

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC193/14-15
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 35th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Saturday, 14 February 2015, at 10:41 am

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Public officers attending:

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Professor K C CHAN, GBS, JP | Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury |
| Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP | Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) |
| Ms Esther LEUNG, JP | Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹ |
| Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong | Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch) |
| Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, GBS, JP | Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development |
| Miss Susie HO, JP | Permanent Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology) |
| Mr Joe WONG, JP | Deputy Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology) |
| Miss Janet WONG, JP | Commissioner for Innovation and Technology |
| Mr Johann WONG, JP | Deputy Commissioner for Innovation and Technology |
| Mr Victor LAM, JP | Acting Government Chief Information Officer |
| Miss Joey LAM, JP | Deputy Government Chief Information Officer (Policy and Community) |

Clerk in attendance:

| | |
|--------------|-------------------------------|
| Ms Anita SIT | Assistant Secretary General 1 |
|--------------|-------------------------------|

Staff in attendance:

| | |
|------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Mr Derek LO | Chief Council Secretary (1)5 |
| Mr Daniel SIN | Senior Council Secretary (1)7 |
| Mr Raymond SZETO | Council Secretary (1)5 |
| Mr Frankie WOO | Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3 |
| Ms Michelle NIEN | Legislative Assistant (1)5 |
| Miss Yannes HO | Legislative Assistant (1)6 |

Action

Item No. 1 – FCR(2014-15)36

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 11 JUNE 2014**

Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)37

**NEW HEAD "GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :
INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY BUREAU"**

**HEAD 47 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :
OFFICE OF THE GOVERNMENT CHIEF
INFORMATION OFFICER**

**HEAD 55 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :
COMMERCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
BUREAU (COMMUNICATIONS AND
TECHNOLOGY BRANCH)**

**HEAD 155 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :
INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY COMMISSION**

Motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Committee

The Committee continued with the debate on Mr Albert CHAN's motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Committee. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Albert CHAN introduced his motion.

2. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr Gary FAN, Ms Emily LAU, Mr IP Kin-yuen, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Mr WU Chi-wai, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Ms Cyd HO, Mr Frederick FUNG and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen spoke in support of the motion.

3. In gist, these members criticized the Administration for withdrawing important funding items to make way for early approval of the two funding

items related to the establishment of the Innovation and Technology Bureau ("ITB"). Some members commented that the Administration had not sufficiently elucidated the justifications and the scope of work of the proposed ITB, while some other members criticized the Administration for lack of vision and planning on the long-term development of technology industries in Hong Kong. Some members also criticized the Administration for establishing ITB just to accommodate the Chief Executive's political cronies. One member commented that the Innovation and Technology Commission was ineffective in promoting commercialization of research and development results, the development of which was funded under the Innovation and Technology Fund. He considered that it was unlikely that the proposed ITB would be able to make significant improvement in this regard.

4. Mr YIU Si-wing, Ms Starry LEE, Mr IP Kwok-him, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Dr LO Wai-kwok, Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Mr Jeffrey LAM, Dr LAM Tai-fai, Mrs Regina IP, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr Charles MOK, Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Mr LEUNG Chi-cheung, Mr Steven HO and Mr TAM Yiu-chung spoke against the motion.

5. These members mainly criticized members of the pan-democrat camp for procrastinating the funding process and stalling the development of technology industries and promotion of innovation in Hong Kong. They appealed to those members to drop their filibustering tactics and to approve the proposals expeditiously.

6. Mr SIN Chung-kai spoke in response to some members' comments on his position on the matter.

7. While Mr TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke loudly in his seat. The Chairman told Mr LEUNG to remain silent when it was not his turn to speak. Mr Frederick FUNG interrupted Mr TAM's speech and tried to clarify a comment of Mr TAM about him. The Chairman said that Mr Frederick FUNG should respond to Mr TAM's comments when it was his turn to speak during the debate on the agenda items.

8. The Administration did not have comments in response to the motion.

9. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Albert CHAN delivered his concluding remarks. During Mr CHAN's speech, Mr TAM Yiu-chung interrupted and said that some of Mr CHAN's remarks were offensive, and requested the Chairman to order Mr CHAN to retract his comments. In response to the Chairman, Mr CHAN said that some members of the

pro-establishment camp had used similar language to criticize Mr Alan LEONG, but the Chairman had not ruled such remarks as offensive. The Chairman said that Mr Alan LEONG had not raised a point of order and asked for his ruling against such remarks. He suspended the meeting at 12:21 pm to consider the point of order raised by Mr TAM Yiu-chung about Mr Albert CHAN's remarks.

10. The meeting resumed at 12:28 pm. The Chairman said that he had reviewed the video recording of the meeting. He considered that members from either camp had been sharp and critical at times in their comments about members of the opposite camp. He reminded members to show mutual respect and avoid personal attack in their speeches. Mr Albert CHAN then continued his concluding speech.

11. The Chairman then put Mr Albert CHAN's motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes.

12. The Chairman announced that 19 members voted for and 33 members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Ms Claudia MO
Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr IP Kin-yuen
(19 members)

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WONG Yuk-man
Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr SIN Chung-kai

Against:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr IP Kwok-him

Dr LAU Wong-fat
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Dr LAM Tai-fai
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee

| | |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun | Mr NG Leung-sing |
| Mr Steven HO Chun-yin | Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming |
| Mr YIU Si-wing | Mr MA Fung-kwok |
| Mr Charles Peter MOK | Mr CHAN Han-pan |
| Mr LEUNG Che-cheung | Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen |
| Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung | Dr Elizabeth QUAT |
| Mr POON Siu-ping | Mr TANG Ka-piu |
| Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok |
| Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen | |
| (33 members) | |

13. The Chairman declared that the motion was negated.

14. The Committee resumed the deliberation on the items FCR(2014-15)36 and FCR(2014-15)37.

15. Mr IP Kin-yuen said that Mr Charles MOK had made an effort to lobby him to support the proposed establishment of ITB. He commented that because of the Administration's withdrawal of the relevant funding proposals to make way for priority handling of the items related to the establishment of ITB, the implementation of the Enriched IT Programme in Secondary Schools and the Fourth Strategy on Information Technology in Education suffered delay and many schools would be affected.

16. The Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned and the deliberation on the agenda items would continue at the next meeting after a break of 30 minutes.

17. The meeting was adjourned at 12:39 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
12 June 2015