

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)255/14-15

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/1/12

Panel on Welfare Services and Panel on Health Services

Joint Subcommittee on Long-term Care Policy

**Minutes of the seventeenth meeting
held on Tuesday, 24 June 2014, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members Present : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)
Hon TANG Ka-piu (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH

Members absent Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Public Officers Attending : Item I

Ms Angela LEE
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food & Health
(Health)²
Food and Health Bureau

Dr Daisy DAI
Chief Manager (Primary & Community Services)
Hospital Authority

Dr Christina MAW
Senior Manager (Elderly & Community Care)
Hospital Authority

Mrs Elina CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare
(Welfare) 3
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Miss Cecilla LI
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Social Welfare Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

Item I

SKH Holy Carpenter Church District Elderly
Community Centre

Mr LEUNG Tsz-tun
Senior Service Manager

Society for the Promotion of Hospice Care

Mr KWAN Kam-fan
Executive Director

Hong Kong Society of Palliative Medicine

Dr CHAN Kin-sang
Council Member

Mr LEE Siu-po

Ms Edith LEE

The Forthright Caucus

Miss LAM Ling

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan
Deputy Spokesperson of Welfare

Ms Christine M.S. FANG

The Salvation Army

Ms Irene LEUNG Pui-yiu
Social Services Director

Labour Party

Mr LO Ho-yuen
Representative

Hong Kong Association of Gerontology

Ms YUNG Lai
Executive Director

St James' Settlement

Mr SHAM Chi-wing
Service Development Manager (RSW)

Ms LO Yuen-ching

Department of Social Work & Social Administration,
The University of Hong Kong

Dr Amy CHOW Yin-man
Associate Professor

Sau Po Centre on Ageing, The University of Hong
Kong

Dr Andy HO Hau-yan
Research Assistant Professor

The Association of Parents of The Severely Mentally
Handicapped

Mr LEE Chi-yung

Clerk in Attendance : Mr Colin CHUI
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in Attendance : Miss Karen LAI
Council Secretary (2) 6

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Hospice care services

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1816/13-14(01), CB(2)1820/13-14(01) to (02), CB(2)1888/13-14(01) to (05), CB(2)1901/13-14(01) to (02), CB(2)1982/13-14(01), CB(2)2037/13-14(01) and CB(2)2084/13-14(01)]

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Joint Subcommittee requested the Administration to provide –

Admin

- (a) information on the additional funding for the two new contract residential care homes for the elderly, which had already commenced service tendering, for the provision of end-of-life care services for elderly residents and support to their carers; and
- (b) international benchmarks regarding the provision of palliative care beds and the number of patients with chronic or terminal illness who had passed away in hospitals in Hong Kong.

3. The Joint Subcommittee agreed that the Secretariat should write to the Administration to seek –

LegCo
Secretariat

- (a) response from the Chief Secretary for Administration to members' request for the establishment of an inter-departmental committee under the purview of her office dedicated to formulate a comprehensive hospice care policy and coordinate the work of different bureaux/departments to improve the provision of hospice care for the needs of the ageing population; and
- (b) response from the Secretary for Security to members' concerns regarding the application of the Hospital Authority's Do-Not-Attempt Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation Guidelines in an ambulance setting, and the factors and legal responsibilities that the Secretary would consider in deciding whether the Guidelines should be followed.

Action

(*Post-meeting note:* The Administration's response to item (a) and item (b) were issued to members vide LC Paper CB(2)2037/13-14(01) on 14 July 2014 and LC Paper CB(2)2084/13-14(01) on 18 July 2014 respectively.)

II. Item(s) for discussion at the next meeting

[LC Paper No. CB(2)272/13-14]

4. The Chairman advised that the next meeting was scheduled for 24 July 2014 to discuss the draft report of the Joint Subcommittee. He said that he would propose the moving of a motion at a Council meeting in the next session to take note of the Joint Subcommittee report.

III. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:31 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 November 2014

**Proceedings of the seventeenth meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee on Long-term Care Policy
on Tuesday, 24 June 2014, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Hospice care services</i>			
000104 - 000626	Chairman	Opening remarks of the Chairman that around 40 000 people passed away in hospital each year representing 90% of the annual number of deaths. His concerns that the provision of palliative care beds and other hospice care services was far from adequate in view of the ageing population.	
000627 - 000947	Society for the Promotion of Hospice Care Chairman	Views that palliative care services should not be restricted to cancer patients but extended to patients suffering from other terminal diseases and organ failure. Community care services for the elderly should be provided by inter-disciplinary professionals including doctors, nurses, medical social workers, clinical psychologists and physiotherapists.	
000948 - 001304	SKH Holy Carpenter Church District Elderly Community Centre Chairman	Views that the Administration should allocate more resources for the enhancement of community care services for the elderly, in particular around the clock services for patients with terminal diseases in the community.	
001305 - 001637	Hong Kong Society of Palliative Medicine Chairman	Presentation of views that palliative care services was a better term to reflect the comprehensive care services to improve quality of life of patients facing death. Review of palliative care services should cover the following areas: (a) collaboration between healthcare and welfare sectors; (b) collaboration between public and private organizations; (c) life-and-death education for the public; (d) review of laws relating to advance medical directives, Enduring Powers of Attorney, the application of resuscitation guidelines on ambulance, and procedures of reporting of death to Coroners, etc.;	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(e) provision of community care services regarding hospice care; and</p> <p>(f) training of palliative care professionals in universities and tertiary institutions.</p>	
001638 - 001643	Mr LEE Siu-po Chairman	Mr LEE's intention to present his views later.	
001644 - 001958	Ms Edith LEE Chairman	Presentation of views that training should be provided for social workers in advising elderly persons on hospice care and funeral services; and that 24-hour community care services should be provided for elders to facilitate them to age in place.	
001959 - 002313	The Forthright Caucus Chairman	<p>Presentation of views –</p> <p>(a) the Administration should formulate a holistic hospice care policy, covering palliative care, life-and-death education, and counselling for family members of patients;</p> <p>(b) hospice care services should be provided especially for singleton elderly persons, and persons with intellectual disabilities; and</p> <p>(c) elderly persons' decisions stated in advance medical directives should be implemented in both hospital and non-hospital settings such as ambulance.</p>	
002314 - 002708	Ms Christine M.S. FANG Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1888/13-14(01)]	
002709 - 003044	The Salvation Army Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1982/13-14(01)]	
003045 - 003355	Labour Party Chairman	Presentation of views about the acute shortage of palliative care beds in public hospitals; manpower shortage in hospitals providing palliative services; the lack of nursing staff with professional hospice care training in public hospitals; and enquiries about whether the Administration would collaborate with private organizations in offering life-and-death education and bereavement services for the general public.	
003356 - 003746	Hong Kong Association of Gerontology Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1888/13-14(02)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
003747 - 004014	St James' Settlement Chairman	Expressing the view that a proper mechanism should be in place so that elderly persons' decisions (e.g. donation of organs) in regard to their death arrangement could be well respected and properly executed.	
004015 - 004346	Ms LO Yuen-ching Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1820/13-14(02)]	
004347 - 004702	Department of Social Work & Social Administration, The University of Hong Kong Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1888/13-14(03)]	
004703 - 005024	Sau Po Centre on Ageing, The University of Hong Kong Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1888/13-14(04)]	
005025 - 005436	The Association of Parents of The Severely Mentally Handicapped Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1901/13-14(02)]	
005437 - 011446	Chairman Administration	<p>Summing up of deputations' views by the Chairman and his enquiries about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the lack of a hospice care policy; (b) limitations of the service scope and service places (e.g. palliative care beds) of the existing hospice care services; (c) the existing legal system should be reviewed in terms of respecting the choice of the elderly concerning their death arrangement; (d) the way forward for hospice care services in particular the Administration's plan for increasing the number of palliative care beds and palliative home care teams; and (e) details of end-of-life care services provided in residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHEs"). <p>Response of the Administration to deputations' views and the Chairman's enquiries –</p> <p><i>Palliative care services of HA</i></p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) HA had been providing palliative care services with a comprehensive service model for terminally-ill patients (who were not restricted to cancer patients) through a multi-disciplinary team of healthcare professionals;</p> <p>(b) there were currently 360 palliative care beds. The number of beds was not small when compared with overseas countries. Palliative care services were not restricted to in-patient services but covered outpatient, day care and home care services, as well as bereavement services;</p> <p>(c) HA's palliative care home care teams conducted more than 25 000 home visits in 2013 to provide continuing care for discharged patients;</p> <p>(d) strengthening of palliative care services (mainly home care services, bereavement care and support to caregivers) would be proposed at HA's annual meeting. Whether the proposal could be taken forward would be subject to HA's overall service priority;</p> <p>(e) HA had developed internal guidelines regarding resuscitation for patients who had given advance directives and donation of organs after death;</p> <p><i>End-of-life care services in elderly centres and RCHEs</i></p> <p>(f) additional resources had been provided for elderly centres to strengthen counselling and carer support services which may include life and death education;</p> <p>(g) the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") had been promoting a continuum of care in subsidized RCHEs to enable elderly residents to stay in the same RCHE even when their health conditions deteriorated;</p> <p>(h) non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") had offered end-of-life care programmes on their own initiatives. The Administration would also provide end-of-life care programmes in five new contract RCHEs which would commence service from 2015-2016 to 2016-2017; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(i) of the five new contract RCHEs, tenders had been invited for two RCHEs and it was highlighted in the service specifications that end-of-life care services should be provided and successful bidders should work with hospitals in respective clusters to enhance collaboration between healthcare and welfare sectors. Additional funding had been included in the contract sum for the successful bidder to provide end-of-life care services.</p> <p>At the request of the Chairman, the Administration would provide information on the additional funding for the two contract RCHEs for the provision of end-of-life care services (with differentiation from the funding previously allocated).</p> <p>Enquiry of the Chairman about the bureau responsible for formulating hospice care policy and reply of the Administration that the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB") and HA would undertake a study on how to strengthen hospice care services. HA doctors specialized in gerontology would explore ways on how to collaborate with RCHEs for the provision of hospice care; and that should be worked out inter-departmentally.</p>	<p>Admin</p>
<p>011447 - 011713</p>	<p>Mr POON Siu-ping Department of Social Work & Social Administration, The University of Hong Kong Chairman</p>	<p>Concurrence of Mr POON Siu-ping that the provision of hospice care services was fragmented. His enquires about details of a report on the quality of death mentioned in a deputation's submission –</p> <p>(a) reasons behind the rather low ranking (20th) of Hong Kong in the report; and</p> <p>(b) the ranking of Hong Kong in previous surveys of the kind and what factors, policy- or resource-wise, would help improve the quality of death.</p> <p>Reply of the deputation that –</p> <p>(a) the report on the quality of death published by the Economist Intelligence Unit in 2010 was the first and only survey done on the subject. The survey covered 40 countries and provided analysis on different areas of quality of death; and</p> <p>(b) the rather low ranking of Hong Kong was attributed to inadequate support for the elderly</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>in terms of healthcare services and financial assistance as well as the lack of an inter-departmental policy on hospice care. The quality of hospice care of Hong Kong got a lower ranking of 31st in the report in respect of basic end-of-life healthcare environment.</p>	
011714 - 012411	Deputy Chairman Administration Chairman	<p>Views/enquiries of the Deputy Chairman that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the review of hospice care services to be conducted by FHB and HA should be comprehensive covering the monitoring of columbaria and funeral services; (b) whether HA would form a working group or commission a consultant to conduct the study; and (c) whether the ambulance medical personnel would respect the directives of terminally ill patients by following the same guidelines adopted by medical personnel of HA. <p>Reply of the Administration that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) FHB and HA would conduct the study on their own. They would draw on experiences of overseas countries and invite related departments such as the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") to give inputs; and (b) HA had adopted internal guidelines regarding resuscitation since 1998 which were recently revamped as the Do-Not-Attempt Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation ("DNACPR") Guidelines. HA had consulted the Fire Services Department ("FSD") on the application of the Guidelines in an ambulance setting but FSD replied that it would not follow those Guidelines at this stage. 	
012412 - 012515	Sau Po Centre on Ageing, The University of Hong Kong Chairman	<p>Views of the deputation that the Administration should take the lead in coordinating different departments in the implementation of hospice care services and develop measurement tools to ensure delivery of quality services.</p>	
012516 - 013136	The Association of Parents of The Severely Mentally Handicapped	<p>Enquiries of the Association of Parents of The Severely Mentally Handicapped about whether the Social Welfare Department or HA would</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
	Administration Chairman	<p>follow up the directives on funeral and burial services for persons with intellectual disabilities after the death of their parents.</p> <p>Views/enquiries of the Chairman –</p> <p>(a) it was a pity that the Guidelines developed by HA were not followed by other relevant departments such as FSD; and</p> <p>(b) whether the study on hospice care to be undertaken by FHB would cover the guardianship system for mentally incapacitated persons, which was currently under the purview of LWB.</p> <p>Reply of the Administration that views of patients and their family members would be considered in the coming study, which would be an overall review of the scope of hospice care services and would not put forward specific proposal in regard to the guardianship system.</p> <p>Remarks of the Chairman that the Administration should expedite the review of hospice care services in view of the ageing population.</p>	
013137 - 014406	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Administration Chairman	<p>Enquiries/observations of Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration should provide a timetable for the study to be undertaken by FHB, and whether HA and LWB would allocate new funding for the provision of hospice care and end-of-life care services respectively;</p> <p>(b) currently NGOs might deploy existing resources from other areas to initiate hospice care services in the community; and for the way forward the Administration should allocate new resources for the provision of hospice care services;</p> <p>(c) the Administration should take into account the experiences of the five new contract RCHEs to map out its future provision of hospice care services in RCHEs; and</p> <p>(d) the Administration should increase the number of palliative care beds with reference to the number of patients with chronic or terminal diseases who had passed away in hospitals.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Reply of the Administration that –</p> <p>(a) FHB and HA would take one year to complete the study and would first decide the scope of study and develop a timeframe afterwards;</p> <p>(b) HA had been committed to seeking more funding for the provision of hospice care services. The number of palliative care beds did not reflect the whole picture of palliative care services since doctors specialized in palliative care would visit chronically or terminally ill patients in their wards, and home visits would be arranged for discharged patients if necessary. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration would provide international benchmarks regarding the provision of palliative care beds and the number of patients with chronic or terminal illness who had passed away in hospitals; and</p> <p>(c) LWB would continue to strengthen end-of-life care services in RCHEs, and would enhance related services through staff training and educating family members. It would draw experiences from the end-of-life care services provided in new contract care homes and would seek additional funding to cater for the needs of the ageing population.</p>	Admin
014407 - 014728	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong Chairman	Views that hospice care covered a wide range of services for both patients and their family members. More resources should be allocated in terms of publicity of palliative care in HA as well as enhancement of home-based support for the elderly to facilitate their wish for aging in place. Before additional funding could be obtained from the Administration, the Community Care Fund could offer assistance in respect of hospice care for the needy.	
014729 - 014814	Department of Social Work & Social Administration, The University of Hong Kong Chairman	Supplementary information by the deputation that according to international statistics, on the average the percentage of people passing away in hospitals and residential care homes were 60% and 40% respectively.	
014815 - 014850	The Association of Parents of The Severely Mentally Handicapped Chairman	Enquiries of the deputation about arranging a third party to take care of funeral and burial matters of persons with intellectual disabilities after the death of their parents.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
014851 - 015013	Mr LEE Siu-po Chairman	Mr LEE Siu-po's views on the monitoring of columbaria and funeral services.	
015014 - 015110	Administration Chairman	Reply of the Administration that it would relay the related views to FEHD and seek legal advice on issues relating to the provision of funeral and burial services for persons with intellectual disabilities after the death of their parents.	
015111 - 015744	Deputy Chairman Administration Chairman	<p>Views of the Deputy Chairman that the reasons why ambulance personnel of FSD did not follow the Guidelines might be due to their statutory duty to rescue people; and his enquiries about the hospice care services currently provided by private hospitals and the possibility of the inclusion of hospice care services in the service content of the new round of the Enhanced Home Community Care Services for the elderly.</p> <p>Reply of the Administration that doctors in private hospitals provided advice on hospice care in consultation with patients' family members and that the inclusion of hospice care services in community care services for the elderly was a more complicated issue than that for residential care services.</p> <p>Advice of the Chairman that –</p> <p>(a) given the wide spectrum of policy issues involved regarding hospice care services, the Joint Subcommittee would write to the Chief Secretary for Administration requesting the establishment of an inter-departmental committee under the purview of her office dedicated to formulate a comprehensive hospice care policy and coordinate the work of different bureaux/departments to improve the provision of hospice care for the needs of the ageing population; and</p> <p>(b) the Joint Subcommittee would also write to the Secretary for Security seeking the Administration's response to members' concerns regarding the application of the DNACPR Guidelines in an ambulance setting and the factors and legal responsibilities the Secretary would consider in deciding whether the Guidelines should be followed.</p>	<p>LegCo Secretariat</p> <p>LegCo Secretariat</p>
015745 – 020027	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Chairman	Concurrence of Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che on writing to the Chief Secretary for Administration.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		He considered that FHB should look into the complexities of cases such as funeral and burial arrangements for persons with intellectual disabilities and revert to members the outcome of its study.	
<i>Agenda items II and III — Item(s) for discussion at the next meeting & Any other business</i>			
020028 - 020210	Chairman	Date and agenda item of the next meeting Closing remarks of the Chairman that the Joint Subcommittee would complete its work in end-July 2014 and his proposal that the Joint Subcommittee should seek the support of the Panel on Welfare Services and the Panel on Health Services for priority allocation of a debate slot for him to move a motion on the Joint Subcommittee report at a Council meeting in the next session.	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 12 November 2014