

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/14

LC Paper No. CB(2)103/15-16
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

**Subcommittee on Proposals on
the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive in 2017**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting
held on Saturday, 23 May 2015, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

**Members
absent** :

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Public Officers : Mr Gordon LEUNG Chung-tai
attending Deputy Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Mr Ronald CHAN Ngok-pang
Political Assistant to Secretary for Constitutional and
Mainland Affairs

Attendance by : Session One
Invitation

Miss CHEUNG Lam-ping

Mr YIP Ka-fu

Mr LAM Po-chi

Mr HUANGPOU xing

Miss SO King-miu

Mr YIP Yau-yuk

Mr CHONG Kam-fung

Mr Jonathan FONG

Mr SO Wing-lap

Mr NG Chung-tat

Liberal Party Youth Committee

Mr Harris YEUNG
Vice Chairman

Mr Andy LIU

Mr Ronald HO

Mr Timothy CHUI

Mr William TSANG

Mr Eric CHUNG

Liberal Party

Mr Peter SHIU
Vice Party Chair

Miss LAU Mei-ting

Mr CHEW Kwok-wai

Mr CHEUNG Kam-chung

Progressive Lawyers Group

Mr Kevin YAM
Convenor

Ms LEE Wai-ming

寰球政治策略研究組

Mr Thomas YEUNG
Convenor

Progressive Teachers' Alliance

Mr Simon HUNG Ling-fai
Member

Mr LEUNG Ka-nam

Miss WONG Yuk-ting

Reclaiming Social Work Movement

Mr Rivalino CHUNG Wai-lung

Miss Kanley TSANG King-lai

IT Voice

Mr Ken LAM

The Professional Commons

Mr S C LEUNG

Mr Victor NG

Session Two

Ms Maggie WU

The Alumni Association of Pah Tsung High School Jakarta
Indonesia

Mr Henry LEE Lung-fang
Secretary General

Mr WONG Yui-hin

Mr Edward LAU Wai-tak

Miss CHU Man-wa

Mr NG Wing-tak

Mr YIP Kam-lung

Miss LUEN Shuk-wah

Mr HO Wai-cheung

Miss MAK Wa-ki

Miss Andrea Melody CHUH

Miss LI Ka-wai

Mr Jackie YUE Tsz-kit

Miss HUI Wing-ting

Mr WONG Lok-hang

Miss WONG Sze-wing

Mr Jake CHOI

Mr CHEUNG Chun-ho

Mr LAI Yuk-yeung

Mr MOK Chun-tung

Miss WONG Wing-ki

Mr TSANG Kwok-tung

Mr LO Tak-cheong

Miss KWOK Hoi-ching

Mr Albert CHAN

Mr Willson LAW King-tin

Mr LI Man-ho

One of the Archian

Mr PO Chung-yin

ArchiVision

Mr Derek LAU

Civic Architects for Democracy

Mr Ken WONG

Architect Political Reform Concern Group

Miss Millie LAM

思政築覺

Mr KWAN Siu-lun

Mr WONG Ho-wa

Mr Innes TANG Tak-shing

精算思政

Mr CHAN Ching-chuen
Spokesman

Mr FUNG Wai-shing

精益求精政改關注組

Mr LEE Tsz-kin
Convenor

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Assistant Secretary General 2

Mr Kelvin LEE
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Miss Cindy HO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Miss Karen LAI
Council Secretary (2) 6

Mrs Fanny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

- I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration**
[Consultation Report and Proposals on the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive by Universal Suffrage]
1. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
 2. The Subcommittee received views from 68 deputations/individuals attending the meeting.

II. Any other business

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:32 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
23 October 2015

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of the
Subcommittee on Proposals on
the Method for Selecting the Chief Executive in 2017
on Saturday, 23 May 2015, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
000535 - 000957	Chairman	Opening remarks Meeting with deputations to receive views on the Administration's proposals on the method for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") by universal suffrage ("the Proposals").	
<i>Session One</i>			
000958 - 001219	Miss CHEUNG Lam-ping	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1529/14-15(14) and CB(2)1591/14-15(02)]	
001220 - 001414	Mr YIP Ka-fu	Presentation of views	
001415 - 001527	Mr LAM Po-chi	Presentation of views	
001528 - 001838	Mr HUANGPOU xing	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(16)]	
001839 - 001915	Miss SO King-miu	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(17)]	
001916 - 002233	Mr YIP Yau-yuk	Presentation of views	
002234 - 002509	Mr CHONG Kam-fung	Presentation of views	
002510 - 002755	Mr Jonathan FONG	Presentation of views	
002756 - 003038	Mr SO Wing-lap	Presentation of views	
003039 - 003332	Mr NG Chung-tat	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1568/14-15(04)]	
003333 - 003625	Liberal Party Youth Committee	Presentation of views	
003626 - 003814	Mr Andy LIU	Presentation of views	
003815 - 004012	Mr Ronald HO	Presentation of views	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
004013 - 004213	Mr Timothy CHUI	Presentation of views	
004214 - 004521	Mr William TSANG	Presentation of views	
004522 - 004827	Mr Eric CHUNG	Presentation of views	
004828 - 005138	Liberal Party	Presentation of views	
005139 - 005319	Miss LAU Mei-ting	Presentation of views	
005320 - 005629	Mr CHEW Kwok-wai	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1568/14-15(05)]	
005630 - 005857	Mr CHEUNG Kam-chung	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(18)]	
005858 - 010157	Progressive Lawyers Group	Presentation of views	
010158 - 010506	Ms LEE Wai-ming	Presentation of views	
010507 - 010811	寰球政治策略研究組	Presentation of views	
010812 - 011119	Progressive Teachers' Alliance	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1545/14-15(04)]	
011120 - 011418	Mr LEUNG Ka-nam	Presentation of views	
011419 - 011727	Miss WONG Yuk-ting	Presentation of views	
011728 - 012031	Reclaiming Social Work Movement	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1591/14-15(03)]	
012032 - 012341	Miss Kanley TSANG King-lai	Presentation of views	
012342 - 012645	IT Voice	Presentation of views	
012646 - 012954	The Professional Commons	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1591/14-15(04)]	
012955 - 013419	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Mr CHAN Kam-lam stressed the need to discuss the specific method for selecting CE in 2017 on the basis of the legal framework constituted by the relevant provisions in the Basic Law ("BL") and the relevant Interpretation and Decisions of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress ("NPCSC"). He considered that Hong Kong's democratic development should proceed	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		step by step and he did not support using extreme and illegal means to strive for democracy.	
013420 - 013835	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan considered that the Proposals should be endorsed by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") so that five million eligible voters of Hong Kong might elect the CE-elect through "one person, one vote" in 2017. She pointed out that the 1 200 members of the nominating committee would also be returned through elections. She suggested that consideration might be given to adding new subsectors (such as Women and Youth subsectors).	
013836 - 014226	Chairman Mr Charles Peter MOK Progressive Lawyers Group	Mr Charles Peter MOK considered that the drop in support for the Proposals in recent surveys had reflected public opinions on relevant issues.	
014227 - 014634	Chairman Ms Emily LAU 寰球政治策略研究組 The Professional Commons	Ms Emily LAU criticized that the Administration had failed to take measures to narrow the gap in views, and the community was becoming more divided over political reform and related issues. She discussed with deputations on what actions should be taken by the Administration in order to implement the BL provisions on the selection of CE and the formation of LegCo ultimately by universal suffrage once the Proposals were vetoed by LegCo.	
014635 - 015042	Chairman Mr WONG Yuk-man	Mr WONG Yuk-man said that "civic nomination" was widely adopted in other jurisdictions and it should be adopted for nominating CE candidates in 2017 when universal suffrage was implemented for the selection of CE. He expressed strong objection to the Proposals.	
015043 - 015447	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr KWOK Ka-ki considered that the Decision of NPCSC on 31 August 2014 ("the Decision") had throttled room for implementing "genuine universal suffrage" for the CE election in 2017. He stressed that under the restrictive framework imposed by the Decision, voters would only be allowed to choose from among two to three candidates favoured by the Central Authorities. He considered that if the Proposals were to be "pocketed first", the Central Authorities and the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		("HKSAR") Government would consider that the universal suffrage as prescribed in BL 45 had been attained and they would not seek to improve the universal suffrage system beyond 2017.	
015448 - 015854	Chairman Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr IP Kwok-him considered that any constitutional reform proposal should be formulated strictly in accordance with BL and the relevant Interpretation and Decisions of NPCSC. In his view, the pace of democratic development varied from place to place.	
015855 - 020211	Chairman Mr Victor NG	Presentation of views	
020212 - 020622	Chairman Mr Steven HO	As regards some deputations' concern about the difference in the electorate size within the Election Committee subsectors, Mr Steven HO considered that it was inappropriate to make comparisons between different subsectors. He clarified that there were at least 6 500 fishing vessels with more than ten thousand members in the fisheries industry of Hong Kong.	
020623 - 021024	Chairman Administration	In response to the concerns raised by members and deputations, the Administration emphasized that the Proposals were in strict compliance with BL and the relevant Decisions of NPCSC. The Administration explained that after the implementation of universal suffrage for the CE election through "one person, one vote" in 2017, should there be a need to amend the method for selecting CE, Article 7 of Annex I to BL and the "Five-step Process" of constitutional development set out in the "Interpretation of Article 7 of Annex I and Article III of Annex II to the Basic Law" had already provided a clear legal basis for initiating such further amendments to the method for selecting CE.	
<u>Session Two</u>			
021438 - 021749	Chairman	Opening remarks	
021750 - 022103	Ms Maggie WU	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1529/14-15(20) and CB(2)1568/14-15(06)]	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
022104 - 022438	The Alumni Association of Pah Tsung High School Jakarta Indonesia	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(19)]	
022439 - 022743	Mr WONG Yui-hin	Presentation of views	
022744 - 023049	Mr Edward LAU Wai-tak	Presentation of views	
023050 - 023345	Miss CHU Man-wa	Presentation of views	
023346 - 023622	Mr NG Wing-tak	Presentation of views	
023623 - 023926	Mr YIP Kam-lung	Presentation of views	
023927 - 024232	Miss LUEN Shuk-wah	Presentation of views	
024233 - 024538	Mr HO Wai-cheung	Presentation of views	
024539 - 024828	Miss MAK Wa-ki	Presentation of views	
024829 - 025137	Miss Andrea Melody CHUH	Presentation of views	
025138 - 025443	Miss LI Ka-wai	Presentation of views	
025444 - 025738	Mr Jackie YUE Tsz-kit	Presentation of views	
025739 - 030036	Miss HUI Wing-ting	Presentation of views	
030037 - 030245	Mr WONG Lok-hang	Presentation of views	
030246 - 030549	Miss WONG Sze-wing	Presentation of views	
030550 - 030823	Mr Jake CHOI	Presentation of views	
030824 - 031128	Mr CHEUNG Chun-ho	Presentation of views	
031129 - 031308	Mr LAI Yuk-yeung	Presentation of views	
031309 - 031608	Mr MOK Chun-tung	Presentation of views	
031609 - 031844	Miss WONG Wing-ki	Presentation of views	
031845 - 032048	Mr TSANG Kwok-tung	Presentation of views	
032049 - 032203	Mr LO Tak-cheong	Presentation of views	
032204 - 032349	Miss KWOK Hoi-ching	Presentation of views	
032350 - 032628	Mr Albert CHAN	Presentation of views	
032629 - 032933	Mr Willson LAW King-tin	Presentation of views	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
032934 - 033243	Mr LI Man-ho	Presentation of views	
033244 - 033537	One of the Archian	Presentation of views	
033538 - 033820	ArchiVision	Presentation of views	
033821 - 034128	Civic Architects for Democracy	Presentation of views	
034129 - 034424	Architect Political Reform Concern Group	Presentation of views	
034425 - 034734	思政築覺	Presentation of views	
034735 - 035037	Mr WONG Ho-wa	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1529/14-15(21)]	
035038 - 035238	Mr Innes TANG Tak-shing	Presentation of views	
035239 - 035545	精算思政	Presentation of views	
035546 - 035814	Mr FUNG Wai-shing	Presentation of views	
035815 - 040123	精益求精政改關注組	Presentation of views	
040124 - 040248	Chairman Administration	In response to the concerns raised by members and deputations, the Administration emphasized that the Proposals were in strict compliance with BL and relevant Decisions of NPCSC, and the elements contained in the Proposals were attempts to find the greatest common ground, strike the right balance amongst diverse views, and were appropriate to the actual situation in HKSAR. The Administration explained that as far as constitutional procedures were concerned, the Second Step of the "Five-step Process" for amending the method for selecting CE had already been completed. The Administration would soon introduce into LegCo a motion and secure its endorsement by a two-thirds majority of all Members.	