

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)139/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 4 July 2014, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present :** Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members attending :** Hon Claudia MO
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
- Members absent :** Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Public officers attending : Agenda item II

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Andy CHAN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)2
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)4
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr WOO Kin-ming, JP
Deputy Director/Regulatory Services
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Mr WONG Lap-chi
Assistant Director/Railways (Ag.)
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Ms Macella LEE
Assistant Commissioner/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Agenda item III

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr YEUNG Kong-sang
Chief Engineer/Railway Development 1-3
Highways Department

Mrs Ada YAU LAU Kwau-yau
Curator (Archaeology)
Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Agenda item IV

Mr CHAN Fan, JP
Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Mr WOO Kin-ming, JP
Deputy Director/Regulatory Services
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport
and Housing (Transport)3
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr TAM Hon-choi
Government Engineer/Railway Development 2
Highways Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item II**

Dr Jacob KAM
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Tony LEE
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager-External Affairs
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item III

Mr CHEW Tai-chong
Projects Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Philco WONG
General Manager-SCL
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr LEE Tsz-man
General Manager-SCL E&M
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager-Projects and
Property Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr LIU Wen-suo
Experienced Archaeologist
ERM-Hong Kong Limited

Agenda item IV

Mr CHEW Tai-chong
Projects Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Jacob KAM
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Alvin LUK
General Manager-XRL E&M
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr LEUNG Chi-lap
Chief E&M Engineer
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO Man-kit
Deputy General Manager-Projects and
Property Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

Action

I

Information papers issued since last meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1490/13-14(01) - Joint letter from Hon WU Chi-wai and Hon SIN Chung-kai on the progress update of the construction of the South Island Line (East)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1501/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen on supervision of the management and works progress for the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1744/13-14(01) - Submission from 觀塘線延線紅磡段工程監察組 on the construction of the Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1744/13-14(02) - Submission from Whampoa Resident Association on the construction of the Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1745/13-14(01) - Submission from 華基索償會 on compensation cases of Wah Kai Industrial Centre)

Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

II East Rail Line service disruptions on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(01) - The MTR Corporation Limited's paper on East Rail Line service disruptions on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(02) - Paper on East Rail Line service disruptions on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014 prepared by the

Legislative Council
Secretariat (background
brief))

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on the East Rail Line service disruptions on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014.
3. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

MTRCL 4. After deliberation, MTRCL was requested to provide a written report on the Corporation's current risk management system.

III Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(03) - Administration's paper on progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(04) - Paper on the construction of the Shatin to Central Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1500/13-14(01) - Joint letter from Hon WU Chi-wai and Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link and the proposed visit to the site where relics of Song Dynasty were discovered
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1567/13-14(01) - Submission from Chiu Clansmen's General Association of Hong Kong Ltd on the monuments and antiques unearthed at the construction site of the Shatin to Central Link

Action

LC Paper No. CB(1)1653/13-14(01) - Submission from a member of the public on the construction of the Shatin to Central Link)

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration and MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link.

6. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin / MTRCL 7. After deliberation, the Administration and MTRCL were requested to provide the number of construction personnel short for each of the five new railway projects under construction.

IV Safety management measures for trains of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(05) - Administration's paper on safety management measures for trains of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

LC Paper No. CB(1)1722/13-14(06) - Paper on the construction of the Shatin to Central Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

8. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

V Any other business

9. The Chairman informed members that the Administration would brief the Subcommittee on railway development at a special meeting to be held on 29 September 2014.

(Post-meeting note: The meeting to discuss railway development was subsequently rescheduled to 27 October 2014.)

Action

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:15 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
29 October 2014

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 4 July 2014, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000507 – 000518	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item II – East Rail Line service disruptions on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014</i>			
000519 – 000826	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the East Rail Line ("ERL") service disruptions occurred on 27 and 28 April, and 1 and 2 May 2014.	
000827 – 001714	Chairman MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1759/13-14(01)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the abovementioned ERL service disruptions.	
001715 – 002247	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) expressed dissatisfaction with the four incidents of service disruption during rush hours as they caused much inconvenience to thousands of commuters; (b) asked whether the central monitoring and communications system of ERL had any ageing problem or if there was adequate control over operational stability; and (c) urged MTRCL to carry out a comprehensive review on the central monitoring and communications system of ERL to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the concerned router and concentrator had not yet reached their designed lifespans of over 20 years and therefore the possibility of ageing problem was ruled out; (b) a data analyzer was installed aiming at expediting recovery works by early detecting and rectifying problems if there was any 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>instability of the data network transmission; and</p> <p>(c) experts from the supplier of the central monitoring and communications system conducted an investigation of the service disruptions on 27 and 28 April 2014 and confirmed that they were caused by the malfunctioning of router and concentrator respectively, instead of systemic problem.</p>	
002248 – 002812	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam MTRCL	<p>Mr CHAN Kam-lam raised the following views and concerns:</p> <p>(a) unhappy with the frequent service disruptions of ERL which was a significant transport mode for New Territories residents;</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL decided to claim compensation from the supplier of the central monitoring and communications system, which might have provided substandard routers and concentrators to MTRCL and caused the recent ERL service disruptions; and</p> <p>(c) urged MTRCL to conduct a comprehensive review on all routers and concentrators in the central monitoring and communications system of ERL to prevent recurrence of similar incidents.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the supplier of the central monitoring and communications system should be responsible for any design problems whereas malfunctioning of individual routers and concentrators in the system would be generally regarded as maintenance issue; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL would learn from the recent service disruptions because they had not experienced unstable operation of the routers of a similar nature in the central monitoring and communications system of any railway line before.</p>	
002813 – 003403	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration	<p>Mr Gary FAN made the following enquiries:</p> <p>(a) whether the recent service disruptions reflected</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	<p>any ageing problem of the railway system of ERL which had been operating for more than 30 years;</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL had timely notified the media and the public of ERL service disruption on 27 April 2014; and if no, whether the Corporation would be penalized; and</p> <p>(c) whether the comment on railway service performance by Mr Jay WALDER, Chief Executive Officer, or Dr Jacob KAM, Operations Director, at a media briefing on 3 July 2014 was right because the former described MTRCL's performance as stable while the latter's comment was negative.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that after the recent ERL service disruptions, they, together with MTRCL, would discuss and review how to enhance the existing arrangement for notifying the public on train service disruptions.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the causes of the six ERL service disruptions in the first half 2014, such as faulty overhead line insulators, did not reveal any ageing problem; and</p> <p>(b) Mr Jay WALDER, Chief Executive Officer, reported that overall train service performance remained stable with 99.9% on-time performance in the first half of 2014. Nevertheless, Dr Jacob KAM, Operations Director, noted that six out of seven service disruptions in the same period occurred in ERL and therefore commented that the service performance of ERL was far from satisfactory.</p>	
003404 – 004111	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman raised the following questions:</p> <p>(a) whether MTRCL had installed a data analyzer in the central monitoring and communications system with a view to addressing the design failure to detect operational instability of routers and concentrators;</p> <p>(b) why MTRCL failed to notify the Administration and the media within eight minutes of ERL service disruption on 27 April</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>2014; and</p> <p>(c) whether MTRCL's maintenance staff lacked experience to tackle the problems encountered in railway service disruptions, e.g. the maintenance staff should wait for the backup train control system to activate train service, rather than rebooting the computers of the signalling system, as it would have saved about 10 minutes to resume the train service on 27 April 2014.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL would learn from ERL service disruption on 27 April 2014 because they had not experienced unstable operation of the routers of a similar nature in the central monitoring and communications system of any railway line before;</p> <p>(b) before notifying the Administration and the public of railway service disruptions, MTRCL needed time to confirm if the train involved had spent eight minutes or more than the original schedule to arrive at the terminal; and</p> <p>(c) after realizing ERL service disruption on 27 April 2014, MTRCL's staff had spared no effort to solve the problem and resume train service as early as practicable.</p>	
004112 – 004638	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL should place emphasis on the importance of risk management because if not, frequent railway service disruptions would occur;</p> <p>(b) urged MTRCL to conduct a comprehensive review on the risk management system, in particular the risk management of its hardware; and</p> <p>(c) requested MTRCL to provide a written report on the Corporation's current risk management system.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that their risk management system was in line with international</p>	MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 4 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>practice while the Corporation would take Ir Dr LO's views into account and try their best to enhance the system.</p>	
<p>004639 – 005159</p>	<p>Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG made the following suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) urged MTRCL to conduct a comprehensive review on ERL computer system for train control, which had been put into use since 1998; and (b) suggested enhancing ERL computer system for train control by various means, say, replacing the whole system with an updated version; and making standby train control system and backup train control system run in parallel. <p>MTRCL advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the works for replacement of ERL signalling system and data network transmission, which generally required six to seven years to complete, had already commenced; and (b) for the sake of safety, ERL signalling system should require certain time (say, one to two minutes) to undergo various processes, such as data verification, before switching from standby train control system to backup train control system. 	
<p>005200 – 005402</p>	<p>Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) when would the works for replacing ERL signalling system and data network transmission be completed; and (b) whether the Administration had appointed any professional engineers to monitor MTRCL's computer system for train control. <p>MTRCL explained that the new signalling system and data network transmission of ERL were expected to be in operation one or two years before the completion of the North South Corridor of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") project.</p> <p>The Administration advised that professional engineers from the Railways Branch of the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Electrical and Mechanical Services Department would monitor the safety performance of railway services provided by MTRCL, such as assessing the Corporation's new systems to ensure safety.</p>	
005403 – 005647	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman expressed that the Operations Director of MTRCL who was responsible for the operations of all railway lines might be heavily loaded and unable to implement forward-looking measures to prevent railway service disruptions. He, therefore, suggested that the railway lines in urban and rural areas be separately managed by two divisions within MTRCL.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) railway operations and developments were not the sole responsibility of the Operations Director because he was indeed supported by numerous teams and staff in the Corporation; and (b) MTRCL annually exchanged views and experiences with about thirty international railway operators with a view to continuously enhancing the Corporation's railway service performance. 	
005648 – 005907	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok enquired about the follow up on replacing faulty insulators after ERL train service disruptions in February 2014 and what lessons were learnt thereof.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) all insulators at 128 locations on ERL were replaced with a more reliable model; and (b) to enhance quality control after ERL incidents in February 2014, MTRCL arranged sampling test in verifying the mechanical tensile property upon receipt of the insulators, plus high voltage insulation property test before installation of each insulator. 	
005908 – 010136	Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG raised the following questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether MTRCL's maintenance staff lacked experience or clear guidelines and procedures 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>to tackle the problems encountered in railway service disruptions;</p> <p>(b) whether the Government, being the majority shareholder of MTRCL, would request the Corporation to conduct a comprehensive review on ERL computer system for train control, which had been operating since 1998; and</p> <p>(c) whether the signalling system of other railway lines, similar to that of ERL, required certain period of time to undergo some procedures before switching from standby train control system to backup train control system.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL's maintenance staff were well trained that they were able to handle railway service disruptions according to the established guidelines and procedures; and</p> <p>(b) in order to increase the efficiency of train service resumption, MTRCL's backup train control system would allow the Operations Control Centre at Tsing Yi to bypass the data network transmission and gain direct control of the signalling system when needed.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item III – Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link</i>			
010137 – 010624	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the progress update of the construction of SCL.	
010625 – 011956	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(1)1759/13-14(02)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the progress update of the construction of SCL.	
011957 – 012441	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) urged the Administration and MTRCL to spare no effort to protect the monuments and antiques unearthed on the one hand, whereas on the other hand, to minimize impact of archaeological work on the progress of the construction of SCL in To Kwa Wan;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) suggested renaming To Kwa Wan Station as "Sung Wong Toi Station" to commemorate the unearthing of monuments and antiques of the Song Dynasty and other periods; and</p> <p>(c) suggested setting up a museum to display monuments and antiques unearthed in the course of construction of SCL.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that:</p> <p>(a) they had been paying close attention to the archaeological discovery and making the best arrangement in respect of construction of SCL; and</p> <p>(b) they would discuss with relevant parties on Mr WONG's suggestions.</p>	
<p>012442 – 012846</p>	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Kam-lam expressed concern over the progress of the construction of SCL and raised the following questions:</p> <p>(a) whether the underground investigation work was not done thoroughly during the site investigation process so that MTRCL failed to detect the ground conditions at an earlier stage;</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL faced labour shortage problem in respect of railway construction; and if yes, whether MTRCL would formulate any remedial measures, such as application for labour importation, to ease the problem;</p> <p>(c) as MTRCL should handle the archaeological monuments unearthed under the direction and supervision of the Antiquities and Monuments Office ("AMO"), whether it affected the progress of the construction of SCL; and</p> <p>(d) why the tendering exercise for the works of Exhibition Station was conducted so late.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) it should be noted that ground investigations had been carried out as far as practicable to assess the ground conditions;</p> <p>(b) after realizing the possible delay in the progress of SCL project, MTRCL had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>implemented various measures to speed up the programme, such as installation of noise enclosure to allow 24-hour tunnel excavation works; and</p> <p>(c) MTRCL admitted that they faced the challenge of insufficient manpower, in particular tunnel workers. At present, MTRCL employed almost 100 tunnel workers while more were expected to speed up the progress of SCL project.</p>	
012847 – 013232	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN enquired whether the Administration and MTRCL would set up an independent archaeological expert group to ensure impartiality in protecting the monuments and antiques unearthed from SCL construction sites.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the Corporation was responsible for the coordination works in SCL construction sites whereas the independent archaeologist appointed by MTRCL's contractor should report the progress and findings of all the archeological works to AMO direct.</p> <p>The Administration supplemented that:</p> <p>(a) AMO had examined the qualifications of the archaeologist appointed by MTRCL's contractor before issuing a licence to the applicant in carrying out the archaeological work; and</p> <p>(b) AMO conducted site inspections weekly and reported regularly to the Antiquities Advisory Board ("AAB") to ensure that MTRCL complied with the statutory requirements to protect the relics unearthed from SCL construction sites.</p>	
013233 – 013732	Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG MTRCL	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG made the following enquiries:</p> <p>(a) apart from the lack of construction manpower, whether MTRCL encountered any other difficulties in the construction of Exhibition Station, which was expected to experience a six-month delay; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) whether the delay in the construction of Exhibition Station or the archaeological discovery in SCL sites would further delay the works in the Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter as it would cause much inconvenience to the Typhoon Shelter users.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) according to the latest information from the Administration, some of the critical works areas at Expo Drive East and Convention Avenue would only be available and handed over to SCL six months later than the original schedule, which would delay the progress of the construction of Exhibition Station; and</p> <p>(b) the Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter Tunnel Section was part of the construction works in the Central-Wan Chai Bypass project. If the works in the Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter Tunnel Section were carried out smoothly, the progress of the construction works in the Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter might not be delayed.</p>	
013733 – 014255	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Administration MTRCL	<p>Dr Helena WONG raised the following questions and views:</p> <p>(a) whether there was any delay in the existing progress that MTRCL only completed 16% of SCL overall works, as compared with the planned schedule;</p> <p>(b) whether it was possible to arrange the commissioning of SCL by phases because the works at certain stations, like Hin Keng, Diamond Hill and Kai Tak Stations, were in smooth progress;</p> <p>(c) whether the Administration or MTRCL formulated any possible measures to strike a balance between protecting archaeological discovery and making the best arrangement in respect of the construction of SCL;</p> <p>(d) which party (say, the Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB"), AAB, AMO or MTRCL) would be the decision maker to finalize the arrangement for the monuments and antiques unearthed from SCL construction sites; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(e) suggested that the Administration should submit the reports from PYPUN-KD & Associates Limited, the monitoring and verification consultant appointed by the Highways Department to assist in the monitoring work and undertake regular audits of SCL project, to members for reference.</p> <p>The Administration explained that they had closely monitored the work of MTRCL in SCL project through a Project Supervision Committee led by the Director of Highways ("DHy"). It also appointed a monitoring and verification consultant to assist DHy to monitor and carry out regular checking of the work of MTRCL. Besides, other government departments like AMO would be responsible for protecting relics unearthed from SCL construction sites.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL said that they would take into consideration Dr WONG's suggestion of commissioning SCL by phases when formulating the relevant measures.</p>	
014256 – 014724	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok raised the following questions and concerns:</p> <p>(a) the numbers of workers required and shortage for the construction works in SCL project;</p> <p>(b) expressed worry that the manpower shortage problem would further delay the progress of SCL project; and</p> <p>(c) apart from the change in the alignment of the proposed carriageway of Road L9 of the Stage 5 Infrastructure Works in the Kai Tak Development Area, whether MTRCL would propose other changes to the railway alignment of SCL project due to archaeological discovery.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the numbers of workers required and the shortage for the construction works in SCL project were about 4 100 and 1 000 respectively. It was estimated that manpower required for SCL project would increase to 8 000 during the peak construction period in the third quarter of 2014; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) MTRCL had no plan to make other changes to the railway alignment of SCL project in view of archaeological discovery.	
014725 – 015150	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>The Chairman expressed the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether the recent archaeological discovery of the well of the Qing Dynasty was taken into account when estimating that the delay brought by the archaeological work would be about six months; (b) expressed worry that more archaeological finds to be unearthed and serious labour shortage problem would further delay the progress of SCL project; (c) as regards the latest progress of the tunnel works and reclamation involved in SCL project, whether the handover of the site areas adjoining the junction of Expo Drive East and Convention Avenue would be further delayed; and if yes, how it might affect road traffic in Hung Hom; and (d) remarked that representatives from the Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") should attend the future Subcommittee meeting when discussing SCL project. <p>In response, MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the recent archaeological discovery of the well of the Qing Dynasty was not included in the estimation of the delay of about six months brought by the archaeological work so far. AMO's advice on how to handle such archaeological find was being awaited; and (b) if the labour shortage problem could not be eased, the progress of SCL might be adversely affected. <p>The Administration advised that after continuous discussions and review of the works progress with CEDD, the delay in the handover of the site areas adjoining the junction of Expo Drive East and Convention Avenue was shortened from eight months to six months.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015151 – 015622	Chairman Mr Tony TSE Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Tony TSE enquired:</p> <p>(a) whether MTRCL had reserved time to overcome unforeseeable difficulties and challenges encountered in the course of railway construction when assessing the anticipated commissioning dates of the North South Corridor and the East West Corridor of SCL; and</p> <p>(b) since Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section was expected to be commissioned earlier, whether the Administration had formulated any measures to alleviate the heavy traffic flows anticipated in busy areas such as Tsim Sha Tsui before the commissioning of Hung Hom to Admiralty Section two years later.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that in the light of the tight schedule of critical construction works in SCL project, it was difficult to reserve time for contingency purposes. Nevertheless, the Corporation would spare no effort to implement various measures to speed up the works.</p> <p>The Administration responded that they would closely monitor the progress of SCL project and formulate necessary measures to ensure smooth traffic flow before the commissioning of Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section of SCL.</p>	
015623 – 020133	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai made the following enquiries:</p> <p>(a) whether THB and the Development Bureau ("DEVB") had ever jointly discussed and reviewed the construction industry's delivery capacity to implement the railway projects simultaneously;</p> <p>(b) if the works at certain stations were in smooth progress, whether it was possible to arrange the commissioning of SCL by phases, similar to the backup plan to skip Sai Ying Pun Station of the West Island Line; and</p> <p>(c) as regards the launching shaft of the tunnel boring machine ("TBM") at To Kwa Wan Station, whether the TBM could be assembled as scheduled or the construction works there were suspended to make way for the archaeological survey.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>In response, the Administration explained that:</p> <p>(a) THB and DEVB had collaborated with each other to assess the construction industry's delivery capacity, say, manpower demand for infrastructure projects; and</p> <p>(b) upon Mr WU's request, the Administration/MTRCL would provide the number of construction personnel short for each of the five new railway projects under construction.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the construction works of the launching shaft were suspended to make way for the archaeological survey and therefore, the progress of tunnelling works and To Kwa Wan Station were adversely affected.</p>	<p>Administration / MTRCL to provide information / response (paragraph 7 of minutes)</p>
<p><i>Agenda Item IV – Safety management measures for trains of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i></p>			
<p>020134 – 020634</p>	<p>Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing raised the following questions:</p> <p>(a) whether trains of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") would not be able to comply with EN15227 standard on crashworthiness for trains, as reported by some media, were true or not; and why MTRCL did not clarify the concerned matter as early as practicable; and</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration had monitored safety of XRL trains before the media revealed the problem.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <p>(a) the Corporation assured that safety performance of XRL trains was in compliance with international standards. However, as local requirements and scenarios were different from those in European Union countries, EN15227 standard could not be fully applicable to XRL trains;</p> <p>(b) arising from the public concern over safety of XRL trains, MTRCL had already issued letters to the media to clarify that XRL trains would be able to meet the relevant international safety</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>standards; and</p> <p>(c) to allay public concern, MTRCL also sought advice from various parties, such as high speed train manufacturers in the Mainland and overseas countries, to ensure that XRL trains would be able to comply with international safety standards.</p>	
020635 – 020956	Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL	<p>Mr Tony TSE expressed that MTRCL seemed:</p> <p>(a) unfamiliar with the market as none of the existing high speed train models could meet the requirements of EN15227 standard stipulated in MTRCL's tenders; and</p> <p>(b) uncertain what international safety standard XRL trains would be in compliance with and therefore had to clarify with various parties in view of the negative media reports.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that EN15227 standard, which was developed based on the operation modes of railways in Europe with different types of trains running on the same railway track, was not applicable for the case of XRL high speed trains. Indeed, the Hong Kong section ("HKS") of XRL adopted Chinese Train Control System ("CTCS") specifications for active protection, including CTCS-2 specification and CTCS-3 specification as multiple back-up systems designed to provide multiple failure defense to ensure operation safety.</p>	
020957 – 021537	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan made the following enquiries:</p> <p>(a) which international safety standard (e.g. EN12663 standard or EN15227 standard) was adopted for XRL trains; and</p> <p>(b) compatibility of the signalling systems between HKS and the Mainland section.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that trains of HKS of XRL adopted EN12663 standard for the design of carbody structure which was a widely adopted international standard in this respect; whereas the process described in EN15227 standard was adopted to cater for the operation conditions in Hong Kong.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration made the following responses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) active train safety protection measure was adopted for XRL trains to ensure a safe distance between trains to avoid collision; and (b) the causes of the Wenzhou incident in the Mainland had been reviewed and it was considered that such incident would not occur in HKS of XRL. 	
021538 – 021906	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok raised the following views and concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) suggested providing quicker response and giving clear explanations of MTRCL's safety management measures for XRL trains in the light of relevant negative media reports; and (b) enquired about the carbody structure requirement for train crashworthiness of the trains procured for XRL. <p>In response, MTRCL advised that the current structural strength of XRL train body was reported to be able to withstand the impact at collision speed of around 25 kilometres per hour. MTRCL explained that EN12663 stipulated requirements for structural strength of train carbody.</p> <p>The Administration supplemented that they had requested MTRCL to submit the report to be prepared by independent consultants on verifying the above strength of XRL trains in respect of train crashworthiness (i.e. 25 kilometres per hour) and the report was being awaited.</p>	
021907 – 022326	Chairman Dr Helena WONG MTRCL	<p>Dr Helena WONG enquired:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether MTRCL stipulated the specified speed of XRL trains regarding crashworthiness in the tenders; and (b) whether the signalling system for XRL trains was enhanced as compared with the one adopted for the train service involved in the Wenzhou incident. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it was considered that EN15227 standard provided for the cases where provision of active safety measures, such as the automatic train protection system by signalling, was not available or railway with mixed mode operation or with level crossing. In addition, the carbody structure requirements for train crashworthiness at 36 kilometres per hour specified in EN15227 standard were only for slow speed collision, not a protection for collision at high speed. In this connection, it was not considered necessary to stipulate the specified speed of XRL high speed trains regarding crashworthiness in the tenders; and (b) the signalling system adopted for the train system involved in the Wenzhou incident was CTCS-2 system whereas CTCS-2 system and CTCS-3 system would be adopted for HKS of XRL as multiple back-up systems designed to provide multiple failure defense to ensure operation safety. 	
022327 – 022635	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai MTRCL	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the compatibility of train models and signalling systems between HKS and the Mainland section.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the signalling systems between the Mainland section and HKS were compatible because both sections adopted the same systems (i.e. CTCS-2 and CTCS-3 systems); (b) it was designed that only nine XRL trains would be purchased by Hong Kong for operation between Guangzhou section and HKS, and the signalling systems (inclusive of trackside and trainborne signalling systems) adopted by the nine XRL trains, as with other high speed train models running on dedicated passenger lines in the Mainland, would comply with CTCS specifications; and (c) MTRCL would discuss with the Administration on the arrangement for other train models from the Mainland to come to Hong Kong to ensure their compatibility with the signalling systems. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
022636 – 023036	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan MTRCL	<p>The Chairman cast doubt on why MTRCL did not indicate the carbody structure requirement for train crashworthiness of XRL trains during the tendering process. He opined that in extreme cases, like malfunction in the signalling systems, manual operation would be required and a higher requirement for train crashworthiness might help minimize the possible injuries caused to all people on board.</p> <p>MTRCL made the following response:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) safety management measures for XRL trains took account of the requirements to achieve overall train reliability and railway safety; (b) the carbody structure requirement for train crashworthiness at 36 kilometres per hour specified in EN15227 standard was only for slow speed collision, not a protection for collision at high speed. In addition to different scenarios as compared with the European Union countries, EN15227 standard could not be fully applicable to XRL trains; and (c) in extreme cases where manual operation was required, the emergency procedures would include restricted operations at low speed to ensure that adequate safety distance were provided between trains to prevent collision. <p>Mr CHAN Han-pan suggested that MTRCL should provide more details on signalling systems and safety standards of Hong Kong and other places to members for reference at an appropriate time.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item V – Any other business</i>			
023037 – 023119	Chairman	The Chairman informed members that the Administration would brief the Subcommittee on railway development at a special meeting to be held on 29 September 2014.	