

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. CB(4)580/13-14  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/12

**Panel on Education**

**Subcommittee on Integrated Education**

**Minutes of the eleventh meeting  
held on Tuesday, 14 January 2014, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

**Member absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending** : Item II & III  
  
Mr Kevin YEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Education  
  
Mrs Betty IP  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Ms Sophia WONG  
Principal Education Officer (Special Education &  
Kindergarten Education)

Mr Anchor TSE Lap-wa,  
Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises  
Maintenance)  
Education Bureau

**Attendance by** : Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union  
**Invitation**

Mr CHAN Kwok-kuen  
Executive Committee Member

Association for the Rights of Students with Hearing  
Impairment

Ms MOK Mei-ling  
Chairperson

Professor SIN Kuen-fung of The Hong Kong  
Institute of Education

Hong Kong Blind Union

Mr WONG Chun-hang  
Vice-President

**Clerk in** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
**attendance** Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

**Staff in** : Mr Ian CHOW  
**attendance** Council Secretary (4) 4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4) 3

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)281/13-14 -- Minutes of meeting on 20 November 2013)

The minutes of the meeting held on 20 November 2013 were confirmed.

**II. Capacity of and professional development and training for teachers to support students with special educational needs**

**III. Measures/plans to improve facilities of schools to better meet the needs of their students with special educational needs**

Letter from the Chairman

(LC Paper No. CB(4)291/13-14(01) - Letter dated 23 December 2013 from the Chairman requesting additional information on the provision of barrier-free access and facilities in ordinary schools (*Chinese version only*))

Papers provided by the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(4)291/13-14(02) - Administration's written response to the letter dated 23 December 2013 from the Chairman

LC Paper No. CB(4)952/12-13(01) - Administration's written response to the consolidated summary of views/concerns raised at the meetings on 30 April and 27 May 2013

LC Paper No. CB(4)1006/12-13(01) - Administration's response to issues raised by the

Subcommittee at the  
meeting on 8 July 2013

LC Paper No. CB(4)1007/12-13(01) - Administration's written  
response to the  
consolidated summary of  
views/concerns raised at  
the meetings on 18 June  
and 8 July 2013

LC Paper No. CB(4)146/13-14(01) - Administration's written  
response to the summary  
of views/concerns raised  
at the meeting on  
3 October 2013)

Papers prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

(LC Paper No. CB(4)291/13-14(03) - Composite table listing the  
views/concerns of  
deputations and members,  
as well as the responses  
provided by the  
Administration in respect  
of previous meetings  
(April to October 2013)

LC Paper No. CB(4)824/12-13(01) - A consolidated summary  
of views/concerns raised at  
the meetings on 30 April  
and 27 May 2013

LC Paper No. CB(4)945/12-13(01) - A consolidated summary  
of views/concerns raised at  
the meetings on 18 June  
and 8 July 2013

LC Paper No. CB(4)111/13-14(01) - A summary of  
views/concerns raised at  
the meeting on 3 October  
2013)

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)312/13-14(02) - Submission from The Special Education Society of Hong Kong Ltd. (*Chinese version only*))

LC Paper No. CB(4)312/13-14(03) - Submission from SEN Rights (*Chinese version only*))

Meeting with deputations / individuals and the Administration for agenda items II and III

2. The Deputy Chairman informed members that due to other engagements, the Chairman would only be able to join the latter part of the meeting. The Deputy Chairman took over the chair in the temporary absence of the Chairman.

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

EDB 4. The Education Bureau ("EDB") was asked to take the follow-up actions below –

- (a) EDB would provide written information on the existing professional support/services available to support ordinary schools in implementing integrated education, including pilot projects for enhancing the support for students with special educational needs;
- (b) regarding the next tender for the supply of hearing aids, EDB would, as far as practicable, advise the Subcommittee in writing the directions that would be adopted in meeting the needs of students with hearing impairment ("HI");
- (c) EDB would inform the Subcommittee of how Hong Kong had given effect to the relevant provisions under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities regarding the learning, teaching and use of sign language in the education for students with HI; and

- (d) to increase transparency and facilitate parental choice, EDB was asked to consider requiring all primary and secondary schools to disclose in their school profiles information on the provision and, where applicable, non-provision of barrier-free access and facilities in their school premises.

**IV. Any other business**

- 5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:35 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
17 April 2014

**Proceedings of the meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Integrated Education  
on Tuesday, 14 January 2014, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000148 - 000313	Deputy Chairman	Minutes of meeting on 20 November 2013 were confirmed	
<i>Agenda Item II – Capacity of and professional development and training for teachers to support students with special educational needs</i>			
000314 - 000549	Deputy Chairman	Opening remarks	
000550 - 001128	Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union ("HKPTU") Deputy Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)312/13-14(01)]	
001129 - 001521	Association for the Rights of Students with Hearing Impairment ("ARSHI") Deputy Chairman	Presentation of views	
001522 - 002222	Professor SIN Kuen-fung ("Professor SIN") of the Hong Kong Institute of Education ("HKIED") Deputy Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)300/13-14(01)]	
002223 - 002621	Deputy Chairman Education Bureau ("EDB")	EDB briefed members on the professional development and training provided for teachers to support students with special educational needs ("SEN"). The provision of the Basic, Advanced and Thematic ("BAT") Courses would enable teachers to acquire structured training in a systematic manner, which would facilitate the implementation of integrated education ("IE") through the whole school approach ("WSA"). Besides, major teacher education institutions had included "supporting SEN students" or related contents in their pre-service training programmes.	
002622 - 003047	Hong Kong Blind Union ("HKBU") Deputy Chairman	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
003048 - 005152	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung EDB Deputy Chairman	<p>As very often, there were students with different types of SEN within the same class, Mr LEUNG questioned whether the existing training courses could adequately equip teachers in handling their students.</p> <p>At the school level, Mr LEUNG suggested that for each of the four core subjects of Chinese Language, English Language, Mathematics and Liberal Studies, at least one teacher should have received training on special education. These trained teachers would help develop appropriate teaching strategies and provide guidance to other teachers in supporting SEN students. Mr LEUNG also enquired whether supply teachers would be provided when schools released their teachers to attend training.</p> <p>EDB advised that the training targets to be achieved by each public sector ordinary school by the end of the 2014-2015 school year were as follows –;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) at least 10% to 15% of teachers to have completed the 30-hour Basic Course;</li> <li>(b) at least three to six teachers to have completed the Advanced Course; and</li> <li>(c) at least three to six teachers to have completed the 90 to 120-hour Thematic Course (with at least one teacher to have completed the course(s) under each category of SEN as far as possible).</li> </ul> <p>Since 2009-2010, EDB had been providing public sector ordinary schools with written updates on their teacher training positions to facilitate their planning for professional development of teachers. Whilst most of the schools were able to meet the above training targets, some schools had not met the targets due to reasons such as the resignation of those teachers who had received the training. EDB would keep in view the training progress of teachers and review the training targets in due course. Meanwhile, supply teachers would be provided for regular teachers of public sector schools released to attend the BAT Courses.</p> <p>EDB reiterated that the existing arrangements aimed at equipping teachers with the necessary training for supporting SEN students and building up a critical mass of trained teachers in each school to guide and collaborate with their colleagues to adopt WSA to IE.</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>It was not possible for all teachers to have acquired relevant training before taking forward IE.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG considered the existing professional support such as educational psychologists ("EPs") highly inadequate, and enquired about the provision of professional support to schools.</p> <p>In response, EDB advised that—</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the number of EPs would be progressively increased with the target to provide School-based Educational Psychology service to all public sector primary and secondary schools by the 2016-2017 school year;</li> <li>(b) public sector primary schools were provided with subsidies to procure speech therapy services or employ speech therapists to cater for students with speech and language impairment;</li> <li>(c) EDB had established a school support network, through which ordinary schools with rich experience in IE were encouraged to serve as resource schools on WSA and share with other ordinary schools their knowledge and practices in supporting SEN students. In addition, some special schools had been invited to serve as special schools cum resource centres ("SSRCs") for the same purpose;</li> <li>(d) schools for children with hearing impairment ("HI") and visual impairment ("VI") were provided with additional resources to recruit additional resource teachers ("RTs") to provide additional support for students with HI or VI studying in ordinary schools. RTs also paid visits to these schools to share teaching strategies with ordinary school teachers in catering for the needs of those students with HI or VI and supporting their parents; and</li> <li>(e) professional staff of EDB would visit ordinary primary and secondary schools regularly to provide advice and assistance as appropriate.</li> </ul>	
005153 - 010119	Ms Cyd HO Professor SIN EDB Deputy Chairman	Ms HO considered the support available to SEN students attending post-secondary institutions highly inadequate. She also enquired whether consideration would be given to extending the services of SSRCs and RTs to post-secondary institutions.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB said among local post-secondary institutions, the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") currently enrolled the largest number of SEN students. Starting from the 2013-2014 financial year, a recurrent subsidy of \$12 million was allocated to VTC each year for providing support to SEN students. Other post-secondary institutions also provided support services to SEN students with their resources available. For the time being, there was no plan to extend the service of SSRCs or RTs to post-secondary institutions.</p> <p>Referring to the support measures adopted by HKIED, Professor SIN said that HKIED had allocated resources to provide sign interpretation to cater for the needs of two students with HI admitted recently.</p> <p>Ms HO considered that more opportunities should be provided for SEN students to receive higher education. If these students became teachers after graduation, they would be in the best position to understand and cater for the needs of SEN students.</p>	
010120 - 011637	<p>Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che EDB HKPTU Professor SIN Deputy Chairman Chairman</p>	<p>Mr CHEUNG sought the comments of EDB and deputations on –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the proportion of teachers with training in BAT Courses to effectively cater for the needs of SEN students in an ordinary school;</li> <li>(b) the estimated resources needed to achieve the target proportion in (a); and</li> <li>(c) whether EDB would consider providing additional support to those newly established ordinary schools which were willing to admit SEN students.</li> </ul> <p>EDB explained that apart from the BAT courses and the professional support for schools as mentioned above, it had facilitated the formation of a support network in the North District comprising ordinary schools that had admitted SEN students. The participating schools, supported by an outsourced EP and EDB professional staff, conducted regular experience-sharing sessions in handling SEN students. With the resources provided by EDB, a support network among schools in the district was successfully established, and schools had learnt to effectively collaborate with EPs to adopt a WSA to support their SEN students.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr CHEUNG considered that the successful experience of such support network should be promoted in other districts.</p> <p>HKPTU remarked that on the assumption that about 20% of the teachers in each ordinary school had completed various levels of the BAT Courses over the past five years, it would take about 25 years for all serving teachers to have acquired training under the BAT Courses.</p> <p>HKPTU urged for the creation of a functional post in each school to serve as co-ordinator for SEN students ("SENCO"). The post-holder should be the designated teacher entrusted with the responsibility to coordinate and promote the implementation of IE.</p> <p>Professor SIN said that each year, about 150 graduates of HKIEd possessed a bachelor degree in education with a major or minor in special needs and inclusive education. He urged EDB and schools to capitalize on the professional training acquired by these teachers and appoint them as the resource persons responsible for coordinating and implementing IE in their schools.</p> <p>EDB advised that as at November 2013 –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) almost all public sector ordinary primary schools had 10% of its teachers having attended various BAT Courses; and</li> <li>(b) overall, over 40% and about 18% of the teachers of public sector ordinary primary and secondary schools respectively had attended structured special education training of 30 hours or more.</li> </ul> <p>EDB envisaged that the above proportions of trained teachers would improve as more teachers would take part in BAT Courses and more teacher education graduates with relevant training would enter the teaching profession.</p>	
011638 - 012354	Chairman EDB	Noting that EDB had been encouraging schools to adopt WSA in implementing IE, the Chairman opined that all teachers in public sector ordinary schools should have received training under BAT Courses.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>In response, EDB advised that the implementation of WSA to IE required the concerted efforts of the whole school and not the sole effort of teachers. In addition, professional support was provided by the Government and other sources such as SSRCs, etc. EDB would continue to monitor the teacher training targets and progress of teacher training in catering for SEN students.</p> <p>The Chairman enquired about the teacher training targets if an ordinary school had admitted students with, say, three different types of SEN.</p> <p>EDB advised that under the prevailing training targets, each public sector ordinary school should have at least one teacher who had completed the Thematic Courses on each category of SEN. EDB would also encourage those schools which had admitted a larger number of students with different SEN to arrange for more teachers to attend the Thematic Courses.</p> <p>The Chairman considered the above target grossly inadequate in providing proper teacher support for SEN students. He urged EDB to seriously consider setting up a functional post of SENCO in each school.</p>	
012355 - 013057	Dr Kenneth CHAN Chairman EDB	<p>Dr CHAN shared the views of the deputations that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the expertise of teachers with a bachelor degree specializing in special needs had not been duly recognized by the schools where they taught. Hence, they did not have the opportunity to apply their specialized knowledge in their day-to-day work; and</li> <li>(b) these teachers should be designated as Diversity Managers in their respective schools to take forward the implementation of IE.</li> </ul> <p>Dr CHAN also suggested that EDB should encourage post-secondary institutions to put in place support measures for implementing IE in order that more SEN students could be admitted.</p> <p>EDB advised that apart from BAT courses for teachers, relevant training was provided for school principals to enhance their awareness and understanding of supporting SEN students. It was envisaged that they would provide the steer at the management level to take forward IE and would</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>make good use of the expertise possessed by teachers who had acquired training in their respective schools.</p> <p>The Subcommittee noted that issues related to the opportunities of SEN students to receive university/post-secondary education would be discussed in due course.</p>	
013058 - 013800	Deputy Chairman Chairman EDB Professor SIN	<p>The Deputy Chairman considered that it was of paramount importance for teachers to receive more specialized training instead of merely the BAT Courses to support SEN students. In anticipation of the decline in the number of students in the coming years, the Deputy Chairman urged EDB to take the opportunity to consider resuming the two-year SEN training for teachers which had ceased 10 years ago.</p> <p>EDB noted that currently, HKIEd offered degree programmes in special education which were comparable to the former two-year training on special education for teachers. EDB said that the BAT Courses were a practical form of training to equip a critical mass of teachers with the requisite knowledge and skills in supporting SEN students.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman opined that pre-service training, such as the degree programmes in special education offered by HKIEd, were equally important as on-the-job training such as the BAT Courses for developing the professional capacity of teachers to support SEN students.</p> <p>Professor SIN of HKIEd said that to groom more teachers specializing in IE, the Government could consider providing scholarships for aspiring graduate teachers to pursue relevant postgraduate studies overseas.</p>	
013801 - 014209	Ms Cyd HO EDB Chairman	<p>Noting that the Government had not pursued the proposal announced in the 2013-2014 Budget to set up scholarships for outstanding local students to take degree courses or teacher training programmes in prestigious overseas universities, Ms HO considered that EDB should make use of the proposed funding to award scholarships for further studies in special education at overseas universities. EDB took note of Ms HO's view.</p> <p>After deliberation, Ms HO requested EDB to provide written information on the existing professional support/services available to support ordinary schools in implementing IE. She added that, in the long-run,</p>	EDB was requested to provide the information as

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		EDB should inject additional resources to support SEN students. The Chairman also requested EDB to provide examples of pilot projects to enhance the support for SEN students which had been implemented in the past.	stated in paragraph 4(a) of the minutes.
<i>Agenda Item III – Measures/plans to improve facilities of schools to better meet the needs of their students with special educational needs</i>			
014210 - 014251	Chairman	Opening remarks	
014252 - 014504	ARSHI Chairman	Presentation of views	
014505 - 014648	HKBU Chairman	Presentation of views	
014649 - 015439	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung EDB Chairman	<p>Mr LEUNG suggested EDB to consider carefully the next tender for procuring hearing aids to ensure that the needs of students with HI would be met. In relation to the supply of hearing aids, the Chairman requested EDB to advise the Subcommittee in writing the direction in the provision of hearing aids that would be adopted in the next tender.</p> <p>On the provision of cochlear implants to students with HI, Mr LEUNG considered that the Subcommittee might wish to follow up the matter with the two responsible bureaux, namely, EDB and the Food and Health Bureau.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) while details of the tender terms were confidential, more choices and higher flexibility would be the direction in preparing the tender document, and</p> <p>(b) the Hospital Authority was responsible for the provision of cochlear implants. If necessary, EDB and the relevant bureaux/departments would discuss the relevant issues with the Subcommittee.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG requested EDB to inform the Subcommittee of how Hong Kong had given effect to the relevant provisions under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities ("UNCRPD") regarding the learning, teaching and</p>	<p>EDB was requested to provide the information as stated in paragraph 4(b) of the minutes.</p> <p>EDB was requested to provide the information as stated in</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>use of sign language in the education for students with HI.</p> <p>EDB informed members that the Rehabilitation Advisory Committee had been reviewing the use of sign language in the community. A project had also been conducted by a special school for children with HI on the development of new signed vocabularies that could be used in teaching. EDB would revert to the Subcommittee regarding Hong Kong's compliance with UNCRPD.</p>	paragraph 4(c) of the minutes.
015440 - 015903	Deputy Chairman EDB Chairman	<p>The Deputy Chairman said that to his knowledge, the supplier of the hearing aids was responsible for fine-tuning the devices to meet the needs of students with HI. However, very often, it could not deliver satisfactory service. He asked whether EDB would include as one of the requirements under the tender that the supplier had to provide satisfactory fine-tuning service of the hearing aids for the use of students with HI.</p> <p>In response, EDB advised that if students with HI had repeated problems with their hearing aids, they could approach EDB for appropriate assistance.</p> <p>In reply to the Deputy Chairman, EDB said that students with HI provided with hearing aids were asked to complete and return to EDB a questionnaire on the satisfaction level of the service. The response rate was above 80%. EDB supplemented that the respondents expressed satisfaction.</p> <p>The Chairman drew EDB's attention to a number of practical problems related to the provision of hearing aids to students with HI which had been brought to his attention.</p>	
015904 - 020608	Chairman EDB	<p>The Chairman said that according to the information provided by the Administration in 2012, 119 public sector ordinary schools had not installed lifts in their premises. He enquired about EDB's plans, if any, to provide the necessary barrier-free access and facilities in all public sector ordinary primary and secondary schools.</p> <p>In response, EDB advised that of the 119 public sector ordinary schools (including seven Government schools), the conditions at 29 schools were not technically feasible for the installation of lifts. EDB was working with the Architectural Services Department to evaluate the technical feasibility for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the installation of lifts at these seven Government schools. In the 2012-2013 school year, about 70 public sector schools had not yet installed lifts in their premises; about 60 schools had applied for installation of lifts in the context of the 2013-2014 major repair/alteration programme. Lifts would be installed in at least five public sector ordinary schools every year according to EDB's schedule.</p> <p>The Chairman asked whether EDB would provide additional resources to those schools without lifts to cater for the needs of SEN students. EDB advised that where necessary, its staff would visit these schools to discuss feasible alternatives, such as arranging students with physical disabilities to attend classes in classrooms located on lower or ground floors, and installing ramps for better access.</p> <p>The Chairman requested EDB to consider requiring all primary and secondary schools to disclose in their school profiles information on the provision and, where applicable, non-provision of barrier-free access and facilities in their school premises to increase transparency and facilitate parental choice.</p>	<p>EDB was requested to provide the information as stated in paragraph 4(d) of the minutes.</p>
<i>Agenda Item IV – Any other business</i>			
020609-020628	Chairman	Closing remarks	