

THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE

in response to the

**REPORT OF
THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
No. 60**

of July 2013

23 October 2013

**THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE IN RESPONSE TO THE
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT NO. 60
DATED JULY 2013**

**REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR
MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 60)**

Chapter 1 – Conservation of monuments and historic buildings

The Administration generally welcomes the views and accepts the recommendations made by Audit Commission (Audit), and has taken appropriate follow-up actions on the recommendations.

Declaration of Monuments

2. In the light of experiences in the past few years, the Administration considers that there is a need to review the present policy on the conservation of built heritage to better meet public expectations. The Development Bureau (DEVB), assisted by the Antiquities Advisory Board (AAB), is conducting the review. The AAB aims at producing a consultation paper by end 2013 and will join hands with the DEVB to solicit public views thereon. The Panel on Development of the Legislative Council (LegCo) will also be consulted and kept informed of the outcome of the review.

Assessment of historic buildings

3. It has been the Government's objective to strike a proper balance between heritage conservation and respect for private property rights. Owners of most of the buildings on the list of 1 444 buildings which are pending finalisation of grading have expressed varying degrees of concern with the grading exercise. The grading of these private buildings has not been finalised pending further discussion with the owners. The Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) will continue to engage the owners concerned. The AAB has already proceeded to examine new items/categories suggested for grading by the public alongside the items outstanding from the list of 1 444 buildings. DEVB reported this arrangement to the LegCo Panel on Development on 26 February 2013 and will continue to report further progress to the Panel.

4. For better protection of the new items/categories pending completion of their grading assessment, the AMO has started distributing the updated list to the Buildings Department, Lands Department (LandsD) and Planning Department (PlanD) on a bi-monthly basis so that the departments concerned can alert the Commissioner for Heritage's Office (CHO) of the DEVB and the AMO upon receipt of redevelopment proposals for these items/categories.

Government monuments and graded buildings

5. In response to Audit's recommendation, the AMO has refined arrangements for regular inspections of Government monuments and graded buildings. The Administration will enhance efforts to facilitate the public to appreciate Government monuments and graded buildings as far as practicable. Apart from encouraging the bureaux/departments to allow public access and arrange guided tours to the buildings under their management where appropriate, the DEVB will also continue to select suitable buildings for public access and guided tours under its annual publicity event – Heritage Fiesta. Having due regard to the nature of operation and site constraints, the CHO has also been specifying in tenancy agreements the minimum number of guided tours which partnering organisations of the Revitalising Historic Buildings Through Partnership Scheme (Revitalisation Scheme) have to organise and half-yearly reports on visitor satisfaction surveys which partnering organisations have to submit.

6. DEVB has reviewed with the relevant departments the management and maintenance responsibilities in respect of the 10 unallocated buildings identified by Audit. Relevant departments have conducted site inspections to the buildings and will initiate maintenance programmes as necessary. Upon LandsD's request, the Government Property Agency is also assisting in identifying suitable Government users for unallocated buildings. However, such users may not be readily identified in view of the inherent site constraints.

Private monuments and graded buildings

7. In response to Audit's recommendation, the AMO has enhanced the arrangement for regular inspections of private monuments and graded buildings. The AMO has also reminded private owners to comply with the relevant Ordinances and regulations in carrying out works at their graded buildings. Relevant departments have been reminded to notify the CHO and the AMO of any demolition or alteration plans of private monuments and graded buildings. On receipt of alerts from relevant departments, the CHO and AMO will approach the owners concerned to explore conservation options and seek the owners' agreement for the AMO to prepare photographic records of the buildings.

8. To encourage higher participation in the Financial Assistance for Maintenance Scheme (FAS), the CHO issued to all owners of graded historic buildings in July 2013 a pamphlet to promote the FAS. In its review of the policy on the conservation of built heritage, the AAB will also consider how the attractiveness of the FAS may be enhanced. The Panel on Development of the LegCo will be kept informed of proposed enhancement measures.

Promotion of heritage conservation

9. The AMO is liaising with relevant government departments to erect information signs outside Government monuments and graded buildings subject to site conditions and other circumstances of individual buildings. As for private monuments and graded buildings, the AMO is offering to help the owners concerned to install information signs outside these buildings. The AMO will proceed with the installation upon obtaining the consent of individual private owners and when site conditions so permit.

10. To address Audit's concern, the AMO will conduct a territory-wide survey to identify the aspirations of the general public on heritage conservation, gauge their views on the effectiveness of Government policies, and seek their opinions on improvement areas. The AMO will also continue to report its plans on heritage education and publicity strategy to the AAB.

11. To facilitate wider public access to the information on the guided tours to the projects under the Revitalisation Scheme, the information in websites for all completed projects are now provided in both English and Chinese.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

12. Appropriate follow-up actions have been taken for all Audit's recommendations. The DEVB will keep the Panel on Development of the LegCo informed of the outcome of the review on the policy on the conservation of built heritage. Details of the implementation progress are set out at Enclosure 1.

Encl. 1

Chapter 2 – Administration of road safety measures

13. The Government agrees with the recommendations of the Director of Audit (D of A) and the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) of the LegCo. The Transport and Housing Bureau, the Transport Department (TD), the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) and the Information Services Department (ISD) have been following up the recommendations as appropriate and the progress is reported below.

Measures to tackle drink driving

Implementation of random breath tests (RBT)

14. HKPF will enhance the existing computing system to improve data analysis on RBT by the end of 2013. In addition, a set of guiding principles has been formulated and disseminated to all the traffic formations within HKPF in August 2013 to facilitate the planning of RBT operations.

Enforcement of the three-tier penalty legislation

15. HKPF plans to equip all land region police stations with evidential breath test (EBT) devices by the end of 2013.

16. HKPF has reduced the time interval target taken between taking screening breath test and EBTS from 90 minutes to 75 minutes with effect from 1 August 2013. A further review will be conducted after all land region police stations have been equipped with EBT devices.

17. Subject to the satisfactory completion of the mobility performance test on EBT devices, a police vehicle will be modified as a Mobile Breath Test Centre for trial use in December 2013.

Measures to tackle speeding and red light jumping

Operation of enforcement camera systems

18. As the LegCo Panel on Transport did not support the proposed trial scheme of the average speed enforcement camera system at its meeting on 24 May 2013, the Government is considering whether and when to present the proposed trial scheme to the LegCo Panel on Transport for consideration again.

19. TD will continue to explore new technology and cost-effective methods so as to further enhance the performance of the present enforcement camera systems and minimise the limitations in taking images of the offending vehicles under some circumstances, such as being blocked by other vehicles.

Measures to promote safer vehicle operation

Public light buses (PLB)

20. As mentioned in the Policy Address in January 2013, the Government has proposed to phase out the heavily polluting pre-Euro IV diesel commercial vehicles (DCVs), including PLBs, through an incentive-cum-regulatory approach. A sum of \$10 billion has been set aside for a proposed ex-gratia payment scheme to provide incentive to vehicle owners to comply with the mandatory phasing out of their pre-Euro IV DCVs. The Environmental Protection Department has consulted the relevant trades and the LegCo Panel on Environmental Affairs (the Panel) and came up with a revised proposal which received the support of the Panel on 2 October 2013. The Government will introduce the necessary legislative proposals into LegCo for approval for early implementation of the new initiative. As PLBs registered on or after 1 August 2004 are required by law to be equipped with seat belts in the passenger seats, the implementation of the new initiative will lead to an increase in the number of PLBs with passenger seat belts.

21. For the Liquefied Petroleum Gas fuelled PLBs without passenger seat belts, which will not be covered by the above initiative, TD will continue to engage the PLB trade to review and examine the feasibility and viability of retrofitting seat belts on those PLBs having regard to their objection and concerns.

22. The Road Safety Council (RSC) has agreed to enhance publicity for promoting the wearing of seat belts by PLB passengers at its meeting held in May 2013.

23. In April 2012, the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) was amended to introduce measures to deter speeding by PLB drivers and enhance safe operation of PLBs. The measures included imposing a maximum speed limit for PLBs at 80 km/h; mandating all PLBs to install speed limiters; mandating PLB drivers to display PLB driver identity plates on PLBs; mandating completion of a pre-service training course by applicants for a PLB driving licence; and mandating the installation of approved electronic data recording device on newly registered PLBs. The first three measures came into effect when the amendment legislation was passed by LegCo in April 2012. The Government plans to table new subsidiary legislation for effecting the last two measures at LegCo within 2013. Since the commencement of the 2012 amendment legislation, HKPF has conducted a number of territory-wide enforcement operations targeting for enhancement of PLB safety, including detection of speeding PLBs and checking whether PLBs are equipped with speed limiters as required, while TD has continued to conduct surveys to check PLB operations. HKPF has been submitting Defective Vehicle Reports to TD for the latter to arrange vehicle examination for those PLBs found speeding in excess of speed limiter since January 2013.

Franchised buses

24. Following the fatal bus accident on Chai Wan Road in November 2012, TD has been in active discussion with the franchised bus companies about the health check arrangements for their drivers. All franchised bus companies have implemented additional measures to further improve the health check arrangements since August 2013. Specifically, the new measures are:

- (a) requiring bus captains, irrespective of their age, who have ever suffered from certain illnesses (such as stroke and cardio-vascular diseases) to subject to annual health checks and an electrocardiogram (“ECG”); and
- (b) all bus captains at 50, 54 and 57 years old will have to undergo ECG during their annual checkup.

They are in addition to pre-existing arrangements where bus captains aged 50 or above would need to undergo annual health checks and for those at or over 60 to also undergo ECG during the health checks.

Taxis

25. To tackle the speeding problem of taxis, apart from enforcement efforts, a series of publicity and education programmes have been and will be implemented. These include appealing to the taxi trade to drive safely at the taxi conference meetings in August 2013, publishing a taxi newsletter for taxi drivers emphasising driving safely in September 2013, organising the Taxi Driver Commendation Scheme Prize Presentation Ceremony 2013 (to be held around end 2013), and holding a seminar on driving safely for taxi drivers around March 2014. The Government will review the effectiveness of these efforts to determine if more should be done.

For all drivers

26. The Government is also reviewing the age requirement for applicants to produce a medical examination certificate issued by a registered medical practitioner when applying for first issue or renewal of driving licence.

Accuracy of traffic accident data

27. To improve the accuracy of traffic accident data, HKPF and TD will work together to improve the procedures for data input and implement system enhancement as appropriate.

Publicity and education programmes

28. Learning from the two incidents relating to TV Announcements in the Public Interest (APIs) on anti-drug driving and cycling safety, ISD has introduced a number of additional measures to address the D of A's concerns and minimise the recurrence of similar incidents in future.

29. To ensure all TV APIs on road safety are in compliance with the Road Traffic Ordinance, ISD has added a written directive to its API Production Checklist to require the presence of technical experts during API filming sessions when necessary.

30. HKPF and TD have undertaken to comply with the relevant requirement of the Good Practice Guide on Publicity Campaigns issued by ISD concerning the presence of appropriate experts during the shooting sessions of the APIs.

31. In respect of the Audit's recommendation to step up publicity to promote public awareness of the statutory requirements for bicycle safety fittings, HKPF and TD have issued publicity materials on cycling safety including statutory requirements on bicycle fittings. The publicity materials have been distributed during publicity campaigns to cyclists, bicycle shops and through public outlets such as district offices, schools, libraries, etc.

Progress Made in Implementing the Audit's Recommendations

Encl. 2 32. A summary of progress in implementing the Audit's recommendations is set out at the Enclosure 2.

Chapter 3 – Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme

33. The Education Bureau (EDB) has studied in detail the recommendations made by the Audit and the PAC on the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme (PEVS), and has taken follow-up actions for improvement of the scheme.

34. The Government introduced the PEVS in the 2007/08 school year to provide fee subsidy to the parents of kindergarten (KG) children. On top of the voucher subsidy, families with financial difficulties may apply for fee remission to ensure that no children will be deprived of KG education due to the lack of financial means. By providing direct fee subsidy to parents in the form of voucher, the Government wishes to preserve the responsiveness of the KG sector to the diversified service needs as well as to enhance the quality and affordability of KG education at the same time. We are pleased to note that the Audit recognizes the contributions of the PEVS in easing the financial burden on parents and raising the professional qualifications of KG principals and teachers.

35. While it is not the policy intent of the PEVS to provide free KG education, the voucher subsidy has helped parents defray a large part of the tuition fee of KG education. In the 2012/13 school year, the average tuition fee for half-day (HD) classes paid by parents was \$3,500 per student per annum, which was much lower than the average amount of \$15,169 paid by parents in 2006/07 prior to the introduction of the PEVS.

36. To ensure the quality of KG education, PEVS KGs are subject to a quality assurance (QA) mechanism. Under the QA mechanism, PEVS KGs conduct school self-evaluation (SSE) and the EDB conducts Quality Review (QR) to validate their SSE results. Only KGs meeting the prescribed quality standards under the QR mechanism are allowed to remain in the PEVS.

37. In the 2012/13 school year, there are 735 KGs under the PEVS, representing about 97% of all local non-profit-making (NPM) KGs. The number of KG students under the PEVS has also increased from 119 700 in the 2007/08 school year to 129 400 in 2012/13.

38. The EDB set up a Committee on Free KG Education (the Committee) in April 2013 to examine how to practicably implement free KG education and recommend specific proposals. Five Sub-committees have also been formed under the Committee. The issues to be studied by the Sub-committees include the objectives of KG education, funding modes, the different needs of whole-day and half-day (HD) KGs, teacher qualification and salary framework, teacher-to-student ratio, monitoring and governance framework, catering for student diversity, home-school cooperation, and public engagement strategies, etc. The Committee will gauge the views of stakeholders on the current policy and practice of KG education, including the PEVS, identify issues for possible improvements, consider various options, and make recommendations to the EDB on the way forward, taking into consideration the recommendations of the Audit and PAC.

39. In view of the intricacies of the issues involved and the possible far-reaching implications of any changes in policy, our current assessment is that the Committee will take about two years to complete its tasks and make recommendations to the Government. During this period, the Committee will maintain communication with the KG sector, and explore short- and medium-term measures which could help KGs meet their challenges. The Government will actively consider providing support accordingly. The EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the Panel on Education of the LegCo (LegCo Panel on Education) from time to time.

40. We note that the PAC has urged the EDB not to overly interfere in the governance and operation of non-PEVS KGs. In fact, it is not our policy intent to over-regulate the privately run KGs, though all registered schools, including PEVS and non-PEVS KGs, are required to comply with the provisions under the Education Ordinance and Education Regulations. After all, there is a need to strike a balance between the promotion of the diversity and vibrancy of the KG sector on the one hand and on the other hand, the community's, especially parents', expectation that the Government is the custodian of public interest and would ensure that KGs operate at an acceptable standard.

Professional development of kindergarten principals and teachers

41. In response to the Audit's and PAC's concern and recommendation with regard to continued support for the professional upgrading of KG principals and teachers, the EDB will offer course fee reimbursement to serving principals and teachers in PEVS KGs who are pursuing the relevant approved courses in the 2012/13 and/or 2013/14 school year(s) and would complete the courses on or

before 31 August 2014 to assist the PEVS KGs concerned in meeting the policy target of the PEVS. A circular memorandum on the details was issued on 16 August 2013.

42. Both the Audit and PAC have expressed concern about the high turnover rate of regular teachers in some PEVS KGs. It should be noted that staff turnover is a result of a host of various factors related to the personal decision of the teachers and human resources management of the KG. Staff management is under the domain of management and organisation that the EDB will look into when conducting QR. As a regular practice, the QR team will review teachers' information submitted by PEVS KGs. Should the outflow of regular teachers in individual KGs warrant attention, the team will provide advice on team building, leadership, work climate and/or provision of staff support and training, etc. to ensure the delivery of quality education. At the territory level, the EDB has been monitoring the demand and supply of KG teachers and will continue to do so to ensure an adequate provision of qualified KG teachers and overall stability in the sector.

43. The issues about teacher qualification and salaries will be included in the study of the Committee, whose work progress will be reported to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time.

Quality assurance mechanism

44. The EDB has commissioned a consultancy study on the effectiveness of the QR mechanism and its impact on pre-primary education. The study was completed in 2012 and the executive summary of the report has been uploaded onto the EDB website. In the light of the recommendations of the consultancy study, the EDB has introduced improvement measures in the second QR cycle starting from the 2012/13 school year, including increasing the time spent in KGs for on-site QR, fine-tuning the School Report template to make it more user-friendly for schools in conducting the SSE, and further enhancing the Kindergarten Quality Review Information System with an analysis tool that helps KGs conduct the stakeholder surveys.

45. To avoid creating excessive administrative workload and pressure on PEVS KG principals and teachers, we have encouraged KGs to embed SSE in the school's daily practices. In this connection, we have also reminded KGs, through a standing circular, to make full use of the evidence readily available in school for SSE and compilation of Performance Indicators with a view to avoiding unnecessary documentation and preparation. This message is reiterated during the SSE workshops, briefing sessions and QR visits by the EDB. Specifically, between the date of release of the Audit Report and the end of the 2012/13 school year, four seminars/workshops on SSE for PEVS KGs have been conducted. We will continue to conduct training workshops and sharing sessions, as well as provide school-based support for KGs on SSE.

Regulatory measures

Fee ceilings

46. We note that PAC has urged the EDB to devise expeditiously a suitable mechanism for regular review of the school fee ceilings to take into account factors other than changes in the Composite Consumer Price Index. The issue will be examined by the Committee in the course of its study on practicable implementation of free KG education. The Committee will also explore interim measures to address the imminent needs of the KGs. The work progress of the Committee will be reported to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time.

Trading activities and miscellaneous fee income

47. We note the PAC's concerns about the high miscellaneous fees charged by some KGs for the sale of optional school items and provision of paid services. In this connection, the EDB has set out requirements with specified profit limits for compliance by PEVS KGs. They are required to report the miscellaneous fees they charge for trading activities in the "statements of profit/loss from trading activities" attached to their audited accounts, so that excessive profits could readily be identified for taking follow-up actions.

48. To prevent PEVS KGs from grouping the whole or part of their miscellaneous fee income under "other operating income" which might have bypassed the above-mentioned requirements, the EDB has taken measures to step up the regulation of PEVS KGs' trading operation, including reporting of such income as "other operating income" in the audited accounts.

49. The EDB has introduced a practice in the course of review of PEVS KG's 2011/12 audit accounts, whereby PEVS KGs and their auditors are requested to provide explanatory notes and details of the sale of school items and provision of paid services in the audited accounts where necessary. The EDB also issued a circular in September 2013 to consolidate all prevailing guidelines and reiterate the general principles on trading operation. The circular provides clearer guidance on trading activities, income from which should be reported as "income from trading activities" in the audited accounts.

50. In the call circular for KGs' audited accounts for 2012/13 to be issued in November 2013, KGs will be reminded to properly classify their "income from trading activities" and "other operating income" and report them properly in their audited accounts in accordance with EDB's guidelines/directives, and to observe the list of components of school fees as set out in EDB's guidelines/directives which parents should not be charged separately. Briefing sessions would also be conducted on a regular basis to strengthen KGs' financial management.

Rental payments

51. We note the Audit's and PAC's concern about the significant rental payments by some PEVS KGs and inadequate disclosure of related party transaction. Starting from the annual KG fee revision exercise for 2013/14, for cases where the rental paid by individual PEVS KG is higher than that assessed by the Rating and Valuation Department (RVD), the EDB will alert the respective supervisors of the KGs and advise them to make reference to the RVD's assessed rental when entering into a tenancy agreement in future. In this regard, 16 letters were issued so far. In the next call circular for KG fee revision applications to be issued in early 2014, KGs will be reminded to make proper disclosure of related party transactions in both their applications for school fee revision and their audited accounts. Those found not to have done so will be followed up.

Rent reimbursement scheme

52. With regard to the Audit's and PAC's concern about the rent reimbursement scheme for NPM KGs, related issues will be examined by the Committee, whose work progress will be reported to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time.

Timely Completion of Audit Review

53. The timely submission of audited accounts by PEVS KGs will enable the EDB to better schedule the review work. With the close follow-up by the EDB, the proportion of PEVS KGs not submitting their audited accounts by the deadline had declined significantly from 64% for the 2007/08 school year to 34% for the 2011/12 school year, and those that were exceptionally late in submitting their audited accounts (i.e. submitting 3 months after the deadline) had also declined significantly from 20% for the 2007/08 school year to 2% for the 2011/12 school year. To step up monitoring, in addition to the issue of annual circular in November 2013 to the PEVS KGs calling for submission of audited accounts, the EDB will issue reminder to the KGs urging for timely submission of their audited accounts one month before the deadline starting from the next call for the audited accounts for the 2012/13 school year.

54. The EDB had made vigorous efforts to speed up the review of the 2010/11 audited accounts of PEVS KGs, which was completed by November 2012, five months earlier than the previous exercises. The EDB will further synchronize the processes involved in the examination of PEVS KGs' fee revision applications and the review of their annual audited accounts to expedite the completion of the annual review of audited accounts.

Disclosure and transparency

55. The EDB has all along been encouraging PEVS KGs to disclose other charges for school items/services through different effective means (e.g. leaflet). To further enhance transparency, PEVS KGs have been required to publish additional items of miscellaneous fees starting from the 2013 KG Profile, to which parents would make reference for choosing a suitable KG for their children. The EDB has issued a circular in August 2012, before the start of the second QR cycle in the 2012/13 school year, to encourage KGs, among other things, to upload their School Reports/Plans onto school's website. We will continue to advise KGs during QR visits and annual KG seminars/workshops to do so. For those KGs which have yet to set up their own website, the EDB has encouraged them to make use of the additional one-off school development grant for PEVS KGs (up to \$250,000 per school) disbursed in the 2013/14 school year to develop a school website so that school information can be made available for public access.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

Encl. 3 56. A summary of the progress of implementing the Audit's recommendations is at Enclosure 3.

57. Since follow-up actions on the recommendations made by the Audit have either been completed or will be taken on an on-going basis, whereas issues covered by the deliberations of the Committee will continue to be reported to the LegCo Panel on Education, we recommend deleting this chapter from the next progress report.

Chapter 4 – Development and management of parks and gardens

Encl. 4 58. The Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) accepts the recommendations made by the Audit on the development and management of parks and gardens. To follow-up on the recommendations, LCSD has set up a Steering Committee, chaired by the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services, to conduct a comprehensive review with a view to improving the development, management and maintenance of parks and gardens. The Steering Committee is underpinned by three working groups to examine issues relating to (a) planning and provision of open space; (b) inspection, maintenance and other management related issues for parks and gardens; and (c) maintenance and inspection of playground equipment. LCSD's response to and actions taken in implementing the Audit's recommendations are summarised at Enclosure 4. Major measures are set out as follows:

Planning and provision of park and garden facilities

59. LCSD and the PlanD have set up a working team and agreed to undertake an overall update of the information on the provision of open space in both LCSD and non-LCSD venues at a five-year interval in order to tie in with the revised population data from Population Census/By-census. In between the five-year interval, an interim review would be conducted at a two-and-a-half-year interval with update on the open space information. To shorten the lead time in commissioning new park and garden projects, LCSD and the Architectural Services Department (ArchSD) have devised a mechanism for monitoring the work progress and resolving pre-handover issues as soon as practicable.

60. LCSD consulted the District Facilities Management Committee (DFMC) of the Kwai Tsing District Council on the future development of the Kwai Chung Park on 26 February and 18 June 2013 respectively. Taking into account members' views and the environmental constraints of the landfill site, LCSD is drawing up the proposed project scope and will consult the DFMC again in late 2013.

61. On the transfer of facilities from the Home Affairs Department to LCSD, as at July 2013, 114 ex-HAD facilities have been gazetted as public pleasure grounds while another seven, for which land allocation has been completed, would be gazetted soon. LCSD will continue to solicit the assistance of the relevant departments with a view to resolving the outstanding issues regarding land allocation for some 30 venues.

62. LCSD will conduct a survey in the fourth quarter of 2013 to gauge the utilisation and user satisfaction in respect of parks and garden facilities. The summary of the relevant survey findings will be uploaded on LCSD's website to enhance transparency and accountability in the management of parks and gardens.

63. The design parameters for park furniture and signage developed under the Park Deco pilot scheme have been finalised and will be provided to ArchSD for reference when developing new parks and renovating existing parks. LCSD will also make reference to the good practices for public engagement adopted in the Park Deco project.

Inspection and monitoring of parks and gardens

64. To improve the effectiveness of inspections conducted by its District Leisure Services Offices, LCSD has reminded the staff concerned to follow the prevailing guidelines on the inspection of land-based leisure venues. The Department has also reviewed the existing guidelines taking into account the Audit's recommendations and relevant factors. The revised guidelines will be promulgated to staff shortly.

65. To adopt a risk-based approach for conducting structural inspections, LCSD has prioritised the playground equipment in its venues into three risk categories (high, medium and low risk). Inspection frequency will be set according to the risk level of the equipment (e.g. annual inspection for high-risk equipment such as basketball stands; at least one structural inspection every two years for medium-risk equipment such as elderly fitness equipment and children playground equipment). In addition, venue staff will watch out for possible defects during their routine inspections of the venues.

Repair and maintenance of facilities

66. LCSD has reminded its staff to enhance the monitoring of repair and maintenance works and reiterated the importance of adhering to the relevant guidelines, including the target time frames for completing works. Outstanding cases should be reported to senior levels in headquarters for follow-up actions with ArchSD and Electrical and Mechanical Services Department as necessary.

Chapter 5 – Tung Chung Road Improvement Project

67. The Government accepts the recommendations made by the D of A. The Highways Department (HyD) has taken steps to improve the procedures of project implementation including project planning, environmental impact assessment and adoption of alternative designs.

68. HyD will continue to strive for further improvement. Taking into account the observations in the Audit Report, HyD, in collaboration with the TD, completed a post-completion review of the Tung Chung Road Improvement Project in May 2013.

69. HyD has adopted the requirements in the latest technical circulars issued by the DEVB for works departments, which have introduced a set of mandatory special conditions of contract allowing the Government to accept alternative designs from the contractors after contract award, and enhanced measures in dealing with alternative designs both in the pre-contract and construction stages.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

70. Details of the progress made in implementing improvement measures identified by D of A are set out at the Enclosure 5.

Encl. 5

**Conservation of monuments and historic buildings
Progress in implementing the Audit and PAC Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: Declaration of monuments		
2.18	<p>Audit recommends that the Secretary for Development should –</p> <p>(a) conduct a review of the existing mechanism for heritage conservation, particularly that relating to private historic buildings, drawing experience from the Ho Tung Gardens case and making reference to overseas practices.</p>	<p>The Secretary for Development announced at a press conference in December 2012 that the Development Bureau (DEVB) would commence reviewing its policy on the preservation of privately-owned historic buildings. The Secretary for Development invited the Antiquities Advisory Board (AAB) in February 2013 to assist the Government with this policy review. The AAB is reviewing the policy and working on a consultation paper by end 2013. The DEVB will keep the Panel on Development of the Legislative Council (LegCo) informed of the progress of the review.</p>
Part 3: Assessment of historic buildings		
3.5	<p>Audit recommends that the Secretary for Development should –</p> <p>(a) task the Executive Secretary of the Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) to:</p> <p>(i) formulate a plan for confirming the grading of the outstanding 175 historic buildings;</p>	<p>The finalisation of the grading of private buildings requires the consent of the owners, and it will be difficult to set a timeframe for completing the exercise. Nevertheless, the AAB in February 2013 agreed that, while the AMO will continue to engage the owners concerned, it will proceed to examine new items/categories suggested for grading by the public alongside the remaining buildings from</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		the list of 1 444 buildings. DEVB reported such arrangement to the LegCo Panel on Development on 26 February 2013 and will continue to report the progress of the assessment of historic buildings to the Panel.
3.10	(ii) update the list of potential historic buildings and distribute it to the Buildings Department (BD), the Lands Department (LandsD) and the Planning Department (PlanD) on a timely basis;	The AMO has been distributing the updated list of new items/categories suggested for grading by the public to the BD, the LandsD and the PlanD on a bi-monthly basis since February 2013. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.11	(iii) in consultation with the AAB, consider assessing newly-referred historic buildings by the public while confirming the grading of the outstanding historic buildings mentioned in (i) above.	The AAB agreed in February 2013 to examine new items suggested for grading by the public alongside the remaining items on the list of 1 444 buildings, and has started processing the new items. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 4: Government monuments and graded buildings		
4.8	<p>Audit recommends that the Secretary for Development should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to ensure that all unallocated Government graded buildings (particularly the 10 unallocated buildings identified by Audit) are properly maintained and gainfully used.</p>	For the 10 unallocated buildings identified by Audit, relevant departments have conducted site inspections to the buildings and will initiate maintenance programmes as necessary. In parallel, upon LandsD's request, the Government Property Agency is also assisting in identifying suitable Government users for unallocated buildings, however, such users may not be readily identified in

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		view of the inherent site constraints.
4.19	(b) task the Executive Secretary of the AMO to formulate and issue guidelines for regular inspections of Government monuments and graded buildings, and disseminate the guidelines to responsible bureaux or departments (B/Ds) for conducting regular inspections of these premises.	<p>The AMO has refined the inspection arrangements for Government monuments and Government graded buildings which will be inspected at least once a year and once every three years respectively. The AMO has drawn up guidelines for the inspection arrangements in September 2013.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.16	<p>(c) task the Commissioner for Heritage to:</p> <p>(i) in collaboration with the AMO, the responsible B/Ds and non-governmental organisations (NGOs), periodically organise guided tours to Government monuments and graded buildings as far as practicable; and</p>	<p>As the Administration stated in its response to Audit's recommendation, not all Government monuments and graded buildings are appropriate for public access and guided tours, and it may not be cost effective to arrange so on a year round on-going basis. DEVB has been selecting and will continue to select suitable historic buildings for public access and guided tours under the annual publicity event - Heritage Fiesta. DEVB has also been encouraging and will continue to encourage B/Ds which are managing monuments and graded buildings to allow public access and arrange guided tours to their buildings where appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.26	(ii) require tenants under the Revitalising Historic Buildings Through Partnership Scheme	Since Batch III of the Revitalisation Scheme, DEVB has required the selected non-profit-making organisations (NPOs) to undertake in

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>(Revitalisation Scheme) to submit to the Commissioner for Heritage's Office (CHO) periodical returns on visitor information, and specify guided tour requirements in the related tenancy agreements.</p>	<p>their Consolidated Project Proposals to conduct visitor satisfaction surveys and submit the results to the CHO on a half-yearly basis. Such requirements will be specified in all related tenancy agreements in future. Subject to the business nature of the revitalisation projects and the site constraints, the CHO has been working and will continue to work with the NPOs to design and specify in the tenancy agreements a minimum number of guided tours per day during weekdays and during weekends/holidays, and of open days per year as appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.12	<p>Audit has recommended that, regarding the six Government historic buildings that have been left unused for a long period of time, the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services, the Director of Water Supplies, the Government Property Administrator and the Director of Health should take action to ensure that the buildings are properly utilised.</p>	<p><u>Old House at Wong Chuk Hang San Wai</u></p> <p>The Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) has opened the Old House to the public during Saturdays, Sundays and Public Holidays since 19 January 2013. The effectiveness of the opening arrangement will be reviewed in early 2014.</p> <p><u>Tai Tam Tuk Raw Water Pumping Station No. 2 Staff Quarters Building and Peak Depot on Old Peak Road</u></p> <p>The Water Supplies Department (WSD) has completed an internal review and confirmed that there is no suitable use of the staff quarters and the depot within WSD. Following the established mechanism, WSD is arranging to relinquish the staff quarters and depot for identification of suitable uses. In parallel, WSD is working with other departments to</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>identify other possible uses.</p> <p><u>Main Block at Lady Ho Tung Welfare Centre in Sheung Shui and Bungalow</u></p> <p>The Main Block of Lady Ho Tung Welfare Centre was returned by the Hospital Authority to the Department of Health (DH) on 11 Jun 2013. The DH has continued to liaise with relevant B/Ds to make appropriate use of the Main Block and the Bungalow at Lady Ho Tung Welfare Centre. The DH will install information signs outside the two buildings to help the general public locate these two graded buildings.</p> <p><u>Ex - Victoria Road Detention Centre</u></p> <p>Under the Land Grant Scheme of the Education Bureau, the site will be allocated to the University of Chicago Booth School of Business ("Chicago Booth") for the development of a self-financing post-secondary institution. Chicago Booth will undertake all necessary procedures such as seeking planning permissions.</p>
Part 5: Private monuments and graded buildings		
5.8	<p>Audit recommends that the Administration should –</p> <p>(a) task the Executive Secretary of the AMO to:</p> <p>(i) conduct promotion campaigns on the requirements for building owners to seek the BD's consent before demolition of historic buildings or obtain the LandsD's Certificate of Exemption in respect of building works before</p>	<p>Since July 2013, the AMO has been sending and will continue to send letters to owners of private historic buildings to remind the latter to comply with the relevant Ordinances and regulations in carrying out works to their buildings when the AMO informs them of the proposed grading of their buildings. In addition, the CHO and the AMO have</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>redevelopment of historic buildings;</p>	<p>also issued a pamphlet to, among others, remind owners of private graded buildings to comply with the relevant requirements in conducting works to the buildings. The pamphlet was uploaded to the internet (http://www.heritage.gov.hk/en/online/publication.htm) in May 2013 and sent by post to owners of private historic buildings in July 2013.</p> <p>The BD also continues to arrange publicity programmes to promulgate the statutory requirements on carrying out building works through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● newspaper supplements, pamphlets, booklets and posters targeted at the general public; ● talks in educational venues; ● announcements in the Public Interest on television, radio, buses and trains; ● mini-TV programmes; and ● banners on buses and minibuses. <p>The BD has also posted relevant Frequently Asked Questions on the BD's website for public's reference.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
5.10	<p>(ii) take proactive action to prepare photographic and drawing records of private historic buildings when the AMO is notified of any demolition plans of such buildings;</p>	<p>It has been a standing practice of the AMO to arrange photographic records of private historic buildings if the AMO is notified of any demolition plans of such buildings. The AMO will continue with the practice. However, in some cases where there is no owner's consent, photographic and drawing records for the interiors of the private historic buildings cannot be made.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.16	(iii) formulate and issue guidelines for regular inspections of private monuments and graded buildings;	<p>The AMO has drawn up the following guidelines in September 2013: (i) to conduct inspections of private monuments at least once a year; and (ii) to conduct inspections of the exterior of private graded buildings at least once every two years.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
5.18	(iv) conduct preventive maintenance surveys of the outstanding 25 private monuments;	The consultancy contract to conduct preventive maintenance surveys of the outstanding 25 private monuments has been awarded. The survey is expected to be completed by December 2013.
5.19	(v) set time targets for completing monument survey reports, remind AMO staff of the need to complete the reports in a timely manner, and provide the survey reports to the owners concerned; and	<p>The AMO has set and will continue to set time targets for completing the monument survey reports in the contract requirements when engaging the related consultancy services. The AMO will closely monitor the progress of the consultancy to ensure that the survey reports are completed in a timely manner and in compliance with contract requirements. The survey reports will be provided to the owners concerned for reference.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
5.21	(vi) formulate an action plan, set time targets and take prompt action to rectify building defects identified during monument surveys,	The AMO has drawn up an action plan with time targets in September 2013 to rectify building defects identified during monuments surveys. Building defects identified during monument

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>particularly those requiring urgent attention.</p>	<p>surveys will be rectified based on the action plan.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>5.10</p>	<p>(b) remind the related B/Ds of the requirement to notify the CHO and the AMO of any demolition or alteration plans of private historic buildings.</p>	<p>The DEVB issued a memo to the BD, the LandsD, the PlanD, the LCSD, the Home Affairs Department and all District Officers in March 2010 to set out the administrative monitoring mechanism to better protect privately-owned monuments, proposed monuments, and historic sites and buildings that have been graded or proposed to be graded or that are in recorded sites of archaeological interest from threat of demolition, alteration and addition works or material changes in their uses which may affect their heritage values. The DEVB issued another memo in March 2013 to the above-mentioned departments again to remind them of the monitoring mechanism and ask them to re-circulate DEVB's memo dated 29 March 2010 to their staff concerned on a half-yearly basis.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>5.25</p>	<p>(c) task the Commissioner for Heritage to conduct a review of the Financial Assistance for Maintenance Scheme (FAS) with a view to ascertaining the reasons for the low participation and whether the scheme is effective.</p>	<p>The AAB is assisting the Government in reviewing its policy on the preservation of privately-owned historic buildings, which includes FAS. The AAB aims to produce a consultation paper by end 2013. The Panel on Development of the LegCo will be kept informed of the outcome of the review in due course. In the meantime, the CHO and AMO issued a pamphlet to promote FAS. The pamphlet was uploaded to the internet</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>(http://www.heritage.gov.hk/en/online/publication.htm) in May 2013 and sent by post to owners of private historic buildings in July 2013.</p>
Part 6: Promotion of heritage conservation		
6.5	<p>Audit recommends that the Secretary for Development should –</p> <p>(a) task the Executive Secretary of the AMO to:</p> <p>(i) take action to erect information signs outside all Government monuments and graded buildings;</p> <p>(ii) persuade the owners of private monuments and graded buildings to allow the erection of information signs outside their buildings as far as possible;</p>	<p>Information signs will be installed for all Government monuments by early 2014. As for Government graded buildings, the AMO issued a memo to relevant B/Ds in May 2013, seeking their help in the installation of information signs outside Government graded buildings. The AMO is working with the departments concerned so that information signs will be installed outside Government graded buildings where site conditions and other circumstances of individual buildings so allow.</p> <p>The AMO will erect information signs outside all private monuments subject to site conditions, the owners' agreement and the implementation schedule. As for private graded buildings, the AMO issued a pamphlet informing owners of private graded buildings of AMO's offer to help install information signs outside their buildings in August 2013. The pamphlet was sent by post to all owners of private graded buildings in August 2013 and was uploaded to the internet in September 2013 (http://amo.gov.hk.hk/form/Information_Signs.pdf). The AMO will proceed with installing the information signs outside individual</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>private graded buildings when the owners concerned have given consent for the installation and when site conditions permit.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
6.10	(iii) conduct a territory-wide survey to identify the needs of the general public on heritage conservation, gauge their views on the effectiveness of the Government's actions in this aspect, and seek their opinions on improvement areas; and	The AMO will conduct the survey in 2014-15 to gauge views from members of the public on heritage conservation.
6.12	(iv) compile and submit to the AAB annual and biennial plans required under the AAB's heritage education and publicity strategy.	<p>The AMO reported to AAB the education and publicity programmes to be conducted in 2013 vide Board Paper AAB/1/2013-14 at its meeting on 20 February 2013. The AMO will continue to report its plan to the AAB.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
6.6	(b) task the Commissioner for Heritage to require all tenants under the Revitalisation Scheme to provide information in both Chinese and English on their websites.	<p>All the websites for completed revitalisation projects (including the Former North Kowloon Magistracy) now provide guided tour schedules and related information in both Chinese and English.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Administration of Road Safety Measures

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: Measures to tackle drink driving		
2.13	<p><i>Implementation of random breath tests (RBTs)</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should:</p> <p>(a) regularly compile and analyse the statistics on RBT operations, the drink driving related accidents and arrest patterns for the strategic planning of operations; and</p> <p>(b) conduct an overall review of RBT operations taking into account the observations made in this Audit Report.</p>	<p>Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) will enhance its existing computing system by including additional data fields for data analysis. It is anticipated that the enhanced information system could be put into operation in the 4th quarter of 2013.</p> <p>HKPF has completed the review and already formulated a set of guiding principles for incorporating into the Police Traffic Procedures Manual to facilitate the planning of RBT operations. This set of guiding principles has been disseminated to all traffic formations within HKPF in August 2013. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
2.25	<p><i>Enforcement of the three-tier penalty legislation</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should streamline the breath test procedures with a view to improving the effectiveness in enforcing the three-tier penalty legislation. In particular, action should be taken to:</p> <p>(a) complete the current testing of the mobile evidential breath test (EBT) device as soon as possible and make an early decision on the way forward in providing suitable and adequate equipment for implementing drink driving breath tests;</p>	<p>The mobility performance test on the evidential breath analyser is expected to be completed by October 2013.</p> <p>HKPF will modify a police vehicle as a Mobile Breath Test Centre, which is expected to be used for trial in December 2013.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>(b) closely monitor the maintenance programme to ensure that all EBT devices are properly kept in a workable condition;</p> <p>(c) study the feasibility of modifying the Police General Order requirement to streamline the arrest procedures of drink driving suspects for conducting EBTs; and</p> <p>(d) review and revise the target for monitoring the timeliness of EBTs.</p>	<p>The new EBT device “Drager Alcotest 9510” was gazetted for use on 19 July 2013 by the Police. The new device will be provided to all land region police stations which presently do not have an EBT device by the end of 2013.</p> <p>The study is in progress.</p> <p>After review, HKPF has reduced the time interval target between taking screening breath test and EBT from 90 minutes to 75 minutes with effect from 1 August 2013.</p> <p>A further review will be conducted after all land region police stations have been equipped with EBTs.</p>
Part 3: Measures to tackle speeding and red light jumping		
3.18	<p><i>Operation of enforcement camera systems</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport, in conjunction with the Commissioner of Police, should:</p> <p>(a) expedite action on the trial scheme of the average speed camera system;</p> <p>(b) explore measures to improve the effectiveness of the present enforcement camera systems,</p>	<p>The LegCo Panel on Transport, at its meeting on 24 May 2013, did not support the Government’s proposal to conduct a trial scheme to test out the average speed camera system. The Government is considering whether and when to present the proposal to the LegCo Panel on Transport for consideration again.</p> <p>Transport Department (TD) will continue to explore new technology and cost-effective methods to further</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>drawing on overseas experience where appropriate; and</p> <p>(c) take into account the latest technology development in future expansion/replacement projects of the speed enforcement camera system and the red light camera system.</p>	<p>enhance the performance of the present enforcement camera systems and minimise the limitations in taking images of the offending vehicles under some circumstances, such as being blocked by other vehicles.</p> <p>TD will take into account the latest technology development in future expansion/replacement projects of the enforcement camera systems.</p>
<p>3.23</p>	<p><i>Monitoring of speeding enforcement operations</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should require all Regional Traffic Formations to:</p> <p>(a) compile sufficient management information regularly to monitor the prevailing speeding situation; and</p> <p>(b) make good use of such information for the effective deployment of their enforcement resources in tackling speeding offences.</p>	<p>HKPF promulgated the guiding principles relating to deployment of resources in tackling speeding activities on 18 March 2013 and has incorporated them into the Police Traffic Procedures Manual for compliance by all Traffic Formations within HKPF. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>Part 4: Measures to promote safer vehicle operation</p>		
<p>4.31</p>	<p><i>Safety seat belt</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should:</p> <p>(a) in conjunction with the Director of Environmental Protection, make greater efforts to encourage owners of diesel Public light buses (PLBs) to participate in the upcoming incentive scheme for the early replacement of their vehicles with cleaner models</p>	<p>\$10 billion has been set aside for a proposed ex-gratia payment scheme to provide incentive to vehicle owners to comply with the mandatory phasing out of their pre-Euro IV diesel commercial vehicles (DCVs). Environmental Protection Department has consulted the relevant trades and the LegCo Panel</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>fitted with passenger seat belts for protecting both the environment and passenger safety; and</p> <p>(b) explore other measures to encourage owners of the Liquefied Petroleum Gas (LPG) fuelled PLBs without passenger seat belts to retrofit their vehicles with seat belts.</p>	<p>on Environmental Affairs (the Panel) and came up with a revised proposal which received the support of the Panel on 2 October 2013. The Government will introduce the necessary legislative proposals into LegCo for approval for early implementation of the new initiative. As PLBs registered on or after 1 August 2004 are required by law to be equipped with seat belts in passenger seats, the implementation of the new initiative will lead to an increase in the number of PLBs with passenger seat belts. Under the proposed scheme, scrapping of the old DCVs is mandatory by a date to be stated in the legislation. This means that from the stipulated date, there will be no more diesel PLBs without seat belts. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>TD continues to engage the PLB trade to review and examine the feasibility and viability of retrofitting seat belts on LPG fuelled PLBs having regard to their objection and concerns.</p>
4.32	<p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should, in conjunction with the Road Safety Council, step up the enforcement and publicity efforts on promoting the wearing of passenger seat belts on PLBs.</p>	<p>The Road Safety Council agreed to enhance publicity for promoting the wearing of seat belts by PLB passengers at its meeting held in May 2013.</p> <p>Enforcement operations by HKPF have been increased from a quarterly basis to a bi-monthly basis since May 2012. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.33	<p><i>Other measures to enhance safety of PLB operation</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should:</p> <p>(a) review the PLB speeding cases</p>	<p>HKPF has completed the review on the</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>from April to October 2012 to see if there is any suspected speed limiter offence and take necessary follow-up action accordingly; and</p> <p>(b) enhance the analysis of PLB speeding cases to highlight those exceeding the 80 km/hr limit for monitoring enforcement action against suspected speed limiter offence cases.</p>	<p>PLB speeding cases between April to October 2012. As there is a 6-month prosecution time bar, no further action can be taken by HKPF after the review. Since January 2013, HKPF has been submitting Defective Vehicle Reports to TD for arranging vehicle examination for those PLBs found speeding in excess of the speed limit set by the speed limiter. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>A new monthly report format has been used by HKPF since March 2013 with the inclusion of an additional column for reporting PLB speeding cases over 80km/hr and the required follow-up actions. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.34	<p>Audit has also recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should:</p> <p>(a) seek the Police's assistance to ensure that PLBs involved in suspected offences of speed limiter and speed display device are examined in a timely manner;</p> <p>(b) promptly refer suspected speeding related offence cases to the Police for necessary follow-up action; and</p> <p>(c) expedite action on the implementation of the pre-service training course for PLB driving licence applicants.</p>	<p>The Government is exploring the possibility of detaining a PLB when tampering with the speed limiter and/or speed display device of that vehicle is suspected so as to inspect the devices in a timely manner.</p> <p>TD has taken the advice and has referred promptly suspected speeding related offence cases to HKPF for follow-up action. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>The Government will submit the relevant commencement notice to LegCo within 2013.</p>
4.42	<p><i>Measures for taxis</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should:</p>	

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>(a) consider the need for introducing additional measures to enhance the safe operation of taxis; and</p> <p>(b) keep the Panel on Transport apprised of any subsequent change in the implementation of a planned road safety measure.</p>	<p>TD will implement practicable measures to enhance the safe operation of taxis, including through educational means and publicity efforts.</p> <p>TD will continue to keep LegCo Panel on Transport apprised of any subsequent change in the implementation of a planned road safety measure. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.52	<p><i>Measures for franchised buses</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should:</p> <p>(a) take into account the health check requirements on taxi and bus drivers adopted by the Mainland and other countries in the ongoing review of measures to ensure the road safety of franchised buses and other major road-based public transport modes; and</p> <p>(b) explore measures to address the problem of obtaining drivers' consent to access their medical records in case they are suspected to be suffering from impaired health.</p>	<p>TD, taking into account the health check requirements for bus drivers in the Mainland and other countries, has completed a review of the health check arrangements of franchised bus captains. All bus companies have implemented additional measures to further improve the health check arrangements since August 2013.</p> <p>Separately, the Government is also reviewing the age requirement for applicants to produce a medical examination certificate issued by a registered medical practitioner when applying for first issue or renewal of driving licence.</p> <p>TD is exploring, in consultation with the Department of Justice, the feasibility and legality of seeking exemptions under the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Cap. 486) to obtain medical records of the suspected health-impaired drivers without their written consent.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 5: Accuracy of traffic accident data		
5.14	<p><i>Inaccurate grid references</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) tighten up procedures and supervisory control to ensure the correct input of grid references for traffic accident locations; and (b) in conjunction with the Commissioner for Transport: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) take measures to address any difficulties encountered by police investigation officers in inputting grid references; and (ii) consider enhancing the Traffic Operations and Management System (TOMS)/ Transport Information System (TIS) by incorporating a validation check control in the TOMS/TIS, so that police investigation officers would be alerted to any out of the range error at the time of data input. 	<p>To improve the accuracy of traffic accident data, the Government will find ways to improve the procedures for data input and implement system enhancement as appropriate.</p>
5.22	<p><i>Traffic accident contributory factors</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should tighten the Police's management control to improve the accuracy of accident contributory factors input to the TOMS by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) reminding supervisory staff to critically check the accuracy of data input to the TOMS against the records kept in the case files; 	<p>After review, HKPF has recommended to expand the contributory factors list in the TOMS.</p> <p>In the long run, HKPF is considering to</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date						
	<p>(b) extending the TOMS supervisory checking functions to cover data for transfer to TIS;</p> <p>(c) specifying the required percentage of supervisory checks and regularly monitoring its compliance; and</p> <p>(d) requiring supervisory staff to maintain record of their supervisory checks (such as keeping printouts of TOMS/TIS data checked) in relevant case files for management review.</p>	<p>re-design TOMS to enable a comprehensive automated transfer of data from TOMS to TIS so as to further reduce data input errors.</p> <p>HKPF has introduced internal guidelines in August 2013 which require all data input into TOMS and TIS to be checked at Police Sergeant (SGT), Senior Inspector of Police/Inspector of Police (SIP/IP) and Chief Inspector of Police (CIP) levels in the following ratio:</p> <table data-bbox="995 770 1286 904"> <tr> <td>SGT</td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>IP/SIP</td> <td>50%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>CIP</td> <td>10%</td> </tr> </table>	SGT	100%	IP/SIP	50%	CIP	10%
SGT	100%							
IP/SIP	50%							
CIP	10%							
Part 6: Publicity and education programmes								
<p>6.7</p>	<p><i>Production of Announcements in the Public Interest (API)</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Information Services should:</p> <p>(a) step up the review of API and other materials to be produced by contractors to identify early any possible copyright infringement issues; and</p>	<p>Information Services Department (ISD) has implemented the following measures :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● added a Production Checklist to each API file to ensure that all procedures are completed and documented during the production process; ● specifically asked contractors to confirm the originality of their creative concept during the presentation stage of their creative ideas; and ● carried out Internet-based searches on successful creative concepts to identify ideas, executions, storylines, etc. in Hong Kong or overseas that may give rise to copyright concern. This step has 						

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(b) explore the feasibility of introducing performance-based contract payment to encourage compliance with the copyright requirement in API production.	<p>also been added to the Production Checklist.</p> <p>We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>ISD is exploring whether performance-based contracts are feasible and practical for API productions.</p>
6.8	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police should, in conjunction with the Road Safety Council, tighten controls to ensure that road safety API contents are critically checked.	HKPF accepts the recommendations made by Audit and has already played a greater role in the supervision of the TV API produced in 2013. For the recent TV API for 'Cycling Safety', HKPF took the lead to clear the API storyboard, script and attended the shooting sessions of the TV API. As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
6.17	<p><i>Publicity on bicycle safety fittings</i></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner of Police and the Commissioner for Transport should, in conjunction with the Road Safety Council, step up publicity to promote the public awareness of the statutory requirements for bicycle safety fittings, paying particular attention to shops from which the general public buy/rent their bicycles.</p>	HKPF and TD have increased publicity through distribution of publicity materials on statutory bicycle fittings to the public and the bicycle shop owners to raise their awareness of the statutory requirements for bicycle safety fittings. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

**Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme
Progress in Implementing Audit's Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: Overview of the Voucher Scheme and its financial features		
2.17 to 2.20	The Secretary for Education (SED) should conduct a review of the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme (PEVS) with a view to enhancing the PEVS, so that it will continue to be effective in meeting the expectations of the stakeholders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee on Free KG Education (the Committee) is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG (kindergarten) education, including the PEVS. - Since the Education Bureau (EDB) will report the work progress of the Committee to the Panel on Education of the Legislative Council (LegCo Panel on Education) from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 3: Professional development of KG principals and teachers		
3.13	SED should explore how assistance and support, outside the PEVS, can further be provided to KG principals and teachers who have yet to complete their professional upgrading.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To provide further support for the professional upgrading of kindergarten principals and teachers, the Government will offer course fee reimbursement to principals and teachers who are serving in PEVS KGs and pursuing the relevant approved courses in the 2012/13 and 2013/14 school years. A circular memorandum on the details was issued on 16 August 2013. - In view of the follow-up action taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.15	SED should continue to monitor the wastage rate of KG teachers to ensure that the supply of KG teachers is not affected by a high wastage rate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The EDB will continue to monitor the demand and supply of KG teachers at the territory level to ensure adequate supply of qualified KG teachers and overall stability in the sector. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
3.21	<p>SED should keep in view the turnover rate of KG teachers, ascertain if the high turnover in 2010/11 was due to any systemic issues, and provide advice to PEVS KGs with a high turnover rate to ensure that the turnover has not adversely affected the quality of their education service.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Staff management is an aspect that the EDB looks into when conducting Quality Review (QR) of PEVS KGs. As a regular practice, the EDB reviews information related to turnover of teachers submitted by PEVS KGs. Should the outflow of regular teachers in individual KGs warrant attention, the team will provide recommendations on team building, leadership, work climate and/or provision of staff support and training, etc. to ensure the delivery of quality education. It should be noted that staff turnover is a result of a host of various factors related to the personal decision of the teachers as well as human resources management of the KG. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.22	<p>SED should follow up on the Education Commission's recommendation made in its 2010 review that an advisory body should be set up to take a professional view on various issues relating to the long-term development and quality of KG education, such as a reference salary scale for teachers and principals and their continuous professional development.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG education, including those relating to the long-term development and quality of KG education. - The sub-committees formed under the Committee will study a wide range of related issues, such as the objectives of KG education, funding modes, the different needs of whole-day and half-day KGs, teacher qualification and salary framework, teacher-to-student ratio, monitoring and governance framework, catering for student diversity, home-school cooperation, etc. - Since the EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 4: Quality assurance mechanism		
4.12	SED should provide appropriate training and support to help PEVS KGs conduct self-evaluations and disseminate the self-evaluation results to parents.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The EDB has been conducting training workshops and sharing sessions for PEVS KGs to facilitate their conduct of self-evaluation and will continue to do so. - Between the date of release of the Audit report and the end of 2012/13 school year, four seminars/workshops on school self-evaluation have been conducted as scheduled. - The EDB has issued a circular in August 2012, before the start of the second QR cycle in the 2012/13 school year, to encourage KGs, among other things, to disseminate their School Reports/Plans to the stakeholders through various means, including uploading them onto the school websites. Similar message will be relayed to KGs through other suitable avenues such as during QR visits and at annual briefing sessions on QR findings and seminars for sharing effective KG practices. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
4.14	SED should expedite the completion of the consultancy report on the effectiveness of the QR mechanism.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The report of the consultancy study on the effectiveness of the QR mechanism and its impact on pre-primary education has been completed. An executive summary of the report has been uploaded onto the EDB website. - Since follow-up action has completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 5: Regulatory measures		
5.14	SED should, in the forthcoming review of KG education, devise a suitable mechanism, as appropriate, for regular review of the school fee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG education, including the PEVS.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	ceilings to cater for special adjustments required due to changes in circumstances in addition to changes in the CCPI.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Since the EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.22	SED should set out clearer guidelines on the types of trading activities which are subject to the EDB's administrative directives and explore ways to strengthen the controls over trading profits.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - During the course of review of PEVS KGs' 2011/12 audited accounts, the EDB has taken a new step to request PEVS KGs and their auditors to provide explanatory notes and details of their sale of school items and provision of paid services in their audited accounts where necessary. - A new circular was issued in September 2013 to consolidate all prevailing guidelines and reiterate general principles on trading operation in KGs. The circular also provides clearer guidance on trading activities, income from which should be reported as "income from trading activities" in the audited accounts. - In the call circular for KGs' audited accounts for 2012/13 to be issued in November 2013, KGs will be reminded to – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • properly classify their "income from trading activities" and "other operating income" and report them properly in their audited accounts in accordance with EDB's guidelines/directives; and • observe the list of components of school fees as set out in EDB's guidelines/directives and not to charge parents for these items separately. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.22	SED should remind PEVS KGs of the need to comply with the EDB's administrative directives on trading activities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - KGs will be reminded to follow the revised guidelines and general principles on trading operation in the annual circular memorandum on submission of audited

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>accounts, which will be issued in November each year.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Briefing sessions on issues related to financial management will be conducted on a regular basis for KGs. The revised guidelines and general principles on trading operation would be covered in the briefing sessions scheduled for November 2013 and February 2014. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.27	<p>SED should remind PEVS KGs to properly classify their miscellaneous fees in the audited accounts in accordance with the guidelines issued by the EDB, step up the EDB's review of the miscellaneous fees reported in the audited accounts and, where appropriate, require the PEVS KGs to rectify or provide supplementary information.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In addition to the circular issued in September 2013 and reminders through different avenues to schools for compliance with the guidelines and principles pertaining to trading operation in KGs, the EDB will step up scrutiny on the audited accounts of KGs on any miscellaneous income reported in the accounts. Where necessary, the KGs will be required to provide supplementary information and take appropriate remedial action. - Since follow-up action will be taking on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.33	<p>SED should review the EDB's KG rent reimbursement practices in its forthcoming review of KG education, and revise them if necessary.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG education, including the rent reimbursement scheme. - Since the EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.39	<p>SED should remind PEVS KGs to make proper disclosure of related party transactions in both their</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In the annual call circulars for fee revision applications and audited accounts, KGs will be reminded to make disclosure of related

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>applications for school fee revisions and their audited accounts.</p>	<p>party transactions in both the fee revision applications and their audited accounts. Those found not to have done so will be followed up.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
<p>5.43</p>	<p>SED should continue the EDB's efforts in completing the annual review of audited accounts in a timely manner and explore ways to further streamline its review procedures.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The EDB will issue reminder to KGs urging for timely submission of their audited accounts one month before the deadline in February of the year following the relevant school year starting from the submission of 2012/13 audited accounts. - The following measures will be adopted for reviewing KGs' audited accounts for the 2012/13 school year and beyond – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • audited accounts which remain outstanding after the submission deadline will be brought up monthly in order that prompt follow-up action can be taken up with the KGs concerned; • synchronizing the processes involved in the examination of PEVS KGs' fee revision applications (which is more time-critical as it directly affects the operation of KGs and has to be completed by August) and the review of their annual audited accounts to expedite the completion of the annual review of audited accounts; and • endeavoring to complete the review of KG's audited accounts in November, i.e. within three months after completing the review of fee revision applications. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 6: Disclosure and transparency		
6.8	SED should enhance the transparency and disclosure of the operation of PEVS KGs by requiring them to publish additional items of miscellaneous fees in the KG Profile.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As suggested by the Audit, PEVS KGs have been required to publish additional items of miscellaneous fees in the KG Profile starting from the 2013 KG Profile. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
6.11	SED should encourage PEVS KGs to upload their School Reports and/or School Plans onto their school websites, and provide them with additional support and necessary assistance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The EDB has encouraged KGs, via a standing circular issued in August 2012, before the start of the second QR cycle in 2012/13, to disseminate their School Reports/Plans to the stakeholders through various means, including uploading them onto the school websites. Such message is also reiterated during QR visits and annual events such as briefing sessions on QR findings and seminars for sharing effective KG practices. - For those KGs which have yet to set up their own website, the EDB has encouraged them to make use of the additional one-off school development grant for PEVS KGs (up to \$250,000 per school) disbursed in the 2013/14 school year to develop a school website so that school information can be made available for public access. - Since follow-up action will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 7: Way forward		
7.10	SED should keep in view the changes in the participation rates of KGs and KG students in the PEVS and ascertain the reasons for the declining participation, and explore ways to address the challenges faced by PEVS KGs and the parents of KG students in the forthcoming review of KG education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG education, including ways to address the challenges faced by PEVS KGs and affordability of parents of KG students. - The Committee will maintain communication with the KG sector and

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>gauge their views and will explore short- and medium-term measures to help the KG sector meet their existing challenges. The Administration will actively consider providing support in this regard.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Since the EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
7.11	SED should draw experience from the implementation of the PEVS and suitably enhance it at an opportune time, taking into account the audit findings and the Audit's recommendations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- The Committee is examining various issues with a view to making recommendations on the practicable implementation of free KG education, taking into account experience from the implementation of the PEVS as well as the Audit's findings and recommendations.- Since the EDB will report the work progress of the Committee to the LegCo Panel on Education from time to time, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

**Progress in Implementing the Recommendations Made in the
Audit Report on Development and Management of Parks and Gardens**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
PART 2 : PLANNING AND PROVISION OF PARK AND GARDEN FACILITIES		
2.14	Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Planning should expedite the updating of information on the provision of open space (LCSD and non-LCSD venues), both at the district level and at the territory-wide level.	The updating of information on the provision of open space in both LCSD and non-LCSD venues at the district and territory-wide level by PlanD is at the final stage and will be completed in the fourth quarter of 2013.
2.15	Audit has also <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Planning and the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should consider establishing a mechanism under which the PlanD and the LCSD liaise with each other on a periodic basis so as to update relevant information on the provision of open space in both LCSD and non-LCSD venues.	<p>PlanD had agreed with LCSD to set up a working team with representatives from both departments to oversee the updating of the information on the provision of open space in both LCSD and non-LCSD venues. The working team met in July 2013 and agreed to undertake an overall update of the open space information at a five-year interval in order to tie in with the revised population data from Population Census/By-Census. In between the five-year interval, an interim review would be conducted at a two-and-a-half-year interval with update on the open space information.</p> <p>As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
2.25	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>2.25(a) ascertain the underlying reasons for cases with long lead time in commissioning parks and gardens, and take effective measures to expedite, as far as practicable, project implementation in future; and</p> <p>2.25(b) consider, in consultation with the Architectural Services Department</p>	<p>The underlying reasons for the longer lead time for commissioning of parks and gardens include inclement weather and unsatisfactory performance of contractors that have led to delay in works completion, as well as the need to carry out improvement works before commissioning to ensure public safety. LCSD will, in conjunction with</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(ArchSD), enhancing liaison between the LCSD and the ArchSD (e.g. holding Projects Review Meetings on a more timely basis) to help monitor and resolve works issues arising from the implementation of park and garden projects.	<p>ArchSD, take necessary measures to shorten the lead time in commissioning new park and garden projects where practicable.</p> <p>LCSD and ArchSD have set up a mechanism for monitoring work progress and resolving pre-handover issues as early as practicable.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>2.34</p> <p>2.34(a)</p> <p>2.34(b)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>taking account of district needs, devise an action plan for the future development of the Kwai Chung Park site, with a view to putting it into gainful use as soon as practicable; and</p> <p>explore alternative sources of funding for the future development of the Kwai Chung Park site.</p>	<p>LCSD consulted the District Facilities Management Committee (DFMC) of the Kwai Tsing District Council (KwTDC) on the future development of the Kwai Chung Park on 26 February and 18 June 2013 respectively. Taking into account members' views and the environmental constraints of the landfill site, LCSD is drawing up the proposed project scope and will consult the DFMC again in late 2013.</p> <p>When LCSD consulted DFMC of KwTDC on the future development of the site on 26 February 2013, DC members had no objection to implement the project under the Public Works Programme (PWP).</p>
<p>2.40</p> <p>2.40 (a)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>for ex-HAD facilities without unresolved issue, expedite their designation as public pleasure grounds under the Public Health and Municipal</p>	<p>As at July 2013, 114 ex-HAD facilities have been gazetted as public pleasure grounds while another seven, for which land allocation has been completed,</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
2.40(b)	<p>Services Ordinance; and</p> <p>for those with unresolved issues, take necessary steps to sort out the issues in collaboration with the relevant departments (e.g. LandsD for cases involving unauthorised construction) with a view to designating the facilities as public pleasure grounds.</p>	<p>would be gazetted soon.</p> <p>LCSD will continue to solicit the assistance of the relevant departments with a view to resolving the outstanding issues regarding land allocation for some 30 venues. However, the remaining 14 ex-HAD facilities are confirmed to be non-starter cases and will not be gazetted as public pleasure grounds as the sites have either been turned into other uses, put under the Lands Sales Programme, or have no amenity values for turning into a proper open space.</p>
2.48 2.48 (a) 2.48 (b)	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>finalise as soon as possible the design parameters for park furniture and signage developed from the pilot implementation of Park Déco, with a view to facilitating the upgrading of park and garden design; and</p> <p>consider adopting the good practice used by design collaborators in the pilot implementation of Park Déco, i.e. actively engaging the public during different stages of park and garden projects, so as to better meet public expectations.</p>	<p>The design parameters for park furniture and signage developed under the Park Déco pilot scheme have been finalised and will be provided to ArchSD for reference when developing new parks and renovating existing parks. LCSD will also make reference to the good practices for public engagement adopted in the Park Déco project.</p>
2.53	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should expedite the follow-up actions on improvement areas in the booking and allocation of sports facilities (including those located in parks and gardens).</p>	<p>LCSD had already formulated the implementation plan and reported the proposed arrangement to the Community Sports Committee on 1 March 2013.</p> <p>As at July 2013, LCSD has implemented 11 of the 22 recommendations made by The Ombudsman and will implement another seven recommendations before the first quarter of 2014. LCSD will</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		review the remaining four recommendations and conduct feasibility studies and assessment of their cost-effectiveness in 2014-15.
PART 3 : INSPECTION AND MONITORING OF PARKS AND GARDENS		
3.8	Audit has recommended that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should take measures to improve the effectiveness of District Office inspections of parks and gardens, with a view to ensuring that park and garden facilities are always safe, clean and serviceable for use by the public.	To improve the effectiveness of inspections conducted by its District Leisure Services Offices, LCSD has reminded the staff concerned to follow the prevailing guidelines on the inspection of land-based leisure venues. As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.16 3.16(a) 3.16(b)	Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should: review the practices of the 18 District Offices in the management and conduct of routine inspections, paying particular attention to the need for: (i) a minimum inspection frequency; (ii) systematic planning of inspections taking account of relevant risk factors (e.g. complaints and problem areas previously identified); (iii) adopting a suitable inspection checklist for conducting and documenting inspection work; and (iv) properly recording all the inspections conducted; and consider using information technology to help LCSD staff manage and conduct routine inspections, for example: (i) computerising inspection records	The Department has reviewed the existing guidelines taking into account the Audit's recommendations and relevant factors. The revised guidelines will be promulgated to staff by October 2013. As follow-up action has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report. LCSD will explore the feasibility of the recommendations having regard to departmental priorities in the deployment of resources. LCSD will also examine the feasibility of

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>and related information; and</p> <p>(ii) using mobile/handheld devices to help inspection officers make reference to the inspection checklist and record their inspection results.</p>	<p>computerising inspection records and related information.</p>
<p>3.21</p> <p>3.21 (a)</p> <p>3.21(b)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>ascertain the extent of LCSD playground equipment not being checked annually for structural soundness, with a view to drawing up a priority list of high-risk equipment taking into account such risk factors as :</p> <p>(i) results of routine inspections conducted by District Offices;</p> <p>(ii) the time elapsed since the equipment being last inspected; and</p> <p>(iii) any relevant public complaints;</p> <p>in planning the Technical Unit's (TU's) structural inspections, give priority to inspecting high-risk equipment on the priority list;</p>	<p>Having examined the risk levels, public concerns and the number of complaints received, LCSD had prioritised the playground equipment into three risk categories i.e. high risk, medium risk and low risk as illustrated below:</p> <p>(a) High risk equipment: Basketball Stands</p> <p>(b) Medium risk equipment: Elderly Fitness Equipment, Children Playground Equipment</p> <p>(c) Low risk equipment: Other type of fitness/play equipment, i.e. Adult Fitness Equipment</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>Inspection frequency has been set according to the risk levels of the playground equipment as follows:</p> <p>High risk equipment : Once a year</p> <p>Medium risk equipment : At least one inspection every two years</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
3.21(c)	review the adequacy of the manpower of the TU for conducting structural inspections; and	<p>Low risk : Upon request from equipment district offices, upon receipt of complaints or when situation warrants</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>In view of the large number of LCSD venues and the increasing workload arising from new projects, including PWP and District Minor Works (DMW) projects, LCSD had reviewed the manpower structure of the TU with a view to strengthening the clerical and administrative support for the TU. As the follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
3.21(d)	ensure that adequate structural inspections are conducted for playground equipment in future.	<p>The following measures had been implemented:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) prioritising the annual structural inspections according to the risk levels of the play equipment as mentioned in 3.21 (a) above; (b) carrying out annual structural inspections by technical staff during site visit at venues; and (c) planning to out-source part of the annual inspection work to engineering firms through service contracts. <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
PART 4 : REPAIR AND MAINTENANCE OF FACILITIES		
<p>4.10</p> <p>4.10(a)</p> <p>4.10 (b)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>in consultation with the ArchSD and the EMSD :</p> <p>(i) ascertain the reasons for the significant proportion of cases which were not completed within the target time frames for repair and maintenance works of playground equipment ; and</p> <p>(ii) review the appropriateness of the target time frames for different types of repair and maintenance works of park and garden facilities, taking account of the reasons for delays identified in (i) above and the public expectation for prompt repair works; and</p> <p>take measures to ensure that repair and maintenance works of park and garden facilities are completed promptly, including regularly reviewing the level of the contingency stock of commonly-used spare parts kept by the TU, in order to ensure that adequate spare parts are always available for conducting repair and maintenance works.</p>	<p>Taking into account the main reasons for delay, LCSD has discussed with ArchSD and EMSD in September 2013 on measures that can be taken to shorten the time required for repairing outstanding items as well as the timeframes for different types of repair and maintenance works of park and garden facilities.</p> <p>LCSD has implemented the following measures to speed up the repair works:</p> <p>(a) stocked up more items of spare parts and increased the quantity of each item. The TU will review the items and quantity of spare parts being kept from time to time;</p> <p>(b) built in sanction clause and set clear timeframe for effecting repairs in the newly effected Term Contract for maintenance of play equipment;</p> <p>(c) taken the past performance of the contractors into account while arranging procurement/tender exercise for the repair of play equipment; and</p> <p>(d) set the order of priority of DMW projects initiated by 18 districts so as to devote more resources to the repair/maintenance/annual structural inspections.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
<p>4.18</p> <p>4.18 (a)</p> <p>4.18(b)</p> <p>4.18(c)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>in consultation with the ArchSD and the EMSD, review the adequacy of the mechanism for the follow-up of overdue repair and maintenance works for parks and gardens;</p> <p>lay down a clear definition of long overdue cases which require the follow-up actions of the LCSD headquarters management; and</p> <p>ensure that District Offices keep adequate records (including target completion date and actual completion date) of their repair and maintenance works.</p>	<p>LCSD has reviewed the existing “Guidelines on Repair and Maintenance of Leisure Facilities by Works Departments”. Standard forms are included in the guidelines for reporting of outstanding cases of over one month for follow-up action with the works departments.</p> <p>LCSD has reminded its staff to enhance the monitoring of repair and maintenance works and reiterated the importance of keeping proper records of works orders. It also reminded staff to adhere to the relevant guidelines, including the target time frames for completing works. Outstanding cases should be reported to senior levels in headquarters for follow-up actions with ArchSD and EMSD as necessary.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
PART 5 :PERFORMING MEASUREMENT AND REPORTING		
<p>5.6</p> <p>5.6(a)</p>	<p>Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should:</p> <p>conducting periodic surveys to gauge the level of:</p> <p>(i) the public’s utilisation of park and garden facilities; and</p> <p>(ii) user satisfaction on the parks and gardens managed by the LCSD; and</p>	<p>LCSD will conduct a survey in the fourth quarter of 2013 to gauge the utilisation and user satisfaction in respect of parks and garden facilities.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
5.6(b)	developing and publishing relevant outcome indicators and utilisation information (e.g. results of the surveys in (a) above) on the LCSD website for enhancing transparency and accountability in the management of parks and gardens.	LCSD will upload a summary of the relevant survey findings on its website to enhance transparency and accountability in the management of parks and gardens.
PART 6 : WAY FORWARD		
6.18	Audit has <i>recommended</i> that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services should review the adequacy of the LCSD's information management practices, with a view to ensuring that adequate management information is collected from various stakeholders (including other providers of open space and users of parks and gardens) for planning the future development of parks and gardens.	LCSD will make reference to the updated open space data in planning the future development of parks and gardens. LCSD will also make reference to the findings of the opinion surveys as well as the views obtained from stakeholder engagement in planning future parks and garden facilities.
6.19	Audit has also <i>recommended</i> that, in conducting the review on sites reserved for open space development, the Director of Planning should, in collaboration with the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services, critically assess the future effective use of lands reserved for open space development, taking into account relevant factors.	<p>PlanD has been reviewing the sites zoned for open space development in consultation with LCSD when opportunity arises and would propose amendments to the Outline Zoning Plan to meet the changing needs of the community, with a view to having a more effective use of land resources.</p> <p>LCSD will continue to give its views to PlanD on the effective use of lands reserved for open space development having regard to the relevant factors.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

**Latest progress of Implementing Audit's Recommendations in
Tung Chung Road (TCR) Improvement Project**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: Project Planning and Environmental Impact Assessment		
2.29	<p>Audit has recommended that, in planning a road project in future, the Director of Highways (D of Hy) should:</p> <p>(a) conduct thorough examination with a view to identifying all feasible options for comparison and choosing the most practicable and cost-effective one for implementation;</p> <p>(b) heighten vigilance in planning works that will affect areas of ecological significance; and</p> <p>(c) re-examine the viability of a chosen project option when there are significant changes in circumstances.</p>	<p>It has been a standing practice for Highways Department (HyD) to comply with the requirements of the Project Administration Handbook, which includes thorough examination to identify various feasible options for consideration before recommending the final option. As part of this process, Project Steering/Working Groups with members from various Bureaux and Departments are formed to deliberate and give steer on various planning and engineering matters.</p> <p>D of Hy issued an internal memorandum in May 2013 to remind all staff of the Audit's recommendations in these aspects.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for this item have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Part 3: Project Implementation		
3.29	<p>Audit has recommended that the D of Hy should, in implementing a road project in future where project delays will lead to significant adverse impacts:</p> <p>(a) strengthen the monitoring of the contractor's performance and explore measures to minimise any contract delays caused by the contractor's slow progress in carrying out works;</p> <p>(b) in consultation with the Commissioner for Transport, take measures to ensure that sufficient</p>	<p>It has been a standing practice for HyD to comply with the requirements of the Project Administration Handbook and Contractor Management Handbook, which include guidelines on the monitoring of contractor's performance and progress of works, as well as the relevant Technical Circulars on carrying out additional pre-contract site investigation as far as practicable.</p> <p>D of Hy issued an internal memorandum in May 2013 to remind all staff of the Audit's recommendations in these aspects.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>number of road permits are specified in the works contract and issued to the contractor, where applicable;</p> <p>(c) if works are to be carried out within country-park areas, closely liaise with the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation with a view to exploring arrangements for acquiring more thorough site information before contract award; and</p> <p>(d) if a works site is not available for conducting adequate site investigation during the design stage, conduct additional site investigation before contract award as far as practicable.</p>	<p>HyD, in collaboration with TD, completed a post-completion review of the TCR Improvement Project in May 2013, taking into account the observations in the Audit Report. For similar contracts in future that require road permits, HyD will consult TD on the maximum number of permits during the design stage, with reference to the traffic conditions, road capacity, road safety considerations, nuisance caused to the public, proposed construction details etc., and will assess its impact on the programme of works before adopting the requirement in the contract documents. Specifying an exact number of road permits in the contract should be avoided as far as possible. During construction, the Contractor/Engineer should maintain close liaison with TD on the application of the road permits to ensure that it could comply with the contract requirement.</p> <p>The report was promulgated for internal reference in July 2013.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for this item have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Part 4: Adoption of alternative design		
4.18	<p>Audit has recommended that the D of Hy should, in administering a works contract in future:</p> <p>(a) comply with the requirements stipulated in 2004 Technical Circular to:</p> <p>(i) critically consider inviting tenderers to submit alternative designs at the</p>	<p>It has been a standing practice for HyD to comply with the requirements of the 2004 Technical Circular (TC) and the 2009 Development Bureau Circular Memorandum (CM) on administering contractor's alternative designs. As stipulated in the TC and CM, relevant Special Conditions of Contract have been included in the contract documents, and the condition that the contractor would provide a guaranteed</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	<p>tender stage where there is a potential for better value for money; and</p> <p>(ii) in accepting alternative designs after contract award, agree with the contractor over the terms of implementing the alternative-design works before the works commence;</p> <p>(b) in granting approvals to the contractor for carrying out works, avoid imposing a condition that the contractor would provide a guaranteed minimum cost saving to the Government without specifying the amount; and</p> <p>(c) comply with the requirement stipulated in the 2009 Development Bureau Circular Memorandum to document the justifications if tenderers are not invited to submit alternative designs at the tender stage.</p>	<p>minimum cost saving will be avoided.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for this item have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Part 5: Utilisation of Tung Chung Road		
5.10	<p>Audit has recommended that, in implementing a road project in future, the D of Hy should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, enhance vigilance in conducting and presenting traffic forecasts with a view to making traffic-flow estimations as accurately as possible.</p>	<p>HyD, in collaboration with TD, has completed a post-completion review of the TCR Improvement Project in May 2013, taking into account the observations in the Audit Report. In the design of future road projects, the forecasting methods adopted in Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) would be carefully reviewed from various aspects to better address possible variations in parameters affecting traffic flow predictions, e.g. formulation of different scenarios, conducting sensitivity tests and comparing various data sources, etc.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		<p>The review results and assumptions taken in evaluation and forecasting volume-to-capacity ratios should be appropriately and concisely presented in the TIA report with a view to making traffic-flow estimation as accurate as possible.</p> <p>The report was promulgated for internal reference in July 2013.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for this item have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Part 6: Way forward		
6.6	Audit has recommended that the D of Hy should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, conduct a post-completion review of the TCR Improvement Project, taking into account the audit observations in this Audit Report.	<p>HyD, in collaboration with TD, completed the post-completion review of the TCR Improvement Project in May 2013, taking into account the audit observations in the Audit Report. The report was promulgated for internal reference in July 2013.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for this item have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
