

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC196/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(25)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 20th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 13 May 2015, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Public officers attending:

Mr YEUNG Tak-keung, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr HON Chi-keung, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment

Ms Jasmine CHOI Suet-yung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr Frankie LUI Kin-fun	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (E)
Mr LEUNG Koon-kee	Director of Architectural Services
Mr Frank WONG Tak-choi	Project Director (1) Architectural Services Department
Mr Alan SIU Yu-bun	Government Property Administrator
Mr LAM Chik-man	Chief Property Manager (Acquisition, Allocation and Disposal) Government Property Agency

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Sharon CHUNG	Chief Council Secretary (1)2
-----------------	------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Fred PANG	Senior Council Secretary (1)2
Mr Raymond CHOW	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Christina SHIU	Legislative Assistant (1)2
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)7
Ms Clara LO	Legislative Assistant (1)8

Action

The Chairman advised that there were six funding proposals on the agenda for the meeting. All these proposals were agenda items carried over from the meeting of the Subcommittee on 6 May 2015. He reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") of the Legislative Council, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the item. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

Head 703 – Buildings**PWSC(2015-16)12 74KA Construction of West Kowloon Government Offices**

2. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2015-16)12, was to upgrade 74KA to Category A at an estimated cost of \$4,742.5 million in money-of-the-day prices for the construction of West Kowloon Government Offices ("WKGO"). The Subcommittee had commenced deliberation on the proposal at the meeting on 6 May 2015. The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC177/14-15(01) on 11 May 2015.

Provision of car parking spaces in the proposed West Kowloon Government Offices

3. Dr Helena WONG noted the Administration's new proposal of providing 20 car parking spaces at the ground level of the proposed WKGO in addition to the 92 spaces in the basement of the building. However, she considered the revised provision still insufficient to meet the demand of some 3 000 civil servants, many of whom were senior officials, who would work in the building. While expressing in-principle support for the project, Dr WONG reiterated the Democratic Party's concern that the shortage of parking spaces in WKGO would drive up the demand for and subsequently the rentals of private parking spaces in nearby residential developments and shopping malls. She urged the Administration to consider adopting a double-deck or triple-deck parking system in the basement or at the ground level to further increase the number of parking spaces in WKGO. Noting it was planned that there would be two levels of basement in WKGO, she asked about the cost for constructing an additional basement floor for use as a carpark, and whether the height of each of the two levels of basement could be adjusted to accommodate a double-deck parking system without changing the overall height of the basement.

4. Mr James TO echoed Dr Helena WONG's views. He said that the development of WKGO, which was a government facility, was exempted from following the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG"). As such, the provision of parking spaces in WKGO might be well below the standard provision applicable to a private office building under HKPSG. He stressed that WKGO should be self-sufficient in terms of provision of parking spaces to avoid driving up the demand for and rentals of private parking spaces in nearby areas.

5. Pointing out that multi-level parking systems had been widely used in Taiwan, Japan and Korea, Dr KWOK Ka-ki urged the Administration to consider seriously Dr Helena WONG's proposal of adopting a double/triple-deck parking system in WKGO. He said he would vote against the item if the Administration did not make any effort to accommodate members' suggestions in this respect. Mr Albert CHAN said he was also very concerned about insufficient provision of parking spaces in WKGO and the problems that might arise from the shortage.

6. Mr IP Kwok-him opined that the Administration should strike a balance between the need for provision of additional parking spaces in WKGO and the cost implications. He asked whether, according to the Administration's assessment, the proposed provision of 112 parking spaces altogether could meet the basic operation needs of WKGO. He also enquired about the cost for the construction of an additional floor of underground carpark.

7. Mr Tony TSE said that the project site had been idle for years and he supported early implementation of the WKGO project. He did not agree to the idea of providing an additional floor of underground carpark in WKGO in view of the substantial construction cost to be involved. In his view, the Administration should set an example in reducing the use of cars. Pointing out that the provision of a double-deck parking system would incur additional recurrent operating and maintenance expenses and the utilization rate of such systems in Hong Kong had been low, Mr TSE cast doubt on the cost-effectiveness of adopting a double-deck parking system in WKGO.

8. Government Property Administrator ("GPA") advised that it was not the Government's policy to provide private parking spaces in government buildings for civil servants to meet their personal needs. As WKGO was conveniently located, staff working in the building were encouraged to commute by public transport. To address members' concerns about the provision of parking spaces in WKGO, and on the basis of not increasing the project cost and delaying the implementation of the project, the Administration suggested that the landscape area at the ground level of WKGO be adjusted to provide 20 additional open air parking spaces. The Administration considered that such an arrangement could address members' concerns, ensure the smooth operation of WKGO and avoid bringing in a lot of traffic to the vicinity of the building, which was a major concern of the Yau Tsim Mong District Council ("YTMDC") and the nearby schools expressed during the public consultation exercise.

9. On Dr Helena WONG's suggestion of adopting a double-deck parking system in WKGO, Director of Architectural Services ("DArchS") advised that the depth of the two-level basement was designed to the minimum under the current proposal in view of the high construction costs of underground carpark and the large volume of construction waste that would be generated by the related works. He said that the floor-to-floor heights of the two levels of basement, at about 5 metres (for parking of large vehicles) and 3.5 metres (for parking of small vehicles, mainly saloon cars) respectively, would just meet the relevant basic height requirements. The height of the two-level basement was insufficient to house a double-deck parking system and the feasibility of deeper basement could not be confirmed at this stage until detailed technical studies were conducted.

10. GPA added that the use of a double-deck parking system would require additional manoeuvring space in the carpark for vehicle movements. Given that the open air parking spaces at the ground level of WKGO was only made available by adjusting the landscape area, there would not be sufficient space to allow for such vehicle movements. Hence, the adoption of a double-deck parking system for the parking spaces at the ground level was also not feasible.

11. In response to Dr Helena WONG's enquiry about the estimated cost for increasing the height of the basement, DArchS advised that in view of the close proximity of the site to the harbour and two underground railways, a detailed technical study had to be conducted to ascertain the feasibility of adding another floor of underground carpark. DArchS also advised that the construction cost of the additional underground floor would depend on the actual conditions of the project site. Generally speaking, the cost would be substantially higher than that of a carpark to be constructed above the ground level. At the request of Mr IP Kwok-him, the Administration would provide information about the costs for the construction of underground carparks in general for members' reference.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

12. Noting that only nine parking spaces would be provided in WKGO for visitors, Ir Dr LO Wai-ki considered such a provision insufficient. He advised that the Administration should take into account visitors' needs when planning the number of parking spaces in government office buildings.

13. Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (E) ("PAS(Tsy)E/FSTB") said that the Administration understood members' concerns about the provision of parking spaces in WKGO. He said that the Administration would look into the issue and advise the Subcommittee on whether and how, apart from the 20 additional open air parking spaces to be provided at the ground level, the number of parking spaces could be further increased.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

Facilities to be provided in the proposed West Kowloon Government Offices

14. Pointing out that there was an acute shortfall in the provision of government dental services for the elderly, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung queried the Administration's rationale for setting up in WKGO a government dental clinic exclusively for civil servants but not for the elderly.

15. Dr KWOK Ka-ki shared Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's concern. He urged the Administration to put forth concrete proposals to address the shortfall in the provision of elderly health care services in the community. In this connection, he requested the Administration to provide information on its plan to increase the provision of elderly health care facilities in other Government, Institution or Community ("G/IC") sites in the territory, as well as the estimated reduction in the waiting time for elderly health care services upon the completion of the relevant projects.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

16. Mr Tony TSE supported the setting up of a government dental clinic at the proposed WKGO to address inadequacy in the provision of dental services for civil servants to fulfill the Government's obligations as an employer. Considering that the provision of elderly health care services should be examined from a regional or even a territory-wide perspective, Mr TSE requested the Administration to explore other possible sites in the YTM District for setting up the relevant facilities.

17. PAS(Tsy)E/FSTB advised that the prime objective of constructing WKGO was to provide office accommodation for reprovisioning government offices currently accommodated in leased premises in Wan Chai, Tsim Sha Tsui, Mong Kok and Kwun Tong, as well as some of the government offices currently accommodated in the three government office buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront and in Yau Ma Tei Multi-storey Carpark Building. The remaining space in WKGO would then be allocated for other government facilities in consultation with relevant government bureaux/departments. He said that no request for setting up a dental clinic for the elderly had been received during the internal consultation exercise.

18. GPA added that after discounting the office accommodation required to be provided for the above-mentioned offices, the space that remained available in WKGO for other facilities was rather limited. Upon consultation with government bureaux/departments, it was decided that suitable and sufficient space in WKGO could be allocated to the Department of Health for setting up a government dental clinic for civil servants and a student health service cum special assessment centre. In respect of the provision of other welfare and health facilities in the YTM District, the Administration had explored the setting up of a community health centre at the ex-Mong Kok market site. The Administration had also reserved space at Hoi Fai Road close to WKGO for providing residential care services for the elderly. The facility was expected to commence operation within 2015-2016.

19. Referring to the setting up of a public art display area in the proposed WKGO, Mr Tony TSE enquired about the details of the said facility, including its size, objective and management. PAS(Tsy)E/FSTB advised that the proposed public art display area was a new facility that would be managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department. It would serve to provide a venue for local artists to showcase their works for public appreciation. The Administration undertook to provide relevant supplementary information after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

Monitoring on the use of public funds allocated for capital works projects

20. Mr Albert CHAN said that the prices of some raw construction materials for civil engineering works, such as steel, copper and cement, had dropped significantly by 30% to 50%. He queried whether the

Administration had taken into account the decreasing construction material costs when deriving the price adjustment factors that were used for estimating the costs of capital works projects. Pointing out that the adoption of the price adjustment factors proposed in the discussion paper might have over-stated WKGO's project cost, Mr CHAN asked whether the payments for the related works contracts in the future would be adjusted downward if there was a decreasing trend in tender prices.

21. DArchS responded that in estimating the provision for price adjustment, the relevant works departments adopted the latest price adjustment factors to convert the cost estimates of capital works projects from constant prices into money-of-the-day prices. The adjustment factor was derived from the latest set of assumptions made by the Government Economist ("GE"). In the process, GE would take full account of all the relevant factors, including survey data on the trend rate of change in prices of public sector buildings and construction output, the overall situation in the labour market, the latest trend of labour wages and prices of construction materials in the construction industry, as well as trends in global and local economic performance. He added that contracts of capital works projects had provided for a Contract Price Fluctuation ("CPF") mechanism. Under the CPF mechanism, payments to contractors for construction contracts would be adjusted according to prevailing labour and material costs. At the request of Mr Albert CHAN, the Administration would provide supplementary information on GE's assessment of the price adjustment factors for the next few years in the light of significant decrease in prices of some major raw construction materials mentioned above.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

22. Referring to the construction of the new Civil Aviation Department headquarters where numerous cases of non-compliances had been identified, Mr Albert CHAN asked whether the Administration would enhance its existing monitoring mechanism on the use of public funds in government building projects.

23. Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works) advised that there were established mechanisms in the Administration to ensure prudent use of public funds on capital works projects. The relevant controlling officers should ensure that the expenditure of each works project was within the approved project estimate ("APE") and the project scope was in accordance with that approved by the Finance Committee ("FC"). Relevant user departments were required to

seek approval from the Government Property Agency or the Property Vetting Committee on the schedule of accommodation of new government buildings. For the purchase of furniture and equipment ("F&E") items for use in new government buildings, approval from FSTB, the Government Property Agency or delegated authorities was required. At the request of Mr Albert CHAN, the Administration undertook to provide relevant supplementary information to the Subcommittee after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

24. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung enquired about the rationale for setting aside a provision of \$41.4 million in the project estimate for the procurement of F&E for the proposed WKGO. GPA advised that it was the Government's policy for the concerned government departments to continue using existing F&E upon their reprovisioning as far as practicable. He explained that the relevant provision was mainly provided for the procurement of some new systems, such as the closed circuit television system and the telephone system, etc., given that the existing systems could not be taken for use in the new office building. He added that the proposed amount of provision was necessary given the large number of staff to be housed in WKGO.

Accessibility of the proposed West Kowloon Government Offices

25. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok remarked that the proposed WKGO was not in close proximity to either the Mong Kok MTR Station or the Olympic MTR Station. He enquired about the complementary public transport facilities to be introduced to tie in with the commissioning of the building. He suggested that the Administration should consider constructing a covered walkway to connect the proposed WKGO with its nearest MTR station to enhance the accessibility of the building.

26. PAS(Tsy)E/FSTB advised that the proposed WKGO was within 10 minutes' walking distance (500 m - 600 m) from the Olympic MTR Station and 15 minutes' walking distance (1 000 m) from the Yau Ma Tei MTR Station. There were many bus and mini-bus routes in the vicinity of WKGO. The nearest public transport interchange (at Park Avenue) was within 3 minutes' walking distance (200 m). This inter-change currently served as the terminus or inter-change stop for seven bus and two mini-bus routes. There were also stops for various bus and mini-bus routes along Hoi Wang Road and its vicinity, which facilitated commuting to the nearby MTR stations and other districts throughout the territory. He said that the Transport Department had undertaken to review the traffic conditions in the

district in relation to the commissioning of WKGO in due course. At the request of Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, the Administration would provide information on how the accessibility of WKGO for pedestrians would be enhanced.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

Admin

27. Mr Albert CHAN pointed out that, pursuant to the prevailing policy, only covered walkways not exceeding 500 metres would be provided by the Administration to connect exits of MTR stations with nearby major buildings and communal facilities. He suggested that the Administration should consider relaxing the length restriction of covered walkways and incorporating the provision of the said facility, which should exceed 500 metres in length, into relevant planning standards to enhance the accessibility of major buildings, including private office buildings. Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) ("PS/DEV(P&L)") undertook to convey Mr Albert CHAN's suggestion to the Transport and Housing Bureau for consideration.

Utilization of land resources at the project site

28. Mr WU Chi-wai noted with concern that the plot ratio ("PR") of the project site of WKGO was set at 8 only and expressed doubt on whether the land resources had been fully utilized. He said that a relatively higher PR of 10 to 12 would probably be set for a private office building project site and asked how the planning parameters of G/IC sites were determined, and how they were different from those provided in HKPSG applicable to private developments. He considered that the Administration should strive to optimize the utilization of G/IC sites to provide more badly needed facilities to the community.

29. PS/DEV(P&L) advised that in determining the optimal PR of a G/IC site, apart from considering the requirements of the concerned bureaux/departments, the Planning Department would also make reference to the surrounding planning context, prevailing planning parameters, site characteristics and development restrictions/constraints. For instance, as the site of WKGO was located at an important air path between the harbour and the core YTM areas, further enhancement to the PR of the site might block the south-westerly wind from entering the inland and the area at Charming Garden. In addition, during the public consultation exercise, YTMDC had requested the Administration to reduce the environmental impacts of the development of WKGO, including the height of the building, as far as possible. The setting of the PR of the project site at 8 had taken into

account the relevant view of YMTDC. He said that the relevant government departments had optimized the utilization of the project site with a PR of 7.99, which was very close to the recommended maximum PR of 8.

30. At the request of Mr WU Chi-wai, the Administration would provide information on utilization of land resources at G/IC sites, including the mechanism/guidelines for determining the usage and the planning parameters of such sites; and how the planning parameters were different from those provided in HKPSG.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC182/14-15(01) on 19 May 2015.)

Timeframe for relocation of government offices accommodated in the three government office buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront

31. Mr Tony TSE enquired about the timeframe for the relocation of the government departments in the three government office buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront and the interfacing arrangements of the said relocation plan with the development of WKGO, which was targeted for completion in 2019. He cautioned the Administration that there might be difficulties in renting out the concerned vacant office premises in the government offices buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront if their tenancy periods were too short.

32. PAS(Tsy)E/FSTB advised that the reprovisioning of the government offices currently accommodated in the three government office buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront involved 29 departments, 175 000 m² of office space and more than 10 000 staff. The exercise would be carried out in phases. In addition to WKGO, other replacement government office buildings would be developed for the relocation of all the offices currently accommodated in the three buildings. Subject to availability of resources and progress of the preparation for the replacement building projects, the Administration planned to seek FC's funding approval to take forward the projects in the next few years. It was expected that the construction works concerned would be completed in succession after 2019. The Administration would arrange to lease out the vacated floor space in the three buildings as each replacement building was completed and the government departments concerned were relocated to help increase the supply of Grade A offices in Wan Chai. After the completion of WKGO in 2019, some 10 000 m² of office space in the three buildings would be released for leasing. The Administration would consider putting up the three buildings for sale at an appropriate time upon completion of the entire relocation project.

Motion on adjournment of discussion on PWSC(2015-16)12

33. Dr Helena WONG moved a motion to adjourn the discussion on PWSC(2015-16)12, i.e. 74KA - Construction of West Kowloon Government Offices, pursuant to Paragraph 33 of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") Procedure.

34. The Chairman said that the Subcommittee would proceed to deal with Dr Helena WONG's motion. Each member could speak once on the motion, and the speaking time should not be more than three minutes. He then invited members to speak on the motion.

35. Dr Helena WONG reiterated that her request for increasing parking spaces in the proposed WKGO was made with a view to mitigating the adverse impact of the project on local residents, rather than offering benefits to the civil servants who would work in the building. The adjournment motion was moved in a bid to allow the Administration to have more time to study members' suggestions relevant to the project, such as the feasibility of adopting a double-deck parking system to further increase the capacity of the carparks in WKGO and the measures to improve the accessibility of the building, so as to facilitate further discussion. If the motion was carried, the Subcommittee could proceed to deal with other less controversial items on the agenda.

36. Ms Emily LAU considered members' requests for increasing parking spaces in WKGO reasonable, as the shortage of public parking spaces in the YTM District had all along been a major concern of YTMDC. Criticizing the Administration for being too rigid in its handling of the WKGO parking space issue, Ms LAU urged the Administration to address the problem in a proactive and responsible manner.

37. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok said that he did not support the motion, as there was an imminent need to implement the WKGO project to complement the reprovisioning of government offices currently accommodated in the three government offices buildings at the Wan Chai waterfront. The Administration should provide its response to the issues raised by members before the item was considered by FC.

38. Mr CHAN Kam-lam spoke against the motion. He opined that the proposed addition of parking spaces in WKGO might depart from the existing policy and would instigate a policy change in relation to planning of government offices buildings. Given that the Administration had already undertaken to provide 20 additional open air parking spaces in WKGO and to

explore other sites for enhancing the provision of elderly health services in response to members' requests, Mr CHAN considered the moving of the adjournment motion an abuse of PWSC Procedure.

39. Mr James TO said he supported the proposed WKGO project in principle. He emphasized that the request for increasing parking spaces in WKGO was made with a view to minimizing the adverse impact of the unsatisfied demand for such spaces on local residents. He was well aware that the validity period of the tenders for the project would expire soon, and urged the Administration to work out solutions with members to address the parking space problem so that the proposal would have members' support and go ahead.

40. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)³ responded to the motion moved by Dr Helena WONG. He said that the Administration would, in the light of members' requests, explore the feasibility of further increasing the number of parking spaces at WKGO despite the site constraints, and would furnish the Subcommittee with the information requested by members before the relevant FC meeting. The Administration had invited tender for the design and construction of WKGO and the tender validity period would expire on 25 June 2015. If funding approval from FC was not available before the expiry of the tender validity period due to the passing of the adjournment motion, the project might have to be re-tendered.

41. Dr Helena WONG said that, by proposing to adjourn the discussion on the item, she hoped the Administration would, at the next meeting on 20 May, after careful consideration, advised the Subcommittee of its final position on whether and how the parking spaces in WKGO could be further increased. She considered that giving the Administration one week to study the issue would not have any impact on the expiry of the tender validity period.

42. The Chairman put to vote the question that the discussion on PWSC(2015-16)¹² be then adjourned. At the request of Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, the Chairman ordered a division. Eleven members voted for, 17 voted against the motion and no one abstained. The individual votes were as follows:

For:

Mr Albert HO
Ms Emily LAU
Mr Albert CHAN
Mr Gary FAN

Mr James TO
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr IP Kin-yuen
(11 members)

Dr Helena WONG

Against:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr Frederick FUNG
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr Steven HO
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Miss Alice MAK
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Tony TSE
(17 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr Paul TSE
Mr Frankie YICK
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG
Mr Christopher CHUNG

Abstain:

(0 member)

43. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived.
44. At 10:26 am, the Chairman consulted members on whether to extend the meeting for 15 minutes to allow sufficient time for the continued discussion on the item. Most members expressed disagreement.
45. The Chairman advised that discussion on the item would continue at the next meeting scheduled for 20 May 2015.
46. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:30 am.