

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

Ref : CB2/HS/2/14

LC Paper No. CB(2)102/15-16  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

**Subcommittee on Proposals on  
the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive in 2017**

**Minutes of the fifth meeting  
held on Saturday, 23 May 2015, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon YIU Si-wing  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

**Members absent** :

- Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Deputy Chairman)
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
- Hon James TO Kun-sun
- Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
- Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
- Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
- Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
- Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
- Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
- Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
- Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
- Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Hon WONG Yuk-man
- Hon Claudia MO
- Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
- Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
- Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
- Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
- Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
- Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
- Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- Hon Dennis KWOK
- Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
- Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
- Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
- Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
- Hon IP Kin-yuen
- Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
- Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
- Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Public Officers attending** :

- Mr Gordon LEUNG Chung-tai  
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
  
- Mr Ronald CHAN Ngok-pang  
Political Assistant to Secretary for Constitutional and  
Mainland Affairs

**Attendance by : Session One**  
**Invitation**

New Century Forum

Mr CHAN Choi-hi  
District Affairs Officer

Mr SIU Yuk-kong

The Y. Elites Association

Mr Clarence LEUNG  
Chairman

Mr Johnny YU

Mr Wingco LO

Hong Kong Women's Art Society

Ms CHAN Suet-yi  
President

Democratic Party

Mr LAM Cheuk-ting  
Spokesman

Mr CHAN Hei-hing

Ms CHOW Fung-yee

Mr Daniel CHAN Yat-nam

Mr LUI Hung-kik

Mr Bernard WU

Labour Party

Mr KWOK Wing-kin

Hong Kong Motion Picture Industry Association Ltd

Mr HUNG Cho-sing  
Chairman

Mr CHAN Ka-wai

Mr Albert CHUANG

Mr TSOI Hing-fa

Ms LEE Yuek-ping

Mr DENG Zhi-hao

Mr MUK Ka-chun

Mr CHAN Chee-chuen

Mr Owen CHOW Ho-wan

Mr LI Chung-ming

Federation of Hong Kong Sports Organization

Mr Samuel HO Wai-hing  
Secretary General

Hong Kong Hiking Association, China

Mr CHOW Kwok-keung  
Chairman

Civic Party

Mr CHENG Tat-hung  
Executive Committee Member

Mr FONG Yin-bun

Laos Overseas Chinese Friendship Hong Kong Association

Mr CHAN Keung  
President

Mr LEUNG Chi-kong  
Member of Eastern District Council

Mr Jaime SZE Wine-him

*Session Two*

Mr PAK Hon-pun

Miss FU Hiu-lam

Mr HUNG Lung-chun

Miss WONG Ching-chi

Mr HO Kai-ming  
Member of Kwun Tong District Council

Mr Allen CHAN Chun-tat

Hong Kong Department Stores and Retail General Union

Mr LAM Hiu-ban  
Executive Director

Hong Kong Political, Economic and Cultural Society

Mr LEE Shou-shoon  
Vice President

Miss CHAN On-yan

Mr CHEUNG Yin-nam

Mr Ken WONG

Mr WONG Kai-san

Ms LO Ching

Mr LEE Ka-hang

Mr KAN Ming-tung  
Member of Kwun Tong District Council

Mr CHAN Tsz-kin

Ms CHIN Po-fun

公民提名最公道學會

Ms WONG Siu-har  
Chairman

Mr Billy CHENG

Mr LAM Chun-yip

Mr TAM Kwok-sun

People Power

Mr Fastbeat TAM Tak-chi  
Executive Member

剷走功能組別研究所

Mr Peter LAI  
Director

Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association

Mr Samuel YUNG, SBS, MH, JP  
Founding President & Political & Public Administration  
Committee Chairman

Miss Eva CHOY

Mr LAU Tik-hung

屯門社區關注組

Mr HON Lai-yin  
Organizer

Hong Kong United Youth Association

Mr Kenneth FOK  
Chairman

Mr JIM Shing

Mr Henry WONG Chun-fai

Mr William FUNG Hon-kwong

Mr WONG Sai-lung

Mr PANG Man-fai

Mr NG Ka-chiu

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Flora TAI  
Assistant Secretary General 2

Mr Kelvin LEE  
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Miss Cindy HO  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Miss Karen LAI  
Council Secretary (2) 6

Mrs Fanny TSANG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

---

Action

- I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration**  
[Consultation Report and Proposals on the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive by Universal Suffrage]
1. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 57 deputations/individuals attending the meeting, and noted three written submissions from other organizations/individuals which/who did not attend the meeting.

3. At 12:28 pm, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen drew the attention of the Chairman to the fact that a quorum was not present. The Chairman directed members to be summoned.

4. At 12:42 pm, the Chairman said that as he reckoned that a quorum would not be present by 12:43 pm (i.e. expiry of 15 minutes during which members were summoned), he proposed and members agreed that arrangements be made to convene another meeting at 2:30 pm in that afternoon to continue to receive views from deputations.

5. At 12:43 pm, the Chairman said that as a quorum was not present within 15 minutes after members had been summoned, he declared the meeting closed.

*(Post-meeting note: As instructed by the Chairman after consulting members of the Subcommittee, a meeting was held at 2:30 pm on 23 May 2015 in Conference Room 1. Written notice of the meeting was issued by the Clerk to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1554/14-15 dated 23 May 2015. Members were also notified by way of pager messages.)*

## **II. Any other business**

6. The meeting ended at 12:43 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
23 October 2015



**Proceedings of the fifth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Proposals on  
the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive in 2017  
on Saturday, 23 May 2015, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
000900 - 001356	Chairman	Opening remarks  Meeting with deputations to receive views on the Administration's proposals on the method for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") by universal suffrage ("the Proposals").	
<b><u>Session One</u></b>			
001357 - 001709	New Century Forum	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(01)]	
001710 - 001941	Mr SIU Yuk-kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1545/14-15(01)]	
001942 - 002131	The Y. Elites Association	Presentation of views	
002132 - 002439	Mr Johnny YU	Presentation of views	
002440 - 002703	Mr Wingco LO	Presentation of views	
002704 - 002805	Hong Kong Women's Art Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(02)]	
002806 - 003057	Democratic Party	Presentation of views	
003058 - 003208	Mr CHAN Hei-hing	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1568/14-15(01)]	
003209 - 003431	Ms CHOW Fung-yee	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1568/14-15(02)]	
003432 - 003734	Mr Daniel CHAN Yat-nam	Presentation of views	
003735 - 004025	Mr LUI Hung-kik	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(03)]	
004026 - 004210	Mr Bernard WU	Presentation of views	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
004211 - 004512	Labour Party	Presentation of views	
004513 - 004625	Hong Kong Motion Picture Industry Association Ltd	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(05)]	
004626 - 004649	Mr CHAN Ka-wai	Presentation of views	
004650 - 004947	Mr Albert CHUANG	Presentation of views	
004948 - 005253	Mr TSOI Hing-fa	Presentation of views	
005254 - 005605	Ms LEE Yuek-ping	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(06)]	
005606 - 005840	Mr DENG Zhi-hao	Presentation of views	
005841 - 010150	Mr MUK Ka-chun	Presentation of views	
010151 - 010335	Mr CHAN Chee-chuen	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(07)]	
010336 - 010623	Mr Owen CHOW Ho-wan	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1545/14-15(02)]	
010624 - 010932	Mr LI Chung-ming	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(08)]	
010933 - 011146	Federation of Hong Kong Sports Organization	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(09)]	
011147 - 011433	Hong Kong Hiking Association, China	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(10)]	
011434 - 011714	Civic Party	Presentation of views	
011715 - 011851	Mr FONG Yin-bun	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(11)]	
011852 - 012136	Laos Overseas Chinese Friendship Hong Kong Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1529/14-15(12) and CB(2)1568/14-15(03)]	
012137 - 012406	Mr LEUNG Chi-kong	Presentation of views	
012407 - 012723	Mr Jaime SZE Wine-him	Presentation of views	

012724 - 013252	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam Mr MUK Ka-chun	Mr CHAN Kam-lam considered that the strong aspiration of Hong Kong people for implementing universal suffrage for the CE election in 2017 should be met. He noted that the Proposals were generally supported by local academics as well as overseas politicians. The deputation agreed with Mr CHAN's view that CE should "love the country and Hong Kong" and be accountable to the Central Authorities and Hong Kong people because Hong Kong was not an independent country but a special administrative region of the State.	
013253 - 014321	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Administration	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan considered that the Proposals, based on the Decision of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress ("NPCSC") on 31 August 2014 ("2014 Decision of NPCSC"), would only give Hong Kong people "fake universal suffrage", and voters could only choose from candidates whose nomination process was completely controlled by the Central Authorities. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that such a system would have no credibility at all as CE candidates nominated by the nominating committee ("NC") would not help ensure that the CE-elect would be accountable to the general public.	
014322 - 014736	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr YIU Si-wing considered that the Hong Kong community would become more divided if the Proposals were voted down by the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), and the democratic development in Hong Kong would be delayed.	
014737 - 015237	Chairman Mr SIN Chung-kai Democratic Party	Mr SIN Chung-kai invited views from deputations on the unfairness of the nomination system under the framework of the 2014 Decision of NPCSC. The deputation believed that the 1 200 members of NC would conduct political screening to ensure that only those who were favoured by the Central Authorities could stand as candidates.	
015238 - 015754	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN	Mr Michael TIEN considered that a system that allowed Hong Kong people to elect the CE-elect was surely more democratic than the existing system that the CE-elect was only elected by the 1 200-member Election Committee. He pointed out that the timetable for attaining universal suffrage had not come by easily; and after the	

		implementation of universal suffrage for the CE election in 2017, the electoral method could be further refined, and would be developed in the light of the actual situation in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.	
015755 - 020258	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG	Dr Priscilla LEUNG suggested that the Administration should explain to the community that implementing universal suffrage would not be able to resolve all the problems and livelihood issues. She stressed that a pragmatic approach should be adopted in taking forward constitutional development of Hong Kong.	
020259 - 021850	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Mr James TIEN Mr Steven HO	Miss CHAN Yuen-han, Mr James TIEN and Mr Steven HO considered that the strong aspiration of Hong Kong people for implementing universal suffrage for the CE election in 2017 should be met, thereby taking an important step forward in the constitutional development of Hong Kong. They considered that further efforts should be made in enhancing communication with Members of the pan-democratic camp in order to narrow the gap in views and strive for the endorsement of the Proposals.	
021851 - 022028	Chairman Administration	In response to the concerns raised by Members and deputations, the Administration emphasized that the Proposals, which were formulated after more than 16 months of extensive and in-depth discussions during the public consultations, were in strict compliance with the Basic Law and relevant Decisions of NPCSC. The Administration had made the best endeavour to strike a balance amongst the diverse views, to secure acceptance by a majority of the public, the LegCo, CE, as well as the Central Authorities, so that the aim of selecting CE by universal suffrage could be attained. The Administration called on Members to support the Proposals so as to meet the aspiration of the community for electing the next CE through "one person, one vote" in 2017, thereby taking an important step forward in the constitutional development of Hong Kong.	
<b><u>Session Two</u></b>			
022638 - 022907	Chairman	Opening remarks	
022908 - 023028	Mr PAK Hon-pun	Presentation of views	

023029 - 023311	Miss FU Hiu-lam	Presentation of views	
023312 - 023554	Mr HUNG Lung-chun	Presentation of views	
023555 - 023842	Miss WONG Ching-chi	Presentation of views	
023843 - 024148	Mr HO Kai-ming	Presentation of views	
024149 - 024457	Mr Allen CHAN Chun-tat	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(13)]	
024458 - 024804	Hong Kong Department Stores and Retail General Union	Presentation of views	
024805 - 025115	Hong Kong Political, Economic and Cultural Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1545/14-15(03)]	
025116 - 025343	Miss CHAN On-yan	Presentation of views	
025344 - 025602	Mr CHEUNG Yin-nam	Presentation of views	
025603 - 025923	Mr Ken WONG	Presentation of views	
025924 - 030224	Mr WONG Kai-san	Presentation of views	
030225 - 030523	Ms LO Ching	Presentation of views	
030524 - 030811	Mr LEE Ka-hang	Presentation of views	
030812 - 031043	Mr KAN Ming-tung	Presentation of views	
031044 - 031109	Mr CHAN Tsz-kin	Presentation of views	
031110 - 031419	Ms CHIN Po-fun	Presentation of views	
031420 - 031535	公民提名最公道學會	Presentation of views	
031536 - 031818	Mr Billy CHENG	Presentation of views	
031819 - 032128	Mr LAM Chun-yip	Presentation of views	
032129 - 032436	Mr TAM Kwok-sun	Presentation of views	
032437 - 032737	People Power	Presentation of views	
032738 - 032736	Chairman	The Chairman ruled that Mr TAM Tak-chi and Ms CHIN Po-fun behaved disorderly and ordered them to withdraw immediately from the meeting	

		in accordance with Rule 87 of the Rules of Procedure.	
032737 - 032854		Suspension of meeting	
032855 - 033023	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen drew the attention of the Chairman to the fact that a quorum was not present. The Chairman directed members to be summoned.	
033024 - 033329	劃走功能組別研究所	Presentation of views	
033330 - 033556	Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1591/14-15(01)]	
033557 - 033704	Miss Eva CHOY	Presentation of views	
033705 - 034001	Mr LAU Tik-hung	Presentation of views	
034002 - 034311	屯門社區關注組	Presentation of views	
034312 - 034410	Chairman	As a quorum was not present 15 minutes after members had been summoned, the Chairman declared the meeting closed.	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
23 October 2015