

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)961/12-13
(The minutes have been seen by the
Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/ED

Panel on Education

Minutes of special meeting
held on Saturday, 3 November 2012, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Members absent : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Public Officers : Agenda item I
attending

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP
Secretary for Education

Mrs Michelle WONG
Deputy Secretary for Education (4)

Attendance by : Session 1 (9:00 am - 11:10 am)
invitation

The Hong Kong Institute of Education Student Union

Mr KAO Chun-wai
External Vice President

Hong Kong Federation of Students

Mr LIU Sze-ming
Spokesperson

STFA Leung Kau Kui College

Mr TAI Ming-kee
Principal

POCA Wong Siu Ching Secondary School

Mr CHUNG Fat-shing
Principal

Mr LAU Chun-hung

Ms FUNG Kam-yin

The Methodist Lee Wai Lee College

Mr CHEUNG Yam-lung

Mr WONG Lik-hak

Notre Dame College

Mr Steven HON Sze-ping
Principal

Christ College

Mr FUNG Chi-tak
Principal

Ho Ngai College (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen)

Mr Jackson CHEUNG Kin-sun
Principal

S.K.H. St. Benedict's School

Mr LO Fat-keung
Principal

Mr Tung Kwok-leung

TWGHs Kwok Yat Wai College

Mr LO Man-piu
School Principal

CCC Kei Long College

Mr LO Shiu-ming
Principal

Po Leung Kuk Wu Chung College

Mr TSANG Kin-Keung
Principal

Federation of Parent-Teacher Association Kowloon City
District

Miss Isabel CHAN
Vice President

Miss LAU Sau-yin

S.K.H. Lam Kau Mow Secondary School

Ms HO Wai-ling
Principal

Mr YEUNG Hok-hoi

Kowloon City District School Principals' Liaison
Committee

Mr YIP Chee-tim
Council member

The Jockey Club Eduyoung College

Mr LUI Chi-hong
Principal

Mr TSE Hung-sum

Federation of Parent-Teacher Association, Tai Po
District

Mr HO Chu-ping

Buddhist Wong Wan Tin College

Mr KWOK Yiu-fung
Principal

Session 2 (11:25 am - 1:05 pm)

Kwun Tong Schools Liaison Committee

Mr LAI Wing-chun

Tuen Mun District Secondary School Heads Association

Ms TANG Yin-ping
Chairperson

Mr WONG Tsz-ching

Mr AU Kin-kwan

CCC Fung Leung Kit Memorial Secondary School

Ms Caroline YEE
Principal

Caritas Tuen Mun Marden Foundation Secondary School

Mr Lobo HO Lik Sang
Principal

Southern District Joint Schools Conference

Mr Peter YU Lap-fun
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools Council

Mr LAM Kin-wah
Chairman

The Church of Christ in China Kei Chi Secondary School

Mr Adolph YUEN
Principal

Subsidized Primary Schools Council

Mr SIN Kim-wai
Chairman

Mr LEE Sai-kee

Aplichau Kaifong Primary School

Ms FUNG Pik-yee
Headmistress

Children Caring Network

Mr LEUNG Ka-yue
Chairman

Federation of Parent-Teacher Associations (Kwai Tsing District) Ltd

Mr LI Chi-ho
Chairperson

Mr LEE Ting-leung

Mr SUM Sing-wah

Mr MAK Chi-keung

Yan Chai Hospital Lan Chi Pat Memorial Secondary School

Mr TSANG Kwok-yung

Mu Kuang English School

Mr NG To-pong
Principal

The Association of Hong Kong Chinese Middle Schools

Ms. Yau Kit Ying, Veronica
Principal

Clerk in attendance : Ms Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (4)4

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Esther CHEUNG
Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Action

I. Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population

(LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(02) -- Background brief entitled "Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)89/12-13(02) -- Submission from Education Convergence

LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(09) -- Submission from Ms Grace WONG Chung-yan

LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(10) -- Submission from San Wui Commercial Society Secondary School

LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(11) -- Submission from Pui Shing Catholic Secondary School)

The Chairman welcomed all deputations/individuals to the special meeting. Members noted the background brief prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(02)] and noted the submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting.

Session 1

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

2. A total of 25 deputations/individuals presented their views in the first session. Their major views were summarized in the **Appendix**.

Action

Initial response by the Administration

3. The Secretary for Education ("SED") recalled that some members, including Ms Cyd HO and Dr Kenneth CHAN, had requested at the last meeting that Mrs Cherry TSE, Permanent Secretary for Education (PS"Ed") should also attend this meeting. SED said that PS(Ed) was unable to attend this special meeting due to prior official commitment, as PS(Ed) had to attend and officiate at a series of meetings and activities in respect of the Scheme for Admission of Hong Kong students to Mainland Higher Education Institutions participated by 70 Mainland higher education institutions.

4. Before proceeding to the discussion, the Chairman drew members' attention to Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure which provided that a Member shall not move any motion or amendment relating to a matter in which he had a pecuniary interest, whether direct or indirect, or speak on any such matter, except where he disclosed the nature of that interest. He reminded members to declare interests, if any, in the matter under discussion.

Discussion

Consultation with stakeholders and the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by the education sector

5. Noting the relief measures set out in the Administration's paper, Ms Cyd HO asked whether the Administration would propose additional measures having regard to the views of stakeholders and deputations, in particular the "3-2-1 proposal". SED said that the Administration would have intensive meetings with stakeholders next week. It was expected that a consensus could be reached to allow flexibility for schools to adjust the number of student intake in the light of changes in Secondary One ("S1") student population.

6. Mr TAM Yiu-chung noted that both the Administration and the school principals attending the Panel meeting shared common objectives in preserving the stability of schools and the teaching force in the face of a temporary decline in S1 student population in the next few years. Since the school principals had put forward the "3-2-1 proposal" and agreed to consider a mechanism of providing upward and downward adjustments in the light of changes in student population, Mr TAM asked the Administration to seriously consider taking forward this proposal.

Action

7. Mr Paul TSE shared a similar view. Noting the attendance of an unprecedented large number of school principals who rarely proclaimed their stance in such a high-profile manner, Mr TSE urged the Administration to seriously consider the proposal put forward by the school principals.

8. Mr WONG Yuk-man expressed his dissatisfaction as he considered that the relief measures proposed by the Administration could hardly address the crux of the problem. He reminded the Administration to study the proposal of the education sector very carefully as the consensus among school principals was already very clear. Regarding the possible financial commitment, Dr Kenneth CHAN asked the Administration to advise whether the implementation of the "3-2-1 proposal" would be cost-neutral.

9. SED advised that the relief measures put forward by the Administration for discussion in the past few weeks would aim at achieving the objective of preserving the stability and strength of schools and the teaching force. The Education Bureau ("EDB") would continue the discussion with stakeholders with a view to coming up with an option that would be acceptable by different stakeholders. SED said that in the month of October 2013 alone, EDB had met with the organizations of school principals three times. In the course of discussion, the Administration had not precluded any proposal from consideration.

10. Regarding the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by the education sector, Mr MA Fung-kwok was of the view that it was also necessary to take into account the parents' concerns, as the proposal, if implemented, might have the effect of reducing the opportunities for their children to gain admission to the schools of their preference. The expected rebound of student population several years later would also need to be considered.

11. In this regard, Mr LAU Chun-hung explained that as envisaged by the education sector, the large number of untaken S1 places in secondary schools would eventually lead to "Band 3" students being allocated to "Band 2" or "Band 1" schools, thereby resulting in a mismatch between the level of attainment of some students and the prevailing requirements of certain schools. This competency gap easily led to adjustment problems to the detriment of both the students and the schools.

12. Dr Kenneth CHAN was concerned about the risk of school closure in the next few years and asked the Administration to provide information, if any, on the estimated number of secondary schools that would be closed as a result of the decline in S1 student population in the three school years

Action

after 2012-2013. To preserve the stability of schools and teachers, Dr Priscilla LEUNG said that consideration should be given to allowing schools with unique and outstanding performance in certain non-academic disciplines/activities to continue their operation despite the low intake of S1 students. SED re-affirmed that the relief measures would aim to preserve secondary schools and provide schools with greater flexibility since the minimum number of S1 class operated as well as the minimum number of intake of SI students had been relaxed.

13. Mr Paul TSE enquired whether the deputations had in mind other proposals in addition to the "3-2-1 proposal". Mr TSE wondered whether there was any other alternative which stakeholders were hesitant to share at the meeting.

14. In this connection, the Deputy Chairman said that the Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union had all along urged the Administration to take the opportunity of the decline in secondary student population to immediately reduce the class size to 30 students, and then progressively to 25 students per class so as to improve the quality of education. The Deputy Chairman remarked that in his view, the "3-2-1 proposal" was already a very moderate option. This option alone might not tackle the existing problems in secondary education.

15. Noting from the deputations that on 22 November 2012 the Secondary School Places Allocation ("SSPA") Committee would finalize the allocation arrangements for the coming school year, Dr Kenneth CHAN and Ms Cyd HO urged the Administration to come up with a substantive response to address the current issues as soon as possible. In response, SED advised members that in the following week, EDB would continue discussion with the associations of school principals and school councils. Issues related to the teaching force would also be considered. It was expected that the Administration and the school sector would be able to reach a consensus before 22 November 2012.

16. The Deputy Chairman said that the Panel might wish to follow up this matter at the coming regular meeting to be held on 12 November 2012. He also indicated his intention to move a motion on this matter.

Small class teaching

17. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung declared that he was a secondary school teacher. He was of the view that small class teaching ("SCT") could help address the problems arising from learning diversity among students,

Action

enhance the quality of education and the relationship between teachers and students. He enquired about the impediments, if any, to the implementation of SCT and whether the Administration had any timetable for implementation. In reply, SED highlighted that issues arising from learning diversity could not be solved merely by implementing SCT or reducing the class size.

18. Dr Kenneth CHAN noted that the Hong Kong Institute of Education had conducted a study on implementing SCT in Hong Kong, and asked whether the Administration had considered the findings of local research studies. Dr CHAN also reiterated members' request raised at the meeting held yesterday that the Administration should provide relevant statistics/findings of studies in Europe and the United States to facilitate the discussion on SCT.

19. Mr LAU Chun-hung suggested that SCT might be implemented in secondary schools on a pilot basis. In the absence of any local implementation experience, it would not be possible to conduct local researches or consolidate relevant experience to take forward SCT in the local context.

20. On the effectiveness or otherwise of SCT, Mr Paul TSE made his observation that in popular private tuition schools, each class comprised a large number of students and it was not uncommon for these students to attain good academic results.

21. SED advised that reducing the class size and SCT were two separate issues. SCT was a method of teaching. Regarding the effectiveness of implementing SCT in secondary schools in Hong Kong, conclusion was yet to be drawn from international studies.

22. The Deputy Chairman did not subscribe to SED's view, and said that SCT was not a teaching method, but a measure to enhance the teaching/learning environment which would enable the adoption of different pedagogies to suit students' needs. He also suggested EDB to make reference to the findings of local research on the effectiveness of SCT, such as the research conducted by Dr Gary HARFITT of the University of Hong Kong.

Quality of education

23. Dr Fernando CHEUNG stressed that the most important issue at stake was the need to sustain the quality of education, rather than cost

Action

implications as always referred to by EDB. Dr CHEUNG was of the view that following the adoption of the school-based management approach, EDB had in effect shirked its responsibilities and passed on all the difficult tasks to individual schools. He urged the education sector to show solidarity in dealing with the aftermath of the decline of S1 student population and to enlist support from students and parents. Dr Priscilla LEUNG said that to maintain the quality of education, it was imperative that experienced teachers be retained in the education sector.

24. SED took note of members' views and re-affirmed that the Administration was committed to sustaining the quality of teaching as well as the stability of the teaching force.

25. Mr MA Fung-kwok asked whether the education sector had any plan to enhance the quality of education, given the decline in secondary student population during the next few years.

26. Mr TAI Ming-kee of STFA Leung Kau Kui College shared Mr MA's concern about enhancing the quality of education. He informed members that several groups of secondary school principals and teachers had visited some schools in Mainland China to study their self-learning model where the students were required to prepare for the lessons and give presentations in class. Based on the experience acquired from the visits, some schools had launched joint-school pilot programmes aimed at enhancing the quality of learning.

Session 2

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

27. A total of 20 deputations/individuals presented their views in the second session. Their major views were summarized in the **Appendix**.

Discussions

"3-2-1 proposal" and other relief measures

28. Ms Starry LEE noted from the deputations' views that different stakeholders shared the common objective of preserving the stability and strength of schools and the teaching force. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung urged the Administration to consider the views of deputations in particular the "3-2-1 proposal". The Deputy Chairman said that there were strong views from school principals and teachers that the number of students allocated

Action

to a class should be reduced. The education sector also supported the arrangement for schools to operate two S1 classes with an intake of only 26 students.

29. In response, SED stressed that in addition to preserving the stability and strength of schools and the teaching force, the Administration and the stakeholders also shared the common objective of maintaining the quality of education. He hoped that in the next two weeks, the discussion with stakeholders would focus on the practicable arrangements of reducing the number of students allocated to each school and each class. SED re-affirmed EDB's preparedness to work closely with the stakeholders for the purpose of coming up with a practicable solution within the next two weeks.

30. Dr Kenneth CHAN reiterated his request for information on whether the implementation of reducing the class size of S1 would be cost-neutral. SED agreed to follow up his request.

31. The Deputy Chairman said that the Administration had not learnt the lesson from the experience of consolidating primary schools, and had failed to plan in advance to cope with the decline of S1 student population. He reiterated his grave concern about the possible adjustment problems arising from the mismatch between the students and the schools when "Band 3" students were allocated to "Band 2" or "Band 1" schools. The Deputy Chairman considered that the decline of S1 student population was not a short-term problem, and remarked that if the decline of student population would last for about four years, the repercussions might spread over eight cohorts of students.

32. Ms Starry LEE was of the view that in addition to the measures to address the temporary decline in S1 student population, the Government should formulate medium- and longer-term plans to improve basic education, such as reducing the class size of the senior secondary levels to 30 students, which was the typical class size of Forms 6 and 7 prior to the implementation of the New Academic Structure. Ms LEE requested the Administration to provide information on its medium- and longer-term plans in writing.

33. Dr Priscilla LEUNG was of the view that private tuition schools might help improving the students' academic performance but were no substitute for ordinary schools in catering for the whole person development of students. She reiterated that the Administration should give consideration to allow schools with unique and outstanding

Action

performance in certain non-academic disciplines to continue their operation despite the low intake of S1 students.

34. In response, SED said that the New Senior Secondary curriculum provide a broader and more diversified choices of elective subjects to cater for the diverse interests, aptitudes and abilities of students. Citing two secondary schools in Cheung Chau as examples, he said that the elective subjects offered by these two schools could complement each other and cross-enrolment of students from the two schools was allowed.

35. Ms Cyd HO considered that since the SSPA Committee would finalize the allocation arrangements for the coming school year on 22 November 2012, EDB should report to the Panel at its upcoming regular meeting the details of the way forward. Ms HO said that according to her knowledge, PS(Ed) had been heavily involved in the policy-making process and therefore PS(Ed) should also attend the Panel's meetings to answer members' questions and respond to stakeholders' views.

36. In reply, SED said that as he had understood from the Chairman of SSPA Committee, the Committee might postpone its meeting for about one week after 22 November 2012. He expected that a finalized option could be worked out and reported to the Panel at its next meeting.

37. Regarding PS(Ed)'s attendance, SED said that as he had explained earlier on, PS(Ed) had to meet with representatives from 70 Mainland higher institutions and therefore had not been able to attend this meeting. Nevertheless, PS(Ed) would attend the upcoming meeting of the Panel.

Small class teaching

38. Dr Kenneth CHAN saw merits in SCT and said that he and the Members of the Civic Party supported the implementation of SCT. Dr CHAN was of the view that the Government should seize the opportunity of the decline in secondary student population to enhance the quality of secondary education by implementing SCT, instead of putting forward several relief measures allegedly to preserve the stability and strength of schools and the teaching force.

39. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung commented that the crux of the matter was the need to reform the existing selective system of education in Hong Kong, and to significantly increase public expenditure on education. He also urged the Administration to implement SCT.

Action

40. Noting members' concerns, SED highlighted that the implementation of SCT was an important subject which required a holistic study. He referred to some newspaper reports that according to some local scholars, while the experience of implementing SCT in primary schools in Hong Kong had yet to be consolidated, there was insufficient information at this stage to support the extension of SCT to secondary schools in Hong Kong.

41. Concluding the discussion, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide its early response to the views and concerns raised at the meeting, in particular the concrete proposal of "3-2-1" put forward by the education sector.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, a list of issues arising from the meeting had been drawn up and the Administration's written responses thereto were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)247/12-13(01) on 17 December 2012.)

II. Any other business

42. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:05 pm.

Panel on Education

Special meeting on Saturday, 3 November 2012, at 9:00 am

Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
1.	The Hong Kong Institute of Education Student Union [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(01)]	The Administration should seize the opportunity of the decline in Secondary One ("S1") student population to implement small class teaching ("SCT") for the purpose of enhancing the quality of education and maintaining the stability of the teaching force.
2.	Hong Kong Federation of Students	The deputation supported the implementation of SCT which could facilitate students' communication and participation in class, and enhance the quality of education. Implementing SCT could also allow teachers to spend more time and give more attention to students with special educational needs ("SEN students").
3.	STFA Leung Kau Kui College	The Administration might have underestimated the number of classes to be packed in the 2013-2014 school year due to the decline of S1 student population. The Administration was urged to reduce the class size to 30 students and allow upward adjustment to the existing level when there was a rebound in student population. The school expected that the Education Bureau ("EDB"), school principals and teachers could work hand in hand to achieve the common goal of improving the quality of education rather than dwelling on the discussion of relief measures.
4.	POCA Wong Siu Ching Secondary School	The school stressed that the consensus of school principals was to improve the learning environment and enhance the quality of education. In this connection, the Administration was urged to consider to adopt the "3-2-1 proposal", reduce the class size of senior secondary levels to 30 students and improve the class-to-teacher ratio to 1:2.3, which was similar to the arrangements for Forms 6 and 7 in the old system. The teacher-to-student ratio should be improved and teachers' workload should be reduced. The Administration should also explore the feasibility of implementing SCT in secondary schools.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
5.	Mr LAU Chun-hung	Citing his own experience, Mr LAU highlighted the adverse consequences of the mismatch between the abilities of the students and the requirements of the schools when Band 3 students were admitted to Band 2 and Band 1 schools. He urged the Administration to make greater effort in improving the quality of education.
6.	Ms FUNG Kam-yin	She doubted whether the Administration had any clear mission, rationale and supporting data to justify the proposed relief measures to address the issues arising from the decline of S1 student population. Instead of stating abstract objectives like preserving the stability and strength of secondary schools and their teachers, efforts should be made to uphold the quality of education. The Administration was urged to reduce the class size to 30 students so as to cater for the needs of students and enhance the quality of education.
7.	The Methodist Lee Wai Lee College	The school doubted the effectiveness of the proposed relief measures and considered that the Administration should make reference to the successful experience in the past rather than developing new measures on its own. The former Secretary for Education ("SED") had personally visited schools in different districts and discussed with the education sector how to address the problems encountered by the sector. In this connection, both SED and the Permanent Secretary should attend the special meetings of the Panel on Education.
8.	Mr WONG Lik-hak	He doubted the effectiveness of the relief measures proposed by the Administration and considered that the Administration should take the opportunity to address the problems in the education sector, such as retaining the experienced teachers and reducing the class size, for the purpose of enhancing the quality of education. The Administration should take into account the needs and concerns of Band 3 students and their parents in the light of the reduction in number of classes and the risk of closure of schools due to the decline in S1 student population.
9.	Notre Dame College	The school was concerned that in the event of the closure of some schools admitting Band 3 students due to insufficient enrolment, students from schools of a lower Band would be allocated places in Band 1 or Band 2 schools. This would result in a mismatch between the performance of the students and the requirements of the schools. It was necessary to retain schools of different banding within the education system to cater for students of different learning abilities. The Administration was urged to consider the "3-2-1- proposal".

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
10.	Christ College [LC Paper No. CB(4)89/12-13(01)]	The school urged the Administration to consider the "3-2-1 proposal" or any similar proposal to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class. The Administration should consider how to enhance the quality of education rather than merely to preserve the stability and strength of schools and teachers. Regarding concerns that parents might oppose the "3-2-1 proposal", the Administration should enhance communication with parents to explain to them the rationale and the adverse consequences arising from the mismatch when students from schools of a lower banding were allocated to schools of a higher banding.
11.	Ho Ngai College (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen)	Although the Administration stressed that its objectives were preserving the stability and strength of schools and teachers, the proposed relief measures were not targeted at improving the teacher establishment or retaining experienced teachers. Given that the "3-2-1 proposal" would not involve additional resources from the Government, the school urged the Administration to seriously consider the "3-2-1 proposal".
12.	S.K.H. St. Benedict's School [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(02)]	The workload of teachers had increased over the years as a result of the implementation a number of education initiatives, such as integrated education, the New Academic Structure and New Senior Secondary curriculum, in particular the requirement to carry out Independent Enquiry Study for the Liberal Studies subject. The school urged the Administration to take the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to reduce the class size of senior secondary classes to 30 students, which was similar to the class size of Forms 6 and 7 in the old system.
13.	Mr Tung Kwok-leung	Being a teacher of a school that admitted students with lower academic achievement, he urged the Administration to implement appropriate measures to safeguard the interests of Band 3 students. According to his experience, about 10% of Band 3 students were SEN students. Schools and teachers had to do additional work to support these students. If no effective measures were implemented to address the decline of student population, schools admitting Band 3 students would close down due to insufficient enrolment.
14.	TWGHs Kwok Yat Wai College	SCT was implemented in over 300 primary schools in the 2009-2010 school year with a class size of 25 students. These students would progress to secondary education in the 2015-2016 school year. It would be difficult for them to study in a class of 36 students. The school urged the Administration to consider the "3-2-1 proposal" which would provide a better teaching and learning environment. Otherwise, the decline in S1 student population would give rise to a problem of mismatch when Band 3 students were allocated to Band 2 and Band 1 schools.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
15.	CCC Kei Long College [LC Paper No. CB(4)108/12-13(01))	Since not all secondary school leavers had the chance to receive tertiary education, secondary education would be very important for nurturing talents for the society. The Administration should take the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to enhance the teaching environment and quality of education, which would eventually improve the productivity and competitiveness of Hong Kong's human capital. The school strongly supported the "3-2-1 proposal" which could help enhance the teaching environment without involving additional resources.
16.	Po Leung Kuk Wu Chung College	The school did not fully agree with the Administration's view that the decline in S1 student population was a temporary problem. If the decline in student population lasted for four years and a gradual rebound lasted for another three years afterwards, secondary schools had to encounter fluctuations of student intake for a period of as long as seven years. The "3-2-1 proposal" would be an appropriate measure to avert the under-enrolment problem of lower banding schools.
17.	Federation of Parent-Teacher Association Kowloon City District [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(03)]	<p>The deputation expressed the following views from the perspective of parents–</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As there were insufficient S1 places in public sector secondary schools in Kowloon City district, the deputation was concerned that the proposed reduction in the number of students allocated to each S1 class across the board would aggravate the shortfall of S1 places in the district. - The few places made available by individual schools for application by parents after the announcement of the Secondary School Places Allocation results should be maintained. - Due to insufficient S1 places in Kowloon City district, the more affluent families would try to secure S1 places at Direct Subsidy Scheme ("DSS") schools. In parallel, more subsidized schools in the district had joined DSS. - The mismatch between the students' abilities and the requirements of schools would become inevitable because those students with better academic achievement might have been admitted to DSS schools, while students from lower banding would take up the places in Band 1 schools.
18.	Miss LAU Sau-yin	She was of the view that the Administration should have taken proactive measures and planning in the light of the expected decline in S1 student population. The "3-2-1 proposal" had been put forward for EDB's consideration for over one year but no positive response had been given. Noting some parents' concerns that the "3-2-1 proposal" might reduce the chance of their children to get admitted to schools of their choice, the Administration should enhance communication with the parents. In addition to the "3-2-1 proposal", the Administration should also consider ways to improve the teacher manpower and teacher-to-class ratio in the long run.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
19.	S.K.H. Lam Kau Mow Secondary School	To cater for the learning diversity among students and the implementation of the NSS curriculum, many schools had already implemented school-based SCT or small group teaching. As a result, the number of teaching sessions and workload of teachers had been increased. According to the school, a number of teachers had decided to give up their full-time teaching posts and take up part-time posts instead so as to relieve their teaching load. Noting the adverse consequences of the mismatch when students from schools of a lower banding were allocated to schools of a higher banding, the school urged the Administration to take this opportunity to reduce the class size.
20.	Mr YEUNG Hok-hoi	He was concerned about the adverse consequences arising from the reduction in the number of classes. The Administration was urged to adopt the "3-2-1 proposal" and to reduce the secondary class size to 30 students.
21.	Kowloon City District School Principals' Liaison Committee	The deputation cautioned about the possibility of mismatch between the abilities of the students and the requirements of the schools in case Band 3 students were allocated to places in Band 2 and Band 1 schools. It expressed support for the suggestion to reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class such as the "3-2-1 proposal". The deputation was concerned that EDB's newspaper advertisement would convey a wrong message to parents that EDB's main concern was preserving schools and teaching posts. It urged SED to strengthen the communication with stakeholders.
22.	The Jockey Club Eduyoung College	The school supported the "3-2-1 proposal". The Administration should commit itself to upholding the quality of education instead of misdirecting its attention to preserving teaching posts.
23.	Mr TSE Hung-sum	The Administration had mentioned that the decline in S1 student population was a time-limited problem. If schools were closed due to the decline in S1 student population but were re-opened upon a rebound in S1 student population, considerable resources would be wasted in this process. The Administration should implement the "3-2-1 proposal" given that its implication on resources was limited.
24.	Federation of Parent-Teacher Association, Tai Po District [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(04)]	EDB should address the problem of mismatch when Band 3 students were allocated to schools of a higher banding. The deputation supported the "3-2-1 proposal" with a mechanism to allow flexible upward and downward adjustment in the number of students allocated to each S1 class.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
25.	Buddhist Wong Wan Tin College	The "3-2-1 proposal" merited serious consideration although some parents were concerned that the chance for their children to get admitted to Band 1 schools would be reduced if it was implemented across the board. EDB should explain to the parents that the banding of a school only reflected the academic performance of students admitted to the school and not the standard of the school itself.
26.	Kwun Tong Schools Liaison Committee	The deputation was supportive of the "3-2-1 proposal" and the EDB's relaxed criterion on allowing schools to operate two classes with 26 students.
27.	Tuen Mun District Secondary School Heads Association	The deputation's major concern was upholding the quality of education. The Administration was asked to implement a mechanism to allow flexible adjustment in the number of students allocated to each S1 class as the core measure, supplemented by the ancillary measure of relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes. It cautioned about the possibility of mismatch between the abilities of the students and the requirements of the schools when Band 3 students were allocated to places in Band 2 and Band 1 schools. At the same time, those schools with a high intake of Band 3 student and SEN students would face a high risk of closure.
28.	Mr WONG Tsz-ching	He was concerned that if the "3-2-1 proposal" was not adopted, Band 3 schools would be closed due to insufficient enrolment. When Band 3 students were allocated to schools of a higher banding, a mismatch between the students' abilities and the requirements of schools would bring about detrimental consequences to both the students and the schools.
29.	Mr AU Kin-kwan	He commented that the relief measures proposed by the Administration to prevent schools from closure due to insufficient student enrolment could not resolve the problems encountered by the education sector. The Administration should consider adopting the "3-2-1 proposal" which was the consensus of a large number of school principals.
30.	CCC Fung Leung Kit Memorial Secondary School	The school considered that the Administration's proposed relief measures would work against its objectives of preserving the stability and strength of schools and teachers. Even if the criterion for approving S1 classes was relaxed, schools would be provided with fewer resources and teaching posts would be abolished. Eventually, the stability of schools and teaching force would be jeopardized. The school asked the Administration to seriously consider adopting the "3-2-1 proposal" with a mechanism allowing the flexible upward and downward adjustment of the number of students allocated to each S1 class.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
31.	Caritas Tuen Mun Marden Foundation Secondary School	The school had encountered the problem of insufficient enrolment and the school principal and teachers had to conduct promotion activities in Lo Wu in order to recruit students. The Administration was urged to adopt a flexible mechanism to reduce gradually the number of students allocated to each S1 class. The school hoped that the Administration would deploy more resources to improve the quality of education rather than merely emphasizing the objectives of maintaining stability and strength of schools and teachers.
32.	Southern District Joint Schools Conference [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(05)]	Noting the decline in S1 student population, the deputation was concerned about the possible mismatch between the abilities of the students and the requirements of the schools when Band 3 students were allocated to schools of a higher banding. The adverse impact on schools could only be mitigated by reducing the number of students allocated to each S1 class. The deputation considered that reducing the number of classes of a school might have a labeling effect which would eventually lead to a drop in student enrolment.
33.	Hong Kong Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools Council [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(06)]	The deputation was supportive of the proposal to reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class, and allow district-based or school-based fine-tuning of the specific number of S1 places. The deputation did not agree with the application of across-the-board measures to DSS schools because the number of students admitted to DSS schools would have implications on the calculation of recurrent subsidy to the schools.
34.	The Church of Christ in China Kei Chi Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)108/12-13(02)]	The Administration was asked to reduce the size of each secondary class to 30 students, which was similar to the class size of Forms 6 and 7 of the old system. The school considered that the "3-2-1 proposal" would not involve additional funding because the funding provided to schools on the basis of the number of classes operated instead the number of students admitted.
35.	Subsidized Primary Schools Council	The deputation supported the "3-2-1 proposal" to reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class. The proportion of school places for the discretionary stage and the central allocation stage should remain unchanged. Noting the proposed relaxation of the criterion for approving S1 classes, the deputation commented that a school with 26 students in each level would hardly be capable of providing a wide range of school activities and learning environment for whole-person development. The Administration should have long term planning to prepare for significant fluctuations in primary and secondary student population.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
36.	Mr LEE Sai-kee	Since there were already untaken S1 places in the 2012-2013 school year, the number of untaken S1 places would increase in the next school year as a result of the decline in S1 student population. The Administration was asked to seriously consider the "3-2-1 proposal".
37.	Aplichau Kaifong Primary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(07)]	Several primary schools in the South district had been closed in the past few years due to the Administration's lack of long term planning to cope with the decline in student-age population. Since the existing class size was not conducive to catering for the needs of SEN students and learning diversity among students, the Administration should take the opportunity of decline in S1 student population to implement SCT rather than requiring schools to reduce classes or close down. The school cautioned that the possible mismatch between students' abilities and the requirements of schools would result in a decline in academic performance of Band 1 schools.
38.	Children Caring Network [LC Paper No. CB(4)96/12-13(08) & CB(4)108/12-13(03)]	From the point of view of parents, the deputation asked the Administration to provide a stable teaching and learning environment for teachers and students. The deputation was concerned that EDB had underestimated the number of schools that would be closed due to the decline in S1 student population. The Administration was asked to take the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to implement SCT.
39.	Federation of Parent-Teacher Associations (Kwai Tsing District) Ltd	From the parents' point of view, the deputation considered the existing banding of students and schools appropriate because students of different learning abilities could study at schools suitable for them. If schools admitting Band 3 students closed down, Band 3 students would be allocated to higher banding schools, resulting in the mismatch between the students' abilities and the requirements of schools. The deputation expressed its support for the "3-2-1 proposal".
40.	Mr LEE Ting-leung	Being a school principal, he urged EDB to adopt a mechanism of adjusting the number of students allocated to each S1 class. There was a need to reduce the class size, in particular at senior secondary levels, to 30 students, which was similar to the class size of Forms 6 and 7 in the old system. He stressed that the proposal to reduce the class size was not equivalent to implementing SCT.
41.	Mr SUM Sing-wah [LC Paper No. CB(4)108/12-13(04)]	He was concerned about the effectiveness of the relief measures proposed by the Administration. Noting the relaxed criterion for approving S1 classes, he cautioned that a school with only two classes at each level could hardly offer a wide range of elective subjects to students under the NSS curriculum. Teachers were concerned that if the experienced teachers left the profession under the early retirement scheme, there would be insufficient experienced teachers several years later when

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		there was a rebound in student population.
42.	Mr MAK Chi-keung	Citing the experience of Sha Tin district where students of lower banding had been allocated to Band 1 schools because school places exceeded the number of students, he expressed concern about the mismatch of students' abilities and the requirements of schools. He pointed out that the severe blow to schools arising from the reduction in the number of classes should not be underestimated. When a school reduced one class at each level, the school would altogether reduce six classes, as well as 12 teacher posts.
43.	Yan Chai Hospital Lan Chi Pat Memorial Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)108/12-13(05)]	According to the school, the teachers could hardly spare time to cater for the needs of students as they had to conduct activities during weekends and summer vacation to recruit students. The school supported the proposal to reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class.
44.	Mu Kuang English School	Being a Caput school, the school supported the "3-2-1 proposal". Noting that most of the schools had implemented school-based SCT at senior secondary levels for implementing NSS curriculum, it considered it necessary for EDB to officially endorse the reduction in class size.
45.	The Association of Hong Kong Chinese Middle Schools	The deputation urged EDB to consider the possible labeling effect on schools before launching any new policy. The proposed relief measures to relax the criterion for approving S1 classes would eventually bring about labeling effect on those schools that were allowed to operate two classes at each level. The deputation remarked that such a labeling effect would discourage student enrolment, resulting in the closure of these schools. The deputation also urged the Administration to study the implementation of SCT and measures to retain experienced teachers.