

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(3) 118/13-14

Ref : CB(3)/M/MM

Tel : 3919 3300

Date : 31 October 2013

From : Clerk to the Legislative Council

To : All Members of the Legislative Council

Council meeting of 6 November 2013

**Amendments to motion on
“Imposing economic sanctions on the Philippines and
restoring Hong Kong people’s dignity”**

Further to LC Paper No. CB(3) 87/13-14 issued on 25 October 2013, five Members (Hon Alice MAK, Hon IP Kwok-him, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon Mrs Regina IP and Hon CHAN Chi-chuen) have respectively given notices of their intention to move separate amendments to Hon Albert CHAN’s motion on “Imposing economic sanctions on the Philippines and restoring Hong Kong people’s dignity” scheduled for the Council meeting of 6 November 2013. As directed by the President, the respective amendments will be printed in the terms in which they were handed in on the Agenda of the Council.

2. The President will order a joint debate on the above motion and amendments. To assist Members in debating the motion and amendments, I set out below the procedure to be followed during the debate:

- (a) the President calls upon Hon Albert CHAN to speak and move his motion;
- (b) the President proposes the question on Hon Albert CHAN’s motion;
- (c) the President calls upon the five Members who wish to move amendments to speak in the following order, but no amendment is to be moved at this stage:
 - (i) Hon Alice MAK;

- (ii) Hon IP Kwok-him;
 - (iii) Hon SIN Chung-kai;
 - (iv) Hon Mrs Regina IP; and
 - (v) Hon CHAN Chi-chuen;
- (d) the President calls upon the public officer(s) to speak;
- (e) the President invites other Members to speak;
- (f) the President gives leave to Hon Albert CHAN to speak for the second time on the amendments;
- (g) the President calls upon the public officer(s) to speak again;
- (h) in accordance with Rule 34(5) of the Rules of Procedure, the President has decided that he will call upon the five Members to move their respective amendments in the order set out in paragraph (c) above. The President invites Hon Alice MAK to move her amendment to the motion, and forthwith proposes and puts to vote the question on Hon Alice MAK's amendment;
- (i) after Hon Alice MAK's amendment has been voted upon, the President deals with the other four amendments; and
- (j) after all amendments have been dealt with, the President calls upon Hon Albert CHAN to reply. Thereafter, the President puts to vote the question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion, or his motion as amended, as the case may be.

3. For Members' reference, the terms of the original motion and of the motion, if amended, are set out in the **Appendix**.

(Odelia LEUNG)
for Clerk to the Legislative Council

Encl.

(Translation)

**Motion debate on
“Imposing economic sanctions on the Philippines and
restoring Hong Kong people’s dignity”
to be held at the Council meeting of 6 November 2013**

1. Hon Albert CHAN’s original motion

That, on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; due to the Philippine authorities’ serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the victims’ families at all, even adopting an extremely poor attitude in handling the incident; however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan’s announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, and the progress is hardly acceptable and is grossly unjust to the victims’ families, this Council urges the Government to impose strong and forceful economic sanction measures, so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the victims’ families, i.e. to apologize to the victims’ families, to offer compensation to the victims’ families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists’ personal safety.

2. Motion as amended by Hon Alice MAK

That, on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; due to the Philippine authorities’ serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, *and the Incident Investigation and Review Committee which was set up under the instruction of the President of the Philippines AQUINO III also categorically pointed out the blunders of the relevant authorities in the incident*, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the victims’ families at all, ~~even adopting an extremely poor attitude~~ *with its*

attitude, especially that of its President, being extremely poor in handling the incident; however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan's announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, and the progress is hardly acceptable and is grossly unjust to the victims' families, this Council ***calls on the public to unite and hold the Philippine Government responsible, and*** urges the Government to impose strong and forceful economic sanction measures, so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the victims' families, i.e. to apologize to the victims' families, to offer compensation to the victims' families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists' personal safety.

Note: Hon Alice MAK's amendment is marked in ***bold and italic type*** or with deletion line.

3. Motion as amended by Hon IP Kwok-him

That, ***Hong Kong people have yet to forget the incident that*** on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; due to the Philippine authorities' serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the victims' families at all, even adopting an extremely poor attitude in handling the incident; however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan's announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, and the progress is hardly acceptable and is grossly unjust to the victims' families, this Council urges the Government to impose strong and forceful economic sanction measures, ***and calls on the various sectors in the society to unite and support the SAR Government in holding negotiations with the Philippine Government on the Philippine hostage incident,*** so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the victims' families, i.e. to apologize to the victims' families, to offer compensation to the victims' families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists' personal safety.

Note: Hon IP Kwok-him's amendment is marked in ***bold and italic type***.

4. Motion as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai

That, on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; ~~due to~~ **at that time, with** the Philippine authorities' serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the ~~victims'~~ **victims and their** families at all, even adopting an extremely poor attitude in handling the incident; however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan's announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine **Government has kept on procrastinating, rendering that the** hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, ~~and the progress is hardly acceptable and~~ **which** is grossly unjust to the ~~victims'~~ **victims and their** families, this Council ~~urges the~~ **considers that this has seriously hurt the feelings of the victims in the hostage incident, their families and Hong Kong people, and that the Philippine Government should be condemned in this regard, and urges the Hong Kong** Government to impose strong and forceful ~~economic~~ **sanction measures which have immediate effect**, so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the ~~victims'~~ **victims and their** families, i.e. to apologize to the ~~victims'~~ **victims and their** families, to offer compensation to the ~~victims'~~ **victims and their** families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists' personal safety; **the relevant sanction measures should include:**

- (1) **the Hong Kong Government to suspend the procurement of Philippine products;**
- (2) **the Hong Kong Government to suspend the new round of negotiations on areas such as air freedom rights and trade, etc.;**
- (3) **except for the hostage incident, the Hong Kong Government to suspend all its dealings with the Philippine Government;**
- (4) **the Hong Kong Government to suspend inviting Philippine cultural organizations to Hong Kong to participate in the cultural and arts activities organized by the Hong Kong Government;**
- (5) **the Hong Kong Legislative Council to suspend its friendship exchanges and liaison with the Congress of the Philippines; and**

- (6) *the Hong Kong Government to call on the Hong Kong community and commercial sector to suspend their commercial and cultural exchanges with the Philippines, and call on the public to boycott Philippine goods.*

Note: Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

5. Motion as amended by Hon Mrs Regina IP

That, on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; due to the Philippine authorities' serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the victims' families at all, even adopting an extremely poor attitude in handling the incident; ~~however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan's announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, and the progress is~~ *also* hardly acceptable and is grossly unjust to the victims' families, ~~this Council urges the Government to impose strong and forceful economic sanction measures, so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the victims' families, i.e. to apologize to the victims' families, to offer compensation to the victims' families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists' personal safety;~~ *however, Hong Kong as a member of the World Trade Organization, under the agreements of the Organization, will have difficulty in imposing economic sanctions in respect of merchandise trade or trade in services, etc., against other members of the Organization; in this connection, this Council urges the SAR Government to consider suspending the visa-free arrangement for Philippine visitors, and even tightening the arrangements for issuing business and employment visas to Philippine passport holders (excluding visas for foreign domestic helpers) until the Philippine authorities have formally responded to the demands of the victims and their families for an apology and compensation regarding the hostage incident, taken truly effective measures and put forward ways to properly resolve the issue.*

Note: Hon Mrs Regina IP's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

6. Motion as amended by Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

That, on 23 August 2010, a Hong Kong tour group was tragically taken hostage in Manila in the Philippines; due to the Philippine authorities' serious mishandling of the rescue work, the Philippine hostage incident eventually resulted in a tragedy with eight Hong Kong people killed and seven injured; more than three years have lapsed since the Philippine hostage incident, yet the Philippine Government has never faced up to the relevant demands of the victims' families at all, even adopting an extremely poor attitude in handling the incident; however, after a Taiwan fisherman was shot dead by the Philippine Coast Guard in May this year, the Philippine Government tendered a formal apology for the incident within three months following Taiwan's announcement of sanctions against the Philippines; given that the Philippine hostage incident has yet to be resolved properly, and the progress is hardly acceptable and is grossly unjust to the victims' families, this Council urges the Government to impose strong and forceful economic sanction measures, so as to press the Philippine Government to make a prompt and formal response to the four demands of the victims' families, i.e. to apologize to the victims' families, to offer compensation to the victims' families, to penalize the relevant officials for dereliction of duty in the Philippine hostage incident, and to implement measures to protect tourists' personal safety; ***this Council also proposes to implement economic sanction measures in phases by amending the Immigration Ordinance until the incident has satisfactorily been resolved; the relevant sanction measures should include:***

- (1) ***phase one: from 1 April 2014 onwards, to forbid the issuance of employment visas to newly-employed Philippine domestic helpers, but excluding the issuance of employment visas for employment contracts which are renewed with the same employers during the period from 1 April to 31 December 2014;***
- (2) ***phase two: from 1 January 2015 onwards, to forbid the extension of Philippine domestic helpers' limit of stay; and***
- (3) ***phase three: from 1 July 2015 onwards, to forbid the issuance of entry visas to Philippine passport holders.***

Note: Hon CHAN Chi-chuen's amendment is marked in ***bold and italic type***.