

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC252/14-15
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 51st meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 5 June 2015, at 3:15 pm

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon Claudia MO

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr HON Chi-keung, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr CHAN Chi-ming, JP	Deputy Secretary for Development (Works) ²
Mr CHENG Ting-ning, JP	Project Manager (New Territories East), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr WONG Kin-por	Chief Engineer (Boundary Control Point), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Stephen TANG, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mrs Sylvia LAM	Project Director (2), Architectural Services Department
Mr Michael LI	Chief Project Manager 202, Architectural Services Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1) ⁵
-------------	--

Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Miss Queenie LAM	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

**Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)20
RECOMMENDATION OF THE
PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE MADE
ON 20 MAY 2015**

The Chairman advised that the item invited the Committee's approval of the recommendation of the Public Works Subcommittee made on 20 May 2015. There being no question from members, the Chairman put the item to vote.

2. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

**Item No. 2 – FCR(2015-16)11
CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Support – Boundary facilities (other than road works)
19GB – Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point and associated
works – site formation and infrastructure works**

**Item No. 3 – FCR(2015-16)12
CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND
HEAD 703 – BUILDINGS
Support – Boundary facilities (other than road works)
13GB – Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point and associated
works – construction of boundary control point buildings and associated
facilities**

3. The Committee continued with the deliberation on the items FCR(2015-16)11 and FCR(2015-16)12 related to Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point ("LT/HYW BCP") and associated works, which were carried over from the meetings on 29 May 2015.

4. The Chairman said that members who wished to submit proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FC Procedure") to express views on the items FCR(2015-16)11 and FCR(2015-16)12 should clearly state in each proposed motion the item, i.e. FCR(2015-16)11 or FCR(2015-16)12, on which the view was to be expressed. The Chairman said that the Committee would deal with the motions after completing the combined discussion on the items. He would first put the proposed motions that he had ruled to be directly related to FCR(2015-16)11 to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded forthwith. After the Committee had dealt with those motions, he would then put the item FCR(2015-16)11 to vote. He would then deal with the proposed motions with respect to FCR(2015-16)12 and then put the item to vote in the same manner.

Utilization of the proposed boundary control point

5. Mr Gary FAN said that as a result of the change in the policy on the multiple-entry Individual Visit endorsements under the Individual Visit Scheme ("IVS") from unlimited visits to one visit per week for Shenzhen residents holding multiple-entry endorsements, the number of Mainland visitors coming to Hong Kong was bound to drop. Mr FAN asked whether the Administration had assessed how this would affect the utilization and hence the cost effectiveness of the LT/HYW BCP facilities.

6. Project Manager (New Territories East) ("PM(NTE)") said that the Administration had forecasted the utilization of LT/HYW BCP under different scenarios of travellers flow, including the different policies that could possibly be introduced under the IVS. He said that the differences in forecast utilization of LT/HYW BCP under these different scenarios were within 5% to 6%.

Project completion time and cost over-run

7. Mr Kenneth LEUNG asked whether the increase in cost due to poor ground condition for tunnelling works mentioned in item (b) in paragraph 22 of the paper PWSC(2014-15)33 had been reflected in item (a) relating to the recent surge in construction price in the same paragraph. PM(NTE) said that the two cost increase factors were separate. He explained that item (a) reflected the cost increase arising from the surge in labour wages and equipment cost whereas item (b) was related to the additional engineering facilities required for construction in poor ground conditions.

8. Mr Kenneth LEUNG asked whether the proposed cost increase of \$698.6 million to cater for poor ground condition for tunnelling works would still be sufficient if there was further labour or material cost escalation. PM(NTE) said that cost contingencies were allowed in the cost estimates to cater for price fluctuations.

9. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung enquired about the amount of the project estimates earmarked as contingencies and the basis for it. PM(NTE) replied that, as a matter of practice of practice, about 10% of the project cost would be earmarked as contingencies to cater for unforeseen fluctuations in costs.

10. Dr KWOK Ka-ki noted that the cost increase in the heavy civil engineering works accounted for 38.1% of the proposed total increase in the project 19GB "LT/HYW BCP and associated works – site formation and infrastructure works". He asked whether there was a downward trend in the cost of labour and construction material. PM(NTE) advised that the labour and material cost had been increasing sharply over the past few years and there was no sign of the costs moving down.

11. Dr KWOK Ka-ki noted the Administration's claim that a month's delay in commencing Contract 6 for the construction of the northern section of the Connection Road between Sha Tau Kok Road and LT/HYW BCP under project 19GB would add some \$30 million to the total project cost was based on the target completion date being set at end-2018. He considered that the setting of such target was entirely arbitrary, and in fact there was no convincing reason nor urgency that the works had to be completed by end-2018. Dr KWOK asked if the project cost could be reduced if the Administration could allow a longer works schedule. Permanent Secretary for Development (Works) ("PS(W)") said that the cost increase for 19GB was not due to the need to meet the target works completion date of end-2018, and he added that the Administration considered the current work schedule reasonable.

The Administration's estimation of project cost

12. Mr James TO noted that one of the factors leading to the proposed increase in the approved project estimates ("APE") was the recent surge in construction prices. Mr TO also noted that the original cost estimate was evaluated based on the market situation and by reference to the cost information of similar infrastructure projects up to early 2012. Tenders were invited starting from mid-2012, and the tender prices turned out to be a lot higher than the APE prices. Mr TO queried why the construction prices could have increased by some \$3,974.7 million within a short span of six months or so.

13. PM(NTE) said that the cost estimates for the project 19GB that the Administration presented in early 2012 for funding application was evaluated by reference to the available information prior to 2012 and the projected cost variation in the years that followed. He admitted that the Administration had not accurately assessed the market conditions at the time. The construction costs as revealed in the returned tenders represented the contractors' forecast of construction cost movement in the coming years. With more up-to-date information, the Administration was now in a better position to come up with a more realistic revised project estimate.

14. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung commented that to a large extent, the Administration controlled the demand side of the construction works in Hong Kong, and so it was in a position to influence construction price levels. He queried whether there was a lack of co-ordination within the Administration to spread out public works projects, and if so, responsible officials should be held accountable for repeated cost over-runs in public works projects.

15. Mr Gary FAN asked if part of the project works could be postponed so as to avoid clustering of public works projects and pushing up construction costs. PS(W) said that the Administration had examined this option but did not consider it feasible as the rising trend of construction price levels was expected to continue and further delay in works progress would only result in even higher project cost.

16. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung asked if the Administration had conducted an overall assessment of the cost implications arising from clustering the major works projects together. PS(W) said that the Administration had been monitoring the overall volume of public works in progress and the trend of construction price levels, and had been working closely with the Construction Industry Council on measures to increase supply of construction workers.

17. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked if the Administration would review the priority in rolling out public works projects so that items that benefited the community (such as public housing projects) would proceed ahead of other non-pressing infrastructure developments.

18. The Chairman reminded members that similar questions had been repeatedly raised many times at this and previous meetings.

19. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed concern that the implementation of the third runway system for the Hong Kong International Airport would further push up the demand for construction activities and would inevitably cause further increase in construction costs. PS(W) reiterated that the Administration had already taken into consideration the impact of the construction of the third runway system, and with the additional amount of construction activities, the total amount of works to be carried out in a year would still be within \$200 billion.

Whether the Administration could undertake not to incur further cost over-run

20. Mr Gary FAN commented that the estimated project cost of LT/HYW BCP and associated works had doubled within a short span of six years from 2008. He considered that the magnitude of increase was high by comparison with other normal public works projects. Mr FAN asked if the Administration could guarantee that it would not seek the Committee's approval for further increase in APE for this 19GB project.

21. The Chairman reminded Mr Gary FAN that his question had been raised by members many times in the previous meetings and the Administration had also repeated its position many times. PS(W) reiterated that the Administration was confident that the remaining works of 19GB could be completed with the proposed increase in the APE. However, there could still be unforeseen factors which might cause further cost over-run, and that the Committee might be invited to approve the cost adjustment.

22. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that the Administration was in the position to control the pace at which public projects were rolled out, and could therefore influence the construction price levels. Mr LEUNG asked the Administration to make a commitment that it would not seek further funding from FC to cover future cost over-run due to construction price escalation.

23. The Chairman said that members had raised this question many times already and the Administration repeatedly replied that it could not make such commitment as members wanted. He asked members not to repeat the same question or the same view.

Benefits of the Liantang / Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point

24. Dr Fernando CHEUNG noted that the Administration had reviewed and updated the quantifiable benefits of the LT/HYW BCP project to be about \$64 billion at 2014 prices over a 32-year period (from 2018 to 2050). He also noted that the quantifiable benefits were calculated with reference to the savings

in vehicle operation costs and the value of time saved for travellers over a 32-year period (from 2018 to 2050). He asked the Administration to provide information on the average saving per traveller and the average saving per vehicle.

25. PM(NTE) undertook to provide the information after the meeting. He explained that the methodology involved dividing Hong Kong into regions, and calculating the amount of time saved when travelling across regions when LT/HYW BCP was in operation. The gain in productivity could be estimated from the time saved, while the productivity gained would differ with different types of vehicles.

26. Dr Fernando CHEUNG noted that the Administration had conducted several analyses of the economic benefits that could be brought about by the LT/HYW BCP project, but the findings of these analyses differed from one another. He requested the Administration to provide information on the various estimations made at different stages of the project, the quantifiable benefits from the implementation of LT/HYW BCP and associated works, and to explain the differences among the estimations.

27. PM(NTE) undertook to provide the information and added that the original estimate of quantifiable benefits was based on 2007 prices, and the value of \$14.3 billion of quantifiable benefits covered only a 12-year period.

[Post-meeting note: Information on the economic benefit assessment of LT/HYW BCP provided by the Administration was issued on 24 June 2015 vide LC Paper No. FC203/14-15.]

Completion date of the proposed Liantang / Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point project

28. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted that the Administration expected a risk that the LT/HYW BCP project could not be completed by end-2018. He asked the Administration to give a more realistic target for the commissioning of BCP. PS(W) said that according to the current works contracts, LT/HYW BCP was scheduled for completion by end-2018. Barring any unforeseen circumstances, works would be deferred by a few months at most. There was also flexibility in the contract to allow for slight delay in the works schedule. However, it was still the Administration's target for LT/HYW BCP to be commissioned by end-2018.

29. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen then asked if the Administration could undertake to complete the project by 2020. PS(W) reiterated that there were always uncertain factors in any civil engineering works and there would be no absolute guarantee that LT/HYW BCP could be commissioned by an arbitrary date.

Other comments

30. Dr KWOK Ka-ki noted that the on-cost payable to Shenzhen Municipal Government ("SZMG") was reduced by \$9.8 million. Dr KWOK queried whether the reduction was a deal between Hong Kong and the Shenzhen authorities to encourage the Hong Kong side continue to undertake the LT/HYW BCP project.

31. PM(NTE) explained that \$9.8 million payable to SZMG was intended to be the entrustment costs for the construction of the Hong Kong portion of the cross boundary bridges. As the works were now to be undertaken by the Hong Kong side, the on-cost payable to SZMG was no longer necessary.

32. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung asked the Administration to provide the list of Category C contractors which had been awarded contracts to undertake major public works since 2008 and the terms of the relevant contracts. PS(W) undertook to provide the list of contractors after the meeting, but said that the Administration could not provide the terms of the contracts as they involved confidential commercial information.

[Post-meeting note: Information provided by the Administration on Category C contractors was issued on 24 June 2015 vide LC Paper No. FC203/14-15.]

33. Dr Fernando CHEUNG requested the Administration to provide the terms of reference of the joint Shenzhen and Hong Kong Special Administrative Region governments task force, as well as the terms of reference of working groups, if any, formed under it to oversee the implementation of the LT/HYW BCP project. In response to Dr CHEUNG, PM(NTE) advised that the two governments would monitor the project costs of the respective portions of the project. The Civil Engineering and Development Department was responsible for overseeing the project progress as well as the cost control of the Hong Kong side of the project.

[Post-meeting note: Information project provided by the Administration on the terms of reference of the joint Shenzhen and

Hong Kong task force and its working group overseeing the LT/HYW BCP was issued on 24 June 2015 vide LC Paper No. FC203/14-15.]

Motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2015-16)11

34. As no members raised further questions, the Chairman invited members to indicate whether they intend to move motions under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on the agenda items under deliberation. A few members then indicated that they had prepared such proposed motions.

35. The Chairman announced that the meeting be suspended for 15 minutes so that he could consider whether the proposed motions to be submitted by those members were directly related to the agenda items under deliberation. He asked other members to submit proposed motions, if any, to him immediately so that he could consider them as well during the suspension of the meeting.

36. The meeting was suspended at 4:21 pm and resumed at 4:36 pm.

37. When the meeting resumed, the Chairman again called on members to submit proposed motions, if any, to him for ruling.

38. The Chairman said that he had received from Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr Gary FAN four, five and three proposed motions respectively to express views on the item FCR(2015-16)11 and he would put the questions to the Committee, one by one, whether these motions should be proceeded forthwith before he put the item FCR(2015-16)11 to vote.

39. The Chairman also announced that Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had submitted five proposed motions to express views on the item FCR(2015-16)12 and he would put the questions to the Committee, one by one, whether Mr LEUNG's motions should be proceeded forthwith before he put the item FCR(2015-16)12 to vote.

Motion proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki

40. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki numbered A0001 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was run for five minutes. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr KWOK read out his

motion during the ringing of the division bell. The Chairman declared that the question was negatived.

Motion to shorten the duration of the division bell from five to one minute

41. Mr TAM Yiu-chung moved without notice under paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute.

42. The Chairman proposed the question on Mr TAM Yiu-chung's motion and said that members, when speaking on the question, might speak once for not more than three minutes each. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung commented that the division should be rung for one and a half minute instead.

43. The Chairman said that the motion was not amendable and members could vote against the motion if they did not agree to shorten the duration of the division bell.

44. There being no further comment from members, the Chairman put Mr TAM Yiu-chung's motion to vote. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was run for five minutes.

45. Before the Chairman announced the voting results, Ms Cyd HO said that she had pressed the "NO" button of the electronic voting system when she, in fact, intended only to indicate her presence at the meeting and not to cast vote on the motion. The Chairman then disregarded her vote as registered in the electronic voting system.

46. The Chairman announced that 26 members voted in favour of, and three members voted against the question. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Dr LAM Tai-fai
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mrs Regina IP LAU Shuk-yee
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr MA Fung-kwok

Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun	Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(26 members)	

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	
(3 members)	

47. The Chairman declared that Mr TAM Yiu-chung's motion was carried.

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2015-16)11

Motions proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki

48. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki numbered A0002 to A0004 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr KWOK read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

49. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered A0005 to A0009 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr Gary FAN

50. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr Gary FAN numbered A0010 to A0012 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the

proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr FAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Voting on FCR(2015-16)11

51. As the Committee had dealt with all of the proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on item FCR(2015-16)11, the Chairman put the item to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute.

52. The Chairman reminded members that the duration of division bell to be sounded on motions to be moved in relation to the subsequent item FCR(2015-16)12 would remain five minutes unless a motion to shorten the duration of the division bell pursuant to paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure was moved and carried for the item.

53. After members had cast their votes, the Chairman announced that 26 members voted in favour of, and 10 voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mrs Regina IP LAU Shuk-ye
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr IP Kin-yuen
Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun
(26 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Dr LAM Tai-fai
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WU Chi-wai

Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Mr Kenneth LEUNG
(10 members)

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

54. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

[*Post-meeting note*: Mr IP Kin-yuen wrote to the Chairman on 8 June 2015 indicating that he had intended to vote against (rather than to vote for) the item.]

55. The Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned, and that the Committee would proceed to deal with the proposed motions from Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung to express views on the item FCR(2015-16)12 at the next meeting after a break of 10 minutes.

56. The meeting was adjourned at 5:12 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
18 September 2015