

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)832/12-13
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/12

Panel on Education

Subcommittee on Integrated Education

Minutes of the third meeting
held on Tuesday, 30 April 2013, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Claudia MO
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Member attending : Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Members absent : Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Public Officers attending : Item III

Education Bureau

Mr Kevin YEUNG
Under Secretary for Education

Mrs Betty IP, JP
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Ms Sophia WONG
Principal Education Officer (Special Education &
Kindergarten Education)

Ms Doris LEE
Senior Specialist (Educational Psychology Service /
New Territories)

Food and Health Bureau

Ms Eureka CHEUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health
(Health)3

Department of Health

Dr Catherine LAM Chi-chin, JP
Consultant Paediatrician (Child Assessment Service)

Hospital Authority

Dr K L CHUNG
Chief Manager, Integrated Care Programs

Social Welfare Department

Ms CHAN Lai-chu
Acting Chief Social Work Officer
(Rehabilitation and Medical Social Services)1

Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority

Mrs Christina LEE
Acting Director – Public Examinations

Ms Margaret HUI
General Manager – School Examinations and
Assessment

Attendance by Invitation : Hong Kong Association of Squint and Double Vision Sufferers

Ms CHU Yim-chun
Chairperson

Special Educational Needs & Parents Association Limited

Ms TAI Ngan-yung
Chairman

Dr Tony LAI Tai-sum

Hong Kong Association for AD/HD

Ms Marcia NG
Chairperson

Labour Party

Mr Michael CHENG
Executive Member

Civic Party

Mr Joshua LI
District Developer, Kowloon West Branch

Miss CHEUNG Pui-pui

香港特殊學習障礙協會(小學關注組)

Ms MOK Wai-har
Representative

香港特殊學習障礙協會(小學家長代表)

Mr TANG Chi-kwong

香港特殊學習障礙協會(中學關注組)

Ms SUNG Yuet-ling
Representative

香港特殊學習障礙協會(大專關注組)

Ms YIP Leung-ching
Representative

香港特殊學習障礙協會(大學關注組)

Ms LI Man-ying
Representative

HK Association for Specific Learning Disabilities

Ms KEUNG Wai-lin
Chairperson

Ms Ice CHAN Suet-lai

Ms Bernice LEUNG

Mr Joseph LAU

Mr LO Tak-keung

Ms Shirley HUI

Ms Winnie CHAN

Education Employees General Union

Ms WONG Heung-lin
Committee Member

Ms NG Lai-ho

Young DAB

Miss Iris WONG Ping-fan
Member

Ms Maggie MAN Suet-yung

Ms HO Shuk-yi

Ms LEE Kit-yi

Mr CHOI Yip-piu

Ms CHOI Shuet-chun

Mr WO Wei-yan

Mr WA Kwai-lun

Ms CHEUNG Man-chu

Ms WONG Ping

Buddhist Tai Kwong Chi Hong College Parent-Teacher
Association

Ms LEE Pui-ying
Chairman

Hong Kong Integrated Education Concern Association

Ms LAM Yuet-lan
Chairperson

Dr Lydia NG Shuk-ying

Mr IP Chi-yung

Ms SO Ting-wai

Ms AU Pik-hau

明愛康復服務家長諮詢聯會融合教育關注小組

Ms KAM Tsui-fun

Ms Angela WONG

Hong Kong Christian Service School Social Work
Service

Miss HON Shun-sum
Supervisor

Mrs LING CHOW Hor-ye

Democratic Party

Mr OR Yiu-lam
Central Committee Member

Hong Kong Occupational Therapy Association

Ms POON Yan-chee

Mr Ronald NG Ho-yin

Clerk in attendance : Miss Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Esther CHEUNG
Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(4)587/12-13 — Minutes of meeting on
19 February 2013)

The minutes of the meeting held on 19 February 2013 were confirmed.

II. Applications for late membership

(LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(01) — Letter dated 16 April 2013
from Hon TAM Yiu-chung)

2. The Subcommittee accepted the application for late membership from Mr TAM Yiu-chung.

III. Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with —

- (a) Specific Learning Difficulties; and**
- (b) Attention Deficit and Hyperactivity Disorders**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(02) — Paper provided by the
Administration)

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(06) — Submission from Mr SHIU
Siu-pui

LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(07) — Submission from Caritas
Youth and Community
Service

LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(08) — Submission from Mr Philip
CHAN

LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(09) — Submission from Ms Krystal
CHEUNG

LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(10) — Submission from Ms LO Sau-
fun

- LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(11) — Submission from Ms Peggy YAU Pik-wan
- LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(08) — Submission from a member of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(09) — Submission from Ms ANNE
- LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(10) — Submission from Ms HUNG Sau-king
- LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(11) — Submission from Ms LAM Ka-man
- LC Paper No. CB(4)610/12-13(04) — Submission from Ms JENNY
- LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(05) — Submission from Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union
- LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(06) — Submission from Mr CHIU Ka-chun)

Meeting with deputations and the Administration

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).
4. The Chairman said that he would extend the meeting for 15 minutes beyond the appointed time. With the agreement of members, the meeting was further extended by 30 minutes to allow more time for discussion.
5. The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the view/concerns raised at the meeting.

Admin

(Post-meeting note: On the subsequent instruction of the Chairman, a "consolidated summary" of the views/concerns raised at this meeting and the meeting held on 27 May 2013 has been prepared and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)824/12-13(01). The Administration has also been requested to provide a written response.)

Admin

6. The Administration was also requested to provide a paper on the issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education ("IE") with respect to students with Autistic Spectrum Disorders; Emotional and Behavioural Difficulties; and Communication Difficulties for the next meeting on 27 May 2013.

7. Dr Helena WONG submitted the wording of a motion which she intended to move at the meeting urging the Education Bureau to set up an inter-departmental working group to review the resources needed for implementing IE by 2013. In this connection, the Chairman advised that in accordance with House Rule 24A(f), no new motion could be proposed during the period of extension of the Subcommittee meeting. The Chairman suggested that Dr WONG might consider proposing the motion at the next meeting.

(Post-meeting note: Dr Helena WONG submitted a letter which contained the wording of a motion. With the concurrence of the Chairman, the letter was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)619/12-13(01) on 3 May 2013 and included on the agenda of the next meeting to be held on 27 May 2013.)

IV. Any other business

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:15 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 July 2013

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Integrated Education
on Tuesday, 30 April 2013, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000144 - 000154	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of meeting of 19 February 2013.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Applications for late membership</i>			
000155 - 000513	Chairman	The Subcommittee's acceptance of the application for late membership from Mr TAM Yiu-chung.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with (a) Specific Learning Difficulties; and (b) Attention Deficit and Hyperactivity Disorders</i>			
000514 - 001007	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001008 - 001343	Administration Chairman	Briefing by the Administration on its information paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(02)].	
001344 - 001618	Hong Kong Association of Squint and Double Vision Sufferers Chairman	Presentation of views	
001619 - 001935	Special Educational Needs & Parents Association Limited Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)624/12-13(01)]	
001936 - 002243	Dr Tony LAI Tai-sum Chairman	Presentation of views	
002244 - 002552	Hong Kong Association for AD/HD Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)610/12-13(01)]	
002553 - 002900	Labour Party Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(01)]	
002901 - 003148	Civic Party Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(07)]	
003149 - 003501	Miss CHEUNG Pui-pui Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in her submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(03)]	
003502 - 003832	香港特殊學習障礙協會 (小學關注組) Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(02)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
003833 - 004116	香港特殊學習障礙協會 (小學家長代表) Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(03)]	
004117 - 004501	香港特殊學習障礙協會 (中學關注組) Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(04)]	
004502 - 004818	香港特殊學習障礙協會 (大專關注組) Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(05)]	
004819 - 005150	香港特殊學習障礙協會 (大學關注組) Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(06)]	
005151 - 005608	Hong Kong Association for Specific Learning Disabilities Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(07)]	
005609 - 010139	Ms Ice CHAN Suet-lai Chairman	Presentation of views	
010140 - 010441	Ms Bernice LEUNG Chairman	Presentation of views	
010442 - 010753	Mr Joseph LAU Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)610/12-13(02)]	
010754 - 011117	Mr LO Tak-keung Chairman	Presentation of views	
011118 - 011451	Ms Shirley HUI Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in her submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(04)(second revised version)]	
011452 - 011807	Ms Winnie CHAN Chairman	Presentation of views	
011808 - 012123	Education Employees General Union Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(02)]	
012124 - 012450	Ms NG Lai-ho Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in her submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)599/12-13(05)]	
012451 - 012919	Young DAB Chairman	Presentation of views	
012920 - 013250	Ms Maggie MAN Suet- yung Chairman	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
013251 - 013616	Ms HO Shuk-yi Chairman	Presentation of views	
013617 - 014020	Ms LEE Kit-yi Chairman	Presentation of views	
014021 - 014400	Mr CHOI Yip-piu Chairman	Presentation of views	
014401 - 015143	Ms CHOI Shuet-chun Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in her submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(03)]	
015144 - 020207	Break		
020208 - 020313	Chairman	Introductory remarks	
020314 - 020708	Mr WO Wei-yan Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)617/12-13(04)]	
020709 - 021240	Mr WA Kwai-lun Chairman	Presentation of views	
021241 - 021638	Ms CHEUNG Man-chu Chairman	Presentation of views	
021639 - 022011	Ms WONG Ping Chairman	Presentation of views	
022012 - 022446	Buddhist Tai Kwong Chi Hong College Parent- Teacher Association Chairman	Presentation of views	
022447 - 022909	Hong Kong Integrated Education Concern Association Chairman	Presentation of views	
022910 - 023243	Dr Lydia NG Shuk-ying Chairman	Presentation of views	
023244 - 023616	Mr IP Chi-yung Chairman	Presentation of views	
023617 - 023821	Ms SO Ting-wai Chairman	Presentation of views	
023822 - 024210	Ms AU Pik-hau Chairman	Presentation of views	
024211 - 024611	明愛康復服務家長諮詢 聯會融合教育關注 小組 Chairman	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
024612 - 024951	Ms Angela WONG Chairman	Presentation of views	
024952 - 025049	Hong Kong Christian Service School Social Work Service Chairman	Presentation of views	
025050 - 025247	Mrs LING CHOW Hor-ye Chairman	Presentation of views	
025248 - 025650	Democratic Party Chairman	Presentation of views	
025651 - 030005	Hong Kong Occupational Therapy Association Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)610/12-13(03)]	
030006 - 030335	Mr Ronald NG Ho-yin	Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)607/12-13(01)]	
030336 - 030615	Chairman	<p>The Chairman's views that —</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) parents of students with special educational needs ("SEN students") had encountered many difficulties when raising their children; and (b) the Education Bureau ("EDB") should collaborate with relevant government departments to ensure the effective and equitable implementation of integrated education ("IE"). <p>Extension of meeting for 15 minutes beyond the appointed ending time.</p>	
030616 - 031422	EDB Chairman	<p>EDB informed the meeting that —</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) implementation of IE provided SEN students with the opportunity to pursue studies in ordinary schools; (b) public sector ordinary schools had been encouraged to adopt a Whole School Approach ("WSA") in implementing IE. As set out in the Operation Guide on the Whole School Approach to Integrated Education, schools were required to establish a regular communication mechanism with parents, and to provide details about their IE policies, support measures and resources allocated for IE in their annual school reports; (c) the progress of teacher training on IE would be kept under review, and the target would be suitably adjusted with a view to further 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>enhancing the professional capacity of teachers in catering for SEN students; and</p> <p>(d) home-school cooperation, public education and cross-sector collaboration were necessary for the successful implementation of IE.</p>	
031423 - 031654	Department of Health ("DH") Chairman	<p>DH's comments that —</p> <p>(a) while the Child Assessment Service ("CAS") of the Department of Health ("DH") had been providing comprehensive multi-disciplinary team assessment for children with SEN under 12 years of age, CAS had to cope with a significant increase of new cases requiring CAS assessment over the past 10 years, from 6 000 to over 9 000 cases a year. Pending the availability of necessary rehabilitation services for referral of diagnosed cases by CAS, interim support service would be provided by CAS for the children and their parents concerned; and</p> <p>(b) as the children in (a) had their assessments done at an early age, CAS assessment reports provided to the responsible agencies some 10 years later when the children had grown up might not be helpful for the purpose of follow-up training and management.</p>	
031654 - 032052	Hospital Authority ("HA") Chairman	<p>HA informed the meeting that —</p> <p>(a) in 2011-2012, the total number of new cases registered at the Child and Adolescent Psychiatry Specialist Outpatient Clinics ("C&A Clinics") of HA was around 9 900, while only around 6 300 new cases could be handled in the same period;</p> <p>(b) the median waiting time for children to receive diagnoses, treatment and training provided by C&A Clinics was around 16 weeks and the 90th percentile waiting time was over 80 weeks;</p> <p>(c) although the number of psychiatrists for HA had been increased from around 270 to 330 in the past five years and an addition of 48 professional staff comprising doctors, nurses, speech therapists, occupational therapists and clinical psychologists had been recruited to provide multi-disciplinary support service for child and adolescent psychiatric patients in 2011-2012, this level of staffing provision could not meet the service demand of these children;</p> <p>(d) HA was conducting a manpower review with a view to increasing the number of psychiatric</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>nurses and occupational therapists in two years' time;</p> <p>(e) the support service and facilities provided by the Holistic Child & Youth Wellness Centre Cum Training Centre (i.e. Serene Teen) under Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Hospital in New Territories East Cluster and the Child & Adolescent Mental Health Centres operated by the hospitals in New Territories West Cluster had been enhanced; and</p> <p>(f) collaboration among the medical and other professions was required in the implementation of IE.</p>	
032053 - 032208	Social Welfare Department ("SWD") Chairman	<p>SWD informed the meeting that —</p> <p>(a) there was a growing demand for pre-school rehabilitation service;</p> <p>(b) about 607 additional pre-school rehabilitation places would come on stream in 2013-2014; and</p> <p>(c) since December 2011, the Community Care Fund had launched an assistance programme for children on the waiting list of subvented pre-school rehabilitation services. It was the Administration's intention to extend or regularize the programme.</p>	
032209 - 032332	Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority ("HKEAA") Chairman	<p>HKEAA's view that —</p> <p>(a) Applications for special examination arrangements ("SEA") received from SEN candidates would be considered by the Committee on Special Needs Candidates and the Task Group on Special Examination Arrangements for Candidates with Specific Learning Disabilities; and</p> <p>(b) the SEA adopted by the schools attended by SEN students was far more important than those provided by HKEAA in public examinations.</p>	
032333 - 032640	Ms Claudia MO Chairman	<p>Ms MO's view that —</p> <p>(a) the effectiveness of the initiatives implemented by EDB to promote equal learning opportunities for ethnic minorities and IE was questionable;</p> <p>(b) the support services provided for SEN students and their parents were far from adequate; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the existing academic system and public examinations were result-oriented. To ensure that SEN students would have a fair chance of pursuing further education, HKEAA should take responsibility in making necessary accommodations to facilitate SEN students in taking public examinations.</p>	
032641 - 033256	Dr Helena WONG Administration Chairman	<p>Dr WONG's view that —</p> <p>(a) the Democratic Party strongly supported the provision of more resources to cater for SEN students;</p> <p>(b) according to paragraph 28 of EDB's paper, the total expenditure of the support services for SEN students was estimated to be around \$1.02 billion in the 2012-2013 school year. EDB should consider injecting more resources to further enhance the support for SEN students;</p> <p>(c) the Administration should set up an interdepartmental body to take forward the implementation of IE in a holistic and well co-ordinated manner.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that EDB should provide the steer and take the lead in setting up the interdepartmental body.</p> <p>The Administration's clarification that –</p> <p>(a) the said \$1.02 billion was provided to schools, on top of the regular subvention, for implementing the various support services on IE;</p> <p>(b) EDB would continue to work closely with other government departments and organizations on the implementation of IE; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration would be prepared to listen to the views of deputations and members on how the implementation of IE could be enhanced.</p> <p>With the agreement of the Subcommittee, the Chairman further extended the duration of the meeting (which ended at 6:15 pm).</p>	
033257-033612	Dr Kenneth CHAN Administration Chairman	<p>Dr CHAN's comments/enquiries as follows —</p> <p>(a) SEN students should be given the opportunity to develop the potentials and abilities that they possessed;</p> <p>(b) although the Administration had promulgated a policy on IE and provided resources for schools</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>and students, there was inadequate monitoring over the deployment of resources and how IE was actually implemented at the school level;</p> <p>(c) it appeared that the academic structure of Taiwan was more conducive for the pursuing of tertiary education by SEN students; and</p> <p>(d) whether the number of local SEN students pursuing tertiary education in Taiwan was available.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the information required at (d) above was not available.</p>	
033613 - 034028	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Administration Chairman	<p>Mr LEUNG's remarks that during his recent study tour to Taiwan, he had found that both SEN students and their parents were able to benefit from the well-structured tertiary education system. He further enquired whether —</p> <p>(a) the Administration would make reference to Taiwan's experience in implementing IE in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration would consider introducing legislation to provide for equal learning opportunities for SEN students in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Administration's responses that —</p> <p>(a) EDB had kept the implementation of IE under ongoing review and introduced improvements where necessary and practicable; and</p> <p>(b) the legislative approach required very careful study. The learning opportunities of SEN students had been catered for. Hence, for the time being, there was no plan to introduce legislation regarding equal learning opportunities for SEN students.</p>	
034029 - 034602	Chairman Labour Party	<p>The Chairman's remarks on the way forward and his initial view on the arrangements for the next meeting.</p> <p>The Chairman's advice regarding Dr Helena WONG's intention to move a motion at the meeting.</p> <p>The Chairman's instruction that the views and concerns raised at the meeting would be consolidated for easy reference.</p>	<p>The Administration to provide a paper as stated in paragraph 6 of the minutes.</p> <p>The Secretariat to prepare a summary of views.</p>
034603 - 035000	Mr WO Wei-yan Administration	Mr WO and Dr CHAN enquired about the Administration's stance on/response to the various	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Dr Kenneth CHAN Chairman	views and concerns raised at the meeting. The Chairman requested the Administration to provide a detailed written response to the views, concerns and suggestions raised at the meeting before the next meeting on 27 May 2013.	The Administration to provide a written response as stated in paragraph 7 of the minutes.
<i>Agenda Item IV – Any other business</i>			
035001 - 035047	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 July 2013