

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)534/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 5 July 2013, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** :
- Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy Chairman)
 - Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
 - Hon James TO Kun-sun
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
 - Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
 - Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
 - Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
 - Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
 - Hon CHAN Han-pan
 - Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
 - Hon TANG Ka-piu
 - Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
 - Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen
- Member attending** : Hon KWOK Wai-keung

**Public officers
attending** : **Agenda item II**

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Andy CHAN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)2

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Ms Macella LEE
Assistant Commissioner/Bus & Railway
Transport Department

Dr LEUNG Kin-man
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Agenda item III

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Andy CHAN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)2

Mr Raymond CHENG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)7

Ms Macella LEE
Assistant Commissioner/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Mr Reginald CHAN
Principal Transport Officer/Bus and Railway 3
Transport Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item II**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Adi LAU
Chief of Operating

Mr Terry WONG
Deputy General Manager – Infrastructure
Implementation

Mr Sammy WONG
Operations Manager – WRL & LR

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs

Clerk in attendance: Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

- I Information papers issued since last meeting**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)1389/12-13 - Referral from Members' meeting-cum-luncheon with Southern District Council members on 6 June 2013 on the development of South Island Line (West))

Members noted the above paper which had been issued since the last meeting.

Action

II Service performance of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")

LC Paper No. CB(1)1421/12-13(01)	No.-	MTRCL's paper on service performance of MTRCL
LC Paper No. CB(1)1421/12-13(02)	-	Paper on railway service performance prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)
LC Paper No. CB(1)1421/12-13(03)	-	Paper on railway safety prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)
LC Paper No. CB(1)1421/12-13(04)	Nos. -	Letter dated 17 June 2013 and from Hon CHAN Kam-lam and MTRCL's response
LC Paper No. CB(1)1445/12-13(01)		
LC Paper No. CB(1)1445/12-13(02)	-	Letter dated 4 July 2013 from Hon TANG Ka-piu)

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration briefed members on the service performance of MTRCL for the period from January to May 2013, with the aid of a powerpoint presentation.

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**). Members' major views and concerns were summarized in the ensuing paragraphs.

Improvement of station facilities

4. Members generally expressed appreciation of MTRCL's plan to install public toilets at major interchange MTR stations. Some members further suggested that public toilets should be made available at all stations in the near future. Most members also welcomed the provision of free Wi-Fi service at all MTR stations. Nevertheless, they opined that it would be better to extend the free Wi-Fi service up to 30 minutes. They also enquired about the number of Wi-Fi spots available at each station.

5. Some members suggested that MTRCL should review and increase the number of escalators because passengers at certain MTR stations, say Tai Wo Hau Station, might have to climb more than 70 steps from the station entrance to a nearby footbridge. In addition, to facilitate public participation in large-scale activities at Victoria Park, MTRCL should try to solve the technical problems with relevant departments in order to install an external lift

Action

at Tin Hau Station. Some members also pointed out that there was room for improvement to encourage commuters to be considerate and give priority to those in need regarding the use of lifts and wide gates. For instance, MTRCL could assign staff to assist passengers at the entrance of lifts and wide gates during peak hours.

6. In response to members' views and concerns, MTRCL advised that public toilets would be installed at the interchange stations during their major refurbishment and such works were expected to be completed at Admiralty, Mong Kok and Prince Edward Stations by 2015. Furthermore, MTRCL explained that passengers would be able to enjoy the free Wi-Fi service at all MTR stations for 15 minutes each time and they might renew such service for each eligible device 5 times per day. MTRCL would also review the usage of the free Wi-Fi spots at all MTR stations.

7. MTRCL further responded that they would collaborate with stakeholders to study the possibility to install additional escalators or lifts at some MTR stations. It was explained that despite technical difficulties encountered, MTRCL had already formulated preliminary proposals to install external lifts at Fortress Hill and Shau Kei Wan Stations, whereas solutions were being sought to address the technical problems at Tin Hau Station. As regards the courtesy campaign, MTRCL said that they had put up labels and notices at 20 lifts since 2012 to remind passengers to give priority to those in need and it was proven to be effective.

Facilities of train compartments

8. Some members expressed concerns over the facilities and environment of train compartments. As regards the installation of inflatable train door seals to reduce in-cabin noise levels, they enquired about the time required to complete the installation for the total of 90 older model MTR trains. Besides, they suggested that MTRCL should consider broadcasting instant news inside train compartments of the Tung Chung Line ("TCL") and restricting passengers to occupy those designated seats reserved for people in need. In addition, a member pointed out that while shops inside stations sold food and drinks, MTRCL prohibited passengers from eating or drinking inside compartments and suggested that such policy should be reviewed. Another member also requested MTRCL to provide the number of indecent assault cases in MTR in the previous year and the current year. It was suggested that MTRCL should seriously consider installing closed circuit television inside train compartments to combat crime and introducing female-only compartments to protect female commuters.

Action

Admin /
MTRCL

9. In response, MTRCL explained that the installation of inflatable train door seals for the older model MTR trains would take 7 years to complete because the trains were in active use to provide service every day. The time window for the installation works was limited. Besides, they would consider setting up means to broadcast the latest news inside train compartments of TCL during the future refurbishment. MTRCL would also continue to promote the courtesy campaign by various means to encourage passengers to give priority seats to those in need. MTRCL explained that the sale of goods, including food and beverage, at stations provided convenience to passengers whereas forbidding passengers to eat and drink inside compartments aimed to provide a clean environment for passengers. Furthermore, MTRCL explained that both the Railway District of the Hong Kong Police Force and MTRCL had been working closely together to combat indecent assault on trains and they would provide the relevant information on the number of indecent assault cases in MTR for members' reference in due course.

Safety issue

10. Members showed grave concerns over the fatal incident with regard to a woman jumping onto the track as the train approached Tai Wai Station on 30 June 2013. They therefore urged MTRCL to retrofit automatic platform gates ("APGs") for the East Rail Line ("ERL") and the Ma On Shan Line ("MOSL") the soonest possible. Besides, some members also expressed concern over the news reports that MTR train captains used mobile phone while on duty. They asked for information on the number of captains who had ever violated the guidelines on the use of mobile phones; and what the maximum penalty was. In addition, it was observed that passengers at Central Station could reach the concourse from the platform via 2 escalators only. Some members were worried that passengers might fall from the escalators when both the platform and concourse were overcrowded. In this connection, it was suggested that MTRCL should review its crowd control management at Central Station and other stations with similar problem.

11. MTRCL responded that the provision of a safe and reliable railway service was of paramount importance. Before initiating the APG retrofitting works, MTRCL had to solve a series of technical problems, including replacement of the signalling system; extension of platform and so on. It was envisaged that with the completion of the Shatin to Central Link, APGs along MOSL and ERL would be fully operational in 2017 and 2020 respectively. MTRCL also explained that there were clear guidelines on the use of mobile phones by train captains. Essentially, train captains might use mobile phones only when communicating with the Operations Control Centre or other

Action

MTRCL staff; and during emergency. If train captains violated the guidelines on the use of mobile phones, warnings might be issued. For serious cases, MTRCL might take disciplinary actions against the train captains.

Train delays and maintenance works

12. Some members noticed that the total number of delays of 8 minutes or more between 1 January and 31 May 2013 had dropped when compared to that of 2012. However, they expressed concern over the causes of train delays. It was found that 40 out of 75 delays from 1 January to 31 May 2013 in heavy rail were attributed to equipment fault and members were worried whether such was due to the ageing fleet of trains and track. Some members also expressed concern about MTRCL's recent signalling problems. To better understand the various causes of train delays in heavy rail, they asked MTRCL to provide updated and detailed breakdown of those delays by categories as well as time interval. Some members also expressed concern over MTRCL's maintenance works, such as the deployment of outsourcing staff of MTRCL and the rail inspection for heavy rail by the latest ultrasonic testing vehicle.

Admin /
MTRCL

13. In response to members' views and concern, MTRCL advised that their procedures for maintenance and repairs were aligned with international practices and they would annually invest \$5 billion in asset maintenance, repair and replacement. MTRCL further explained that under the fail-safe design, in case of irregularities of the signalling system, trains would be slowed down and stopped for the sake of safety. MTRCL indicated that from 1 January to 31 May 2013, of the total number of 75 delays in the heavy rail network, 73 were between 8 and 30 minutes; one was between 31 and 60 minutes; and one exceeded 60 minutes. They would submit the supplementary information on train delays for members' reference in due course.

Overcrowding in train compartments

The
Clerk to
arrange
the visit

14. Some members expressed concerns over the problem of overcrowding in MTR trains at certain stations (e.g. Admiralty Station) and on some railway lines (e.g. Tseung Kwan O Line, TCL, MOSL, ERL, West Rail Line) during peak hours. They suggested increasing train frequency and developing new railway projects in the long run to alleviate the problem. It was also suggested that visits to certain ERL stations be organized for members to better understand the problem of over-crowdedness as well as the nuisance caused by parallel traders.

Action

15. In response, MTRCL advised that they had implemented various service enhancements since 2012 to ease the crowding problem and reduce waiting time of passengers under the "Listening•Responding Programme". MTRCL also explained that they had deployed additional platform assistants to maintain platform order during peak hours. They would closely monitor their service performance and increase the train frequency as and when necessary, subject to the safe operation of the railway.

Other issues

Admin

16. Some members asked whether the export of MTRCL's services to other countries had undermined its existing local services. In addition, some members opined that MTRCL should further examine the noise problem arising from railway operation at Chai Wan Station and the ventilation problem caused by North Point Station to the nearby buildings (e.g. Tung Fat Building). One member also pointed out that upon the rail merger, the review of relevant by-laws had not yet been completed and follow-up was required. Besides, members also suggested MTRCL to offer more significant fare concessions to long-distance frequent travellers; review MTRCL's handling of incidents; and transform the current Light Rail system to an elevated automated people mover system to cope with the latest development in the New Territories.

17. In response, MTRCL explained that while the export of services to other countries and the Mainland of China would add value to MTRCL's business portfolio, they would continue to deploy adequate resources to operate safe and reliable railway service for the people of Hong Kong. Moreover, they would continue their efforts to mitigate the impact of the noise and ventilation problems arising from railway operation. Besides, MTRCL stated that they had set up the Customer Service Rapid Response Unit to improve MTRCL's handling of incidents and the merged Operations Control Centre at Tsing Yi to enhance overall control of the MTR service. Content of the smartphone apps and website of MTRCL would also be enhanced to provide more timely and useful information to passengers.

III Coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of West Island Line ("WIL") and South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)")

(LC Paper
CB(1)1421/12-13(05))

No.- Administration's paper on coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of

Action

WIL and SIL(E)
LC Paper No. CB(1)1421/12-13(06) - Paper on WIL and SIL(E)
prepared by the Legislative
Council Secretariat
(background brief)

18. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration briefed members on the coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E).

19. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**). Members' major views and concerns were summarized in the ensuing paragraphs.

Public transport re-organization plans ("PT Plans")

20. Some members expressed concern about how the transport services would be coordinated after the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E), particularly for residents travelling from Wah Fu, Wah Kwai and Aberdeen to Queen Mary Hospital. In addition, some members opined that the Administration should also take traffic flows in the vicinity of Wong Chuk Hang area into consideration when devising PT Plans. They also suggested having more direct routes after rationalization of bus and green minibus routes, maintaining some alternative transport services so that passengers could still enjoy certain franchised bus and green minibus services, offering free shuttle bus service or fare concessions on feeder service for residents nearby, and setting up a public transport interchange.

21. The Chairman added that the Administration should provide specific information to be included in the consultation documents on the coordination of public transport services to the Subcommittee, in particular those for Kennedy Town and Wong Chuk Hang Stations. If possible, the Chairman suggested paying a site visit to the new WIL and SIL(E) in order to better understand the circumstances at an appropriate time.

Admin
to
arrange

(Post-meeting note: The full District Council consultation documents on the coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E) were passed to the Legislative Council on 30 July 2013 [LC Paper No. CB(1)1636/12-13(01)].)

22. The Administration explained that upon the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E), a number of passengers currently taking road-based transport might switch to the railway service given the much shorter journey time.

Action

Due to the change in passenger demand, the service level of bus and green minibus routes should be rationalized to avoid duplication and to maintain overall network efficiency. In the course of devising PT Plans, the Transport Department ("TD") would maintain some alternative transport services so that passengers could still enjoy certain franchised bus and green minibus services. TD had already briefed the public transport trades on the proposed arrangements for the new railway lines and would consult the relevant District Councils in due course on the proposed PT Plans. The Administration stated that they would take account of the stakeholders' views and adjust the PT Plans and implementation programme where necessary.

Admin

23. The Administration supplemented that they would submit documents with detailed proposals to the relevant District Councils and seek their views on the proposed PT Plans to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). To address members' concerns, they would also provide such information to the Subcommittee for members' reference.

Impact to public transport industry

24. Members generally expressed concerns that the commissioning of the railway lines might adversely affect the livelihood of bus drivers and minibus drivers. They suggested that the Administration should communicate with the stakeholders and provide support to those affected professional drivers. Some members were worried that no franchised bus operators or minibus operators would be willing to operate the routes as proposed by TD, even though relevant District Councils agreed with TD's proposal after consultation.

25. In response, the Administration explained that when devising the PT Plans, TD had maintained close liaison with the stakeholders, including franchised bus operators and minibus operators. The re-organization of franchised bus services would be put in place to ensure the overall efficiency and integrity of the transport network. The franchised bus operators would reallocate their manpower and vehicles, or arrange the exit of excess manpower through natural wastage, rather than having any laid-offs. The Administration advised that the impact of PT Plans on the employment situation of the public transport trades should be mild.

Way forward

26. Some members urged the Administration to conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study for the overall benefit of the local transport system. Besides, they supported the development of South Island Line

Action

(West) to meet the growing transport demand and allow easier access to Queen Mary Hospital for people with disabilities.

IV Any other business

27. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
13 December 2013

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 5 July 2013, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000416 – 000440	Chairman	Information paper issued since the last regular meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Service performance of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")</i>			
000441 – 000829	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the service performance of MTRCL.	
000830 – 002545	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1473/12-13(01)], MTRCL gave a briefing on their service performance from January to May 2013.	
002546 – 003018	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed the following views and concern:</p> <p>(a) while appreciating that MTRCL had accepted his suggestion of installing inflatable train door seals to reduce in-cabin noise levels, Mr WONG enquired about the estimated time of completion of such works for the 90 older model MTR trains;</p> <p>(b) being a directly elected Legislative Council Member from the Hong Kong Island geographical constituency, Mr WONG asked when public toilets would be available at all Island Line stations; and</p> <p>(c) citing the fatal incident with regard to a woman jumping onto the track as the train approached Tai Wai Station on 30 June 2013 as an example, Mr WONG was dissatisfied that MTRCL had not yet improved platform safety for many years, in particular at Tai Wai and Kowloon Tong Stations.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) it was estimated that the installation of inflatable train door seals for the 90 older model MTR trains would take 7 years to complete as each train had 80 doors, and the trains were in active use to provide service every day. The time window for the installation works was limited;</p> <p>(b) public toilets would be installed at MTRCL's interchange stations during their major refurbishment. Such works would be completed at 3 major interchange stations, i.e. Admiralty, Mong</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Kok and Prince Edward Stations, by 2015; and</p> <p>(c) noting members' grave concern over retrofitting automatic platform gates ("APGs") for the East Rail Line ("ERL") and the Ma On Shan Line ("MOSL"), MTRCL explained that the provision of a safe and reliable railway service was of paramount importance. Before initiating the retrofitting works, MTRCL had to solve a series of technical problems, including replacement of the signalling system; extension of platform to fit the increase in the number of train compartments from 4 to 8; etc.</p>	
<p>003019 – 003519</p>	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Hak-kan MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Hak-kan conveyed the following views:</p> <p>(a) from 1 January to 31 May 2013, it was found that 40 out of 75 delays for heavy rail were attributed to equipment fault. As some of the trains had serviced ERL for some 30 years, Mr CHAN wondered whether the equipment fault was due to the ageing of the fleet;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL's response to service disruptions was disappointing. A recent example was the fatal incident at Tai Wai Station on 30 June 2013 in which a woman jumped onto the track and was hit by a train. Mr CHAN suggested that MTRCL should review of its arrangements of incident handling, such as prompt dissemination of information to passengers on the incidents and service disruptions; and</p> <p>(c) while appreciating the provision of free Wi-Fi service at all MTR stations, Mr CHAN opined that it would be better to extend such service up to 30 minutes.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL's procedures for maintenance and repair aligned with international practices. They invested \$5 billion on asset maintenance, repair and replacement annually. In addition, MTRCL would procure new trains when ERL was linked up with the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL");</p> <p>(b) the Customer Service Rapid Response Unit was set up to improve MTRCL's incident handling. Besides, content of their smartphone apps and website would be enhanced to provide more timely and useful information to passengers. Moreover, the merged Operations Control Centre at Tsing Yi would further enhance communication; and</p> <p>(c) passengers would be able to enjoy the free Wi-Fi</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>service at all MTR stations for 15 minutes each time and they might renew such service for each eligible device 5 times per day.</p>	
003520 – 003950	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan MTRCL	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) the 75 delays in heavy rail between 1 January and 31 May 2013 were roughly equal to one delay every 2 days on average and caused much inconvenience to the commuters. Mr LEE noted that there were 2 delays exceeding 30 minutes in June 2013. To better understand the underlying causes of the delays in heavy rail services, Mr LEE asked MTRCL to provide updated and detailed breakdown of those delays by categories as well as time interval in the heavy rail network; and</p> <p>(b) why MTRCL had outsourced its maintenance works, such as those in Tseung Kwan O Line, to contractors.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) from 1 January to 31 May 2013, of the total number of 75 delays in the heavy rail network, 73 were between 8 and 30 minutes; one was between 31 and 60 minutes; and one exceeded 60 minutes. MTRCL would submit supplementary information for members' reference in due course; and</p> <p>(b) in line with international practices, MTRCL had outsourced its maintenance works of the railway system on account of contractors' professional skills. For certain maintenance works, such as maintenance of the fire services system and escalators, MTRCL would employ qualified contractors to comply with the requirements stipulated in relevant ordinances and MTRCL's service standards.</p>	Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 13 of minutes)
003951 – 004429	Chairman Mrs Regina IP MTRCL	<p>Mrs Regina IP raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) the total number of delays of 8 minutes or more between 1 January and 31 May 2013 had decreased when compared to that of 2012. MTRCL indeed positioned well among other international railway systems;</p> <p>(b) what kind of MTRCL's services had been exported overseas and whether this had undermined the existing local service provided to the people of Hong Kong;</p> <p>(c) installation of public toilets at major interchange MTR stations reflected that MTRCL was willing to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>address public's views and concerns; and</p> <p>(d) while shops inside stations sold food and drinks, MTRCL prohibited passengers from eating or drinking inside compartments. MTRCL should review such policy.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL provided services as regards management systems of railway operations, safety and asset management systems and so on to other places, including Beijing, Hangzhou, Shenzhen, London, Sweden and Australia. The export of services would add value to MTRCL's business portfolio. While some staff would be posted overseas, MTRCL would continue to deploy adequate resources to operate safe and reliable railway service for the people of Hong Kong;</p> <p>(b) public toilets were now available at ERL, West Rail Line ("WRL") and MOSL. As regards the remaining stations, public toilets would be installed at MTRCL's interchange stations during their major refurbishment; and</p> <p>(c) while allowing the sale of food and drinks at stations for the sake of convenience MTRCL prohibited passengers from eating and drinking inside compartments with an aim to providing a clean environment for passengers. MTRCL so far received passengers' support for this policy.</p>	
004430 – 004939	Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG raised the following views and concern:</p> <p>(a) though nothing that MTRCL encountered technical difficulties like being blocked by a sewer pipe in Hing Fat Street, MTRCL should solve the problems together with relevant departments like the Drainage Services Department to install an external lift at Tin Hau Station. It would facilitate passengers to participate in large-scale activities at Victoria Park. Besides, MTRCL should further study how to enhance the access for passengers to reach their destinations, e.g. the many office buildings near Quarry Bay and Fortress Hill Stations;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL had not yet solved the noise problem arising from railway operation at Chai Wan Station for over 20 years. They might consider collaborating with different parties and retrofitting noise barriers to alleviate the problem;</p> <p>(c) MTRCL should further examine how to solve the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>problem of hot air emitted from the ventilation system of North Point Station affecting the nearby buildings like Tung Fat Building; and</p> <p>(d) in order to let passengers enjoy art easily and comfortably, MTRCL should designate more station areas for the local arts groups or the public to stage their performance or display their artwork.</p> <p>MTRCL replied that:</p> <p>(a) despite facing challenging technical difficulties, MTRCL had already formulated preliminary proposals to install external lifts at Fortress Hill and Shau Kei Wan Stations, whereas they would continue to seek solutions to address the technical problems at Tin Hau Station;</p> <p>(b) as regards the noise problem arising from railway operation, MTRCL would continue their efforts to mitigate the problem; and</p> <p>(c) along the MTR lines, there were ventilation facilities for safety operation of the railway. MTRCL would take the public's concern into account and minimize the impact of those ventilation facilities to buildings nearby, say by adjusting their operating hours.</p>	
004940 – 005431	Chairman Mr Gary FAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) while appreciating the provision of free Wi-Fi service at all MTR stations and the launch of courtesy campaign, Mr FAN opined that there was room for improvement for MTRCL to encourage passengers to give priority to those in need to use the lifts and wide gates. For instance, during peak hours, MTRCL might consider assigning their staff to assist passengers at the entrance of lifts and wide gates to provide assistance;</p> <p>(b) according to page 7 of MTRCL's powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1473/12-13(01)], 80% of the passengers found that trains and platforms were less crowded. Mr FAN, however, pointed out that the figure was not applicable to ERL, the trains on which were overcrowded due to the nuisance caused by parallel traders. He suggested paying visits to certain ERL stations to understand the circumstances;</p> <p>(c) as regards the Chairman's earlier concern about the use of mobile phones by MTR train captains on duty, Mr FAN asked for the number of captains who had violated the guidelines on the use of mobile phones before and what the penalty was; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) when public toilets would be made available at all MTR stations.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) since last year, MTRCL had put up labels and signage near 20 lifts to remind passengers to give priority to those in need to use the lifts and it proved to be effective. In this connection, MTRCL would continue such promotion activity at other lifts and consider arranging station assistants at some lift entrances to improve the situation;</p> <p>(b) to solve the problem of over-crowdedness at ERL, MTRCL had limited the maximum weight of luggage to 23 kilograms to combat the parallel trading activities. The new measure was effective; and</p> <p>(c) there were clear guidelines on the use of mobile phones by train captains. Essentially, train captains might use mobile phones only when communicating with the Operations Control Centre or other MTRCL staff; and during emergency. MTRCL also provided training to remind train captains about the guidelines and the safety requirements when operating trains. Besides, MTRCL had in place a system to monitor train captains' performance. Supervisors would go on board the trains from time to time for inspection or spot check purposes. To address the public concern, MTRCL had enhanced its inspection on train captains' performance.</p> <p>The Chairman agreed with Mr FAN's suggestion and the Subcommittee would conduct visits to certain ERL stations later to better understand the situation.</p>	<p>The Clerk to arrange the visit</p>
<p>005432 – 010059</p>	<p>Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT MTRCL</p>	<p>Dr Elizabeth QUAT raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) while appreciating MTRCL's service enhancements, Dr QUAT expressed grave concern about MTRCL's recent signalling problems. The information provided by MTRCL did not indicate how many delays were caused by signalling problems. Nevertheless, such problems led to delays at Tseung Kwan O and Tiu Keng Leng Stations on 13 March and 11 April 2013 respectively;</p> <p>(b) during peak hours, passengers might have to wait for 2 to 3 trains at some stations, especially for Tseung Kwan O Line and MOSL, in order to board a train. MTRCL should consider developing the North Island Line to alleviate the over-crowdedness in the long run;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) Dr QUAT asked MTRCL to provide the number of cases of indecent assault in MTR in the previous year and the current year. Besides, MTRCL should consider installing closed circuit television inside train compartments and introducing female-only compartments to protect female passengers from indecent assault;</p> <p>(d) echoing Mr WONG Kwok-hing's views on the fatal incident about a woman jumping onto the track as the train approached Tai Wai Station on 30 June 2013, Dr QUAT urged MTRCL to retrofit APGs for ERL and MOSL soonest possible; and</p> <p>(e) while appreciating the provision of Wi-Fi service at all MTR stations, Dr QUAT enquired about the number of Wi-Fi spots available at each station.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL procured and maintained the signalling system in alignment with international practices to ensure provision of safe and reliable railway service. Besides, the signalling system was very complicated. Over 8 000 train trips per day were operated and it was inevitable that minor problems would arise. In addition, under the fail-safe design, when there were irregularities of the signalling system, trains would be slowed down and stopped for the sake of safety;</p> <p>(b) both the Railway District of the Hong Kong Police Force and MTRCL had been working closely together to combat the crime of indecent assault. Besides, MTRCL put up posters at MTR stations to step up the promotion of anti-crime messages. Passengers were encouraged not to remain silent but to report crime immediately to the Police or station staff for prompt assistance. MTRCL would provide the requested information for members' reference in due course; and</p> <p>(c) MTRCL would review the usage of the free Wi-Fi spots available at all MTR stations.</p>	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 9 of minutes)</p>
<p>010100 – 010507</p>	<p>Chairman Mr Frankie YICK MTRCL</p>	<p>Concerns and questions raised by Mr Frankie YICK were as follows:</p> <p>(a) Mr YICK shared Mrs Regina IP's opinion that Hong Kong was indeed doing well in the provision of railway service by international standard. In brief, there was about 1 delay for every 10 000 train trips in heavy rail and such service performance should be acceptable;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) echoing Mr CHAN Hak-kan's views, Mr YICK suggested that MTRCL should closely monitor their maintenance service for MTR trains and to pay heed to the ageing problem of the trains;</p> <p>(c) in spite of the complexity involved, Mr YICK suggested that MTRCL should consider the replacement of the signalling system;</p> <p>(d) MTRCL should speed up the installation of public toilets and external lifts at MTR stations;</p> <p>(e) passengers at Central Station could reach the concourse from the platform via 2 escalators only. Mr YICK was worried that passengers might fall from the escalators when both the platform and concourse were overcrowded. In this connection, MTRCL should review its crowd control management at Central Station and other stations with similar conditions; and</p> <p>(f) what would be the maximum penalty for train captains who used mobile phone on duty and whether MTRCL had ever penalized any train captains for this before.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL would install public toilets at interchange stations when they underwent major refurbishment, and external lifts at MTR stations without one at an appropriate time;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL would follow up Mr YICK's observation at Central Station and take actions as necessary; and</p> <p>(c) MTRCL had in place a system to monitor train captains' performance. If train captains violated the guidelines on the use of mobile phones, warnings might be issued. For serious cases, MTRCL might take disciplinary actions against the concerned train captains.</p>	
010508 – 010924	Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL	<p>Mr Tony TSE expressed the following concerns:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL ranked high amongst railways in major cities. However, MTRCL should implement enhancement measures in response to passengers' views and concern;</p> <p>(b) though MTRCL announced earlier that the average train loading during peak hours was around 70%, Mr TSE did not agree with the figure, and observed that the loading was indeed much higher, in particular at Admiralty Station. He asked whether MTRCL was</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>able to further increase its train frequency, or whether the train loading had already reached its saturation, making it impossible to increase the frequency;</p> <p>(c) it was observed that passengers might not always give priority seats to those in need. He suggested that MTRCL should consider means to restrict passengers from occupying those designated seats for people in need; and</p> <p>(d) it would be appreciated if MTRCL would offer more fare concessions to long-distance frequent travellers.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) since 2012, MTRCL had implemented various service enhancements to ease the overcrowding problem and reduce waiting time for passengers under the "Listening • Responding Programme", including increase in train frequency; adjustment in train schedules; and study of different railway projects; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL had launched the courtesy campaign in major heavy rail lines to encourage passengers giving priority seats to those in need, such as senior citizens, persons with disabilities and pregnant women, since 2009. This campaign received support from passengers. In this connection, MTRCL would continue their efforts in promoting the campaign by various means, like the music video by Hip Hop artist MastaMic on the do's and don'ts of good MTR passenger behaviour.</p>	
010925 – 011339	Chairman Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Dr LO Wai-kwok raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) as regards the fatal incident of a woman jumping onto the track as the train approached Tai Wai Station on 30 June 2013, Dr LO stated that he was affected by the incident and found that affected passengers showed concern towards the victim, rather than the train delay. He asked MTRCL about the latest progress of retrofitting APGs for ERL and MOSL; and</p> <p>(b) while appreciating MTRCL's usage of the latest ultrasonic testing vehicle to conduct the rail inspection for heavy rail since January 2013, Dr LO enquired about the speed or accuracy of the testing, the time required to complete a testing cycle and the result of the recent testing of the rail.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) while understanding members' concern on the early retrofitting of APGs for ERL and MOSL, MTRCL should at the same time provide safe and reliable railway service. Before the commencement of the retrofitting works, MTRCL had to replace the signalling system, extend the platform and so on. MTRCL envisaged that with the completion of SCL, APGs along MOSL and ERL would be operational in 2017 and 2020 respectively; and (b) the ultrasonic testing vehicle was able to enhance both the speed and accuracy of the rail inspection. Besides, it would take around 2 to 6 weeks to complete a testing cycle. This was much faster than using other rail testing method. In addition, MTRCL's patrolmen and manual ultrasonic testing equipment would also play an auxiliary role in the rail inspection. 	
011340 – 011757	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan MTRCL	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed the following views and concern:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was appreciated that MTRCL had adjusted MTR student fare concessions in response to the public's views; (b) in order to cope with the development and population growth in the New Territories, how MTRCL would alleviate the crowdedness on WRL; (c) the Tung Chung Line ("TCL") train currently ran at an average headway of about 8 minutes, how MTRCL would improve the train frequency of TCL to meet the growing transport demand; and (d) MTRCL should review and increase the number of escalators at MTR stations. <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) they had all along been closely monitoring the service level and passengers' demand of WRL. WRL patronage was higher during peak hours, but generally it could still cope with passengers' need. Most of the passengers were able to get on the first train arriving at the platform. Besides, they deployed additional platform assistants at WRL during peak hours to maintain order at the platform. They would closely monitor their service performance and increase the train frequency if necessary; and (b) they would collaborate with stakeholders to study 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the possibility to install extra escalators at MTR stations.</p> <p>The Chairman remarked that escalators were sometimes more efficient than lifts and MTRCL therefore should take this into consideration.</p>	
011758 – 012222	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung MTRCL	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) to alleviate the overcrowding problem at MTR stations, such as Mong Kok Station, during peak hours, MTRCL should stop turning the public space into shops at MTR station concourse;</p> <p>(b) why MTRCL had not yet retrofitted APGs for ERL and MOSL; and</p> <p>(c) as the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project would cost about \$66.8 billion, whether MTRCL had ever estimated the opportunity cost for MTRCL's service enhancement, like installation of PSDs, APGs or external lifts.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that provision of safe and reliable railway service was of paramount importance. In order to retrofit APGs for ERL and MOSL, MTRCL had to replace the signalling system and train fleet for ERL, and extend the platform. It was estimated that with the completion of SCL, APGs along MOSL and ERL would be operational in 2017 and 2020 respectively.</p>	
012223 – 012928	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Michael TIEN expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) while appreciating MTRCL's outstanding performance in heavy rail, he was worried about the safety of the Light Rail system, which had to use the road surface with other vehicles and the train captains had to react to actual road conditions. The Light Rail derailment incident on 17 May 2013 was an example; and</p> <p>(b) the existing Light Rail system in Hong Kong had possibly reached its saturation. In this connection, Mr TIEN urged the Administration and MTRCL to transform the current Light Rail system to a new system in order to cope with the latest development in the New Territories. He requested the Administration to provide a timetable for such transformation.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that after the Light Rail derailment incident, MTRCL had implemented a number of enhancement measures, including more frequent</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>reminders to Light Rail captains on the importance of safe driving and stepping up of spot-checks within the Light Rail network regarding the speed of Light Rail vehicles.</p> <p>The Administration replied that:</p> <p>(a) Mr TIEN's recommendation would be taken into account when pursuing the relevant policies; and</p> <p>(b) although railway was the backbone of the public transport system, the Transport Department ("TD") had been making continuous efforts to coordinate different public transport services to improve the local transportation, such as the implementation of various bus route rationalization plans.</p>	
012929 – 013451	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) like other railway lines, MTRCL should consider broadcasting instant news inside train compartments of TCL;</p> <p>(b) as regards the fatal incident of a woman jumping onto the track on 30 June 2013, Mr TANG urged MTRCL to speed up the retrofitting of APGs for ERL and MOSL;</p> <p>(c) MTRCL should be penalized if any passenger fell onto the railway track; and</p> <p>(d) the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Scheme should cover passengers falling onto the railway track. Mr TANG explained that sometimes the victim falling might be caused by faint or being pushed by others, resulting in injuries or death.</p> <p>MTRCL noted Mr TANG's suggestion and would consider installing means to broadcast the latest news inside train compartments of TCL during their refurbishment.</p> <p>The Administration explained that in accordance with the service performance arrangement under the new Fare Adjustment Mechanism, MTRCL might be fined for serious service disruptions. Nevertheless, disruptions caused by factors outside MTRCL's control, like passengers' behaviour and bad weather, would be exempted.</p>	
013452 – 013743	Chairman Mr James TO Administration	Mr James TO pointed out that upon the rail merger, the review of relevant by-laws had not yet been completed.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		In response, the Administration would update the Subcommittee on the progress of the review of MTR by-laws in due course.	Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 16 of minutes)
<i>Agenda Item III – Coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of West Island Line ("WIL") and South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)")</i>			
013744 – 014304	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the coordination of public transport services to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E).	
014305 – 014908	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <p>(a) Mr WONG reflected the views of the Southern District Council that they supported the development of South Island Line (West) ("SIL(W)") to meet the growing transport demand; and</p> <p>(b) Mr WONG expressed concerns on how transport services would be coordinated, particularly for residents travelling from Wah Fu, Wah Kwai and Aberdeen to Queen Mary Hospital.</p> <p>The Administration made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the views of the Southern District Council on the development of SIL(W) were noted and would be considered as appropriate;</p> <p>(b) upon the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E), a number of passengers currently taking road-based transport might switch to railway service given the shorter journey time. Due to the change in passenger demand, the service of bus and green minibus routes should be rationalized to avoid duplication of service and to maintain overall network efficiency;</p> <p>(c) TD would consult the relevant District Councils on the proposed public transport re-organization plans ("PT Plans") to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). The PT Plans included the provision of 7 new bus or green minibus feeder services to the new railway stations; and</p> <p>(d) to address the pressing need of feeder service to and from Queen Mary Hospital, a new green minibus feeder service to serve between Kennedy Town Station and Queen Mary Hospital had been proposed.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		The Chairman requested the Administration to set out the information of the PT Plans in table format for members' reference.	Administration to provide information / response (paragraph 23 of minutes)
014909 – 015437	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu Administration	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu raised the following views:</p> <p>(a) the Administration should reply to his letter enquiring about MTRCL's service performance;</p> <p>(b) according to the Administration, about 200 buses in total would be saved under the PT Plans and as a result, the livelihood of 500 bus drivers in total would be affected. Mr TANG enquired whether the Administration had assessed the negative impact of the PT Plans on the livelihood of professional drivers; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration indicated that upon the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E), some taxis and red minibuses currently operating mainly in the Western and Southern Districts would expand their service to other districts. In this connection, the Taxi & PLB Concern Group submitted a letter to the Subcommittee expressing their worries about the commissioning of the new railways on the public transport industry. Mr TANG asked if the Administration had communicated well with the stakeholders.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that:</p> <p>(a) while devising the PT Plans, TD had maintained close liaison with the stakeholders, including franchised bus operators and minibus operators. The re-organization of franchised bus services would be put in place to ensure the overall efficiency and integrity of the public transport network. The franchised bus operators would reallocate their manpower and vehicles, or arrange the exit of excess manpower through natural wastage, rather than having any laid-offs; and</p> <p>(b) it was estimated that around 200 buses would be saved under the PT Plans, including about 100 from the Citybus Limited, about 100 from the New World First Bus Services Limited plus some from the Kowloon Motor Bus Co. (1933) Limited. TD had already briefed the public transport trades on the proposed arrangements for the new railway lines and the pick-up / set-down facilities to be provided at the new railway stations.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015438 – 015918	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK Administration	<p>Mr Frankie YICK expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was good for the Administration to have completed a consultancy study on the coordination of other transport services before the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). Hopefully problems such as those faced by the public transport sector during the commissioning of Tseung Kwan O Line could be avoided; (b) in view of the letter from the Taxi & PLB Concern Group, Mr YICK asked if the public transport trades was fully consulted or not; and (c) Mr YICK urged the Administration to conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study. <p>The Administration responded as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) when devising the PT Plans, TD had already briefed the public transport trades, in particular franchised bus operators and minibus operators, on the proposed arrangements for the new railway lines. They were in general supportive of TD's proposal. The Administration would closely monitor the actual situations and maintain communication with the stakeholders. Where necessary, the details and pace of the implementation programme would be adjusted; and (b) the consultant for the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 was collating the public views collected during the two-stage Public Engagement exercise and optimizing the planning of the major regional railway corridors and local enhancement schemes. The Administration would consider the consultant's final recommendations and explore the way forward for different railway projects with a view to announcing the results to the public in 2014. 	
015919 – 020430	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai raised the following views and questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) during rationalization of bus and green minibus routes, the Administration should place emphasis on having more direct routes; (b) resources to be saved under the PT Plans should be reallocated to other bus services. Mr WU enquired whether the Administration would conduct a comprehensive review of the bus services provided by different bus operators or reorganize the bus services on a district-by-district basis; 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) whether the PT Plans would involve any bus-interchange schemes, like the bus route rationalization in North District. If yes, whether the Administration would consider setting up a public transport interchange on Hong Kong Island; and</p> <p>(d) as regards the Taxi & PLB Concern Group's worries that the commissioning of the new railways would affect the livelihood of professional drivers, Mr WU asked if the Administration would review the existing no-stopping restriction zones to alleviate the problem.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) bus and green minibus resources saved under the PT Plans would be reallocated to other bus and green minibus services, if there were new demands for them;</p> <p>(b) when devising the PT Plans, TD had already briefed the relevant public transport trades on the proposed arrangements for the new railway lines, such as the pick-up / set-down points to be provided at new railway stations to serve various public transport modes;</p> <p>(c) the Administration would not necessarily designate more no-stopping restriction zones just because of the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). Generally speaking, in planning for designation of no-stopping restriction zones, the public transport trades would be consulted; and</p> <p>(d) the service level of bus and green minibus routes would be adjusted appropriately through route cancellation, diversion or frequency reduction. Simultaneously, service improvement measures like new routes, route extension or frequency improvement would also be introduced to meet new demand for feeder services to the new railway stations. In the course of devising the PT Plans, TD would maintain some alternative public transport services to ensure that passengers could still have a choice of alternative mode of public transport service.</p>	
020431 – 020939	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung Administration	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung raised the following concerns:</p> <p>(a) upon the commissioning of the new railway lines, the livelihood of the bus drivers and minibus drivers would be affected. The Administration should provide support to those affected professional drivers;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) when devising the PT Plans, the Administration should pay attention to traffic congestion that might be resulted near the south end of the Aberdeen Tunnel and Wong Chuk Hang Road;</p> <p>(c) whether free shuttle bus service to and from the new railway stations or fare concessions on feeder service would be provided to residents nearby;</p> <p>(d) it was difficult for people with disabilities to travel to Queen May Hospital by minibuses. Mr KWOK thus urged the Administration to develop SIL(W) soonest possible; and</p> <p>(e) after the commissioning of the railways concerned, TD should maintain some alternative transport services so that passengers could still have certain franchised bus and green minibus services.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that:</p> <p>(a) the feeder service from Pokfulam area to the new railway stations would be enhanced. In addition, public transport interchange facilities would be included in the design of Wong Chuk Hang Station where pick-up / set-down areas would be designated for franchised buses, minibuses and private cars; and</p> <p>(b) it was estimated that traffic flow would be improved upon the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). The Administration would monitor the traffic flow nearby, including the flow at traffic lights and road junctions.</p>	
020940 – 021212	Chairman Administration	<p>If possible, the Chairman suggested conducting a site visit to the new WIL and SIL(E) before their commissioning in order to have a better understanding of the arrangements.</p> <p>The Administration advised that they would submit documents to the relevant District Councils and seek their views on the proposed PT Plans to tie in with the commissioning of WIL and SIL(E). To address members' concerns, they would also provide such information to the Subcommittee for members' reference in due course.</p>	<p>Administration to arrange</p> <p>Administration to provide information / response (paragraph 23 of minutes)</p>