THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE

in response to the

REPORT OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE No. 61

of February 2014

THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE IN RESPONSE TO THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT NO. 61 DATED FEBRUARY 2014

REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 58)

MATTERS OUTSTANDING

Unlawful occupation of government land

(Chapter 2 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 58)

Legislative amendments to increase the penalties against unlawful occupation of government land

The Development Bureau (DEVB) and the Lands Department (LandsD) reviewed the provisions relating to unlawful occupation of unleased land in the Land (Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance (Cap. 28) and examined corresponding legislative amendments to increase the deterrent effect against the relevant offences and to introduce a system of daily fines, taking into account the views of the Audit Commission (Audit) and Public Accounts Committee (PAC) of the Legislative Council (LegCo). We aim at introducing the relevant legislative amendment bill into the LegCo in the second half of this legislative year, after consulting the Panel on Development.

Making use of mobile devices to facilitate the Land Control Teams' inspections

2. Following the completion of the design stage of the revamping-Land Control Information System (LCIS) project in December 2013, LandsD has, on the basis of the finalized design, proceeded to explore the feasibility of making use of mobile devices to facilitate land control work. We have requested the authorized contractors to estimate the resources required for the feasibility study.

Revamping of the LCIS

3. The project for revamping LCIS commenced in April 2013 and is targeted for rolling out by the end of 2014. The System Design and Analysis Stage of the project has been completed and successfully progressed to the System Implementation and System Integration Stage as scheduled. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Youth Square

(Chapter 3 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 58)

Review on Youth Square

- 4. The Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) completed its review in December 2013 on the management and operations of the Youth Square (YS), its positioning and way forward. The review has taken into account the views and recommendations of the PAC, the Audit, and the stakeholders. Major findings and recommendations of the consultancy review are set out as follows:
 - (a) All the stakeholders who participated in the review opined that as youth development is a long-term and on-going process, input of resources from the Government is both necessary and justifiable. By offering a diversified range of venues and facilities for the young people and youth organisations, YS is an important platform for the Government to pursue its youth development objectives. To encourage patronage from youths and youth organisations, the rates charged for the facilities of YS have to be set at a level affordable to these target users whose budgets are limited;
 - (b) since the opening of YS, its utilisation has been improving through various promotional efforts and implementation of concessionary proposals. On the other hand, YS has been incurring operating deficits due to various constraints. These include the limited room to reduce cost or increase revenue significantly (about 85% of the operating cost is the management fee which is adjusted annually according to the Composite Consumer Price Index while about 60% of the income comes from the hostel which the utilisation rate is already over 80% with a rental policy of offering discounts to the youths). It is therefore not realistic for YS to achieve full-cost-recovery as originally planned;
 - (c) YS should continue its position of serving as a focal point for youth development activities in Hong Kong and contribute to youth development by providing venues and facilities to the youths and youth organisations at affordable prices;
 - (d) to further improve the rental strategy for venues and facilities, YS should provide further discounts for the target users for a few under-utilised facilities and set charges based on the affordability of the target users. It is also recommended that the retail units in YS should be used to serve and support social enterprises, youth

organisations and young entrepreneurs and a lower rental should be offered to suitable priority tenants to improve the tenancy mix of the retail units;

- (e) YS should maintain (i) its current management and operation mode by contracting out its day-to-day management and operation; (ii) its hostel strategy of offering discounts to the youths and youth organisations; and (iii) provision of catering services in YS; and
- (f) the future target cost-recovery ratio will be set at 50% which is considered to be reasonable and realistic based on past experience and consultant's financial analysis.

The recommendations of the consultancy review have been endorsed by the YS Management Advisory Committee and are being implemented progressively with effect from the 2014-15 financial year. HAB has also reported the outcome of the review to the LegCo Panel on Home Affairs at its meeting in March 2014.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

5. A summary of progress in implementing the Audit's recommendations since the last progress report is at Enclosure 1. HAB has taken action to follow up on all the Audit's recommendations. We recommend deleting this chapter from the next progress report.

REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 59)

MATTERS OUTSTANDING

Equal Opportunities Commission

(Paragraphs 3 to 5 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

- 6. All the recommendations made by the Audit and the PAC in 2009 in respect of the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) have been implemented, save for the recommendation on the separation of the posts of Chairperson and Chief Executive Officer.
- 7. The EOC Chairperson is following up on the review of the composition of the management echelon of the EOC and the recruitment or otherwise of a Chief Operations Officer (COO). The review on EOC's management structure including the need for and, if so, the role of the COO post, are expected to be completed by the first quarter of the 2014-15 financial year.

Recoverability of the outstanding advances to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

(Paragraphs 6 and 7 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

- 8. The Administration has continued to urge the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) to make renewed efforts to appeal to the international community for donations with a view to settling the outstanding advances, which remain at \$1,162 million. The Security Bureau (SB) discussed the issue with UNHCR again in January 2014 to reiterate the Administration's stance and register the Hong Kong community's expectation of an early recovery of the outstanding advances.
- 9. Although it is not optimistic that repayment can be made by UNHCR in the near future, the Administration will continue to pursue an early repayment of the outstanding advances from UNHCR.

Footbridge connections between five commercial buildings in the Central District

(Paragraphs 8 and 9 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

10. In late November 2013, the agent of the owner of Building II submitted a feasibility study report for the proposed Footbridge A for the Government's consideration. The LandsD, the Buildings Department (BD) and other concerned departments are considering the report and will continue to follow up with the owners of Building I and Building II on the matter.

Small house grants in the New Territories

(Paragraphs 10 to 14 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

11. The existing Small House Policy has been in operation for a long period of time. The relevant review would inevitably entail complex issues including legal, environment and land use planning issues which require careful examination. At the same time, we will maintain dialogue with key stakeholders as well as the community at large.

The acquisition and clearance of shipyard sites

(Paragraphs 15 and 16 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Assessment of Contamination at the Penny's Bay Shipyard Site

12. The Lands Tribunal hearings to determine the amount payable in respect of the former lessee's claim for compensation under the Foreshore and Sea-bed (Reclamations) Ordinance (Cap. 127) were held from 8 to 19 October 2012, from 20 to 22 March 2013, on 23 April 2013, and from 25 to 26 April 2013. The Judgement from Lands Tribunal is awaited.

Food labelling and nutrition labelling of infant and special dietary foods (Paragraphs 21 to 23 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Development of the Hong Kong Code of Marketing of Breast-milk Substitutes

13. A four-month public consultation on the Hong Kong Code of Marketing and Quality of Formula Milk and Related Products, and Food Products for Infants & Young Children was conducted from 26 October 2012 to 28 February 2013. Briefing sessions and meetings with manufacturers, distributors, importers, retailers and other relevant parties were arranged. The Government has consolidated the views and comments from different sectors of the community. In addition to comments on the draft Code itself, there are various

- 6 -

suggestions on ways to promote breastfeeding and related facilities. The Government is now considering the merits and feasibility of these comments and proposals. We will announce the result of the public consultation and the way forward in due course.

As regards nutrition labelling of special dietary foods, the Centre for Food Safety (CFS) has studied the relevant standards of the Codex Alimentarius Commission and the regulatory approaches adopted by other jurisdictions in respect of nutrition labelling of special dietary foods. CFS will take into account the local situation and the latest international development in mapping out the way forward. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Nutrition claims and health claims

15. CFS is studying the local and international situations on the use of nutrition and health claims in formula products and foods for infants and young children under the age of 36 months. In light of the study, the Government will examine the possible strategies on regulating such claims in 2014. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Publicity and education

- 16. Education on nutrition labelling has become part and parcel of CFS' food safety and nutritional education programmes. In addition to publicity programmes on nutrition labelling through different platforms such as roving exhibitions, talks, media, and social network as recommended in a survey conducted to identify knowledge gaps and information needs of the general public, CFS works closely with stakeholders and community organisations to promote the use of nutrition labels among target groups such as students and the elderly. For instance, CFS is organising a "Secondary School Food Safety and Nutrition Labelling Quiz Competition" with the Education Bureau to enhance students' understanding of nutrition labelling and food safety.
- 17. In addition, a new training kit has been developed and distributed to primary and secondary schools and community organisations to promote the use of nutrition labels in daily lives. Workshops on the use of the training kit are being arranged for the stakeholders. As publicity and education in relation to nutrition labelling is an on-going effort, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.

The Codex Alimentarius Commission was established in 1963 by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and World Health Organization as an international authority to set food-related

standards and guidelines.

_

Follow-up actions on cases identified by Audit

<u>Chapter 4 "Nutrition labelling of infant and special dietary foods" of the Audit</u> Report

18. CFS has investigated the 12 cases involving 30 products identified by Audit. The labels of 19 products were considered to be in order, and one product was found not for sale. The labels of the remaining 10 products have been revised and are being vetted by the CFS. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Records management work of the Government Records Service

(Paragraphs 24 to 26 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Records appraisal and accessioning of archival records

19. The Government Records Service (GRS) is actively clearing the backlog of records pending appraisal of archival value and archival records pending accessioning. As GRS aims to complete the tasks in 2015, we recommend deleting this item from the next progress report.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

20. A summary of the updated progress of implementing the Audit recommendations is at the Enclosure 2.

Monitoring and reporting of air quality

(Chapter 1 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Administration of Air Pollution Index

Air-quality monitoring network

21. The new Air Quality Health Index System has replaced the Administration of Air Pollution Index (API) since 30 December 2013. The Tuen Mun Air Quality Monitoring station, our twelfth general air quality monitoring station, has started reporting air quality data on the same date. As for the setting up of a general air quality monitoring station in Tseung Kwan O, the Sai Kung District Council (SKDC) endorsed the proposed site at its meeting on 7 January 2014. The Environmental Protection Department (EPD) is now making preparations for the design and construction of the station with a view to commencing its operation by end of 2015. We will report the progress to the SKDC. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Implementation of air-quality improvement measures

(Chapter 2 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Emission control of vehicles

Emissions from pre-Euro, Euro I and Euro II diesel vehicles

22. We are implementing an incentive-cum-regulatory approach to phase out progressively some 82 000 pre-Euro IV (i.e. pre-Euro and Euro I, II and III) diesel commercial vehicles (DCVs), including goods vehicles, light buses and non-franchised buses, before 2020. The Air Pollution Control (Air Pollutant Emission) (Controlled Vehicles) Regulation, which stipulates respective commencement dates for not renewing the vehicle licences of the relevant DCVs and caps the service year limits of newly registered DCVs at 15 years, has taken effect from 1 February 2014. The Finance Committee of the LegCo approved the funding of some \$11.4 billion for launching an ex-gratia payment scheme for phasing out the pre-Euro IV DCVs. We have been receiving applications for the ex-gratia payment since 1 March 2014 and shall report the progress to the LegCo Panel on Environmental Affairs (EA Panel) on an annual basis. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Outstanding items set out in paragraph 25 of Part 4 of the PAC Report No. 61

- 23. We have already taken follow-up actions in respect of the four air quality improvement measures set out in paragraph 25 of Part 4 of the PAC Report No. 61. The latest progress is reported as follows:
 - (i) formulating better strategies for reducing the number of pre-Euro IV diesel commercial vehicles running on the street;
 - (ii) implementing a subsidy scheme for replacing high-polluting vehicles:
 - These two recommendations are being implemented through the incentive-cum-regulatory approach to phase out pre-Euro IV DCVs as set out in paragraph 22 above.
 - (iii) requiring local and river-trade vessels to use ultra-low-sulphur diesel in Hong Kong waters as early as possible; and
 - The Air Pollution Control (Marine Light Diesel) Regulation which mandates the light diesel to be supplied for the use of vessels to be low sulphur light diesel (i.e. with sulphur content not exceeding 0.05%) has already taken effect from 1 April 2014.

(iv) completing the legislative procedures necessary for implementing the proposed non-road mobile machinery emission-control system.

We are drafting the relevant legislation with a view to completing the legislative procedures in 2014.

24. We will report the progress of implementing various air quality improvement measures (including the above items) to the LegCo EA Panel as and when appropriate. We recommend deleting the above items from the next progress report.

Regulatory control of private hospitals

(Chapter 3 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Monitoring of sentinel events

25. The Department of Health (DH) has reviewed the sentinel event reporting system for private hospitals and will seek the views of the Steering Committee on Review of the Regulation of Private Healthcare Facilities (Steering Committee). DH will update its guidelines on the sentinel event reporting system based on the Steering Committee's recommendations. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Price transparency in hospital charges

26. The Steering Committee will review and examine measures that would help enhance price transparency of private hospital services, such as disclosure of price information, quotation system, packaged pricing and publication of statistics on hospital charges. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Performance reporting in Controlling Officer's Report

- 27. DH has revised the performance indicators for regulatory control of private hospitals and increased the target number of inspection to private hospitals from once a year to not less than twice in a year.
- 28. As DH has taken necessary follow-up actions, we recommend deleting this item from the next progress report.

Way Forward

29. The review of the regulatory regime for private hospitals is on-going. The Steering Committee is expected to come up with recommendations within 2014 and conduct public consultation exercise on the recommendations put

forward. Recommendations will be made to strengthen the regulatory control of private hospitals in the areas of corporate and clinical governance, price transparency, sentinel event reporting system, complaint management, etc. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Progress made in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations

30. A summary of progress in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations is at Enclosure 3.

Land grants for private hospital development

(Chapter 4 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Encl. 3

General protocol in administering private treaty grants

31. The LandsD has consulted relevant policy bureaux and departments (B/Ds) on a draft general protocol intended to clarify the roles and responsibilities among B/Ds in the administration of private treaty grants (PTGs) falling under their respective policy areas and in the subsequent monitoring of compliance and enforcement. Based on the feedback from B/Ds, we will formulate a common code of shared responsibilities to guide B/Ds in the work. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Monitoring and enforcement of land grant conditions

32. The DH and LandsD have been following up on the irregularities observed at some private hospitals. The two departments have implemented a monitoring system at the headquarters level to keep track of progress and have continued to discuss the delineation of responsibilities for monitoring compliance with conditions of private hospital leases and coordinating enforcement actions. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Provision of free or low-charge beds

- 33. Hospital D set up a geriatric ward to provide 20 free beds in accordance with the land grant conditions since February 2013. The hospital has taken measures to increase the utilization rate of its low charge beds. DH has stepped up the monitoring measures for the provision of free bed and low-charge bed services.
- 34. Hospital F has agreed to provide low-charge beds in accordance with DH's requirements based on the land grant conditions. DH is discussing with Hospital F on the detailed arrangements for providing low-charge beds starting from July 2014. DH will monitor the implementation progress. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Profits/surplus plough-back requirement

35. Private hospitals that are subject to financially-related conditions under the land grants have submitted to DH annually audited accounts and auditors' certification for observance with such conditions. DH and LandsD are continuing the review of past audited accounts of the private hospitals concerned and following up with the grantees as necessary. We will keep PAC informed of the progress.

Site development required by land grant conditions

- 36. In the case of Hospital C, following LandsD's approval of the amendment building plans for a social centre for the elderly in May 2013, the building works had been completed and the social centre for the elderly commenced operation in November 2013.
- 37. As the Audit's and PAC's recommendations in this aspect have been addressed, we recommend deleting this part (paragraph 5.10(g) of Audit Report) from the next progress report.

Way forward

- 38. In disposing the Wong Chuk Hang site for private hospital development, the Administration has imposed a set of minimum requirements on the tenderer in the conditions of sale and the service deed. DH has developed an enforcement protocol for monitoring compliance with the conditions of sale relating to hospital services and with the service deed.
- 39. As the Audit's and PAC's recommendations in this aspect have been addressed, we recommend deleting this part (paragraph 5.12(a) of Audit Report) from the next progress report.

Progress made in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations

40. A summary of progress in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations is at Enclosure 4.

Government's financial support to film industry

(Chapter 5 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Film Development Fund and Film Guarantee Fund

41. Create Hong Kong (CreateHK) kick-started a review on the Film Development Fund and the Film Guarantee Fund in October 2013. The review

covers the existing practice of using the applicant's ability to secure third-party financing as a measure of the commercial viability of a film and the existing requirements on submission of documents stipulated in the production finance agreements of film-production projects and the funding agreements of film-related projects. It is expected that the review will be completed by mid-2014. We will report to the PAC of the LegCo the progress of the review in due course.

Funding support for the Hong Kong International Film Festival Society

42. As for the funding support to the Hong Kong International Film Festival Society (the Society), CreateHK is following up with the parties concerned on the setting of a ceiling on the accumulated fund of the Society. We will report to the PAC the outcome in due course.

Management of public enquiries and complaints by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

(Chapter 6 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

43. The Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) has been overseeing the development of a new Complaints Management Information System (CMIS) for more effective monitoring of the processing of complaint cases. The new CMIS project had progressed to Phase II of the User Acceptance Test stage in February 2014 and User Training stage in April 2014. According to the current schedule, the system will be rolled out by phases in May and come into operation in late 2014. FEHD will continue to closely monitor the progress of the project. After the full implementation of the new CMIS, FEHD will review the role and establishment of the Complaints Management Section.

Provision of local services by the Marine Department

(Chapter 7 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

44. The Marine Department has taken action to follow up on all the recommendations made by the Audit and PAC in respect of the local services provided by the department. The details of the follow-up actions are set out at the Enclosure 5. We recommend deleting this chapter from the next progress report.

Youth employment services

(Chapter 8 of Part 7 of P.A.C. Report No. 59)

Procurement of services

Encl. 5

45. In January 2014, Labour Department (LD) submitted the tender documents on provision of pre-employment training courses for trainees of Youth

Employment and Training Programme, which were drafted in accordance with the procurement procedures specified in Stores and Procurement Regulations, to the Central Tender Board (CTB). Upon endorsement of CTB, LD issued, on 28 February 2014, the invitation for tenders, and the procurement exercise will be completed according to established procedures. As the Audit recommendations relating to procurement of services have been implemented, we suggest deletion of this part from the next progress report.

Review on opening hours of the Youth Employment Resource Centres

- 46. At present, the Youth Employment Resource Centres (YERCs) are open from 10 a.m. to 7 p.m. from Monday to Saturday. There are about 80 000 members. Of these, around 73% are students, 18% seeking employment, about 7% in employment, and the remaining pursuing self-employment.
- 47. In response to the recommendations of Audit, LD reviewed the opening hours of YERCs. An opinion survey was conducted to collect views from over 200 members from May to July 2013 while feedback was gathered from six focus groups comprising about 150 target users from April to October 2013.
- According to the opinion survey, if the existing opening hours were to be extended to 9 p.m., the majority of users $(73\%)^2$ would still choose the period between 1 p.m. and 4 p.m. in making visits to YERCs. The two other most-preferred time slots were 4 p.m. to 7 p.m. $(57\%)^2$ and 10 a.m. to 1 p.m. $(47\%)^2$. All three time slots fall within our existing opening hours. For users who indicated that they would like to make visits to YERCs in the time slot 7 p.m. to 9 p.m., the majority were out of their interest in attending training courses and employment support activities.
- 49. A total of six focus groups covering secondary students, career teachers, youths not in employment, employed youths, and young people pursuing self-employment were conducted. LD learnt that for students, most of them (97.4%) would prefer to visit YERCs on Saturdays or after school on weekdays but did not show interest in visiting YERCs after 7 p.m. For career teachers, they would usually arrange students to participate in functions of YERCs on weekdays or Saturdays and did not consider it appropriate for students to participate in career activities at night. For those who were not employed, as their schedules were flexible, they did not see a need to visit YERCs in late hours. Even if YERCs' opening hours were to be extended, 85% of the youths not in employment would still prefer to make visits between 10 a.m. to 7 p.m. For those members (mostly in employment or self-employment) who would prefer to use the services of YERCs after 7 p.m., the vast majority aimed at attending training courses and employment support activities rather than using other services or centre facilities.

-

The percentages add up to more than 100% because one respondent might choose to use the services and facilities in more than one time slot.

50. Based on the information collected, LD considers that the existing opening hours of YERCs can generally meet the needs of various service users. In the past, YERCs had been offering training and employment support activities at evenings and Saturdays for the members on an ad hoc basis. To better cater for the needs expressed by members, starting from 2014, each YERC will organise training courses and employment support activities after 7 p.m. for at least 200 hours a year so that members can attend with advance booking. To meet the needs of young people who wish to upgrade themselves after their working hours, we will specifically design and provide training courses on soft skills, vocational skills and self-employment at night. We will continue to monitor the service needs and stand ready to increase the number of training hours after 7 p.m. if the demand so warrants. As follow-up action has been taken by LD on this subject, we suggest deletion of this part from the next progress report.

REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 61)

Chapter 1 – Direct land grants to private sports clubs at nil or nominal premium

Overall

51. Whilst recognising the contribution of private sports clubs towards sports development and the provision of recreation facilities in Hong Kong both in the past and at present, the Administration accepts the recommendations made by the Audit and the PAC of the LegCo on direct land grants to private sports clubs at nil or nominal premium through Private Recreational Leases (PRL).

Review of the PRL Policy

- 52. The Administration started the PRL policy review in September 2013. We will take into account the recommendations of Audit and the PAC during the review.
- 53. The HAB will take the lead in conducting the PRL policy review from a sports policy perspective and will involve other concerned policy B/Ds as necessary. In this regard, the DEVB and the Planning Department (PlanD) will provide input on land use and planning, and the LandsD will provide input on land administration matters.
- 54. In reviewing the PRL policy, we will take into account factors such as sports development needs, land use, site and facilities utilisation, the interests of the lessees and their members, and the wider public interest. In the course of the review we will also consider how to ensure an appropriate apportionment of sports and non-sports facilities on PRL sites. We expect that preliminary findings of the review will be available by the end of 2014.

Implementation of the "opening-up" requirement

55. HAB has asked all lessees to open up their sports facilities more extensively. Apart from providing non-members with a much higher degree of access to their facilities, lessees are also required to operate junior membership schemes to allow talented young athletes to join the clubs as members at greatly reduced levels of subscription fee. The approved "opening up" scheme forms part of the Conditions of Grant when a PRL is renewed.

- 56. HAB has increased publicity on the availability of sports facilities of lessees for use by outside bodies by
 - (a) advertising the availability of such facilities in the print media;
 - (b) requiring the lessees to provide full information about their opening up schemes on their websites;
 - (c) giving detailed information on the opening up schemes to eligible outside bodies through the concerned Competent Authorities;
 - (d) informing District Officers and the Sports Federation & Olympic Committee of Hong Kong, China of the opening up schemes and asking them to pass the information to relevant community and sports organisations; and
 - (e) providing detailed information on the opening up schemes on HAB's website.
- 57. HAB will continue to advertise the availability of sports facilities at lessees' premises in the print media, and will issue revised guidelines in mid-2014 to help lessees provide more detailed and informative reports on the implementation of the opening up schemes.

Monitoring of compliance with lease conditions

- 58. HAB works closely with the LandsD and other government departments to ensure that PRL sites are used in accordance with their Conditions of Grant. HAB will monitor the utilisation rates of sports facilities on PRL sites, in particular with regard to the requirement to give greater access to outside bodies in accordance with the approved new opening up schemes. Using the quarterly returns as a monitoring tool, HAB follows up with lessees in cases of low utilisation and conducts random checks on the accuracy of the reported information.
- 59. The Administration will work on further strengthening the monitoring mechanism and improving lease conditions. As part of the comprehensive policy review on PRL, HAB and the LandsD will clarify their respective responsibilities with regard to inspections on PRL sites and will formulate plans for routine inspections accordingly. In addition to conducting site inspections in the context of processing lease renewals, the LandsD will inspect sites where lease renewal is not yet due.
- 60. The LandsD will, in consultation with HAB and other relevant B/Ds, continue to follow up on individual cases of irregularity and suspected

non-compliance with the lease conditions as identified in the Audit Report and take lease enforcement action as appropriate.

Progress made in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations

61. In HAB's reply dated 18 December 2013 to the PAC, we have provided information on the progress made in implementing Audit's and the PAC's recommendations under HAB's purview. An updated progress report including information on the progress made to date with the recommendations under the purview of the LandsD is at the Enclosure 6.

Chapter 2 – Management of roadside skips

Encl. 6

Encl. 7

- 62. The Administration accepts the recommendations in the Audit Report. To follow up on the recommendations, a Joint Working Group (JWG) has been set up in February 2014 to review the effectiveness of the existing regulatory and management regime on roadside skips and to explore measures to better regulate and facilitate the operation of roadside skips.
- 63. The JWG is led by the Environment Bureau/EPD, supported by the DEVB, Transport and Housing Bureau, FEHD, Home Affairs Department (HAD), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF), Highways Department (HyD), LandsD and Transport Department (TD).
- 64. The JWG is now collecting and collating relevant information with a view to ascertaining the magnitude of the skip problem and is reviewing the effectiveness of the existing enforcement regime on skips adopted by the LandsD and the HKPF. After reviewing the findings, including the feasibility of the idea of introducing a permit system, the JWG will consider and recommend the appropriate measures to better regulate and facilitate skip operations for discussion with stakeholders. It is expected that the JWG would complete the review within 2014. While the Administration will report to the relevant Panel of the LegCo as soon as the JWG completes its review, the Administration will also continue to keep the PAC informed of the progress of the JWG in the next progress report.
- 65. Taking into account the views of the PAC, EPD and TD are making joint efforts to educate the skip operators on the practices promulgated in the Guidelines on skip operations by the two departments. EPD and TD co-organized a seminar in March 2014 for practitioners from construction and related waste collection trades to promote the adoption of those practices in the Guidelines. More seminars are being planned for the rest of the year.

Progress Made in Implementing the Audit's Recommendations

66. A summary of the progress of implementing the Audit's recommendations is set out at Enclosure 7.

Chapter 3 – Allocation and utilisation of public rental housing flats

67. The Administration generally welcomes the views and accepts the recommendations made by the Audit and the PAC of the LegCo regarding the allocation and utilisation of public rental housing (PRH) flats. The Housing Department (HD) has accordingly taken actions to follow up on them as appropriate. The progress made is reported below.

Management of the Waiting List for General Applicants

- 68. The HD will continue to provide PRH to low-income families who cannot afford private rental accommodation and strive to maintain the average waiting time (AWT) ³ target at around three years for general applicants on the Waiting List (WL). The HD will also keep in view the number of applications on the WL and where possible, adjust the development programme for PRH and the Home Ownership Scheme as appropriate.
- 69. On the PAC's recommendation for the HD to consider publicising the definition of the AWT and the basis of its calculation through various public channels, the HD agreed that more can be done to publicise the definition of the AWT and the basis of its calculation. Apart from uploading the definition and computation method of the AWT onto the Housing Authority (HA)/HD's website on 29 January 2014, the HD has also taken action to incorporate into the brochure on "Waiting List for Public Rental Housing Information for Applicants" and the application form the definition and computation method of the AWT for applicants, together with clearer advice on the channels for obtaining declaration forms for PRH applications and the proper use of the forms as recommended by the Audit.
- 70. The HD agreed with the PAC's view that investigations should be conducted periodically to identify long-outstanding cases on the WL. The HD has in fact conducted an analysis of the housing situation of WL applicants each year since 2011 to study, amongst other things, those cases on the WL with longer waiting time. The reports of the analysis have been uploaded onto the HA/HD website for public reference. The HD also briefed the Panel on Housing of the LegCo on 4 November 2013 on the analysis of the WL position as at end-June 2013, and will undertake this analysis on an annual basis.

_

Under the established methodology, waiting time refers to the time taken between registration on the Waiting List and first flat offer, excluding any frozen period during the application period (e.g. when the applicant has not yet fulfilled the residence requirement; the applicant has requested to put his/her application on hold pending arrival of family members for family reunion; the applicant is imprisoned, etc.). The average waiting time for general applicants refers to the average of the waiting time of general applicants housed to public rental housing in the past 12 months.

Implementation of the Quota and Points System

- 71. The Audit considers that the current Quota and Points System (QPS) tends to encourage young applicants to apply for PRH under the QPS as early as possible, and unless such incentive is removed, the number of non-elderly one-person applications under the QPS is expected to continue to increase. In this connection, the PAC recommends the HD to examine whether there is room for improvement in the points system of the QPS.
- 72. PRH is intended for those who cannot afford private rental accommodation. Given the large number of applicants, there is a need to set priorities among different categories of applicants. The current policy is to accord priority to families and the elderly applicants (i.e. the general applicants) over non-elderly one-person applicants. The QPS was therefore introduced in September 2005 to rationalise and to re-prioritise the allocation of PRH to non-elderly one-person applicants. The QPS regulates the allocation of PRH to non-elderly one-person applicants on the basis of the age of applicants at the time of application, the length of time which they have been registered on the WL and whether they are existing PRH residents. In view of the ongoing increase in the number of general applicants on the WL, the HD considered that priority should continue to be given to families and elderly applicants (i.e. the general applicants).
- 73. On the PAC's recommendation that the HD should conduct a comprehensive review of the QPS and consider the need to screen out ineligible QPS applicants periodically, it is noteworthy that in the Long Term Housing Strategy (LTHS) Consultation Document published by the Steering Committee on Long Term Housing Strategy (the LTHS Steering Committee), the LTHS Steering Committee also put forward recommendations on the QPS, including allocating more points to those who are above the age of 45, developing a mechanism to regularly review the income and asset of QPS applicants, etc. The three-month public consultation on the LTHS ended on 2 December 2013. The Audit's recommendations and observations, the views received during the PAC's public hearings, as well as the LTHS Steering Committee's recommendations and feedback from the public collected during the public consultation exercise, have been referred to the HA for consideration.

Processing of Applications

74. On the Audit's recommendation that the HD should revise the application form, the Information for Applicants and the video clip on the availability and proper use of the declaration forms, and to take action to streamline processing of applications to avoid frequent returning of application forms back to the applicants, the HD has taken action to revise the application form, the brochure on 'Waiting List for Public Rental Housing - Information for Applicants' and the video clip to advise applicants where to obtain the declaration forms and the proper use of the forms.

75. The HD will continue to take measures to enhance the processing of applications, such as providing clearer advice to applicants and communicating with applicants to avoid frequent returning of application forms to applicants as far as possible.

Management and Control of Unoccupied Flats

- 76. The PAC considers that the HD should enhance the transparency of the vacancy rate of the PRH, in particular to make public the number of unoccupied flats which were "unlettable" or "under offer".
- 77. "Unlettable" flats are reserved for a purpose and are not available for letting to PRH applicants; whereas flats "under offer" are under offer to applicants and are expected to be taken up in the near future. Since both types of flats are not available for further letting, the HD considered it inappropriate to include these two types of flats in the vacancy rate.
- On PAC's recommendation that the HD should step up its efforts to ensure better utilisation of "unlettable" flats and higher turnover of "under offer" flats, the HD has already enhanced monitoring. Since December 2013, the HD has increased the frequency of the review on the need for continued reservation of these flats by the Regional Chief Managers from bi-monthly basis to one and a half month basis. Besides, since the 2012 Express Flat Allocation Scheme (EFAS) exercise, if an "under offer" flat is rejected by an applicant and the EFAS flat list is not yet finalised, the flat concerned will be included in the flat list for that EFAS exercise.

Under-occupation of Public Rental Housing Flats

79. Upon implementation of the revised Prioritised Under-occupation (PUO) threshold in October 2013, the tightened PUO standard leads to more families becoming PUO households that require mandatory transfer to smaller flats. The HD has been closely monitoring and exerting greater efforts to ensure that Notice-to-quit will be issued against those PUO households who refused four housing offers without valid reasons.

Conversion of Converted One Person and Housing for Senior Citizens Flats

80. Since February 2013, the HD has been implementing the management transfer for those non-elderly tenants in Housing for Senior Citizens (HSC) Type 1 units to step up the recovery of HSC units for conversion back into PRH flats. Additionally, system enhancement has been completed in October 2013 to provide for better monitoring the conversion of Conversion of Converted One Person (C1P) and HSC Type 1 units into PRH flats. With the implementation of the

above enhanced measures, the process of conversion has been accelerated. For those elderly tenants who are less adapted to new environments living in HSC Type 1 and C1P units, the HD will continue adopting a pragmatic yet persistent approach in encouraging them to apply for transfer.

Tackling Abuse of Public Rental Housing Flats

- 81. On PAC's recommendation that the HD should consider requiring applicants to submit supporting documents for major types of declarable assets at the pre-registration vetting stage, the HD has examined the issue carefully. In order to expedite the pre-registration vetting to allow applicants to be registered on the WL within a pledged time of three months and considering the fact that the value of investment and bank deposits will change over time, the HD considered it more appropriate to rely on the existing honour system and request applicants to declare their assets at the time of application and for them to notify the HD of any changes in the information after registration. The applicants will be requested to submit all supporting documents at the detailed vetting stage, which is close to the time of flat allocation, to determine their eligibility for PRH. To maintain the integrity of the system, at present the Public Housing Resources Management Sub-section (PHRM) will conduct detailed investigation through random selection of the WL applicants both at the initial vetting stage and at the detailed vetting stage. As such, the current system strikes an appropriate balance between avoiding having to ask applicants to submit too many supporting documents at the application stage hence delaying the application process on the one hand, and guarding against false submission of information on the other.
- 82. The HD has in August 2013 strengthened its guidelines and reminded the investigators of PHRM to follow the established timeframe in checking the income and assets of PRH applicants. To tighten monitoring and supervision, the investigators were required to report to their supervisors all cases that could not be completed within the prescribed timeframe (i.e. three months) whereas the supervisors were required to review the investigation progress regularly to ensure timely completion of all investigations.
- 83. In response to PAC's observation that the sample size used by the HD to select applicants on whom to conduct in-depth checking is small, the HD will increase the sample size of random checks from 300 to 600 cases per year with effective from 2014-15.
- 84. The HD has also strengthened efforts to deter false declarations by deploying an additional 30 experienced staff to increase the number of checks; doubling the publicity budget from \$2 million in 2012-13 to \$4 million in 2013-14 to promote awareness of the need of proper use of public housing resources; and publicising false declaration cases involving tenants convicted by the Courts to draw public attention to such cases.

The Way Forward

Encl. 8

85. The HD will take into account the PAC's observations and recommendations in the formulation of public housing policies, in particular the recommendations concerning allocation of flats to people in need of PRH. The HD will continue to carry out analysis on the housing situation of the WL applicants and to study the cases with longer waiting time on an annual basis; and will follow-up with the HA regarding the recommendations of the PAC in respect of the QPS.

Progress Made in Implementing the Audit's Recommendations

86. A summary of progress in implementing the Audit's recommendation is set out in the Enclosure 8.

Chapter 4 – Protection of country parks and special areas

87. The Administration welcomes the views and accepts the recommendations made by the Audit regarding the protection of country parks and special areas. The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) has taken appropriate follow-up actions to implement the recommendations.

Issues highlighted in the PAC Report

Patrolling practices at country parks

88. AFCD has thoroughly reviewed the current patrol beats, including the monitoring on enclaves and private lands, the beat length, coverage, check points and target frequency. Improvement measures including revision of patrol beats, addition of checkpoints, as well as setting appropriate target frequencies for patrol beats of all Ranger Offices have been implemented with effect from 1 April 2014. AFCD has established a proper record keeping system to monitor the patrolling duties and frequencies.

Protection of Country Parks Enclaves

89. The enclaves of Kam Shan, Sai Wan and Yuen Tun were incorporated into the Kam Shan Country Park, Sai Kung East Country Park and Tai Lam Country Park respectively on 30 December 2013. While the PlanD would continue its effort in protecting enclaves through statutory planning in accordance with the provision of the Town Planning Ordinance, AFCD will continue to assess the priority of incorporating the remaining enclaves into the existing country parks taking into account all relevant factors such as accessibility of the site and immediate

development threats, as well as the appropriate protection measures to be applied. Three enclaves at Fan Kei Tok, Sai Lau Kong and the site near Nam Shan are assessed to be suitable for incorporation into country parks in accordance with the updated principles and criteria. AFCD is consulting relevant stakeholders on the proposed country parks designation before the statutory procedure is invoked. AFCD will also carry out assessment for the remaining enclaves in light of the experience gained from the incorporation of the enclaves of Kam Shan, Sai Wan and Yuen Tun into country parks.

Encroachment of a landfill in the Clear Water Bay Country Park

90. According to the EPD, the Southeast New Territories Landfill will be closed in 2015. Of the 18 hectares (ha) of country park land inside the landfill, about 9 ha of land can be returned to AFCD after completion of about two years of restoration following the closure of the landfill. The remaining some 9 ha of land are located within the proposed landfill extension which is subject to LegCo's approval of the funding application. The landfill extension, if approved, will operate for about six years. Upon completion of the operation, the country park area within the extension site will be returned to AFCD after another two years of restoration. In the meantime, AFCD will continue to patrol in the Clear Water Bay Country Park (CWBCP). If any irregularity arising from the operation of the landfill is detected inside the CWBCP, AFCD and EPD will jointly take necessary action to rectify the situation.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

Encl. 9

91. AFCD has been actively following up the Audit's recommendations. Improvement measures have already been implemented or will be carried out on an on-going basis to address Audit's concerns. A summary of progress in implementing the Audit's recommendations is set out at the Enclosure 9.

Chapter 5 – Fire protection and prevention work of the Fire Services Department

92. The Fire Services Department (FSD) accepts the recommendations made by the Audit and notes the views of PAC of the LegCo. The FSD has set up a working group, chaired by a directorate officer, to study and take follow-up actions on Audit's recommendations on the fire protection and prevention work. Major measures taken/to be taken are set out as follows:

Monitoring fire service installations and equipment in buildings

93. To effectively monitor the maintenance of all Fire Service Installations and Equipment (FSIs) and the rectification of defective FSIs installed

in buildings, the FSD has been making use of a customised computer system which was commissioned in April 2012, to monitor the follow-up actions of building owners, occupiers and management offices who/which were found to have failed to submit the Certificate of Fire Service Installations and Equipment (FS251) after issuing advisory letters to them.

- 94. The FSD has made efforts to expedite the updating of existing computer database with FS251s received. By cross-matching building FSI information against the FS251s, the FSD would identify those buildings which have not submitted FS251 and take timely follow-up actions. The Department has also taken steps to promote the use of electronic form of FS251 by Registered Fire Service Installation Contractors (RFSICs).
- As regards the unwanted alarms, the FSD has taken actions to identify buildings with frequent unwanted alarms and will liaise with relevant buildings on proper installation and maintenance of the automatic fire detection systems with a view to reducing the unwanted alarms. The FSD has distributed pamphlets and posters on the proper maintenance of FSIs to relevant stakeholders such as property management companies, and plans to produce a new Announcement in the Public Interest (API) in this regard.

Monitoring licensed premises

96. The FSD has taken action to ensure that the verification inspections to FSIs in licensed premises would comply with the internal guidelines. The FSD has also adopted a risk-based inspection approach to monitor fire safety of the licensed premises.

Monitoring ventilating system

97. The FSD has been updating the existing database for ventilating systems. The FSD is preparing the relevant guidelines for the adoption of a risk-based approach for monitoring statutory annual inspections of ventilating systems in buildings and licensed premises.

Registration and monitoring of fire service installation contractors

- 98. The FSD has been reviewing the measures and relevant regulations to improve the fire service installation contractor registration scheme and the monitoring of the timely submission of FS251s by RFSICs. The FSD will discuss with the SB on follow-up actions at an appropriate time.
- 99. The FSD will continue to remind RFSICs to submit FS251s in time through various means. The FSD has introduced a bring-up system in January 2014 to ensure cases requiring disciplinary hearing by the Fire Service Installation Contractors Disciplinary Board would be conducted in a timely manner.

Handling complaints about fire safety

100. The FSD has reminded its staff to strictly follow internal guidelines when handling fire safety-related complaints and put in place an active reporting mechanism in monitoring the performance of handling fire safety-related complaints. The FSD has also implemented an internal audit mechanism in November 2013 under which random sampling check would be conducted on a monthly basis to ensure the accuracy of performance information on handling complaints.

Publicity and education on fire safety

101. The FSD is actively conducting market research for potential providers in undertaking a survey on future major publicity campaigns. The FSD will continue to educate the general public on fire safety and promote the Building Fire Safety Envoy Scheme so as to enhance the building fire safety. The department also plans to produce a new API to step up publicity on the statutory requirement to conduct annual inspection and maintenance of FSIs and will continue efforts to enhance public awareness of such requirement through various means such as uploading posters onto the departmental website and disseminating them to property management companies, etc.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

102. A summary of the progress of implementing the Audit's recommendations is at Enclosure 10.

Chapter 6 – Government's efforts to enhance fire safety of old buildings

- 103. The BD and the FSD agree with the recommendations made by the Audit and note the views of the PAC of the LegCo. Appropriate follow-up actions have been taken by both departments on the recommendations.
- 104. As the target buildings/premises, which are subject to the Fire Safety (Commercial Premises) Ordinance (FS(CP)O) (Cap. 502) and Fire Safety (Buildings) Ordinance (FS(B)O) (Cap. 572), were required to comply with the fire safety requirements under the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) in force at the time of their construction, these buildings/premises have already attained certain levels of fire safety protections before the completion of the required fire safety improvement works. As such, they do not pose imminent danger.
- 105. A joint working group headed by directorate officers of the BD and FSD is conducting an overall review on enhancing the implementation of the

FS(CP)O and FS(B)O taking into account relevant aspects including the recommendations put forward by the Audit and various previous commitments to the LegCo. Improvement measures and long-term enhancement strategy are also being considered by the working group.

Implementation of fire safety improvement programmes

- 106. To facilitate public understanding and monitoring of relevant implementation progress of FS(CP)O and FS(B)O, the BD and FSD will regularly upload the cumulative compliance information onto the respective departmental websites on a half-yearly basis (i.e. in January and July each year).
- 107. The FSD will make more proactive efforts to arrange meetings and seminars with the owner(s)/Owners' Corporation(s)(OC)/occupier(s)/Authorized Person(s)/Registered Fire Service Installation Contractor(s) to explain the fire safety requirements and provide assistance as appropriate.
- 108. On improving the compliance rates of Fire Safety Directions (FSDn), the FSD will step up inspections and progress checks and, at the same time, increase the frequency of issuing warning/reminding letters to the owner(s)/OC/occupier(s). In addition, the FSD has been conducting a feasibility study on further relaxing the capacity of water tank required for the fire hydrant/hose reel system to address the spatial and structural constraints of old buildings.
- 109. The FSD has been sending leaflets on financial assistance schemes together with the FSDn to the building owners to facilitate those who may encounter financial difficulties in complying with the FSDn to apply for subsidy/loan under the relevant schemes.
- 110. The BD and FSD will regularly forward the list of target buildings without OC to the HAD in advance to facilitate the HAD to provide timely assistance to the concerned buildings in forming OC before the joint inspections to the target buildings by the BD and FSD.
- 111. To assess whether the Government's financial assistance and technical support could meet the owners' needs, a survey in this aspect is planned to be conducted. The FSD, BD, Hong Kong Housing Society and Urban Renewal Authority have been working on the survey arrangement. It is expected that the survey will be conducted in the second quarter of 2014.
- 112. While the compliance rate of FSDn would largely depend on owners' efforts, the BD would step up efforts to improve the compliance rate by rendering continuous assistance to the owners for complying with the FSDn/fire safety improvement directions (directions), stepping up enforcement action on long outstanding cases without reasonable excuses and cases not showing any sign of positive follow-up action, and enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the outstanding directions.

Arrangements for inspections and issuing fire safety directions

- 113. The BD and FSD are jointly carrying out a review on the timeliness of inspections and issuance of FSDn as well as the appropriate performance targets. The two departments will also map out a plan for clearing the backlog of those target buildings to which FSDn have not yet been issued.
- 114. Guidelines for assisting the identification of Prescribed Commercial Premises (PCPs) under FS(CP)O have been reviewed and revised by the FSD and BD with a view to facilitating the identification of respective types of PCPs for inspection. The FSD has adopted the enhanced guidelines in the territory-wide scouting exercise commenced in February 2014.
- 115. The FSD will enhance its existing computer system with a view to strengthening case management and ensuring that cases will be managed and followed up in accordance with the internal guidelines.

Administration of fire safety directions issued

- 116. The BD is in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the timely issuance of directions as well as the outstanding directions so that follow-up and enforcement actions can be taken in a timely manner.
- 117. FSD officers have been reminded to strictly observe relevant internal instructions in the administration of FSDn issued. The enhancement of the existing computer system will help tighten controls over the case management and monitoring as well as enforcement actions against non-compliant owners/occupiers.

Follow-up actions on unauthorized building works found during inspections

118. The BD is reviewing its procedures on the handling of unauthorized building works (UBWs) with fire safety concerns, including works associated with subdivision of flats, with a view to following up in a more organized and efficient manner on UBWs identified during the inspections carried out under the FS(CP)O and FS(B)O.

Progress made in implementing the Audit's recommendations

119. Appropriate follow-up actions have been taken in response to the recommendations made by the Audit, details of which are set out at the Enclosure 11.

Encl. 11

Youth Square

Updated Progress of Implementing Audit's Recommendations (As at 14 May 2014)

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}		
Part 1: Ir	Part 1: Introduction			
1.14	Audit has recommended that the Secretary for Home Affairs (SHA) should take into account, in the 2013 review, the audit observations and recommendations in the Audit Report and consult, where appropriate, various stakeholders, namely the Commission on Youth, the Youth Square Management Advisory Committee (MAC), the management and operation contractor of Youth Square (the Management Contractor), the youth-related Non-governmental organisations (NGOs), and relevant government bureaux and departments (B/Ds) involved in youth development. In view of the fact that the youth development objective for the Youth Square (YS) might be conflicting with the full-cost-recovery objective that Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) aims to achieve, the Secretary may wish to critically consider, in the 2013 review, how the YS should be positioned to strike a proper balance between the two objectives.	The HAB completed the review on the YS in December 2013. The review has taken into account the views and recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC), the Audit Commission (Audit), and stakeholders. The review confirmed that it would not be realistic for YS to achieve full-cost recovery. It is recommended that YS should continue its position of serving as a focal point for youth development activities in Hong Kong by providing venues and facilities to the youths and youth organisations at affordable prices. Based on YS' operational and financial performance, a cost-recovery ratio of 50% is recommended. Recommendations of the review have been endorsed by the MAC and reported to the Legislative Council (LegCo) Panel on Home Affairs at its meeting in March 2014. As the review has been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.		
Part 2: O	Part 2: Operation and Performance			
2.19	Audit has recommended that SHA should:			
	Need to formulate qualitative and quantitative performance targets			
	(a) set qualitative and quantitative performance targets, as far as possible, to measure the extent of	(a) and 2.33 (b) The consultant for the review on the YS recommended that the contribution of		

 $^{^{}m Note}$ Figures are presented on contract year basis, i.e. from May to April of the following year.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
	the YS in contributing to youth development;	YS in enhancing youth development should be reflected by some "input-specific" measurement indicators demonstrating the number of youth events held at YS and the relevance of their natures and objectives to the YS' youth development objectives. The Management Contractor will maintain and report the statistics to HAB and MAC. As follow-up action will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Need to improve hostel usage by youth organisations	
	(b) continue making vigorous efforts to improve the hostel usage by youth organisations, such as stepping up promotion efforts for the YS;(c) assess the demand of youth	(b) & (c) Through various promotional efforts and implementation of concessionary proposals, the occupancy of the hostel, in particular by the target users, has continued to rise as reflected by:
	organisations for hostel accommodation and set an optimal target-user mix in the long term for the YS;	(i) an increase in the hostel usage from 85.5% in 2012-13 to 87.1% in the first 9 months of 2013-14; and
		(ii) an increase in the percentage of target users from 41% in 2012-13 to 53% in the first 9 months of 2013-14.
		The consultant confirmed that the concessionary proposals have been effective and recommended that the current hostel strategy and 40% target mix should be maintained at this stage and be monitored. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
	Need to increase the number of youth programmes	
	(d) continue making vigorous efforts to organise, in close collaboration with stakeholders, more meaningful and attractive youth programmes at the YS;	(d) HAB has taken note of the recommendation. In 2013, in collaboration with the Management Contractor, HAB has organised a number of meaningful and attractive youth programmes at the YS. Examples included Dancing Fest 2013, "Meet the Soccer Star" Sharing Session, Book Crossing Festival 2013, Crafts Mart 2013, Music for Food • Music for Good Charity Concert and Band Show, etc. As the above will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Need to improve usage of facilities by youth organisations	
	 (e) continue taking measures to enhance the gainful use of the offices at the YS for the intended purposes, such as introducing appropriate tenancy requirements on office use in future; (f) consider imposing tenancy requirements in future for office tenants to organise youth programmes at the YS; and 	(e) and (f) YS' office tenancy agreement requires the tenants to strictly comply with the business nature and operation hours as stipulated in their original rental applications. YS has also made reference to the organisation of activities at the YS by office tenants/applicants when considering the leasing applications. As follow-up action will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting these parts from the next progress report.
	(g) continue making efforts to invite more "high-priority" tenants to hire retail shops at the YS as far as possible.	(g) To improve the tenancy mix and attract "high-priority" tenants to hire retail shops at the YS, the consultant for the review on the YS recommended YS to:

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
		(i) offer a lower rental to the priority tenants;
		(ii) include social enterprises and young entrepreneurs as priority tenants to enjoy the same leasing terms on rental as other local non-profit making organisations; and
		(iii) relax the current 2-year lease term to allow a lease term of 3 to 4 years (i.e. 2+1 or 2+2) to attract target tenants.
		The above recommendations have been implemented with effect from 1 April 2014. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.33	Audit has recommended that SHA should:	
	Need to improve usage of facilities	
	 (a) regarding the low-usage facilities at the YS for audio recording, video recording and editing, photographic production, fashion and design, dancing and exhibition: (i) ascertain the reasons for their low utilisation; (ii) take measures to improve 	(a) The consultant for the review on the YS observed that some facilities had low utilisation because of their relatively high hiring charges and the relatively complicated rental policy. To improve the rental strategy for venues and facilities, the consultant recommended YS to:
	their utilisation; and (iii) in the event of continued low demand, consider converting	(i) provide further discounts for the target users for a number of facilities with low utilisation;
	some of the pertinent areas into other gainful use;	(ii) provide same concessions to individual youths for minor facilities;
		(iii) set regular rates based on the affordability of the target users; and

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
1101		(iv) simplify the rental system.
		The above recommendations from the consultant have been implemented with effect from 1 April 2014. We recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Need to improve recording of visitors	
	(b) take measures to compile more meaningful statistics to assess the popularity of the YS in meeting the youth development objective; and	(b) [see 2.19(a)]
	(c) continue stepping up efforts to promote the YS, particularly to youths.	(c) HAB has taken note of the recommendation. In 2013, in collaboration with the Management Contractor, HAB has organised a number of meaningful and attractive youth programmes at the YS. Examples included Dancing Fest 2013, "Meet the Soccer Star" Sharing Session, Book Crossing Festival 2013, Crafts Mart 2013, Music for Food • Music for Good Charity Concert and Band Show, etc.
		Apart from placing advertisements on local press and radio, the Management Contractor has continued its efforts to promote the YS to stakeholders through various means such as e-marketing, the YS website and Facebook, etc. They will continue to explore further channels to promote the YS, e.g. through District Councils and other government departments.
		As the above will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
2.46	Audit has recommended that SHA should:	
	Need to review justifications for the costs incurred	
	(a) consider whether the operating costs of the YS are justified by its contribution to youth development;	(a), (c) and (d) The consultant for the review on YS collated from stakeholders that as youth development is a long-term and
	 (c) review the rental strategy, in collaboration with the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau, with a view to offering the venues and facilities of the YS at affordable prices to the youths and, at the same time, achieving the full-cost-recovery objective as far as possible; and (d) if a proper balance between the two objectives in (c) above cannot be achieved, critically consider in HAB's 2013 review how the YS should be positioned. 	on-going process, input of resources from the Government is both necessary and justifiable. By offering a diversified range of venues and facilities for the young people and youth organisations, YS is an important platform for the Government to pursue its youth development objectives. To encourage patronage from youths and youth organisations, the rates charged for the facilities of YS have to be set at a level affordable to these target users whose budgets are limited; Since the opening of YS, its utilisation has been improving through various promotional efforts and implementation of concessionary proposals. On the other hand, YS has been incurring operating deficits due to various constraints. It is therefore not realistic for YS to achieve full-cost-recovery as originally planned. YS should continue its position of serving as a focal point for youth
		development activities in Hong Kong and contribute to youth development by providing venues and facilities to the youths and youth organisations at affordable prices.
		The future target cost-recovery ratio will be set at 50% which is considered to be reasonable and realistic based on

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date ^{Note}
		past experience and consultant's financial analysis. The recommendations of the consultancy review have been endorsed by the MAC and are being implemented progressively with effect from the 2014-15 financial year. HAB has also reported the outcome of the review to the LegCo Panel on Home Affairs at its meeting in March 2014. As the review has been completed and the follow-up action will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting these parts from the next progress
		report.
Part 4: W	ay Forward	
4.4	As mentioned in paragraph 1.14, Audit has recommended that SHA should take into account the audit observations and recommendations in the Audit Report in his 2013 review of the YS. In his review, the Secretary should also take into account the views of the youth-related NGOs summarized in paragraph 4.3.	The consultant engaged by HAB had completed the review on the YS in December 2013. In conducting the review, the consultant had taken into account the views and recommendations of the PAC and the Audit, and consulted various stakeholders involved in youth development. As the review has been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the
		recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Records management work of the Government Records Service

Updated Progress of Implementing Audit's Recommendations (As at May 2014)

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 4: M	Ianagement of Archival Records	
	Access to archival records	
4.35	Audit has recommended that the Director of Administration should: (a) expedite action on ascertaining the current B/Ds responsible for confirming the access status of the 627 archival records created by some former B/Ds	(a) The Government Records Service has completed the review and confirmed the access status of the 627 archival records accordingly. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this item from the next progress report.

Regulatory Control of Private Hospitals Progress in implementing the Audit's and PAC's Recommendations

Para. No.	Audit's/ PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 3: M	Ionitoring of Sentinel Events and Comp	olaints
Para. 3.21 of Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(c) consider issuing guidelines to private hospitals for the surveillance, reporting and management of sentinel events, as well as the setting up of relevant policies and procedures, particularly the criteria for disclosing sentinel events to the public; and	Department of Health (DH) has reviewed the sentinel event reporting system and will update the guidelines and implement improvement measures based on the recommendations by the Steering Committee on Review of the Regulation of Private Healthcare Facilities (Steering Committee).
	(d) consider disclosing in a timely manner the identities of private hospitals and more details of the sentinel events, including the cumulative number of sentinel events for each private hospital.	
Para. 3.22 of Audit Report	Consider aligning the systems and practices for disclosing sentinel events in both private and public hospitals as soon as possible.	
Part 4: P	rice Transparency in Hospital Charges	
Para. 4.17 of Audit Report	Take measures (e.g. by revising the Code of Practice for Private Hospitals, Nursing Homes and Maternity Homes (COP)) to further enhance the price transparency of private hospitals, taking into account the good practices adopted locally and overseas.	DH has reminded private hospitals to observe the requirements for disclosure of price information during inspections to private hospitals since 2013. The Steering Committee will review and examine measures that would help enhance price transparency, such as disclosure of price information, quotation system, packaged pricing and publication of statistics on hospital charges.

Para. No.	Audit's/ PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
Page 116 of PAC Report	The PAC urges the Administration to – (b) formulate guidelines for private hospitals to adopt standardised format and terminology for their fee schedules for the purpose of facilitating price comparison.	The Steering Committee is considering measures to enhance price transparency, including standardising the content of fee schedules provided by private hospitals.
Part 5: Po	erformance Reporting in Controlling O	officer's Report
Para. 5.7 of Audit Report	Audit recommends that the Administration should – (a) develop appropriate effectiveness/outcome indicators in respect of DH's regulatory work on private hospitals for publication in the Controlling Officer's Report (COR); and	Action completed. DH has revised the performance indicators for regulatory control of private hospitals and increased the target number of inspections to private
	(b) consider providing a breakdown of inspections conducted for each type of healthcare institution in the COR.	hospitals from once a year to not less than twice in a year. Action completed. DH has finished revising the COR with a breakdown of inspections by the type of healthcare institution.
Part 6: W	ay Forward	
Para. 6.14 of Audit Report	Audit recommends that the Administration should — (a) take into account the audit observations and recommendations, and take on board the findings and recommendations of the 2000 review when conducting a review on the regulatory regime for private healthcare facilities; and	The review of the regulatory regimes for private healthcare facilities will take into account the audit observations and recommendations, as well as the findings and recommendations of the 2000 review.

Para. No.	Audit's/ PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(c) explore the possibility of extending the set of special requirements (which are applicable to new private hospital developments) to existing private hospitals, for example through legislative amendments or other administrative measures (including revision of the COP).	The Food and Health Bureau (FHB) will look into the appropriateness and possibility of extending the set of special requirements to existing private hospitals in the context of the review on the regulatory regimes for private healthcare facilities.

Land Grants for Private Hospital Development Progress in implementing the Audit's and PAC's Recommendations

Para. No	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: S _]	pecial Land Grant Conditions set on Pr	ivate Hospitals
Page 152 of PAC Report	PAC urges the Administration to – (a) delineate clearly their responsibilities for the inclusion or continuance of the Two Salient Requirements in the terms of the private treaty grants (PTGs) made to non-profit-making private hospitals to ensure that essential requirements are always included in the lease terms in future.	The Lands Department (LandsD) has consulted relevant policy B/Ds on a draft general protocol to set out the responsibilities among B/Ds in the administration of PTGs and the subsequent monitoring of compliance and enforcement. Based on the feedback from B/Ds, the Administration will formulate a common code of shared responsibilities to guide B/Ds in the work.
		LandsD has issued internal guidelines to remind staff to liaise with the FHB/DH, taking future opportunity to include appropriate Government requirements in private hospital leases.
Part 3: M	Ionitoring and Enforcement of Land G	rant Conditions
Para. 5.10 of Audit Report	(e) put in place a proper mechanism and step up the Government's controls to monitor the private hospitals' compliance with the land grant conditions, in particular the provision of "free or low-charge beds" and the "profits/surplus plough-back" requirement;	DH and LandsD have stepped up efforts to ensure compliance by private hospitals with land grant conditions. DH has drawn up a checklist to facilitate the checking of compliance with land grant conditions relating to hospital services under DH's purview; DH and LandsD have continued with their discussion on the delineation of responsibilities for monitoring compliance with conditions of private hospital leases;
		Hospital D has set up a geriatric ward to provide 20 free beds since February 2013. The utilization rate of its low-charge beds also has improved. DH has stepped up the monitoring in this regard;

Para. No	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
		DH will monitor the implementation of low-charge beds by Hospital F, which will commence in July 2014; and
		DH has required the hospitals concerned to submit audited accounts and auditor's certification for their compliance with financially-related land grant conditions every year.
	(f) in the case of Hospital D and Hospital F, request the submission of grantees' confirmations and audited accounts to ensure that they have complied with the "profits/surplus plough-back"	Hospital D and Hospital F have submitted audited accounts and auditor's certification for their compliance with financially-related land grant conditions to DH;
	requirement in the land grants, and look into other issues highlighted in paragraph 3.13 (such as whether related party transactions and profit-sharing arrangements are permissible under the land grant	DH and LandsD are continuing the review of past audited accounts of the private hospitals concerned and following up with the grantees as necessary; and
	conditions);	DH has also reminded private hospitals to make applications to LandsD for any business arrangement with third party for providing services in the hospitals. LandsD would follow up on referrals and applications received and will take advice and seek policy support from FHB/DH in processing any such applications.
	(g) require Hospital C to rectify as early as possible, in consultation with the Social Welfare Department, the various irregularities found on LG 4;	Action completed. The amendment building plans submitted by Hospital C for the social centre for the elderly were approved by LandsD in May 2013. The building works had been completed and the social centre for the elderly commenced operation in November 2013.
	(i) take actions to clarify if similar situations as in Hospital E also exist in other private hospitals and take appropriate follow-up on the	DH has reminded private hospitals to make applications to LandsD for any business arrangement with third party for providing services in the hospitals.

Para. No	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to date
	three issues of audit concern as mentioned in paragraph 3.38, including whether the provision of specialist medical centres (operated by third parties) within the hospital premises on PTG sites would constitute subletting and whether the hospital management is responsible for the hospital-related services provided by such medical centres (see also page 161 of PAC Report).	No such application has been received so far. LandsD will follow up on referrals and applications, if received in future, and will take advice and seek policy support from FHB/DH in processing any such applications. As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 5: W	ay Forward and Audit Recommendati	ons
Para. 5.12 of Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(a) take steps to ensure that the 2011 minimum requirements set for new private hospitals to be developed on new Government sites are properly included in the land leases and service deeds to be entered into by the Government with the successful tenderers	Action completed. In disposing the Wong Chuk Hang site for private hospital development, the Administration has imposed a set of minimum requirements on the tenderer in the conditions of sale and the service deed; and
		DH has developed an enforcement protocol for monitoring compliance with the conditions of sale relating to hospital services and with the service deed.

Provision of local services by the Marine Department Progress in Implementing Audit's Recommendations (As at May 2014)

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: N	Management of Public Cargo Working A	Areas
	Re-tendering of vacant berths	
2.17(b)	The Director of Marine (D of M) shouldreview the tender terms with a view to minimising the risk of an operator surrendering his berth obtained at a high bid price and re-tendering for the surrendered berth at a lower bid price.	After conducting a review on the tender terms of Public Cargo Working Areas (PCWA) Berth License Agreements, Marine Department (MD) has included since October 2013 in the tender documents a restriction provision that prohibits an operator who has early surrendered a berth from bidding the same berth again if the surrender date falls within 12 months preceding invitation to the tender.
	Redeployment of posts	
2.25	D of M should:	
	(a) take urgent action to delete the 15 vacant posts of the decommissioned Kwun Tong and Cha Kwo Ling PCWAs; and	(a) Out of the 15 vacant posts, 12 were deleted by end of September 2013. For the remaining three posts, they were permanently redeployed by end of November 2013; and
	(b) grant covering approval for the 12 temporarily redeployed posts and critically review whether there is genuine long-term need for these posts with a view to arranging for their deletion/permanent redeployment in accordance with the requirements of Financial Circular No. 4/94.	(b) MD has arranged permanent redeployment of all these 12 posts in accordance with the requirements of Financial Circular No.4/94.
	Automated vehicle entry/exit control system	
2.36	D of M should:	
	(a) consider installing suitable automated vehicle entry/exit	(a) and (b) MD has worked out the project

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	control systems for Western District and Chai Wan PCWAs with a view to improving the cost effectiveness and control of their operation; and (b) expedite action to replace the unserviceable vehicle entry/exit control systems for Tuen Mun and Rambler Channel PCWAs.	proposals in consultation with the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD). EMSD is now conducting ground works, including site inspections and preparing for tender specifications, etc Tendering exercises will be conducted later this year.
Part 3 : \$	Surveying and licensing of vessels	
	Vessels without valid licences	
3.27(e)	D of M should conduct a review with a view to formulating appropriate prosecution guidelines on belated licence renewal cases.	MD has reviewed the existing practice in respect of expired licences and is revising the relevant guidelines on handling belated licence renewal cases, including the procedures of follow-up action. The changes will come into operation after clearance with Department of Justice and the parties concerned will be duly informed.
Part4: M	lanagement of private moorings	
	Control of private moorings	
4.14(a)	D of M should require owners concerned to remove private moorings not in use (such as those no longer used by their designated vessels as mentioned in para. 4.10) and vacate the spaces for MD's re-allocation to applicants on the waiting lists.	MD has stepped up patrol at designated mooring areas and is upgrading the computer system to further facilitate the patrol officers to conduct on-site inspection. Instead of commissioning in April 2014, the upgrading is now re-scheduled for completion in July 2014 to allow more time for strengthening the functions and design of the system before it is put into operation.
		MD completed the exercise of updating the information of designated vessels in August 2013. MD will continue to conduct on-site inspection and take follow-up action if a mooring is vacant

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		or not used by the designated vessel by following the established procedures to re-allocate any vacated spaces to applicants on the waiting list.

Direct Land Grants to Private Sports Clubs at Nil or Nominal Premium Progress in implementing the Audit and PAC Recommendations

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
General		
Para. 5.8 of the Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(a) work out a timetable for the policy review, so that new policy directions on Private Recreational Leases (PRLs) would be in place before the expiration of a number of PRLs;	A comprehensive policy review is now underway. Preliminary findings are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
	(b) take into account the needs and demands of different stakeholders (namely, the interests of the private sports clubs on PRLs and their members, and the wider public interest) and strike a proper balance between different objectives;	
	(c) set out key principles to be adopted for the renewal of existing PRLs and the granting of new PRLs in future, with a view that public interest will be better served; and	
	(d) conduct a similar review of the 37 PRLs granted to NGOs and other organisations (i.e. uniformed groups, welfare organisations, national/district sports associations and civil servants' associations) to ascertain if the Administration is facing similar problems and challenges ahead with these PRLs.	
Page 59 of the PAC Report	PAC urges that in renewing the PRLs for a 15-year term, the HAB should ensure that the following conditions of the prevailing PRL policy are met:	
	(a) the site note being required for a	The Administration will continue to

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	public purpose;(b) there being no significant breach of lease conditions;(c) the lessee having a	follow the prevailing policy in renewing PRL leases until there are any new policy directions on PRL in view of the outcome of the comprehensive review.
	non-discriminatory membership policy; and	
	(d) HAB having approved the "opening-up" scheme submitted by the lessee for fulfilling the greater access requirement.	
PART 2:	Government policy decisions in 1969 ar	nd 1979
Para. 5.9 of the Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(a) examine individual PRLs on a case-by-case basis and consider how they should be revised/refined in the light of changes in circumstances, taking into account the key principles set in the forthcoming policy review on PRLs;	Upon expiry of existing PRLs, LandsD and HAB will work together to consider whether the PRLs should be renewed with additional conditions on a case-by-case basis.
	(b) set up an effective mechanism to monitor the use of PRL sites, including the requirement to approve the developments on the PRL sites and the conduct of regular site inspections under the enforcement regimes of the HAB/LandsD;	Part of the comprehensive policy review is to strengthen the monitoring mechanism. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
	(c) draw up planning standards to help assess how PRL sites should in future be reasonably apportioned among sports and non-sports facilities to meet the purpose of the PRLs;	Part of the comprehensive policy review is to draw up a set of assessment guidelines to ensure reasonable apportionment of PRL sites. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(d) keep the clubs' membership and their use of the PRL sites under regular review;	The comprehensive policy review will take stock of the experience gained from over a year of implementing the "opening-up" schemes, and explore options for regular reviews of such schemes. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
	(e) step up controls to ensure that in future, commitments made to Executive Council (ExCo) relating to PRL policy are properly followed through for implementation; and	The Administration has been handling matters related to the PRLs in accordance with ExCo's policy decisions. The HAB will brief ExCo on the findings of the latest policy review upon completion of the report, and implement new policies and measures under the policy guidance of ExCo.
	(f) in future cases of sufficient importance, seek the advice of ExCo before granting the PRL.	HAB will work closely with LandsD and will seek the advice of ExCo where there are sufficient justifications to do so.
PART 3:	Implementation of the "opening-up" re	equirement
Para. 5.9 of the Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(g) keep the approved "opening-up" schemes for individual private sports clubs under regular review and monitor the scheme usage by Outside Bodies	The comprehensive policy review will take stock of the experience gained from implementing the "opening-up" schemes, and explore options for regular reviews of such schemes. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
	(h) closely monitor how the club mentioned in paragraph 3.22 of the Audit Report would implement its proposed "opening-up" scheme on the PRL before approval is granted;	HAB will examine how the club would implement its "opening-up" scheme before granting approval.
	(i) issue detailed guidelines to help private sports clubs report the scheme usage in their quarterly	HAB will take stock of the experience gained by requiring private sports clubs to submit quarterly reports. HAB will

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	reports submitted to the HAB (see also page 60 of the PAC report);	issue new guidelines in mid-2014 to assist clubs in making more detailed and accurate reports.
	(j) set up a proper mechanism to verify the reported usage of the clubs' sports facilities by Outside Bodies (see also page 60 of the PAC report);	HAB will take stock of the experience gained by requiring private sports clubs to submit quarterly reports. HAB will step up the verification of quarterly reports upon the release of new guidelines in mid-2014.
	 (k) continue stepping up publicity on the clubs' facilities available for use by Outside Bodies and coordinating with the Education Bureau (EDB) to encourage schools in the vicinity of the clubs to make more use of the clubs' facilities; and (l) take note of the obstacles ahead which might discourage Outside Bodies from using the clubs' facilities and take steps to overcome them as far as possible. 	HAB will coordinate with the EDB to encourage schools to make more use of the clubs' facilities. HAB will follow up with individual lessees in cases of low utilization by Outside Bodies to improve usage by, for example, adjusting publicity strategies. HAB have placed advertisements on print media in the first quarter of 2014.
Page 67 of the PAC report	PAC urges the Administration to step up its efforts to remind the clubs to promote the availability of their sports facilities.	HAB will follow up with individual lessees in cases of low utilization by Outside Bodies to improve usage by, for example, adjusting publicity strategies.
PART 4:	Monitoring of compliance with lease co	onditions
Para. 5.9 of the Audit	Audit recommends that the Administration should –	
Report	(m) follow up the irregularities/suspected non-compliances with Conditions of Grant reported in Examples 9 to 15; (see also pages 68-69 (i) – (vii) of PAC report):	LandsD will continue to follow up on individual cases of irregularities/suspected non-compliances with Conditions of Grant identified in Examples 9 to 15 in conjunction with HAB and other B/Ds as appropriate, having regard to facts and clarifications provided by grantees.

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	Example 9 Unauthorised building works	LandsD is following up the preparation of submission to the Buildings Department (BD) for rectification of the unauthorized building works.
	Example 10 & 11 Slopes not properly maintained	BD as empowered under section 27A of the Buildings Ordinance has taken up the concerned slope remedial works of Example 10 and would charge the club of the costs.
		LandsD has been closely monitoring the progress of the slope works of Example 11.
	Example 12 (see also page 60 & 61 (i) of PAC Report)	LandsD has been following up with the private sports clubs in Example 12.
	(i) One private sports club was found hosting on the PRL site wedding banquets/dining functions for members of the public; and	LandsD advised the club that to permit members of the public to use the lot under the lease to host wedding banquets on the lot was a breach of the lease. The grantee advised that they had ceased accepting booking of wedding banquets from members of the public.
	(ii) another club was found to have leased storage/mooring spaces on the PRL site to government departments.	After further clarifications with the clubs in Example 12, the concerned government departments, HAB and taking legal advice, LandsD has concluded that there is no non-compliance with the Conditions of Grant. In particular it was clarified that the mooring space being used by the department concerned does not fall within the PRL site. It is in fact part of some mooring spaces made available to the club by the MD on payment of prescribed fees. As for the leasing of storage spaces in the PRL site to another department, having regard to the club's confirmation that the concerned government department had no exclusive space on the PRL site as

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		stated in the contract between them and legal advice, the hiring of the storage spaces under the terms of the said contract does not breach the non-alienation clause of the lease.
	Example 13 (see also page 61 (ii) of PAC Report) One private sports club was found to have breached the lease condition on alienation by failing to first obtain a waiver from the LandsD before allowing the installation of radio base stations on the rooftop of the club's premises which was used for commercial purposes;	The club in Example 13 has submitted waiver application to LandsD for regularizing the installation of radio base stations on the PRL site. LandsD is processing the waiver application in consultation with relevant bureau/departments.
	Example 14 (see also page 61 (iii) of PAC Report) Master plans and building plans for one PRL granted to a private sports club had not been approved by the LandsD since 1995, but the club still proceeded with the building works; and	The club has submitted the master plans and building plans for approval under the Conditions of Grant. LandsD is consulting HAB and relevant departments on the plans.
	Example 15 (see also page 61 (iv) of PAC Report) LandsD had not monitored one private sports club's compliance with one of the lease conditions to permit local visitors to use the golf course on weekdays (subject to an overall limit of 10% of its capacity)	As long as the private sports club does not permit local visitors to use the golf course for more than 10% of the club's capacity on weekdays, there is no non-compliance with the Conditions of Grant.
	(n) conduct checks on the suspected commercial/subletting cases identified in Example 12 in paragraph 4.13, with scope expanded where appropriate, to other private sports clubs holding PRLs, and determine the full extent	LandsD has been actively following up with the clubs identified in Example 12 with HAB, taking legal advice on whether there is non-compliance of relevant restrictions.

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	and propriety of such practices; (o) critically review the existing PRLs and improve the Conditions of Grant in the long term, taking into account the useful Special Conditions identified in some of the existing PRLs which may help effective implementation of the Government's policy on PRLs (see also page 70 of the PAC report);	Upon expiry of existing PRLs, Lands D and HAB will work together to consider whether the PRLs should be renewed with additional conditions on a case-by-case basis.
Page 70 of the PAC Report	PAC urges the Administration to — establish a proper monitoring mechanism over PRLs to ensure the clubs' compliance with the Conditions of Grant and to safeguard public interest, including exploring the development of a set of guidelines on PRL conditions and rules which the clubs are expected to observe.	Part of the comprehensive policy review is to strengthen the monitoring mechanism. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
Page 61 of the PAC report	PAC also urges HAB and LandsD to expeditiously implement the relevant improvement measures to safeguard public interest.	
PART 5:	Way forward	
Para. 5.9 of Audit Report	Audit recommends that the Secretary for Home Affairs should – (p) work collaboratively with the Secretary for Development and Heads of other relevant government departments to assess whether any of the PRLs due for renewal should be renewed;	The comprehensive policy review will assess the status of PRLs due for renewal. Preliminary findings of the review are expected to be available by the end of 2014.
	(q) review whether the current practice of only assessing alterations that have been made to the Memorandum and Articles of Association (M&As) since the last renewals is sufficient to ensure that	When considering applications for PRL renewal, we will examine the existing M&As of the clubs to ensure that clubs on PRL sites have met the non-discriminatory membership policy requirement.

Para. No	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	all clubs on PRL sites have duly met the non-discriminatory membership policy requirement;	
	(r) monitor the progress of the renewals for the 16 expired PRLs, including those clubs which had submitted timetables for rectifying breaches on PRLs;	As at 28 February 2014, four of the 16 expired PRLs mentioned in paragraph 5.4(c) have been renewed, including the one mentioned in paragraphs 4.11 and 4.12. The club concerned was granted renewal of its PRL after the breaches were rectified. We will complete the renewal of the remaining 12 PRLs as soon as possible.
	(s) resolve the issue that part of the PRL site has overlapped with the Country Park in Example 16; and	LandsD is following up with HAB and other relevant parties on whether the site boundary should be adjusted for resolving the overlapping issue.
	(t) review the current status of the PRL which had expired since 1996, but was still under "hold-over" arrangement on quarterly basis, and critically consider whether the existing "hold-over" arrangement should continue.	LandsD is considering the subject in conjunction with HAB and Development Bureau (DEVB) to review the status of this PRL taking into account the latest programme for long-term use of the site.
Page 71 of PAC Report	PAC urges the Administration to follow up on Example 16 of the Audit Report which may constitute a threat to the safety of the visitors of the Country Park if the PRL site is allowed to continue overlapping with the Country Park.	LandsD is following up with HAB and other relevant parties on whether the site boundary should be adjusted for resolving the overlapping issue.

Enclosure 7

Management of Roadside Skips

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
2.00	Audit has recommended that the Secretary for Development, the Secretary for the Environment and the Secretary for Transport and Housing should jointly:	
5.6(a)	conduct a survey to ascertain the magnitude of the skip problem;	The Joint Working Group (JWG) is collecting data to determine the magnitude of the skip problem.
5.6(b)	conduct a review of the effectiveness of the existing enforcement actions on roadside skips taken by the LandsD and the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF);	LandsD has reviewed the operational arrangements for taking enforcement actions under the Land (Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance (Cap. 28) against roadside skips. Upon review, the department has fine-tuned its internal guidelines on the time of inspection and posting notices to shorten, as far as practicable, the action time after receiving complaints about roadside skips.
		HKPF has enhanced the reporting system on enforcement actions since January 2014 to facilitate the review on the effectiveness of enforcement actions.
		Based on the review conducted by LandsD and HKPF, the JWG will review the effectiveness of the existing enforcement actions.
5.6(c)	based on the results of para. 5.6(a) and (b), (i) formulate strategies and action plans for regulating and facilitating skip operations; and	Subject to output of action items 5.6(a) and 5.6(b), the JWG will consider and recommend the appropriate measures to regulate and facilitate skip operations for discussion with stakeholders.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(ii) assign a Government department to take up the responsibility for regulating and facilitating skip operations;	
5.6(d)	conduct a review to reassess whether the current situation justifies Government actions to introduce a regulatory system to regulate and facilitate skip operations; and	Subject to outputs of action items 5.6(a) and 5.6(b), the JWG will consider and recommend the appropriate measures to regulate and facilitate skip operations for discussion with stakeholders.
5.6(e)	seek the Secretary for Justice's advice on, apart from police officers, whether public officers of other relevant Government departments can take effective removal actions on unauthorised roadside skips placed on public roads.	The JWG is seeking views from the Secretary for Justice.
5.7	Audit has also recommended that the Director of Lands should remind District Lands Offices (DLOs) of the need to comply with Lands D Instructions on: (a) drawing up a list of black spots of unauthorised placing of skips; (b) formulating a patrol programme for the black spots; and (c) seeking assistance from pertinent District Councils and District Offices of the Home Affairs Department (HAD) for referring observed skips to the DLOs for actions.	The recommendations have been implemented. Reminder was sent to DLOs in December 2013. Following the reminder and having regard to the prevalence of roadside skips in individual districts, four DLOs have compiled black-spot lists of roadside skips and formed patrol programmes. The four DLOs, together with two other DLOs, have sought assistance from District Councils and District Offices for referring observed roadside skips for follow-up actions. The remaining DLOs are in the process to do the same. As the recommendations will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
5.8	Audit has also recommended that the Commissioner of Police should remind HKPF officers of the need to step up enforcement actions on roadside skips.	Frontline police officers have been regularly reminded of the need to take enforcement actions on roadside skips and that the internal operational guidelines would also be circulated via

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		the Police Intranet on a regular basis. The last reminder was issued in March 2014.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Allocation and Utilisation of Public Rental Housing Flats Updated Progress of Implementing Audit Recommendations (as at May 2014)

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Part 2: A	Allocation of Flats to People in Need of P	Public Rental Housing
2.31	Management of the Waiting List for general applicants	
	Transparency and accountability in the AWT computation	
	 (a) To enhance the transparency and accountability of Housing Department's (HD) management of the Waiting List (WL) for public rental housing (PRH) by, for example, the HD may consider: (i) publicising the definition of AWT and the basis of its calculation in the Housing Authority (HA)'s website, pamphlets and brochures; and (ii) enhancing the transparency of the flat allocation mechanism to help applicants make informed decisions. 	(a) The HD has already uploaded the definition and computation method of AWT onto the HA/HD's website on 29 January 2014. Action has also been taken to incorporate information on AWT into the brochure on "Waiting List for Public Rental Housing - Information for Applicants".
	WL applications	
	(b) To conduct investigations periodically to identify long-outstanding cases in which general applicants on the WL have waited for over 3 years without any housing offer, in particular for those cases with very long waiting time (say 5 years or more), and take necessary follow-up actions.	(b) The HD has conducted an analysis of the housing situation of WL applicants in 2011, 2012 and 2013 respectively to study, amongst other things, those cases on the WL with longer waiting time. The reports of the analysis have been uploaded onto the HA/HD website for public reference. The HD has also briefed the LegCo's Panel on Housing on 4 November 2013 on the analysis of the WL position as

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		at end-June 2013, and will continue with this analysis on an annual basis.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an ongoing basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.50	Implementation of the Quota and Points System	
	Sustainability of the QPS	
	 (a) To conduct a comprehensive review of the Quota and Points System (QPS), including: (i) examining whether there is room for improvement in the points system of the QPS; and 	(a) & (b) PRH is provided for those who cannot afford private rental accommodation. In view of the considerable number of applicants, there is a need to set priority among different categories of applicants.
	 (ii) assessing the effectiveness and sustainability of the QPS in achieving its objectives Screening out ineligible applicants on the WL (b) To consider the need to screen out ineligible QPS applicants from the WL on a periodic basis, and 	It is the policy of the Government and the HA to accord priority to the general applicants (which include family applicants and single elderly applicants) over non-elderly one-person applicants. The QPS was therefore introduced in 2005 to rationalise and to re-prioritise the allocation of PRH to non-elderly one-person applicants. The QPS regulates the allocation of PRH to non-elderly one-person applicants on the basis of the age of applicants at the time of application, the length of time which they have been registered on the WL and whether they are existing PRH residents. In view of the soaring number of
		general applicants on the WL, priority should continue to be given to families and elderly applicants (i.e. the general applicants).

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) To conduct regular checks to ensure that follow-up actions are promptly taken on applicants on the WL who have been housed in PRH through other channels.	On the PAC's recommendation that the HD should conduct a comprehensive review of the QPS and consider the need to screen out ineligible QPS applicants periodically, it is noteworthy that in the Long Term Housing Strategy Consultation Document published by the Steering Committee on Long Term Housing Strategy (the LTHS Steering Committee), the LTHS Steering Committee also put forward recommendations on the QPS, including allocating more points to those who are above the age of 45, developing a mechanism to regularly review the income and asset of QPS applicants, etc. The three-month public consultation on the LTHS ended on 2 December 2013. Audit's recommendations and observations, the views received during the PAC's public hearings, as well as the LTHS Steering Committee's recommendations and views of the public collected during the public consultation exercise, have been referred to the HA for consideration. (c) The HD has reminded staff to conduct regular checks to ensure that follow-up actions were promptly taken on WL applicants who had been housed through other channels.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.79	Processing of applications	
	Use of declaration forms	
	(a) To consider suitably revising the Information for Applicants and the	(a) The HD has taken action to revise the "Information for Applicants"

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	video clip to provide guidance to applicants on the availability and the proper use of the declaration forms provided by the HD.	brochure and the video clip to provide more guidance to applicants in respect of the declaration forms. As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Resubmitted applications	
	 (b) To take measures to streamline HD's processing of applications, in order to avoid frequent returning application forms to the applicants multiple times. For example, the HD should consider: (i) communicating with applicants by telephone or interview as far as possible to take necessary follow-up action; (ii) providing applicants with clearer advice on the information required by the HD; and (iii) requiring the applicants to make reference to previous return letters when resubmitting applications. 	 (b) The HD has adopted a three-pronged approach to enhance the processing of applications: the applicants have already been requested to refer to the letters attached to the return application forms listing out the missing information for the applicants to follow up; for those applications which have been returned more than twice, HD staff will contact the applicants by telephone or by interview; and action has been taken to provide clearer guidelines to applicants on the brochure on "Waiting List for Public Rental Housing - Information for Applicants" and to revise the video clip on PRH application reminding the applicants to refer to previously returned letters when resubmitting applications. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Update on deceased persons records	
	(c) To take measures to ensure that the names of the deceased persons are promptly deleted from the WL for	(c) The HD has reminded staff to take prompt action to delete records of deceased person from the WL for

Para. No.		Audit's Recommendations		Progress to Date
		PRH.		PRH.
				As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Che	ecking of outstanding records		
	(d)	To conduct the random checking of outstanding deceased person records on a periodic basis, so as to ensure that follow-up actions are taken promptly.	(d)	The HD has reminded the Housing Managers concerned to conduct the random checking of outstanding deceased person records on a periodic basis.
				As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(e)	To consider using a risk-based approach in selecting samples for checking of outstanding deceased person records. For example, all long outstanding cases should be selected for checking.	(e)	The HD has reminded the Housing Managers to adopt a risk-based approach in selecting all long outstanding cases of deceased persons' records for checking. As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part
				from the next progress report.
	Rai asse	ndom checking of income and ets		
	(f)	To investigate into the reasons for the unduly long time taken by Public Housing Resources Management Sub-section (PHRM) for the random checking of income and assets, particularly the significant increase in the average case investigation time in the past few years.	(f)	The PHRM had in August 2013 strengthened its guidelines and reminded the investigators to follow the established timeframe in checking the income and assets of PRH applicants.
	(g)	To take measures to expedite PHRM's efforts to conduct the	(g)	To tighten monitoring and supervision, the investigator is

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations		Progress to Date
	random checking on income and assets.		required to submit written application with justifications to the supervising Assistant Housing Managers and Housing Managers for extension of the investigation time to 4 months and 6 months respectively if a case cannot be completed within the 3-month time frame. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 3: M	Taximising the Rational Utilisation of Po	ublic	Rental Housing Flats
3.24	Management and control of unoccupied flats and close monitoring of "under-offer" flats and unlettable flats		
	(a) To step up the monitoring of "under offer" flats and unlettable flats, for example by increasing the frequency of the monitoring checks.	(a)	The HD has tightened the monitoring system by shortening the intervals of review on flat reservation by Regional Chief Managers (RCMs) from bi-monthly basis to 1.5 month basis.
			As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Letting of long vacant flats		
	(b) To expedite the letting of long vacant flats, including the "under offer" flats by including them in the Express Flat Allocation Scheme (EFAS).	(b)	The HD has included the "under offer" flats as targets for flat pooling. Unless there are other more suitable usages, flats meeting the EFAS flat pooling criteria with offers refused before finalisation of the flat list will be pooled for EFAS exercises.
			As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		part from the next progress report.
	Refurbishment of vacated flats	
	(c) To closely monitor the progress of refurbishment works for vacated flats. In particular, cases involving long periods of refurbishment should be reported to the senior management for attention.	(c) Departmental guidelines have set out the timeframe for refurbishment work. The HD is able to meet the pledge of completing refurbishment of vacant flats within 44 days on average.
		Some vacant flats involved serious water seepage, structural repairs, re-roofing works above the flats and special technical arrangements that required more time for refurbishment. The cases mentioned in the audit report were very special or isolated cases where additional processing time was justified.
		The progress of vacant flats refurbishment works is under the monitoring of Senior Works Professional and Works Professional in the Bi-monthly Contract Meeting and Weekly Meeting respectively. To further tighten the monitoring, cases involving long refurbishment period are reported and monitored in an internal committee chaired by Assistant Directors.
		System enhancement was completed in October 2013 to generate batch report for monitoring the conversion progress of Converted One Person (C1P) and Housing for Senior Citizens (HSC) flats.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Monitoring of unlettable flats	
	(d) To enhance the monitoring mechanism for flats which have remained unlettable for a long time.	(d) Memo by Chief Housing Manager/Applications has been issued to RCMs for reviewing the position of unlettable flats on a 1.5-month basis.
		As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(e) To require estate staff to indicate the expected period of reservation for reserving flats as unlettable flats so that the senior management can closely monitor the use of these reserved flats.	(e) The HD has required estate staff to specify the expected reservation end date when reserving unlettable flats.
		As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Conversion of HSC and C1P flats	
	(f) To expedite the phasing out of the HSC and C1P flats and conversion into normal PRH flats for allocation.	(f) All HSC Type 1 tenants have been included in the phasing-out programme since 2011. Upon review in February 2013, the HD has arranged management transfer for all non-elderly tenants of HSC Type I flats to further expedite the flat recovery for conversion to PRH flats.
		The HD has also carried out the system enhancement in October 2013 to better monitor the conversion progress for recovered C1P and HSC Type I flats.
		Monthly monitoring has been

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		conducted at headquarters level to ensure prompt actions are being taken.
		For those elderly tenants who are less adapted to new environments living in HSC Type I and C1P units, the HD will continue adopting a pragmatic yet persistent approach in encouraging them to apply for transfer.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.40	Implementation of the Well-off Tenants Policies	
	Verification of reasons for Housing Subsidy Policy (HSP) exemption	
	(a) To take measures to ensure that all exemption indicators in the Domestic Tenancy Management Sub-system (DTMS) are correctly	(a) Instruction has been issued to remind estate staff to promptly update irregular cases and records in DTMS.
	recorded.	Tenancies of Elderly Priority Scheme and Shared Tenancies have been included for purification exercise before starting the new HSP declaration cycle.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Review of the Well-off Tenants Policies	
	(b) To critically review the Well-off Tenants Policies to see whether the various parameters of the HSP and the Policy on Safeguarding	(b) "Well-off Tenants Policies" is one of the discussion items of the Steering Committee on LTHS. The Steering Committee has taken note

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	Rational Allocation of Public Housing Resources (SRA) can be fine-tuned for further improvements.	that there are divergent views on the policies in the community. The public consultation document on LTHS further invited public's views on the policies and the collected views have been passed to the HA for consideration.
	(c) To explore ways to encourage well-off PRH tenants to purchase Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) flats.	(c) The HD will consider offering well-off PRH tenants priority to purchase HOS flats when the new HOS programme is launched later.
3.62	Under-occupation of PRH flats	
	Stepping up efforts to tackle the Under-occupation (UO) issue	
	(a) To step up HD's efforts in tackling the UO issue, paying particular attention to those long-outstanding UO households.	(a) Triggered by the Audit recommendations in 2006 that the HA should draw up a plan to tackle the UO problem in order of priorities, the HA has formulated a phased approach and accorded priority to tackle those Prioritised Under-occupation (PUO) cases (formerly known as Most Serious Under-occupation, viz. MS UO cases) having due regard to the increasing demand from other rehousing categories and the acute supply of small flats. Families with disabled or elderly members aged 60 or above were being put at end of the UO transfer list.
		The majority (about 72%) of the long-outstanding UO cases identified in the audit study belong to the elderly or disabled categories that were put at the end of the UO transfer list. With effect from October 2013, about 48% of the above mentioned long-outstanding UO cases were having disabled or

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		elderly members aged 70 or above that have been excluded from the UO list. The HD would continue according priority to tackle those identified PUO cases before the policy is to be reviewed in 2016.
	Progress monitoring for MS UO cases	
	(b) To expedite HD's effort in dealing with the MS UO cases, paying particular attention to those long-outstanding MS UO cases.	(b) The reason for those long-outstanding PUO cases may attribute to the shortage of small vacant units in the same estates which the PUO tenants requested for transfer. The frontline staff have been reminded to proceed with offer of housing allocations within the same District Council district if flats of suitable size within the residing estate are not available for arranging the internal transfer.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(c) To consider terminating the existing tenancies of those MS UO households who refused all the housing offers without valid reasons.	(c) The frontline staff have been reminded to strictly follow the prevailing guidelines to consider issuing Notice-to-quit to terminate the tenancies for those PUO households who refused 4 housing offers without valid reasons.
		Monthly report on the transfer progress of PUO cases is submitted to the headquarters level for monitoring purpose.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	UO households each occupying more than one PRH flat	
	(d) To make greater efforts to persuade UO households each occupying 2 or more flats to surrender at least one flat, or transfer to flats of appropriate size.	(d) Upon implementation of the revised PUO threshold in October 2013, the HD has been exerting greater efforts to arrange management transfer for those households occupying 2 or more flats with living density exceeding the prescribed thresholds.
		As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 4: Ta	ackling Abuse of Public Retal Housing	
4.17	Checking of eligibility of applicants	
	Supporting documents for preliminary vetting	
	(a) To consider requiring applicants to submit supporting documents for declarable assets at the date of application for preliminary vetting.	(a) In order to expedite the pre-registration vetting to allow applicants to be registered on the WL within a pledged time of three months and considering the fact that the value of investment and bank deposits will change over time, the HD considered it more appropriate to rely on the existing honour system and request applicants to declare their asset amount at the time of application and for them to notify us of any changes in the information after registration. The applicants will be requested to submit all supporting documents at the detailed vetting stage, which is closer to the time of flat allocation, to determine their eligibility for PRH. To maintain the integrity of the system, at present the PHRM will conduct detailed investigation through

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		random selection of the WL applicants both at the initial vetting stage and at the detailed vetting stage. As such, the current system strikes an appropriate balance between avoiding the need for the applicant to submit too many supporting documents at the application stage hence delaying the application process on the one hand, and guarding against false submission of information on the other. As the HD has considered the recommendation, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	In-depth checking of selected applications	
	(b) To remind Applications Sub-section and PHRM to select additional cases to make good any shortfalls in the selected cases to meet the pre-determined sample size for in-depth checking of applicants.	 (b) The HD has already reminded staff to select additional cases to make good the shortfalls in the selected cases to meet the pre-determined sample size for in-depth checking. As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(c) To consider increasing the sample size for in-depth checking by PHRM on new applications in view of the high rates of detected false declarations.	(c) The sample size of applications for in-depth checking by PHRM has been increased from 300 to 600 cases starting from April 2014.As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations		Progress to Date
	Follow-up actions on false declarations (d) To align the practices within the Applications Sub-section between the Registration and Civil Service Unit and the Waiting List Unit in handling false declaration cases identified by PHRM to ensure fairness in treatment.	(d)	The practices in handling false declaration cases within Applications Sub-section have already been aligned. As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
4.35	Processing of household declarations under the Well-off Tenants Policies		
	Need to strengthen the monitoring mechanism		
	(a) To strengthen the mechanism by issuing more detailed guidelines on conducting and monitoring of HSP reviews conducted by estate offices.	(a)	Staff have been reminded to comply with the detailed guidelines to follow up the submission of declaration forms from tenants in each HSP exercise. The management would further strengthen the overall monitoring of the implementation of HSP. As follow-up action has been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Need to strengthen strategy to deter false declarations		
	(b) To keep under review the rates of detected false declarations under the HSP and the SRA, and strengthen strategy to deter false declarations.	(b)	The HD has strengthened the efforts in deterring false declarations by carrying out the following actions –
	deciarations.		(i) deploying additional 30 experienced staff to increase the number of checkings for one year;
			(ii) increaseing the publicity budget from \$2M in 2012-13

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		to \$4M in 2013-14; and (iii) publicising convicted false declaration cases to draw public attention. As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Areas for improvement on in-depth checking and follow-up actions	
	(c) To issue more detailed guidelines to PHRM staff and closely monitor the investigation for conducting in-depth checking.	(c) Updated in-house guidelines were issued in early March 2014 for HD staff's compliance. Supervisors of PHRM would closely monitor the investigation and offer advice to the Housing Officers on doubtful cases.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(d) To strengthen supervisory controls over follow-up actions on false declaration cases.	(d) Frontline staff have been reminded to observe the existing guidelines on handling false declarations.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
4.51	Flat inspections under the Biennial Inspection System	
	 Flat inspection practices (a) To adopt a standard checklist with detailed instructions for conducting flat inspections to ensure consistency in checking practices 	(a) The HD has enhanced the existing guidelines and reminded frontline staff to observe them when conducting flat inspections.
	among estates and among estate	As follow-up action has been

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	staff.	taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Supervisory checking on inspections	
	(b) To instruct estate staff to input correctly the details and code of inspection results for supervisory checking.	(b) Staff have been reminded to comply with the existing guidelines for conducting flat inspection and refer suspected tenancy abuse cases to PHRM for in-depth investigations.
		As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Inspections with only one household member found	
	(c) To keep in view the percentage of cases where only one household member was seen during flat inspections and consider the need for additional measures for following up such cases.	(c) HD staff are trained to detect occupancy irregularities by observations of the bedding facilities, furniture arrangement and personal belongings of household members etc. during flat inspections. Additional guideline has been issued reminding HD staff to observe the prevailing requirements when conducting the flat inspections. As follow-up action has been
		taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
1	Monitoring of follow-up inspections	
	(d) To remind estate staff to follow laid-down procedures to conduct follow-up flat inspections for warranted cases (e.g. admission of elderly household members to residential care homes, and cases involving conditional residence).	(d) Estate staff have been reminded to follow the laid-down procedures on conducting follow-up inspections.As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(d) To remind estate staff to follow laid-down procedures to conduct follow-up flat inspections for warranted cases (e.g. admission of elderly household members to residential care homes, and cases	(d) Estate staff have been reminfollow the laid-down proceducting follow-up inspectation. As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.68	Enforcement actions	
	Time bar for prosecution action	
	(a) To take measures to ensure that HD staff are aware of and observe the requirements to submit relevant files and documents to the Prosecutions Section for taking prosecution action at least two months before the time bar.	(a) The HD has reminded staff to observe the timeframe for prosecution action.As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Sufficiency of evidence for prosecution	
	(b) To require HD staff to use the Checklist to record the interview with applicants/tenants when conducting investigation.	(b) Staff have been reminded to use the Checklist during initial investigation for establishment of the knowingly element and recording interviews/statements.
		PHRM staff will caution each interviewee before starting the investigation interview and require the interviewee to declare his income/assets instantly on requisite forms. They will record details of rigorous checking on income/assets declarations in the investigation report.
		If any false declaration is suspected, the case will be referred to PHRM for in-depth investigation including conducting "investigation interview", taking cautioned statements and gathering evidence for prosecution.
		As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Prosecution of WL applicants making false declarations	
	(c) To continue to analyse periodically the reasons for the low prosecution	(c) The HD has taken follow-up actions to continue to analyse the

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	rates for false declaration cases.	reasons for the low prosecution rates for false statement cases. The reasons for "not to prosecute" were analysed critically in each case for the purpose of enhancing the chance of conviction in future similar cases. As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(d) To take measures to ensure that the relevant information provided in the declaration forms can be used, if necessary, as evidence for prosecution, including for example, reviewing all forms relating to PRH application so that all declaration forms include a clause indicating that the declarations made therein are subject to legal liabilities of knowingly making false statements, and, if necessary, conducting investigation interviews in connection with the completion of HD forms.	(d) The declaration forms have been revised to the effect that they can serve as evidence for prosecution.As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(e) To further enhance legal training (including experience sharing seminars) for staff of the Applications Sub-section and housing estates in order to equip them with better knowledge on gathering sufficient evidence for prosecuting applicants making false declarations.	(e) The HD has taken follow-up actions to enhance legal training related to prosecution system and investigation skills (including organising more experience sharing seminars on evidence collection, witness and cautioned statements for suspected false declaration cases). Some legal training programmes have already been lined up for February and March 2014. In addition to the regular legal training programmes, more experience sharing sessions will be organised in 2014-15.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
PART 5:	WAY FORWARD	
5.8	Way Forward	
	(a) Audit recommends that the audit observations and recommendations in this Audit Report in taking forward the LTHS Review should be taken on board.	(a) The Steering Committee on LTHS has published a Consultation Document on the LTHS for Hong Kong for the next ten years. The Steering Committee's recommendations and all of the views collected during the consultation period have been referred to the HA for consideration and implementation.

Protection of Country Parks and Special Areas Progress in Implementing Audit's recommendations

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
2.23	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) require all Ranger Offices to set appropriate target frequencies for routine patrols of their foot beats;	(a) - (c), (e) and (f) AFCD has thoroughly reviewed the current patrol beats, including the monitoring on enclaves and private
	 (b) review the adequacy of the coverage and frequency of routine patrols in individual Ranger Offices, taking account of the need for monitoring development activities in enclaves and on private land; (c) remind Ranger Offices to conduct 	lands, the beat length, coverage, check points and target frequency. Improvement measures including revision of patrol beats, addition of checkpoints, as well as setting appropriate target frequencies for patrol beats of all Ranger Offices have been implemented with effect from 1 April 2014. AFCD has established a proper
	routine patrols according to the planned coverage and frequencies;	record keeping system to monitor the patrolling duties and frequencies.
	(d) require Ranger Offices to maintain adequate records of staff deployment, in particular, records of the use of any unplanned time after completion of routine patrols;	(d) A proper record keeping system has been implemented with effect from 1 April 2014 for all Ranger Offices to record the staff deployment including patrolling and other duties such as providing
	(e) take measures to improve the efficiency in the conduct of routine patrols;	visitor services and compiling reports.
	(f) consider setting more check points for inspection along the foot beats, with a view to improving the accountability of patrol staff and the quality of their routine patrols; and	(g) The downtime of the GPS function of the PDAs was mainly due to the map generation function of the server which caused no GPS map being shown on web application. Such problem was fixed after the programme in the server was modified in August 2013. To
	(g) ascertain the reasons for and minimise the downtime of the	ensure that any malfunction of the server could be detected as early as

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
	Global Positioning System (GPS)function of the Personal Data Assistants (PDAs) provided to patrol staff.	possible so that remedial action could be taken. However, poor GPS signals in certain remote locations of the country parks is an intrinsic limitation of the technology that cannot be fully resolved. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.29	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should, having regard to the need for conserving natural environment, take measures to better meet visitors' needs for camping in country parks, such as:	
	(a) exploring the feasibility of providing new designated campsites in suitable locations, in particular, in country parks which do not have any designated campsites; and	(a) AFCD has explored the feasibility of providing more designated campsites in country parks. For instance, a site at Ham Tin in Sai Kung East Country Park was designated as a campsite for the use of the public in September 2013. A new campsite at Sai Wan in Sai Kung East Country Park is being planned. AFCD would continue to explore the feasibility of providing more designated campsites in country parks as necessary.
	(b) consider providing more tent spaces at existing designated campsites.	(b) AFCD has conducted improvement works (e.g. removal of barbecue pits with low usage rate, soil re-profiling and extension of campsite boundary) at the designated campsites in Twisk, Hok Tau, Rotary Park at Tai Mo Shan, Ngong Ping in Lantau, Tai Tan in Sai Kung with an aim of providing more space at these campsites.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.41	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) keep in view the advance in technology for automated fire surveillance systems and their use in the Mainland and overseas, with a view to exploring the feasibility of applying the technology in Hong Kong; and	(a) AFCD has approached a service provider to examine the infrastructure (i.e. electricity supply, 3G technology, etc.) for installing an automated fire surveillance system on a trial basis at a hillfire lookout in a country park in January 2014. AFCD will study the trial results for this hillfire surveillance system. If the initial results are positive, AFCD will consider further evaluating the applicability of the system in country parks by expanding the scope of the study. As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) examine the desirability of prohibiting smoking (or restricting smoking only to designated areas) in country parks, having regard to the need for further reducing fire hazard and the need for better conserving country parks.	 (b) Following Audit's recommendation, AFCD has conducted a review to examine the desirability and feasibility of prohibiting smoking in country parks with a view to further reducing the fire hazard for better conserving country parks. The review suggests that prohibiting smoking in country parks for fire hazard reduction is neither practical nor necessary. Our findings are set out as follows: There is a significant decrease in
		hill fires inside country parks in

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		recent years, from over 100 cases some 10 years ago to 18 cases in 2012-13;
		• Smoking is not the major source of hill fires in recent years;
		 It is already an offence to discard burnt cigarettes under the Country Parks and Special Areas Regulations (Cap 208A);
		Unlike the Hong Kong Wetland Park (where smoking is prohibited) which has a well-defined boundary and entrances, the boundaries of country parks are long and unmarked on the ground hence difficult to recognize for smokers, the public or the enforcement staff; and
		 For the recreation areas in country parks, they are rarely the origins of hill fires according to our records; and
		• According to the view of the then Health, Welfare and Food Bureau (HWFB) in 2006, country parks are extensive open air areas, the health impacts of second-hand smoke is difficult to establish.
		It is noted that the hill fire issues remain basically the same when the then HWFB conducted the review on smoking ban in country parks in 2006 except that hill fire number in country parks has further declined. In this connection, we do not see an imminent need to conduct smoking ban in country parks.
		Higher public awareness on fire safety is one of the major factors contributing to fewer hill fire cases.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
2.00		Publicity programmes on hill fire prevention from AFCD and other departments have proved to be effective.
		As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.22	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) critically review the progress made by the AFCD in protecting enclaves by incorporating them into country parks, with a view to devising a more effective strategy for incorporating the 27 enclaves into country parks in accordance with the October 2010 arrangements. In particular, the AFCD should:	
	(i) for the 3 enclaves with designation process initiated, take measure to ensure that the process is completed in a timely manner as intended; and	(a)(i) The enclaves of Kam Shan, Sai Wan and Yuen Tun were incorporated into the Kam Shan Country Park, Sai Kung East Country Park and Tai Lam Country Park respectively on 30 December 2013.
	(ii) devise a timetable for designating the remaining 24 enclaves having regard to the need to give priority to enclaves identified to be under imminent development threats, including the priority sites identified in October 2010 (see paras. 3.3 to 3.5), and the enclave at Tsing Fai Tong with incompatible developments detected in early 2013;	(a)(ii) AFCD will continue to assess the priority of incorporating the remaining enclaves into the existing country parks taking into account all relevant factors such as accessibility of the site and immediate development threats, as well as the appropriate protection measures to be applied. Three enclaves at Fan Kei Tok, Sai Lau Kong and the site near Nam Shan are assessed to be suitable for incorporation into country parks in accordance with the established principles and criteria. AFCD is

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		consulting relevant stakeholders on the proposed country park designation before the statutory procedure is invoked. AFCD will also carry out assessment for the remaining enclaves in light of the experience gained from the incorporation of the enclave of Kam Shan, Sai Wan and Yuen Tun into country parks.
	(b) continue to monitor possible incompatible development activities at enclaves for necessary follow-up actions by relevant departments; and	(b) AFCD has taken the monitoring of enclaves into consideration when revising the patrol beats mentioned in the progress with respect to para. 2.23. AFCD would continue to monitor possible incompatible development activities at enclaves.
	(c) further promote the use of the MA Scheme for conserving enclaves.	(c) AFCD is encouraging suitable non-profit organizations to enter into management agreement (MA) with the landowners to promote ecotourism in Sai Wan. Besides, AFCD will continue to further promote the use of the MA Scheme for conserving enclaves to non-profit organizations, relevant District Councils and rural communities.
		As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.23	Audit has recommended that the Director of Planning should continue its efforts in protecting enclaves through statutory planning in accordance with the October 2010 arrangement	Since the Sai Wan incident, the Government has committed to incorporating the remaining 54 enclaves either as part of the Country Parks or Development Permission Area (DPA) plans. To date, 25 of these remaining enclaves have been covered by 18 DPA plans (with Sai Wan included as part of the Sai Kung East Country Park and six enclaves have been replaced by Outline

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		Zoning Plans (OZPS)). The Planning Department will continue
		the best efforts to prepare statutory plans for the remaining enclaves deemed suitable for designation as DPAs in 2014. OZPs will also be prepared to replace the DPA plans in three years' time in accordance with the provision of the Town Planning Ordinance.
		As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.32	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) in consultation with the Director of Lands, review the adequacy of the arrangements for following up unauthorised development on private land within country parks, taking account of the need for prompt action to contain the problem at an early stage;	(a) AFCD is liaising with the LandsD in reviewing the adequacy of the arrangement for following up unauthorized development on private land within country parks.
	(b) consider updating the database of private land in country parks more frequently; and	(b) Starting from January 2014, AFCD has increased the frequency of updating the database of private lands within country parks from once every two years to once per year. As follow-up action will be done on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
ı	(c) consider making use of the database to help enhance the planning of foot beats for patrolling	(c) AFCD has made reference to the database in reviewing the patrol beats as mentioned in the progress

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
	country parks.	with respect to para. 2.23. As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.41	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) follow up with the Director of Environmental Protection about the expected timeframe and the required restoration work for the return of the 18 ha of land in the Clear Water Bay Country Park to the AFCD; and	(a) According to the EPD, the Southeast New Territories Landfill will be closed in 2015. Of the 18 hectares of country park land inside the landfill, about 9 hectares of land can be returned to the AFCD after completion of about two years of restoration following the closure of the landfill. The remaining some 9 hectares of land are located within the proposed landfill extension which is subject to Legislative Council's approval of the funding application. The landfill extension, if approved, will operate for about six years. Upon completion of the operation, the country park area within the extension site can be returned to AFCD following completion of about two years of restoration.
	(b) closely monitor the impact of the landfill site on the Clear Water Bay Country Park, and take necessary remedial measures to protect the natural environment of the Country Park.	 (b) AFCD will continue to patrol in the Clear Water Bay Country Park (CWBCP). If any irregularity arising from the operation of the landfill is detected inside the CWBCP, AFCD and EPD will jointly take necessary action to rectify the situation. As follow-up action has been taken or will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
4.11	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	 (a) take measures, including redeployment of resources within the AFCD, to further enhance the school education programmes for promoting nature conservation and appreciation. For example, the AFCD may consider: (i) conducting more school visits under the school education programmes so as to reach out to more students; and (ii) extending the school visit programmes also to secondary schools; 	(a)(i) and (ii) The number of school visits for kindergartens and primary schools has increased from 193 to 245 in the new academic year (September 2013 to July 2014). The school visit programme will be extended to secondary schools starting from the 2014/15 academic year as a trial. Based on the feedback of participating schools, AFCD will evaluate the effectiveness and the demand for the programme.
	 (b) conduct an evaluation of the education kit for secondary schools. This should include, for example: (i) ascertaining the number of secondary schools which have adopted the education kit for use in teaching nature conservation; and (ii) assessing teachers' training needs for using the education kit; and 	(b) and (c) To further encourage and facilitate outdoor learning expedition in country parks, AFCD has launched a series of school education programme in country park visitor centres in September 2013. To supplement the programme, AFCD is going to update the worksheets in the education kit according to the education programmes in the country parks visitor centres to help teachers and students explore the natural wonders in country parks and enjoy their learning experience. AFCD will organize
	(c) having regard to the evaluation, take steps to ensure that adequate support is provided to users of the education kit for secondary schools (e.g. organising induction sessions and refresher workshops for teachers on a periodic basis).	teacher workshops in the 2014/15 academic year to promote the programme and evaluate the feedback from teachers. As follow-up action has been taken or will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
4.19	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) review the effectiveness of the AFCD's publicity efforts in promoting the message of keeping country parks clean; and	(a) In order to strengthen the promotion of keeping country parks clean, AFCD will implement Country Park Waste Reduction Campaign in 2014. The Campaign contains an array of ongoing publicity and education programmes with an aim to arousing public awareness and calling for concerted efforts on waste reduction.
	(b) take measures to step up the AFCD's publicity measures (e.g. broadcasting APIs on radio and television) to better promote waste reduction at country parks.	 (b) AFCD will disseminate the keep country parks clean and waste reduction messages through various channels and programmes, including guided eco-tours at Country Park Visitor Centres, school visits, public lectures, leaflet, banners, posters, websites, etc. Where appropriate, Announcement of Public Interests(APIs) will be produced and broadcasted on appropriate channels. As follow-up action has been taken
		or will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
4.35	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation should:	
	(a) review the adequacy of the collaboration arrangements between the AFCD and its Geopark partners in publicising the Hong Kong Geopark and promoting geo-tourism, including:	(a) - (d) Private public partnership is imperative to ensure the Global Geoparks Network enlistment of the Hong Kong Geopark (HKGP). To this end, AFCD recognizes that a more welcoming approach is essential to the partnership

Para. No.		Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		(i) maintaining proper documentation of the formal correspondence with the Geopark partners;	concept. While the department mainly played the role of a facilitator, and did not take part in the business operation of any partners of HKGP in the past, the
		(ii) clarifying the roles of the AFCD in the collaboration, taking into account the Government's exposure to business risks of the Geopark partners; and	roles of Hong Kong Geopark and its partners, together with the eligible criteria for Geopark partners have been further reviewed and promulgated at the geopark website (http://www.geopark.gov.hk/b5_s1k.htm) to minimize the government's exposure
		(iii) considering entering into formal agreements with the Geopark partners, clearly specifying the respective duties and responsibilities in	to business risk of our partner and to improve the transparency and accountability of partnership recruitment.
	(b)	the collaboration;	We also stated clearly at our website that a partnership with HKGP is NOT a
	(b)	in publicising the collaboration between the AFCD and a Geopark partner, avoid using wording which may imply a business relationship between the Government and the	business relationship. Any activities of a partner posted at the geopark website is limited to basic information needed by the visitors.
	(c)	Geopark partner; take measures to improve the transparency and accountability in the recruitment of Geopark partners, including:	There has been no new partnership relationship formed since the recommendation of the Audit Report has been provided. Nevertheless, AFCD will continue to upkeep proper documentation of formal
		(i) publicising the eligibility criteria for recruitment of Geopark partners (see para. 4.30(a)); and	correspondence with the Geopark partners. Existing partnership relationship has been reviewed and formal agreement would be made for
		(ii) conducting the recruitment of the Geopark partners in an open and transparent manner; and	those relationships which are considered suitable and practicable. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this part from
	(d)	review the appropriateness of the existing practice of advertising Geopark partners' commercial activities on the Hong Kong Geopark website, including the	the next progress report.
		need to formulate a clear policy for advertising commercial activities	

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
	in publicising the Geopark and promoting geo-tourism.	
5.10	Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation, in consultation with the Secretary for the Environment, should: (a) having regard to the multifarious factors mentioned in paragraph 5.5,	(a) (i) and (ii) AFCD and the Secretary for the
	revisit the AFCD's strategy for the designation of new country parks. In particular, the AFCD should:	Environment will consult other relevant departments for revisiting the strategy for the designation of those potential sites identified in 1993 as country
	(i) for the nine potential sites identified in the 1993 review which have not yet been designated as country parks, keep under review their suitability for designation as country parks; and (ii) formulate an action plan (with expected timeframe) for implementing the revised strategy, taking account of all relevant factors; and	parks, and formulate an action plan for implementing the revised strategy. Considering the potential threat faced by some of the country park enclaves, the AFCD will give priority to assess the suitability of enclaves for incorporation into country parks and carry out the relevant statutory designation procedures before the designation of other potential sites.
	(b) consider developing performance measures showing the outcomes and effectiveness of the AFCD's work on nature conservation in country parks for publishing in its website.	(b) Since 2002, the AFCD has been carrying out regular territory-wide biodiversity surveys which cover country parks and special areas. Results showed that country parks and special areas are rich in biodiversity. However, ecosystem itself is complicated and affected by many confounding factors, including both man-made (e.g. human disturbance) and dictated by mother nature (e.g. weather, natural fluctuations, conditions of other habitats outside Hong Kong for migratory species). Biodiversity outcomes, e.g. number of individual/species recorded or the breeding success of a particular species, are by nature hard to

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendation	Progress to date
		quantify owing primarily to their transient and elusive nature and/or the not well-known ecological aspects of wildlife in the ecosystem. As a result, increased conservation efforts might not necessarily lead to tangible biodiversity outcomes. Therefore, it is rather difficult and inappropriate to create a quantifiable indicator on the effectiveness of the AFCD's work on nature conservation in country parks. As follow-up actions will be taken on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Progress of implementing Audit's recommendations on fire protection and prevention work of the Fire Services Department

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: M	Ionitoring Fire Service Installations in l	Buildings
2.14	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should: (a) for buildings found without Certificate of Fire Service Installations and Equipment (FS251) in 2012-13 to support the annual inspections of their Fire Service Installations and Equipment (FSIs), closely monitor the follow-up actions of the owners, occupiers or management offices and take appropriate further measures to ensure timely compliance with the statutory annual inspection requirement;	(a) The Fire Services Department (FSD) uses a customized Integrated Licensing, Fire Safety and Prosecution System (LIFIPS), among other functions, to match the annual inspection records of Fire Service Installations (FS251) with corresponding records of Fire Service Installations (FSI) of buildings (FS21). The FSD will make better use of LIFIPS to identify unmatched records or FSIs not having been inspected annually
		for taking follow-up actions, with a view to enhancing monitoring of the proper maintenance of building FSIs and take timely follow-up actions as appropriate. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) complete updating and verifying the LIFIPS data on FSIs installed in buildings as soon as possible, in order that LIFIPS can be used more effectively for monitoring the proper maintenance of all FSIs installed and highlighting FSIs without annual inspection;	The FS21 records have been updated in LIFIPS after completion of some modifications in LIFIPS in March 2014. At the same time, the FSD has made efforts to expedite the input of FS251s received into the LIFIPS, in order to facilitate the effective monitoring of maintenance of FSIs. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	 (c) follow up on FSIs without annual inspection, with priority to be given to key FSIs not having been inspected for a long period; and (d) closely monitor the overall non-compliance rate for annual inspection of FSIs to assess whether additional efforts in certain areas are needed to enhance compliance. 	The FSD will continue to follow up on FSIs found without annual inspection and give priority to handle major defects (i.e. defects affecting the principal functions of the FSIs) of major FSIs (i.e. sprinkler system; fire hydrant and hose reel system; fire alarm system; street fire hydrant system; dry riser; and smoke extraction system). As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report. (b) The FSD will make better use of LIFIPS to monitor the overall non-compliance rate for annual inspection of FSIs and take appropriate actions, including stepping up and prioritizing enforcement actions in accordance with the risk level of the premises, in order to enhance compliance. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.21	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should: (a) remind FSD staff of the need to monitor the rectification of defective FSIs in accordance with	(a) The FSD has reminded all relevant staff to strictly adhere to the guidelines in following up
	the guidelines;	rectifications of defective FSIs. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Au	dit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(b) tight	the responsible fire station conducts a risk assessment of each case involving defects in any major FSI; and	(b)(i) The FSD has reminded all Unit Commanders of local fire stations to adhere to the guidelines in conducting risk assessments of buildings with defects in major FSIs. The relevant notice will be initially circulated to remind all relevant staff on a quarterly basis.
			Regarding the 147 cases identified by the Audit without documentary evidence that risk assessments had been conducted by local fire stations, the FSD has subsequently documented all the risk assessment made. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(ii)	the Task Force closely monitors the rectification of defects in such cases for taking prompt follow-up actions, particularly for cases outstanding for a prolonged period; and	(b)(ii) The FSD has been closely monitoring the rectification of defects. To deal with the additional caseloads relating to FSI issues subsequent to the use of LIFIPS, reshuffling of duties among staff has been made to assist the supervisors to expedite follow-up actions. An experienced officer has been assigned to assist the supervisor of each region to dispatch new cases to other officers. Under such arrangement, the regional supervisors have more time/resources to take timely action for the backlog cases. Additional features will be added to LIFIPS to flag up overdue cases for case officers to take follow-up actions. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(c) take follow-up action on the 20 outstanding cases in para. 2.19, which involved defects found in major FSIs.	(c) The FSD has taken follow-up actions on the 20 long outstanding cases (involving defects in major FSIs) identified by Audit, and all cases were completed. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
2.30	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	 (a) conduct a follow-up review to formulate further measures to reduce the overall number of unwanted alarms; and (b) conduct regular analyses to identify buildings with many unwanted alarm cases and give priority to following up such cases, with a view to reducing the number of their unwanted alarms. 	(a) and (b) The FSD has been taking proactive actions to investigate premises/buildings with frequent unwanted alarms since May 2013. Internal guidelines were issued in September 2013 requiring local fire stations to refer repeated/frequent unwanted alarm cases to a dedicated unit of the FSD (Fire Service Installation Task Force) for investigation. The FSD generates monthly reports to identify premises/buildings with frequent unwanted alarms since February 2014. The FSD will then liaise with the concerned premises/buildings on the proper installation and maintenance of the fire detection system. Trend analyses will be carried out to map out further improvement measures in the long run with a view to reducing the numbers of unwanted alarms. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
2.37	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) step up efforts to promote the use of the electronic form of FS251; and	(a) The FSD has formed a dedicated study team to explore means to promote the use of the electronic form of FS251.
		The team has conducted briefings for relevant Government departments (e.g. the EMSD) to introduce and promote the electronic form of FS251 such that they might help encourage such use by the Registered FSI contractors (RFSICs) they have engaged. The FSD also conducted two seminars for RFSICs in December 2013 and February 2014 to promote the use of the electronic form of FS251. The FSD will continue promoting the use of the electronic form of FS251.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) find out the reasons why many major FSI contractors did not use the electronic form of FS251 and take appropriate measures to encourage them to adopt it.	 (b) The use of the electronic form of FS251 is not mandatory at present. Some FSI contractors are reluctant to use it mainly because it cannot seamlessly match their business operational mode. To find out more specific reasons of using or not using the electronic form of FS251, the FSD has conducted interviews with three focal groups amongst the pool of RFSICs: (i) Top users of electronic form
		of FS251; (ii) Non-users of electronic form of FS251; and

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		(iii) Non-frequent users of electronic form of FS251.
		The FSD is analysing the results to map out appropriate measures to promote the adoption and usage of the electronic form of FS251.
Part 3: N	Monitoring Licensed Premises	
3.12	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) remind FSD staff to conduct verification inspections of food business premises granted with provisional licences promptly in accordance with the FSD's guidelines; and	(a) The FSD has issued internal guidelines in August 2013 that inspection officers should liaise with the provisional food business licensees or their representatives to schedule a verification inspection within seven working days after the receipt of notifications of the grant of provisional licences. If the inspection could not be carried out within seven working days, the reasons should be documented.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) ensure that FSD staff handle cases of non-compliance with fire safety requirements by provisional food business licensees consistently.	(b) The FSD has aligned the handling processes amongst various offices such that non-compliance cases of provisional food business licensees would be handled consistently and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) would be notified for all non-compliance cases.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
3.18	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) review the monitoring mechanism for the FSIs in licensed premises;	(a) The FSD and the FEHD have reviewed the actions to follow up cases of breaching fire safety requirements of food business premises. The FHB/FEHD/FSD consulted the Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene Panel in December 2013 on the proposed measures (e.g. imposing fire safety requirement for renewal of licence such that licence would only be renewed when there are valid FS251s of the premises) and implementation plan. Comments of the Panel were being followed up and the relevant measures are expected to be implemented in second quarter of 2014.
		The FSD has built a database in LIFIPS for FSIs of licensed premises starting from general restaurants, light refreshment restaurants and factory canteens in April 2014 to facilitate monitoring of the FSIs in licensed premises.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) based on the review results in (a) above, determine how to make effective use of LIFIPS to monitor the maintenance of FSIs in licensed premises; and	When the measures on fire safety requirements for licensing/licence renewal of food business are implemented, the FSD would be able to make better use of LIFIPS to identify those food premises which failed to submit FS251 as all received FS251s of food premises will be inputted into the LIFIPS. The FSD is then able to monitor all non-compliance cases and will take

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(c) take enforcement action as appropriate in cases of non-compliance with the statutory annual FSI inspection requirement (including those mentioned in para. 3.16).	appropriate enforcement actions to rectify. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report. (c) The FSD has completed actions for all the 20 cases found non-compliant with the statutory requirement to conduct annual inspections of FSIs cases or submit FS251s. The FSD will continue to take appropriate actions against non-compliant cases in future. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.24	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) follow the risk-based approach in allocating inspection resources and give priority to licensed premises with a high fire risk;	(a) The FSD will continue to adopt a risk-based approach in monitoring the fire safety of licensed premises. The FSD will regularly review the approach and inspection targets, and follow the approach in allocating inspection resources.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) establish procedures to ensure that licensed premises selected for inspection are really in operation; and	(b) The FSD has issued internal guidelines in September 2013 to require inspection officers to check the case file in detail and/or check with relevant licensing authorities to ensure that the premises selected for inspection are in operation before carrying out physical

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		inspection. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(c) ascertain the reasons for inspecting the same school twice within a short period, as mentioned in paragraph 3.23(b), and take appropriate improvement measures.	(c) Investigations on the case for inspecting the same school twice within a short period were completed. It was found that the concerned officer was not familiar with the functions and available information in LIFIPS and the case was an isolated one.
		To avoid recurrence of similar incidents, the FSD has issued internal guidelines in September 2013 to require case officer to check records in the file and LIFIPS to ensure that the selected premises have not been inspected within the preceding 12 months before conducting a surprise inspection.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.32	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) regularly review the effectiveness of the measures taken to combat illicit fuel filling activities; and	(a) Since 2012, the FSD has been conducting regular reviews of the effectiveness of the measures taken to combat illicit fuel-filling activities and will continue to do so annually with a view to improving the effectiveness.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis,

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) take additional measures to combat illicit fuel filling activities where necessary.	(b) Since 2012, the FSD has been taking the following additional measures to combat illicit fuel filling activities:
		(i) conducting decoy operations;
		(ii) conducting joint road block operations with Police/tunnel operators;
		(iii) discussing with the oil trades and insurance industry on possible measures to combat illicit fuel filling activities; and
		(iv) exploring the feasibility to provide additional dangerous goods stores for forfeiture of dangerous goods.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 4: N	Monitoring Ventilating Systems	
4.9	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) review the issues relating to monitoring the maintenance of ventilating systems identified by Audit in paragraphs 4.5 to 4.8; and	(a) and (b) To enhance the monitoring of ventilating systems in buildings and premises, the FSD has been taking the following measures:
	(b) take appropriate measures to improve the monitoring of the maintenance of ventilating systems.	(i) conducting a matching exercise for premises with ventilating systems to confirm the receipt of Annual Inspection Certificates (AICs). Meanwhile, warning letters have also been issued to owners of ventilating systems for which no AICs were

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		received;
		(ii) liaising with relevant licensing authorities for updating of database of ventilating systems of premises/buildings;
		(iii) working out enhancement plan for LIFIPS for sorting out premises/buildings without AICs automatically to facilitate follow-up actions; and
		(iv) working out publicity plan to raise the awareness of building owners to conduct annual inspection to ventilating systems.
		Regarding the 60 cases identified by Audit with no AICs received, the FSD has taken follow-up actions and received all the AICs.
		The updating and verification of the ventilating systems database are expected to be completed by April 2015. After that, the FSD should be able to make better use of LIFIPS to identify premises/buildings without AICs to facilitate the department's monitoring.
		As ventilating systems installed in the licensed premises are of relatively higher fire safety concerns than those in buildings, the FSD will accord priority to monitor those in licensed premises.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
4.15	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) explore the need for requiring the Ventilation Division to conduct	(a) and (b) The FSD has completed a review on the

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	prompt risk assessments and inspections when receiving inspection certificates reporting serious defects in ventilating systems; and (b) improve the guidelines for inspecting ventilating systems.	risk level of defective ventilating systems and has been reviewing the inspection procedures to conduct more speedy inspections for AIC reporting defective fire dampers of ventilating systems. The relevant guidelines are expected to be drawn up for implementation by June 2014.
Part 5: R	egistration and Monitoring of Fire Servi	ce Installation Contractors
5.8	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should, having regard to new developments (such as the current progress in implementing third party fire safety certification) and in consultation with the Secretary for Security, determine as soon as possible how best to implement the working group's recommendations on improving the FSI contractor registration scheme.	The FSD has been revising the draft drafting instructions for the proposed legislative amendments to both the Fire Service (Installation Contractors) Regulations (Cap. 95A) and Fire Service (Installations and Equipment) Regulations (Cap. 95B) regarding the implementation of the working group's recommendations on improving the FSI contractor registration scheme and would discuss with the Security Bureau (SB) on the appropriate follow-up action to be taken.
5.17	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) establish procedures to monitor the timeliness of submission of FS251s by FSI contractors;	 (a) The FSD will monitor the timeliness of submission of FS251s by making better use of LIFIPS, and refer cases to the Fire Service Installation Contractor Disciplinary Board for follow-up action where appropriate. The FSD will also continue to use the demerit point system to monitor the performance of RFSICs and adjust the inspection frequency according to the cumulative demerit points. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(b) take appropriate actions to ensure that FSI contractors always submit FS251s within 14 days after work completion in compliance with the Fire Service (Installations and Equipment) Regulations; and	(b) The FSD conducted two seminars in December 2013 and February 2014 to remind RFSICs to submit FS251s within 14 days after the completion of work in accordance with the statutory requirement.
		The FSD will consider amending the relevant legislation to allow direct electronic submission of FS251s by RFSICs, which is not permitted under the current legislation. The FSD has been revising the draft drafting instructions for the proposed legislative amendment and would discuss with the SB on the appropriate follow-up action to be taken. The electronic submission will facilitate submission of FS251s by RFSICs and FSD's monitoring of submission situation.
	(c) remind FSD staff to comply with the guidelines on conducting disciplinary board hearings in a timely manner.	 (c) Internal guidelines were revised and issued to all concerned officers in November 2013 to ensure the timely conduct of disciplinary board hearings. In addition, the FSD introduced a bring-up system with a computer database in January 2014. Two tiers of monitoring officers will cross check the cases on a quarterly basis to ensure disciplinary board hearings would be conducted in a timely manner. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 6: H	Handling Complaints about Fire Safety	
6.6	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) remind FSD staff of the need to investigate complaints promptly; and	 (a) The FSD issued an internal notice in October 2013 to remind all relevant staff to strictly follow the guidelines in handling routine and complaint inspections and observe various pledges/targets. The guidelines also mention that all case-related information such as date of informing complainant of the inspection result and reasons for not meeting the pledges/targets, etc. should be properly documented. The notice will be initially circulated to remind all relevant staff on a quarterly basis. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) tighten controls to ensure that FSD staff comply with the complaint investigation requirements laid down in the FSD's guidelines.	 (b) The FSD has put in place an active reporting mechanism since November 2013 under which relevant units are required to report information on handling complaints on a monthly basis. The FSD has also implemented an internal audit mechanism under which monthly random sampling checks are being conducted to ensure the accuracy of performance information on handling complaints. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
6.11	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	 (a) remind supervisors of the need to give clear instructions to case officers for handling complaint cases and ensure that they follow such instructions; (b) remind case officers of the need to handle complaint cases in accordance with instructions given by their supervisors; 	(a) and (b) The FSD issued an internal notice in October 2013 to remind all relevant staff to strictly follow the guidelines in handling routine and complaint inspections and observe various pledges/targets. The guidelines also mention that all case-related information such as date of informing complainant of the inspection result and reasons for not meeting the pledges/targets, etc. should be properly documented. The notice will be initially circulated to remind all relevant staff on a quarterly basis. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(c) provide supervisors with regular reports on the details of outstanding complaint cases to facilitate their monitoring and control work; and	(c) The FSD has set up a working group to study the feasibility of, among others, generating monitoring reports by LIFIPS automatically to facilitate monitoring and control work of supervisors.
	(d) deal with the outstanding complaint cases as soon as possible, particularly those outstanding for a long period.	 (d) Among the 1 525 outstanding complaint cases identified by Audit, actions for 1 119 have been completed. The FSD will continue to follow up the remaining outstanding complaint cases and take appropriate follow-up actions. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
6.15	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should establish control procedures to ensure that performance information on complaint handling set out in the COR is substantiated and accurate.	The FSD issued an internal notice in October 2013 to remind all relevant staff to strictly follow the guidelines in handling routine and complaint inspections and observe various pledges/targets. The guidelines also mention that all case-related information such as date of informing complainant of the inspection result and reasons for not meeting the pledges/targets, etc. should be properly documented. The notice will be initially circulated to remind all relevant staff on a quarterly basis.
		The FSD has put in place an active reporting mechanism since November 2013 under which relevant units are required to report information on handling complaints on a monthly basis. The FSD has also implemented an internal audit mechanism under which monthly random sampling checks are being conducted to ensure the accuracy of performance information on handling complaints.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 7: P	ublicity and Education on Fire Safety	
7.6	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should consider the need to review the effectiveness of the annual Fire Prevention Campaign by commissioning a market research company to conduct a survey.	The FSD is actively conducting market search for potential providers in undertaking the survey in future major Fire Prevention Campaigns.
7.15	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) take appropriate measures to encourage Building Fire Safety Envoys to participate actively in	(a) and (b) The Building Fire Safety Envoy Scheme is a voluntary services

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
No.	the fire safety matters of their buildings,particularly in respect of the annual inspections of FSIs; and (b) following the risk-based approach, give priority to recruiting Envoys for old buildings without Owners' Corporations (OCs), residents' organisations or property management companies.	programme. The FSD has enhanced the merit points of the Building Fire Safety Envoy Award Scheme to provide more incentives so as to encourage more active participations in fire safety matters of their buildings. The FSD has been making efforts to recruit Envoys for old composite and domestic buildings without OCs, residents' organisations or property management companies, with a view to enhancing their fire safety. A matching exercise to identify Fire Safety Ambassadors residing in those buildings has been completed and the FSD will approach and invite them to join the Envoy Scheme. The FSD also organised publicity activities in Mongkok and Yau Ma Tei in November 2013 and January 2014 respectively to introduce the Envoy Scheme and recruit Envoys as well as to disseminate fire safety messages to old buildings. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
7.20	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should:	
	(a) enhance public awareness of the statutory requirement to conduct annual inspections of FSIs by publicising the requirement in future Announcement in the Public Interests (APIs) on fire prevention as appropriate; and	(a) The FSD plans to produce a new API later in 2014 to strengthen publicity on the statutory requirement to conduct an annual inspection of FSI to enhance the public awareness of such requirement.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	Audit's Recommendations (b) request more broadcasting spots for an API to enhance publicity when conducting any large scale operation on related matters.	Progress to date (b) The Information Services Department has acknowledged FSD's request for more broadcasting spots for the relevant APIs. Other than broadcasting APIs, the FSD has also taken measures to enhance public awareness of such requirement through different means such as uploading posters onto the departmental website and disseminating them to property management companies, etc.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Government's efforts to enhance fire safety of old buildings Updated Progress of Implementing Audit's Recommendations

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
Part 2: In	nplementation of fire safety improveme	ent programmes
2.23	Audit has recommended that the Director of Buildings and the Director of Fire Services should –	
	(a) consider providing more performance information in the BD's and FSD's CORs (such as the cumulative compliance information) to enable stakeholders to have a better picture of the progress made in upgrading the fire safety provisions of Prescribed Commercial Premises (PCPs)/Specified Commercial Buildings (SCBs)/Target Composite Buildings (TCBs);	(a) The FSD and the BD will compile relevant cumulative compliance information and upload the information to the respective websites of the FSD and BD on a half yearly basis (i.e. in January and July each year). The first batch of relevant cumulative compliance information will be uploaded in July 2014. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis,
	(b) step up efforts to improve the	we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report. (b) The BD will continue to render
	compliance rates of fire safety directions, especially those for TCBs, and those issued by the BD for PCPs and SCBs;	assistance to the owners for complying with the fire safety directions (FSDn). The measures include –
		 offering technical advice, attending meetings with the owners and their appointed consultants;
		 administering the Building Safety Loan Scheme (BSLS) to provide financial assistance;
		 working with the HAD in assisting the formation of OCs; and
		 participating in District Fire Safety Committee

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		Meetings/Seminars at district level to instill the concept of upgrading fire safety.
		The BD will step up prosecution actions against those owners who fail to comply with the directions without reasonable excuse in long outstanding cases.
		The BD is in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the FSDn issued and taking appropriate actions to pursue the compliance.
		The FSD has issued guidelines requiring the case officers to carry out more periodic progress checks on the compliance of the FSDn and issue timely reminding/warning letters.
		The FSD will continue to conduct thematic seminars on a district/area basis for the OCs/owners/occupiers of TCBs to promote their understanding of the Fire Safety (Buildings) Ordinance (FS(B)O).
		In addition, the FSD has been conducting a feasibility study on further relaxing the capacity of water tank required for the fire hydrant/hose reel system without compromising the fire safety, with a view to further addressing the spatial/structural constraints of the buildings and facilitating buildings in complying with the fire safety requirement.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
No.	(c) share the inspection plans with the HAD as early as practicable, so as to allow the HAD more time to plan its liaison work to provide timely assistance to owners of target composite/domestic buildings which do not have OCs;	(c) Since February 2014, on a regular basis, both the BD and FSD have been forwarding the list of TCBs without OCs to the HAD to facilitate the latter department to provide timely assistance to buildings in forming OCs before the joint inspections to the TCBs/issuance of FSDn. The BD and FSD will continue to coordinate with each other to make similar referrals of target buildings without OCs to the HAD as soon as the monthly inspection schedule of TCBs is ready. For those backlog cases to which FSDn had not been issued yet, those TCBs without an OC would be sorted out and referred to the HAD for providing assistance to the buildings in forming OCs.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(d) conduct another survey to find out whether the Government's financial assistance and technical support are meeting the owners' needs so that improvement measures can be taken accordingly; and	(d) The BD has discussed with the FSD, Hong Kong Housing Society (HKHS) and Urban Renewal Authority (URA). It was agreed that a survey would be carried out for those owners/OCs who have applied for the financial assistance and technical support from HKHS and URA. The relevant parties are discussing the survey arrangement and details of the survey form. It is expected that the survey would be conducted in the second quarter of 2014.
	(e) send promotional leaflets of the available financial assistance schemes to owners together with	(e) The FSD has been sending the promotional leaflets on Integrated Building Maintenance Assistance

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	the directions.	Scheme and 'Introduction to the BSLS' to the affected owners together with the FSDn since November 2013.
		As this recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 3: A	rrangements for inspections and issuin	g fire safety directions
3.11	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should – (a) provide adequate guidance to FSD staff for identifying PCPs; and (b) in conjunction with the Director of Buildings, review the PCPS inspection list to see if there are inconsistency and omission in identifying PCPs similar to that mentioned in paragraph 3.6 of the Audit Report and take necessary action accordingly.	(a) and (b) Guidelines to assist in the identification of the PCPs have been jointly reviewed and revised by the FSD and BD. The FSD has adopted the enhanced guidelines in territory-wide scouting exercise since February 2014. The scouting exercise will be completed in June 2014.
3.12	Audit has recommended that the Director of Buildings should — (a) in conjunction with the Director of Fire Services, expedite actions on the pilot study of pre-war buildings with a view to improving the fire safety measures of pre-war buildings as soon as practicable; (b) expedite actions on Buildings A and B (see Case 1 in para. 3.10) that the BD had determined to be subject to the FS(CP)O; and	 (a) The pilot study of pre-war buildings with FSDn issued will be completed in 2014. The BD will also inspect the remaining target pre-war buildings in 2014 as soon as practicable. (b) The BD has completed the review with further information and has determined that both Buildings A and B are not subject to the
		FS(CP)O. As follow-up actions have been taken, we recommend deleting this

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		part from the next progress report.
	(c) ascertain whether Buildings C and D, and other similar utilities buildings should also be subject to the FS(CP)O without further delay.	(c) For Building C, the BD has completed the review with further information and has determined that the building is not subject to the FS(CP)O.
		The BD has determined that Building D is a SCB and will issue the necessary directions before the end of May 2014.
		Consideration for applicability of the FS(CP)O would be given on a case-by-case basis, according to the use and construction of the building and the provisions of the FS(CP)O.
		As follow-up action has been taken, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.28	Audit has recommended that the Director of Buildings and the Director of Fire Services should –	
	(a) take effective measures to improve the timeliness in issuing directions and to clear the backlog of directions overdue for issuing as soon as possible;	(a) - (d) The BD is conducting a review on the work procedures with a view to enhancing efficiency in issuing the directions.
	(b) review the current target of inspecting 1 150 TCBs a year, to see if it is commensurate with the capacity in issuing directions	The BD and FSD are considering various options for clearing the backlog of issuing the directions.
	within four months after inspections;	A working group headed by directorate officers of the BD and FSD has been set up to study and follow up on Audit's
	(c) based on the review result in (b) above, consider including the four-month time target for issuing directions in the CORs of the BD and FSD respectively; and	observations and recommendations. The working group has held several meetings to review the annual inspection target and the internal timeframe for issuing FSDn after joint inspection of target buildings/premises.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(d) strengthen controls over the timely preparation of inspection reports after joint inspections.	The two departments will continue to discuss with a view to working out improvement proposals and/or specific measures.
		The BD is also in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the preparation of inspection reports and issuance of directions.
		The FSD is drawing up an enhancement plan for the LIFIPS to strengthen monitoring and control over the preparation of inspection reports after joint inspections as well as the issuance of FSDn.
3.29	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should –	
	(a) enhance FSD's computer system for case management and monitoring the timeliness of its enforcement actions.	(a) A working group has been formed in the FSD to draw up an enhancement plan for the LIFIPS to strengthen case management and the monitoring of the timeliness of enforcement actions.
		The crucial data of all building cases handled have been inputted into LIFIPS in February 2014. Reports can be generated manually for case management and monitoring the progress of enforcement actions.
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	Audit has also recommended that the Director of Buildings should take measures to –	
	(a) improve the timeliness in	(a) The BD is in the process of

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	determining PCPs boundaries after joint inspections; and	enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the issuance of directions. The boundaries of PCPs should have been determined before the issuance of directions and therefore they are jointly monitored.
	(b) ensure that the laid-down guidelines on taking synchronized action on target buildings also under large scale operations are complied with as far as possible.	 (b) Regular coordination meetings and quarterly reports are in place for monitoring synchronization with other large scale operations. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Part 4: A	dministration of fire safety directions is	ssued
4.12	Audit has recommended that the Director of Buildings should –	
	(a) consider stipulating the frequency of progress check on works required under the FS(CP)O and FS(B)O;	(a) The BD, in collaboration with the FSD, is reviewing the enforcement actions on fire safety improvement including the frequency of progress check.
	(b) tighten controls to ensure that BD staff strictly follow the laid-down procedures on –	
	(i) granting extension of time for complying with FSDn based on relevant and substantiated grounds;	(b)(i) BD staff have been reminded to strictly adhere to the guidelines laid down in the office instructions on the granting of extension of time.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(ii) conducting compliance inspections of completed works in a timely manner (including those cases taken over from consultants as mentioned in para. 4.9(a));	(b)(ii) The BD is in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the outstanding directions so that follow-up actions can be taken in a timely manner.
	(c) step up enforcement actions against non-compliant owners/occupiers by requiring BD staff to –	
	(i) promptly issue warning letters upon detection of non-compliance with the directions, and closely monitor the response from owners/occupiers for considering the need for further enforcement actions;	(c)(i) The BD is in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the outstanding directions so that follow-up actions can be taken in a timely manner;
	(ii) instigate prosecution actions on long outstanding cases without reasonable excuses (such as Case 5 in para. 4.8 and Case 7 in para. 4.11); and	(c)(ii) The BD will step up prosecution actions on long outstanding cases without reasonable excuses.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(d) closely monitor the convicted owners' compliance with outstanding directions and court orders, and take necessary actions accordingly.	(d) The BD is in the process of enhancing the computerized system for monitoring the outstanding directions and court orders so that follow-up and enforcement actions can be taken in a timely manner.
4.13	Audit has recommended that the Director of Fire Services should –	
	(a) tighten controls to ensure that the stipulated frequency of progress check is strictly complied with;	(a) A working group has been formed in the FSD to draw up an enhancement plan for the LIFIPS to strengthen case management and monitoring over the timeliness of

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
	(b) remind FSD staff to review the need for issuing new directions for any change in the occupier of PCP (such as Case 6 in para. 4.8 of the Audit Report); and	conducting progress checks. The crucial data of all building cases handled have been inputted into LIFIPS in February 2014. Reports can be generated manually for case management and monitoring the progress of enforcement actions. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report. (b) FSD case officers have been reminded to strictly observe the relevant departmental procedural instructions and review the need to issue new FSDn for change in the occupier of PCP. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	 (c) step up enforcement actions against non-compliant owners/occupiers by requiring FSD staff to – (i) promptly issue warning letters upon detection of non-compliance with the directions, and closely monitor the response from owners/occupiers for considering the need for further enforcement actions; and (ii) instigate prosecution actions on long outstanding cases without reasonable excuses. 	(c) The FSD has issued internal instructions in February 2014 to remind case officers to step up enforcement actions by issuing warning letters timely and initiating prosecution action against long outstanding cases without reasonable excuses. As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date	
Part 5: F	Part 5: Follow-up actions on Unauthorized Building Works found during inspections		
5.8	Audit has recommended that the Director of Buildings should –		
	(a) take measures to ensure that Unauthorized Building Works (UBWs)/sub-divided flats (SDFs) found during inspections under the FS(CP)O and FS(B)O are promptly followed up, particularly those with fire hazards. Such measures may include –		
	(i) stipulating a time frame within which the Fire Safety Section (FSS) staff should issue statutory orders for fire-safety-related UBWs/SDFs found or refer such findings to the Existing Buildings Division (EBD) for action;	 (i) When issuing statutory orders for fire- safety-related UBWs, the FSS staff would follow the timeframe of the EBD as stipulated in its Manual. Meanwhile, the procedure for the FSS to make referral of UBWs to the EBD is being formulated. 	
	(ii) stipulating a time frame within which the EBD should determine whether to include buildings found with SDFs in its large scale operations for tackling SDFs;	(ii) The BD is reviewing its procedures of recording the buildings found with SDFs in the computerized database kept by the BD so that the selection exercise of target buildings of large scale operations on SDFs can take that into account and cover such buildings as appropriate.	
	(iii) reminding the EBD staff to carry out inspection on actionable cases within 50 days as laid down in the BD's guidelines; and	(iii) The BD has revised its EBD manual to clearly stipulate that cases referred from other government departments or other divisions of the BD should be handled in the same manner as cases reported by the public, i.e. they should be properly screened to determine whether an	

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to date
		inspection is required. If inspection is required, it should be carried out within 50 days.
		As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	(b) make effective use of all available enforcement tools to expedite the compliance with statutory orders for early rectification of fire-safety-related UBWs/SDFs.	 (b) The BD will make effective use of all available enforcement tools to expedite the compliance with statutory orders, including prosecuting the owners for non-compliance with the orders and arranging the government contractor to carry out the works in default of the owners and recover the cost thereof, plus supervision charge and surcharge, from the owners. Dedicated teams will be set up in the EBD to expedite the clearance of backlog statutory orders. As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
