

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)522/12-13

(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 4 January 2013, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** :
- Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy Chairman)
 - Hon James TO Kun-sun
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
 - Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
 - Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
 - Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
 - Hon CHAN Han-pan
 - Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
 - Hon TANG Ka-piu
 - Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
 - Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen
- Member attending** : Hon KWOK Wai-keung
- Members absent** :
- Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing (Acting)

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing
(Transport)

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)

Mr NG Tak-wing
Chief Engineer/Railway Development
Highways Department

Mr LEUNG Kin-man
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing (Acting)

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing
(Transport)

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item IV

Mr C L LEUNG
Chief E&M Engineer
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager - Projects & Property
Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI
Head of Operating - East Region
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Mark CUZNER
Project Manager - SIL Civil
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item V

Mr Wilfred YEUNG
Chief Architect
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager - Projects & Property
Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Franco KWONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Clara LO
Legislative Assistant (1)9

Action

- I Confirmation of minutes**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)349/12-13 - Minutes of meeting on
30 November 2012)

The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Mr TANG KA-piu proposed an amendment to the draft minutes of the meeting on 30 November 2012.

(**Post-meeting note:** The amended draft minutes were issued vide LC Paper No. CB(1)402/12-13 on 10 January 2013. As no further comments was received, the minutes were taken as confirmed on 17 January 2013.)

II Information papers issued since last meeting

3. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since the last meeting.

III Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 1 March 2013

(LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(02) - List of follow-up actions)

4. Members agreed to discuss "the Review and Update of Railway Development Strategy 2000" ("RDS 2000") at the next regular meeting to be held on Friday, 1 March 2013, at 10:45 am.

IV New railway system for the South Island Line (East)

(LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(03) - MTRCL's paper on new railway system for the South Island Line (East)

LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(04) - Paper on the South Island Line (East) (Background brief))

5. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed the Subcommittee on the new railway system for the South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)"). Members noted that the MTRCL would introduce the Fully Automatic Operation ("FAO") for SIL(E) under which preparation for train service as well as door opening and closing would be fully automatic under the control of Operations Control Centre ("OCC") with preset commands. MTRCL stated that FAO had been

Action

commonly adopted in some of the railway lines in many overseas cities, such as Paris, London, Barcelona, Vancouver, Detroit, Seoul, Taipei, etc. The Disneyland Resort Line was also operated under FAO which had been performing satisfactorily since the service commenced in 2005.

6. Members in general expressed concern on the passenger safety during emergency under the operation of FAO system. The Administration assured members that before the commissioning of SIL(E), it would request the MTRCL to provide detailed contingency plans to handle service disruptions for the review of the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department.

7. Having noted that SIL(E) would be operated with a three-car configuration and the initial headway would be three to four minutes, members expressed concern that the passenger handling capacity would be insufficient. Members enquired the feasibility of replacing the three-car configuration by four-car configuration. MTRCL replied that the three-car configuration was built to suit the geographical constrain, provide train service with headway similar to urban lines, and operate efficient train service.

8. Members also expressed views on other issues including the depot development project at Wong Chuk Hang, energy conservation design of SIL(E), provision of facilities at SIL(E) stations, retrofitting of platform screen doors/automatic platform gates and so on.

9. Chairman proposed that a visit to the OCC should be arranged for members to observe and understand the features of FAO before the commissioning of SIL(E) in 2015. Members and the Administration agreed.

V Art programme in MTR stations

(LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(05) - MTRCL's paper on arts programme in MTR stations)

10. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, the MTRCL briefed the Subcommittee on the approach and updates of MTR station art programme.

11. Members noted that the objectives of MTR station art programme were to enhance travelling environment, showcase the diversity of cultural and historical characteristics of local districts, help to promote the

Action

appreciation of art in Hong Kong, and offer a channel for local artists to exhibit their talent.

12. While appreciating the efforts made by MTRCL in promotion of art and enhancement of the space inside stations, members proposed that MTRCL should also consider –

- (a) incorporating the elements of art into the architectural appearances of stations and viaducts and also functional objects in stations such as benches or signage;
- (b) providing a less commercial environment inside stations by reducing the number of advertising light boxes at MTR stations to give more space for display of art pieces;
- (c) retrofitting the electronic information system in all train compartments to provide real-time information as well as cultural and historical characteristics of local districts;
- (d) using the concourse and trackside television screens to promote the activities or programmes of local art-related organizations free of charge;
- (e) considering the display of other forms of art, apart from visual art; and
- (f) formulating a policy to replenish/replace the art pieces on display under the programme.

VI Any other business

13. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 4 January 2013, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000110 – 000149	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Draft minutes of the meeting on 30 November 2012.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000150 – 000152	Chairman	Subcommittee members noted that no information paper had been issued since last meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 1 March 2013</i>			
000153 – 000309	Chairman	Chairman advised that the proposed discussion item of the meeting to be held on 1 March 2013 was "Review and Update of Railway Development Strategy 2000" ("RDS 2000"). This item involved a number of proposals of extensions of existing railway lines. To allow more time for the Subcommittee to discuss this item, there would not be any other discussion item.	
000310 – 000325	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu	Regarding the minutes of the meeting on 30 November 2012, Mr TANG Ka-piu proposed an amendment to include the proposed extension of Tung Chung Line in the list of items to be discussed by the Subcommittee. The Clerk was requested to follow up.	Clerk
000326 – 000400	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested the Administration to provide a report on recent MTR service performance as soon as possible.	
<i>Agenda Item IV – New railway system for the South Island Line (East)</i>			
000401 – 002200	Chairman Administration MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)	Briefing and Powerpoint presentation by the Administration and MTRCL on the South Island Line (East) (SIL(E)) Railway System (LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(03)).	
002201 – 002750	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN MTRCL	Mr Michael TIEN's enquired – (a) whether fail-safe device was available to ensure passenger safety, given the lack of manual override system in Fully Automatic Operations (FAO); and (b) the minimum headway of SIL(E), and whether it could be enhanced to cope with future traffic demand. The MTRCL's responded that – (a) the railway system of SIL(E) adopted the fail-safe	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>design that train operations would be suspended immediately if component or system failures were detected. The train movement safety was also guaranteed by automatic train protection signalling system;</p> <p>(b) the Operations Control Centre ("OCC") would continuously monitor the train operations in real time and take contingency measures when necessary; and</p> <p>(c) SIL(E) would be operated with a three-car configuration and the initial headway was three to four minutes. Consideration had been given to the population growth in the Southern District and patronage forecast. If necessary, the headway could be reduced to two minutes.</p>	
002751 – 003301	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu MTRCL	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu shared the view of Mr Michael TIEN and expressed concern that the passenger handling capacity of SIL(E) might be insufficient, in particular during the peak demand period at the Ocean Park Station. Besides, he enquired about the provision of basic facilities at the SIL(E) stations, such as toilets and breast feeding rooms, as well as disabled facilities. He was also concerned about the liaison work between MTRCL and the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Jockey Club Rehabilitation Complex (JCRC) to minimize the impact of noise made by SIL(E) on JCRC.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that –</p> <p>(a) consideration had been given to the travelling pattern of the Southern District at the planning stage of SIL(E);</p> <p>(b) toilets and disabled facilities would be provided at SIL(E) stations. Further assistance would be provided subject to individual's needs; and</p> <p>(c) since the planning stage of SIL(E), it had regularly communicated with JCRC to consult their views on alignment design and construction works.</p> <p>In response to Mr TANG Ka-piu's further enquiries, the MTRCL advised that public toilets would be built inside SIL(E) stations. The depot development project at Wong Chuk Hang (WCH) had entered into the stage of drafting of the master layout plan after the consultation with the relevant District Council and stakeholders over the past few years.</p>	
003302 – 003814	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiries –</p> <p>(a) the feasibility to replace three-car trains with</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	<p>four-car trains, if the capacity of SIL(E) was saturated; and</p> <p>(b) the possibility to build an extension of SIL(E) from South Horizons to Wah Fu Estate, Wah Kwai Estate and Cyberport.</p> <p>The Administration advised that during the review and update of RDS 2000, public consultation exercises would be conducted to seek views from the public on the proposals of extensions of existing railway lines, including the South Island Line (West) ("SIL(W)") project.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that the area along the rail alignment in the Southern District was densely populated with limited space available for accommodating railway stations and associated facilities. By operating a medium capacity railway system, SIL(E) was expected to meet the transport needs of the commuters in the Southern District. Its stations and associated facilities would be of a smaller scale so as to allow more flexibility for alignment planning and station design. As a result, stations could be built in the heart of the densely populated areas to better meet the needs of commuters.</p> <p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern that the construction of SIL(W) might increase the passenger flow of SIL(E). The MTRCL advised that when the patronage forecast of SIL(E) was made, the passenger flow to be arising from SIL(W) had been taken into account.</p>	
003815 – 004324	Chairman Deputy Chairman MTRCL	<p>While appreciating the energy conservation design concept of SIL(E), Deputy Chairman enquired –</p> <p>(a) what contingency measures would be taken, if a train failure occurred inside a tunnel section; and</p> <p>(b) how the design of viaduct section of SIL(E) could minimize the noise nuisance to residents nearby.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that –</p> <p>(a) if a train failure occurred inside tunnel, OCC would use remote recovery to resume train operations. If not successful, OCC would control the successive train to push the train concerned to enter the next station. If necessary, station staff would arrange the evacuation of passengers by rescue train; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL would adopt appropriate measures to reduce noise generated by running trains, including regular grinding of rails and wheels and constructing</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>noise barriers. For the noise generated by other sources such as traction motor, acoustic silencers would be installed.</p>	
004325 – 004814	<p>Chairman Mrs Regina IP Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mrs Regina IP enquired about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the progress/plan of the redevelopment projects of Wah Fu Estate and Wah Kwai Estate; (b) the extension of the Island Line to Siu Sai Wan; and (c) the progress of the WCH development project. <p>The Administration and MTRCL advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the second stage of public consultation exercise of RDS 2000 would cover the SIL(W) and the extension of the Island Line to Siu Sai Wan. The Administration would consult the views of the Subcommittee in March 2013; (b) the Administration had yet to finalize any redevelopment plan of Wah Fu Estate and Wah Kwai Estate; and (c) railway works of SIL(E) were in progress, whereas the depot development project at WCH had entered the stage of drafting of the master layout plan. 	
004815 – 005400	<p>Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed the following concerns –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) both Wah Fu Estate and Wah Kwai Estate were aged estates, the redevelopment works had to be carried out sooner or later. The three-car configuration could not cope with the future traffic demand; (b) more efforts should be made by MTRCL to reduce the noise nuisance caused by running trains; and (c) evacuation of passengers stranded inside tunnel would be very difficult if a catastrophic incident occurred. <p>The MTRCL advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) OCC would closely monitor train conditions and in case of emergency could communicate with passengers by making public announcement through the Public Address system on trains. Train service could be resumed via reset of train and automatic recovery supported by control from OCC without reliance on manual control on train; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) there were multiple levels of back-up systems to ensure the effective communication between OCC and passengers.</p> <p>Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed worry about the reliability of the back-up systems.</p>	
005401 – 010035	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai MTRCL	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai expressed views and concerns –</p> <p>(a) given that there was an increase in the number of service disruptions in Disneyland Resort Line, it was not convincing that FAO could improve system reliability;</p> <p>(b) whether the windows of train compartments could be opened to maintain ventilation in case of service disruptions;</p> <p>(c) whether the energy conservation design of SIL(E) could be applied to other railway lines; and</p> <p>(d) air ventilation at platform was adversely affected by installation of platform screen doors at existing stations.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that –</p> <p>(a) the trains of SIL(E) would be equipped with back-up systems to ensure the operation of ventilation system during service disruptions. Some windows of train compartments could be opened;</p> <p>(b) consideration would be given to introducing the energy conservation design of SIL(E) to older stations under renovation and new railway lines as appropriate;</p> <p>(c) having studied the experience in operating Disneyland Resort Line and relevant overseas experience, MTRCL had reviewed the system design and operational procedures to enhance its reliability; and</p> <p>(d) it would retrofit platform screen doors at underground stations and automatic platform gates at aboveground and at-grade stations. At underground stations, trains in motion could still produce piston effect and drive fresh air from outside into the tunnel through ventilation shafts.</p>	
010036 – 010602	Chairman Mr Gary FAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN expressed views and enquired –</p> <p>(a) the possibility of introduction of four-car configuration;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) whether the proposed SIL(W) project would adopt three-car configuration;</p> <p>(c) whether other railway lines were required to adopt FAO to increase the train frequency to a headway of two minutes;</p> <p>(d) consideration should be given that the aboveground and at-grade stations with island platform design, such as Ngau Tau Kok Station and Kwun Tong Station, should be retrofitted with platform screen doors for installation of air conditioning system; and</p> <p>(e) whether SIL(E) only had one interchange station, i.e. WCH station.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that</p> <p>(a) the use of 3-car train arrangement allowed more flexibility in alignment planning which enabled the stations be located in the most populated areas. With the current arrangement, it was not possible to expand the stations to accommodate 4-car trains.</p> <p>(b) the number of cars to be used in SIL(W) was subject to further study.</p> <p>(c) the existing railway lines such as Island Line, Kwun Tong Line and Tsuen Wan Line could achieve two minutes headway. The level of service headway was determined by various factors including the alignment design.</p> <p>(d) half height automatic platform gates had been adopted in above ground stations.</p> <p>(e) Wong Chuk Hang could be modified and expanded to become an interchange station. Detailed arrangement would require further studies.</p>	
010603 – 011109	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung MTRCL	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed concern on the train safety under the FAO system. He also enquired whether the profit arising from the depot development project at WCH could be used to subsidize the fares and to enhance the community facilities in the area.</p> <p>The MTRCL further explained the safety measures of FAO system. It also advised that SIL(E) project adopted the rail-plus-property development model. The profit arising from the depot development project would be used to bridge the funding gap of SIL(E) project.</p>	
011110 – 011344	Chairman Administration	The Chairman suggested, and the Administration agreed, that a visit to OCC should be arranged in the future to	Clerk

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>enable members to better understand the FAO to be used for SIL(E).</p> <p>The Administration advised that before the commissioning of SIL(E), it would request the MTRCL to provide detailed contingency plans to handle service disruptions for the review of the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item V – Art programme in MTR stations</i>			
011345 – 012755	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing and Powerpoint presentation by the MTRCL on the approach and updates of MTR station art programme (LC Paper No. CB(1)363/12-13(05)).	
012756 – 013145	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan MTRCL	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan enquired whether the MTRCL could reduce the number of advertising light boxes at MTR stations to give more space for display of art.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that several factors were taken into account when selecting locations to display art pieces. It might not be viable to display a number of art pieces in a single location. There should also be a certain distance between passengers and art exhibits for appreciation. Also, the MTRCL needed to strike a balance between promotion of art and collection of revenue from advertisements.</p>	
013146 – 013449	Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed views –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) while appreciating the efforts made by MTRCL on promotion of art, he considered that such efforts were still insufficient. MTRCL should make reference to the station design of other railway systems in overseas cities such as Moscow. Moreover, station could be designed as a piece of art; (b) consideration should be given to broadcasting short art films on the concourse and trackside screens; and (c) consideration should also be given to providing venues for short-term art exhibitions. <p>The MTRCL advised that apart from the display of art pieces on a long-term basis, some MTR stations had community galleries for displaying works of students from the local community or non-profit organizations on short-term basis.</p>	
013450 – 013835	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	While supporting the incorporation of art elements into station design, Mr WONG Kwok-hing further suggested using the concourse and trackside screens to help local art-related non-government organizations to promote their activities and programmes free of charge.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The MTRCL advised that it had all along reserved some advertising space for charity or non-profit organizations for promoting their activities and programmes. It would give due consideration to extend such practice to cover electronic screens too for these organizations to promote art-related activities .</p>	
013836 – 014307	Chairman Mr Gary FAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN expressed views –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the appearances of stations or viaduct sections should include the element of art; (b) functional objects in stations, such as benches or signage, should be made artistic objects; and (c) apart from visual arts, reference should be made to the experience of Taiwan to promote literary arts, such as Chinese poems, at MTR stations. <p>The MTRCL advised that due to objective constraints, not all MTR stations could incorporate art elements into their external appearances. Nevertheless, MTRCL would carefully consider members' suggestions. It drew members' attention that the terminus station of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link and the future Admiralty Station would have unique appearance and be a piece of architectural art by itself.</p>	
014308 – 015000	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN MTRCL	<p>While appreciating the efforts made by MTRCL on promotion of art, Mr Michael TIEN expressed concern that the art pieces would be displayed at locations with low passenger flow. He enquired on the matters relating to the cost and life span of art pieces. He also urged the MTRCL to install electronic information system in all train compartments and use such system to provide information about cultural and historical characteristics of local districts.</p> <p>The MTRCL expressed his opinions that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) many large art pieces were hung below the ceilings of stations which were prominent positions with high passengers flow; (b) in general, the cost of art exhibits had been included in the construction cost of railway projects or the cost of improvement works of stations. As the cost of art pieces was relatively low, it would not constitute any pressure for fare increase; (c) the MTRCL had yet to formulate a policy on the life span of the art pieces on display, and a mechanism to replenish or replace them; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) some new trains currently running on urban lines were already equipped with the electronic information system and the installation of such system in train compartments of all railway lines would involve large-scale fleet renewal; MTRCL was currently reviewing the train refurbishment programme.</p> <p>Chairman remarked that it was important to provide real-time information to passengers in train compartments and the MTRCL should work out an implementation programme of installing electronic information system in all train compartments as early as possible.</p>	
015001 – 015520	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT MTRCL	<p>While appreciating the approach and progress of the incorporation of art in MTR stations, Dr Elizabeth QUAT urged the MTRCL to consider displaying more inspiring art exhibits, organizing performing art and multi-media art activities in stations. She also suggested to organize book floating (漂書) programmes to encourage reading.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that –</p> <p>(a) during the open call for the proposals of station art programme, local and overseas artists were given freedom to create their art pieces;</p> <p>(b) performing art activities were regularly organized at the pedestrian subway connecting Hong Kong Station and Central Station; and</p> <p>(c) consideration would be given to introducing multi-media art display.</p>	
015521 – 020005	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai MTRCL Administration	<p>While supporting the MTR station art programme, Mr WU Chi-wai considered that the programme should include different forms of art, not limited to visual arts. He also urged the MTRCL to provide venues for roving art exhibitions.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that it had set up the "art-tube" at Central Station, a mini art gallery located near Entrance/Exit J of Central Station, for short-term art exhibitions. It also provided cylindrical exhibition boxes at various stations for roving art exhibitions.</p>	