

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)628/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Minutes of special meeting held on
Friday, 3 May 2013, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present :** Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen
- Members attending :** Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
- Members absent :** Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Winnie WONG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)³
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Henry CHAN, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN
Chief Engineer/Railway Development 2-2
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item I

Mr Perran COAK
Associate Director
AECOM Asia Company Limited

Mr Karl CHEUK
Associate Director
MVA Hong Kong Limited

Session 1

Sai Kung Taxi Operators Association Ltd

Mr LI Siu-bun
Chairman

Taxi Dealers & Owners Association Ltd

Mr NG Kwan-sing
Chairman

New People's Party

Mr NG Ka-chiu
Community Development Officer

Individual

Mr LAI Siu-tong

Yat Tung Community Network Association

Mr KWOK Chung-man
Representative

Labour Party

Mr CHENG Sze-lut
Vice-chairperson

Hong Kong Taxi Owners' Association Limited

Mr WONG Po-keung
Chairman

Public Transport Think Tank of Hong Kong
and Idea4HK

Mr YEUNG Wing-chun
Officer

Southern District Social Service Association

Mr CHAN Sing-yiu
Representative

Individual

Mr CHU Lap-wai
Southern District Councillor

Individual

Mrs MAK TSE How-ling
Southern District Councillor

Wah Fu Estate Residents' Association

Mr WONG Choi-lap
Representative

Hong Kong Southern District Community
Association Limited

Mr TSANG Wai-sing
Representative

Session 2

富怡花園業主立案法團

Mr YEUNG Hon-sing
Chairman

Taxi & P.L.B Concern Group

Mr LAI Ming-hung
Chairman

DAB Central and Western Branch

Mr YEUNG Hoi-wing
Representative

Individual

Miss CHUNG Ka-man
Wan Chai District Councillor

Individual

Miss LEE Kwun-yee
Wan Chai District Councillor

Individual

Mr David WONG Chor-fung
Wan Chai District Councillor

Individual

Miss Christine FONG
Sai Kung District Councillor

Individual

Mr CHEUNG Mei-hung

North Island Line Action

Miss Natalie CHOI
Convenor

Individual

Mr KUNG Pak-cheung
Eastern District Councillor

Designing Hong Kong

Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN
Chief Executive Officer

爭取地鐵西區支線行動

Mr Nelson WONG Kin-shing
Founder

Office of Cllr Joanna LEUNG

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-cheong
Assistant to District Councillor

Office of Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
(Eastern)

Mr CHAN Kar-pak
Community Officer

Individual

Mr Michael LEE
Eastern District Councillor

楊小璧地區服務社

Miss YEUNG Siu-pik
Chairman

Office of Southern District Councillor AU
Nok-hin

Mr AU Nok-hin

MTR South Island Line Concern Group

Miss Becky LI Shee-lin
Member

The Democratic Party Hong Kong Island
Branch

Mr Leroy TONG Chi-pui
Member

Office of Southern District Councillor LO
Kin-hei

Mr LO Kin-hei

Office of Kevin TSUI

Mr TSUI Yuen-wa

Individual

Mr CHAI Man-hon
Southern District Councillor

Civic Party

Mr CHENG Tat-hung
Representative

HK Redevelopment Concern Group

Mr NG Yin-keung
Representative

Individual

Mr MA Ku-sang

Individual

Mr LAM Chun-ka

Individual

Mr Kelvin CHUI

Rail Connection

Mr KEI Chun-on
Representative

West Kowloon Environmental Protection
Association

Mr Harris YEUNG
Chairman

Individual

Mr Mark FU

自由黨西九龍支部

Mr Dan CHAN
Representative

小西灣邨瑞喜樓互助委員會

Mr LAU Hao-king
Chairman

佳翠苑業主立案法團

Mr LEUNG Chi-wai
Chairman

Fight for the South Island Line West Alliance

Mr AU Lap-sing
Representative

Central & Western Caucus, The Democratic
Party

Ms CHENG Lai-king
Convenor

Motor Transport Workers General Union

Mr LAM Tin-fu
Deputy Secretary General

Association of Hong Kong Railway Transport
Professional

Mr WONG Yuen-wood
Secretary

AMS Public Transport Holdings Limited

Mr Andrew WONG
Operations Manager

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Miss Ariel SHUM
Clerical Assistant (1)2

Action

- I Proposed local enhancement schemes**
- LC Paper No. CB(1)595/12-13(03) - Administration's paper on "Our Future Railway" Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)595/12-13(04) - Paper on the review and update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 (Updated background brief)
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(01) - Submission from Office of Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP (Eastern)
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(02) - Submission from a member of the public
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(03) - Submission from 香港青年聯會賢慧社
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(04) - Submission from 九龍兩的士商聯會
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(05) - Submission from HK Redevelopment Concern Group
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(06) - Submission from Office of Southern District Councillor AU Nok-hin
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(07) - Submission from North Island Line Action
 - LC Paper No. CB(1)1095/12-13(01) - Submission from Civic Party

Action

LC Paper No. CB(1)1095/12-13(02) - Submission from Rail
Connection)

The special meeting was called to invite deputations to present their views on the 7 local enhancement schemes for the existing railway lines as set out in the consultation document of the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000. A total of 51 deputations and individuals attended the meeting with the Administration and presented their views. After hearing the views, the Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II Any other business

2. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
24 December 2013

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the special meeting
on Friday, 3 May 2013, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda Item I – Proposed local enhancement schemes			
<i>Session 1</i>			
000403 – 000715	Chairman	The Chairman made an opening remark.	
000716 – 001059	Administration Chairman	The Administration introduced the background and objectives of the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000.	
<i>Presentation of views by deputations / individuals</i>			
001100 – 001403	Sai Kung Taxi Operators Association Ltd Chairman	<p>Due to the short distance between Tuen Mun Station and the area near Tuen Mun Ferry Pier as well as the provision of feeder service at present, there was no urgency to develop the Tuen Mun South Extension.</p> <p>It seemed that the Administration planned to construct the Hung Shui Kiu Station to tie in with the development of Qianhai in Shenzhen. However, it was not necessary to do so because the road based and waterborne transport systems were well-developed in Qianhai.</p> <p>The Administration should consider extending the railway network from Wu Kai Sha Station of the Ma On Shan Line to serve the Hong Kong University of Science and Technology ("HKUST") via Sai Sha Road and also to further extend the Line to the Sai Kung area. The network could then link up HKUST and the Tseung Kwan O Line ("TKO Line") to alleviate traffic congestion in Sai Kung area, especially during weekends. This would provide environmentally-friendly and efficient railway service to the Hong Kong citizens.</p>	
001404 – 001717	Taxi Dealers & Owners Association Ltd Chairman	The deputation supported the development of the Tuen Mun South Extension, Hung Shui Kiu Station, Tung Chung West Extension and Kwu Tung Station because these projects could enhance the efficiency of the transport networks and bring economic benefits to the community such as creation of	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>employment opportunities.</p> <p>The Administration should however consider the impact of the railway developments on the operation scope of the taxi trade and the livelihood of taxi drivers, in particular after the commissioning of the South Island Line (East) and the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL").</p>	
001718 – 001941	New People's Party Chairman	<p>The deputation showed support to the development of Tuen Mun South Extension and Hung Shui Kiu Station because they would alleviate the overcrowding problems on the West Rail Line and the Light Rail.</p> <p>The Administration should transform the current Light Rail system to a "people-mover system" in order to cope with the latest development in the New Territories.</p> <p>The Administration should either develop a new railway line or provide more feeder service for North Kwai Chung residents due to the pressing transport needs in the district.</p>	
001942 – 002251	Mr LAI Siu-tong Chairman	<p>Due to the growing population in the Southern part of Tuen Mun, the Administration should develop the Tuen Mun South Extension.</p> <p>In view of the latest development of Hung Shui Kiu and the consequential growth of population and employment opportunities in the district, the Administration should develop this Station.</p> <p>The Tung Chung West Extension should not be given priority as it would only benefit the local residents of Tung Chung.</p> <p>The Administration should consider developing the Northern Link which should be linked up with the West Rail via Kwu Tung Station to provide a fast and convenient rail service. This would also serve well the residents of the northern and western New Territories and facilitate cross-border passengers.</p>	
002252 – 002600	Yat Tung Community Network Association Chairman	<p>The Administration should develop the Tung Chung West Extension soonest possible to meet the transport demand of residents of the Yat Tung Estate in Tung Chung West. The current provision of bus service there was far from sufficient.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)946/12-13(01)].	
002601 – 002854	Labour Party Chairman	<p>The deputation preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme because the former would not affect the integrity of the existing Island Line and commuters would not have to change line all the way along the northshore of Hong Kong Island. The limitation of the "Swap" scheme was also pointed out in that the train frequency of the Tung Chung Line would be restricted by the Tsing Ma Bridge and the maximum train frequency of the eastern half of the Island Line would be reduced.</p> <p>As for the other schemes, the Administration should give due consideration to the development needs of the rural part of the territory, enhance transportation facilities to meet the needs of the local residents, commercial interests and environmental impact on the countryside.</p>	
002855 – 003028	Hong Kong Taxi Owners' Association Limited Chairman	<p>The Administration should, before developing the North Island Line extension project, assess carefully the number of the commuters that it would serve and should not spend excessive resources on less populated areas such as those near the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre ("HKCEC") and Tamar.</p> <p>The Administration should not accord top priority to develop the Siu Sai Wan Line because the number of passengers for this extension line might be too small to justify the construction of it.</p> <p>The deputation expressed support of the Administration's policy of using railways as the backbone of Hong Kong's passenger transport system, but it would be unfair for the Administration to use tax payers' money to subsidize the operation of railway, which should be self sustainable.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)967/12-13(01)].</p>	
003029 – 003336	Public Transport Think Tank of Hong Kong and Idea4HK Chairman	The Administration should decide whether to develop the North Island Line after the commissioning of the Central-Wan Chai Bypass and review of the effect of the commissioning of it on transport.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration should consider simultaneously developing Kwu Tung Station together with the Northern Link to tie in with the future developments in the northeast New Territories and to alleviate the current heavy load of the East Rail.</p> <p>The deputation considered it less desirable to develop the Siu Sai Wan Line as there were many buildings developed in the vicinity of the proposed Siu Sai Wan Line and problems relating to resumption of land would arise.</p> <p>The deputation expressed concern about the capacity of the Admiralty Station which would be the interchange station for both the South Island Line (East) and SCL after the commissioning of them.</p> <p>The deputation showed support to the Tuen Mun South Extension in view of the technical feasibility, pressing transport needs in the western New Territories and saturation of the Light Rail service.</p> <p>The Administration should not consider the schemes of Hung Shui Kiu Station and Tung Chung West Extension until these two districts were well developed.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Papers Nos. CB(1)909/12-13(01) and (02)].</p>	
003337 – 003555	Southern District Social Service Association Chairman	It was necessary to develop the South Island Line (West) for the benefits of the local residents. The deputation showed support to the development of the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section in two phases. The section from Aberdeen to Wah Fu should be developed first whereas provision be made for the future extension to Pokfulam.	
003556 – 003847	Mr CHU Lap-wai, Southern District Councillor Chairman	<p>The Administration should develop the South Island Line (West) as soon as practicable due to the pressing transport needs in the community. It would be desirable if this Line could be implemented right after the commissioning of the South Island Line (East) in 2015.</p> <p>The Administration should consider developing the Aberdeen Section first and then the Pokfulam Section, given the technical and other difficulties encountered along the Pokfulam areas.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003848 – 004155	Mrs MAK TSE How-ling, Southern District Councillor Chairman	The local residents in general strongly supported the development of the South Island Line (West) for the sake of alleviating traffic problems, opening up business opportunities in Island south and creating job opportunities.	
004156 – 004452	Wah Fu Estate Residents' Association Chairman	The deputation expressed support to the development of the South Island Line (West) as soon as possible to ease the road traffic congestion and facilitate the redevelopment of Wah Fu Estate. The deputation suggested to develop the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section in two phases so that railway service could first be provided to Aberdeen up to Wah Fu whereas provision be made for the future extension to Pokfulam.	
004453 – 004622	Hong Kong Southern District Community Association Limited Chairman	The deputation suggested that the Administration should develop the South Island Line (West) soonest possible to meet the pressing transport demand. In addition, the Administration should consider developing the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section in two phases and providing railway service to areas from Aberdeen up to Wah Fu first, given the technical and other difficulties encountered along the Pokfulam districts.	
004623 – 005034	Administration	<p>The Administration made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the views expressed by the deputations and individuals from different backgrounds, industries and districts were noted. The Administration would take them into consideration;</p> <p>(b) the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise would last until 20 May 2013 and the public might submit views through various means; and</p> <p>(c) the consultant would collate the public views collected at both Stage 1 and Stage 2 and then present their final recommendations to the Administration. After that, the Administration would explore the way forward for different railway projects with a view to reporting the results to the public in 2014.</p>	
005035 – 005115	Chairman	The Chairman thanked deputations for attending the meeting.	
Break			

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Session 2</i>			
011320 – 011431	Chairman	The Chairman made an opening remark.	
011432 – 011816	Administration Chairman	The Administration introduced the background and objectives of the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000.	
<i>Presentation of views by deputations / individuals</i>			
011817 – 012002	富怡花園業主立案 法團 Chairman	The deputation suggested that the Administration should develop the Siu Sai Wan Line as soon as practicable in order to provide convenience to residents there to cope with the growing population in the district. They had no strong views on the "Extension", "Bifurcation" and "Feeder" Schemes as all involved certain technical difficulties.	
012003 – 012207	DAB Central and Western Branch Chairman	<p>The deputation preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme for the North Island Line because the former would maintain the integrity of the existing Island Line and would not affect the travelling pattern of the passengers of the existing Island Line.</p> <p>The deputation also pointed out the limitation of the "Swap" scheme in that the train frequency of the Tung Chung Line (if merged with the existing Island Line) would be restricted by the Tsing Ma Bridge structure and the maximum train frequency of the eastern half of the Island Line would be reduced, resulting in problems of overloading of trains during peak hours.</p>	
012208 – 012416	Miss CHUNG Ka-man, Wan Chai District Councillor Chairman	The Administration should adopt the "Interchange" Scheme, rather than the "Swap" Scheme, for the North Island Line as the former would not change the travelling pattern of passengers of the existing Island Line. Furthermore, the Administration should consider enhancing the pedestrian schemes for the current and new railway lines, such as those connecting Admiralty and Tamar Stations, and Causeway Bay and Causeway Bay North Stations.	
012417 – 012707	Miss LEE Kwun-ye, Wan Chai District Councillor Chairman	The deputation expressed that because the "Swap" Scheme for the North Island Line would change the travelling habits of passengers of the existing Island Line, it would cause inconvenience to the passengers in particular the elderly who had leg problems. In addition, the Administration should	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		consider enhancing pedestrian schemes to connect Causeway Bay and Causeway Bay North Stations to facilitate passengers and tourists and to bring economic benefits to the district.	
012708 – 012948	Mr David WONG Chor-fung, Wan Chai District Councillor Chairman	The North Island Line was essential to alleviate the current passenger load in particular after the commissioning of the West Island Line, the South Island Line (East) and SCL. The deputation also suggested that the Administration should provide the public further details of both the "Interchange" and "Swap" Schemes to facilitate a more meaningful and fruitful discussion.	
012949 – 013100	Mr KUNG Pak-cheung, Eastern District Councillor Chairman	The Administration should try to preserve the integrity of the existing Island Line when considering the North Island Line. To cope with the growing transport demand of residents, the Administration should develop the Siu Sai Wan Line as soon as practicable.	
013101 – 013404	Designing Kong Chairman Hong	The deputation preferred the "Swap" Scheme to the "Interchange" Scheme because the former would maximize the number of stations of both the Tung Chung Line and TKO line which could directly reach the northshore of the Hong Kong Island. Although this option required changing passengers' travelling habits, it would bring benefits to the whole community in the long run. The deputation suggested that for the South Island Line (West), elevated or exposed rail should be avoided so as to minimize impact on the local communities and that all rail should be underground. The proposed stations at Queen Mary Hospital, Cyberport and Wah Fu were supported if put underground. The deputation expressed support to the 7 local enhancement schemes as proposed by the Administration. It was suggested that the Administration should provide further details of the railway development projects, like the financing arrangements, environmental impacts, and passengers' travelling patterns, to the public for thorough discussions. It was also suggested that the Administration whilst planning the rail network should also look at	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>pedestrian issues and create great neighbourhood by creating linkages between railway stations and districts by all means that were above ground, at ground and underground.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)909/12-13(04)].</p>	
013405 – 013636	Office of Cllr Joanna LEUNG Chairman	The deputation expressed that they preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme for the North Island Line. As the latter would affect the passengers' travelling pattern and reduce 8 trains of the eastern half of the existing Island Line per hour, inconvenience would be caused for commuters, especially for the elderly living on the Hong Kong Island.	
013637 – 013845	Office of Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP (Eastern) Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed that over 90% of the residents in Sai Wan Ho and Shau Kei Wan preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme for the North Island Line because the latter would affect the integrity and reduce 8 trains per hour for the eastern half of the existing Island Line, and might cause inconvenience to the handicapped who had to use the wheel-chair. Moreover, Admiralty Station, an interchange station, might be too overloaded to speed up flow of passengers, in particular after the commissioning of the West Island Line.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(01)].</p>	
013846 – 014156	Mr Michael LEE, Eastern District Councillor Chairman	<p>The deputation requested the Administration to provide to the public further details of the "Interchange" and "Swap" Schemes for the North Island Line for information and reference. Besides, their opinion survey showed that over 90% of the local residents preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme. He also suggested that the North Island Line should be completed before the commissioning of SCL in order to lessen the burden of its interchange station, i.e. Admiralty Station.</p> <p>The Siu Sai Wan Line should be developed soonest possible in order to provide convenience to residents there. Nevertheless, the "Bifurcation" Scheme was less preferred as it might result in a lower service frequency and longer waiting time for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		the passengers. Besides, the Chai Wan Cargo Handling Basin might have to be filled up under the "Bifurcation" Scheme and as a result the related business activities might be adversely affected.	
014157 – 014511	楊小璧地區服務社 Chairman	The local residents generally supported the development of South Island Line (West) so as to ease traffic congestion and bring about economic benefits. Nevertheless, it would be very disappointing to the residents in particular the elderly if the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section were to be developed in two phases because according to past experience, one railway project would take more than 10 years to complete.	
014512 – 014756	Office of Southern District Councillor AU Nok-hin Chairman	The Administration should not develop the Aberdeen section and Pokfulam section of the South Island Line (West) in two phases. Though there were divergent views expressed by residents in the Pokfulam area, residents of the Southern part of Hong Kong Island in general supported the construction of the South Island Line (West). The Administration should try to create consensus and come up with an acceptable scheme to develop both Aberdeen and Pokfulam sections in one go. Please also see [LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(06)].	
014757 – 015106	MTR South Island Line Concern Group Chairman	The deputation proposed that both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) should be developed simultaneously and underground. It would not only satisfy commuters' transport demand, but also reduce the burden of Admiralty Station as an interchange station. The proposed Queen Mary Hospital station of the Pokfulam section would greatly benefit the community and could tie in timely with the re-development of the hospital in the next decade.	
015107 – 015432	The Democratic Party Hong Kong Island Branch Chairman	The deputation suggested that the Administration should develop both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) in one go. It would provide convenience to the local residents, alleviate traffic congestion problems and meet the transport needs of those who had to travel to Cyberport, Queen Mary Hospital and the University of Hong Kong for work, treatment or study.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015433 – 015753	Taxi & P.L.B Concern Group Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed that the Administration had wasted public money to develop unnecessary and unjustified railway projects, in particular Whampoa Station on the Kwun Tong Line Extension and LOHAS Park Station on the TKO Line. Some of the trains were under-utilized. As a result, the interests of other public transport modes including those of the taxi and minibus were jeopardized. The Administration should consider the negative impact of the new railway projects on the livelihood of professional drivers.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)909/12-13(03)].</p>	
015754 – 020059	Miss Christine FONG, Sai Kung District Councillor Chairman	<p>The Administration should develop the North Island Line as soon as practicable to satisfy the transport needs of commuters living on the Hong Kong Island, Tseung Kwan O and East Kowloon. The Administration should pay heed to views expressed by the public on the "Interchange" or "Swap" Schemes before they adopted either one of them. Also the North Island Line was also greatly needed for visitors going to the HKCEC. It would be a shame to Hong Kong if efficient transport facilities could not be provided to overseas delegates taking part in events held at the HKCEC.</p>	
020100 – 020406	Mr CHEUNG Mei-hung Chairman	<p>Due to the rapid growth of population in Tseung Kwan O, the Administration should develop the North Island Line as soon as possible to meet the pressing transport demand.</p> <p>The deputation expressed support of the proposed "Interchange" Scheme and suggested to extend the TKO Line under the "Interchange" Scheme further west by making Sheung Wan Station as the west-end terminal station in place of Tamar. By doing this, the travelling pattern of the passengers of the existing Island Line would not be affected and the passenger flow would be maximized.</p>	
020407 – 020714	爭取地鐵西區支線 行動 Chairman	<p>The deputation suggested to build the South Island Line (West) soonest possible to alleviate the traffic congestion in Pokfulam and to tie in with the latest large-scale re-development of the Queen Mary Hospital. The Administration should construct the South Island Line (West) underground and in one go and provide direct access to the University of Hong Kong and the Queen Mary Hospital for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		citizens going there for employment and study.	
020715 – 021115	Office of Southern District Councillor LO Kin-hei Chairman	The deputation expressed objection to developing the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of South Island Line (West) in two phases. He urged the Administration to develop both sections simultaneously and underground.	
021116 – 021438	Office of Kevin TSUI Chairman	Both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) should be developed at the same time to meet the transport needs of the residents and to cope with the community development. The Administration should be forward-looking in developing the railway network. The deputation also reminded that many years ago the Administration had proposed to connect the North Hong Kong Line to the South Island Line (West) and then to the South Island Line (East) so that a "loop" like railway could be provided to serve the Hong Kong Island.	
021439 – 021741	Mr CHAI Man-hon, Southern District Councillor Chairman	The Administration should develop both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) at the same time, instead of constructing them in two phases.	
021742 – 022052	Civic Party Chairman	<p>For the North Island Line, the deputation suggested that the "Swap" Scheme would bring convenience to the residents of Tseung Kwan O and Tung Chung while passengers travelling to and from the eastern part of the Hong Kong Island might need to wait for a longer time. The deputation suggested that whichever Scheme was eventually implemented, the number of trains per hour of the existing Island Line should not be reduced.</p> <p>The deputation showed support to develop the Siu Sai Wan Line Line and preferred the "Feeder" Scheme which seemed to be more technically feasible than the "Extension" and "Bifurcation" Schemes.</p> <p>The deputation urged the Administration to develop the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) simultaneously and underground.</p> <p>The deputation expressed support of the proposed schemes including the Tuen Mun South Extension, Hung Shui Kiu Station, Tung Chung West</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Extension and Kwu Tung Station. It was also suggested that in the course of railway development, the Administration should maintain some alternative public transport means so that passengers could still have certain choices.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)1095/12-13(01)].</p>	
022053 – 022411	HK Redevelopment Concern Group Chairman	<p>The Administration should develop the North Island Line as soon as practicable to meet the transport demand. Due to the fact the controversial nature of the "Swap" and "Interchange" Schemes, the Administration should explore other alternative options by drawing reference from data produced by computer modelling systems.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(05)].</p>	
022412 – 022731	Mr MA Ku-sang Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed concern that the new railway developments might affect adversely the livelihood of minibus drivers. The Administration should conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study for the overall benefit of the whole community. Also, upon the commissioning of the West Island Line, the Administration should fully consult the public transport industry when devising the public transport re-organization plans.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(02)].</p>	
022732 – 023030	Mr LAM Chun-ka Chairman	<p>The deputation urged the Administration to develop the North Island Line to meet the pressing transport demand of Tseung Kwan O residents. To avoid overloading the interchange station, i.e. Admiralty Station, the North Island Line should be commissioned before the completion of SCL. The Administration should also ensure that commuters could travel from Tseung Kwan O to Causeway Bay or vice versa within 15 minutes when the North Island Line was completed.</p>	
023031 – 023218	West Kowloon Environmental Protection Association Chairman	<p>The North Island Line should be implemented soonest possible because Admiralty Station, as an interchange station, might be overloaded upon the commissioning of SCL. The Administration should conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study for the overall benefit of the whole</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		community and the potential contribution of electric vehicles should be studied too.	
023219 – 023539	Rail Connection Chairman	<p>The Administration should develop the North Island Line soonest possible to provide convenience to commuters travelling to and from the Hong Kong Island, Tseung Kwan O and Tung Chung.</p> <p>The existing public transport service was found to be sufficient to meet the transport demand in Siu Sai Wan district and it was therefore not necessary to develop this Line.</p> <p>It would be more appropriate to develop simultaneously the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West).</p> <p>The deputation supported the development of the Tuen Mun South Extension which would enable the residents in the district to ride the West Rail directly, without having to spend extra time and cost on feeder transport.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)1095/12-13(02)].</p>	
023540 – 023801	Mr Kelvin CHUI Chairman	It was essential to develop the North Island Line to cope with the growing population in the Tseung Kwan O district and to ease the overcrowding problem at the North Point Station and also stations along the TKO Line. The Administration was urged to set a schedule for the commissioning of the North Island Line. Although the "Swap" and "Interchange" Schemes were both controversial, the latter was preferred as it could take residents from Tseung Kwan O directly to Causeway Bay within 15 minutes.	
023802 – 023846	佳翠苑業主立案法 團 Chairman	The deputation expressed support to the Siu Sai Wan Line due to the ageing population there and feeder service in the district was far from sufficient. The Administration was urged to complete this line as soon as practicable.	
023847 – 024027	小西灣邨瑞喜樓互 助委員會 Chairman	The deputation expressed support to the Siu Sai Wan Line due the serious lack of feeder service in the district at the moment and preferred the "Bifurcation" Scheme to the "Extension" and "Feeder" Schemes. It was also suggested that the Administration should consider further extending	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		the Siu Sai Wan Line to the neighbouring area of Shek O in the future.	
024028 – 024206	自由黨西九龍支部 Chairman	<p>The deputation urged the Administration to develop the North Island Line as soon as practicable to relieve the overcrowding problem of trains on the existing Island Line and Tsuen Wan Line, and strongly demanded a schedule for its completion.</p> <p>The deputation also suggested that commuters in general preferred the Tsuen Wan Line to the Tung Chung Line to go to destinations on the Hong Kong Island due to the unfavourable location of Hong Kong Station on the Tung Chung Line. The Administration was urged to consider the addition of pedestrian facilities at the Hong Kong Station of the Tung Chung Line, such as footbridges, to connect it to the Central Station of the existing Island Line.</p>	
024207 – 024431	Mr Mark FU Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed that the North Island Line should be implemented soonest possible because Admiralty Station, as an interchange station, might be overloaded upon the commissioning of SCL. Moreover, for the benefits of the exhibition and tourism industries, the Airport Railway should be extended to reach the HKCEE in Wan Chai.</p> <p>The Administration should conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study as soon as possible for the overall benefit of the transport industry and the community as a whole.</p>	
024432 – 024810	Motor Transport Workers General Union Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed that the Administration should consider the adverse impact of the railway developments on the scope of business of the transport trades including the taxi and minibus operators as well as the livelihood of professional drivers. Some of them were driven out of a job subsequent to the commissioning of the TKO Line. It was expected that more drivers would lose their job after the commissioning of the South Island Line (East) and the West Island Line in the near future.</p> <p>The provision of bus feeder service and the monthly concessionary fares by the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") also took over many customers of taxis and minibuses. The deputation urged the Administration to provide alternative</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>transport means to citizens who should be given a choice in taking transport service. In addition, it was unfair for the Administration to support the railway development with public money whilst no subsidy was given to the operators of other transportation means.</p>	
024811 – 025009	<p>Fight for the South Island Line West Alliance Chairman</p>	<p>The deputation expressed support to the development of the South Island Line (West) in order to alleviate the traffic congestion problem in the south of Hong Kong Island.</p> <p>The deputation suggested that they would support the development of the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section in one go, yet they would also support the proposal to build the South Island Line (West) in two phases. They welcomed the proposal that railway service could first be developed from Aberdeen to Wah Fu whereas provision could be made for the future extension to Pokfulam in view of the concerns expressed by residents in the area and technical difficulties encountered.</p>	
025010 – 025201	<p>AMS Public Transport Holdings Limited Chairman</p>	<p>The Administration should not consider developing South Island Line (West) until after the commissioning of the South Island Line (East) which was under construction. The Administration should assess the actual public transport demand after the commissioning of the South Island Line (East) before making the decision to develop the South Island Line (West).</p> <p>Also currently most of the maxicab operators were unable to make any profits due to the rising cost of production and impact of the new railway developments. The Administration was urged to consider the cost efficiency of new railway projects and the adverse impact on the livelihood of professional drivers.</p>	
025202 – 025515	<p>Association of Hong Kong Railway Transport Professional Chairman</p>	<p>The development of the underground railway network in Hong Kong in the last 40 years should provide opportunities and experience to drive industrial development and manpower training in railway design and operation. The local universities and relevant institutes should consider offering training courses to train up the expertise in addition to the in-house training offered by MTRCL. Besides, the Administration should</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		encourage relevant local industries such as the electronics industry to develop the management and control system of railways by offering subsidies, or by requiring that a certain part of the equipment used by railways should be locally produced.	
025516 – 025822	North Island Line Action Chairman	<p>The deputation expressed opposition to the "Swap" Scheme for the North Island Line because passengers travelling to and from the eastern district of the Hong Kong Island might have to wait longer for the trains.</p> <p>Please also refer to [LC Paper No. CB(1)986/12-13(07)].</p>	
025823 – 030150	Central & Western Caucus, The Democratic Party Chairman	<p>The deputation preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme because the former would not affect the integrity of the existing Island Line and could also satisfy the transport needs of the residents from Tung Chung and Tseung Kwan O.</p> <p>The Administration should simultaneously develop both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) so that direct access to the University of Hong Kong and the Queen Mary Hospital would be provided.</p>	
030151 – 031147	Administration Chairman	<p>Administration's response to views expressed by deputations:</p> <p>(a) the objective of the Public Engagement Exercise was to collect the public's views on the conceptual proposals of railway projects;</p> <p>(b) given the fact that Hong Kong was densely populated, there might be merits in constructing the railways underground, subject to technical feasibility. The Administration would like to engage the public at an early planning stage;</p> <p>(c) the public generally supported the Administration's policy of using railways as the backbone of Hong Kong's passenger transport system while there might be concerns about the implications on other public transport modes. In the implementation of any new railway projects, the Administration would carefully consider the coordination of different public transport modes to cater for the needs of the community; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise would last until 20 May 2013 and the public might submit views through various means; and the consultant would collate the public views collected at both Stage 1 and Stage 2 and then present their final recommendations to the Administration. After that, the Administration would explore the way forward for different railway projects with a view to reporting the results to the public in 2014.</p>	
<i>Discussion</i>			
031148 – 031608	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed views and concerns below:</p> <p>(a) North Island Line – residents on the Hong Kong Island preferred the "Interchange" Scheme to the "Swap" Scheme. The former scheme would not affect the integrity of the existing Island Line while the latter would divide the existing Island Line into two separate sections;</p> <p>(b) Siu Sai Wan Line – the Administration should develop this Line soonest possible in order to cope with the growing transport demand. The "Extension" Scheme was preferable because it would provide smooth and flexible railway service; and</p> <p>(c) South Island Line (West) – residents on the Hong Kong Island suggested extending the railway line from South Horizons to Aberdeen, Wah Fu, Wah Kwai and the Queen Mary Hospital.</p>	
031609 – 032035	Mr TANG Ka-piu Chairman Administration	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) it was estimated that there were currently around 43 000 residents in Tung Chung West, and an additional 10 000 residents would move into Tung Chung's new public housing estates in the future. The Tung Chung West Extension was therefore necessary to meet the growing transport demand in the district;</p> <p>(b) reclamation should not be carried out when developing the Tung Chung West Extension;</p> <p>(c) whether the Administration would propose any alternative arrangement for Tung Chung</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>residents if the Tung Chung West Extension was shelved subsequently; and</p> <p>(d) currently, 5 railway projects were under construction. On completion of these 5 projects between 2014 and 2020, the rail share of local public transport was estimated to increase to 43%. However, according to the MTRCL's latest annual report released in March 2013, its share of local public transport already rose to 46.4%. In this connection, Mr TANG urged the Administration to take note of the adverse impact of the railway developments to the livelihood of professional drivers and conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study for the overall benefit of the local transport stakeholders and the community.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that:</p> <p>(a) the views expressed by Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Mr TANG Ka-piu were noted; and</p> <p>(b) the consultant would collate the public views collected at both Stage 1 and Stage 2 and then present their final recommendations to the Administration. After that, the Administration would explore the way forward for different railway projects with a view to reporting the results to the public in 2014.</p>	
032036 – 032154	Mr SIN Chung-kai Chairman	<p>Mr SIN Chung-kai opined that:</p> <p>(a) for the North Island Line, the "Interchange" Scheme was preferred to the "Swap" Scheme because the former would not affect the integrity of the existing Island Line;</p> <p>(b) the Siu Sai Wan Line should be developed soonest possible to provide convenient rail service to residents there. No strong views were expressed on the "Extension", "Bifurcation" and "Feeder" Schemes as all involved certain advantages and disadvantages; and</p> <p>(c) both the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section of the South Island Line (West) should be developed simultaneously to satisfy the passengers' transport demand. Besides, when considering the development of new projects,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the Administration should not only take into account the number of population on Hong Kong Island, the daily number of passengers travelling to and from Cyberport and Queen Mary Hospital should be considered too.</p>	
<p>032155 – 032719</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan Chairman Administration</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should develop the Tung Chung West Extension to meet the residents' transport needs; (b) the consultant suggested in the consultation document of the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise that the existing Tung Chung Line was capable of carrying more passengers. However, such information was misleading because most passengers boarding at Tung Chung would change line at Lai King Station and Nam Cheong Station for other railway lines. If the Administration conducted the survey at Kowloon Station which was further south, the current train loading for the Tung Chung Line would not be accurately reflected; (c) the Administration's consultation document also mentioned that a large number of bus routes were available in Tung Chung West but such information was misleading. For instance, the bus frequency of some routes was only once or twice a day and some of the bus routes were only provided on weekdays; and (d) in the consultation document of the Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise, photomontage of the proposed Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan (Tsing Lung Tau) was given for reference. The photomontage depicting a giant viaduct adjacent to residential blocks gave very negative impression to the readers. Mr CHAN found the photomontage misleading and might adversely affect the public's views about the development of the Coastal Railway. <p>The Administration made the following response:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the views expressed by Mr SIN Chung-kai were noted; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) regarding Mr CHAN's views and concerns, the Administration explained that the public was consulted on the conceptual proposals of the railway projects. The consultant's preliminary findings on the functions of each proposal, planning considerations, traffic demand, as well as constraints in technical, environmental and other aspects were presented to allow early engagement of the public in the planning process.</p>	
032720 – 032935	Mr Frankie YICK Chairman Administration	<p>Mr Frankie YICK expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) to facilitate fruitful discussion, the Administration should provide further information on the railway projects such as fares and the financial and financing arrangements; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study as soon as practicable for the overall benefit of the local transport system and should announce the decision as soon as once made.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that:</p> <p>(a) the objective of the Public Engagement Exercise was to collect the public's views on the conceptual proposals of railway projects. The detailed planning of an individual railway project would be carried out when a decision had been made to implement the project; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration would decide whether to conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study after completing the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000, which would provide a solid base for the said study.</p>	
032936 – 033330	Mr Christopher CHUNG Chairman Administration	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) for the Siu Sai Wan Line, given that all the "Extension", "Bifurcation" and "Feeder" Schemes involved certain constraints, the Administration should consult the relevant parties and explore other possible alternative schemes or combination of the 3 Schemes;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) for the North Island Line, it was not desirable to have the "Swap" Scheme because the existing Island Line would be severed into two halves and interchange might be required for the east-west journeys taken by residents on the Hong Kong Island. Moreover, the Administration should consider pedestrian schemes for the current and new railway lines, such as pedestrian facilities connecting Admiralty and Tamar Stations, and Causeway Bay and Causeway Bay North Stations; and</p> <p>(c) South Island Line (West) – the Administration could develop the Aberdeen Section and Pokfulam Section in two phases and that railway service should first be developed from Aberdeen to Wah Fu whereas provision be made for the future extension to Pokfulam.</p> <p>The Administration responded that they would take into account Mr CHUNG's views when considering the railway schemes.</p>	
033331 – 033645	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung raised the following views and concerns:</p> <p>(a) it was not appropriate for the Administration to present all possible constraints of the railway projects to the public in the consultation process because it might affect the public's views of the proposed schemes and result in the "killing" of them;</p> <p>(b) other than just taking note of views at meetings, the Administration should also respond promptly to the suggestions made by the members and the public;</p> <p>(c) the Administration should make use of the opportunities brought by railway developments to complement the housing policy, such as to build more public housing estates or Home Ownership Scheme on land along the new railway lines; and</p> <p>(d) the Administration should establish a fare stabilization fund to stabilize MTR fares, and another infrastructure reserve fund to finance the construction of new railways. If this was done, the share price of MTRCL would drop and then the Administration could buy back the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		20+% of MTRCL shares on the stock market.	
033646 – 034049	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung expressed concern over the accuracy of the estimated passenger capacity in 2031 for Tuen Mun South Extension and Hung Shui Kiu Station which were projected according to the data of 2011. He opined that those who lived near the railway would take the rail whereas those not living close to the stations would take other transport means.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that the projections presented in their consultation documents were based on the data of the Census and Statistics Department and the Planning Department. Besides, the consultant would also draw on past experience in railway development in making the projections.</p>	
034050 – 034458	Mr Michael TIEN Chairman Administration	<p>Mr Michael TIEN expressed his views and suggestions as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the strategy of using railways as the backbone of the passenger transport system was supported and the role of other transport means was suggested to be strengthened in providing interchange service, such as those between minibus and MTR and between bus and MTR. Interchange discount could be provided to encourage passengers to do so. Buses running long-distance parallel routes of MTR should be reduced as appropriate; (b) operators of maxicabs could be allowed to run feeder service to and from MTR stations by means of outsource of the service to them; and (c) the train frequency should be increased to alleviate the overcrowding problem in train compartments which were very packed during the peak hours. <p>The Administration said that they would inform MTRCL of Mr TIEN's suggestions and consider them when pursuing the relevant policies. As regards the spatial issues on trains, MTRCL would continue to monitor the situation and take measures as appropriate.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
034459 – 034517	Chairman	The Chairman thanked members, representatives of the Administration and deputations for attending the meeting.	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
24 December 2013