

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)562/13-14
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/PS

Panel on Public Service

**Minutes of special meeting held on
Friday, 10 January 2014, at 10 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members attending : Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming

Member absent : Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Mr Paul TANG, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Raymond H C WONG, JP
Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Eddie MAK, JP
Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 1

Mr Peter CHAN, JP
Director of General Grades
Civil Service Bureau

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item I

Hong Kong Civil Servants General Union

Mr CHUNG Tak-cheung
Vice Chairman

Correctional Services Officers' Association

Mr CHENG Yuk-leung
Chairman (Junior Section)

Civil Servants & Subsidized Organizations
Committee, The Federation of Hong Kong &
Kowloon Labour Unions

Mr TANG Tak-ho
Convener

HKSAR Government Employees General Unions

Mr KONG Ming-chung
Chairperson

Union of Hong Kong Post Office Employees

Mr IP Kam-fu
Chairman

Hong Kong Immigration Department Staff Association

Mr WONG Tong-sing
Chairman

Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions

Mr LEUNG Chau-ting
CEO

Hong Kong Leisure Services Staff General Union

Mr CHEUNG Siu-wing
Chairman

Hong Kong Fire Services Department Staffs General Association

Mr NIP Yuen-fung
Deputy Chairman

Association of Customs & Excise Service Officers

Mr CHAN Cho
Chairperson

Immigration Service Officers Association

Mr NGAI Sik-shui
Chairman

Government Model Scale 1 Staff General Union

Mr TSUI Yat-keung
Committee Member

食環署員工分會

Mr CHEUNG Chi-wah
Chairman

Hong Kong Immigration Department Rank and
File General Union

Mr HUI Chi-hung, Charles
Chairman

Government Disciplined Services General Union

Mr LAM Kwok-ho
Chairman

Government Frontline Employees Union
Hawker Control Team Staff Branch

Mr WONG Ka-fai
Member

Disciplined Services Consultative Council

Mr CHAN Kin-lun
Staff Side Chairman

Hong Kong Correctional Services General Union

Mr LEE Siu-kai
Executive Committee Member

Hong Kong Immigration Assistants Union

Mr LAU Yuk-fai, Daniel
Chairperson

Labour Party

Mr TAM Chun-yin
Vice-Chairperson

Hong Kong Customs Officers Union

Mr Chan Ming
Chairman

Liberal Party

Mr Peter SIU
地區執行委員會港島區主席

Hong Kong Fire Services Officers Association

Mr MAK Kam-fai, Donny
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene
Department Staff Rights Union

Ms LI Mei-siu
Chairperson

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Mr SHEE Shing-chung, Eddie
Vice-President

Hong Kong Fire Services Control Staff's Union

Mr TAM Tat-chi
Vice Chairman

Police Force Council (Staff Side)

Mr CHAN Cho-kwong
Representative

Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

Ms LI Kwai-yin
Vice-President

A.G.T.S.O Working Group for TO(A) in Housing
Department

Mr LAU Wai-on, Raymond
Chairman

Hong Kong Fire Services Department
Ambulancemen's Union

Mr WAT Ki-on
Executive Director

Government Employees Association

Mr CHEUNG Wai-kuen
Rights Secretary

Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council (Staff
Side)

Ms LI Wai-yee
Chairman

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and
Progress of Hong Kong

Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan
Deputy Spokesperson of Public Service

Hong Kong Senior Government Officers
Association

Mr CHAN Sai-kwing
Chairman

Government Flying Service Aircraft Technicians
Union

Mr KWOK Tak-shun
Chairman

Government Educational Staff Union

Mr CHEUNG Kam-fai
Chairman

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (4)1

Staff in attendance : Ms Shirley CHAN
Senior Council Secretary (4)1

Ms Angela CHU
Council Secretary (4)1

Ms Linda MA
Legislative Assistant (4)1

Action

I. Manpower situation of the civil service and retirement age of civil servants

LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(01) -- Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

Welcoming remarks by the Chairman

1. The Chairman welcomed representatives from the Administration and the deputations to the special meeting. She reminded the deputations that, when addressing the Panel at the meeting, they were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) ("P&P") Ordinance (Cap. 382), and their written submissions were also not covered.

2. The Chairman said that apart from the 36 deputations attending the meeting, two organizations and one member of the public had provided written submissions as listed on the agenda of the meeting.

(Post meeting note: Subsequent to the meeting, the Panel has received written submissions from the following organizations –

(a) Submission from Government Frontline Employees Union (LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(05)); and

Action

(b) Submission from Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union (LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(04)).)

Presentation of views by deputations

3. A total of 36 deputations presented their views. An index of the proceedings was at the **Appendix**.

4. In gist, a majority of the deputations were supportive of extending the retirement age of civil servants. The deputations expressed the view that as the number of retiring civil servants would be on the rise in the next five to 10 years, extending the retirement age of civil servants could help solve the succession problem in the civil service and alleviate the manpower shortage problem in some bureaux/departments ("B/Ds"). They opined that if any scheme to extend the retirement age of civil servants was implemented, serving civil servants should be allowed to opt for such new scheme or their existing retirement entitlements. The Administration should consult civil servants on relevant concrete proposals as soon as practicable.

5. Some other deputations indicated that there was no consensual view on the matter within their organizations. A few other deputations did not support extending the retirement age of civil servants. These deputations opined that such arrangement would create blockage to the posting and promotion prospects of civil servants, and fewer new recruits would be joining the civil service thereby slackening the regeneration process within the civil service. To address the manpower shortage problem in B/Ds, the Administration should increase manpower provision rather than extending the retirement age of civil servants.

6. In respect of the manpower issue, a majority of the deputations expressed the view that the growth in civil service establishment since 2007-2008 was insufficient to cope with the expansion of services and increase in demand arising from various new policy initiatives and the significant growth of visitors etc. In addition, the recruitment freeze in the civil service in the early years of 2000s had created a manpower gap, resulting in the succession problems at present and the near future. They urged the Administration to strengthen the civil service establishment in order to address the manpower shortage problems in the civil service.

7. Some deputations also expressed concern on the engagement of non-civil service contract ("NCSC") staff, and urged the Administration to

Action

speed up the conversion of NCSC positions into civil service posts. There were also suggestions for improving the attractiveness of the remuneration package of specific grades so as to attract and retain staff.

The Administration's response to the deputations' views

8. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Secretary for the Civil Service ("SCS") made the following points in response to deputations' views -

- (a) In face of growing public expectation on the delivery of public service, the Administration would give due consideration to additional manpower needs of B/Ds for them to deliver effective services to the public. While conscious of the need for prudent management of public finance, new civil service posts would be created where fully justified by operational needs. Meanwhile, the Administration would explore measures to enhance efficiency, such as internal deployment, streamlining and re-engineering work procedures etc., so as to better utilize existing resources to cope with the additional workload.
- (b) Since 2007-2008, the civil service establishment had increased by about 1% annually. However, the "1%" should not be regarded as a cap set by the Administration on the annual growth of the civil service establishment. In fact, manpower support of some of the B/Ds, such as Housing Department and Customs and Excise Department, had increased by more than 1% each year in the past three financial years. Subject to the finalization of the 2014-2015 Budget and the approval by the Legislative Council, additional civil service posts would be provided for B/Ds to address their manpower needs.
- (c) As regards the issue of the engagement of NCSC staff, the scheme aimed at providing B/Ds with a flexible means of employment to respond rapidly to changing operational and service needs which were time-limited or seasonal; or which required staff to work less than conditioned hours of work; or where the mode of service delivery was under review or likely to be changed. It was inappropriate to create civil service posts to perform these specific duties which were not of a permanent nature. That said, CSB would work closely with

Action

B/Ds to identify NCSC positions which involved permanent service needs and could be converted into civil service posts. As at 30 June 2013, about 5 900 NCSC positions had been phased out and replaced by civil service posts.

- (d) It was expected that the wastage of civil servants would be higher in the coming years. That said, no serious succession problems were envisaged in general. The Administration had put in place a well-established mechanism to facilitate B/Ds in making early succession planning for individual grades and taking timely action where appropriate. In addition, B/Ds would continue to conduct recruitment and promotion exercises to fill vacancies arising from retirement and creation of new posts in a timely manner, and streamlining measures were in place to expedite the recruitment processes to meet the manpower needs of B/Ds more swiftly. In addition, under the existing mechanism, further employment might be offered, on an exceptional basis, to officers without a break in service beyond their retirement age for B/Ds to retain these officers for a specified period with a view to meeting special operational and/or succession needs.
- (e) The Administration noted that civil service jobs remained attractive in retaining and motivating staff, and in attracting persons of suitable calibre in joining the civil service. The turnover of civil servants remained stable and keen competition was seen for civil service jobs in general. In addition, salary surveys were conducted on a regular basis to ascertain whether civil service pay was broadly comparable to the private sector pay.
- (f) The proposal of extending the retirement age of civil servants was a complicated subject, entailing a wide spectrum of policy, operational and relevant issues (including manpower planning, public finance, promotion prospects of serving civil servants and employment prospects of job seekers), which needed to be carefully examined. CSB was conducting a study to assess the manpower and retirement situation in the civil service in the coming years, and to examine possible options for extending the service of civil servants taking into account the unique features and circumstances of the civil service system. The Administration aimed to complete the

Action

study around the first quarter of 2014, and would then consult the staff sides and other relevant stakeholders.

Discussion

Shortage of manpower in B/Ds

9. Taking note of the views expressed by the deputations working in the Immigration Department ("ImmD"), Ms Claudia MO said that the tremendous increase in the number of cross-border passengers had created immense work pressure for staff of ImmD. She expressed concern over the manpower situation in ImmD and enquired if the Administration had taken immediate measures to alleviate the situation.

10. SCS said that Security Bureau and ImmD had taken multi-pronged steps to address the manpower situation in ImmD. Firstly, around 400 civil service posts had been created in ImmD in the past three financial years to cope with the upsurge in workload. Secondly, in tandem with the increase of manpower provision, the department had also made use of service automation, such as eChannel, to help relieve the work pressure of frontline staff in carrying out immigration clearance duties at various control points. Thirdly, Customs & Excise Department ("C&ED") had engaged retired civil servants on NCSC terms to assist in export control of powdered formula. ImmD could make reference to C&ED's arrangement and engage retired civil servants on a contract basis for discharging duties which were seasonal or time-limited in nature, such as meeting service demands during peak periods. SCS further said that new civil service posts would be created in the coming financial year for B/Ds to deliver new or enhanced services to the public, details of which would be published in the 2014-2015 Budget.

11. The Chairman sought the views of the deputations working in ImmD on whether the measures highlighted by SCS could address the manpower shortage problem in ImmD. Mr NGAI Sik-shui, Chairman of the Immigration Service Officers Association, welcomed the Administration's proposal to increase the manpower of ImmD, as it was the most direct way to address the manpower shortage problem. The use of automation, such as eChannel, could only ease the work pressure of staff to some extent, as it could not totally replace human operation. He also expressed reservation on the re-employment of retired civil servants to undertake duties in ImmD on a short-term basis, as many of the tasks might

Action

involve the handling of sensitive and confidential information, and it would be difficult to ensure the quality of service delivery.

12. The Deputy Chairman expressed concern that the staff of some government departments had recently staged demonstrations to demand for increase in manpower provision and improvement in work conditions. He opined that although the Administration had expanded the civil service establishment by 1% annually since 2007-2008, the increase was clearly inadequate in meeting the manpower needs of some B/Ds. He urged the Administration to conduct a comprehensive review on the manpower needs of B/Ds. In reply, SCS said that for those B/Ds which had pressing manpower needs, the growth in their manpower establishment had been more than 1% annually in the past years. Taking into account the timeline of creation of new posts, B/Ds would plan ahead and conduct recruitment exercises to fill the vacancies in a timely manner. In the process, CSB would offer advice to B/Ds on any suggested ways to streamline the recruitment procedures where necessary. SCS further said that there was an established mechanism under which B/Ds would review their manpower situation and submit their manpower requests in the annual resource allocation exercise. The Administration would consider, on one hand, the operational needs of B/Ds in meeting new and improved service demands, and on the other hand, the prudent use of public funds and the long-term impact on public finance.

13. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan held the view that there was in fact a pre-determined "1%" cap set on the annual growth of the civil service establishment. He said that some of the B/Ds had already withheld the provision of certain public services because of the shortage of manpower. Referring to the commentaries made by some media recently that the Financial Secretary was planning to set up a "future fund" with an intention to curb the growth of public services, he sought clarification from SCS in this regard. SCS said that no pre-determined ceiling had been set on the civil service establishment, and new posts would be created where fully justified by operational needs. In some situations, B/Ds might need to adjust its work priorities for better utilization of its limited resources in meeting competing demands for public services, or to meet the relevant services by re-deployment of staff or through alternative modes of delivery. With regard to the setting up of a "future fund" mentioned by Mr LEE, SCS said that it was inappropriate for him to comment on media commentaries.

14. Noting that the current labour market was tight with a strong labour demand, Mr KWOK Kwai-keung opined that it was difficult to attract and

Action

retain persons of good calibre, causing brain drain problems and a shortage of manpower in certain grades in the civil service. He suggested the Administration should consider offering a more competitive remuneration package than the private sector to attract talents to join the civil service and to retain staff.

15. Mr YICK Chi-ming said that to address the manpower shortage problem, B/Ds could consider ways to ensure a more efficient use of manpower, such as streamlining and re-engineering of work processes. It was necessary to adopt a more prudent approach in considering the expansion of the civil service establishment, as it involved the use of public money. He did not agree to the suggestion of increasing the salary of civil servants to solve the manpower shortage problem. He was also worried that such an increase would have a direct impact on the overall salary level in various sectors, causing the operating costs of small and medium enterprises to increase and thus weakening their competitiveness in face of a highly competitive business environment.

16. SCS said that there was no brain drain problem in the civil service. The turnover rate of civil servants was relatively stable and had been at a low level. Also, civil service jobs remained attractive to job seekers, as evidenced by the large number of job applications being received in each of the recruitment exercises conducted in recent years. To alleviate the immense work pressure faced by some of the B/Ds, apart from increasing their staff establishment, the relevant B/Ds might also revisit work priorities and engage retired civil servants to meet short-term service needs. As regards the salary level of civil servants, SCS said that it was the Administration's pay policy to maintain civil service pay broadly comparable to the private sector pay. It was inappropriate to offer civil servants a remuneration package over and above the private sector level. Also, salary increase might not be the most effective way to attract and retain staff, but rather, the stability of civil service posts and the mission of serving the public could be a better drive and motivation for attracting and retaining staff.

Extending the retirement age of civil servants

17. Noting that CSB was conducting a study to examine possible options for extending the service of civil servants, the Deputy Chairman asked when the findings of the study would be released for consultation with civil servants. The Chairman urged the Administration to release the findings of the study as soon as practicable and remarked that the study

Action

would have a great impact on public bodies and the private sector. SCS said that the study was expected to be completed around the first quarter of 2014, and CSB would then consult the staff sides and other relevant stakeholders. The Administration also planned to report the major findings of the study and its proposals to the Panel on Public Service in the second quarter of 2014.

18. Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that there would be an increasing number of civil servants retiring in the coming decade, resulting in succession problems in the civil service. He asked whether CSB would consider setting up a dedicated taskforce to review the retirement and succession situation in the civil service. SCS replied that the Administration had taken a number of measures to facilitate succession planning in the civil service. B/Ds would continue to plan ahead and conduct recruitment and promotion exercises in good time with a view to filling vacancies arising from retirement in a timely manner and ensuring smooth succession. In this connection, a well-established mechanism had been put in place for B/Ds to regularly review the succession situation in individual departments and grades, with a view to facilitating early identification of any succession problems, and timely implementation of suitable measures to address them. In addition, where necessary, B/Ds could further employ civil servants beyond their retirement age for a specified period so as to meet special operational and/or succession needs. With the above measures, there was no need to set up a dedicated task force in CSB to deal with the matter.

19. Ms Emily LAU sought the views of the deputations on whether they supported extending the retirement age of civil servants. Mr TANG Tak-ho, Convenor of the Civil Servants and Subsidized Organizations Committee of the Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Unions, said that staff of Model Scale 1 grade welcomed extending the retirement age of civil servants, as the monthly pension they received after retirement could hardly sustain their living. Mr LEUNG Chau-ting, CEO of Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions, and Mr CHAN Kin-lum, Staff Side Chairman of Disciplined Services Consultative Council, said that for civil servants appointed on or after 1 June 2000, they could withdraw the accrued benefits attributable to the mandatory contributions under the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Ordinance (“MPFSO”) only upon reaching the age of 65. As the present normal retirement age was 60 for civilian grades and 57 for disciplined services grades, there would be a gap of 5 to 8 years. They expressed support to extending the retirement age of civil servants.

Action

20. Mr TSUI Yat-keung, Committee Member of Government Model Scale 1 Staff General Union, said that extending the retirement age of civil servants would help the Government to save on the amount of pension given out to eligible retiring civil servants on pensionable terms. Mr CHEUNG Kam-fai, Chairman of Government Educational Staff Union, said that the most direct way of solving manpower shortage problem was to increase manpower provision, rather than extending the retirement age of civil servants. The Administration should also review the relevant provisions in MPFSO to allow earlier withdrawal of benefits accrued attributable to the mandatory contributions to tie in with the present retirement age of civil servants.

21. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that in face of an ageing population and a dwindling labour force, there was a need for the Administration to review the retirement age of civil servants. As the normal retirement age for civil servants from the disciplined services was 55 or 57 at present, many of them welcomed the suggestion of extending their retirement age, as they were still physically fit for work. As the issue involved different considerations, he suggested the Administration fully consult civil servants and relevant stakeholders on the options identified from the study. SCS responded that the study sought to assess the manpower and retirement situation in the civil service as a whole, including both civilian and disciplined services grades, in coming years. The Administration was fully aware of the importance of engaging civil servants on this important subject and would consult the staff sides and other relevant stakeholders before deciding on the way forward and the implementation details.

22. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that he held a contrary view and considered that people should be entitled to enjoy their retirement. He did not support the suggestion of extending people's work life for sustaining their living after reaching their retirement age and considered that this would adversely affect the advancement of younger civil servants. He opined that the wage level and the retirement protection scheme should offer adequate financial support in maintaining people's living after their retirement.

23. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan asked for the reasons why government school teachers had to retire immediately upon reaching the age of 60, instead of allowing them to retire at the end of the school year during which they reached the age of 60. He said that the current arrangement might cause interruptions to school teaching. SCS undertook to provide a written

Admin

Action

response in consultation with the Education Bureau after the meeting.

II. Any other business

24. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
14 April 2014

Panel on Public Service
on Friday, 10 January 2014, at 10:00am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
000354-000546	Chairman	Opening remarks
000550-000857	Mr CHUNG Tak-cheung, Vice Chairman Hong Kong Civil Servants General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(13)
000902-001123	Mr CHENG Yuk-leung, Chairman (Junior Section) Correctional Services Officers' Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(01)
001134-001416	Mr TANG Tak-ho, Convenor Civil Servants & Subsidized Organizations Committee, The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(02)
001425-001723	Mr KONG Ming-chung, Chairperson HKSAR Government Employees General Unions	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(03)
001730-001941	Mr IP Kam-fu, Chairman Union of Hong Kong Post Office Employees	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(01)
001949-002156	Mr WONG Tong-sing, Chairman Hong Kong Immigration Department Staff Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(04)
002205-002512	Mr LEUNG Chau-ting, CEO Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions	Presentation of views that - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Nearly 6 years of recruitment freeze in the civil service in the early years of 2000s had created a manpower gap, leading to succession problems at present. ● Extending the retirement age of civil servants could alleviate the manpower shortage problems in some B/Ds. ● Civil servants of the basic ranks welcomed the extension of retirement age of civil servants

		because many of them still had to support families financially, and the pensions they received upon retirement were insufficient to sustain a living.
002521-002827	Mr CHEUNG Siu-wing, Chairman Hong Kong Leisure Services Staff General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(02)
002835-003058	Mr NIP Yuen-fung, Deputy Chairman Hong Kong Fire Services Department Staffs General Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(02)
003104-003418	Mr CHAN Cho, Chairperson Association of Customs & Excise Service Officers	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(03)
003425-003730	Mr NGAI Sik-shui, Chairman Immigration Service Officers Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(04)
003740-003940	Mr TSUI Yat-keung, Committee Member Government Model Scale 1 Staff General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(05)
003948-004118	Mr CHEUNG Chi-wah, Chairman 食環署員工分會	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(04)
004129-004349	Mr HUI Chi-hung Charles, Chairman Hong Kong Immigration Department Rank and File General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(04)
004357-004700	Mr LAM Kwok-ho, Chairman Government Disciplined Services General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(06)
004726-004952	Mr WONG Ka-fai, Member Government Frontline Employees Union, Hawker Control Team Staff Branch	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(06)
005002-005306	Mr CHAN Kin-lun, Staff Side Chairman Disciplined Services Consultative Council	Presentation of views that – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Civil servants appointed on or after 1 June 2000 generally enjoyed less favourable fringe benefits and retirement benefits. This, coupled with growing public expectations on public service delivery and

		<p>increasing workload, had created brain drain problems in the civil service.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● It normally took at least 12 months for new recruits in the disciplined services to be able to discharge their duties effectively, taking into account the training time needed. This had created undue work pressure for staff in face of the retirement of their counterparts. ● Civil servants in the disciplined services supported an extension of retirement age on a voluntary basis.
005315-005614	Mr LEE Siu-kai, Executive Committee Member Hong Kong Correctional Services General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(06)
005624-005903	Mr LAU Yuk-fai Daniel, Chairperson Hong Kong Immigration Assistants Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(04)
005909-010218	Mr TAM Chun-yin, Vice-Chairperson Labour Party	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The growth in civil service establishment in recent years were insufficient to cope with the expansion of and increased demand for public services. ● The ratio of civil servants to total population (including mobile population) was decreasing. ● Increasing manpower provision and extending the retirement age of civil servants would solve the manpower shortage problem and facilitate the transfer of knowledge/skills from retiring civil servants to their successors.
010225-010517	Mr Chan Ming, Chairman Hong Kong Customs Officers Union	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Manpower provision in ImmD was insufficient to cope with the increase in workload. ● The Union supported extending the retirement age of civil servants on a voluntary basis, and the Government should consult civil servants on the

		options identified as soon as practicable.
010522-010828	Mr Peter SIU, 地區執行委員會 港島區主席, Liberal Party	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(03)
010835-011118	Mr MAK Kam-fai Donny, Vice-Chairman Hong Kong Fire Services Officers Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(07)
011127-011443	Ms LI Mei-siu, Chairperson Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene Department Staff Rights Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)302/13-14(01)
011452-011705	Mr SHEE Shing-chung Eddie, Vice-President Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(04)
011716-012025	Mr TAM Tat-chi, Vice Chairman Hong Kong Fire Services Control Staff's Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)302/13-14(02)
012033-012351	Mr CHAN Cho-kwong, Representative Police Force Council (Staff Side)	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(08)
012359-012729	Ms LI Kwai-yin, Vice-President Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)289/13-14(07)
012744-013111	Mr LAU Wai-on Raymond, Chairman A.G.T.S.O Working Group for TO(A) in Housing Department	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(09)
013117-013425	Mr WAT Ki-on, Executive Director Hong Kong Fire Services Department Ambulancemen's Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)278/13-14(10)&(11)
013435-013746	Mr CHEUNG Wai-kuen, Secretary Government Employees Association Rights	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)302/13-14(03)]
013754-014119	Ms LI Wai-ye, Chairman Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council (Staff Side)	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(05)

014126-014448	Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan, Deputy Spokesperson of Public Service, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views that – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Hong Kong people's life expectancy was getting longer, and it was opportune to explore extension of retirement age. ● Extending the retirement age of civil servants would help solve succession problems, and could be rolled out in the disciplined services first.
014454-014801	Mr CHAN Sai-kwing, Chairman Hong Kong Senior Government Officers Association	Presentation of views that – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Extending the retirement age of civil servants could help solve succession problems and facilitate the transfer of knowledge and skills from retiring civil servants to their successors. However, the extension should not affect promotion prospects of existing civil servants and the creation of new civil service posts to cope with the demand for existing and new services. ● As there would be a large number of civil servants retiring in the next 10 years, CSB should strengthen the training for civil servants at all levels, and increase manpower provisions to meet growing demand for public services.
014810-015051	Mr KWOK Tak-shun, Chairman Government Flying Service Aircraft Technicians Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)425/13-14(06)
015059-015428	Mr CHEUNG Kam-fai, Chairman Government Educational Staff Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)302/13-14(04) and CB(4)425/13-14(04)