

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)189/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/12

Panel on Education

Subcommittee on Integrated Education

**Minutes of the fifteenth meeting
held on Wednesday, 28 May 2014, at 8: 30 am
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Members attending : Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

Member absent : Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Public Officers attending : Items II & III

Education Bureau

Mr Kevin YEUNG, JP
Under Secretary for Education

Mr KWONG Ying-wai
Principal Education Officer (Special Education &
Kindergarten Education)

Ms Louise HUI
Senior Specialist (Speech Therapy)

Ms Doris LEE
Senior Specialist (Educational Psychology Service / New
Territories West)

Attendance by : Items II & III
Invitation

SILENCE

Mr William TANG
Chairman

Kowloon Bay St. John the Baptist Catholic Primary
School

Ms VU Im-fan
Headmistress

Center for Sign Linguistics and Deaf Studies, The Chinese
University of Hong Kong

Professor TANG Wai-lan
Director

The Hong Kong Institute of Education

Professor SIN Kuen-fung

Division of Speech Therapy, Department of
Otorhinolaryngology, Head and Neck Surgery, Faculty of
Medicine, The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Dr Kathy LEE Yuet-sheung
Associate Professor

Mr LAI Ka-yau

Clerk in attendance : Miss Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Senior Council Secretary (4) 4

Ms Sandy HAU
Legislative Assistant (4) 3

I. Papers issued since last meeting

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)694/13-14(01), - Presentation materials
(02), (03), (04) and (05) related to the visit to
Kowloon Bay St. John the
Baptist Catholic Primary
School)

Members noted the above papers issued since the last meeting.

II. Promotion of sign bilingualism in mainstream schools

(LC Paper No. CB(4)703/13-14(01) -- Paper provided by the
Administration)

III. Cross-sectoral collaboration in supporting students with special educational needs

(LC Paper No. CB(4)703/13-14(02) -- Paper provided by the
Administration)

Other papers

Written submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)731/13-14(03), - 9 batches of submissions
(04), (05), (06), (07), (08), (09), (10) - from
and (11) deputations/individuals)

Meeting with the Administration and deputations / individuals for agenda items II and III

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex I**).

3. To facilitate members' consideration of the educational needs of students with hearing impairment ("HI"), the Education Bureau ("EDB") was asked to provide information, where practicable, on the number of babies born each year with different degrees of HI ranging from mild to profound.

(Post-meeting note: EDB's written response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)985/13-14(02) on 1 August 2014.)

4. The Chairman invited Prof TANG Wai-lan of the Centre for Sign Linguistics and Deaf Studies of the Chinese University of Hong Kong and Prof SIN Kuen-fung of the Hong Kong Institute of Education ("HKIEd") to provide the following respectively -

- (a) the research findings on the performance and academic attainment of students with HI supported under the Sign Bilingualism and Co-enrolment in Deaf Education Programme ("Co-enrolment Programme") in core academic subjects vis-à-vis that of other students with HI studying in mainstream schools; and
- (b) the findings on the academic performance of students with HI studying in mainstream schools which were part of a research commissioned by the Hong Kong Society for the Deaf and conducted by HKIEd a few years ago.

(Post-meeting note: Written responses to (a) and (b) were issued to members vide LC paper No. CB(4)1041/13-14(01) on 28 August 2014 and LC Paper No. CB(4)782/13-14(01) on 6 June 2014 respectively.)

5. Under Secretary of Education ("US(Ed)") remarked that EDB officers would explore with Prof TANG the feasibility of seeking funding support from the Quality Education Fund to sustain the operation of the Co-enrolment Programme.

(Post-meeting note: EDB's written response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)985/13-14(02) on 1 August 2014.)

6. Having regard to EDB's explanation that some ordinary schools had adopted other teaching / support modes which were also effective in catering for students with HI, Mr TAM Yiu-chung enquired whether EDB could assist in making arrangements for the Subcommittee to visit some of these schools to observe how teaching and learning support was provided to students with HI. EDB agreed to follow up the request.

(Post-meeting note: due to imminence of the close of the 2013-2014 legislative session and the end of the school year, a mutually convenient date could not be worked out for the proposed visit before the end of the current session.)

Motion

7. The Chairman concluded the discussion and proceeded to deal with the motion moved by the Deputy Chairman (at **Annex II**), which was tabled at the meeting. As the relevant matter had been deliberated thoroughly, members agreed to vote on the motion without further debate. The Chairman put the motion to vote. All the six members present voted for the motion. No member abstained or voted against. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed. EDB was asked to provide a written response to the motion passed by the Subcommittee.

(Post-meeting note: EDB's written response to the motion was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)985/13-14(01) on 1 August 2014.)

IV. Any Other Business

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:30 am.

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Integrated Education
on Wednesday, 28 May 2014, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
000301 - 000652	Chairman	Opening remarks	
<i>Agenda Item II – Promotion of sign bilingualism in mainstream schools</i> <i>Agenda Item III – Cross-Sectoral collaboration in supporting students with special educational needs</i>			
000653 - 000853	SILENCE Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)731/13-14(01)]	
000854 - 001316	Kowloon Bay St. John the Baptist Catholic Primary School ("St. John Primary School") Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)703/13-14(03)]	
001317 - 001944	Center for Sign Linguistics and Deaf Studies ("CSLDS"), The Chinese University of Hong Kong ("CUHK") Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)744/13-14(01)]	
001945 - 002319	The Hong Kong Institute of Education ("HKIEd") Chairman	Presentation of views	
002320 - 002724	Division of Speech Therapy ("DST"), Department of Otorhinolaryngology, Head and Neck Surgery, Faculty of Medicine, CUHK Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)744/13-14(02)]	
002725 - 003159	Mr LAI Ka-yau Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)731/13-14(02)]	
003200 - 005032	Chairman Education Bureau ("EDB")	<p>The Chairman recapitulated the deputations' views that both oral and sign languages were equally important and useful in the education for students with hearing impairment ("HI"). The use of sign language was particularly important for some students with HI attending ordinary schools.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) under the relevant provisions of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities ("UNCRPD"), States Parties had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the obligation to take appropriate measures to promote sign language;</p> <p>(b) it had been encouraging schools to adopt the most appropriate mode to teach and to communicate with students with HI having regard to their abilities and needs. Schools had been using different strategies including the enhancement of inclusive culture, use of body languages or other visual support strategies, etc. in teaching and communicating with students with HI;</p> <p>(c) schools were encouraged to pool and deploy resources flexibly to cater for the specific needs of their students with HI. EDB had been discussing with St. John Primary School possible ways to refine the implementation of the Sign Bilingualism and Co-enrolment in Deaf Education Programme ("the Co-enrolment Programme") with the use of existing school resources allocated by EDB;</p> <p>(d) EDB had been keeping in view the learning progress of the students under the Co-enrolment Programme. It should be noted that a conglomerate of factors contributed to the development of students with HI, rather than solely the support mode. So far, EDB was not aware of strong empirical evidence confirming that the use of sign language was the major contributing factor leading to significant improvement in the academic attainment of students with HI; and</p> <p>(e) if a particular teaching / support mode to support students with HI was to be implemented across the board, consideration must be given to its evidence-based effectiveness as well as the resource implications.</p> <p>The Chairman commented that under Article 24 of UNCRPD, States Parties should take appropriate measures to support the learning and communication of students with HI and students with visual impairment through sign language and braille respectively. At present, there was only one special school for children with HI in Hong Kong which used sign language to teach and communicate with its students. It appeared that, by implementing the Co-enrolment Programme, St. John Primary School was the only ordinary school where teachers used sign language in teaching students with HI. He enquired about EDB's plan in supporting students with HI.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB informed members that the Lutheran School for the Deaf ("LSD") was the special school for children with HI. The school had all along been using sign language and oral language to teach and communicate with its students. LSD also acted as a resource school offering advice and assistance to ordinary schools in supporting students with HI. In February 2012, it obtained funding from the Quality Education Fund ("QEF") to launch a three-year project on "Development of New Vocabulary of Sign Language for Special Educational Needs on New Senior Secondary Curriculum" to integrate and develop new sign vocabularies for the teachers, to cope with the curriculum requirements and to enhance teachers' abilities to use sign language to assist teaching.</p> <p>EDB supplemented that it had all along been encouraging ordinary schools to adopt appropriate modes to teach and to communicate with students with HI having regard to their abilities and needs. For instance, in several ordinary secondary schools which had admitted students with more severe HI, visual strategies were effective in facilitating these students' comprehension and learning in class, together with other forms of support, such as pre-teaching and after-class remedial learning. Teachers would also attend sign language training courses on a need basis, and the use of sign language was promoted through extra-curricular or inclusive activities.</p> <p>EDB further advised that there were international researches investigating the effectiveness of different teaching or support modes for students with HI, including sign bilingualism and co-enrolment. There had not been conclusive results indicating that one particular teaching or communication mode was more effective than the others. While the use of sign bilingualism was an effective mode for some students with HI, it should be noted that these students' mode of learning and the use of oral language were also important in their future education and careers. EDB reiterated that ordinary schools should adopt appropriate modes to teach and to communicate with students with HI.</p>	
005033 - 010057	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che EDB Chairman	<p>Mr CHEUNG said that according to his observations during the visit to St. John Primary School, there was good interaction between hearing students and students with HI. He considered that students with HI were able to integrate into ordinary schools under the Co-enrolment Programme.</p> <p>To facilitate members' consideration of the educational needs of students with HI, Mr CHEUNG requested EDB to provide information, where practicable, on the</p>	EDB was requested to provide the information as stated in

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>number of babies born each year with different degrees of HI ranging from mild to profound.</p> <p>Mr CHEUNG sought the following information –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the annual resources currently earmarked for supporting students with HI in ordinary schools and special school; and (b) the estimated annual resources for all ordinary schools and kindergartens, if sign bilingualism was to be adopted in teaching and learning. <p>Mr CHEUNG said that the above information would enable members to better understand the additional resources required if sign bilingualism was to be adopted in all ordinary schools.</p> <p>Mr CHEUNG and the Chairman urged EDB to re-examine the outcomes of the implementation of the Co-enrolment Programme by St. John Primary School which might be more cost-effective than what had been perceived by EDB.</p> <p>In response, EDB advised that ordinary schools, having regard to the abilities and needs of students with HI, had been adopting different teaching / support modes which were considered effective in supporting students' learning and enhancing their communication skills. No single teaching / support mode had been proven to be more effective than others. Hence, EDB would not require all ordinary schools to implement any single teaching / support mode, such as sign bilingualism, to support the students with HI.</p>	<p>paragraph 3 of the minutes.</p>
010058 - 010627	<p>Mr TAM Yiu-chung EDB Miss WONG Wai-lan (sign language interpreter) CSLDS Chairman</p>	<p>Having regard to EDB's information that some ordinary schools had adopted other teaching / support modes which were also effective in catering for students with HI, Mr TAM enquired whether EDB could assist in making arrangements for the Subcommittee to visit some of these schools to observe how teaching and learning support was provided to students with HI. EDB agreed to follow up the request.</p> <p>In reply to Mr TAM's enquiry, Miss WONG said that currently there were 10 qualified sign language interpreters in Hong Kong.</p> <p>In response to Mr TAM's enquiry on the training of professional sign language interpreters, CSLDS said that subject to availability of funding, CUHK would offer two diploma programmes on professional training for sign language interpreters.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Chairman said that the Administration should take note of the shortage of professional sign language interpreters in Hong Kong. Mr TAM said that the service of volunteer sign language interpreters should be encouraged.</p>	
010628 - 011416	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung EDB	<p>Mr LEUNG was concerned that the shortage of professional sign language interpreters would adversely affect the interest of people with HI. He reiterated his suggestion that sign language should be included in the regular school curriculum.</p> <p>EDB said that it had been promoting sign language to tie in with the work of the Working Group on Promoting Sign Language under the Rehabilitation Advisory Committee.</p> <p>EDB stressed that all along, it had been encouraging schools to adopt appropriate modes, including sign language, to teach and to communicate with students with HI having regard to their abilities and needs.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG did not subscribe to EDB's view that strong empirical evidence should be available if resources were to be deployed to adopt the Co-enrolment Programme or the use of sign language to support students with HI. He commented that although students with HI might respond differently to various teaching / support modes, sign language should be regarded as one of the options to facilitate effective teaching and learning of students with HI.</p> <p>In response, EDB highlighted that as the implementation of a new initiative would entail additional resources, it would only be prudent for the Administration to adopt a new initiative across the board with well-proven effectiveness.</p>	
011417 - 012722	Deputy Chairman St. John Primary School CSLDS EDB DST Chairman	<p>The Deputy Chairman considered that the Co-enrolment Programme had been effective in catering for the learning needs of students with HI and was worth-supporting. The Deputy Chairman –</p> <p>(a) remarked that having visited St. John Primary School, he found that the Co-enrolment Programme was effective in assisting students with HI. He opined that resources should be provided for the operation of the Programme at the school;</p> <p>(b) asked whether the implementation of the Co-enrolment Programme had taken into account the abilities of students with HI, their learning and communication needs; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required												
		<p>(c) asked whether academic performance was the sole factor considered by EDB in evaluating the effectiveness of teaching or support modes. He was concerned whether EDB would also take into consideration other relevant factors such as the interaction between hearing students and students with HI, as well as the latter's integration into the mainstream education.</p> <p>Regarding the implementation of the Co-enrolment Programme, St. John Primary School said that as reflected by its students with HI, the use of sign language in addition to oral language by teachers had been very helpful. The academic performance of students with HI in the school was above average, which was comparable to that of hearing students.</p> <p>St. John Primary School also opined that the Government had the responsibility to put in place appropriate policies and measures to support SEN students including students with HI. Hence, it should provide ordinary schools with more resources so that the schools could deliver the necessary assistance to SEN students and provide teachers with appropriate training.</p> <p>CSLDS said that the internationally renowned deaf education scholars mentioned in EDB's paper had commented positively on the Co-enrolment Programme, which played a pivotal role in the development of language skills of students with HI and inclusive culture.. CSLDS also provided the following information on the academic performance of students with HI in the three core subjects –</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Average passing rate of students with HI studying in -</th><th>Chinese Language</th><th>English Language</th><th>Mathematics</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Other ordinary primary schools</td><td>58.3%</td><td>55.9%</td><td>62.2%</td></tr> <tr> <td>St. John Primary School</td><td>90.9%</td><td>78.8%</td><td>90.9%</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The Chairman invited CSLDS to confirm in writing the findings on the performance and academic attainment of students with HI supported under the Co-enrolment Programme in core academic subjects vis-à-vis that of other students with HI studying in ordinary schools.</p>	Average passing rate of students with HI studying in -	Chinese Language	English Language	Mathematics	Other ordinary primary schools	58.3%	55.9%	62.2%	St. John Primary School	90.9%	78.8%	90.9%	CSLDS was invited to provide the information as stated in paragraph 4(a) of the minutes.
Average passing rate of students with HI studying in -	Chinese Language	English Language	Mathematics												
Other ordinary primary schools	58.3%	55.9%	62.2%												
St. John Primary School	90.9%	78.8%	90.9%												

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the extent to which a particular teaching / support mode can enhance the teaching and learning effectiveness for students with HI was the major factor for consideration. The academic attainment of students was not the sole factor for consideration; and (b) apart from the use of sign language, there were other factors which contributed to the effective interaction between hearing students and students with HI. The successful implementation of the whole school approach in integrated education ("IE") could also be a key factor. <p>DST advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) at present, about 40% of students with HI were able to benefit from education in ordinary schools. Hence, it might not be necessary for all ordinary schools to adopt sign language as a medium of instruction; and (b) since the Co-enrolment Programme had produced positive outcomes, EDB should consider ways to sustain its operation. 	
012723 - 013410	Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB HKIEd Chairman	<p>Dr CHAN commented that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) according to the deputations, the Co-enrolment Programme was effective in enhancing the academic performance of students with HI and their ability to communicate with others; and (b) while EDB had made positive comments on the Co-enrolment Programme, it had insisted that solid evidence was required before it could consider injecting resources to support the general implementation of the Programme in ordinary schools. The Administration should reconsider its stance and provide further support to sustain the operation of the Programme. <p>EDB responded that the use of public resources to implement a new initiative must be justified with sufficient grounds, in particular if it was intended to be adopted across the board.</p> <p>The Chairman invited HKIEd to provide the findings on the academic performance of students with HI studying in mainstream schools which were part of a research commissioned by the Hong Kong Society for the Deaf and conducted by HKIEd a few years ago.</p>	HKIEd was invited to provide the information as stated in paragraph 4(b) of the minutes.

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
013411 - 013954	Mr TANG Ka-Piu EDB	<p>Mr TANG urged EDB to consider –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) ways to help sustain the Co-enrolment Programme and other support programmes, such as by way of assistance under QEF; (b) conducting studies with a view to identifying effective teaching / support modes for students with HI in ordinary schools; and (c) exploring the feasibility of extending the Co-enrolment Programme to secondary schools. <p>EDB noted Mr TANG's suggestions, and agreed to explore with CSLDS the feasibility of seeking funding support from QEF to sustain the operation of the Co-enrolment Programme.</p>	EDB was requested to follow up as stated in paragraph 5 of the minutes.
013955 - 014825	Dr Elizabeth QUAT St. John Primary School Chairman EDB	<p>Referring to the successful experience of the Co-enrolment Programme, Dr QUAT suggested that EDB should consider implementing programmes of a similar nature that focused on catering for a particular type of SEN students in certain ordinary schools.</p> <p>In response to Dr QUAT's enquiry about the total cost required to run the Co-enrolment Programme, St. John Primary School said that the annual cost for running the Co-enrolment Programme was about \$1.2 million. Currently, the School received subsidy from the Government for its students with HI in the amount of \$360,000. Hence, an additional amount between \$800,000 and \$900,000 would be required to sustain the operation of the Programme in the School.</p> <p>Dr QUAT urged EDB to –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) support the continued operation of the Co-enrolment Programme at St. John Primary School; (b) if there was concrete evidence that other teaching / support modes were more effective than the Co-enrolment Programme in supporting students with HI, provide members with such evidence; and (c) inform members on the way forward for supporting SEN students. <p>In response, EDB advised that before consideration could be given to providing public resources to support any measures to cater for the educational needs of students with HI (such as the Co-enrolment Programme), the Administration must first ascertain the effectiveness of such measures in achieving the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>intended objectives and whether such measures were the only cost-effective means.</p> <p>The Chairman urged the Administration to consider setting up certain funding arrangements with the specific purpose of supporting worthwhile IE-related initiatives.</p>	
014826 - 014956	Chairman Deputy Chairman	With the concurrence of the Chairman, the Deputy Chairman moved a motion, the wording of which was tabled at the meeting. The motion was put to vote by the Chairman, and passed.	
014957 - 015644	Dr KWOK Ka-ki EDB	<p>Noting from the deputations that the Co-enrolment Programme was effective in supporting students with HI, Dr KWOK urged EDB to provide St. John Primary School with appropriate support to sustain the Programme. He enquired about EDB's concern over the deployment of regular funding for supporting the Programme.</p> <p>In response, EDB reiterated that if a particular teaching / support mode to support students with HI was to be adopted, consideration must be given to its effectiveness as supported by solid evidence, as well as the resource implications.</p>	
015645 - 020140	Chairman	The Chairman concluded that there was a consensus among the deputations that sign language was considered effective in the teaching and learning of some students with HI. He urged EDB to seriously consider providing support and resources to sustain the operation of the Co-enrolment Programme; and deploying specific supports and resources for the development of effective teaching / support modes for IE through cross-sectoral collaboration.	

教育事務委員會
Panel on Education

融合教育小組委員會
Subcommittee on Integrated Education

在 2014 年 5 月 28 日會議上通過的議案
Motion passed at the meeting on 28 May 2014

議案措辭

本委員會促請政府積極撥款支持現已在主流學校實施的手語雙語共融教育計劃，使這些計劃得以延續及發展，造福聽障學生。

動議人：葉建源議員

Wording of the Motion

(Translation)

That this Subcommittee urges the Government to proactively provide funding support to sign bilingualism co-enrolment schemes currently implemented in mainstream schools so as to sustain the development of such schemes for the benefit of students with hearing impairment.

Mover : Hon IP Kin-yuen