

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC86/14-15
(These minutes have been
cleared with the Chairman)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 19th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 12 December 2014, at 5:40 pm

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon IP Kin-yuen

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr WONG Kam-sing, JP	Secretary for the Environment
Mr Howard CHAN Wai-kee, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)
	Environmental Protection Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1) ⁵
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1) ⁷
Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1) ⁵
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1) ⁵
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1) ³
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1) ⁷

Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)33A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse disposal
165DR – West New Territories Landfill Extension

The Committee continued to deal with the motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FC Procedure") to express views on the item FCR(2014-15)33A.

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

Motions proposed by Mr Gary FAN

2. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr Gary FAN numbered W085 and W086 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr FAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN

3. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered W019 to W046 and W048 and W058 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions submitted by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen without notice

4. At around 6:00 pm, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen submitted 10 proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure. The Chairman considered that seven were directly related to FCR(2014-15)33A, and agreed that they would be put to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded.

Motion proposed by Ms Cyd HO

5. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Ms Cyd HO numbered W060 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. With the agreement of the Chairman, Ms HO read out her proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The question was negatived.

Motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG

6. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG numbered W061 to W066 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr CHEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions submitted by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung without notice

7. At around 6:15 pm, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung submitted 40 proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure. The Chairman considered that 18 were directly related to FCR(2014-15)33A, and agreed that they would be put to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded forthwith. At around 7:00 pm, Mr LEUNG submitted another 19 motions. The Chairman considered that seven were directly related to FCR(2014-15)33A, and agreed that they would be put to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded forthwith.

Motions proposed by Ms Emily LAU

8. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Ms Emily LAU numbered W087 to W089, W091 to W093, W095 and W096 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Ms LAU read out each of her proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

9. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered W108 to W114 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negated.

Motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

10. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered W059, W118 to W134 and W141 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negated.

Motions submitted by Mr Albert CHAN without notice

11. At 7:20 pm Mr Albert CHAN submitted seven proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure. The Chairman considered that all of them were directly related to FCR(2014-15)33A, and agreed that they would be put to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded after Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had moved all his motions.

Motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

12. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered W158 to W161 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negated.

13. After the Committee had dealt with the proposed motion numbered W161, the Chairman reminded members that if no more members submitted further proposed motions, he would put the item to vote after the Committee had dealt with 10 outstanding motions from members.

14. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered W162 to W164 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN

15. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered W165 to W171 to be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Voting on FCR(2014-15)33A

16. As the Committee had dealt with all of the motions proposed to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on item FCR(2014-15)33A, the Chairman put the item to vote.

17. Mr Albert CHAN raised a point of order and asked if he could move a motion to change the duration of the division bell to two minutes. The Chairman referred Mr CHAN to the note prepared by the Secretariat and distributed to members vide LC Paper FC67/14-15 dated 10 December 2014. He said that it was not in order for a member to move such a motion.

18. Mr Albert CHAN said that he had interest to declare. He said that the collection and treatment of waste were financed by General Revenue to which he had contributed through tax and that the charging of waste disposal would affect him as he also contributed towards the generation of waste. The Chairman interrupted and said that the matter that Mr CHAN mentioned was not a direct or indirect pecuniary interest related to the item.

19. The Chairman continued with the voting procedure. At the request of members, he ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman announced that 27 members voted in favour of, and 16 voted against the item. The voting results of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing
Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(27 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Mr TANG Ka-piu
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun

Against:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
(16 members)

Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Ms Claudia MO
Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan

20. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.
21. The Chairman declared that the meeting was adjourned, and that the next meeting would continue to deal with the proposed motions from members in respect of item FCR(2014-15)34A.
22. The meeting was adjourned at 7:40 pm.