

LC Paper No. CB(1)1339/13-14 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

**Panel on Transport** 

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

## Minutes of meeting on Friday, 3 January 2014, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present	:	Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman) Hon CHAN Han-pan (Deputy Chairman) Hon James TO Kun-sun Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon WU Chi-wai, MH Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP Hon TANG Ka-piu Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen
Members absent	:	Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Members absent : Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Public officers :	<u>Agenda item III</u>
attending	Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
	Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)1
	Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)7
	Mr TAM Hon-choi Government Engineer/Railway Development 2 Highways Department
	Mr CHAN Choi-wai Chief Engineer/ Railways Development 2-3 Highways Department
	Agenda item IV
	Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
	Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)1
	Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai

Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)7

Mr TAM Hon-choi Government Engineer/Railway Development2 Highways Department

# Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Andy CHAN Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing(Transport)2

Mr José YAM Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing(Transport)4

Dr LEUNG Kin-man Assistant Director/Railways Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

# Attendance by invitation

## <u>Agenda item III</u>

:

Mr Steve HOWARTH Head of Project Safety MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Stephen CHIK Head of Project Engineering MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO Deputy General Manager – Projects and Property Communications MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Jenny TAM Projects Communications Manager MTR Corporation Limited

## Agenda item IV

Ms Maggie SO Deputy General Manager – Projects and Property Communications MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Prudence CHAN Projects Communications Manager MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI Senior Liaison Engineer MTR Corporation Limited

## Agenda item V

Mr Terry WONG General Manager – Infrastructure MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI Head of Operating MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG Senior Manager – External Affairs MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance :	Ms Sophie LAU
	Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN Council Secretary (1)2

> Ms Emily LIU Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

Ī	Information papers issued since last	tmeeting
	(LC Paper No. CB(1)550/13-14(01)	- Submission from a member
		of the public on the MTR
		Corporation Limited's train
		door safety
	LC Papers Nos. CB(1)595/13-14(04)	- Letters from Hon WONG
	and CB(1)602/13-14(01)	Kwok-hing and Dr Hon
		KWOK Ka-ki on the Light
		Rail incident on
		17 December 2013)
	1	Kwok-hing and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki on the Light Rail incident on

<u>Members</u> noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

II	Items for discussion at the next regu	llar meeting on 28 February 2014
	(LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(01)	- List of outstanding items for
		discussion
	LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(02)	- List of follow-up actions)

2. <u>Members</u> agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting on Friday, 28 February 2014, at 10:45 am -

- (a) Follow-ups on the incident of service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013;
- (b) Light Rail incident on 17 December 2013; and
- (c) Measures to alleviate crowdedness in MTR train compartments.

(*Post-meeting note*: The Subcommittee discussed the recent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail at the meeting on 28 February 2014. It was discussed together with the original agenda items of "Follow-ups on the incident of service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013" and "Light Rail incident on 17 December 2013" under one agenda item. Besides, the agenda item "Measures to alleviate crowdedness in MTR train compartments" was revised as "Capacity and loading of MTR trains".)

# III Construction safety in railway projects

The MTR Corporation
Limited's paper on
construction safety in
railway projects
Paper on construction safety
in railway projects prepared
by the Legislative Council
Secretariat (background
brief))

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>the Administration</u> and <u>the MTR</u> <u>Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")</u> briefed members on the construction safety in railway projects.

4. <u>The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee")</u> deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**). Members expressed views and concern over industrial accident rates, safety enhancement measures, site conditions, and rights and benefits of workers.

Admin / 5. Having noted that the number of accidents occurred in the last seven MTRCL months amounted to 100 and those happened in the three years preceding the last seven months were only 147 for the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"), the Subcommittee requested the Administration and MTRCL to provide information on the total number of working hours spent on XRL project for the abovesaid corresponding periods.

(*Post-meeting note*: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members on 23 April 2014 vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1299/13-14(01).)

IV	The MTR Corporation Limited's associated with the railway projects	community liaison work
	(LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(05) -	The MTR Corporation Limited's paper on community liaison work associated with the railway projects
	LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(06) -	Paper on community liaison work associated with the

6. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>the Administration</u> and <u>MTRCL</u> briefed members on MTRCL's community liaison work associated with the railway projects.

7. <u>The Subcommittee</u> deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin / 8. After deliberation, <u>the Administration</u> and <u>MTRCL</u> were requested to MTRCL provide information on the consultation with local community carried out in the past in respect of the proposal of a pedestrian link at Sands Street with a connection to Tai Pak Terrace under the West Island Line.

(*Post-meeting note*: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members on 22 April 2014 vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1287/13-14(01).)

# V Rail inspection regime of the MTR Corporation Limited

(LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(07)	- The MTR Corporation
	Limited's paper on rail
	inspection: advanced
	ultrasonic testing vehicle
LC Paper No. CB(1)637/13-14(08)	- Paper on rail inspection
	regime of the MTR
	Corporation Limited
	prepared by the Legislative
	Council Secretariat
	(background brief))

9. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>the Administration</u> and <u>MTRCL</u> briefed members on the rail inspection regime of MTRCL.

10. <u>The Subcommittee</u> deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin / 11. After deliberation, <u>the Administration</u> and <u>MTRCL</u> were requested to MTRCL provide the respective number of in-house and outsourced maintenance staff as regards visual inspection for different railway lines of MTRCL.

# VI Any other business

The 12. <u>The Administration</u> and <u>MTRCL</u> were requested to make Clerk arrangement for the Subcommittee members to visit a busy Light Rail station to better understand the crowdedness of the train compartments and on the platform during peak hours at an appropriate time.

13. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:47 pm.

Council Business Division 1 Legislative Council Secretariat 30 April 2014

## **Panel on Transport**

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

#### Proceedings of the meeting on Friday, 3 January 2014, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda Ite	m I – Information papers i	ssued since last meeting	
000419 – 000549	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
Agenda Ite	m II – Items for discussion	at the next regular meeting on 28 February 2014	
000550 – 000820	ř	<ul> <li>The Chairman informed members that the Administration agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting on 28 February 2014:</li> <li>(a) Follow-ups on the incident of service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013; and</li> </ul>	
		<ul><li>(b) Measures to alleviate crowdedness in MTR train compartments.</li><li>Mr WONG Kwok-hing suggested to discuss the Light Rail incident on 17 December 2013 at the forthcoming meeting. Members agreed.</li></ul>	
Agenda Ite	m III – Construction safety	v in railway projects	
000821 – 001125	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the construction safety in railway projects.	
001126 – 002520	Chairman MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)668/13-14(01)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the construction safety in railway projects.	
002521 – 003153	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	<ul> <li>Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about:</li> <li>(a) the details of the four fatal industrial incidents from 2009 to 2013 and corresponding precautionary and remedial measures being taken;</li> <li>(b) whether the Administration would consider installation of electronic devices or sensors at the rear of excavators to enhance safety of the persons nearby; and</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) result of the industrial action by workers against reduction of their resting time.	
		The Administration explained that they attached great importance to construction safety and therefore had requested MTRCL and their contractors to promptly investigate and follow up the fatal incidents to prevent recurrence of similar incidents.	
		MTRCL advised that:	
		<ul> <li>(a) the causes of fatal incidents included falling of a pile on a victim's leg; falling of a piece of rock on a victim's neck and shoulder; and slipping between a top handrail and a bottom toe-board. Safety enhancement measures such as launching of "Don't Walk by" Campaign and "Hands Off" Campaign were implemented after the incidents;</li> </ul>	
		<ul><li>(b) they were conducting trials of the electronic devices, like infrared cameras, at the rear of some large machines to enhance workers' safety; and</li></ul>	
		(c) MTRCL had been trying hard to improve the site conditions. The Labour Department also found that the air quality in the tunnels was up to the legal requirements after conducting inspections.	
003154 – 003706	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai	Mr WU Chi-wai raised the following questions:	
003700	MTRCL	<ul><li>(a) whether workers engaged in the construction sites of railway projects were required to work overtime; and</li></ul>	
		(b) the effectiveness of the near miss reporting scheme.	
		MTRCL responded that:	
		<ul> <li>(a) the standard working hours for each worker were 60 hours a week. Those who were responsible for the blasting works in the tunnels routinely worked 10-hours shifts; and</li> </ul>	
		(b) the near miss reporting scheme aimed to eliminate or reduce accidents and incidents in the workplace and sites. They would	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		investigate and follow up every accident and incident, and share with all staff and contractors the lessons learnt.	
003707 – 004223	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<ul><li>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok enquired about:</li><li>(a) after the recent industrial action, what had been done to further improve the site conditions including air quality inside the tunnel; and</li></ul>	
		(b) whether the Workers' Life Insurance Scheme taken out by MTRCL would cover workers employed by subcontractors and workers who were imported workers.	
		In response, MTRCL advised that:	
		<ul> <li>(a) after the industrial action, the Labour Department had conducted inspection and found that the air quality inside the tunnels was satisfactory. MTRCL was required by certain regulations to ensure that the air quality inside the tunnels was safe. Accordingly, the air quality inside the tunnels would have to be tested and certified to be safe before commencement of each shift; and</li> </ul>	
		<ul> <li>(b) in addition to the statutory employees compensation, the Workers' Life Insurance Scheme taken out by MTR since 2012 would cover all workers who worked in the construction sites for eight days or more in the previous 30 days, regardless of the cause of death. For the four fatal accidents, each family would receive a sum of \$200,000 under the above scheme.</li> </ul>	
004224 – 004911	Chairman MTRCL	Noting that the number of accidents occurred in the last seven months amounted to 100 and those happened in the three years preceding the last seven months were only 147 for the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"), the Chairman enquired why the accident rates increased so dramatically in the recent months.	
		MTRCL advised that:	
		(a) the increase in the accident rates for XRL	

		project in recent months could be due to the change in the nature of work involved in the different stages of construction works. Also more manual labour were involved in recent months as the manpower demand reached its peak. The overall figure of the accident rates was, however, more or less the same as those for other railway projects. MTRCL would continuously implement various enhancement measures to avoid accidents; and upon the Chairman's request, MTRCL would provide information on the total number of working hours spent on XRL project for the corresponding period (i.e. last seven months and three years preceding the last seven months) for members' reference.	Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 5 of minutes)
005441 Mr TANG K	Mr	provide information on the total number of working hours spent on XRL project for the corresponding period (i.e. last seven months and three years preceding the last seven	MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 5 of
005441 Mr TANG K			,
	_	TANG Ka-piu expressed the following views concern: MTRCL should enhance workers' occupational safety, such as regular lunch arrangements and invite the Labour Department and the Construction Industry Employees General Union to deliver talks to workers on occupational safety in confined space; and closely communicate with the workers to better understand their needs and difficulties encountered at work; and	
	MT wor Act bety regu and mar requ sug	MTRCL should offer a set of free round trip ticket of XRL to each of the workers who had worked in the XRL sites to recognize their contribution to the project. RCL responded that they were responsive to kers by launching initiatives like "You Say, We ". Under this initiative, safety communication ween unions and victim associations was alarly arranged for workers of different levels a close dialogue was maintained between the hagement and workers. The Chairman also lested the MTRCL to consider Mr TANG's gestion regarding the offer of free tickets to kers of XRL projects.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	Worker Caring Program, MTRCL advised that one mentor would provide guidance to two new workers. It generally would take six months for the new worker to become a mentor.	
Agenda It	em IV – The MTR Corpo projects	ration Limited's community liaison work associated	with the railway
005810 - 010048	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on MTRCL's community liaison work associated with the railway projects.	
010049 – 011113	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)668/13-14(02)], MTRCL gave a briefing on their community liaison work associated with the railway projects.	
011114 – 011622	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed his dissatisfaction that the Administration and MTRCL cancelled the provision of a barrier-free access facility connecting Tai Pak Terrace under the West Island Line ("WIL").	
		<ul> <li>In response, the Administration advised that:</li> <li>(a) constructing a footbridge there might provoke privacy concerns and they had already explained the relevant details including the consultation with the local community in the past at Legislative Council case conferences; and</li> </ul>	
		(b) upon the Chairman's request, the Administration would provide information on the consultation with the local community carried out in the past in respect of the proposal of a pedestrian link at Sands Street with a connection to Tai Pak Terrace under WIL.	Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 8 of minutes)
011623 – 012119	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu MTRCL	<ul> <li>Mr TANG Ka-piu suggested that MTRCL should:</li> <li>(a) attend every meeting held by each District Council's relevant transport committee to better understand the community's concern about the existing railway lines; and</li> </ul>	
		(b) inform residents in the neighbourhood the schedule and relevant details of retrofitting automatic platform gates ("APGs") at stations along East Rail Line ("ERL") and Ma	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		On Shan Line ("MOSL").	
		MTRCL explained that:	
		<ul> <li>(a) they would attend meetings held by the District Councils as far as practicable in respect of matters relating to railways. In case they were unable to attend, they would respond to the District Councils' views and concern by various means; and</li> </ul>	
		(b) at the same time, they would explore different methods to minimize noise nuisance arising from platform modification and APGs retrofitting works at stations along ERL and MOSL to the residents nearby during mid-night. For example, in order to enhance communication, an information zone was set up at MOSL stations to inform residents the schedule and details of the platform modification works under the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") project.	
012120 -	Chairman	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung suggested that the	
012629	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<ul> <li>Administration and MTRCL should:</li> <li>(a) be responsive to the community's concern, like provision of a barrier-free access facility connecting Tai Pak Terrace from the proposed pedestrian link under WIL; and complaints made by the villagers of Yau Tam Mei regarding the impact of the construction of XRL on the source of water for their use; and</li> <li>(b) better understand the views of the community by setting up of a fund or organization to collect views from the opposition side.</li> <li>In response, the Administration advised that they understand the appaarn of Tai Pak Terrace residents.</li> </ul>	Administration /
		understood the concern of Tai Pak Terrace residents while other factors had been taken into account in the planning of the pedestrian link there. As mentioned earlier, they would provide further information to the Subcommittee on the case of Tai Pak Terrace, including the public consultation process.	MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 8 of minutes)
012630 - 013102	Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL	Mr Tony TSE suggested that: (a) it was vital for MTRCL to maintain dialogue	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		with the commuters and the community. Commuters' concern mainly centred around the fares and the degree of comfort during the ride; and	
		(b) MTRCL should take measures to alleviate crowdedness in MTR train compartments. The announced average occupancy rate of about 70 per cent for both morning and afternoon peak hours did not truly reflect the crowdedness in train compartments. MTRCL should set some specific standard in the design and planning stage in respect of passenger density, say the maximum number of standees per square metre inside a train compartment.	
		MTRCL explained that they had tried to enhance train frequency to satisfy the demand of passengers, in particular during peak hours. They would further study various means to improve passengers' comfort level on train by enhancing train service, having regard to the limit of the current signalling system.	
		The Chairman remarked that the Administration and MTRCL were invited to brief members on capacity and loading of MTR trains at the next regular meeting on 28 February 2014 and further discussion on this issue would be allowed.	
013103 – 013516	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr CHAN Han-pan made the following comment and suggestions:	
	MTRCL	<ul> <li>(a) MTRCL should make reference to the excellent community liaison work carried out by the CLP Power Hong Kong Limited and the Hong Kong and China Gas Company Limited;</li> </ul>	
		(b) MTRCL should simplify the compensation mechanism which was found complicated by owners of buildings affected by the nearby construction works of the new railway lines; and	
		(c) whether MTRCL had actively sought to communicate with the District Councils in the past year to improve their community liaison work, and if yes, how many meetings they had attended.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<b>магкег</b> 013517 – 013808	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<ul> <li>In response, MTRCL advised that:</li> <li>(a) under the existing compensation mechanism, service of a third party, i.e. a loss adjustor, was required to collect independent information, such as the surveying data for monitoring the conditions of the affected buildings. This was aligned with the international practice and sometimes the service of the loss adjustor was not necessary when the damage was obviously caused by the contractor; and</li> <li>(b) MTRCL sometimes would suggest items to be discussed at the District Council meetings, if necessary. Besides, Community Liaison Groups of MTRCL organized visits for the members of the District Councils to railway facilities such as Operations Control Centre, depots and stations to enhance communication with the community.</li> <li>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok raised that residents had much concern about ventilation shaft of WIL and other lines before. He asked what MTRCL had done to allay the resident's worries. MTRCL explained that similar concern was raised in the development of other railway projects like South Island Line (East) and SCL. MTRCL said that they had addressed the community's misconception about the air quality and noise impact arising from ventilation shafts; conducting site visits to other ventilation shafts of existing railway lines; and</li> </ul>	
Agenda Ite	m V – Rail inspection regi	me of the MTR Corporation Limited	
013809 – 014026	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the rail inspection regime of MTRCL.	
014027 – 014638	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)668/13-14(03)], MTRCL gave a briefing on their rail inspection regime.	
014639 – 015141	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<ul> <li>Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about:</li> <li>(a) rail inspection frequency of the advanced Ultrasonic Testing Vehicle ("UTV");</li> <li>(b) whether the introduction of the advanced UTV would streamline the manpower arrangement</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		for visual inspections and hand-held ultrasonic testing; and	
		(c) whether MTRCL would consider purchasing one more UTV to increase the rail inspection frequency.	
		MTRCL explained that:	
		<ul> <li>(a) MTRCL had three UTVs in total for rail inspection. For instance, UTV inspection was conducted once every two weeks for Kwun Tong Line and Tsuen Wan Line. Visual inspection was carried out once every 72 hours whereas hand-held ultrasonic testing was conducted once every three to six months; and</li> </ul>	
		(b) UTV inspections and hand-held ultrasonic testing played complementary roles to each other in rail inspection. The former was mainly for plain rails whereas the latter for rail junctions.	
015142 – 015636	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu MTRCL	Mr TANG Ka-piu expressed that outsourcing of the maintenance services, like rail inspection, for Tseung Kwan O Line might have adversely affected the quality of its maintenance. Upon his request, MTRCL agreed to provide the respective number of in-house and outsourced maintenance staff as regards visual inspection for different railway lines of MTRCL for reference.	Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 11 of minutes)
015637 – 020153	Chairman MTRCL	The Chairman enquired about the reasons for MTRCL to outsource their maintenance services and the criteria (such as job nature or cost) adopted by MTRCL to determine the use of outsourced services.	
		In response, MTRCL advised that:	
		(a) more efficient and effective services could be provided to passengers by making good use of the contractors' specialized skills. For some of the maintenance works such as that for fire services equipment, MTRCL should employ registered and professional maintenance contractors in accordance with the statutory requirements; and	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) with the commissioning of new railway lines and extensions, MTRCL had increased the number of railway maintenance staff based on operational needs.	
Agenda Ite	m VI – Any other business		
020154 – 020238	Chairman Administration	Upon the Chairman's request, the Administration agreed to make arrangement for the Subcommittee members to visit a busy Light Rail station to better understand the crowdedness of the train compartments and on the platform during peak hours at an appropriate time.	The Clerk to arrange the visit

Council Business Division 1 Legislative Council Secretariat 30 April 2014