

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1795/13-14  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/6/12

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**

**Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 29 April 2014, at 4:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Member attending** : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

**Members absent** : Hon CHAN Han-pan  
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

**Public Officers attending** : Item II

The Administration

Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Miss Vinci CHAN  
Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 7

Ms Ava CHIU Wai-fan, JP  
Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene  
(Administration and Development)

Mr FAN Yung-kai  
Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene  
(Operations) 2

BMT Asia Pacific Limited

Dr Simon SU  
Director and Chief Economist

Ms Patsy CHENG  
Director of SEE Network

Dr CHEUNG Waiman  
Professor of the Department of Decision Sciences  
and Managerial Economics (Chinese University  
of Hong Kong), Director of the Asian Institute of  
Supply Chains and Logistics (Chinese University  
of Hong Kong)

Mr Gary YEUNG  
Registered Architect, Adjunct Assistant Professor of  
School of Architecture (Chinese University of  
Hong Kong)

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Alice LEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Richard WONG  
Council Secretary (2) 2

Ms Camy YOONG  
Clerical Assistant (2) 2

Action

**I. Matters arising**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(01))

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Members noted that the Legislative Council Secretariat had prepared a list of follow-up actions required of the Administration to facilitate the Subcommittee's discussion of the issues raised by members at the meeting held on 25 March 2014.

**II. Consultancy study on improving the operating environment of public markets**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1380/13-14(02) and (03))

Admin

3. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to provide the finalized questionnaires that would be used by the consultant for conducting surveys on patrons and non-patrons of public markets as well as stall operators of public markets respectively.

*(Post-meeting note: The Administration's reply was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1462/13-14(01) on 7 May 2014.)*

**III. Work plan of the Subcommittee**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(04))

4. Members noted and agreed on the proposed work plan of the Subcommittee. The Chairman said that if members would like to propose other items for discussion, they could notify the Clerk after the meeting.

5. The Chairman informed members that Mr WONG Kwok-hing had suggested inviting deputations to give views on issues relating to public markets. The Chairman consulted members' view on Mr WONG's suggestion. Members considered it not necessary for the Subcommittee to receive public views at this stage as the consultant would carry out a survey on public market stall operators and patrons as well as non-patrons of public markets in May 2014.

Action

**IV. Any other business**

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:05 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
13 June 2014

**Proceedings of the meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets  
on Tuesday, 29 April 2014, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
000210 - 000218	Chairman	The Chairman's opening remarks.	
<i>Agenda Item I - Matters arising</i>			
000219 - 000321	Chairman	List of follow-up actions required of the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(01)).	
<i>Agenda Item II - Consultancy study on improving the operating environment of public markets</i>			
000322 - 000503	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the background of the consultancy study on improving the operating environment of public markets ("the Consultancy Study").	
000504 - 000903	Chairman BMT Asia Pacific Limited ("Consultant")	Briefing by the Consultant on the purpose, scope and progress of the Consultancy Study (LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(02)).	
000904 - 001500	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's views that the Consultant should broaden the scope of the Consultancy Study to cover the following issues -  (a) recommendations made by the former Municipal Councils regarding the Government's policy on public markets;  (b) whether it was reasonable that a support rate of 85% among market stall operators was required for taking forward air-conditioning retrofitting projects in public markets;  (c) the optimal size of stalls in public markets;  (d) the optimal architectural design of public markets;  (e) the rental adjustment mechanism;  (f) the historical development and future direction of the Government's policy on	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>public markets; and</p> <p>(g) the Government's policy on bazaars.</p>	
001501 - 002051	<p>Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han</p>	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's views that the Consultant should -</p> <p>(a) conduct a comprehensive review on the positioning and functions of public markets;</p> <p>(b) study the architectural design that would best facilitate the business operation of public markets; and</p> <p>(c) explore the future direction of public markets, particularly regarding whether and how to provide space for local creative arts and cultural workers to operate.</p>	
002052 - 003519	<p>Chairman Dr Helena WONG Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Admin Consultant</p>	<p>Dr Helena WONG's views that -</p> <p>(a) the scope of the Consultancy Study was too narrow as compared with members' concerns; and</p> <p>(b) the Subcommittee should discuss a wider range of issues including (i) the need for building new markets in new districts (such as Tin Shui Wai) and; (ii) improvement measures for markets in public housing estates in addition to those managed by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD").</p> <p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiry about the progress, schedule and criteria of sample selection of the Consultancy Study.</p> <p>The Administration's responses that -</p> <p>(a) the scope of the Consultancy Study would be confined to the Consultancy Brief (Appendix to LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(03)), which had already covered many issues that were of concern to members;</p> <p>(b) members' concerns not included in the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Consultancy Study could be discussed in future meetings of the Subcommittee; and</p> <p>(c) issues relating to public markets in public housing estates were under the purview of the Transport and Housing Bureau.</p> <p>The Consultant's elaboration of the methodology and schedule of the Consultancy Study as follows -</p> <p>(a) regarding the selection criteria of the five to six public markets for detailed case study, priority would be given to those markets that had an urgent need for improving the operating environment and increasing the patronage;</p> <p>(b) representative samples would be selected for the questionnaire survey, which was scheduled to commence in May 2014; and</p> <p>(c) patrons and non-patrons of public markets, as well as stall operators of public markets would be covered by the questionnaire survey.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the sample size of the questionnaire survey was expected to exceed 1 100.</p> <p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's request for the Administration to provide the survey questionnaires that would be used by the consultant.</p>	<p><b>Admin to provide the requested information</b> (paragraph 3 of the minutes)</p>
003520 - 004455	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin Consultant	<p>The Deputy Chairman's view that the Consultancy Study should aim at formulating concrete and pragmatic proposals for improving the operating environment of public markets amid competition posed by other retail outlets (e.g. supermarkets), and the Administration's response that this was one of the expected deliverables of the Consultancy study.</p> <p>The Consultant's responses that the Consultancy Study was expected to complete the following tasks -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(a) reviewing the historical development of public markets so as to give advice on the updated positioning and functions of public markets;</p> <p>(b) formulating viable business models for public markets managed by FEHD; and</p> <p>(c) putting forward concrete improvement plans for five to six public markets with a view to demonstrating to market stall operators and the general public that public markets could meet present-day shoppers' expectations.</p>	
004456 - 005104	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Consultant Admin	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai's views that -</p> <p>(a) public markets selected by the Consultant should be representative so that useful reference could be drawn from the improvement plans recommended in the Consultancy Study; and</p> <p>(b) improvement plans recommended by the Consultant should aim to significantly enhance the patronage of public markets.</p> <p>The Administration's and the Consultant's advice that the criteria of selecting public markets to be studied would be based on a set of parameters including patronage and location.</p> <p>The Chairman's remarks that the five to six public markets selected for detailed case study should represent different types of public markets (such as public markets with high and low patronage) so that the recommended improvement plans could be applicable to other public markets.</p>	
005105 - 005610	Chairman Miss Alice MAK Admin Consultant	<p>Miss Alice MAK's views that -</p> <p>(a) it would be useful for the Consultancy Study to come up with a few business models that were of general reference to all public markets; and</p> <p>(b) the Consultant should take into</p>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>consideration town planning issues (such as transport and parking facilities in the vicinity of public markets) in addition to improvement measures on facilities in public markets (such as installation of air-conditioning facilities).</p> <p>The Administration's response that the Consultant would take into consideration a wide range of issues.</p>	
005611 - 010126	Chairman Mr Steven HO Admin Consultant	<p>Mr Steven HO's views that -</p> <p>(a) transport (such as provision of parking spaces) was a major factor in affecting the patronage of public markets; and</p> <p>(b) the Consultancy Study should consider whether and how to change the location of public markets (such as merging two or three small public markets into one bigger public market) in response to population change in the district.</p> <p>The Consultant's responses that -</p> <p>(a) the Consultancy Study would take into consideration a wide range of factors including transport and population density; and</p> <p>(b) although the Consultancy Study was intended to provide concrete improvement proposals that could be generalized to other public markets, it was not realistic to expect the Consultancy Study to solve all problems facing public markets as each public market had its own characteristics and problems.</p>	
010127 - 010634	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views that -</p> <p>(a) in view of the number and geographical coverage of public markets, they could also serve as centres for food waste management and recycling in the community; and</p> <p>(b) the Consultancy Study should review</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>issues relating to FEHD's management of public markets, such as the tender system, rental adjustment mechanism and hygiene-related services, etc.</p> <p>The Administration's responses that -</p> <p>(a) FEHD would collaborate with the Environment Protection Department to enhance support measures for waste recovery and recycling with a view to improving waste management; and</p> <p>(b) management issues were included in the the scope of study as stated in the Consultancy Brief.</p>	
010635 - 010735	Chairman	The Chairman's view that it was of utmost importance to find the right trade mix for and enhance the patronage of public markets so as to improve the operating environment of public markets.	
010736 - 012322	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Deputy Chairman Admin Consultant	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's view that both success and failure cases of public markets should be selected for the detailed case study in the Consultancy Study, and his further enquiry about the schedule of the Consultancy Study.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the work plan of the Subcommittee should dovetail with the schedule of the Consultancy Study.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's view that the Administration and the Consultant should work closer with the Subcommittee to tackle long-standing issues of public markets, such as rental adjustment mechanism.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it had plans to (a) discuss with the Subcommittee on the proposed improvement measures for public markets in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2014; and (b) consult the Subcommittee on an updated proposal of rental adjustment mechanism before March 2015.</p> <p>The Consultant's responses that -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(a) the questionnaire survey was scheduled to commence in May, which would take about four weeks for interviewing the respondents;</p> <p>(b) focus group discussions would also be conducted with a view to formulating concrete improvements proposals for five to six selected public markets; and</p> <p>(c) based on these five to six concrete proposals, general suggestions would be made for reference to other public markets.</p>	
012323 - 013229	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Admin Consultant	<p>Mr Michael TIEN's views that -</p> <p>(a) the function of public markets should be providing the public with good quality commodities at affordable prices, instead of subsidizing stall operators in the form of concessionary rental arrangement;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should review whether public markets should continue to be managed by FEHD, or a statutory body could be set up to take up the role of management of public markets; and</p> <p>(c) public markets should be operated in such a way that stall operators were selected on their ability to attract patronage and their business turnover, instead of awarding the tenant contracts to bidders merely offering the highest bids.</p> <p>The Administration's and the Consultant's responses that they would take Mr TIEN's view into consideration.</p>	
013230 - 013439	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman's conclusion of the discussion that the Administration and the Consultant should work closely with the Subcommittee with a view to (a) enhancing the design of public markets; (b) improving the operating environment of public markets; (c) increasing the patronage of public markets; and (d) ensuring that public markets would provide the public with clean and hygienic shopping environment and good quality commodities at</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
		affordable prices.	
<i>Agenda Item III - Work plan of the Subcommittee</i>			
013440 - 013652	Chairman Deputy Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	<p>The Chairman's consultation with members on the proposed work plan of the Subcommittee (LC Paper No. CB(2)1380/13-14(04)).</p> <p>Members' discussion on Mr WONG Kwok-hing's suggestion of inviting public views in a future meeting of the Subcommittee.</p> <p>In light of members' views, the Chairman's conclusion that the Subcommittee would not invite public views at this stage.</p>	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
13 June 2014