

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)78/13-14  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

**Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development**

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting  
held on Monday, 10 June 2013, at 8:45 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** :
- Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
  - Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
  - Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
  - Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
  - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
  - Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
  - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
  - Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
  - Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
  - Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
  - Hon Claudia MO
  - Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
  - Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
  - Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
  - Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
  - Hon CHAN Han-pan
  - Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
  - Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
  - Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
  - Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
  - Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
  - Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen
- Members absent** :
- Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
  - Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
  - Hon YIU Si-wing
  - Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP

**Public Officers** : Items III to IV  
**attending**

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP  
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Ms Elizabeth TAI  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs  
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH  
Chief Executive Officer

Dr Lars NITTVE  
Executive Director, M+

Mr Louis YU  
Executive Director, Performing Arts

Ms Bonny WONG  
Director, Chief Executive Officer's Office

**Attendance** : Item IV  
**by invitation**

*Session One*

Young DAB

Miss Iris WONG Ping-fan  
Member

The Lion Rock Institute

Mr Andrew SHUEN  
Research Director

Zuni Icosahedron

Mr Mathias WOO  
Co-Artistic Director and Executive Director

The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong

Ms Liza WANG  
Chairperson

The Chinese Opera Academy of Hong Kong

Mr YUEN Siu-fai  
Vice Chairman

Tang Shu-wing Theatre Studio

Mr TANG Shu-wing  
Artistic Director

Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society

Mr LAM Man-kong  
President

Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong

Ms Janet TAM Mei-hing  
Executive Director

Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture

Ms Ada WONG, JP  
Chief Executive

Individual

Mr IP Ngo-tung  
Member of Yau Tsim Mong District Council

International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong

Mr John BATTEN  
President

Chung Ying Theatre Company

Mr KO Tin-lung  
Artistic Director

Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra Limited

Mr YAN Hui-chang  
Artistic Director and Principal Director

Hong Kong Repertory Theatre

Mr CHAN Kin-bun  
Executive Director

Wholala

Mr LEE Ting-chuen  
Director

Art of Nature International Company Limited

Dr Cissy CHEUNG  
President

Individual

Mr LIN Ming-chen

Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance

Ms Jennifer CHOW Kit-bing  
Convenor

Individual

Mr U Ka-long

Individual

Mr WONG Kwok-fun

Individual

Miss Judy PANG

Individual

Mr KONG Chun-kit

Individual

Miss Angel LEUNG

Individual

Mr CHENG Kai-to

Individual

Ms CHOI Wai-shan

*Session Two*

City Contemporary Dance Company

Mr Willy TSAO Sing-yuen  
Artistic Director

The Hong Kong Ballet

Ms Rebecca IP  
Executive Director

Hong Kong Dance Company

Mr Gerard C C TSANG  
Executive Director

Hong Kong Culture Monitor

Ms Anthony LEUNG Po-shan  
Member

The Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Limited

Mr Michael MACLEOD  
Chief Executive

Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Limited

Ms Tisa HO  
Executive Director

Opera Hong Kong Limited

Mr Edward S T HO  
Chairman

Individual

Mr KAN Tai-keung, Museum Expert Adviser of the  
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association

Professor WONG Kam-fai, MH  
Executive Committee Member

Hong Kong Arts Centre

Mr Nelson LEONG  
Chairman, Board of Governors

Hong Kong Arts Administrators Association

Ms Connie LAM  
Chairperson

Individual

Mr KWONG Chi-ching

Democratic Party

Mr LEUNG Chung-wai  
Research Officer

Individual

晴女士

Individual

潘善剛先生

Individual

楊南昌先生

Association of Hongkong Dance Organizations

Mr TO Siu-leung  
Deputy Chairman

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Alice LEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Josephine SO  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Jasmine TAM  
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

---

Action

**I. Matters arising**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(01))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Members noted the list of follow-up actions required of the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") arising from the discussions of the Joint Subcommittee at its meetings on 8 April and 23 April 2013.

**II. Date of next meeting and items for discussion**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1181/12-13(01)-(03) and CB(2)1298/12-13(01))

3. Members noted the response of the Administration and WKCD to the letters from the Chairman, Miss CHAN Yuen-han and Mr Gary FAN on issues relating to the financial situation of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") project.

4. Members agreed that an additional meeting be scheduled for Wednesday, 3 July 2013, from 8:30 am to 10:30 am to discuss the item "Financial situation of and arrangements for the WKCD project", which was originally scheduled for discussion at the meeting on 10 July 2013. Members also agreed that the Joint Subcommittee would discuss the item "Integration

Action

and connectivity of WKCD with the neighbouring districts" at the meeting on 10 July 2013.

**III. Development of cultural software**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1247/12-13(02) and (03))

5. Mr MA Fung-kwok declared interest as a member of the Board of WKCDA.

Admin/  
WKCDA

6. The Joint Subcommittee requested the Administration/WKCDA to -

- (a) provide further information on the Government's plan to provide an additional funding of \$150 million to strengthen the training of arts administrators for five years starting from 2013-2014, including details of the major training programmes/initiatives launched/to be launched as well as the amount of funding earmarked for and the number of training places offered/to be offered under each programme/initiative;
- (b) advise on the amount of resources provided by the Education Bureau for developing learning and teaching materials to support the implementation of the arts and cultural education in schools, as referred to in paragraph 29 of Appendix to Annex 2 to the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02));
- (c) provide the relevant information and statistics (e.g. holistic/by-phase targets and actual number of participants/beneficiaries) in respect of the major initiatives undertaken/planned by the Administration/WKCDA in supporting artistic and professional development, arts education and audience development, as outlined in Annexes 1 and 2 to the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02));
- (d) advise whether the Administration has set any specific targets for the development of cultural software to complement the WKCD project and if so, the respective roles of and the division of work between the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and WKCDA in achieving the targets;
- (e) explain the scope of and strategy for the collection of M+, in particular whether it would focus mainly on artworks of Hong Kong visual culture to be acquired both locally and from abroad, or whether it would comprise a mix of Hong Kong, Chinese, Asian and global visual culture; and



Action

- (f) respond to a member's concern that with only a small number of curators from Hong Kong in its curatorial team, how M+ could achieve its mission to develop content from a Hong Kong perspective and promote Hong Kong visual culture.

**IV. Communication and co-operation with the arts community**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1247/12-13(04) and (05))

Admin/  
WKCD

7. The Joint Subcommittee requested the Administration/WKCD to provide a written response to the following views -

- (a) the communication between WKCD and the arts community was ineffective; and
- (b) given that the Consultation Panel ("CP") of WKCD formed under the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority Ordinance (Cap. 601) was intended to provide a platform for consulting regularly and openly and building consensus among stakeholders and the general public on major matters relating to the work of WKCD, the Administration/WKCD should critically review the work and enhance the role of CP to ensure that it would fully and properly discharge its intended functions.

**V. Any other business**

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:04 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
17 October 2013

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor  
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project  
held on Monday, 10 June 2013, at 8:45 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item I - Matters arising</i>			
000434 - 000451	Chairman	List of follow-up actions required of the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(01)].	
<i>Agenda Item II - Date of next meeting and items for discussion</i>			
000452 - 000625	Chairman	Members' agreement to scheduling an additional meeting on 3 July 2013 and the items to be discussed respectively at the meetings on 3 July and 10 July 2013.	
<i>Agenda Item III - Development of cultural software</i>			
000626 - 001004	Chairman Admin WKCDA	Briefing by the Administration and WKCDA on the development of cultural software to complement the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") project [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02)].	
001005 - 001415	Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok Admin	<p>Mr MA Fung-kwok's declaration of interest.</p> <p>Mr MA's views that -</p> <p>(a) instead of entrusting the task of developing cultural software entirely to WKCDA, the Government should play a leading and more proactive role in the planning and promotion of cultural software development not only for the WKCD project but also for the overall long-term development of the arts and culture in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) while WKCDA had an annual budget of \$30 million for developing cultural software in preparation for the commissioning of the core arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, the Government should allocate more resources to facilitate cultural software development in other contexts, such as promoting culture and the arts in the community and strengthening support for small and medium arts groups.</p> <p>In response to Mr MA's enquiry about the Administration's plan for promoting cultural software development outside the context of the WKCD project, the Administration advised that -</p> <p>(a) apart from the work being undertaken by WKCDA, the Government and its collaborators</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>had been implementing various initiatives to strengthen cultural software development in Hong Kong, details of which were set out in Annex 2 to the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02)]. The Government would communicate closely with WKCDA in taking forward the aforesaid initiatives, which would also complement the WKCD project; and</p> <p>(b) in addition to increasing funding allocation to the Hong Kong Arts Development Council ("HKADC") to enhance its support for small and medium arts groups, the Government had since 2011 introduced the Arts Capacity Development Funding Scheme to disburse an annual provision of around \$30 million to support worthwhile initiatives from arts practitioners as well as small and medium arts groups which contributed to the cultural and arts development in the community. The Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") had also increased its funding support for young artists and small and medium arts groups to stage performances in LCSD's arts and cultural programmes and activities.</p>	
001416 - 001827	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCDA	<p>Ms Claudia MO's concern about how WKCDA would prove to the local community, especially the arts community, that the WKCD project would not become a white elephant.</p> <p>WKCDA's response that -</p> <p>(a) although a full team of WKCDA had been in place for only three years, concrete progress had been made in various aspects of the WKCD project, including completion of the statutory planning process of the Development Plan for WKCD, conduct of design competitions for the Xiqu Centre and M+, implementation of various arts and cultural programmes and activities to build audience and to groom local talents, etc.; and</p> <p>(b) in its view, the major concern of the arts community and the general public was to expedite the implementation of the WKCD project which was first raised in 1998. WKCDA would continue its effort in explaining the vision and values of the WKCD project to the arts community as well as the broader community, so as to build consensus and secure support for the early realization of the project.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
001828 - 002312	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's views that -</p> <p>(a) the Administration and WKCD should provide opportunities for local talents to take part in the WKCD project so that they would be able to benefit from the transfer of expertise from the foreign talents engaged in the project; and</p> <p>(b) given that many local arts groups and arts practitioners were no longer able to operate in industrial buildings owing to the rental increase in recent years, the Administration should step up efforts to make available more arts space for them in districts, thereby facilitating the promotion of arts and culture in the community.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that -</p> <p>(a) to nurture talents for the development of arts and cultural industries as well as the WKCD project, the Government planned to provide an additional funding of \$150 million to strengthen the training of arts administrators at various level of experience for five years starting from 2013-2014;</p> <p>(b) from 2013-2014 onwards, the District Councils would be provided with an additional \$20.8 million per annum under the Community Involvement Fund to strengthen the support for promoting arts and cultural activities in 18 districts; and</p> <p>(c) additional funding had been earmarked for HKADC to renovate and make available arts space for artists in an industrial building in Wong Chuk Hang. HKADC would undertake renovation works and operate a scheme to enable new and budding artists to lease the units for arts creation at a concessionary rate.</p> <p>The Administration was requested to provide further information on the Government's plan to provide an additional funding of \$150 million for the training of arts administrators.</p>	<p><b>Admin to provide information</b> (paragraph 6(a) of the minutes)</p>
002313 - 002717	Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCD	<p>Mr Tony TSE's views and enquiry that -</p> <p>(a) the Administration and WKCD should seek to facilitate the transfer of expertise to local talents in taking forward the WKCD project;</p> <p>(b) arts education should be enhanced to promote</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>knowledge and appreciation of the arts and culture;</p> <p>(c) more blackbox theatres should be provided in WKCD to meet the needs of local small and medium arts groups; and</p> <p>(d) whether the alleged delay in the completion of the Hong Kong section of Guangzhou -Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") as reported by the media would have any impact on the WKCD project, and whether WKCD had formulated any contingency plans and measures to deal with the situation.</p> <p>WKCD's advice that -</p> <p>(a) WKCD currently had a total of 143 staff members, of whom 90% were from Hong Kong. WKCD had all along intended to recruit the best expertise in Hong Kong and supplement it with overseas expertise where necessary for the benefit of WKCD as well as the arts and cultural development in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) there was no indication of any change in the completion timetable of the XRL project. WKCD was in the process of reviewing its plans for the development of the Park and the provision of a blackbox and other movable structures in the Park area, which would provide the much-needed performing space for small arts groups/organizations in Hong Kong.</p>	
002718 - 003241	Chairman Ms Emily LAU Admin	<p>In response to Ms Emily LAU's enquiry about the efforts made by the Administration in promoting arts education in schools and enhancing the arts appreciation ability of the public, the Administration advised that -</p> <p>(a) the Education Bureau ("EDB") had been supporting schools to implement arts education through the provision of learning and teaching materials, teacher training programmes, financial resources and student activities, details of which were set out in Appendix 2 of the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02)];</p> <p>(b) the Audience Building Office of LCSD also helped to promote knowledge and appreciation of performing arts at community and school levels through organizing a wide spectrum of audience building schemes and arts educational activities, such as "School Culture Day</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Scheme", "Arts Experience Scheme for Senior Secondary Students" and "Performing Arts Criticism Project", many of which were targeted at students and young audiences; and</p> <p>(c) HKADC had also organized the "Arts Ambassadors-in-School Scheme", which aimed to encourage primary and secondary students with a flair for the arts to become arts ambassadors and take their passion for the arts beyond campuses into the community.</p> <p>At the request of Ms LAU, the Administration undertook to advise on the amount of resources provided by EDB for developing learning and teaching materials to support the implementation of the arts education in schools.</p> <p>Ms LAU's suggestion that representatives of EDB and the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") should be invited to attend the Joint Subcommittee's meeting when the subject of the promotion of arts education in schools was discussed in future.</p>	<p><b>Admin to provide information</b> (paragraph 6(b) of the minutes)</p>
003242 - 003627	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Admin	Mr Gary FAN's enquiries about the latest financial situation of and arrangements for the WKCD project and the Chairman's advice that relevant issues had been scheduled to be discussed at the Joint Subcommittee's meeting on 3 July 2013.	
003628 - 004123	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman's enquiry about whether the Administration/WKCD had set any specific holistic/by-phase targets for the development of cultural software (e.g. the number of visits made to public museums by primary/secondary school students, the number of arts talents trained by the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA"), the number of arts critics nurtured in a certain period of time, etc.), so as to facilitate review of the progress made in the relevant areas of work.</p> <p>The Administration's response that while it might not be suitable to set specific and quantitative targets for the development of cultural software which was a long-term undertaking and relatively abstract in nature, information concerning the arts and cultural programmes organized by the Government and its collaborators, such as the target and actual numbers of participants of individual arts and cultural events/training schemes, the attendance figures of LCSD's museums, etc., was available and could be provided upon request. Besides, the key performance targets and indicators in respect of the planned programmes for the promotion and development of culture and the arts</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>were set out in the Controlling Officer's Report incorporated in the Government's Estimates for each financial year.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's request for information and statistics concerning the major initiatives undertaken/planned by the Administration/WKCDA for supporting cultural software development.</p>	<p><b>Admin/WKCDA to provide information</b> (paragraph 6(c) of the minutes)</p>
004124 - 004633	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam WKCD	<p>Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry about the attendance at the Mobile M+: INFLATION! exhibition and his views that -</p> <p>(a) apart from enhancing the nurturing of local artistic and creative talents, the Administration and WKCD should attach equal importance to strengthening the training of facility management professionals so as to meet the future manpower demand arising from the phased commissioning of the WKCD facilities in the next few years; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should consider, at the policy level, how to encourage and provide more opportunities for young people to join the arts and creative industries.</p> <p>WKCD's advice that the Mobile M+: INFLATION! exhibition held from 25 April to 9 June 2013 attracted an attendance of 150 000. WKCD was conscious of the necessity to be able to bring audiences to the WKCD site and encourage them to participate in the activities on the site. It would continue to organize more arts, cultural and community events to activate and animate the WKCD site.</p>	
004634 - 005110	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Admin	<p>Dr Helena WONG's concern about the quality of the arts-related programmes currently offered by various tertiary institutions and her enquiry about which government bureau(x) was/were responsible for monitoring and ensuring the quality of these programmes.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that -</p> <p>(a) education programmes offered by tertiary institutions were under the purview of EDB and the University Grants Committee ("UGC"). The eight institutions funded by UGC had been granted self-accreditation status and were responsible for assuring the quality of their own programmes. While EDB and UGC would monitor the quality of the programmes offered by these funded institutions, they had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>the autonomy to decide on the courses to be offered having regard to, among others, the career prospects of the graduates after completion of the courses; and</p> <p>(b) HAB provided an annual subvention to HKAPA to offer programmes in performing arts and related technical arts. There had been keen demand for places of HKAPA's programmes and around 200-300 students were admitted by HKAPA every year. HAB had increased funding allocation to HKAPA to facilitate its migration from a three-year to a four-year undergraduate degree structure starting from the 2012-13 academic year.</p>	
005111 - 005359	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman's view that the Government had all along lacked a knowledge management strategy and failed to tap the experience and expertise of the arts management/museum professionals retired from the former Municipal Councils and LCSD in the implementation of the WKCD project. His suggestion that the Administration should seek to identify these retirees and consider appointing them to relevant advisory boards and committees ("ASBs"), so that they could provide expert advice to the Government on matters relating to the development of arts and culture.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it was committed to recruiting local talents and would bring in foreign talents where necessary to support the development of arts and culture in Hong Kong. Many retired arts personnel from LCSD had remained active and were participating in various areas of work in the local arts sector. For instance, the incumbent Chief Executives of HKADC and some major performing arts groups had formerly served in LCSD. Dr Joseph TING Sun-pao, former Chief Curator of the Hong Kong Museum of History, had also been appointed to a number of committees in relation to the arts and culture under LCSD. The Administration would continue to identify and appoint suitable retired arts professionals to relevant ASBs as appropriate.</p>	
005400 - 005719	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Admin	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG's views and concerns that -</p> <p>(a) nurturing of audience was pivotal to the success of the WKCD project and students should be given sufficient opportunities to cultivate their interest and appreciation ability in the arts and culture in an early stage; and</p> <p>(b) HAB should enhance collaboration with EDB in allocating more resources and strengthening</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>support to primary and secondary schools, so as to facilitate the development and implementation of effective strategies and measures for the teaching and learning of the arts and culture in schools.</p> <p>The Administration's response that HAB had maintained close liaison and discussion with EDB on the promotion of arts education in schools. Under the new senior secondary curriculum, students were provided with more opportunities to learn and sustain contacts with the arts and culture. Details of the current provision of and EDB's support to arts education in schools were set out in Appendix to Annex 2 to the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(02)]. The Audience Building Office of LCSD also organized a wide spectrum of activities to promote knowledge and appreciation of the arts at school levels.</p>	
005720 - 005925	Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok Admin	The Administration was requested to provide a written response to Mr MA Fung-kwok's concern about whether the Administration had set any specific targets for the development of cultural software to complement the WKCD project and if so, the respective roles of and the division of work between LCSD and WKCD in achieving the targets.	<b>Admin to follow up</b> (paragraph 6(d) of the minutes)
005926 - 010129	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCD	Ms Claudia MO's suggestion that WKCD should consider adopting "Chinese Opera" as the English translation for "戲曲".	
010130 - 010727	Chairman Dr Helena WONG	Dr Helena WONG's request for a written response from WKCD to her concerns about the development of M+.	<b>WKCD to follow up</b> (paragraph 6(e) and 6(f) of the minutes)
<i>Agenda Item IV - Communication and co-operation with the arts community (Session One)</i>			
010728 - 011038	Chairman Young DAB	<p>Presentation of views that -</p> <p>(a) WKCD should indicate clearly to the local arts community its plan on the implementation of individual arts and cultural facilities in WKCD and strengthen its consultation and communication with the stakeholders on relevant issues;</p> <p>(b) the Administration and WKCD should disclose information on the financial situation of the project as soon as possible and strive to formulate a more effective cost-control proposal; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		(c) M+ as a flagship museum in Hong Kong should undertake a core mission to promote Hong Kong art and consider including more local artworks in its collection.	
011039 - 011327	Chairman The Lion Rock Institute	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1377/12-13(01)]	
011328 - 011647	Chairman Zuni Icosahedron	Presentation of views that -  (a) the local arts community was becoming more and more frustrated with and concerned about the slow progress and possible serious overspending of the WKCD project;  (b) the Administration and WKCD should provide a clear and detailed account of the reasons for the drastic increase in the estimated construction cost of the Xiqu Centre, and enhance its accountability to the public in the implementation of the WKCD project;  (c) an open and fair mechanism should be put in place to enable small and medium-sized architectural firms to participate in the planning and management of various works under the WKCD project; and  (d) WKCD should make available information on its strategy for software development for the future facilities in WKCD, including the proposed mode of governance and business models for individual performing arts venues.	
011648 - 011936	Chairman The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(02)]	
011937 - 012248	Chairman The Chinese Opera Academy of Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(03)]	
012249 - 012600	Chairman Tang Shu-wing Theatre Studio	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1280/12-13(01)]	
012601 - 012913	Chairman Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(06)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
012914 - 013209	Chairman Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1280/12-13(02)]	
013210 - 013518	Chairman Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture	Concerns were raised about -  (a) how the art-themed park in WKCD would be developed, including whether public views would be sought on the park design and the art installations to be displayed in the park; and  (b) the future governance structure of the Xiqu Centre.	
013519 - 013806	Chairman Mr IP Ngo-tung Member of Yau Tsim Mong District Council	Mr IP Ngo-tung's declaration that he was a member of the Board of WKCDA.  Presentation of views that -  (a) the Yau Tsim Mong District Council ("YTMDC") had all along been concerned about the WKCD development and had followed closely with WKCDA on various issues relating to the WKCD project; and  (b) there was room for enhancement in WKCDA's consultation with YTMDC, in particular on issues relating to the holding of events and activities on the WKCD site and the management of the future Park, which were of concern to the residents in the district.	
013807 - 014111	Chairman International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong	Expression of appreciation for the Mobile M+: INFLATION! exhibition and concern about the lack of progress made by the Administration/WKCDA in formulating the mode of governance for the various facilities in WKCD, especially M+, which in its view should be managed by an independent Board in order to ensure a high degree of autonomy.	
014112 - 014423	Chairman Chung Ying Theatre Company	Presentation of views that -  (a) apart from pressing ahead with the implementation of the WKCD project, the Administration should also attach importance to, and formulate a comprehensive plan for, the overall arts and cultural development in Hong Kong;  (b) in tandem with the hardware development of WKCD, the Administration and WKCDA should strive to develop cultural software through, among others, enhancing arts education, cultivating audience base, and	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>strengthening the grooming of local artistic talents;</p> <p>(c) while consideration might be given to introducing popular performing programmes from abroad, the future performing venues in WKCD should focus mainly on presenting local arts and cultural performances/ productions;</p> <p>(d) WKCD should indicate clearly to the local arts community the relationship between WKCD and the local arts groups/artists, and seek to forge closer collaboration and partnership with them through, for instance, implementation of residency schemes; and</p> <p>(e) WKCD should consider outsourcing the management of individual performing venues in WKCD through open tenders. Tenderers should be required to submit proposals on, among others, the artistic directions, programming strategies and business models for individual venues.</p>	
014424 - 014740	Chairman Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(07)]	
014741 - 015051	Chairman Hong Kong Repertory Theatre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(08)]	
015052 - 015358	Chairman Wholala	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(04)]	
015359 - 015724	Chairman Art of Nature International Company Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1377/12-13(02)]	
015725 - 020042	Chairman Mr LIN Ming-chen	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(09)]	
020043 - 020347	Chairman Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(10)]	
020348 - 020451	Chairman Mr U Ka-long	Expression of support for the proposal of Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance for establishing a Cantonese Opera museum in WKCD.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
020452 - 020607	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-fun	Expression of concern about the long-standing shortage of performance venues in Hong Kong and worry that a significant proportion of the public resources for the development of the arts and culture had been devoted to the WKCD project and yet little progress had been made so far.	
020608 - 020716	Chairman Miss Judy PANG Mr KONG Chun-kit Miss Angel LEUNG Mr CHENG Kai-to Ms CHOI Wai-shan	Expression of support for the proposal of Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance for establishing a Cantonese Opera museum in WKCD.	
020717 - 021232	Chairman Admin WKCDA	<p>The Administration's response that it would take note of deputations' views and continue to work closely with WKCDA in taking forward the development of the various facilities in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA's responses that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the arts and cultural venues to be built in WKCD were determined having regard to, among others, the aspirations of the local arts community reflected in the previous public engagement exercises. WKCDA would continue to maintain dialogue with the arts groups/artists to ensure that the future facilities in WKCD would meet their needs and aspirations;</li> <li>(b) WKCDA would strive to complete the Xiqu Centre in time by 2016, recognizing the importance of Xiqu as a traditional Chinese art form not only in Hong Kong but also in the broader China;</li> <li>(c) M+ aimed to build a world-class collection representative of the 20th and 21st century visual culture, encompassing the disciplines of visual art, design, architecture, and moving image from Hong Kong, China, and expanding to other regions of Asia and the rest of the world;</li> <li>(d) to ensure that WKCD was a place for everyone, WKCDA would endeavour to provide easy, convenient and barrier-free access to and within WKCD and maintain communication with the disabled community in this regard; and</li> <li>(e) WKCDA had adopted a prudent approach in the management of its financial resources and would continue to do so in future to ensure efficient use of public funds. Since its</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>establishment in 2008, WKCDA had incurred a cumulative expenditure of \$950 million.</p>	
<p>021333 - 021928</p>	<p>Chairman Ms Emily LAU Zuni Icosahedron The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance</p>	<p>Ms Emily LAU's concern about whether an effective mechanism was in place for the local arts community to communicate with WKCDA and express their views on various aspects of the WKCD project.</p> <p>Zuni Icosahedron's remark that local arts groups had had numerous meetings with the Administration to express their views and concerns but there seemed to be no follow-up on the issues raised so far.</p> <p>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong's view that as the Xiqu Centre was the first core arts and cultural facility to be delivered in WKCD, WKCDA had made considerable efforts in initiating and maintaining communication and cooperation with the Association and the Xiqu community on various issues relating to the development of the Xiqu Centre.</p> <p>Hong Kong Oil Painting Research's concern that WKCDA had not consulted the local arts community on the acquisition of Dr Uli Sigg's collection of artworks by M+, notwithstanding that huge amount of public funding was involved.</p> <p>Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture's declaration that its Chief Executive was a member of the Consultation Panel of WKCDA ("CP"). Its expression of disappointment that CP conducted meetings only once or twice a year and had failed to discuss many important issues such as the development of the Park in WKCD and the financial position of the WKCD project. Its view that it was imperative for WKCDA to step up efforts in keeping the general public posted of the work being undertaken by WKCDA and the latest development of WKCD.</p> <p>International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong's view that there had been a number of channels for members of the public to participate in the planning of the WKCD development (e.g. submission of views to the Town Planning Board on the draft Development Plan of WKCD).</p> <p>Hong Kong Cantonese Operatic Singing Alliance's view that WKCDA should strengthen its communication with local Cantonese Opera groups operating in various districts.</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
021929 - 022416	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Hong Kong Repertory Theatre International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong	<p>In response to Dr Helena WONG's enquiry, the deputations made the following responses -</p> <p>(a) Hong Kong Oil Painting Research was concerned about WKCDA's capability to promote local arts and culture, given that the current management of WKCDA had very limited knowledge of oriental arts and the cultural ecology in Hong Kong and only a few members of the Board of WKCDA had arts and cultural backgrounds;</p> <p>(b) Hong Kong Repertory Theatre was of the view that the future performing venues in WKCD should focus on presenting local arts and cultural productions. Its suggestion that WKCDA should enhance communication and collaboration with the local arts community in developing more effective strategies and measures for cultivating local audience base; and</p> <p>(c) International Association of Art Critics Hong Kong was of the view that while M+ was still developing on different fronts, it had made considerable efforts in engaging the local visual arts community.</p>	
022417 - 022832	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin WKCDA	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's concern about how the Administration and WKCDA would ensure that local arts and cultural workers would have the opportunity to participate in the WKCD project and benefit from the transfer of expertise from foreign experts brought in by WKCDA.</p> <p>WKCDA's response that only 10% of its serving staff were recruited from abroad. WKCDA had always tried to recruit locally and would bring in talents from other places only when the requisite expertise was not available in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Administration's response that with the aim to find the best expertise to support the arts and cultural development in Hong Kong, the Administration considered it justifiable to bring in a small number of foreign talents and experts where necessary and appropriate. In an effort to support the grooming of local talents, the Government planned to provide an additional funding of \$150 million to strengthen the training of arts administrators through the provision of a range of local and overseas training and internship programmes.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
022833 - 023239	Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok Zuni Icosahedron Mr LIN Ming-chen Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture	<p>In response to Mr MA Fung-kwok's enquiry about the arts and cultural environment in Hong Kong since the establishment of WKCDA, the deputations made the following responses -</p> <p>(a) Zuni Icosahedron was of the view that the environment for the development of local arts and culture was worsening in recent years, asserting that the Government often claimed that it was unable to increase its funding allocations to local arts groups and develop new arts and cultural venues for the reason that much of the public financial resources for the arts and culture had been channelled to the WKCD project.;</p> <p>(b) Mr LIN Ming-chen considered that the artworks acquired by M+ were unable to reflect the essence and characteristics of Hong Kong arts and culture; and</p> <p>(c) Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture was of the view that the current funding resources for small and medium arts groups were still very limited. The long-standing shortage of performance venues and arts spaces in Hong Kong was also not conducive to the development of budding artists and small and medium arts groups.</p>	
023240 - 023701	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman's strong view that with CP having held only 10 meetings since its establishment in 2008, the Administration had clearly failed to fulfill its undertaking to the Bills Committee on WKCDA Bill of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") that CP would perform a role similar to that of Metropoli-30 in Bilbao of Spain and serve as an open platform for consulting regularly and building consensus among stakeholders and the general public on major matters relating to the work of WKCDA. His enquiry about whether the Administration would strengthen the work of CP so as to ensure that it would fully and properly discharge the functions expected of it.</p> <p>The Administration's concurrence that CP could do yet a better job as the bridge between WKCDA and the public. The Administration would request WKCDA to discuss with the new Chairman of CP how CP could discharge its functions more effectively.</p> <p>The Administration/WKCDA was requested to provide a written response to the Deputy Chairman's views in relation to the role and</p>	<b>Admin/WKCDA to provide response</b>



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		functions of CP.	(paragraph 7 of the minutes)
023702 - 024122	Chairman Ms Cyd HO The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong	<p>Ms Cyd HO's view that WKCDA should ensure that the bylaws to be drawn up for the management of the Park in WKCD would not prohibit the staging of street performances in WKCD or inhibit the public from enjoying the Park freely.</p> <p>In response to Ms HO's concern about the involvement of arts groups in the future management of the arts and cultural venues in WKCD, the Chinese Artist Association of Hong Kong said that WKCDA had initiated discussions with the Association on the artistic positioning and the mode of governance of the Xiqu Centre but no conclusions had yet been reached. The Association hoped that the Xiqu Centre would focus mainly on promoting local Cantonese Opera and that its artistic director would be a seasoned practitioner in the local Xiqu sector who should be very familiar with local Cantonese Opera.</p>	
024123 - 024527	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture Wholala	<p>On Ms Claudia MO's enquiry about WKCDA's response to the views received in relation to the Park development in WKCD, Hong Kong Institute of Contemporary Culture said that -</p> <p>(a) given that the Park in WKCD was the first major art-themed park in Hong Kong, WKCDA should seek the views and preferences of the public on how the Park should be built and make available more information about the latest progress of the Park development; and</p> <p>(b) it had been suggested that a public consultation should be conducted on the planning and development of the Park but WKCDA had so far not been responsive to the suggestion.</p> <p>In response to Ms MO's enquiry, Wholala said that in view of the large number of independent musicians/music groups in Hong Kong, its proposal for setting up a music street in WKCD sought to make available free and dedicated space in WKCD for the staging of local music performances.</p>	
024528 - 024959	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's view that WKCDA should step up efforts in communicating with and allaying the concerns of the local arts community so as to build consensus and enlist their support for the WKCD project.	
025000 - 030146	<i>Break</i>		

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item IV - Communication and co-operation with the arts community (Session Two)</i>			
030147 - 030844	Chairman City Contemporary Dance Company The Hong Kong Ballet Hong Kong Dance Company	Chairman's opening remarks  Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1247/12-13(011) and CB(2)1298/12-13(05)]	
030845 - 031200	Chairman Hong Kong Culture Monitor	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(06)]	
031201 - 031426	Chairman The Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(07)]	
031427 - 031650	Chairman Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(12)]	
031651 - 032014	Chairman Opera Hong Kong Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1280/12-13(03)]	
032015 - 032316	Chairman Mr KAN Tai-keung, Museum Expert Adviser of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1247/12-13(13)]	
032317 - 032624	Chairman Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(08)]	
032625 - 032809	Chairman Hong Kong Arts Centre	Presentation of views that WKCDA should be mindful of the impact of its fund-raising methods on the other arts and cultural organizations in Hong Kong, and seek to explore innovative ways to raise funds and expand its fund-raising network for the WKCD project should the need arise.	
032810 - 033043	Chairman Hong Kong Arts Administrators Association	Presentation of the view that the Cultural Leadership Summit jointly organized by WKCDA and the Hong Kong Arts Administrators Association since 2011 was an example of how WKCDA and local arts/cultural institutions could complement each other and achieve synergy in the organization of artistic and professional development programmes for the local arts community.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
033044 - 033344	Chairman Mr KWONG Chi-ching	Presentation of the view that consideration should be given to setting up a music street in WKCD with reference to overseas experiences (e.g. Japan and Taiwan), as it would help facilitate the development of local music, promote tourism and create more employment opportunities.	
033345 - 033704	Chairman Democratic Party	Presentation of the view that instead of imposing excessive control and restrictions, WKCDA should adopt a bottom-up approach in managing the facilities and public space in WKCD with due regard to users' views, and identify and allow suitable organizations to take on the management of individual venues in WKCD. In the absence of a clear cultural policy, WKCD would only become a mega space for consumer spending without providing sufficient space for arts and cultural workers to engage in artistic creations and exchange.	
033705 - 034004	Chairman 晴女士	Presentation of views that -  (a) alternative proposals on the overall layout and development of the WKCD should be adopted such that the underground potential could be fully utilized and the commercial gains maximized;  (b) more effective strategies should be developed for promoting arts education in schools; and  (c) more green initiatives should be incorporated in the development of WKCD.	
034005 - 034621	Chairman 潘善剛先生 楊南昌先生	Presentations of view that the Administration and WKCDA should make collaborative efforts to enhance the provision of arts and cultural spaces in the community and strengthen arts education in Hong Kong, so as to promote wider participation in arts and culture and encourage more young people to develop their artistic talents and potential.	
034622 - 034942	Chairman Association of Hongkong Dance Organizations	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1298/12-13(09)]	
034943 - 035818	Chairman Admin WKCDA	The Administration's advice that LCSD had been following up the recommendations made in the Ombudsman's investigation report on the booking and use of recreation and sports facilities managed by LCSD, which was released in September 2012. LCSD had introduced a number of measures to improve the booking arrangements and allocation of the recreation and sports facilities under its management, with a view to striking a balance	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>between meeting the demand for use of the facilities by organizations/individuals and ensuring operational efficiency.</p> <p>On the deputations' views, WKCDA responded that -</p> <p>(a) WKCDA would maintain dialogue with different arts and cultural organizations on various issues, including specific proposals concerning the development and management of individual venues in WKCD, the training of local talents etc., and explore with them potential cooperation opportunities; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA would exercise caution in exploring alternative funding sources for the WKCD project and would consult the local arts industry and LegCo as appropriate before proceeding with any major fund-raising proposals.</p>	
035819 - 040245	Chairman Ms Emily LAU WKCDA	<p>In response to Ms Emily LAU's concern, WKCDA advised that it had all along attached great importance to stakeholder engagement and had in the past few months devoted much effort to conducting meetings and discussions with the arts groups/artists from the performing arts and visual arts community. WKCDA was committed to engaging and building partnership with the local arts community in the course of taking forward the WKCD project and would continue its efforts in this regard.</p>	
040246 - 040706	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Mr KWONG Chi-ching WKCDA	<p>In reply to Ms Claudia MO's enquiries about the proposal of setting up a music street in WKCD, Mr KWONG Chi-ching said that the proposal would help promote the diversified development of local music and provide more development opportunities for local musicians and music groups. WKCDA responded that the Freespace Fest held on the WKCD site in December 2012 was essentially geared towards local music and local performances and a rerun was planned in 2013. The event was intended as a precursor to the Freespace, which would be situated inside the future Park in WKCD and provide venues for contemporary music performances by local young musicians.</p> <p>On Ms MO's further enquiry about the current status of establishing a literature museum in WKCD, WKCDA advised that while no provision had been made for setting up such a facility in WKCD, WKCDA was considering providing suitable spaces for literary activities in WKCD to address the needs of the literary community.</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
040707 - 041142	Chairman Deputy Chairman	<p>The Administration/WKCDA was requested to provide a written response to -</p> <p>(a) the deputations' view that the communication between WKCDA and the arts community was ineffective; and</p> <p>(b) how CP would perform its due role and intended functions.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's suggestion that given the concerns raised over the communication between the Administration/WKCDA and the local arts community, the Joint Subcommittee should continue to follow up the subject in future.</p>	<b>Admin/WKCDA to provide response</b> (paragraph 7 of the minutes)
041143 - 041555	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Hong Kong Culture Monitor City Contemporary Dance Company	<p>Ms Cyd HO's concerns about whether WKCDA had consulted small and medium arts groups on their needs for venues/spaces in WKCD and how major performing arts groups could render assistance to the development of small and medium arts groups.</p> <p>Hong Kong Culture Monitor's view that while preference was generally given to big corporations and large-scale developments under the existing government policy, a sufficient pool of small and medium enterprises and arts workers was indispensable for the robust and vibrant development of the arts and cultural industries in Hong Kong. It was hoped that the Government and WKCDA would put in place a regular communication/consultation mechanism to gauge the views and understand the needs of individual arts workers and small arts groups/organizations, so as to ensure the diversified and balanced development of arts and culture in Hong Kong.</p> <p>City Contemporary Dance Company's remark that as one of the major performing arts groups in Hong Kong, it attached great importance to its relationship with the small and medium arts groups and had shared resources with them through, for instance, providing dance rooms for them to hire at concessionary rates.</p>	
041556 - 041906	Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok City Contemporary Dance Company	<p>In response to Mr MA Fung-kwok's enquiry about the proposal for establishing a purpose-built dance theatre in WKCD and whether dance performances could also be staged at multi-purpose performing venues, the City Contemporary Dance Company said that while there were specific requirements in regard to the stage and rehearsal facilities for the conduct of dance performances, it had no objection to the idea of staging dance performances at multi-purpose performing venues, provided that the</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
		facilities provided in these venues could meet the dance performers' needs.	
041907 - 042001	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
17 October 2013