

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)319/12-13
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/HA

Panel on Home Affairs

Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 9 November 2012, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok (Deputy Chairman)
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members attending : Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Charles Peter MOK

**Public Officers : Item IV
attending**

Ms Florence HUI Hiu-fai, SBS, JP
Under Secretary for Home Affairs

Ms Elaine MAK Tse-ling
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Culture) 1

Miss WONG Yuet-wah
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Culture) 2

Ms Cynthia LIU Chiu-fun
Deputy Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Culture)

Item V

Mr TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Mr Jonathan McKinley, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2)

**Clerk in : Ms Alice LEUNG
attendance Chief Council Secretary (2) 2**

**Staff in : Miss Josephine SO
attendance Senior Council Secretary (2) 2**

Miss Jasmine TAM
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes
(LC Paper No. CB(2)144/12-13)**

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 October 2012 were confirmed.

Action

II. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting

2. Members noted that the following papers had been issued since the last meeting -

- (a) Letter dated 26 October 2012 from the Deputy Chairman to the Chairman on issues relating to the Lung Mei Beach project (LC Paper No. CB(2)150/12-13(01));
- (b) Chairman's reply to the letter from the Deputy Chairman dated 27 October 2012 (LC Paper No. CB(2)150/12-13(02));
- (c) Administration's information paper on the project proposal to upgrade the infrastructure works for West Kowloon Cultural District Phase 1 - design and site investigation to Category A (LC Paper No. CB(2)157/12-13(01));
- (d) A joint letter from Hon IP Kwok-him, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Steven HO, Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan and Hon Christopher CHUNG dated 2 November 2012 on issues relating to the Lung Mei Beach project (LC Paper No. CB(2)174/12-13(01)); and
- (e) Chairman's reply to the joint letter from Hon IP Kwok-him, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Steven HO, Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan and Hon Christopher CHUNG dated 5 November 2012 (LC Paper No. CB(2)174/12-13(02)).

3. Regarding the Administration's information paper referred to in paragraph 2(c) above, the Chairman said that there was no request from members for discussion of the project proposal at a Panel meeting. The Administration would submit the proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee and the Finance Committee for consideration in December 2012 and January 2013 respectively.

Issues relating to the Lung Mei Beach project

4. Referring to the joint letter signed by five members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong, including himself, referred to in paragraph 2(d) above, Mr IP Kwok-him said that the Panel on Home Affairs ("HA Panel") had been following up on the development of a bathing beach at Lung Mei since it was first proposed. Mr IP noted that, in the light of the recent concerns raised by some environmental concern groups, the Panel on Environmental Affairs

Action

("EA Panel") would discuss the item "Ecological impact arising from construction works as in the case of the Tai Po Lung Mei Beach project" at its meeting on 26 November 2012, and members of the HA Panel were invited to attend the meeting. In his view, it was more appropriate for the two Panels to hold a joint meeting to discuss the matter relating to the Lung Mei Beach project.

Admin

5. Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr Christopher CHUNG and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen supported the proposal for holding a joint meeting with the EA Panel to discuss issues relating to the Lung Mei Beach project. Mr WU said that the Administration should be requested to provide, in its discussion paper for the proposed joint Panel meeting, information on whether and what other options were available that could balance the needs of developing a public beach in Tai Po and ecological conservation.

6. Mr IP Kwok-him suggested that if possible, the EA Panel should be requested to consider holding of the proposed joint Panel meeting on 26 November 2012 at the time originally allocated for discussing the item "Ecological impact arising from construction works as in the case of the Tai Po Lung Mei Beach project" at its regular meeting.

7. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che said that as the matter had attracted wide concern, he anticipated that many other Members, in addition to members of the HA and EA Panels, would likely be interested in participating in the discussion. He considered that a separate session should be arranged for holding the joint Panel meeting.

8. The Chairman said that as members had different views on the meeting arrangements for the proposed joint Panel meeting, he would put the two proposals put forward respectively by Mr IP Kwok-him and Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che to vote. The voting results were: four members voted in favour of the proposal that the proposed joint Panel meeting should be scheduled to be held on a date other than the date of the EA's Panel meeting scheduled for 26 November 2012; and six members voted for the proposal to hold the proposed joint meeting on 26 November 2012 and to make use of the EA Panel's appointed meeting time for discussing the particular agenda item concerning the Tai Po Lung Mei Beach project. In concluding, the Chairman said that he would liaise with the Chairman of the EA Panel on the holding of the joint meeting.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairmen of the HA and EA Panels, the joint meeting would be held on Friday, 23 November 2012, at 8:30 am. The notice of the joint Panel meeting was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)176/12-13 on

Action

15 November 2012. At the request of the Administration and with the concurrence of the two Panel Chairmen, the joint Panel meeting was subsequently re-scheduled to 30 November 2012 at 9:00 am.)

III. Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)156/12-13(01) and (02))

9. The Chairman said that pursuant to the discussions at the informal meeting between himself/the Deputy Chairman and the Secretary for Home Affairs ("SHA") on 25 October 2012, the list of outstanding items for discussion by the Panel had been updated. Referring members to the two newly added items on "Remuneration level of District Council members" (item 19) and "Public consultation" (item 20), the Chairman advised that these issues were raised respectively by Mrs Regina IP and the Deputy Chairman at the meeting of the Panel on Constitutional Affairs held on 16 October 2012. As matters relating to these issues fell under the purview of the HA Panel, it was agreed that these two issues be referred to the HA Panel for follow-up. Members noted and did not raise any query on the list.

10. Members agreed to discuss the following two items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Friday, 14 December 2012, at 8:30 am -

- (a) Open bazaar in Tin Shui Wai; and
- (b) Sports Policy.

IV. Cultural work in the new term

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)156/12-13(03) and (04))

11. With the aid of powerpoint presentation, Under Secretary for Home Affairs ("USHA") briefed Members on the major cultural work of the new-term Government.

(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation material (Chinese version only) was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)187/12-13(01) on 9 November 2012.)

Proposed establishment of a cultural bureau

12. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that at the last Panel meeting, he had expressed his hope that the Administration would provide the Panel with the latest information on the proposed establishment of a cultural bureau, when

Action

briefing the Panel at this meeting on the cultural work of the new-term Government. Noting that there was no mentioning in the Administration's paper of the proposed establishment of a cultural bureau to take over policy responsibilities relating to cultural and arts development in Hong Kong, he enquired about the future direction of the Government in this regard.

13. In response, USHA advised that as the Chief Executive had announced earlier, the new-term Government had decided to hold the proposal of setting up a cultural bureau in abeyance for the time being. It should be noted that by continuously entrusting the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") with the tasks of arts and cultural development could ensure continuity and sustainability. HAB would capitalize on its existing network and continue to take every effort to foster co-operation with different organizations.

14. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed regret at the Government's decision of not taking forward the proposal of setting up a cultural bureau. Mr IP Kwok-him said that the HA Panel in the Fourth Legislative Council ("LegCo") had discussed the proposal of establishing a cultural bureau and members were generally of the view that a dedicated policy bureau would play a far more constructive role than HAB in arts and cultural development in Hong Kong. He hoped that the new-term Government would re-consider the proposal.

Formulation of a cultural policy

15. Mr Steven HO enquired whether the new-term Government's cultural policy covered the preservation and promotion of traditional cultures associated with Hong Kong's history as a fishing port and, if yes, initiatives implemented in the past or to be implemented in the future for supporting the development of traditional cultures in this specific area.

16. USHA responded that the objectives pursued by the new-term Government were, among others, to support the preservation and promotion of Hong Kong's traditional cultures. Its history as a fishing port was recognized as an integral part of the intangible cultural heritage ("ICH") to be preserved and protected. Some social practices, rituals and festive events manifesting the tradition of Hong Kong as a fishing port, such as Tin Hau Festival and Jiao Festival, were items/events of ICH which the Government had made and would continue to make an effort to preserve. The promotion, protection and transmission of this ICH could also be achieved through the featuring of different genres of performing arts, such as ballads and dance.

17. Mr Steven HO hoped that the Administration would step up its communication with the relevant sectors to enlist their support in the

Action

preservation and promotion of local fisherfolk culture while encouraging artistic creation and innovation. In his view, more focused promotion should be run to achieve greater effect. USHA took note of his views.

18. In response to Dr LAM Tai-fai's enquiry about the Administration's effort in preserving and promoting traditional cultures prevalent among local folks from Chaozhou and Fujian, USHA advised that as a customary/traditional festive event originated from Chaozhou, Yu Lan Ghost Festival was an item of ICH to which the Administration had attached much importance.

19. Mr Christopher CHUNG suggested that consideration should be given to organizing thematic arts festivals of international standards, so as to showcase Hong Kong's essence as an international cultural metropolis.

Admin

20. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the measures which the Administration would take to create an atmosphere and cultural environment of universal support, conducive to fostering the diversified and balanced development of culture and the arts. He requested the Administration to provide information on the total amount of resources allocated for cultural purposes, with a breakdown by major initiatives taken/to be implemented in the six major policy areas as set out in the powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

21. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che asked whether the new-term Government had consulted the relevant stakeholders, before finalizing the cultural policy. Sharing a similar concern, Dr Helena WONG considered that for policy formulation to be effective, it was important to gauge the views of different stakeholders, including the academia and the public.

22. USHA responded that the Government of the last term had consulted the public, the cultural sector and LegCo on the formulation of the cultural policy. The new-term Government would continue to gauge the views of the community on the policy with a view to enhancing the policy and measures. USHA stressed that the new-term Government observed a people-oriented principle, to foster the vibrancy and diversity of Hong Kong's cultures, to maintain artistic freedom and to enhance the protection of intellectual property. Adopting a holistic approach, the Government encouraged all sectors of the society to be involved and sought to establish partnership among the Government, the business community and the cultural sector.

Development of Cantonese Opera and other Xiqu in Hong Kong

23. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern about the development of

Action

Cantonese Opera and other Xiqu in Hong Kong, as well as the future of the Sunbeam Theatre. He asked whether the new-term Government would formulate specific measures to assist the Cantonese opera sector, including resolving the long standing problem of shortage of performance venues.

24. USHA responded that the Administration had implemented the following facilitating measures to promote the development of Cantonese Opera and other Xiqu -

- (a) the Cantonese Opera Development Fund ("CODF") was established in November 2005 to raise donations to support and fund programmes and activities on the study, promotion and development of Cantonese Opera. Since its establishment, CODF had raised over \$120 million;
- (b) the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") had been providing additional time slots for staging Cantonese opera performances at the major performing arts venues of LCSD by implementing special venue hiring measures, such as the "Venue Partnership Scheme". Under this Scheme, four venues, including the Sha Tin Town Hall, the Tuen Mun Town Hall, the Yuen Long Town Hall and the Yau Ma Tei Theatre, would allocate dedicated time slots for performances by the Cantonese opera sector;
- (c) the new cultural facilities provided by LCSD in 2012-2013, including the Yau Ma Tei Theatre (with 300 seats and opened in July 2012) and the Ko Shan Theatre Annex Building (a medium theatre with 600 seats expected to be completed in 2013), were dedicated venues for the development of Cantonese opera. Together with the existing facilities, such as the Grand Theatre of the Hong Kong Cultural Centre, the additional performance venues under planning/construction would provide more performing venues of different scales to cater for the development needs of Cantonese opera; and
- (d) to facilitate spectators travelling to and from the performance venues, there were shuttle bus services for the more remote venues.

25. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan held the view that in addition to the development of Cantonese opera, the Administration should consider providing more facilities and support for band performance and for band lovers to participate in such activities.

Action

Promotion of public art in the community

26. Mr IP Kwok-him noted that as an effort to bring art to the community, public art projects were launched with sculptures installed and art works displayed in public spaces. In his view, the Government should make more efforts in taking forward initiatives to bring art closer to the community, by showcasing in the city more sculptures and art works. Consideration should also be given to devoting more resources to the promotion of public art in the community. Mr Christopher CHUNG shared similar view, adding that in taking forward the initiative of promoting public art in the community, the Administration should set a target number of art works to be displayed throughout the territory.

27. USHA responded that the Government's work in promoting public art in the community were many folds. Over the years, the Art Promotion Office of LCSD had been actively working with different organizations, including government departments, cultural and arts groups and private organizations, in promoting public art. Programmes organized included Artists in the Neighbourhood Scheme, Public Art Project - Tamar and Art@Government Buildings, placing public art works at government buildings and public facilities; and Park Déco Scheme and ArtAlive@Park, injecting art elements into more public spaces in Hong Kong and bringing art to the community. LCSD was about to launch the new Art@Government Buildings programme, so as to bring art elements to more government buildings. LCSD had also partnered with the MTR Corporation Limited to call for artwork proposals for the new railway lines so as to provide a more aesthetic environment for passengers.

Entrenching culture and the arts in the community

28. Mr Christopher CHUNG enquired whether more resources would be allocated to enable the 18 District Councils ("DCs") to take up a much more active role in the organization and promotion of community arts programmes/activities in their respective districts. In response, USHA said that it was all along the aim of the Government to develop a closer partnership with the local community, the business and the cultural sectors in promotion of culture and the arts. The 18 DCs, as important partners of the Administration, would be enabled to take up an active role in promoting culture with a district flavour. In this connection, the Entertainment Office of LCSD would continue to assist the 18 DCs in organizing local free cultural and entertainment programmes in the districts each year. LCSD would provide professional advice and assistance in other cultural and entertainment programmes planned and organized by DCs, such as district arts festivals and cultural activities that featured local characteristics of individual districts.

Action

29. Mr Frankie YICK urged the Administration to explore more performance venues and ensure optimal utilization of the existing venue facilities before the completion of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") Project, as this would help contain ticket prices at affordable levels to encourage audience development. In order to promote performing arts to the general public, the Administration should allocate more resources to secondary schools for their organization of co-curricular activities to enhance students' knowledge and interest in arts and abilities of arts appreciation.

30. USHA responded that -

- (a) LCSD had been providing performing spaces for arts groups other than the performance venues operated by LCSD, enabling arts groups to build their audiences in the community. So far, LCSD had explored 17 non-LCSD-operated venues for holding performances. It would continue to identify other venues to support the performances of various arts groups. Meanwhile, a conversion project at the former Royal Hong Kong Yacht Club (a Grade 2 historic building) located at Oil Street in North Point was being carried out. The building would be converted into an art space and would open in mid-2013, providing a platform for training of visual arts talents and for artists and collaborators to meet up for artistic creation and exchanges; and
- (b) at the school level, LCSD would strengthen various arts education programmes to nurture students' interest in the arts, (e.g. the "School Culture Day Scheme", "School Arts Animateur Scheme", "Arts Experience Scheme for Senior Secondary Students", "Let's Enjoy Cantonese Opera in Bamboo Theatre" and "Performing Arts Criticism Project for Senior Secondary Students", etc). In the 2012-2013 academic year, LCSD would introduce a "New Synergy Arts Animateur Pilot Scheme", aiming at providing advanced training courses for students who had previously enrolled in composition or script-writing training programmes under the "School Arts Animateur Scheme" to further cultivate their knowledge in the arts.

31. The Chairman suggested that to help ease the problem of shortage of performance venues, the Administration should consider collaborating with the school sector to arrange for the use of vacant venues/facilities at schools by art groups. In response, USHA said that the Administration would keep an open mind on any proposals for addressing the venue shortage problem.

Action

Admin

32. Ms Starry LEE considered that the Administration should conduct a study to assess the magnitude of the problem of shortage of performance venues and ascertain the needs of various arts groups regarding the provision of additional performance venues. Short, medium and long-term measures should be mapped out to address the problem. She requested the Administration to provide a written response to her views and suggestions after the meeting.

Strengthening the publicity and promotion of the arts

33. Mr Frankie YICK enquired whether a dedicated team would be set up to carry out the publicity and promotion initiatives for arts and cultural development in Hong Kong. USHA replied that HAB worked in close collaboration with LCSD, the business community and the cultural sector in the promotion of arts and cultural development.

34. Mr YIU Si-wing suggested that the Administration should make reference to the experience of Macau in the publicity and promotion of traditional cultures and arts to tourists. In his view, the Administration should step up its co-operation with the Hong Kong Tourist Association as well as the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong on the promotion to tourists of ICH and museums.

35. USHA responded that apart from actively working on the project of creating a cultural and arts channel to promote cultural and arts activities through multi-media channels, the Administration would step up co-operation with various sectors for the purpose of achieving the objectives of the cultural policy.

Support for small and medium arts groups/organizations

36. Mr IP Kwok-him and Dr LAM Tai-fai were concerned about the inadequacy of support provided by the Administration to small and medium arts groups. Dr LAM considered that the new-term Government should come up with more concrete measures to facilitate the long-term and sustainable development of small and medium arts groups and the nurturing of budding artists. Mr IP sought information on the amount of provision used in supporting the small and medium arts groups.

37. USHA responded that -

- (a) the Administration would continue to support the development of small and medium arts groups and nurturing of budding artists through the Hong Kong Arts Development Council ("HKADC").

Action

In 2011-2012 alone, HKADC subsidized over 330 arts groups or arts practitioners in their creative pursuits, including 39 small and medium arts groups benefiting from HKADC's One-year/Two-year Grant Scheme with a total funding of some \$25.42 million. HKADC had also continued to implement a variety of projects with a view to identifying promising budding artists;

- (b) HAB made use of the annual investment returns (around \$60 million annually) generated from the Arts and Sport Development Fund (Arts Portion) to subsidize the long-term development of culture and the arts. Apart from granting an enhanced provision of \$30 million to HKADC, the Administration had introduced the Arts Capacity Development Funding Scheme ("ACDFS") under which around \$30 million was to be disbursed annually to support large scale and cross-year arts and cultural initiatives/activities, so as to enhance capacity development of promising arts groups and arts practitioners. The Administration would consider advice given by the Advisory Committee on Arts Development and keep on enhancing ACDFS from time to time; and
- (c) in the 2011-2012 financial year, LCSD hosted approximately 4 100 performances and activities, and the provision used in supporting the small and medium arts groups was around \$98 million. Building on the existing arrangements, LCSD would further enhance collaboration with the small and medium arts groups as well as individual arts practitioners. Through presenting/sponsoring year-round cultural presentations and arts festivals, enhancing the Venue Partnership Scheme, organizing free cultural and entertainment activities, and strengthening audience building and arts education, the Administration would provide small and medium arts groups with resources and performance venues, and encourage them to create, experiment, perform, share and conduct arts education activities, so that they might have a broad based development.

38. The Chairman was of the view that the funding support provided to the arts sector through HKADC and Arts and Sport Development Fund was far from adequate, having regard to the increase in the number of art groups receiving subsidy therefrom and the rise of the cost of living index in recent years.

Action

39. USHA reiterated that the new-term Government would provide support to small and medium arts groups through different channels. Apart from the total annual provision which amounted to around \$200 million, the Government would further enhance the collaboration with small and medium arts groups as well as individual arts practitioners through enhancing the Venue Partnership Scheme. HKADC had also launched the Internship Schemes and the Cultural Internship Scheme, which respectively sponsored the engagement of budding and promising art workers by arts groups to take up work attachments at local arts groups and overseas institutions.

40. Mr WU Chi-wai said that in taking forward the initiatives to revitalize industrial buildings, the Administration had stifled the growth of some local arts groups. He considered that apart from providing adequate funding to small and medium arts groups, the Administration should formulate suitable support measures to facilitate their sustainable development. USHA responded that the Administration had all along maintained close contact with local arts groups, and there were discussions among policy bureaux on measures to support medium and small arts groups.

41. In response to Mr Christopher CHUNG's enquiry on whether and what measures would be taken by the Administration to help local arts groups open up overseas or the Mainland markets, USHA advised that fostering external cultural exchanges and co-operation was one of the major works of the new-term Government. So far, the Administration had signed Memoranda of Understanding on Cultural Cooperation with 13 countries. In the future, it would further strengthen cultural co-operation and exchanges with other countries and neighbouring regions, including the Mainland, Taiwan and other countries in Southeast Asia. In addition, it would promote overseas performances of Hong Kong's cultural and performing arts groups and join in the effort to bring Chinese culture to the international stage.

Other issues discussed

42. Responding to Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che's enquiry about talent development initiatives for persons with disabilities ("PWDs"), USHA advised that LCSD frequently organized/sponsored various performing arts programmes that facilitated the integration of PWDs in the society. For example, Theatre of the Silence was invited to stage drama performances in 2009, 2011 and 2012, and to participate in the 2011 "Community Cultural Ambassador Scheme", while the Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong ("ADAHK") participated in the 2008 and 2010 "Community Cultural Ambassador Scheme". LCSD's Art Promotion Office had also jointly organized "ArtAlive@Park 2012 - Joyful Dance Fusion" with ADAHK. LCSD was now planning to introduce a pilot programme to offer sign

Action

language translation for suitable dramas in 2013-2014. Meanwhile, public libraries were also actively exploring suitable extension activities, such as seminars and exhibitions, to facilitate the integration of PWDs in the society.

Admin

43. Citing the case of a renowned artist of Cantonese opera who was not qualified to register as an individual elector for the sports, performing arts, culture and publication functional constituency ("FC"), Ms Cyd HO expressed concern that art groups/bodies not listed as electors for the sports, performing arts, culture and publication FC in the Legislative Council Ordinance (Cap 542) were not eligible to vote. She considered it unreasonable and inappropriate for the Administration to impose restriction on the right to vote. She requested the Administration to provide an information paper after the meeting explaining whether it would review the eligibility of electors in the sports, performing arts, culture and publication FC.

44. USHA responded that as election-related issues fell under the purview of the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau ("CMAB"), she would relay Ms Cyd HO's views to CMAB.

V. Development of the Multi-purpose Sports Complex at Kai Tak
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)156/12-13(05) and (06))

45. At the invitation of the Chairman, SHA advised that the Administration had completed an initial Technical Feasibility Study on the Multi-purpose Sports Complex ("MPSC") at Kai Tak and was now considering the procurement and financing options for the project. Although a decision on the procurement and financing plan had yet to be reached, the Administration, in the light of the recent speculation and wide public concerns over the development of MPSC, would like to brief Members on the latest position regarding MPSC at the earliest opportunity.

46. With the aid of powerpoint presentation, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2) ("DSHA") briefed Members on the background to the development of MPSC at Kai Tak, as well as the proposed scope, facilities and implementation plan of the project.

(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the Powerpoint presentation material was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)187/12-13(02) on 9 November 2012.)

(Members agreed to extend the meeting by 15 minutes.)

Action

Inclusion of a MPSC in Kai Tak Development ("KTD")

47. Dr LAM Tai-fai was delighted to note that the Administration had not shelved the development of MPSC. He urged the Administration to speed up the planning and development processes, so as to ensure the early completion of the project. He said that in 2010, when the Administration planned to bid to host the 2023 Asian Games, he was in opposition to the proposal having regard to the shortage of sports venues/facilities within the territory that could meet international standards of hosting large-scale sports events. With the anticipated commissioning of MPSC in 2019-2020, he enquired whether the Administration would re-consider the feasibility for Hong Kong to host the Asian Games.

48. In response, SHA advised that according to the project plan, MPSC would include high quality sports facilities that would alleviate Hong Kong's shortage of venues suitable for hosting major international sports events, as well as sports venues and open space for the community. The Administration recognized the importance of having the full support of all relevant parties, including LegCo Members, before rendering support to the Sports Federation and Olympic Committee of Hong Kong, China in bidding for the hosting of the Asian Games. The Administration would widely consult the community on Hong Kong's hosting of the Asian Games should such a proposal come under consideration again.

49. Mr Albert CHAN said that he had all along been opposing the development of MPSC at Kai Tak. In his view, the Administration had made a serious mistake in including MPSC in the approved Kai Tak Outline Zoning Plan, as the site selected for the construction of MPSC was not put to optimal use to address the prevailing problem of land shortage for residential and community developments in Southeast Kowloon. He pointed out that in overseas countries, many large-scale sports complexes were located further away from the city centre. He cautioned that it was essential for a 50 000-seat stadium designed for the hosting of major international sports and entertainment events be connected with a safe, efficient and reliable public transport system, the absence of which would render the hosting of large-scale events in MPSC a potential threat to public security. Mr CHAN said that Members belonging to People Power would object to the financial proposal of the project when funding was sought from LegCo.

50. The Chairman said that the sports sector was concerned whether and how the Administration would ensure that the proposed facilities for MPSC would meet the needs and aspirations of both the sports sector and the community at large and be brought up to the requisite standards for hosting major international sports events.

Action

51. SHA reiterated that the proposed MPSC would be a major sports park for Hong Kong people, with a mixture of high quality public sports facilities that would alleviate the shortage of local venues for hosting major international sports events. As the proposed MPSC at Kai Tak would be Hong Kong's largest ever sports project, the implementation of the project would require careful planning. SHA further advised that since its establishment in 2005, the Sports Commission had commented regularly on the proposed facilities, financing arrangements and other aspects of the project. During the design and planning stage, the Administration would consult the sports sector, various stakeholders and members of the public on the detailed layout and design of the facilities to ensure that the sports complex would meet the needs of the sports sector and the community.

52. In response to Mr WU Chi-wai's enquiry about whether the proposed MPSC would be equipped with special fields/facilities to support elite sports, SHA said that the new sports venues/facilities for MPSC under planning would complement the Government's policy to promote sport in the community and support elite sports. The Administration noted that there had been calls for the provision of more sports venues for use by the school sector, it would take this into account when taking forward the comprehensive planning of the project.

53. While expressing support for the proposed development of MPSC at Kai Tak, Mr Frankie YICK was concerned whether the proposed MPSC would be connected with a safe, efficient and reliable public transport system that could cope with the large number of spectators seeking access to the facilities therein, in particular the main stadium. DSHA advised that the Shatin to Central Link under construction was a territory-wide strategic railway project. Two of its stations would be in the close vicinity of KTD, making it a desirable location for the development of MPSC.

54. Ms Claudia MO expressed concern about the inadequacy of the Government's support for the promotion of sports among ethnic minority children. She said that while cricket was a popular sport among many South Asians, Hong Kong had a shortage of public cricket pitches. She asked whether the proposed development of MPSC would help address this problem.

55. DSHA responded that the proposed MPSC would be a major sports park for Hong Kong people, with a mixture of high quality public sports facilities to accommodate various activities, including cricket.

56. In response to Ms Claudia MO's further enquiry, DSHA advised that over the past two decades, many new stadiums around the world, including

Action

those in Singapore, Japan and Melbourne, had been built with a retractable roof to cater for all weather operation. The retractable roof would allow for the holding of major international sports and cultural events under all weather conditions and could contain possible noise nuisance from events such as large-scale concerts.

Financial arrangements of the MPSC project

57. The Deputy Chairman enquired about the details of the recommendations of the consultancy study commissioned by the Administration in 2011 to look into the construction and financing options for MPSC and asked whether the Administration had any plan to publish the consultancy report. According to his understanding, the Administration had conducted a preliminary financial feasibility study on MPSC some 10 years ago, and there had been suggestions that the MPSC project would not be financially viable without government funding. It was the Administration's initial thinking to modify the land use of the Wan Chai Sport Ground from the provision of community or communal facilities to industrial/business or residential use, and the proceeds from the sale of the land concerned would help generate funding for public investment for the MPSC project. He asked whether this was still an option under consideration by the Administration. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che expressed concern about the financial viability of the MPSC project and was worried that the project might turn out to be a white elephant if the Government failed to maximize the use of facilities provided in the complex.

58. SHA responded that -

- (a) the consultancy study was yet to be finalized. The Administration would revert to the Panel on the findings of the study and make public the consultancy report, once ready;
- (b) the purpose of developing MPSC at Kai Tak was to make the complex accessible to the public, so as to encourage wider participation in sport and to promote sport at all levels. The Administration would study in detail the recommendations of the consultant when taking forward the comprehensive planning of the project. The Administration would co-ordinate this project with other infrastructural projects within KTD and continue to consult the sports sector, DCs and members of the public on the procurement, detailed planning and design, and management of MPSC, so as to ensure that the needs of the sports sector and the public could be met;

Action

- (c) as a preliminary suggestion, the consultancy study recommended that the "Design-Build-Operate" ("DBO") approach be adopted for the project since it would help ensure the most effective delivery from the planning, design and construction stages through to the long-term operation of MPSC. DBO was a common approach both locally and worldwide for delivering large infrastructure projects, and was normally achieved by the commissioning of a consortium comprising corporations in various disciplines to take up the projects; and
- (d) at present, the Wan Chai Sport Ground, near the Convention and Exhibition Centre, was heavily used by the school sector for holding sport events. The Administration envisaged that upon the completion of the MPSC project by 2019-2020, the new major venues at MPSC would be able to meet the anticipated need for such venues in Hong Kong. The Hong Kong Stadium at So Kon Po could still remain a sports venue and become a major facility for schools and residents on Hong Kong Island, although the Government would need to review the use of the stadium, including whether there was scope for it to replace the Wan Chai Sport Ground, thereby freeing up the site of the current Wan Chai Sports Ground for alternative use. The Administration would develop a suitable proposal after undertaking a comprehensive review.

59. Noting the consultancy study's recommendation that a combination of government and private financing might be appropriate for the project, Mr Frankie YICK sought information as to whether the consultant had considered various financing options for the sports complex before coming to the view that the model of public-private partnership ("PPP") was the most preferable option. He stressed that the construction cost and the estimated revenue/expenditure should be taken into account in assessing the financial viability of any project.

60. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that he was pleased to see that the Administration had stood firm on the development of MPSC at Kai Tak notwithstanding the recent controversy over the matter. Noting that the consultant commissioned by the Administration in 2011 had suggested that the PPP model be deployed for the proposed MPSC, he expressed grave concern about the possible domination of MPSC by big consortia and the transfer of benefits from Government to business if such a financing arrangement was adopted for the project. Citing the Western Harbour Crossing as an example, he called on the Administration to consider seriously the propriety of adopting the PPP model.

Action

61. SHA and DSHA responded that the consultancy study had made a preliminary recommendation that in order to maximize efficiency and innovation, a combination of government and private financing would be appropriate for the MPSC project. However, the Administration had yet to decide on whether to propose the adoption of a PPP model. The Administration was still considering the findings of the consultancy and would study the recommendations of the consultant, in consultation with the Sports Commission and the relevant bureaux, when taking forward the project.

Utilization of sports facilities

62. Responding to Mr WU Chi-wai's enquiry as to whether the Administration would take the opportunity to review the utilization of other sports facilities, such as the Hong Kong Coliseum, SHA said that at present, the demand for using the Hong Kong Coliseum was high. As the seating capacity of the main stadium of the proposed MPSC was 50 000, far more than that of the Hong Kong Coliseum, they were positioned to achieve different objectives. In the face of a shortage of venues suitable for hosting major international sports events and for use by the community, the Administration would continue to strive for further provision of sports facilities in accordance with its policy objectives for sports development and to address the needs of residents in individual districts.

63. Mr Frankie YICK and Mr IP Kin-yuen shared similar concern about the rental level of sports facilities of MPSC. Mr IP enquired about the measures to be taken by the Administration to ensure the utilization of the new venues and sport facilities of MPSC in the most effective manner, and whether the Administration would adopt a tiered fee structure allowing use of the venues/facilities by local sports teams/associations at lower and affordable rates.

64. SHA and DSHA responded that -

- (a) to enhance utilization of the proposed sports facilities at MPSC and to optimize their use, the Government would continue to promote school sports, public sports and elite sports;
- (b) it should be noted that MPSC would be a major sports park for Hong Kong people, with a mixture of high quality public sports facilities, open space, park features and retail and dining outlets, which would be open to the public throughout the day, seven days a week; and

Action

- (c) the proposed facilities for MPSC would, apart from providing a 50 000-seat stadium for the hosting of major international sports and entertainment events, include a public sports ground with permanent seating for 5 000 spectators which would be a venue for athletics training and competition, and football and rugby matches.

VI. Any other business

Setting up of a subcommittee to monitor the implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project

65. The Chairman said that at the Panel meeting on 16 October 2012, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che advised members that in the Fourth LegCo, a joint subcommittee had been formed under the HA Panel and the Panel on Development to monitor the implementation of the WKCD Project. As the WKCD Project was still in progress, there might be a need for establishing a similar committee in the Fifth LegCo to continue the monitoring work.

66. As Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che had left the meeting early, the Chairman proposed and members agreed that the subject be discussed at the next Panel meeting to be held on 14 December 2012.

67. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:42 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 December 2012