

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. FC255/14-15

(These minutes been seen  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

**Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 44<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
on Friday, 8 May 2015, at 3:00 pm**

**Members present:**

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Dennis KWOK  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent:**

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon WONG Yuk-man  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Public officers attending:**

Professor K C CHAN, GBS, JP	Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury
Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yea, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr LAM Sze-chuen	Assistant Director of Housing (Project) 1
Mr LO Kwok-kong	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Housing Department
Mr IP Shing-tim	Acting Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department
Mr WONG Mung-wan	Chief Architect (2), Housing Department
Mr YAU Kwan-wai	Regional Highway Engineer (New Territories), Highways Department
Mr NG Wai-keung	Chief Highway Engineer (New Territories West), Highways Department
Mr POON Chi-man	Principal Transport Officer (New Territories), Transport Department
Prof Sophia CHAN, JP	Under Secretary for Food and Health
Miss Diane WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2
Mr LAM Wing-hong	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations) 2
Mr Edwin WONG Kuo-yang	Chief Architect (Central Management) 2, Architectural Services Department
Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP	Under Secretary for Security
Mr Alex CHAN Yuen-tak	Principal Assistant Secretary for Security (B)
Mr LI Kin-yat, FSMSM	Deputy Director of Fire Services
Dr Axel SIU Yuet-chung	Medical Director, Ambulance Command, Fire Services Department

Mr NGAI Tak-yung	Senior Divisional Officer (Special Project), Fire Services Department
Mr Eric CHUNG Kin-sang	Superintendent (Special Project), Fire Services Department

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

---

**Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)8  
RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE  
PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE MADE  
ON 18 AND 31 MARCH 2015**

The Chairman advised that the item sought the Committee's approval of the recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made at the meetings on 18 and 31 March 2015. Members of PWSC had requested that items PWSC(2014-15)54 and PWSC(2014-15)57 should be considered and voted on separately at the Finance Committee ("FC") meeting.

PWSC(2014-15)54

2. The Chairman advised that the item PWSC(2014-15)54 was to upgrade project 81TI – Public Transport Interchange and Associated Works at Kiu Cheong Road East, Ping Shan to Category A at an estimated cost of \$602.2 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices. He directed that members' speaking time, including the Administration's reply, should not exceed five minutes each.

*Bus service for Tin Shui Wai*

3. Mr Michael TIEN expressed support for the proposal. Noting the difficulty encountered by residents in Tin Shui Wai South boarding buses

during peak hours, he urged the Administration to consider providing more bus stops in Tin Shui Wai South, more circular routes and bus-bus interchange stations at the proposed Public Transport Interchange ("PTI") so as to enable residents in Tin Shui Wai South to get on buses and travel to their destinations more easily. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed similar views.

4. Principal Transport Officer (New Territories), Transport Department ("PTO(NT)/TD") advised that the design of bus routes had taken into account the paces of development and population intake of Tin Shui Wai South and Tin Shui Wai North. Citing as an example the splitting of the bus route E34 into two new bus routes, E34A and E34B, to serve respectively passengers from Tin Shui Wai and Yuen Long travelling to Tung Chung and the Hong Kong International Airport ("HKIA"), PTO(NT)/TD said that the Administration spared no effort in rationalizing bus routes where appropriate. He took note of members' suggestions on an even distribution of bus routes and termini.

5. Miss Alice MAK considered the above-mentioned rationalization of route E34 a failure because she had received quite a number of complaints against it. PTO(NT)/TD said that the upsurged demand in Route E34 was due to a number of infrastructural projects going on in the vicinity of HKIA and Tung Chung North. The Administration had worked with the franchised bus operators to strengthen services in the morning and evening to cater for the demand.

6. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed concern about the long travelling time that Tin Shui Wai residents spent on long-haul bus journeys and that the problem had remained for many years. Mr LEE urged the Administration to provide direct bus routes serving Tin Shui Wai North and South respectively.

7. PTO(NT)/TD advised that the Administration kept pursuing bus route development programme. The Administration discussed with respective District Councils ("DCs") about the "Route Development Programme" every year and maintained good communication with the local community regarding public transport services having regard to local development, demographic change and residents' demand. Bus services of Yuen Long/Tin Shui Wai were rationalized last year. Members' views would be reflected when consulting the relevant DCs.

#### *Design of the pedestrian footbridge*

8. Mr Tony TSE accepted the Administration's proposal of adding green features on both sides of the bridge deck level after reviewing the difficulties of roof greening. Mr TSE asked the Administration to consider providing fixing

brackets for displaying banners and government publicity materials on the outside of the footbridge.

9. Assistant Director of Housing (Project) 1 ("AD of H(P)1") responded that there would be steel brackets at suitable locations of the footbridge to facilitate installation of future display of flexible and mobile exhibits. However, for the safety of road users passing underneath the footbridge, it was not desirable to display banners on the outside of the footbridge.

*Construction cost and capacity of cycle parking facilities*

10. Referring to the supplementary information provided by the Administration to PWSC (Annex B to LC Paper No. PWSC169/14-15(01)), Mr Tony TSE queried the rationale to include in the cost estimate of \$3.1 million for the cycle parking area the expenses arising from other works, such as demolition and reinstatement of part of an existing planter, since it might give rise to the perception that each standard bicycle parking facility cost as high as \$0.1 million. Actually, the estimated cost of the 30 bicycle parking facilities to be provided in the cycle parking area was only \$0.7 million.

11. AD of H(P)1 said that the proposed cycle parking area under current project was located at an existing planting area. The construction works would comprise not only the construction of standard cycle parking facilities with associated pavement and drainage system, but also the transplanting and maintenance of existing trees, demolition and reinstatement of the existing planter, relocation of the affected street furniture as well as detection and protection to existing major utility apparatus underground. In line with usual practice, the costs of associated works were included in individual project estimates.

12. Mr Tony TSE did not subscribe to the Administration's explanation and suggested that the Administration should review the costing practice. Acting Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department ("CCE(2)(Ag.)/HD") replied that in view of the extent of the associated works required, such as detection and protection to existing major utility apparatus before and during construction including a 132kV high voltage cable and two gas mains of 250mm and 400mm in diameter, it was appropriate to subsume relevant expenses under the construction cost of the cycle parking area.

13. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung supported the proposal as it would enhance the accessibility to the West Rail station. Mr LEUNG asked whether the provision of cycle parking spaces was adequate to cater for the needs of the local community. AD of H(P)1 said that there were existing cycle parking facilities for public use in the vicinity, such as two existing cycle parking

facilities providing 514 cycle parking spaces in close proximity of the Tin Shui Wai MTR station for public use, including 330 and 184 spaces at the site north and south of the MTR Station respectively. Besides, the new Home Ownership Scheme ("HOS") development at Ping Shan would provide 322 cycle parking spaces. The Administration would closely monitor the cycle parking situation in the vicinity and if more cycle parking spaces were found necessary, the proposed cycle parking area would be extended to provide more parking spaces.

14. Miss Alice MAK said members of Yuen Long DC had recently raised concerns about insufficient cycle parking spaces and design of parking facilities in the district. She requested the Administration to keep on communicating with the relevant DC and local residents on relevant matters.

*Environmental impact of the proposed works*

15. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung enquired whether the Administration would implement any measures to mitigate the noise impact generated by the operation of the proposed PTI.

16. AD of H(P)1 replied that the cover of the PTI, which had been endorsed by the Environmental Protection Department, could mitigate noise nuisance arising from the operation of the PTI to within the maximum permitted noise level of 55db(A) at night. Covers of similar designs had been adopted for public housing developments in Hung Shui Kiu and Shui Chuen O. Further consideration would be given to installing additional barriers to reduce its noise level if necessary.

17. Miss Alice MAK relayed concerns from local residents about the vibration and noise generated by construction works under the project and said that the Administration should communicate with local residents on the measures to mitigate the impact. AD of H(P)1 said that the Housing Authority ("HA"), which would be responsible for implementing the project, would specify in the relevant contract the requirement for the contractor to implement mitigation measures to control noise, dust, and site run-off nuisances during construction. These included the use of silencers, mufflers, acoustic lining or shields for noisy construction activities, frequent cleaning and watering of the site. To tackle the vibration generated by piling, HA had adopted large diameter bored piling, which would minimize disturbances to adjacent structures. Miss Alice MAK urged the Administration to communicate with Ping Shan residents so as to address their concerns.

*Liability and construction time*

18. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok declared that he was a member of the Building Committee and Tender Committee of HA and expressed support for the proposal. Ir Dr LO sought explanation for the on-cost of \$64.3 million payable to HA for the entrustment of the design and construction of the proposed works, and the respective liability of HA and the Highways Department. He also asked if the construction time of the PTI project could be shortened.

19. AD of H(P)1 advised that as the PTI and its associated works would be in close proximity to the new HOS development, the proposed works and the new HOS development would have significant interface. Considering that there would be limited vehicular access and congested works area, the Administration planned to entrust the design and construction of the proposed works to HA for implementation. Such arrangement would allow better coordination of the PTI project and the adjoining HOS development to ensure timely completion of the PTI and its associated works. As regards construction time of the project, AD of H(P)1 said that the construction of the PTI was planned to commence in October 2015 subject to funding approval of FC. The construction period had been reduced from 34 months to 28 months and could not be further shortened. It would be completed by late 2017/early 2018 to tie in with the population intake of the HOS development.

*Recurrent cost arising from the proposed works*

20. Referring to the supplementary information provided by the Administration to PWSC (Annex C to LC Paper No. PWSC169/14-15(01)), Mr Tony TSE queried the justification for the estimated annual recurrent expenditure of \$5 million arising from the proposed works for the first year after their completion since the works would be under the free maintenance warranty provided by the contractor during the first year.

21. AD of H(P)1 said that upon completion, the PTI and its associated facilities would be handed over to relevant departments for management and maintenance. The above-mentioned expenditure was the average total amount estimated for the operation and relevant repair and maintenance for items such as the highway structure (including PTI cover, footbridge, lift and associated structures), trees and irrigation system in a year. CCE(2)(Ag.)/HD supplemented that the contractor would be responsible for works defects at no extra cost during the first year after works completion, the expenditure for repair and maintenance during the first year would be less than \$5 million and the expenditure of \$5 million was estimated based upon an average-out approach.



22. There being no further question from members, the Chairman put the item PWSC(2014-15)54 to vote. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

PWSC(2014-15)57

23. The Chairman advised that the item PWSC(2014-15)57 was to upgrade project 6NR –Reprovisioning of a refuse collection point ("RCP") at Fuk Wa Street/Fuk Wing Street/Camp Street to Category A at an estimated cost of \$58.6 million in MOD prices.

*Location of proposed refuse collection point and residential units*

24. Dr Helena WONG was concerned that the co-location of the RCP with residential development would cause considerable nuisance to residents in the future residential development. She enquired whether the proposed RCP would be co-located with future residential units in the same building. Mr IP Kwok-him considered it acceptable for the developer to put the RCP and residential units in the same building as long as suitable mitigation measures would be put in place to control environmental impacts of the RCP.

25. Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") responded that as the design of the proposed RCP would be prepared by the developer, it could not confirm whether the proposed RCP and residential units would be co-located in the same building at this stage. She however advised that the entrance, driveway, passageway, sewerage system and other facilities of the proposed permanent RCP would be completely separated from the future residential development. USFH assured members that the Administration accorded great importance to odour mitigation for the RCP. A water scrubber system would be used at the RCP for effective control of the odour.

26. Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2, Food and Health Bureau ("PAS(F)2/FHB") supplemented that to ensure that the developer would design and construct the RCP according to the Government's specifications and satisfaction, a technical schedule detailing the relevant specifications and requirements would be annexed to the land sale conditions of the site. The design, planning, construction and operation of the permanent RCP should also follow the environmental planning principles in Chapter 9 of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines and related environmental pollution control ordinances.

27. Dr Helena WONG expressed grave concern that there would be a large number of complaints from local residents against the nuisances caused by the construction and operation of the RCP. She suggested that the

Administration should stipulate in the relevant Deed of Mutual Covenant a minimum vertical distance between the RCP and the future residential units above it.

*Mitigation measures to reduce odour nuisance*

28. Citing as an example the success of the odour-elimination facilities at the RCP at Tannar Road, North Point, Mr WONG Kwok-hing urged the Administration to adopt similar facilities in the proposed RCP. Ms Emily LAU enquired whether the Administration would refine the technical design of the RCP to address members' views raised at the meeting.

29. PAS(F)2/FHB said that the Administration had studied the Tannar Road RCP but found that the present provision of water scrubber in the ventilating system of the RCP was an effective measure to prevent odour nuisance during the RCP operation. Its effectiveness in odour removal had been well demonstrated in seven other similar RCP projects.

30. Mr IP Kwok-him said that the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong supported the proposal. Mr IP commented that the Administration should specify in the land sale conditions of the site the waste treatment requirements to reduce its odour nuisance, such as utilizing biological treatment technology for treatment of waste. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concern whether the odour absorption system mentioned by the Administration could effectively eliminate the odour at the RCP.

31. USFH said that special ancillary and environmental mitigation measures, including an independent sewage system for foul water, water scrubber system, refuse collection vehicle ("RCVs") exhaust extraction systems and air treatment devices would be provided at the RCP to minimize the nuisance arising from its operation to the residents.

32. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed skepticism that if the said odour absorption measures were effective, they should have been extended to all RCPs. The Chairman said that concerns about other RCPs should be pursued at the relevant Panel instead.

*Reimbursement of the RCP construction cost by the Government*

33. Ms Cyd HO referred to the supplementary information provided by the Administration to PWSC (in LC Paper No. PWSC167/14-15(01)) and sought elaboration on the provisions for the cost of furniture and equipment, and for contingencies in the RCP project cost of \$58.6 million.

34. PAS(F)2/FHB explained that as the furniture and equipment for the RCP would be procured by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD"), the relevant amount would be deducted from the estimated cost of the project for calculating the ceiling of reimbursement to the developer of the site who would be responsible for constructing the RCP. On the provision for contingencies in the cost, it was for use in the event that the Administration might impose additional requirements for the RCP, such as installation of turntable for RCVs.

35. In response to Ms Cyd HO's enquiry, PAS(F)2/FHB clarified that the term "purchaser" of the site appearing in footnote 3(b) in LC Paper No. PWSC167/14-15(01) referred to the future developer of the residential site.

*Pedestrian entrance and exit of the refuse collection point*

36. Mr Albert CHAN expressed dissatisfaction with the Administration's response to the suggestion he had made at PWSC that the pedestrian entrance and exit and the vehicular ingress and egress of the proposed RCP should be made further apart from each other to enhance pedestrian safety at the vehicular ingress and egress.

37. Mr IP Kwok-him enquired whether the pedestrian entrance and exit of the proposed RCP would only be used by workers for collecting and transporting garbage to RCVs since if this was so, it could not be located far away from the vehicular ingress and egress of the RCP. USFH confirmed that the users of the pedestrian entrance and exit of the RCP would be limited to workers only.

38. In response to Mr Albert CHAN's concern, USFH said that the pedestrian entrance and exit of the RCP, which was solely for serving the RCP, would be totally separated from the pedestrian entrance and exit of the residential development.

39. Chief Architect (Central Management)2, Architectural Services Department ("CA(CM)2/ASD") supplemented that it was not possible to confirm the distance between the pedestrian entrance and exit and the vehicular ingress and egress of the proposed RCP at this stage as the actual design of the RCP would be prepared by the developer. Notwithstanding, to enhance pedestrian safety, the Administration would stipulate under the technical schedule that the pedestrian entrance and exit of the RCP facing Fuk Wa Street should be separated from the vehicular ingress and egress of the RCP as far as practicable.

40. The Chairman, Dr Helena WONG and Mr IP Kwok-him enquired whether the Administration could stipulate under the land sale conditions of the site that the entrance and exit of the future residential development would not face Fuk Wa Street.

41. PAS(F)2/FHB said that the Administration would stipulate under the technical schedule that the pedestrian entrance and exit of the RCP facing Fuk Wa Street should be separated from the vehicular ingress and egress of the RCP as far as possible.

42. USFH reiterated that the Administration accorded great importance to pedestrian safety. The developer was required to obtain agreement from the Government on the design proposal of the RCP before commencing the construction of the RCP. Mr Albert CHAN requested the Administration to inform members of its tendering requirements for the sale of the site through short message service in due course. USFH replied in the affirmative.

43. Mr Tony TSE expressed support for the proposal as it would optimize development potential and better utilize scarce land resources, and would contribute to an increase of about 41% in the estimated number of flats to be provided. He held the view that the developer would naturally work out measures to minimize the nuisances caused by the RCP operation. Mr CHAN Kin-por and Mr IP Kwok-him shared Mr TSE's views. Mr CHAN asked if any real examples could be provided to illustrate the situation. Mr IP commented that no developer would allow its future residential development to share a common entrance and exit with the proposed RCP.

44. CA(CM)2/ASD said that the land sale site was surrounded by three streets and the developer could decide on its own the entrance and exit of the residential development facing Camp Street or Fuk Wing Street. The Administration should refrain from imposing too many restrictions on the design of the RCP, which might inadvertently affect the land sale result. Moreover, it was unlikely that the developer would put the entrance and exit of the residential building and the entrance and exit of the RCP close to each other.

45. In response to the Chairman's request, USFH undertook to convey to the Lands Department members' request for including in the land sale conditions restriction that the entrance and exit of the future residential development should not face Fuk Wa Street.

46. Mr Tony TSE suggested that the Administration should impose design requirements on the RCP so that it would be in line with the Government's environmental strategies (e.g. Programme on Source Separation of Domestic Waste).

47. PAS(F)2/FHB responded that space would be provided in the RCP for the use of material recovery and that the RCP would be well operated, managed and maintained by FEHD.

*Other concerns*

48. Dr Helena WONG asked whether the funding proposal would cover the cost of an independent sewage system for foul water and whether the changing rooms with shower facilities equipped in the proposed RCP were designed for cleansing staff. CA(CM)2/ASD replied in the affirmative.

49. Dr Helena WONG enquired why dangerous goods would be kept in the RCP as they would pose danger to the residents in the residential development site. Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations) 2 advised that the dangerous goods that would be stored in the RCP, as in other RCPs, generally referred to insecticides and detergents used for daily street cleaning. It was unlikely that they would pose danger to the residents of the residential development adjacent to the RCP.

50. There being no further question from members, the Chairman put the item PWSC(2014-15)57 to vote. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

**Item No. 2 – FCR(2015-16)6**

**CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND**

**HEAD 710 – COMPUTERISATION**

**Fire Services Department**

**New Subhead "Development of computer system for provision of post-dispatch advice"**

51. The Chairman advised that the item sought the Committee's approval of a new commitment of \$37,880,000 for developing a computer system for the Fire Services Department ("FSD") to provide post-dispatch advice ("PDA") in the handling of emergency ambulance calls.

Report by the Panel Chairman

52. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr IP Kwok-him, Chairman of the Panel on Security, reported that the Panel discussed the proposal on 8 July 2014.

53. Mr IP Kwok-him said that Panel members expressed concern on whether operators of the Fire Services Communication Centre ("FSCC") would be required to make any judgment when providing PDA under the proposed

computer system. The Administration had responded that when using the system, FSCC operators who took emergency ambulance services ("EAS") calls only needed to follow the instructions of the system and ask the callers pre-structured questions. It was the callers to FSCC who decided on their own whether to follow the advice provided by the call-taker.

54. Mr IP Kwok-him said that Panel members had no objection to the Administration's submission of the proposal to FC for consideration. Nevertheless, Ms Cyd HO expressed reservation about the proposal to FC and considered that the Panel should better understand the operations of FSCC and the views of relevant staff. The Panel subsequently visited FSCC on 23 March 2015 to enhance its understanding on the provision of PDA and the proposed computer system.

#### Update of questioning protocol software

55. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed support for the proposal. Noting that the proposed computer system would cover 33 types of injury and sickness, he asked whether the Administration would regularly examine the questioning protocol in the system to ensure the provision of appropriate treatment to patients. He also enquired about the maximum pieces of PDA that could be provided by the system.

56. Deputy Director of Fire Services ("DDFS") said that the questioning protocol incorporated in the computer system was developed by the International Academies of Emergency Dispatch ("IAED"). With the computer system, FSD would be able to provide PDA on more than 30 types of injury and sickness, basically covering all types of injury and sickness in the daily handling of emergency ambulance calls by FSD. As IAED would monitor the effectiveness of the questioning protocol software and review the protocol annually, the Administration would keep track of latest developments and update the questioning protocol software where necessary.

57. Mr Charles MOK expressed support for the proposal. However, he was concerned how the Administration would ensure the most updated questioning protocol software by the time the system was installed three years later. DDFS said that the Administration would update the relevant software to newer version where applicable. The design of the proposed computer system was simple with the questioning protocol software being its key component.

Dispatch of ambulances

58. Dr KWOK Ka-ki was concerned that whether the questioning by the FSCC operators using the proposed computer system would unnecessarily delay the immediate dispatch of ambulances. Under Secretary for Security ("US for S") responded that the procedures of taking calls and dispatching resources would be taken up by two individual FSCC operators as call-taker and dispatcher respectively. Once a call-taker confirmed the location of the incident, the nature of the call and the caller's contact information, the computer system would instantly transmit information and dispatch instructions to a dispatcher for the immediate dispatch of ambulances. Meanwhile, the call-taker would maintain communication with the caller on the phone. There would be no delay in the process of dispatching an ambulance as the dispatching and questioning processes would be taken up by two individual operators.

59. US for S added that at present, upon receipt of an emergency ambulance call, an operator in FSCC would hang up and dispatch an ambulance immediately after obtaining the necessary information. If the ambulance call fell within the six types of easily identifiable injury and sickness, the same operator would call back the caller to provide simple PDA after the ambulance was dispatched. According to the callers' feedback, they would prefer to maintain communication with the call-taker over the phone.

Tendering and implementation

60. Noting that the system would commence live run in March 2018, Mr Charles MOK considered that the three-year lead time was too long. While expressing support for the proposal, Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Dr LAM Tai-fai urged the Administration to proactively review the implementation plan and expedite implementation of the new system for PDA.

61. DDFS said that the Administration had been preparing for the tender of the system and envisaged that the post-tendering process, including vetting the tenders received, would take about a year.

62. US for S supplemented that in preparing for the tender, FSD might need to seek the advice or assistance, where necessary, from the Government Logistics Department on commercial aspects, the Department of Justice on legal aspects, and the Intellectual Property Department on the aspects of intellectual property rights. The Administration would strive to compress the lead time required for implementing the system.

Transfer of patients by ambulances

63. Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Ms Emily LAU enquired whether patients using EAS could request for transfer to a private hospital instead of a public hospital. DDFS said that the present arrangement of transferring patients to the nearest public hospital aimed to ensure that patients could receive treatment within the shortest possible time. On this reply, Ms LAU commented that patients often had to wait for an unduly long time at the Accident and Emergency ("A&E") Department of the public hospital before they could receive medical treatment. However, Dr LAM Tai-fai cited his experience as an example and said that it might not always be in the best interest of ordinary patients using EAS to be transferred to a private hospital in the first instance during emergency since they were not familiar with the services provided by various private hospitals.

64. DDFS said that the Hospital Authority had adopted a triage system which classified patients attending the A&E Departments according to their clinical conditions so as to accord priority in medical treatment to patients based on the seriousness of their conditions. Under the triage system, emergency patients would be given immediate treatment, while those with non-acute symptoms should expect a longer waiting time.

Other enquiries

65. Mr Charles MOK enquired about the kind of contract staff, if any, engaged by contractors for the system. DDFS said that FSD would openly recruit contract staff with an information technology background to support the development and implementation of the system.

66. Mr YIU Si-wing recounted his experience of seeing two teams, viz. fire services staff and ambulance services staff, arriving at the scene in response to an emergency ambulance call. He asked whether the incident arose from insufficient communication within FSD.

67. DDFS said that upon receipt of an emergency ambulance call, an operator of FSCC would dispatch an ambulance immediately after obtaining the necessary information, including the location of the incident. At the same time, FSD would deploy First Responders to provide support to patients before the arrival of the ambulance.

68. In response to Mr YIU Si-wing's enquiry as to whether the proposed computer system could help FSD assess the degree of urgency of each emergency ambulance call, DDFS said that the system would enable FSD to comprehend and analyse information concerning EAS, such as the nature of the



emergency ambulance calls, patients' conditions, geographic distribution and times of occurrence, more systematically and accurately. Such information would facilitate FSD in reviewing and formulating long-term planning strategies of EAS and ambulance deployment.

69. Dr LAM Tai-fai sought information on the staffing provision for 2017-2018, and the annual recurrent expenditure for repair and maintenance of the relevant computer hardware and software. DDFS said that the staffing provision for 2017-2018 would cover allowances for staff training and other related matters.

70. At 5:00 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned and the Committee would continue with the discussion at the next meeting after a break of 10 minutes.

Legislative Council Secretariat  
5 October 2015