

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1928/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 28 February 2014, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Han-pan (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members attending : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him GBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH

Member absent : Hon TANG Ka-piu

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item IV**

Professor Anthony CHEUNG
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Joseph LAI
Permanent Secretary for Transport

Mr Andy CHAN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)2

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr WOO Kin-ming
Deputy Director/Regulatory Services
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Dr LEUNG Kin-man
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Ms Macella LEE
Assistant Commissioner/Bus & Railway
Transport Department

Agenda item V

Professor Anthony CHEUNG
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Joseph LAI
Permanent Secretary for Transport

Mr Andy CHAN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)2

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr WOO Kin-ming
Deputy Director/Regulatory Services
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Dr LEUNG Kin-man
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Ms Macella LEE
Assistant Commissioner/Bus & Railway
Transport Department

**Attendance by
invitation** :

Agenda item IV

Mr Jay WALDER
Chief Executive Officer
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Jacob KAM
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Tony LEE
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms May WONG
General Manager - Corporate Relations
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item V

Mr Jay WALDER
Chief Executive Officer
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Jacob KAM
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Tony LEE
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms May WONG
General Manager - Corporate Relations
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

I Confirmation of minutes
(LC Papers Nos. CB(1)1010/13-14 - Minutes of meetings on
and CB(1)1011/13-14 22 November and 20
December 2013)

1. The minutes of the meetings held on 22 November and 20 December 2013 were confirmed.

Action

II Information papers issued since last meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)700/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the submission on the MTR Corporation Limited's train door safety
- LC Paper No. CB(1)836/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon WONG Kwok-hing on the MTR Corporation Limited's air quality in train compartments and its preventive measures against the spread of influenza amongst passengers
- LC Paper No. CB(1)960/13-14(01) - Referral from Members' meeting-cum-luncheon with Tuen Mun District Council members on 5 December 2013 on the Administration's proposed scheme of the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan
- LC Paper No. CB(1)962/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the submission on the MTR Corporation Limited's crowd control management at Causeway Bay Station)

2. Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

III Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 May 2014

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion
- LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(02) - List of follow-up actions)

3. Members agreed to discuss railway development at the next regular meeting on Friday, 2 May 2014, at 10:45 am.

(Post-meeting note: The Subcommittee discussed the "Latest position of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link" at the meeting in May 2014, whereas the item "Railway development" originally

planned for discussion in May 2014 was deferred to the special meeting to be held on 29 September 2014.)

IV Capacity and loading of MTR trains

(LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(03) - Administration's paper on capacity and loading of MTR trains

LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(04) - Paper on capacity and loading of MTR trains prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on the capacity and loading of MTR trains.

5. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin / MTRCL 6. After deliberation, the Administration and MTRCL were requested to –

a) provide information on the estimate on when the loading of West Rail Line would become saturated;

b) provide the total patronage of different railway lines; and

The Clerk c) make arrangement for the Subcommittee members to visit a busy MTR station to better understand the crowdedness of the train compartments and on the platform during peak hours at an appropriate time.

V Follow-ups on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, and report on subsequent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail

(LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(05) - Administration's paper on follow-ups on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December

Action

- 2013, and report on subsequent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail
- LC Paper No. CB(1)980/13-14(06) - Paper on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, and recent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)896/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai on the East Rail Line incident on 9 February 2014)

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration and MTRCL briefed members on the follow-ups on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, and reported on subsequent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail.

8. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

- Admin / MTRCL 9. After deliberation, the Administration and MTRCL were requested to –
- a) provide information on the procurement of insulators (including the cost) for East Rail Line in the past; and
 - b) provide details of the calculation of the penalty against MTRCL for serious service disruptions under the revised Fare Adjustment Mechanism introduced in 2013.

VI Any other business

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:20 pm.

Action

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
20 August 2014

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 28 February 2014, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000104 – 000136	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meetings held on 22 November and 20 December 2013.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000137 – 000230	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 May 2014</i>			
000231 – 000342	Chairman	The Chairman informed members that the Administration agreed to discuss the railway development at the next regular meeting on 2 May 2014.	
000343 – 000438	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman	Mr WONG Kwok-hing suggested making arrangement for the Subcommittee members to visit a busy MTR station (say, Admiralty Station) to better understand the crowdedness of the train compartments and on the platform during peak hours at an appropriate time. Members agreed.	The Clerk to arrange the visit
<i>Agenda Item IV – Capacity and loading of MTR trains</i>			
000439 – 001518	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the capacity and loading of MTR trains.	
001519 – 002605	Chairman MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1033/13-14(01)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the capacity and loading of MTR trains.	
002606 – 003032	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing made the following suggestions: (a) expediting implementation of possible measures to relieve the high loading situation during peak hours, such as offering 30% or 40% early-bird discount; (b) making use of folding seats, rather than removal of some seats in train compartments, to enhance carrying capacity; and	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the Administration should not only rely heavily on MTR in providing public transport services. Other transport modes, such as bus services, should be fully utilized too.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) the Corporation, together with the Administration and independent experts, would spare no effort to formulate appropriate measures such as implementation of the early-bird scheme, with a view to alleviating the problem of crowdedness in train compartments during peak hours; and</p> <p>(b) folding seats would not help much in enhancing carrying capacity while they might pose a safety problem to passengers according to overseas experience.</p> <p>The Administration supplemented that MTRCL was not the single market player in public transport. As explained at Council meetings before, railway was the backbone of the public transport system in Hong Kong, complemented by services provided by other public transport modes.</p>	
003033 – 003437	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	<p>Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed the following worries:</p> <p>(a) removal of some seats in train compartments might lead to insufficient seats for those passengers in need, in particular the elderly and pregnant women;</p> <p>(b) the senior executives of MTRCL were rewarded with favourable remuneration packages while MTRCL's performance in respect of governance fell short of the community's expectation, e.g. frequent occurrence of railway service disruptions;</p> <p>(c) the Administration failed to monitor MTRCL's service performance and therefore the board of MTRCL should consider deductions of the remunerations and bonuses of MTRCL's directors, having regard to their substandard performance; and</p> <p>(d) it seemed that both the Administration and MTRCL were unable to formulate viable measures to enhance carrying capacity in the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>short run.</p> <p>The Administration advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) being a listed company in Hong Kong, MTRCL should comply with certain standard of corporate governance; (b) the Administration had monitored railway safety and services in various aspects. For instance, the Transport Department and the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department ("EMSD") were responsible for monitoring the service and safety performance aspects of railway services provided by MTRCL respectively. Also, the formula-driven fare adjustment mechanism of MTRCL was reviewed in 2013; and (c) the Administration would conduct a study on public transport strategy to review the roles of different public transport modes given the emerging railway network. 	
003438 – 003842	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration	<p>Mr Gary FAN urged the Administration / MTRCL to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) review the current transport policy of having railway as the backbone of the public transport system in Hong Kong; (b) expedite replacement of MTR signalling system so that train frequencies could be increased as early as practicable; (c) review the measure of removal of some seats in train compartments because the need for selected groups of passengers could not be met; (d) attach greater importance to other public transport modes, such as enhancement of cross-harbour bus services to satisfy the demand of the public; and (e) suspend bus route rationalization plan, which would adversely affect the level of bus services. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the public transport system played a significant role in Hong Kong because its network was handling about 90 per cent of all passenger trips in Hong Kong; (b) railway was regarded as the backbone of the public transport system in Hong Kong, instead of a dominant market player in public transport; (c) bus route rationalization under the area approach aimed at minimizing wastage due to duplication of resources and enhancing the efficiency of the bus network in a holistic manner; and (d) the Administration would closely monitor and regularly review the performance of bus service operators. 	
003843 – 004417	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai suggested that the Administration / MTRCL should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) formulate possible measures, like early-bird scheme, to improve the capacity and loading of MTR trains as early as practicable; (b) ask bus service providers to arrange more "point-to-point" feeder bus services during rush hours to lessen the loading on train services; (c) conduct a comprehensive review on the capacity and loading of MTR trains according to four persons (standing) per square metre ("ppsm") passenger density level; and (d) explore more feasible measures to enhance carrying capacity, apart from removal of some seats in train compartments. <p>In response, the Administration advised that they, together with MTRCL, were studying possible measures, like provision of fare concessions, to encourage passengers to use MTR outside the peak periods.</p> <p>The Chairman requested and MTRCL undertook to formulate remedial measures to alleviate the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>problem of crowdedness in train compartments as early as possible.</p>	
004418 – 004826	<p>Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr Tony TSE expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was appropriate for MTRCL to pitch at four ppsm service benchmark; (b) the Administration and MTRCL should provide figures to reflect crowdedness in train compartments in a reasonable and objective manner; (c) the Administration and MTRCL should formulate possible measures, like provision of fare concessions to passengers, to ease the crowdedness problem in train compartments during rush hours; and (d) the projected loading of MTR trains for each of the five new railway lines under construction, especially for their operation in the first few years. <p>In response, MTRCL explained that all train compartments of the existing MTR railway lines were designed according to the industry standard of six ppsm. The practice had complied with international benchmark for the design of railways and remained safe. Nevertheless, it had been observed that over the years, passenger riding habits had changed. Nowadays, they were less willing to board a train that looked crowded even when there was still room available. In actual operation, trains running during the peak hours on the busy corridors achieved a passenger density of around four ppsm only.</p>	
004827 – 005258	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan enquired:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether increase in MTR train frequencies would undermine railway safety; (b) whether the Administration had assessed if the upgrade of MTR signalling system was able to cope with the rapid growing population, in particular New Territories East and West; 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) if the Administration had underestimated the transport demand on West Rail Line and Tseung Kwan O Line which appeared to be saturated in about ten years after commissioning; and</p> <p>(d) whether it was possible for MTRCL to arrange an empty train compartment to illustrate the difference between four ppsm and six ppsm passenger density.</p> <p>The Administration advised that:</p> <p>(a) when planning railway projects, the Administration would take account of various factors, including community needs and economic impacts; and</p> <p>(b) railway services were designed to operate safely even if the limit of six ppsm was reached. In actual operation, however, the service level was generally pitched at the four ppsm benchmark.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) safety was of paramount importance when upgrading MTR signalling system to increase train frequencies; and</p> <p>(b) apart from the signalling system, MTRCL gave due regard to the coordination of other systems such as the electricity system.</p>	
005259 – 005710	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Administration MTRCL	<p>Dr Elizabeth QUAT raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) noticing crowdedness on certain railway lines (in particular Ma On Shan Line and Tseung Kwan O Line) during rush hours, Dr QUAT urged the Administration to formulate possible measures to alleviate the problem as soon as practicable; and</p> <p>(b) apart from the new railway projects under implementation, Dr QUAT enquired whether four ppsm service benchmark was applicable to existing railway lines.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that the service level of the new railway lines under</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>construction as well as future railway projects was pitched at four ppsm benchmark. Nevertheless, rail services were designed to operate safely even when the limit of six ppsm was reached.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that several measures were or would be implemented to ease the loading of MTR trains:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) "3+1" train service pattern (i.e. every one out of four trains would be running from North Point to LOHAS Park Stations) would be changed to "2+1" train service pattern (i.e. every one out of three trains would be running from North Point to LOHAS Park Stations). It was anticipated that the current loading of Tseung Kwan O Line could be reduced from 100.6% to around 92% afterwards; (b) in the past six years or so, MTRCL had invested a total of \$1.5 billion to purchase 14 new trains; (c) railway services were being improved under the "Listening · Responding" programme; and (d) as regards replacement of MTR signalling system, MTRCL had spent the past three years on the relevant planning and the whole upgrading exercise would require about eight to ten years to complete. 	
005711 – 010151	Chairman Mr Paul TSE Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Paul TSE raised the following questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) when the Administration and MTRCL were aware that the trains running during the peak hours on the busiest corridors achieved a passenger density of only around four ppsm whereas six ppsm in the 1980s and 1990s; (b) why MTRCL could not promptly implement the early-bird scheme, making reference to the past practices while having to conduct study by overseas universities; and whether it was possible to launch the scheme not only in the morning peak but also the evening peak; (c) whether MTRCL would consider introducing female-only or male-only compartments to enhance passengers' comfort and safety; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) whether the future railway development would extend to cover Kai Tak as well as Kowloon East.</p> <p>The Administration explained that they would brief the Subcommittee on railway development in due course.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL monitored passenger density level on an on-going basis. Having realized the change in passenger riding habits for a certain period of time, they made reference to the service benchmark as four ppsm and decided to purchase new trains about six years ago; and</p> <p>(b) in order to carefully devise the early-bird scheme, MTRCL had sought assistance from some overseas universities, including Massachusetts Institute of Technology and Stanford University, and would seek local consultants' advice on the study.</p> <p>Sharing with members' views and concerns, the Chairman remarked that the early-bird scheme should be launched as promptly as possible to alleviate the crowdedness problem in MTR train compartments.</p>	
010152 – 010601	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping MTRCL	<p>Mr POON Siu-ping raised the following questions and views:</p> <p>(a) whether four ppsm passenger density level included passengers with personal belongings such as luggage and backpacks;</p> <p>(b) what difficulties MTRCL encountered to expedite the upgrading of the signalling system, that hindered improvements to be made to the railway service before 2018;</p> <p>(c) suggested implementing the early-bird scheme to cover also the evening peak hours and formulating more measures to enhance MTR carrying capacity as soon as possible; and</p> <p>(d) urged the Administration to attach more importance to bus services in order to lessen the burden on MTR train services.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL replied that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the maximum carrying capacity of train compartments was calculated based on accommodating up to four ppsm on average and the calculation had already taken account of wheelchair users and passengers with luggage, backpacks and prams; and (b) MTRCL spared no effort to expedite upgrading MTR signalling system. On the other hand, they accorded top priority to safety operation. It was estimated that the replacement of the signalling system could only be completed in 2018, when improvements could be made to railway services. 	
010602 – 010931	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam	<p>Mr CHAN Kam-lam expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) due to the growing population and increasing number of tourists, the problem of crowdedness in train compartments did not only occur during peak hours, but also during non-peak hours; (b) it was observed that passengers' riding habits had changed as they were less willing to board a train that looked crowded even when there was still room available; (c) urged MTRCL to strengthen platform management to ensure smooth passenger flow during rush hours by encouraging passengers to move further inside the train compartments; and (d) suggested that the Administration should review its policy of having railway as the backbone of the public transport system because MTR trains became overloaded and MTRCL's performance had been disappointing recently. 	
010932 – 011409	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>The Chairman made the following enquiries:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) under the four ppsm passenger density level, what would be the estimated time when West Rail Line would become saturated after the commissioning of East West Corridor of 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Shatin to Central Link and upgrade of MTR signalling system in 2018;</p> <p>(b) what was the total patronage of different railway lines, in particular cross-harbour journey, during rush hours; and what would be the estimated time when the railway lines would become saturated without developing new railway lines in future; and</p> <p>(c) whether MTRCL would consider implementing fare concessions as in the past to alleviate crowdedness problem in train compartments, e.g. 30% fare discount when passengers exited from any MTR stations between 6:00 am and 7:45 am, and 9:00 am and 9:30 am, and entered any MTR stations between 5:00 pm and 6:00 pm, and 7:00 pm and 7:30 pm.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that:</p> <p>(a) information on the time when West Rail Line would become saturated would be provided for members' reference later; and</p> <p>(b) information on the total patronage of different railway lines would be provided in due course.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the early-bird scheme should be carefully studied because it would have impact on the complicated fare structure.</p>	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 6 of minutes)</p>
011410 – 011817	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Administration	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan suggested that the Administration should formulate concrete measures, like the early-bird scheme, and set a time frame with a view to alleviating the overcrowded problem in MTR trains as promptly as possible; and giving due regard to over-crowdedness in Light Rail during peak hours, increase the frequency of Light Rail service by using more dual-carriers.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that the proposed early-bird scheme could not be simply copied from the one implemented in 1980s and 1990s as well as other comparable overseas examples because the local circumstances nowadays were different. MTRCL would look into the early-bird scheme carefully and implement it as soon as possible.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
011818 – 012404	Chairman Ms Emily LAU Administration	<p>Ms Emily LAU urged the Administration to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) exert pressure on MTRCL to try their best to enhance passengers' comfort in train compartments, rather than removal of some seats or installation of folding seats in train compartments; (b) formulate possible measures, such as the early-bird scheme, and set a time frame as soon as possible to alleviate the crowding problem in MTR trains; and (c) review the existing policy of having railway as the backbone of the public transport system in Hong Kong because of MTRCL's substandard performance. <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the early-bird scheme should be studied carefully before announcing the time frame and relevant details; and (b) the Administration would try their best to maximize the effectiveness of different public transport modes. 	
012405 – 012816	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should not only spend resources on developing cross-boundary facilities, but also allocate adequate resources to enhance the local traffic network; (b) both the Administration and MTRCL should try to solve the crowding problem caused by the increasing number of tourists in MTR train cars and formulate possible measures to alleviate the problem as soon as practicable; and (c) regarding the early-bird scheme, MTRCL should not work with the universities in the United States for the details of the scheme. MTRCL should instead carry out possible measures promptly during rush hours by trial and error and refine the details of the scheme at an appropriate time. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item V – Follow-ups on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, and report on subsequent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail</i>			
012817 – 013542	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the follow-ups on the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, and reported on subsequent major incidents on East Rail Line and Light Rail.	
013543 – 014023	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1033/13-14(02)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the incidents and follow-up actions.	
014024 – 014531	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing raised the following views and questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should pay attention to MTRCL's outsourcing arrangement that about one quarter of MTR maintenance staff was outsourced; (b) the schedule of the Board of MTRCL to finish reviewing the reduction of remunerations and bonuses of the senior management of MTRCL in case of serious railway incidents; and (c) details of the calculation of the penalty against MTRCL for serious service disruptions under the revised Fare Adjustment Mechanism introduced in 2013. <p>In response, the Administration explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) they had reflected members' views that the remunerations and bonuses of the senior management of MTRCL should be reduced in case of serious railway incidents to the Remuneration Committee set up under the Board of MTRCL. The Remuneration Committee had taken note of members' concerns and would seriously look into the matter; and (b) the penalty against MTRCL for serious service disruptions was generally calculated according to the duration of service disruption. <p>Mr WONG opined that the financial penalty imposed on MTRCL was inadequate and urged the Administration to conduct a review on the penalty.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014532 – 015215	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN raised the following questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether MTRCL's performance was adversely affected by having to manage so many railway projects simultaneously; (b) in view of recent press reports on possible safety problems of the new trains procured for the railway lines under construction, how the Administration would monitor and ensure train safety; (c) as regards service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of Kwun Tong Line on 16 December 2013, why MTRCL was unable to detect the improper installation of the overhead line support bracket in the past 12 years and how MTRCL would avoid recurrence of similar events in future; and (d) after the incidents on East Rail Line, how MTRCL assured the quality of those parts (e.g. insulators) in the railway system and whether MTRCL would conduct comprehensive review on its quality control. <p>In response, the Administration advised that EMSD was responsible for monitoring railway safety. EMSD would assess the test reports submitted by MTRCL and take part in the on-site test in Hong Kong before approving the commissioning of new trains.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) MTRCL apologized for the recent railway service suspensions; (b) specialized teams were designated for different railway projects and therefore, MTRCL was capable of handling the five new railway projects simultaneously; (c) as regards improper installation of the overhead line support bracket on Tseung Kwan O Line, MTRCL would introduce new technology to ensure that the actual works should strictly comply with the design requirements; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(d) due to the faulty insulators on East Rail Line, MTRCL would conduct tests of the insulators for all railway lines to ensure that they were of quality before installation.	
015216 – 015726	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	<p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <p>(a) he was disappointed at MTRCL's reply on its risk management system. He considered that more concrete details of the risk management system should have been provided (e.g. management and technical aspects), with definitions and assessments of risks. The system should not only focus on moving parts but also immobile parts, like insulators. In this connection, he urged MTRCL to conduct a comprehensive review on its current risk management system;</p> <p>(b) railway maintenance would be adversely affected by weak management performance, regardless of deploying in-house or outsourced maintenance staff to carry out the work; and</p> <p>(c) MTRCL should learn from experience and review its quality control system over each category of parts in the railway system, including the procurement steps and sampling tests.</p>	
015727 – 020330	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Administration MTRCL	<p>Dr Elizabeth QUAT raised the following views and questions:</p> <p>(a) urged MTRCL to conduct a comprehensive review to find out the underlying reasons for the frequent incidents (e.g. ageing problem of the railway system);</p> <p>(b) asked MTRCL to improve its incident handling for railway service disruptions, free shuttle bus arrangements and incident notification system;</p> <p>(c) whether MTRCL would consider compensating passengers affected by railway service disruptions; and</p> <p>(d) why both EMSD and MTRCL were unable to detect the faulty insulators earlier.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>In response, the Administration advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) MTRCL would be penalized for serious service disruptions according to the "Service Performance Arrangement" introduced in 2013. Proceeds collected therein would be credited to a fare concession account and returned to the passengers through the "10% Same Day Second Trip Discount" scheme; and (b) in 2014, EMSD conducted on-site inspections of different railway lines for more than 160 times and would carry out investigations if necessary. <p>MTRCL supplemented that they would learn from recent railway incidents by enhancing their quality assurance process for all critical components in the railway system.</p>	
020331 – 020958	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>The Chairman raised the following questions and views:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) why MTRCL failed to detect the improper installation of the overhead line support bracket on Tseung Kwan O Line during construction; (b) why MTRCL did not internally test the insulators before the railway incidents and how they assured each insulator in the railway system was of quality to prevent recurrence of similar events; and (c) suggested introducing variable pay system, under which the senior management staff's remunerations and bonuses would be linked to MTRCL's railway service performance. <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) learning from the improper installation of the overhead line support bracket on Tseung Kwan O Line, MTRCL would introduce new technology to ensure strict compliance with the design requirements; (b) due to the faulty insulators on East Rail Line, MTRCL would introduce redundancy design to minimize the impact of faulty insulators on railway operation; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the senior management's pay system was under review.</p> <p>The Administration added that the Remuneration Committee set up under the Board of MTRCL would follow up on members' views on the remunerations and bonuses of the senior management.</p>	
020959 – 021522	Chairman Ms Emily LAU Administration MTRCL	<p>Ms Emily LAU suggested:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) implementing measures to improve the transport network of Tseung Kwan O district so as to lessen residents' dependence on MTR train services; (b) expediting implementation of the aforesaid remedial measures arising from the railway incidents and review on the senior management staff's pay system; (c) enhancing MTRCL's incident handling for railway service disruptions, like improvement in free shuttle bus arrangements and dissemination of information during incidents; and (d) compensating passengers affected by the incidents by means of fare reductions. <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) when free MTR shuttle bus service was needed during railway incidents, the Public Omnibus Operators Association would arrange about seven buses to provide service within 30 to 45 minutes after receiving MTRCL's notification; an additional 40 buses, if required, would be deployed within 1 to 1.5 hours; and about 100 buses in total after two hours. The actual number of buses to be deployed would depend on the extent of impact to train services and road traffic conditions; and (b) MTRCL would be penalized in accordance with the "Service Performance Arrangement" introduced in 2013. Proceeds collected therein would be credited to a fare concession account and returned to the passengers through the "10% Same Day Second Trip Discount" scheme. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) apart from the penalty against MTRCL for serious service disruptions, the Administration attached much importance to MTRCL's safe operation and service performance; and (b) they would provide supplementary information on the fines collected from MTRCL and relevant details under the "Service Performance Arrangement" in due course. 	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 9 of minutes)</p>
021523 – 022152	<p>Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration</p>	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) suggested setting up an independent organization comprising experts and professionals to inquire into the causes of railway service disruptions; and (b) how EMSD monitored MTRCL's railway service performance; and whether EMSD had ever found out about MTRCL's faulty insulators before the incidents. <p>In response, the Administration explained that as a matter of practice, the ordered insulators would normally be checked by the overseas manufacturers due to lack of special equipment in Hong Kong for that purpose. In view of the recent railway incidents, EMSD had already requested MTRCL to replace similar insulators as early as practicable. EMSD had also requested MTRCL to review its procurement procedures.</p>	
022153 – 022709	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed the following views and questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) urged MTRCL to review why its public image was far from satisfactory and suggested that "maximizing its profits under the Fare Adjustment Mechanism", and "slow progress in enhancing barrier-free access facilities and retrofitting public toilets in MTR stations" as reasons; 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) whether MTRCL's growing business in other places had adversely affected the local railway services, such as deployment of experienced staff overseas;</p> <p>(c) whether MTRCL adopted the strategy to accept the lowest bid and as a result affected the quality control recently; and</p> <p>(d) how EMSD monitored MTRCL to ensure railway safety.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL attached great importance to local railway services and less than 100 out of 10 000 MTR staff would be deployed overseas at the same time for other business;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL purchased the same type of insulators for more than ten years and pricing was not of vital importance. Information on the procurement of insulators (including the cost) for East Rail Line in the past would be provided in due course; and</p> <p>(c) as regards public image, MTRCL spared no effort to be responsive to passengers' expectation under the "Listening · Responding" programme, including increase in the number of train trips and adding seats at platforms of MTR stations.</p> <p>The Administration supplemented that EMSD would actively participate in MTRCL's tests of the insulators and verify findings of the tests.</p>	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 9 of minutes)</p>
022710 – 023440	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan MTRCL	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan raised the following questions:</p> <p>(a) what follow-up actions had been taken after the Light Rail incident on 22 January 2014, East Rail Line incidents on 9 February and 18 February 2014;</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL would conduct a comprehensive review on the whole railway system with a view to detecting potential problems, if any; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) whether the 100 staff deployed for overseas railway projects played a key role in local MTRCL's business and if so, the railway services in Hong Kong might be adversely affected.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) as regards the Light Rail incident on 22 January 2014, MTRCL replaced all the insulators with quality issue. The mechanical strength of the newly ordered insulators were higher; and</p> <p>(b) East Rail Line incidents on 9 February and 18 February 2014 were interrelated. After the former incident, MTRCL attempted to tackle the problem as soon as practicable in order to prevent recurrence of similar events. Some tests were conducted to assure the quality of the insulators. Nevertheless, another incident happened on 18 February 2014 just before they started replacing all the insulators with quality problem.</p> <p>The Chairman requested and the Administration agreed to provide details of the calculation of the penalty against MTRCL for serious service disruptions under the revised Fare Adjustment Mechanism introduced in 2013.</p>	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 9 of minutes)</p>