

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1060/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/PS

Panel on Public Service

**Minutes of meeting held on
Monday, 21 July 2014, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members absent** : Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
- Member attending** : Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item III**

Mr Paul TANG, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Eddie MAK, JP
Acting Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service

Agenda item IV

Mr Paul TANG, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Eddie MAK, JP
Acting Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service

Ms Vivian CHEUNG
Acting Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 3

Attendance by invitation : Agenda item III

New People's Party

Mr KAM Man-fung
Member of Central Committee

Hong Kong Fire Services Control Staff's Union

Mr CHAN Kin-lun, Kenneth
Chairman

HKSAR Government Employees General Union

Mr KONG Ming-chung
Chairperson

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan
Deputy Spokesperson of Civil Services

Hong Kong Leisure Services Staff General Union

Mr CHEUNG Siu-wing
Chairman

Liberal Party

Mr Peter SIU
District Councillor

Civil Servants & Subsidized Organizations
Committee, The Federation of Hong Kong &
Kowloon Labour Unions

Mr TANG Tak-ho
Chairperson

Government Model Scale 1 Staff General
Union

Mr TSUI Yat-keung
Vice Chairman

政府第一標準薪級員工總會
食環署二級工人分會

Mr CHEUNG Chi-wah
Chairman

Mr NG Long-sang, Henry

Mr FUNG Kei-lap, Michael

Hong Kong Customs Officers Union

Mr CHAN Kwong-kwong
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Correctional Services General
Union

Mr LEE Siu-kai
Executive member

Hong Kong Fire Services Department Staffs
General Association

Mr NIP Yuen-fung
Chairman

Government Frontline Employees Union
Hawker Control Team Staff Branch

Mr WONG Ka-fai
Member

Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council
(Staff Side)

Mr LEUNG Tat-wah
Vice-chairman

Government Electrical & Mechanical Works
Supervisors, Craftsmen & Workmen Association

Mr LEE Yau-tong
副會務主任

Immigration Service Officers Association

Mr NGAI Sik-shui
Chairman

Hong Kong Food & Environmental Hygiene
Department Staff Rights Union

Mr WONG Tsin-hing
Member

Association of Customs and Excise Service
Officers

MR CHAN Cho
Chairman

Hong Kong Immigration Assistants Union

Mr LAU Yuk-fai, Daniel
Chairman

The Junior Police Officers' Association of the
Hong Kong Police Force, Police Force Council
(Staff Side)

Mr CHAN Cho-kwong
Chairman

Government Employees Association

Mr Steven TSE
Rights Officer

Disciplined Services Consultative Council
(Staff Side)

Mr CHENG Yuk-leung
Chairman

Working Group for TO(A) in Housing
Department

Mr LAM Chun-pang
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Fire Services Department
Ambulancemen's Union

Mr KO Siu-kei
Committee member

Government Disciplined Services General
Union

Mr MAK Kam-fai
Chairman

Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

Mr TSOI Tak-man
Deputy Secretary General

Hong Kong Fire Services Officers Association

Mr CHUNG Chi-kong
Honorary Secretary

Hong Kong Senior Government Officers Association

Mr CHAN Sai-kwing
Chairman

Hong Kong Civil Servants General Union

Mr YUNG Kai-wing
Vice Chairman (Negotiation)

Clerk in attendance : Ms Shirley CHAN
Chief Council Secretary (4)1

Staff in attendance : Ms Wendy JAN
Senior Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Angela CHU
Council Secretary (4)1

Ms Prima LAI
Legislative Assistant (4)1

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes

LC Paper No. CB(4)931/13-14 -- Minutes of meeting
held on 19 May 2014

The minutes of the meeting held on 19 May 2014 were confirmed.

II. Information paper issued since the last meeting

LC Paper No. CB(4)881/13-14(01) -- Administration's response to the submission from a staff member of Clerical Grades on posting arrangement for Clerical Grades

LC Paper No. CB(4)889/13-14(01) -- Submission from the Hong Kong Fire Services Department Ambulancemen's Union on meal break arrangement for the Ambulanceman Grade (Chinese version only)

LC Paper No. CB(4)921/13-14(01) -- Submission from staff members of the Proof Reader Grade in the Government Logistics Department on the conditioned hours of work for different ranks of the Proof Reader Grade (Chinese version only)

2. Members noted that the above papers had been issued since the last meeting.

3. Regarding LC Paper No. CB(4)889/13-14(01), the Chairman informed members that the item on "Meal break arrangement for the Ambulanceman Grade in the Fire Services Department" had been included in the Panel's "List of outstanding items for discussion".

4. On LC Paper No. CB(4)921/13-14(01), the Chairman informed members that the Administration had been requested to provide a written response on the conditioned hours of work for different ranks of the Proof Reader Grade. The Administration's reply was awaited.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response on the issue raised in the submission was issued to members on 1 August 2014 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)986/13-14.)

III. Consultation on extension of the service of civil servants

LC Paper No. CB(4)571/13-14(05)	--	Administration's paper on consultation on extension of the service of civil servants
---------------------------------	----	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(01)	--	Paper on consultation on extension of the service of civil servants prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)
---------------------------------	----	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

A late request for making an oral representation at the meeting

5. The Chairman gave permission for Mr YUNG Kai-wing, the Vice Chairman of the Hong Kong Civil Servants General Union, to present views at the meeting.

Welcoming remarks by the Chairman

6. The Chairman welcomed representatives from the Administration and deputations to the meeting. She reminded deputations that when

addressing the Panel at the meeting, they were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), and their written submissions were also not covered.

Presentation of views by deputations

7. Members received views from a total of 31 deputations/individuals at the meeting. An index of proceedings was at **the Appendix**. Members also noted the submissions from two organizations and two members of the public not attending the meeting. Their submissions were listed on the agenda of the meeting.

8. In gist, a majority of the deputations/individuals supported extending the service of civil servants. They were of the view that the extension could address the problems associated with an ageing population and a shrinking labour force in the next twenty years, succession problems in the civil service, and the outflow of experienced civil servants to other organizations.

9. Citing the situation where civil servants appointed before 1 July 1987 on the Old Pension Scheme were provided with option to transfer to the New Pension Scheme ("NPS") when the latter was introduced in 1987, under which the retirement age of civilian civil servants was extended from 55 to 60, some deputations opined that serving civil servants should be allowed to extend their retirement age on a voluntary basis if they so wished, rather than on a need and selective basis decided by management of bureaux/departments ("B/Ds"). They said that civil servants on pensionable terms, especially those at junior ranks, could hardly sustain a living with the meagre pensions they received upon

retirement. On the other hand, civil servants on the Civil Service Provident Fund ("CSPF") Scheme could only withdraw their accrued benefits derived from the mandatory contributions under the Scheme upon reaching the age of 65, and thus they had to live on their savings before the age of 65. These civil servants had a strong call for extending their retirement age.

10. As regards the initiative for adopting a higher retirement age for civil service new recruits as from a future date, some deputations said it was unfair that the retirement age for new recruits of all the disciplined services grades was proposed to be extended from 55 to 57, which might be further extended to 60 subject to an annual suitability assessment, while the retirement age for new recruits of the civilian grades was proposed to be extended from 60 to 65 without the need of assessment. Some deputations opined that civil servants of all the disciplined services grades should be offered the right to work until the age of 60 without the need to undergo annual suitability assessment.

11. The Hong Kong Fire Services Department Ambulancemen's Union did not support adopting a higher retirement age for new recruits of the disciplined services grades. However, it did not object to allowing serving civil servants of the disciplined services grades to opt to work beyond their retirement age. It opined that given the immense workload and pressure the frontline ambulancemen were facing at work, it was not possible for them to extend their service beyond the age of 55 without sacrificing the quality of service provided to the public. The representative of the Union urged the Administration to improve the conditions of service of frontline ambulancemen, including the provision of an uninterrupted meal break.

12. In respect of the proposed initiatives for making suitable adjustments to the further employment mechanism and introducing a new Post-retirement Service Contract ("PRSC") Scheme, some deputations worried that the selection and vetting of applications by management of B/Ds might give rise to cronyism, and urged the Administration to devise clear and transparent guidelines for the selection process. Some deputations also worried that the frontline civil servants might be excluded from the initiatives as the management of B/Ds might choose officers of senior ranks for further employment. To ensure the quality of service provided to the public, these deputations urged the Administration to further employ experienced frontline civil servants beyond their retirement age.

The Administration's response to the deputations' views

13. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Secretary for the Civil Service ("SCS") made the following points in response to deputations' views –

- (a) Based on the findings of a study conducted by the Civil Service Bureau ("CSB") to assess the manpower and retirement situation in the civil service in the coming years, the number of civil servants who would retire in the coming years up to 2022-23 would increase, but the number was expected to decline thereafter. In general, anticipated vacancies for most grades in the civil service could be filled by promotion and recruitment. However, a few professional and technical grades which had a small establishment with higher wastage up to 2022-23 and/or

faced keen competition for talents from the private sector might require more flexibility to address succession problems and/or recruitment difficulties, and hence the need for considering further employment of civil servants beyond retirement age to meet specific operational and/or succession needs. The Administration saw merits in introducing flexible retirement and employment initiatives to provide Heads of Grade/Heads of Department ("HoGs/HoDs") with more flexibility to extend the service of serving civil servants beyond retirement age to address different operational and/or succession needs of individual grades/departments at different times. A service-wide extension of the retirement age of serving civil servants on a voluntary basis might adversely affect the promotion prospects of younger officers and injection of new blood into the civil service, which would not be conducive to good civil service management.

- (b) Applications for further employment should be subject to a selection process by the management. Under the existing mechanism, further employment might be offered to a pensionable officer beyond retirement age on an exceptional basis. The management of respective grades/departments would take into account all relevant factors, including well justified operational and/or succession needs and other justifiable circumstances in processing the applications and seek prior approval/endorsement from CSB and/or advice of the Public Service Commission ("PSC") as appropriate. Subject to the outcome of the consultation, CSB would

issue guidelines on the approval criteria for further employment mechanism to ensure that applications would continue to be handled through a transparent and objective selection process, and only be approved where the relevant conditions were met.

- (c) Civil servants on CSPF Scheme might withdraw the accrued benefits attributable to the Government's voluntary contributions under the CSPF Scheme upon leaving the civil service at the prescribed retirement age. Furthermore, early withdrawal of accrued benefits derived from mandatory contributions pursuant to the Mandatory Provident Fund Scheme Ordinance ("MPFSO") (Cap. 485) before age 65 might be permissible for those who ceased employment after reaching the age 60.

- (d) In order to keep pace with the demographic challenges arising from an aging population and a shrinking labour force, the Administration had proposed the initiative of adopting a higher retirement age for civil service new recruits as from a future date. It was inappropriate to compare the proposed initiative with the pension schemes arrangements introduced in the 1980s as both the context and circumstances were completely different. Under the proposed initiative, new recruits of the disciplined services grades could extend their services up to the age of 60, subject to an annual suitability assessment based on both physical fitness and work performance after the age of 57. Such assessment was proposed taking into account the unique job nature and physical requirements of the

disciplined services grades, and the fact that a person's physical fitness would likely to be affected by age.

- (e) The Administration would carefully study the views and suggestions collected through the consultation and further examine the relevant issues including the financial implication of the proposals. There was no concrete timetable for the implementation of the proposals at the moment.
- (f) The Fire Services Department and the Security Bureau were following up on the issues raised by the Hong Kong Fire Services Department Ambulancemen's Union regarding the meal break arrangements for the frontline ambulancemen.

Discussion

Retirement age of serving civil servants

14. Noting that some of the serving civil servants would like to extend their retirement age, the Chairman asked why the Administration did not pay heed to their requests. SCS replied that the proposed initiatives for making suitable adjustments to the further employment mechanism and introducing a new PRSC Scheme sought to provide HoGs/HoDs with more flexibility to retain experienced officers where necessary to meet their different operational and/or succession needs at different times in the face of the higher wastage of civil servants in the coming years. A service-wide extension of the retirement age of serving civil servants on a voluntary basis might not be conducive to manpower planning as this

might lead to manpower mismatch between the expertise required by grades/departments and the skill-sets of those who were willing to serve beyond their retirement age. It would also adversely affect the promotion prospects of younger civil servants and injection of new blood into the civil service.

15. In reply to the Chairman's further enquiry, SCS said that amendments to the legislation governing civil service pensions would be required if a service-wide extension of the retirement age of serving civil servants, including those on pensionable terms, were to be implemented. At present, the Administration did not see any need to introduce changes to the retirement benefits system for serving civil servants.

16. Given that the proposed initiatives for adjusting the further employment mechanism and introducing a new PRSC Scheme would be applied to serving civil servants beyond their normal retirement age on a need and selective basis, Mr TANG Ka-piu expressed concerns that civil servants at junior ranks would not benefit from these initiatives since no succession problems or recruitment difficulties were envisaged for those ranks. He was doubtful whether frontline civil servants could sustain their living after retirement on the meagre retirement benefits they received, and urged the Administration to consider allowing civil servants at junior ranks to extend their service after retirement on a voluntary basis.

17. In reply, SCS said that the proposed retirement and employment initiatives were applicable to all civil servants irrespective of their ranks, subject to the relevant conditions being met, including well justified operational and/or succession needs. In addition, one of the new

initiatives proposed by the Administration was to streamline the control regime of post-service employment for non-directorate civil servants at junior ranks so that blanket permission could be given to these frontline and supporting civil servants if they wished to pursue post-retirement career. As regards retirement benefits for civil servants, SCS said that the Government's retirement benefits system was considered reasonable and attractive.

Mechanism on further employment of serving civil servants

18. Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Mr LEUNG che-cheung said that the Government should devise an open and fair mechanism for further employment of serving civil servants beyond their retirement age. They enquired what measures the Administration would take to enhance the transparency of the mechanism so as to inhibit the development of a cronyism culture in the civil service. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that serving civil servants should be given an option to choose whether to extend their retirement age or not, provided that such extension would not create undue promotion blockage to younger civil servants.

19. SCS responded that under the existing mechanism, stringent approval criteria were adopted under which further employment would only be offered on an exceptional basis subject to the relevant conditions being met, including well justified operational and/or succession needs, good performance and physical fitness of the officers concerned, no undue promotion blockage, etc. Prior approval/endorsement from CSB and/or advice of PSC would need to be sought as appropriate. Taking into account the views and suggestions received through the consultation, the Administration would further consider appropriate measures to ensure

that applications for further employment would continue to be subject to a transparent and objective selection process, e.g. the option of requiring respective B/Ds to set up selection panel for the purpose of considering such applications, and issuing further guidelines on the approval criteria for further employment .

20. Mr SIN Chung-kai opined that further employment of serving civil servants should be offered on a selective basis. Instead of conducting a formal selection interview, he suggested the Administration making reference to certain objective criteria, such as the performance appraisals and sick leave records of the civil servants concerned in making the decisions. SCS took note of Mr SIN's suggestion and said that the Administration would ensure that handling of applications for further employment would continue to be subject to a transparent and objective selection process.

Succession problems and shortage of manpower in the civil service

21. Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that a large number of civil servants would be retiring in the next 10 years. He enquired what measures the Administration would take to solve the succession problems. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung said that civil servants were facing ever-increasing work pressure. The increase in civil service establishment, however, could not meet the increasing demand for new or improved services to the public. Given that the proposals did not seek to extend the retirement age of civil servants across the board, he asked what measures the Administration would take to address the manpower problems in the civil service.

22. SCS responded that a well-established mechanism was in place to facilitate B/Ds in making early planning for succession in the civil service and taking timely action where necessary. Under the mechanism, regular review of the succession situation in individual departments was conducted to ensure early identification of any succession problems, advance planning and timely implementation of suitable measures. For individual grades having possible succession problems, the proposed initiatives would provide B/Ds with more flexibility to retain experienced officers beyond retirement to meet their different operational and/or succession needs. As regards the heavy workload of civil servants, new civil service posts would be created where justified to meet the demand for new or improved public services.

23. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung opined that succession problems in the civil service were largely attributable to the six years of open recruitment freeze from 1999-2000 to 2006-2007 and the extensive use of non-civil service contract ("NCSC") staff. He considered that civil servants should enjoy their retirement life, but because of insufficient retirement protection, they would have to work longer to sustain a reasonable standard of living after retirement. To provide civil servants with better retirement protection, he suggested the Administration to consider resuming the pension schemes for all civil servants.

24. SCS replied that over the years, B/Ds had kept the employment situation of NCSC staff under regular review, and sought to replace the NCSC positions with established long-term service needs by civil service posts where appropriate. Generally speaking, the retirement benefits offered under the CSPF Scheme to civil servants who were appointed on or after 1 June 2000 remained attractive. The Administration did not see

the case to resume the pension schemes for all civil servants. In reply to Mr LEUNG's further enquiry on retirement benefits for NCSC staff, SCS said that NCSC staff were covered under the Mandatory Provident Fund Scheme in accordance with the MPFSO. Since civil service and NCSC appointments were two distinct types of employment, it was inappropriate to directly compare the terms and conditions of service between the two types of appointments.

Implementation timetable

25. The Deputy Chairman enquired about the timetable for implementing the proposals. SCS replied that after taking into account the feedback and suggestions received through the consultation and further examination of relevant issues including the financial implications of the proposals, the Administration would decide on the way forward and work out the implementation details as well as timetable. The Administration did not have a concrete timetable for implementing the proposals at the moment. The Administration would report the work progress to the Panel in the next legislative session.

IV. Integrity enhancement initiatives for civil servants

(LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(14) -- Administration's paper on integrity enhancement initiatives for civil servants

LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(15) -- Paper on integrity enhancement initiatives for civil servants prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

(updated background
brief))

26. SCS briefed members on the salient points of the Administration's paper on the integrity enhancement initiatives for civil servants. He said that CSB and the Independent Commission Against Corruption ("ICAC") had been working closely throughout the years with B/Ds to promote and enhance integrity in the civil service through a three-pronged approach, namely, prevention, education and training, and sanction, and that the overall corruption scene in the civil service had remained generally stable and under control over the years.

Key indicators of corruption in the civil service

27. Ms Claudia MO commented that although the number of civil servants convicted of corruption-related offences in 2013 was relatively small (i.e. 11 civil servants representing about 0.01% of all civil servants) as compared to the size of the civil service, what mattered should be the nature of the offences committed by individual civil servants. She cited examples of two former top government officials who had involved in corruption allegations, and said that those two cases had already damaged the public's confidence in the Administration and tarnished the image of ICAC. She further said that the low popularity of the Government and the culture of cronyism might have discouraged the public from lodging complaints with the ICAC, and these might be the reason for the significant drop in the number of civil servants referred by ICAC to B/Ds for consideration of disciplinary or administrative action in 2013 (i.e. from 126 in 2012 to 39 in 2013).

28. Mr SIN Chung-kai said that the number of alleged corruption reports/complaints against civil servants received by ICAC had remained stable from 2009 to 2012, but had dropped significantly in 2013 (i.e. from 1 192 in 2012 to 809 in 2013). Such situation might be attributable to the loss of public confidence in ICAC or an actual drop in the number of corruption cases involving civil servants. He asked whether CSB would conduct an independent study to find out the reason for such significant drop of the number of alleged corruption reports/complaints against civil servants.

29. SCS responded that while he would not comment on individual cases, he understood that recent corruption allegations against some former top government officials had aroused wide public concern and might have caused civil servants some worries. Yet, the Administration had made extra effort in promoting the importance of integrity in the civil service through education, and ICAC would continue to take effective enforcement actions against corruption. SCS said that the Administration would keep in view the corruption scene in the civil service. He, however, did not consider it necessary at this stage for CSB to conduct a study as suggested by Mr SIN as the number of alleged corruption did fluctuate and a longer period should be observed.

30. Noting that all the key indicators of corruption in the civil service had dropped in 2013, Mr TANG Ka-piu hoped that the Administration could provide the indicators for 2014 to the Panel when they were available so that members could have a better picture to examine the reasons for the drop in the indicators.

Admin

31. Referring to the corruption allegation relating to the acceptance of deferred benefits by a retired civil servant of the Civil Aviation Department (“CAD”), Mr TANG Ka-piu asked for the number of corruption cases relating to the acceptance of deferred benefits by civil servants in the past. SCS replied that the Administration would provide information to the Panel regarding the CAD case. As for the availability of statistics relating to the acceptance of deferred benefits, CSB would check with ICAC.

32. Regarding the 39 civil servants referred by ICAC to B/Ds for consideration of disciplinary or administrative action in 2013, the Deputy Chairman asked for a breakdown by B/Ds and grades of these civil servants. SCS undertook to provide the Panel with the information after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response to members' requests in paragraphs 31 to 32 above was circulated to members vide LC Paper No.CB(4)1059/13-14(01) on 15 September 2014.)

Political neutrality and integrity of civil servants

33. Ms Emily LAU said that under the current political environment, civil servants and politically appointed officials were facing great pressure in performing their duties. In this connection, she requested the Administration to explain how civil servants could uphold their political neutrality, integrity and professionalism in performing their duties.

34. SCS responded that while politically appointed officials were to assume political responsibilities for various policy decisions, civil servants had the administrative responsibilities to tender impartial,

professional and objective advice and carry through the policy decisions. Although civil servants sometimes encountered difficulties in the course of implementing Government policies, they would continue to uphold their political neutrality, integrity and professionalism in performing their duties.

35. On Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's concern about the difficulties that civil servants might face in maintaining their integrity, SCS said that civil servants would always uphold the civil service core values, including political neutrality and integrity in discharging their duties.

The practice of cross-leasing flats by civil servants in the past

36. Referring to the case where two former government officials were convicted of housing allowance swindle, Mr WONG Kwok-hing pointed out that a former SCS had made public statements indicating that the practice of cross-leasing flats was legal and common among civil servants in the 1980s. In order to ease the mind of serving civil servants who had in the past claimed housing allowance by cross-leasing their flats, Mr WONG requested SCS to clarify whether the practice of cross-leasing flats was legal or in breach of any regulations.

37. SCS said that he would not comment on individual cases. In response to Mr WONG's question, SCS confirmed that the practice of cross-leasing flats by civil servants did not contravene the rules of the Private Tenancy Allowance Scheme. However, civil servants were not allowed to claim for such tenancy allowance for living in a flat that was actually owned by themselves.

Civil Service Provident Fund Scheme

38. In response to Mr TANG Ka-piu's enquiry, SCS explained that at present, retired civil servants on CSPF Scheme might withdraw the accrued benefits attributable to the Government's voluntary contributions upon leaving the civil service at the prescribed retirement age. The accrued benefits attributable to mandatory contributions under the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Ordinance could be withdrawn at the age of 65, but if a retired civil servant would no longer work, he or she could apply to withdraw this part in advance as early as 60. He trusted that the Scheme provided sufficient financial protection for retired civil servants.

Measures to keep civil servants away from corruption

39. Mr IP Kin-yuen was of the view that the alleged corruption cases of a few former top government officials had given a negative image to the general public and aroused public concern on the system in upholding probity and integrity of civil servants. In addition, the remuneration packages of civil servants, in particular the retirement benefits, had become less attractive. As such, he asked how the Administration could ensure that civil servants were given sufficient protection to stay away from corruption.

40. SCS explained that the Administration had offered a reasonable level of remuneration and a stable working environment to civil servants. In addition, CSPF Scheme was in general better than provident fund schemes offered by the private sector, and there were mechanisms in place to forfeit a civil servant's accrued benefits attributable to the

Government's voluntary contribution under the Scheme if the civil servant was convicted of criminal offences, with a view to increasing the deterrent effect. The Administration had also put in place control measures governing the taking up of post-service work by retired directorate civil servants.

V. Any other business

Civil service pay adjustment for 2014-2015

41. Ms Emily LAU said that the funding application for the civil service pay adjustment for 2014-2015 could not be approved by the Finance Committee ("FC") before the end of this legislative session due to the Administration's reluctance to re-prioritise the funding applications on the agenda of FC. She enquired whether all civil servants and staff of subvented non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") would receive their pay increases according to the civil service pay adjustment rates with retrospective effect from 1 April 2014 when the funding application was approved by FC in the new legislative session.

42. SCS advised that subject to the approval of FC, all civil servants would receive their pay increases with retrospective effect from 1 April 2014. As regards the staff of subvented NGOs, the Administration would provide the NGOs with sufficient provisions to enable them to adjust the salary of their staff according to the civil service pay adjustment rates with retrospective effect from 1 April 2014. Although it would be up to the individual NGOs, as employers, to decide whether and how to adjust the salaries of their employees, he understood that NGOs had been reminded that the additional provision was meant to allow room for pay adjustment for their staff.

43. In response to the enquiry of the Chairman, SCS advised that the civil service pay adjustment mechanism did not apply to NCSC staff. Individual B/Ds had full discretion on the pay adjustment rates for their NCSC staff.

44. Mr IP Kin-yuen requested the Administration to consider advancing some less controversial items, such as civil service pay adjustment for 2014-2015, on the agenda of FC so that the funding applications for such items would be examined at the beginning of the new legislative session. SCS responded that, as mentioned by the Financial Secretary, all of the funding applications on the FC's agenda were important, and that the Administration would follow the current order of funding applications on the FC's agenda in the new legislative session.

45. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:52 pm.

Council Business Division 4

Legislative Council Secretariat

18 September 2014

**Panel on Public Service
on Monday, 21 July 2014, at 09:30am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
000633-000826	Chairman	Opening remarks
000827-001131	Mr KAM Man-fung Member of Central Committee New People's Party	Presentation of views that - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Extending the service of civil servants could address problems associated with an ageing population and a shrinking labour force in the next twenty years. ● The Administration should adopt a flexible approach in extending the service of civil servants, and to ensure that there was adequate retirement protections for civil servants at junior ranks.
001139-001439	Mr CHAN Kin-lun, Kenneth Chairman Hong Kong Fire Services Control Staff's Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)961/13-14(01)
001450-001742	Mr KONG Ming-chung Chairperson HKSAR Government Employees General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(02)
001750-002057	Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan Deputy Spokesperson of Civil Services Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views that - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Extending the service of civil servants could solve succession problems in the civil service. ● Serving civil servants should be allowed to choose whether to extend

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
		<p>their retirement age or not.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● There should be an open and fair mechanism for further employing serving civil servants beyond their retirement age. ● A pilot scheme for extending the retirement age of civil servants could be rolled out in disciplined services departments before a full implementation in the civil service.
002105-002409	Mr CHEUNG Siu-wing Chairman Hong Kong Leisure Services Staff General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(03)
002414-002711	Mr Peter SIU District Councillor Liberal Party	<p>Presentation of views that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Liberal Party supported the proposal put forward by the Administration in extending the service of the civil servants. Such an extension would set a good example for the private sector to follow. ● Allowing people to work longer would lessen people's reliance on the welfare services provided by the Government after their retirement.
002723-003012	Mr TANG Tak-ho Chairperson Civil Servants & Subsidized Organizations Committee, The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(04)
003023-003222	Mr TSUI Yat-keung Vice Chairman Government Model Scale 1 Staff General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)946/13-14(01)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
003236-003513	Mr CHEUNG Chi-wah Chairman 政府第一標準薪級員工總會 食環署二級工人分會	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)946/13-14(02)
003528-003822	Mr NG Long-sang, Henry	Presentation of views that - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Many European countries were prescribing a higher retirement age for civil servants in order to lessen the Government's expenditure on retirement benefits. ● Extending the service of civil servants could effectively address succession problems of the civil service and prevent the outflow of experienced civil servants to other private or public organizations.
003836-004140	Mr FUNG Kei-lap, Michael	Presentation of views that - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Several overseas jurisdictions had set a mandatory retirement age at 65. Hong Kong was lagging behind in this regard. ● Civil servants should have the right to choose whether or not to extend their service in the civil service.
004149-004353	Mr CHAN Kwong-kwong Vice-Chairman Hong Kong Customs Officers Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)946/13-14(03)
004400-004805	Mr LEE Siu-kai Executive member Hong Kong Correctional Services General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper Nos. CB(4)932/13-14(05) and CB(4)961/13-14(04)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
004815-004947	Mr NIP Yuen-fung Chairman Hong Kong Fire Services Department Staffs General Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)978/13-14(01)
005000-005241	Mr WONG Ka-fai Member Government Frontline Employees Union Hawker Control Team Staff Branch	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)961/13-14(02)
005258-005520	Mr LEUNG Tat-wah Vice-chairman Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council (Staff Side)	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)950/13-14(01)
005538-005825	Mr LEE Yau-tong 副會務主任 Government Electrical & Mechanical Works Supervisors, Craftsmen & Workmen Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(02)
005831-010146	Mr NGAI Sik-shui Chairman Immigration Service Officers Association	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Civil service new recruits for both civilian and disciplined services grades should adopt the same higher retirement age, i.e. 65. ● The Administration should devise an open and fair mechanism for further employment of serving civil servants beyond their retirement age. ● Implementation details, including the timetable for the proposed initiatives, should be released as soon as practicable.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
010155-010503	Mr WONG Tsin-hing Member Hong Kong Food & Environmental Hygiene Department Staff Rights Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)957/13-14(01)
010511-010831	Mr CHAN Cho Chairman Association of Customs and Excise Service Officers	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)950/13-14(02)
010839-011132	Mr LAU Yuk-fai, Daniel Chairman Hong Kong Immigration Assistants Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(07)
011142-011447	Mr CHAN Cho-kwong Chairman The Junior Police Officers' Association of the Hong Kong Police Force, Police Force Council (Staff Side)	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)961/13-14(03)
011455-011712	Mr Steven TSE Rights Officer Government Employees Association	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Civil servants appointed on or after 1 June 2000 should be allowed to opt for a higher retirement age. ● Streamlining the control regime of post-service employment should be applicable to civil servants remunerated on or below point 33 of the master pay scale.
011720-012100	Mr CHENG Yuk-leung Chairman Disciplined Services Consultative Council (Staff Side)	<p>Presentation of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The retirement age for new recruits of disciplined services grades should be set on a par with the civilian grades, and without being required to undergo an annual suitability assessment after reaching the age of 57.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Serving civil servants should be allowed to choose whether to extend their retirement age or not. ● The mechanism for the further employment of serving civil servants should be open and transparent to prevent the culture of cronyism.
012110-012234	Mr LAM Chun-pang Vice-Chairman Working Group for TO(A) in Housing Department	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(08)
012244-012448	Mr KO Siu-kei Committee member Hong Kong Fire Services Department Ambulancemen's Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(09)
012455-012800	Mr MAK Kam-fai Chairman Government Disciplined Services General Union	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper Nos. CB(4)932/13-14(10) and CB(4)961/13-14(04)
012805-013028	Mr TSOI Tak-man Deputy Secretary General Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)950/13-14(03)
013034-013350	Mr CHUNG Chi-kong Honorary Secretary Hong Kong Fire Services Officers Association	Presentation of views as detailed in LC Paper No. CB(4)932/13-14(11)
013358-013703	Mr CHAN Sai-kwing Chairman Hong Kong Senior Government Officers Association	Presentation of views that – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Administration should adopt a flexible approach in implementing the retirement and employment initiatives. ● It was important to ensure experience retention and the transfer of

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)
		knowledge from experienced civil servants to younger ones.
013715-014010	Mr YUNG Kai-wing Vice Chairman (Negotiation) Hong Kong Civil Servants General Union	Presentation of views that – <ul style="list-style-type: none">● There should not be any restrictions posed on the further employment of serving civil servants beyond their retirement age.● There were concerns that the approval of further employment of serving civil servants was vested in the relevant Heads of Divisions/Heads of Grades.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 September 2014