

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)579/13-14

Ref : CB2/H/5/13

House Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 10th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
at 2:30 pm on Friday, 13 December 2013**

Members present:

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members absent:

Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Clerk in attendance :

Miss Flora TAI

Clerk to the House Committee

Staff in attendance :

Mr Kenneth CHEN, SBS	Secretary General
Mr Jimmy MA, JP	Legal Adviser
Mrs Justina LAM	Deputy Secretary General
Mr Andy LAU	Assistant Secretary General 1
Miss Odelia LEUNG	Assistant Secretary General 3
Mrs Percy MA	Assistant Secretary General 4
Ms Connie FUNG	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1
Mr Arthur CHEUNG	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Ms Dora WAI	Principal Council Secretary 1
Ms Emily PANG	Chief Public Information Officer
Mr Anthony CHU	Acting Chief Council Secretary (1)6
Ms Amy YU	Chief Council Secretary (2)6
Mr Arthur LEUNG	Chief Council Secretary (3)3
Mr Timothy TSO	Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Miss Kitty CHENG	Assistant Legal Adviser 5
Ms Wendy KAN	Assistant Legal Adviser 6
Mr Jove CHAN	Senior Council Secretary (2)2
Miss Josephine SO	Senior Council Secretary (2)6
Miss Jasmine TAM	Council Secretary (2)6
Ms Anna CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (2)3
Mr Arthur KAN	Legislative Assistant (2)7

Action

**I. Confirmation of the minutes of the 9th meeting held on 6 December 2013
(LC Paper No. CB(2)479/13-14)**

The minutes were confirmed.

II. Matters arising

Report by the Chairman on his meeting with the Chief Secretary for Administration ("CS")

2. The Chairman informed Members that based on their replies, he and the Deputy Chairman had coordinated the attendance lists for the four dinners to be hosted by the Task Force on Constitutional

Action

Development. The attendance lists had been circulated to Members and also forwarded to the Administration for CS to issue formal invitation to Members.

III. Business arising from previous Council meetings

Legal Service Division report on subsidiary legislation gazetted on 6 December 2013 and tabled in Council on 11 December 2013

(LC Paper No. LS19/13-14)

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Legal Adviser ("LA") briefed Members on the Legal Service Division ("LSD") report on the one item of subsidiary legislation (i.e. the Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule 7) (No. 2) Notice 2013) (L.N. 198) gazetted on 6 December 2013 and tabled in Council on 11 December 2013.

4. Members did not raise any questions on the Notice.

5. The Chairman reminded Members that the deadline for amending the Notice was the Council meeting of 8 January 2014.

IV. Further Business for the Council meeting of 18 December 2013

(a) Tabling of papers

Report No. 7/13-14 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments

(LC Paper No. CB(2)481/13-14 issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3)255/13-14 dated 12 December 2013)

6. The Chairman said that the Report covered four items of subsidiary legislation, the period for amendment of which would expire at the Council meeting of 18 December 2013.

7. The Chairman further said that three Members had indicated their intention to speak on the Air Pollution Control (Air Pollutant Emission) (Controlled Vehicles) Regulation (L.N. 160). As the Administration would move a proposed resolution at the Council meeting of 18 December 2013 to amend the Regulation, Members would have the opportunity to speak on it. As such, he would not move a motion in his capacity as Chairman of the House Committee ("HC") to take note of the Report in relation to the Regulation. Members noted the arrangement.

Action

(b) **Questions**

(LC Paper No. CB(3)249/13-14)

8. The Chairman informed Members that Mr Gary FAN had replaced his oral question.

(c) **Bills – resumption of debate on Second Reading, Committee Stage and Third Reading**

(i) **Toys and Children's Products Safety (Amendment) Bill 2013**

(ii) **Waste Disposal (Amendment) Bill 2013**

9. The Chairman said that the Bills Committees on the above two Bills had reported to HC at the last meeting. Members did not raise objection to the resumption of the Second Reading debates on these Bills.

(d) **Government motion**

Proposed resolution to be moved by the Secretary for the Environment under section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) in relation to the Air Pollution Control (Air Pollutant Emission) (Controlled Vehicles) Regulation

(Wording of the proposed resolution issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3)265/13-14 dated 12 December 2013)

10. The Chairman said that the Administration would move the above proposed resolution at the Council meeting to amend the Regulation.

(e) **Members' motions**

(i) **Proposed resolution to be moved by Hon CHAN Kam-lam under section 34(4) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) in relation to the Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2013 and the Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2013**

(Wording of the proposed resolution issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3)263/13-14 dated 12 December 2013)

11. The Chairman said that Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Subcommittee on the above two Orders, would move a proposed resolution at the Council meeting to extend the scrutiny period of the two Orders to the Council meeting of 8 January 2014.

Action

- (ii) **Proposed resolution to be moved by Hon CHAN Yuen-han under section 34(4) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) in relation to the Antiquities and Monuments (Declaration of Historical Buildings) Notice 2013**

(Wording of the proposed resolution issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3)264/13-14 dated 12 December 2013)

12. The Chairman said that Miss CHAN Yuen-han, Chairman of the Subcommittee on the above Notice, would move a proposed resolution at the Council meeting to extend the scrutiny period of the Notice to the Council meeting of 15 January 2014.

V. Reports of Bills Committees and subcommittees

- (a) **Report of the Subcommittee on Fugitive Offenders (Czech Republic) Order, Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Spain) Order and Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Czech Republic) Order**

13. Mr James TO, Chairman of the Subcommittee, made a verbal report on the deliberations of the Subcommittee. Mr TO said that the Subcommittee had held three meetings with the Administration and had completed its scrutiny of the Fugitive Offenders (Czech Republic) Order ("the FO Order"), which was subject to negative vetting.

14. Mr James TO further said that the Subcommittee noted that the agreement on surrender of fugitive offenders ("SFO") between Hong Kong and the Czech Republic was the first agreement to adopt an alternative formulation, which did not require a list of offences for which surrender might be granted to be set out in the SFO agreement. While this formulation was in compliance with the requirements under the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance (Cap. 503), the Administration had, in response to members' concern, undertaken to publicize the lists of offences to be exchanged between Hong Kong and the Czech Republic through Government notice in the Gazette and the website of the Department of Justice. The Administration would also provide the respective lists of offences to Members when or before the commencement notice for the FO Order was gazetted, so that Members might consider whether there was a need to form a subcommittee to study the commencement notice in detail. Mr TO added that the Subcommittee considered the arrangements proposed by the Administration acceptable, and would provide a written report on the FO Order later.

Action

15. Mr James TO informed Members that the Subcommittee would continue its scrutiny of the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Spain) Order and the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Czech Republic) Order, which were subject to positive vetting, and would provide a further report to HC upon completion of scrutiny of these two Orders.

(b) Report of the Subcommittee on Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2013 and Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2013

16. Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Subcommittee, made a verbal report on the deliberations of the Subcommittee. Mr CHAN said that the Subcommittee supported the two Orders, which sought to introduce relevant safety measures to implement the latest requirements set out in the 2013-2014 edition of "Technical Instructions for the Safe Transport of Dangerous Goods by Air" issued by the International Civil Aviation Organization. Mr CHAN added that the Subcommittee had completed its scrutiny work, and would provide its written report later.

17. The Chairman reminded Members that as the deadline for amending the relevant items of subsidiary legislation studied by the above two Subcommittees was extended or would be extended to the Council meeting of 8 January 2014, the deadline for giving notice of amendments, if any, was Tuesday, 31 December 2013.

VI. Position on Bills Committees and subcommittees
(LC Paper No. CB(2)480/13-14)

18. The Chairman said that as at 12 December 2013, there were seven Bills Committees, eight subcommittees under HC (i.e. five subcommittees on subsidiary legislation, one subcommittee on policy issues and two subcommittees on other Council business) and seven subcommittees on policy issues under Panels in action. Four subcommittees on policy issues were on the waiting list.

VII. Amendments to Rule 83(5) of the Rules of Procedure proposed by the Committee on Members' Interests
(LC Paper No. CMI/16/13-14)

19. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr IP Kwok-him, Chairman of Committee on Members' Interests ("CMI"), said that the new Companies

Action

Ordinance (Cap. 622) ("the new CO") to be commenced on 3 March 2014 would effect changes that would make the existing Rule 83(5)(a) and (h) of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") inoperable. Amendments to RoP 83(5) were therefore necessary to tie in with the commencement of the new CO.

20. Mr IP Kwok-him explained that the proposed amendments to RoP 83(5)(a) were to replace the reference to the term "subsidiary" with "holding company", to reflect the alternative drafting approach in defining these terms adopted in the new CO, and those to RoP 83(5)(h) were to replace the reference to "nominal value" of shares of a company with "total number of issued shares", which was necessitated by the abolition of the concept of nominal value of shares by the new CO. Mr IP informed the meeting that the proposed amendments were textual in nature and would not affect the scope of the existing categories of interests required to be registered by Members.

21. Mr IP Kwok-him further said that should HC support the proposal, he would move a motion in his capacity as Chairman of CMI at the Council meeting of 8 January 2014 to amend RoP 83(5), which would take effect upon the commencement of the new CO on 3 March 2014. Mr IP added that should the proposed amendments to RoP 83(5) be agreed to in Council, consequential amendments would also be required to be made to the existing Registration Form on Members Interests ("the Form"), so as to align with the revised provisions.

22. Members agreed to the proposed amendments to RoP 83(5)(a) and (h) and the Form.

VIII. Proposal of Hon SIN Chung-kai to move a motion for adjournment under Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure at the Council meeting of 18 December 2013 for the purpose of debating the following issue: the contribution of Mr Nelson Rolihlahla MANDELA, a Nobel Peace Prize winner and the former President of South Africa, to the international community

(Letter dated 9 December 2013 from Hon SIN Chung-kai (LC Paper No. CB(2)482/13-14(01)))

23. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr SIN Chung-kai explained his proposal to hold an adjournment debate under RoP 16(4) at the Council meeting of 18 December 2013 on the contribution of Mr Nelson MANDELA to the international community. Mr SIN said that more than 100 heads of states and government, including State Vice-President Mr LI Yuan-chao, attended the memorial service for Mr MANDELA held

Action

in Johannesburg, South Africa to pay their respects to this most revered leader and statesman. Mr MANDELA had dedicated his life to advocating human rights and unifying the racially divided South Africa. He had been an inspiration to the international community, including Hong Kong which was currently dealing with the complicated issue of constitutional development. Mr SIN added that Mr MANDELA had visited China twice and there was long-established relationship between China and South Africa. He appealed to Members to support his proposal.

24. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that Mr MANDELA formed a military wing to fight against the apartheid regime that had massacred black people in South Africa. Where there was no universal suffrage, there would always be struggles and people would take violent actions when they were violently suppressed. Mr MANDELA had fostered racial reconciliation only after he had led the country to victory against apartheid and the people in South Africa had been given equal voting rights. Mr LEUNG added that Mr MANDELA reminded him of Mr LIU Xiao-bo, who was also a winner of the Nobel Peace Prize.

25. Mr Kenneth LEUNG quoted a passage from Mr MANDELA's autobiography "Long Walk to Freedom" to highlight the ideal of a democratic and free society cherished by Mr MANDELA. Mr LEUNG said that Mr MANDELA was an important contemporary humanitarian and thought leader who had inspired people of different races, colours and religions. He expressed support for Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal.

26. Ms Emily LAU also expressed support for Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal. Ms LAU said that she had earlier enquired with the Secretariat whether arrangement could be made for Members to observe one minute's silence at the Council meeting of 11 December 2013 to mourn the death of Mr MANDELA, but was informed that such an arrangement could not be made as obituary tribute would generally be paid only to serving Members who passed away, or persons who had made significant contribution to Hong Kong. Ms LAU further said that many people around the world including Hong Kong people had deep admiration and respect for this giant of history who had led South Africa to freedom and democracy after 27 years of imprisonment, and the proposed adjournment debate would provide an opportunity for the Legislative Council to pay tribute to Mr MANDELA.

27. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that Members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong ("DAB") had great respect for Mr MANDELA's remarkable contribution to the world. However, they did not consider it appropriate to hold the

Action

proposed adjournment debate. Mr TAM further said that under RoP 16(4), a Member might move a motion for adjournment of the Council for the purpose of raising any issue concerning public interest, with a view to eliciting a reply from a designated public officer. Such an issue should usually be closely related to Hong Kong and there should also be urgency for the Council to debate it. He did not consider that Mr SIN's proposal fulfilled the requirements stipulated under RoP 16(4). He was also concerned that if the proposal was supported, it would set a precedent for similar cases in the future. Mr TAM stressed that the fact that Members belonging to DAB did not support Mr SIN's proposal should not be taken as disrespect to Mr MANDELA, and Members could use other forums to pay tribute to him.

28. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed support for Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal. Mr LEE said that Mr MANDELA had made extraordinary contribution to the history of mankind in that he had dedicated his life to the anti-apartheid struggle and was determined to pursue reconciliation to resolve conflicts after he was elected the President of the Republic of South Africa, despite having been imprisoned for 27 years. There was much that people in Hong Kong could learn from Mr MANDELA, particularly how to resolve conflicts during the current constitutional reform exercise. Given the extraordinary contribution of Mr MANDELA to the world, Members should pay respects to him through the holding of an adjournment debate in Council.

29. Ms Claudia MO said that Mr MANDELA was a giant of history with exceptional contribution. He had been imprisoned for 27 years for fighting for democracy and human rights. Ms MO further said that Mr MANDELA was awarded the Nobel Peace Prize in 1993 and elected the President of the Republic of South Africa in 1994, while Mr LIU Xiao-bo, also a Nobel Peace Prize winner, was still in prison. She considered it worthwhile to hold the proposed adjournment debate, which would provide a forum for Members to reflect on what lessons they could learn from the life of Mr MANDELA, particularly when the Hong Kong community was now sharply divided over the issue of constitutional development.

30. Mr Albert HO said that Mr MANDELA was undoubtedly one of the world's most revered statesmen who had made remarkable contribution to the international community. He considered that it was in the public interest to hold the proposed adjournment debate, as there was much that politicians in Hong Kong could learn from Mr MANDELA in handling difficult problems such as the constitutional development of Hong Kong. Mr HO further said that he saw no good reasons why Members should object to the proposed adjournment debate.

Action

31. Mr Alan LEONG said that Members belonging to the Civic Party supported Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal, as it was in the public interest to hold the proposed adjournment debate. Mr LEONG further said that the Chief Executive ("CE") had expressed his wish to establish the "Hong Kong camp" to unite all people in Hong Kong. In this regard, CE should attend the proposed adjournment debate to listen to Members' views on what could be learned from Mr MANDELA's efforts in uniting the white and the black communities in South Africa. Mr LEONG added that to face up to the challenge of constitutional development, Hong Kong people should learn from how Mr MANDELA embraced and fought for freedom and democracy.

32. Mr Charles MOK expressed support for Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal to hold an adjournment debate on Mr MANDELA's contribution. He echoed the view that given the need to resolve the prevailing conflicts in the community, and the close ties between China and the African countries, it was worthwhile to hold the proposed debate on Mr MANDELA's contribution before the Council was adjourned for the Christmas break. The proposed adjournment debate would also provide a valuable opportunity for young people in Hong Kong to learn more about the life and achievements of Mr MANDELA.

33. Ms Cyd HO said that unlike RoP 16(2), urgency was not a requirement under RoP 16(4), which stipulated that a motion for adjournment might be moved for the purpose of raising any issue concerning public interest, with a view to eliciting a reply from a designated public officer. She supported Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal, as the subject of the proposed debate concerned public interest. She further said that it was important for people in Hong Kong to learn from Mr MANDELA how to resolve deep rooted conflicts through reconciliation. In her view, it would be appropriate for the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, who was responsible for the policy area of human rights, to attend the proposed adjournment debate. Ms HO added that under RoP 16(7), the duration of an adjournment debate held under RoP 16(4) would be kept within one and a half hours. She hoped that the pro-establishment Members would not impede other Members from debating the matter.

34. The Deputy Chairman said that many overseas legislatures had in place arrangements similar to adjournment debates to enable legislators to express views on issues of public concern. In his view, "any issue concerning public interest" referred to in RoP 16(4) meant an issue of public concern. The Deputy Chairman further said that Mr MANDELA embodied the universal values of mutual respect and tolerance. It would be ironic for some Members to, on the one hand, say that they respected

Action

Mr MANDELA but not to, on the other hand, accommodate other Members' wish to hold an adjournment debate on Mr MANDELA's contribution. He also doubted whether consensus could be forged on the constitutional development of Hong Kong if Members could not even accommodate other Members' wish to debate on certain subject matter.

35. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed support for Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal to hold an adjournment debate which would enable Members to pay tribute to Mr MANDELA, who was a universally revered figure with remarkable contribution to the international community. He expressed disappointment that while some Members had expressed admiration and respect for Mr MANDELA, they did not support Mr SIN's proposal. Dr KWOK further said that to achieve universal suffrage, it was important for Members to put aside their prejudices and work together to resolve their differences. He queried whether constitutional development could take any step forward if some Members were not willing to accommodate even a simple request for holding an adjournment debate.

36. Mr Martin LIAO said that he had great respect for Mr MANDELA but he could not subscribe to the view that it was disrespectful to Mr MANDELA if the Council did not hold the proposed adjournment debate. Furthermore, he did not consider it appropriate to hold the proposed debate under RoP 16(4). He suggested that Mr SIN Chung-kai should consider applying for a debate slot, or request for transfer of a debate slot allocated to another Member, to move a motion on the matter.

37. Mr WU Chi-wai said that he could not see any reason why Members should oppose Mr SIN Chung-kai's proposal which sought to provide an opportunity for Members to honour such a remarkable figure who had dedicated his life to fighting for human rights. Mr WU added that the proposed adjournment debate under RoP 16(4) would be held at the conclusion of all the business on the Agenda of the Council and would last for only one and a half hours. He hoped that the Members belonging to the pro-establishment camp would seriously consider supporting the proposal.

38. Dr Elizabeth QUAT said that while Members should respect great men like Mr MANDELA and learn from them, it was not necessary to hold a debate on their achievements in Council. Dr QUAT further said that Mr MANDELA had spent his life advocating forgiveness, love, peace, tolerance and racial harmony. She observed that while some Members of the pan-democratic camp claimed that they wished to learn from Mr MANDELA, they made personal attacks on other Members in their speeches, which was contrary to the values embodied by Mr MANDELA.

Action

39. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that all the English Premiere League matches held during the last weekend were preceded by a minute's applause to honour Mr MANDELA. He could not understand why some Members had to impede other Members from holding the proposed adjournment debate, when even the English Premiere League paid tribute to this remarkable man.

40. Mr SIN Chung-kai quoted from the speech given by State Vice-President Mr LI Yuan-chao during the memorial service for Mr MANDELA, and said that it would be regrettable if HC did not support his proposal to hold an adjournment debate on the contribution of this colossus. He reckoned that there would not be many similar requests for holding adjournment debates on other great men. He added that having regard to State Vice-President Mr LI Yuan-chao's attendance at Mr MANDELA's memorial service, and the long established relationship between Mr MANDELA and China, he had thought that Members belonging to the pro-establishment camp might support his proposal. He appealed to Members who considered it not necessary to hold the proposed adjournment debate not to deprive other Members of the opportunity to do so.

41. The Chairman put to vote the proposal of Mr SIN Chung-kai to move a motion for adjournment under RoP 16(4) at the Council meeting of 18 December 2013 for the purpose of debating the following issue: the contribution of Mr Nelson MANDELA, a Nobel Peace Prize winner and the former President of South Africa, to the international community. Ms Emily LAU, Ms Claudia MO and Mr Dennis KWOK requested a division.

The following Members voted in favour of the proposal:

Mr Albert HO, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Mr James TO, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Ms Emily LAU, Mr Frederick FUNG, Mr Ronny TONG, Ms Cyd HO, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Ms Claudia MO, Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr Gary FAN, Mr Charles MOK, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Dr Kenneth CHAN, Mr Kenneth LEUNG, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr Dennis KWOK, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr SIN Chung-kai and Mr IP Kin-yuen.
(22 Members)

The following Members voted against the proposal:

Mr TAM Yiu-chung, Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Mr Vincent FANG, Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr Jeffrey LAM, Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Ms Starry LEE, Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Mr CHAN Kin-por, Dr Priscilla LEUNG, Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Mr IP Kwok-him, Mr James TIEN, Mr

Action

NG Leung-sing, Mr Steven HO, Mr Frankie YICK, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr MA Fung-kwok, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan and Mr Tony TSE.

(27 Members)

The following Members abstained from voting:

Mr Martin LIAO and Mr POON Siu-ping.

(2 Members)

42. The Chairman declared that 22 Members voted for the proposal and 27 Members voted against it and two Members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the proposal was negatived.

IX. Any other business

43. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 3:23 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
2 January 2014