2017 Budget;</li> <li>(e) the level of the maximum rent allowance ("MRA") under the CSSA Scheme had a cumulative increase of 40% in the past five years;</li> <li>(f) provision of a rent allowance comparable to the market rent might trigger a rise in the private housing rental and would generate financial pressure on non-CSSA private housing tenants;</li> <li>(g) the Community Care Fund had implemented an assistance programme to provide a one-off subsidy for CSSA households living in rented private housing</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>and paying a rent which exceeded MRA. In the long run, the Administration would continue striving to increase the supply of public rental housing to address housing needs of the needy groups;</p> <p>(h) persons applying for CSSA on an individual basis were required to make a statement about the financial status of their households. The statement should not be viewed as a "bad son statement" as termed by some deputations; and</p> <p>(i) the public consultation on retirement protection was being conducted until 21 June 2016. The Administration would take into account the views collected, including those on the CSSA Scheme, during the consultation period to enhance the retirement protection system.</p>	
023357 - 023935	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che	<p>Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che said that:</p> <p>(a) the increment in the CSSA standard payment rates did not catch up with the economic growth;</p> <p>(b) the updating of the weighting system of SSAIP, which was conducted every five years, had not expanded the coverage of the items of basic needs in SSAIP, resulting in exclusion of many items which became essential nowadays;</p> <p>(c) different rates of rent allowance under the CSSA Scheme should be provided according to the district in which the CSSA recipients were living, as the rental level of private housing varied for different districts;</p> <p>(d) the Administration should consider allowing eligible elderly persons and persons with disabilities, who were living with their family members, to apply for CSSA on an individual basis. By doing so, these CSSA recipients would not need to apply for rent allowance; and</p> <p>(e) many needy elderly persons would not apply for CSSA if the Administration had implemented the universal retirement protection.</p> <p>Noting that the Government's recurrent</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>expenditure on social security had increased from \$28.5 billion in 2012-2013 to \$40 billion in 2015-2016, the Chairman said that such an increment was mainly attributable to the implementation of the Old Age Living Allowance ("OALA") Scheme. It was noteworthy that in the past five years, the number of CSSA cases had declined. Old age cases currently accounted for 60% of all CSSA cases.</p>	
023936 - 024745	<p>Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Admin</p>	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung said that with a cumulative increase of 40% in the past 10 years, the exiting level of the CSSA standard payments was still inadequate to enable recipients to maintain basic living as the base of the CSSA standard payment rates was too low. He asked:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) whether and when the Administration would conduct a comprehensive review of the CSSA Scheme; and</li> <li>(b) the Administration to explain how to calculate the average monthly CSSA payment for one-person CSSA households, which was \$5,399 as at 1 February 2015.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it would continue keeping in view the implementation of the CSSA Scheme and take targeted measures as appropriate; and</li> <li>(b) the calculation of the average monthly CSSA payment of one-person CSSA households (i.e. \$5,399) had taken into account the monthly standard payments, supplements and special grants provided under the CSSA Scheme for all one-person CSSA households.</li> </ul> <p>Mr LEUNG was of the view that the calculation of the average monthly CSSA payments was misleading and had overstated the amount of monthly CSSA payments for one-person CSSA households.</p> <p>The Chairman requested the Administration to provide the average monthly CSSA payments of all CSSA cases in all household categories according to the following case natures, i.e. old age, illness, disability, single parenthood, unemployment, low income and others.</p>	<p>Admin (paragraph 4(a) of the minutes)</p>



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
024746 - 030002	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Admin	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung urged the Administration to consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) reviewing the CSSA Scheme as assistance for CSSA recipients with multiple needs was inadequate;</li> <li>(b) conducting a survey to study the expenditure patterns of CSSA households; and</li> <li>(c) providing additional assistance for CSSA households, of which their household expenditure had exceeded the amount of CSSA payments received.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration advised that the social welfare system, including the CSSA Scheme, was premised upon the principle that the same social security recipient should not receive more than one type of assistance. For example, OALA recipients could not at the same time receive Disability Allowance. The Administration stressed that suitable assistance would be provided under the CSSA Scheme for the eligible needy according to their individual needs.</p> <p>The Chairman said that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the grassroots, i.e. about the 10th percentile of households, were mostly living in sub-divided units and suffering from high rental. However, their expenditure patterns could not be truly reflected by the Consumer Price Index (A). In addition, the items of basic needs covered by the CSSA standard payments were outdated. He therefore strongly urged the Administration to expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review of the CSSA Scheme. Subsequent reviews should be conducted at least once every 10 years; and</li> <li>(b) comparing the average CSSA payments with the 25% non-CSSA households with the lowest expenditure might give a wrong impression to the public that the expenditure levels of CSSA households and the aforesaid non-CSSA households were similar. He asked the Administration to advise which percentile of households the expenditure levels of which were close to the amount of the</li> </ul>	Admin (paragraph 4(b) of the minutes)

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		average CSSA payments of all CSSA cases in all household categories.  The Administration undertook to provide the requisite information if available.	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
30 May 2016