

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC224/14-15
(These minutes have been
cleared by the Chairman)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(19)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of special meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 25 March 2015, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Sharon CHUNG	Chief Council Secretary (1)2
-----------------	------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Fred PANG	Senior Council Secretary (1)2
Mr Hugo CHIU	Senior Council Secretary (1)6
Ms Christina SHIU	Legislative Assistant (1)2
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)7
Ms Haley CHEUNG	Legislative Assistant (1)9

I. Applications for late membership

The Chairman advised that the meeting was the fifth one to consider the applications from 12 Members for late membership. Of the 12 applications, the Subcommittee had accepted those from Mr Paul TSE and Mr Christopher CHEUNG at previous meetings. The Chairman said that after the last meeting on 3 February 2015, he had written to the 10 Members whose applications had yet to be dealt with ("the 10 Members"): (i) to inform them that the Subcommittee had accepted the applications from Mr TSE and Mr CHEUNG; and (ii) to invite them to attend the meeting to explain in person the reasons for their applications, and to provide supplementary written information on their applications. A sample of the letters to these Members had been provided to members of the Subcommittee. The 10 Members had replied that they would not attend any meeting to be held to consider their applications and would not provide any supplementary information on their applications.

Voting on the applications for late membership from the 10 Members

2. The Chairman said that the Subcommittee would consider the applications from the 10 Members in accordance with the order set out on the agenda.

Application from Mr Steven HO

3. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr Steven HO. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr HO's application. At members' request, the division bell was rung for five minutes. Six members voted for, five voted against the application and no one abstained. The voting result was as follows:

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr IP Kwok-him
Miss CHAN Yuen-han
(6 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Frankie YICK
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
(5 members)

Ms Emily LAU
Mr Gary FAN

Abstain:

(0 member)

4. The Chairman declared that Mr Steven HO's application for late membership was accepted by the Subcommittee.

5. Mr IP Kwok-him moved that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Subcommittee would proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. The Chairman invited members to speak on Mr IP's motion.

6. Mr TAM Yiu-chung expressed support for Mr IP's motion. Mr Gary FAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed opposition to the motion. Mr IP Kwok-him said that he would like to withdraw the motion. As no member indicated objection, the motion was withdrawn.

Application from Mr WONG Ting-kwong

7. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr WONG Ting-kwong. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr WONG's application. At the request of Mr Gary FAN, the Chairman ordered a division. Six members voted for, eight voted against the application and no one abstained. The voting result was as follows:

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam

Mr IP Kwok-him

Miss CHAN Yuen-han

(6 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung

Mr Frankie YICK

Mr LEUNG Che-cheung

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

Mr Gary FAN

Dr Kenneth CHAN

(8 members)

Ms Emily LAU

Mr WU Chi-wai

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

Mr SIN Chung-kai

Abstain:

(0 member)

8. The Chairman declared that Mr WONG Ting-kwong's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr Andrew LEUNG

9. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr Andrew LEUNG. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr LEUNG's application. At the request of Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, the Chairman ordered a division. Four members voted for, nine voted against the application and no one abstained. The voting result was as follows:

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
(4 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Christopher CHUNG

Against:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WU Chi-wai
Dr Kenneth CHAN
Mr SIN Chung-kai
(9 members)

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Albert CHAN
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr KWOK Ka-ki

Abstain:

(0 member)

10. The Chairman declared that Mr Andrew LEUNG's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr YIU Si-wing

11. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr YIU Si-wing. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr YIU's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Mr YIU Si-wing's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr WONG Kwok-kin

12. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr WONG Kwok-kin. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr WONG's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Mr WONG Kwok-kin's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr TANG Ka-piu

13. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr TANG Ka-piu. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr TANG's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Mr TANG Ka-piu's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr KWOK Wai-keung

14. The Chairman asked whether any member would like to speak on the application from Mr KWOK Wai-keung. No member asked to speak. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr KWOK's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Mr KWOK Wai-keung's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr NG Leung-sing

15. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung opined that Mr NG Leung-sing, being an ex-Chairman of the Finance Committee and a Legislative Council Member with a long service, should have better handled his application for late membership and attended the Subcommittee's special meeting to explain his reasons for missing the registration deadline. He found the reason given in Mr NG's application, i.e. a mistake committed by his personal assistant ("PA"), unacceptable. Mr LEUNG also said he was perplexed by the fact that of the five Members belonging to the Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions, two (i.e. Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Miss CHAN Yuen-han) had not missed the registration deadline but three (i.e. Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Mr TANG Ka-piu and Mr KWOK Wai-keung) had missed it.

16. Mr Albert CHAN considered that some Members from the pro-establishment camp ("pro-establishment Members") held double standards because they had rejected his request for late membership with the Establishment Subcommittee ("ESC") in June 2014. He criticized that pro-establishment Members had been handling the issue of missing the registration deadline in an awful manner.

17. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr NG Leung-sing's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Mr NG Leung-sing's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Ms Starry LEE

18. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that, for a member of the Executive Council like Ms Starry LEE, integrity was of utmost importance. He considered it unacceptable for anyone who had committed a mistake to put the blame on another person.

19. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Ms Starry LEE's application. The question was voted on and negatived. The Chairman declared that Ms Starry LEE's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

Application from Mr Jeffrey LAM

20. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said he was disappointed that Mr Jeffrey LAM, being a member of the Executive Council, had not provided a better explanation for missing the registration deadline. He opined that the Subcommittee should not accept Mr LAM's application.

21. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan and Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed dissatisfaction on the reasons given by most of 10 Members for missing the registration deadlines, i.e. that their PAs had mishandled the matter. Mr LEE said it was apparent that the requests of pro-establishment Members for late membership only aimed at regaining a majority in the Subcommittee. He drew members' attention to the fact that Mr Jeffrey LAM and Mr Andrew LEUNG, both being members of the Business and Professionals Alliance for Hong Kong, provided similar reasons (i.e. mishandling by their PAs) in their applications for late membership to both the Subcommittee and ESC. Dr KWOK expressed regrets over the absence of the 10 Members from the meeting.

22. The Chairman invited members to vote on whether to accept Mr Jeffrey LAM's application. At the request of Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, the Chairman ordered a division. Seven members voted for, 10 voted against the application and no one abstained. The voting result was as follows:

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
(7 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr Christopher CHUNG

Against:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Albert CHAN
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr KWOK Ka-ki
(10 members)

Mr James TO
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr Gary FAN
Dr Kenneth CHAN
Mr SIN Chung-kai

Abstain:

(0 member)

23. The Chairman declared that Mr Jeffrey LAM's application for late membership was rejected by the Subcommittee.

24. The Chairman concluded that the Subcommittee had handled all the outstanding applications for late membership.

(Posting-meeting note: At the instruction of the Chairman, the Clerk informed the nine Members whose applications had been rejected in writing on 25 March 2015 about the Subcommittee's decision.)

25. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 9:34 am.