

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

Ref : CB4/PS/1/12

LC Paper No. CB(4)54/13-14  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

**Panel on Education**

**Subcommittee on Integrated Education**

**Minutes of the Fifth meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 18 June 2013, at 4:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon Claudia MO  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

**Member absent** : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending** : Item I

**Education Bureau**

Mr Kevin YEUNG  
Under Secretary for Education

Ms Sophia WONG  
Principal Education Officer  
(Special Education & Kindergarten Education)

Ms Louise HUI  
Senior Specialist (Speech Therapy)

**Hospital Authority**

Dr Alexander CHIU  
Chief Manager (Quality and Standards)

Dr John SUNG  
Associate Consultant (Ear, Nose & Throat)  
Prince of Wales Hospital/Alice Ho Miu Ling  
Nethersole Hospital

**Department of Health**

Dr Catherine LAM Chi-chin, JP  
Consultant Paediatrician (Child Assessment Service)

**Social Welfare Department**

Mrs KWOK LI Mung-yee, Helen  
Chief Social Work Officer  
(Rehabilitation and Medical Social Services)

**Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority**

Dr TONG Chong-sze  
Secretary General

Ms Sharon LO  
Senior Manager – Examinations Administration

**Attendance by Invitation** : Centre for Sign Linguistics and Deaf Studies, The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Mr YIU Kun-man  
Project Manager

Prof Gladys TANG Wai-lan

Hong Kong Sign Language Association

Miss KONG Wan-ki  
General Affairs

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Mr CHAN Kwok-kuen  
Executive Committee Member

Dr WONG Chi-tak

Ms CHOI Tsz-wan

Hong Kong Association of the Deaf

Ms Liz TSANG Lok-yan  
Vice Executive Director (Social and Medical Services)

Silence Limited

Ms Maggie MAN Suet-yung  
Executive Director

Mr MAK Ka-yue

Ms LI Lei

Ms Candy LING Yuet-man

Association for the Rights of Hearing Impaired  
Students

---

Mrs YIU NG Wai-ming  
Deputy Chairman

Mr John YIU Chun-yiu

Ms HO Chun

Suen Mei Speech & Hearing Centre

Mrs Bessie PANG  
Executive Director

聽障學生權益會

Ms MOK Mei-ling  
Chairperson

聽障學生權益會人工耳蝸關注組

Ms YIP Miu-ling  
Representative

聽障學生權益會大專教育關注組

Miss CHING Wai-kit  
Representative

聽障學生權益會助聽器質素關注組

Ms LEUNG Yan-bun  
Representative

Ms CHOI Ah-ping

Ms CHENG Ko-yau

Labour Party

Mr Michael CHENG  
Representative

Hong Kong Parents Association for the Hearing-  
Impaired

---

Ms Rebecca CHAN  
Vice-chairperson

Ms Vivian WONG

Ms Cindy TANG

真鐸學生權益關注組

Ms LEUNG Yun-mei  
Convenor

Miss MAK Wai-kwan

Civic Party

Mr Joshua LI  
District Developer

Education Convergence

Dr PANG I-wah

The Forthright Caucus

Mr SIU Yat-chan  
Committee member

Miss Winnie CHEUNG Wing-yin

Miss Stella CHAN Yuen-tang

Ms CHAN Xiang-yuen

聽障學生權益會手語教學關注組

Ms WONG Shuk-han  
Representative

The Hong Kong Society for the Deaf

Miss Anna LAM Ka-yan  
Chairman of Pre-School Education Service Alumni  
Association

Miss Joyce PUN Chung-sze

CODA Hong Kong

Ms Cindy CHAN Kai-yee

Miss CHENG Wing-yan

News of Deaf

Ms NG Sui-ping  
Director

Mr TANG Siu-chung

Miss Mandy TANG Hoi-man

Chinese YMCA of Hong Kong Y's Men's Centre for  
the Deaf

---

Mr CHEUNG Cheuk-ho

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Miss Elly CHAN  
Administrative Assistant (4)2

Ms Jennifer LEUNG  
Clerical Assistant (4)3

Action

---

**I. Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with hearing impairment**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(01) — Paper provided by the Administration)

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(05) — Submission from  
and CB(4)887/12-13(01) Ms Apple YAU

LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(06) — Submission from Alex  
LIU

LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(06) — Submission from 香港聾人協進會聾童教育中心

LC Paper No. CB(4)803/12-13(04) — Submission from Miss Emily LAM)

Meeting with deputations and the Administration

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the views/concerns raised at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: On the subsequent instruction of the Chairman, a "consolidated summary" of the views/concerns raised at this meeting and the meeting held on 8 July 2013 had been prepared and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)945/12-13(01). The Administration's written response to the consolidated summary of views/concerns was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1007/12-13(01) on 2 October 2013.)*

**II. Any other business**

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:45 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
21 October 2013

**Proceedings of the meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Integrated Education  
on Tuesday, 18 June 2013, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

| <b>Time marker</b>  | <b>Speaker(s)</b>   | <b>Subject(s)</b>  | <b>Action required</b> |
|---|---|--|------------------------|
| <i>Agenda Item I – Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with hearing impairment</i> |   |  |                        |
| 000428 -<br>000749  | Chairman  | Opening remarks  |                        |
| 000750 -<br>000841  | Administration<br>Chairman  | Briefing by the Administration on its information paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(01)]. |                        |
| 000842 -<br>001157  | Centre for Sign Linguistics and Deaf Studies, The Chinese University of Hong Kong<br>Chairman | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(02)]      |                        |
| 001158 -<br>001559  | Prof Gladys TANG Wai-lan<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 001600 -<br>001950  | Hong Kong Sign Language Association<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 001951 -<br>002306  | Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)803/12-13(01)]      |                        |
| 002307 -<br>002631  | Dr WONG Chi-tak<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 002632 -<br>002940  | Ms CHOI Tsz-wan<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 002941 -<br>003256  | Hong Kong Association of the Deaf<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(01)]      |                        |
| 003257 -<br>003601  | Silence Limited<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 003602 -<br>003941  | Mr MAK Ka-yue<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)810/12-13(01)]      |                        |
| 003942 -<br>004250  | Ms LI Lei<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views  |                        |
| 004251 -<br>004608  | Ms Candy LING Yuet-man<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views  |                        |



| <b>Time marker</b> | <b>Speaker(s)</b>   | <b>Subject(s)</b>   | <b>Action required</b> |
|--------------------|---|---|------------------------|
| 004609 - 004943    | Association for the Rights of Hearing Impaired Students<br>Chairman | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(03)]   |                        |
| 004944 - 005322    | Mr John YIU Chun-yiu<br>Chairman                                    | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 005323 - 005738    | Ms HO Chun<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 005739 - 010115    | Suen Mei Speech & Hearing Centre<br>Chairman                        | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(02)]   |                        |
| 010116 - 010436    | 聽障學生權益會<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 010437 - 010745    | 聽障學生權益會人工耳蝸關注組<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 010746 - 011040    | 聽障學生權益會大專教育關注組<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 011041- 011242     | 聽障學生權益會助聽器質素關注組<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 011243 - 011420    | Ms CHOI Ah-ping<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 011421 - 011843    | Ms CHENG Ko-yau<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 011844 - 012229    | Labour Party<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(03)]   |                        |
| 012230 - 012636    | Hong Kong Parents Association for the Hearing-Impaired<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 012637 - 013229    | Administration<br>Chairman  | The Administration gave the following initial responses -<br><br>(a) Deputations' views on integrated education ("IE") were noted.<br><br>(b) As to the use of sign language to supplement spoken language in teaching students with hearing impairment ("HI") in ordinary schools, various factors had to be considered, including sign language training of teachers, readiness and |                        |

| Time marker     | Speaker(s)                     | Subject(s)   | Action required   |
|-----------------|--------------------------------|--|---|
|                 |                                | <p>capability of ordinary students in using sign language, etc. The Administration would keep in view the outcomes of a pilot project to be carried out by a post-secondary institution on using sign language in teaching in a secondary school.</p> <p>(c) While noting the views of stakeholders, the Education Bureau ("EDB") had to follow the established tendering procedures in procuring audiological services, including hearing aids for students with HI. Under the present tender, the supplier was required to provide more than one model for each type of hearing aid for parents to choose.</p> <p>(d) The support for post-secondary students with special educational needs ("SEN students") had been included in the recurrent subvention provided by the University Grants Committee ("UGC"). The Administration would communicate with post-secondary institutions regarding support measures for SEN students. It was worth noting that starting from the 2013-2014 academic year, the recurrent subvention for the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") would be increased for enhancing its support to SEN students.</p> |   |
| 013230 - 013644 | Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung<br>Chairman | <p>Mr LEUNG's views that -</p> <p>(a) there was a lack of co-ordination among different bureaux/departments in that the external speech processor, being an integral part of the cochlear implant, was a medical item not covered by the standard fees and charges of the Hospital Authority ("HA"); and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should provide a detailed response to the issues raised at the meeting and advise the Subcommittee how they would be followed up.</p> <p>The Chairman's advice that the Secretariat would prepare a summary of views/concerns and forward to the Administration for detailed response.</p>  | <p>The Secretariat to prepare a summary of views/concerns.</p> <p>The Administration to provide a written response as stated in paragraph 2 of the minutes.</p> |
| 013645 - 014050 | Deputy Chairman<br>Chairman    | <p>The Deputy Chairman's comments that -</p> <p>(a) the different approaches in handling the provision of hearing aids and cochlear implants had never been seriously looked into by the Administration; and</p> <p>(b) EDB should take steps to improve its provision of services and support measures to SEN students.</p>   |   |

| Time marker     | Speaker(s)                                       | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|-----------------|--|---|-----------------|
| 014051 - 014423 | Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che<br>Administration<br>Chairman | <p>Mr CHEUNG's views that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) HI students should be given the option of using the hearing aids provided by EDB, or be issued subsidy or vouchers to purchase suitable hearing aids from a list of approved suppliers;</li> <li>(b) as both the cochlear implant and hearing aids were assistive tools for supporting HI students, the Administration should adopt a uniform approach in the provision of the two types of devices;</li> <li>(c) the Administration should not overlook the difficulties and pressure faced by families with SEN students and should provide necessary support services to them;</li> <li>(d) the use of sign language should be promoted and sign language training should be provided for students and the public; and</li> <li>(e) the Administration should consider introducing legislation on special education.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it was committed to catering for the needs of SEN students and would consider the views raised by deputations and members carefully; and</li> <li>(b) it was mindful of the need to provide adequate support to SEN students pursuing post-secondary education to ensure they would not be deprived of the opportunity of pursuing higher studies due to the lack of relevant support.</li> </ul> |                 |
| 014424 - 014902 | Ms Cyd HO<br>Administration<br>Chairman          | <p>Ms HO's views that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) students with different degrees of HI should be provided with the appropriate models of hearing aids that could meet their individual needs. However, under the prevailing tendering system, the choice of hearing aids was very limited and very often, HI students were provided with hearing aids which could not meet their specific needs;</li> <li>(b) the Administration should review its existing tendering system in the provision of hearing aids; and</li> <li>(c) consideration should be given to inviting the Audit Commission to conduct a study on the existing tendering arrangements to ascertain</li> </ul>  |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker(s)  | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|-----------------|---|---|-----------------|
|                 |   | <p>whether public money allocated for acquiring hearing aids had been spent in the most cost-effective manner.</p> <p>The Administration informed members that according to the service questionnaires completed by parents and returned to EDB from September 2009 to March 2013, a vast majority of the parents was very satisfied or satisfied with the outsourced audiological services.</p> <p>The Chairman's remarks that –</p> <p>(a) the aforesaid findings might not reflect the full picture as those users who were not satisfied with the hearing aids might not have returned the service questionnaires to EDB; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should make reference to a study conducted by Dr Kenneth SIN Kuen-fung on the difficulties encountered by HI students, which revealed that a large number of students found the hearing aids provided by the Government unsuitable and did not use them.</p> <p>While noting members' views, the Administration reiterated that parents were provided with choices on the hearing aids for their children.</p>                                  |                 |
| 014903 - 015833 | Ms Claudia MO<br>Administration<br>Hospital Authority<br>Chairman | <p>Ms MO's remark that although the replacement of external speech processors of cochlear implants had been added to the non-drug subvented items of the Samaritan Fund, HI students were required to pass a household-based financial assessment before they were eligible for assistance. This arrangement was unsatisfactory.</p> <p>Ms MO's enquiry –</p> <p>(a) whether the Administration would subsidize the repair and maintenance of the external speech processors of the cochlear implants for HI students;</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration would consider introducing legislation on special education; and</p> <p>(c) whether awarding the tender to the lowest bid could ensure that HI students would be provided with the most suitable hearing aids.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the Administration should not adopt different approaches in handling the provision of cochlear implants and hearing aids, both being assistive tools for HI students. The provision of external speech processors should not therefore be subject to any means test as currently required under</p> |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker(s)                        | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------|
|                 |                                   | <p>the Samaritan Fund.</p> <p>HA's explanation that the repair and replacement of the external speech processors of the cochlear implants, like other medical items of a similar nature (e.g. prostheses), were not covered by the standard fees and charges of HA. To provide financial assistance to needy HI students, starting from April 2013, HA had already added the replacement of external speech processors of cochlear implants to the non-drug subvented items of the Samaritan Fund. HA would review the eligibility criteria, approving procedures and subvented items of the Samaritan Fund regularly.</p> <p>The Administration advised that -</p> <p>(a) clear government policies and procedures were in place governing the tendering arrangements for the provision of hearing aids; only tenders fulfilling the specified requirements would be considered;</p> <p>(b) the suggestion of allowing greater flexibility in the provision of hearing aids was noted;</p> <p>(c) currently, the provision of the cochlear implants and the accompanying external speech processors, the surgery and follow-up services were under the administration of HA; and</p> <p>(d) at the present stage, the Administration had no plan to introduce legislation on special education. The Administration was prepared to work with the Subcommittee to explore ways of enhancing the implementation of IE.</p> |                 |
| 015834 - 020209 | Ms Vivian WONG<br>Chairman        | Presentation of views   |                 |
| 020210 - 020546 | Ms Cindy TANG<br>Chairman         | Presentation of views   |                 |
| 020547 - 020751 | 真鐸學生權益關注組<br>Chairman             | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)803/12-13(02)]   |                 |
| 020752 - 020918 | Miss MAK Wai-kwan<br>Chairman     | Presentation of views as detailed in her submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)820/12-13(01)]   |                 |
| 020919 - 021228 | Civic Party<br>Chairman           | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)810/12-13(02)]   |                 |
| 021229 - 021611 | Education Convergence<br>Chairman | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(04)]   |                 |

| <b>Time marker</b> | <b>Speaker(s)</b>   | <b>Subject(s)</b>   | <b>Action required</b> |
|--------------------|---|---|------------------------|
| 021612 -<br>021849 | The Fortright Caucus<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 021850 -<br>022130 | Miss Winnie CHEUNG<br>Wing-yin<br>Chairman                                | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 022131 -<br>022401 | Miss Stella CHAN Yuen-<br>tang<br>Chairman                                | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 022402 -<br>022711 | Ms CHAN Xiang-yuen<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 022712 -<br>022856 | 聽障學生權益會手語<br>教學關注組<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 022857 -<br>023238 | The Hong Kong Society<br>for the Deaf<br>Chairman                         | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission<br>[LC Paper No. CB(4)777/12-13(04)]  |                        |
| 023239 -<br>023501 | Miss Joyce PUN Chung-<br>sze<br>Chairman                                  | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 023502 -<br>023817 | CODA Hong Kong<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission<br>[LC Paper No. CB(4)803/12-13(03)]  |                        |
| 023818 -<br>024222 | Ms CHENG Wing-yan<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 024223 -<br>024519 | News of Deaf<br>Chairman  | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission<br>[LC Paper No. CB(4)820/12-13(02)]  |                        |
| 024520 -<br>024728 | Mr TANG Siu-chung<br>Chairman   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 024729 -<br>025100 | Miss Mandy TANG Hoi-<br>man<br>Chairman                                   | Presentation of views   |                        |
| 025101 -<br>025507 | Chinese YMCA of Hong<br>Kong Y's Men's Centre<br>for the Deaf<br>Chairman | Presentation of views as detailed in its submission<br>[LC Paper No. CB(4)787/12-13(05)]<br><br>The Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes<br>beyond the appointed ending time. |                        |
| 025508 -<br>025819 | Deputy Chairman<br>Administration<br>Chairman                             | The Deputy Chairman's views that -<br><br>(a) the Administration should provide suitable<br>hearing aids for students with different degrees<br>of HI;                                |                        |

| Time marker     | Speaker(s)                              | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|-----------------|---|--|-----------------|
|                 |   | <p>(b) although the resources allocated to UGC-funded institutions and VTC had taken into account the provision of support to SEN students, some self-financing post-secondary institutions might lack resources in providing support to the SEN students they had admitted; and</p> <p>(c) apart from the proposal to provide scholarships to deserving post-secondary students with SEN, the Administration should examine ways to enhance the overall provision of support for SEN students pursuing post-secondary education.</p> <p>The Administration elaborated that since there was an increasing number of SEN students attending VTC programmes, the Administration had already proposed in the 2013-2014 Budget to allocate \$12 million to VTC each year to purchase equipment and learning aids for SEN students, provide them with psychological and student counselling services, and enhance the support for teaching and learning.</p>  |                 |
| 025820 - 030305 | Ms Cyd HO<br>Administration<br>Chairman | <p>Ms HO's views that -</p> <p>(a) what SEN students needed was support rather than awards. Given the relatively small number of SEN students undertaking post-secondary studies, the Administration should put resources to better use by providing necessary support measures to enable all SEN students to pursue their post-secondary studies without impediment; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should also provide support services to the parents of SEN students.</p> <p>The Administration pointed out that the proposed scholarships were intended to give recognition to deserving post-secondary SEN students in pursuit of academic and other excellence, and would be in addition to other support measures provided for SEN students undertaking post-secondary studies.</p> <p>The Chairman's remark that the Administration should give due consideration to providing HI students pursuing post-secondary programmes with support measures such as the provision of FM systems and services of note-takers.</p> |                 |
| 030306 - 030821 | Dr Kenneth CHAN<br>Chairman             | <p>Dr CHAN's views that -</p> <p>(a) Hong Kong lagged far behind other places, such as the United States, Canada and Taiwan, in the provision of support to HI students; and</p>   |                 |

| Time marker                                | Speaker(s)                                       | Subject(s)   | Action required  |
|--|--|--|--|
|  |  | <p>(b) providing a scholarship of \$10,000 to a SEN student pursuing post-secondary education was of limited use. Instead, the Administration should introduce targeted measures to support SEN students.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the issues identified in the implementation of IE should be tackled at the system/policy level. He reminded the Administration to provide a detailed written response to the views/concerns raised at the meeting.</p>   | <p>The Administration to provide a written response as stated in paragraph 2 of the minutes.</p> |
| 030822 - 031517                            | Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che<br>Administration<br>Chairman | <p>Mr CHEUNG considered that the Administration should look into situations where HI students had to wait for six to 12 months for the provision of hearing aids.</p> <p>The Administration advised that it had not received cases about long waiting time but it would study the views/concerns raised at the meeting and explore means to enhance the implementation of IE.</p> <p>Summing up, the Chairman's remarks that –</p> <p>(a) to facilitate the implementation of IE for HI students, the Administration should seriously consider promoting the wider use of sign language in ordinary schools;</p> <p>(b) it was necessary for EDB/HA to address the concerns raised by deputations and members on the existing arrangements in the provision and replacement of hearing aids and cochlear implant;</p> <p>(c) teacher training and other services such as sign language interpretation, note-taking services, etc. needed to be strengthened; and</p> <p>(d) post-secondary institutions should enhance their support for SEN students.</p> |  |
| <i>Agenda Item II – Any other business</i> |  |  |  |
| 031518 - 031546                            | Chairman   | Arrangements of next meeting   |  |