

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(4)612 /14-15

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/13

**Panel on Education**

**Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of  
Free Kindergarten Education**

**Minutes of the third meeting  
held on Saturday, 17 January 2015, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon CHUNG Shu-kun, Christopher, BBS, MH, JP
- Members absent** : Hon MA Fung-kiwok, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

**Member attending** : Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Public Officers Attending** : Item I

Mr Kevin YEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Education

Mrs Michelle WONG  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Ms Hera CHUM  
Principal Assistant Secretary  
(Special Education & Kindergarten Education)  
Education Bureau

**Attendance by Invitation** : Item I

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Dr FUNG Wai-wah  
President

Hong Kong Early Childhood Educators Association

Ms CHOW Wai-chun  
Chairman

Christian & Missionary Alliance Social Services

Mr YAN Ho-on  
Professional Development Officer (Child Care)

Early Childhood Education  
Administrators Association (Hong Kong)

Ms Cindy WONG Suk-fong  
Secretary

Professional Association of Masters of  
Education in Early Childhood Education of  
Hong Kong Institute of Education Ltd

Ms TSE Yuk-sim  
Chairman

Liberal Party

Mr Victor NG

Miss KWAN Shuk-ling

Miss CHAN Han-ying

Ms FUNG Pik-yee

Mr CHAN Hung

Council of Non-profit Making Organizations  
for Pre-primary Education

Dr KAM Shau-wan  
Chairman

New People's Party

Mr WONG Wai-shing  
Community Development Officer

Ms CHAN Choi-yee

Ms WONG Lai-yin

Mr CHAN Chun-kit

Miss LAI Suk-ching

Ms CHAN Chor-hang

Ms MAN Wun-king

Miss CHAN Fung-yi

幼師起動聯盟

Ms CHAN Foon-yi  
Kindergarten Teacher

爭取十五年免費教育大聯盟

Dr Gail YUEN  
Convenor

Hong Kong Baptist Kindergarten  
Education Convention

Mr CHAN Mei-tak  
President

Mr FUNG Ka-chun

Ms YUNG Hau-heung

關注十五年免費教育工作小組

Miss WONG Siu-fung  
Principal

Ms WONG Siu-kwan

Centre for Child Enlightenment,  
Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children

Ms Cecilia LAM  
Educational Psychologist

HKSPC Park'n Shop Staff Charitable Fund  
Nursery School

Ms CHEUNG Yuet-far  
Principal

HKSPC Hong Kong Bank Foundation  
Nursery School

Ms YIP Yuk-fong  
Teacher

Ms HUNG Yin-mei

Miss CHEUNG Pik-man

Ms VU Kit-vai

Democratic Party

Mr LAM Cheuk-ting  
Chief Executive Officer

Civic Party

Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
District Developer

Hong Kong Women Workers' Association

Miss LEUNG Wei-ching  
Organizer

Ms NG Lai-chun

Progressive Teachers' Alliance

Ms SY On-na  
Convenor

Mr Jackey LO

Mr CHONG Chun-shun

E.F.C.C. – Tin Yan Nursery School

Ms WONG Man-yan  
Principal

The Tsung Tsin Mission of  
Hong Kong Social Service

Ms YEUNG So-kuen  
Service Supervisor

Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children

Ms Susan SO  
Director

The Association of Evangelical Free Churches  
of Hong Kong E.F.C.C. – Verbena Nursery School

Ms SO Yee-may  
Principal

Hong Kong Christian Service

Ms Adelina KONG Siu-wai  
Chief Supervisor  
Early Childhood Education Service

Hong Kong Baptist University –  
Early Childhood Education Society

Miss LEUNG Siu-ting  
Chairperson

Mr CHENG Kai-yin

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment  
and Progress of Hong Kong

Mr Frankie NGAN  
Family Affairs Committee Member

Dr YU Wai-bing

Mr FAN Chi-lung

Hong Kong Christian Service Times  
Nursery School

Miss German CHEUNG Man-na

Early Childhood Education Programs  
Alumni Association, Faculty of Education,  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Ms WONG Yuk-hing  
Vice-Chairman

Miss LAM Lai-ching

Miss HUNG Wai-shan

Miss WONG Hoi-ling

Miss TSE Tsz-wa

Pacific Early Childhood Education  
Research Association (Hong Kong)

Ms LAU Yau-lin  
Member of Executive Council

Ms CHAN Hoi-man

Caritas Hong Kong – Pre-school  
Education and Child Care Service

Ms Gloria LEUNG Chi-kin  
Service Head

OMEP Hong Kong

Dr Amelia LEE Nam-yuk  
President

Mr SZE Chun-yuen

Miss LEUNG Yan

Miss MA Sze-ching

Mr LEE Chi-to

Miss FUNG Hoi-ching

Miss Ada FUNG Yuen-ting

Ms Milly KAN Mai-ling

Ms Penny PANG Pui-sze

Tin Shui Wai Children Carer Concern Group

Ms TSUI Hin-tung  
Organizing Officer

Tin Shui Wai Community Development Network

Mr CHAN Wai-lun  
Organizing Officer

Miss LAI Wan-yiu

Mr CHENG Wai

Miss CHAN Wai-yan

Special Educational Needs Rights Association

Mr HO Cheuk-hin  
Community Organizer

Miss WU Yuen-kwan

Ms LEUNG Lai-kit

Ms CHEUNG Xiao-ling

Ms LI Lan-chu



The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms Karen YIU Kit-ling  
Chief Officer

Ms Fanny TSANG Miu-fan

Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance

Mr LEE Tai-sing  
Organizer

Alliance for Children Development Rights

Miss HO Yu-ying  
Organizer

Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres

Mr LEUNG Shek-lun  
Advocacy Officer

Cheung Sha Wan Childcare Service Concern Group

Ms QIU Su-hua  
Member

Mr LEUNG Wing-shing

Miss CHAN Yuet-wah

Miss LAM Lai-wah

Evangelical Lutheran Church Social Service –  
Hong Kong

---

Ms LAU Yin-king  
Service Director

Miss LAI Wing-hei

Education Convergence

Ms LAU Seung-man  
Council Member

Miss WONG Pui-man

Mr LAM Kim-cheong

Hong Kong Young Women's Christian Association

Ms TSE Shuk-in  
Deputy Chief Executive

Miss LEUNG Wai-yan

Miss YEUNG Ho-man

Mr YIP Chung-him

Miss SU Guan-qiong

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4) 4

Mr Ian CHOW  
Council Secretary (4) 4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4) 4

Miss Emma LAM  
Clerical Assistant (4) 3

---

**I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)225/14-15(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(4)225/14-15(02) -- Background brief prepared by the LegCo Secretariat)

Other papers

Written submission from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(02) -- Submission from Right of People's Livelihood & Legal Association, Hong Kong (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(05) -- Submission from Mr Thomas LEDGER (*English version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(09) -- Submission from Miss NG Hiu-ying (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(18) -- Submission from Mr K K WONG (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(19) -- Submission from The Salvation Army (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14-15(06) -- Submission from The Forthright Caucus (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(10) -- Submission from Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(11) -- Submission from Mr YEUNG Wai-sing, Eastern District Council Member (*Chinese version only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(12) -- Submission from The Boys' & Girls' Clubs Association of Hong Kong (*Chinese version only*)

Meeting with deputations / individuals and the Administration for agenda item I

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Follow-up actions

2. At members' request, the Secretariat would prepare a paper setting out deputations' major views and concerns raised at this meeting for consideration by the Administration and the Committee on Free Kindergarten Education ("the KG Committee").

*(Post-meeting note: A paper setting out deputations' major views and concerns raised at this meeting had been prepared and forwarded to the Administration and the KG Committee for consideration on 29 January 2015 and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)469/14-15(01). A written response was provided by the Administration on 17 February 2015 and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)538/14-15(01).)*

EDB

3. The Education Bureau ("EDB") was requested to –

- (a) convey the views and concerns of the deputations to the KG Committee for consideration; and
- (b) provide written information on the current situation of families receiving fee remission under the Kindergarten and Child Care Centre Fee Remission Scheme ("KCFRS") and whether it would review and raise the income thresholds for applicants to receive fee remission under KCFRS.

Deputations

4. The deputations were invited to provide information, where available, on the wastage rate of kindergarten teachers. They were also welcomed to provide further information on relevant issues to the Subcommittee in writing.

Invitation to the KG Committee to attend the meeting

5. Mr WONG Kwok-hing noted with some regret that no member of the KG Committee was present at the meeting. In reply to the Deputy Chairman, the Clerk informed members that on the instruction of the Chairman, the Secretariat had written to EDB requesting it to invite and co-ordinate the attendance of representatives of the KG Committee for the meeting. Subsequently, the Secretariat received an email reply from EDB advising that no members of the KG Committee would be present on the basis that the Chairman and/or Vice-chairman of the KG Committee had been organizing meetings with school heads associations in different districts, various political parties, Federations of Parent-Teacher Associations and concern groups etc. to listen to their views.

6. The Deputy Chairman expressed his strong regret at the non-attendance of representatives of the KG Committee. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che and Dr Kenneth CHAN also expressed their dissatisfaction, and indicated that the Subcommittee might wish to follow up the matter by way of a letter or moving a motion.

7. The Deputy Chairman questioned whether the reasons for non-attendance had been put forward by EDB on its own accord or on behalf of the KG Committee. At his invitation, Deputy Secretary for Education (3) ("DS(Ed)3") explained that the KG Committee secretariat had discussed the Subcommittee's invitation with the Chairman and Vice-chairman of the KG Committee. In view of the fact that on quite a number of past occasions, the Chairman and/or Vice-chairman had met with Legislative Council Members and various stakeholders to listen to their views, and that two meetings of the KG Committee were scheduled for 19 and 21 January 2015, it was therefore proposed that only officers from EDB would attend the Subcommittee meeting to collect and reflect deputations' views to the KG Committee at its upcoming meetings. DS(Ed)3 said that in view of the timing and frequency of meetings, the current attendance arrangement was considered appropriate.

**II. Any other business**

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:20 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
10 March 2015

**Proceedings of the third meeting of the  
Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of  
Free Kindergarten Education  
on Saturday, 17 January 2015, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Meeting with deputations and the Administration</i>			
<i>Session One</i>			
000341 - 000924	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000925 - 001052	Education Bureau ("EDB")	EDB briefed members that –  (a) the implementation of free kindergarten ("KG") education was one of the priorities of the Administration; and  (b) the Committee on Free Kindergarten Education ("the KG Committee") set up to make recommendations on how to practicably implement free KG education would submit a report to EDB around mid-2015. EDB would take steps to follow up the KG Committee's recommendations within the current-term Government.	
001053 - 001419	Chairman Hong Kong Professional Teacher's Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14-15(01)]	
001420 - 001735	Chairman Hong Kong Early Childhood Educators Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(01)]	
001736 - 002052	Chairman Christian & Missionary Alliance Social Services	Presentation of views	
002053 - 002349	Chairman Early Childhood Education Administrators Association ( Hong Kong)	Presentation of views	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
002350 - 002649	Chairman Professional Association of Masters of Education in Early Childhood Education of Hong Kong Institute of Education Ltd	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14- 15(01)]	
002650 - 002854	Liberal Party	Presentation of views	
002855 - 003224	Chairman Miss KWAN Shuk-ling	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(02)]	
003225 - 003529	Chairman Miss CHAN Han-ying	Presentation of views	
003530 - 003831	Chairman Ms FUNG Pik-yee	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(03)]	
003832 - 004139	Chairman Mr CHAN Hung	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(04)]	
004140 - 004409	Chairman Council of Non-profit Making Organizations for Pre-primary Education	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(03)]	
004410 - 004716	Chairman New People's Party	Presentation of views	
004717 - 005018	Chairman Ms CHAN Choi-yee	Presentation of views[LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(02)]	
005019 - 005318	Chairman Ms WONG Lai-yin	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(05)]	
005319 - 005624	Chairman Mr CHAN Chun-kit	Presentation of views	
005625 - 005934	Chairman Miss LAI Suk-ching	Presentation of views	
005935 - 010223	Chairman Ms CHAN Chor-hang	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14- 15(02)]	
010224 - 010523	Chairman Ms MAN Wun-king	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14- 15(03)]	
010524 - 010849	Chairman Miss CHAN Fung-yi	Presentation of views	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
010850 - 011159	Chairman 幼師起動聯盟	Presentation of views	
011200 - 011437	Chairman 爭取十五年免費教育 大聯盟	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14-15(04)]	
011438 - 011713	Chairman Hong Kong Baptist Kindergarten Education Convention	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14-15(06)]	
011714 - 012009	Chairman Mr FUNG Ka-chun	Presentation of views	
012010 - 012314	Chairman Ms YUNG Hau-heung	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14-15(07)]	
012315 - 012527	Chairman EDB	<p>EDB noted the following major concerns of the deputations –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the provision of free KG education should cover half-day ("HD"), whole-day ("WD") and long whole-day ("LWD") KGs;</li> <li>(b) a mandatory KG teacher salary scale should be established for compliance by KGs;</li> <li>(c) the issue of whether private independent ("PI") KGs should be subsidized as their non-profit-making ("NPM") counterparts; and</li> <li>(d) the abolition or otherwise of the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme ("PEVS").</li> </ul> <p>EDB clarified that whilst the KG Committee had deliberated and formulated some initial views on certain issues, it had not yet finalized its recommendations for submission to the Administration.</p>	
012528 - 012920	Chairman Mrs Regina IP	<p>Mrs IP referred to the experience in the United States, and remarked that under PEVS, parents could choose the KG for enrolling their children and redeem the voucher subsidy. This might result in commercialization of the KG sector in which well-resourced and reputable KGs would be much sought after while less established ones would be disadvantaged. She asked whether lump sum grant ("LSG") would be used as the funding mode for the provision of free KG education, and highlighted the need for good planning in the provision of KG places and the quality of KG education.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) unlike the provision of subsidy to parents under PEVS, the service providers in the welfare sector had been receiving LSG. This mode of funding might be less market-oriented. The future funding mode for the provision of free KG education was still under deliberation by the KG Committee; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration was aware of the need for planning in the provision of KG places.</p>	
012921 - 013300	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Council of Non-profit Making Organizations for Pre-primary Education EDB</p>	<p>Noting from paragraph 151 of the 2015 Policy Address that the Committee had looked further into such issues as whether to offer basic subsidies to all eligible children who were taking HD KG places and would study ways to encourage KGs to provide more full-day services, Mr CHAN was concerned that a decision had already been made that free KG education would cover HD KGs only.</p> <p>Representative of Council of Non-profit Making Organizations for Pre-primary Education considered that WD and LWD KGs provided the environment which supported the learning and development needs of children. Probably, the 2015 Policy Address' focus was merely the provision of child care services outside the duration of HD KG education.</p> <p>Mr CHAN commented that the so-called full-day service might not be manned according to the existing KG teacher-to-student ratio.</p> <p>EDB said that issues related to WD and LWD KGs were still being studied by the KG Committee.</p>	
013301 - 013616	<p>Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG</p>	<p>Dr CHEUNG said that the implementation of LSG in the welfare sector had brought about dire consequences and LSG must not be adopted in the provision of free KG education. He also suggested that free KG education should not be confined to HD KG service only, as there was a great demand for WD and LWD KG services as well.</p>	
013617 - 013935	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman 爭取十五年免費教育大聯盟</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman remarked that the Administration seemed to be inclined to provide free HD KG places only on the ground that this would suffice in achieving the objectives of KG education. Any service in excess would be in the realm of child care service.</p> <p>Representative of 爭取十五年免費教育大聯盟 responded that according to a number of researches, quality KG education should include learning and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		whole person development of children with unique pedagogical characteristics that integrated physical care and education.	
013936 - 014302	Chairman Hong Kong Early Childhood Educators Association	<p>The Chairman noted the strong view expressed by many deputations that a mandatory salary scale for KG teachers should be established for compliance by KGs.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry about the wastage rate of KG teachers, representative of Hong Kong Early Childhood Educators Association advised that according to a survey conducted a few years ago, LWD KG teachers had a double-digit wastage rate, which could be attributed to their long working hour, the need to take on-the-job courses, and the lack of recognition for their qualification and experience.</p>	The deputations were requested to provide the information as stated in paragraph 4 of the minutes.
014303 - 014540	Chairman Mrs Regina IP EDB	<p>Mrs IP enquired to what extent the five principles of KG education (i.e. uniqueness, equity, quality, diversity and sustainability) could be achieved if free KG education would cover HD KG service only.</p> <p>EDB advised that while the emerging consensus of the KG Committee was that free KG education should cover HD service as the basic provision, the need of some families for extra services was well-noted. The KG Committee would study ways to support WD and LWD KGs.</p>	
014541 - 015729	Break		
<i>Session Two</i>			
015730 - 015905	Deputy Chairman	Opening remarks	
015906 - 020218	Deputy Chairman 關注十五年免費教育工作小組	Presentation of views	
020219 - 020523	Deputy Chairman Ms WONG Siu-kwan	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14-15(08)]	
020524 - 020834	Deputy Chairman Centre for Child Enlightenment, Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children	Presentation of views	
020835 - 021148	Deputy Chairman HKSPC Park'n Shop Staff Charitable Fund Nursery School	Presentation of views	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
021149 - 021449	Deputy Chairman HKSPC Hong Kong Bank Foundation Nursery School	Presentation of views	
021450 - 021809	Deputy Chairman Ms HUNG Yin-mei	Presentation of views	
021810 - 022051	Deputy Chairman Miss CHEUNG Pik-man	Presentation of views	
022052 - 022403	Deputy Chairman Ms VU Kit-vai	Presentation of views	
022404 - 022710	Deputy Chairman Democratic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(09)]	
022711 - 023031	Deputy Chairman Civic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14- 15(10)]	
023032 - 023352	Deputy Chairman Hong Kong Women Workers' Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(03)]	
023353 - 023702	Deputy Chairman Ms NG Lai-chun	Presentation of views	
023703 - 024014	Deputy Chairman Progressive Teachers' Alliance	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(04)]	
024015 - 024328	Deputy Chairman Mr Jackey LO	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(05)]	
024329 - 024637	Deputy Chairman Mr CHONG Chun-shun	Presentation of views	
024638 - 025012	Deputy Chairman E.F.C.C. – Tin Yan Nursery School	Presentation of views	
025013 - 025332	Deputy Chairman The Tsung Tsin Mission of Hong Kong Social Service	Presentation of views	
025333 - 025638	Deputy Chairman Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(04)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
025639 - 025959	Deputy Chairman The Association of Evangelical Free Churches of Hong Kong E.F.C.C. – Verbena Nursery School	Presentation of views	
030000 - 030331	Deputy Chairman Hong Kong Christian Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(04)]	
030332 - 030543	Deputy Chairman Hong Kong Baptist University – Early Childhood Education Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(06)]	
030544 - 030907	Deputy Chairman Mr CHENG Kai-yin	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14-15(05)]	
030908 - 031149	Deputy Chairman Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
031150 - 031711	Deputy Chairman EDB Dr Helena WONG	Dr WONG asked whether the Administration would consider subsidizing WD and LWD KG services in view of the great demand by many families.  EDB said the issues were subject to further deliberation by the KG Committee.	
031712 - 032126	Deputy Chairman EDB	The Deputy Chairman drew EDB's attention to the following views of the deputations –  (a) the provision of free KG education should cover HD, WD and LWD KGs;  (b) the global trend of the provision of "Educare" should be examined in the implementation of free KG education; and  (c) Integrated Programme ("IP") should be extended to HD and WD KGs.  In response, EDB advised that –  (a) when implementing free KG education, the Administration would take into consideration the operational needs of HD, WD and LWD KGs; and	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) under existing arrangements, rehabilitation services for pre-primary children were provided by the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") through a range of services which included IP. EDB would work closely with SWD on enhancing support services for students with special needs.	
032127 - 032546	Deputy Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che EDB	<p>Mr CHEUNG asked why free KG education should cover HD KG service only. He was concerned that if HD KG teachers' daily working hours were 3 hours from Monday to Friday (i.e. a total of 15 hours in a week), their employment would not meet the requirement of a continuous contract as defined under the Employment Ordinance (Cap. 57). Their entitlement to various statutory benefits might become questionable.</p> <p>Mr CHEUNG asked whether the KG Committee had proposed to use LSG as the funding mode because of resource consideration.</p> <p>EDB responded that the major consideration in selecting the funding mode was its effectiveness and sustainability. The future funding mode was still under deliberation by the KG Committee.</p>	
032547 - 032959	Deputy Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN	Dr CHAN was gravely concerned about the lack of substantive progress in the implementation of free KG education, such as the implementation timetable, allocation of resources etc.	
033000 - 033545	Deputy Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing EDB	<p>Mr WONG noted with some regret that no members of the KG Committee attended the meeting. He requested EDB to convey to the KG Committee the views and concerns raised by deputations. He also asked the Secretariat to prepare a paper setting out the major views and concerns raised by deputations for reference of the Administration and the KG Committee.</p> <p>EDB said that the KG Committee had maintained close communication with the KG sector.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman expressed his strong regret that the KG Committee did not attend the meeting in response to the Subcommittee's invitation.</p>	The Secretariat and EDB were requested to provide the information as stated in paragraphs 2 and 3(a) of the minutes.
033546 - 033922	Deputy Chairman Dr Helena WONG EDB	Dr WONG noted the KG Committee's emerging consensus that free or subsidized WD and LWD KG places should be provided on a need basis for children who met certain prescribed eligibility criteria including household income. She sought explanation on such criteria, and urged the Administration to seriously consider providing free or subsidized WD and LWD KG places for children with working	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>parents.</p> <p>EDB advised that the support for WD and LWD KGs was still subject to deliberation by the KG Committee.</p> <p>Dr WONG noted from the submission of Hong Kong Early Childhood Educators Association that according to its survey conducted in October 2014, less than 20% of the responding parents were qualified to receive fee remission under the Kindergarten and Child Care Centre Fee Remission Scheme ("KCFRS"). She requested the Administration to provide written information on the current situation and whether it would review and raise the income threshold for applicants to receive fee remission under KCFRS.</p>	<p>EDB was requested to provide the information as stated in paragraph 3(b) of the minutes.</p>
033923 - 034216	<p>Deputy Chairman EDB Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children</p>	<p>In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry about the provision of "Educare" in the implementation of free KG education, EDB explained that when implementing free KG education, it was necessary to determine the scope of services that should be covered. A distinction should be made between the availability of services (provision) and subsidy (use of taxpayers' money). As stated in paragraph 151 of the 2015 Policy Address, the KG Committee would study ways to encourage KGs to provide more full-day services.</p> <p>Representative of Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children said that the global trend was to provide children with full-day "Educare" to nurture their whole person development. According to a survey on the proportion of children attending WD KGs, Hong Kong ranked 25<sup>th</sup> when compared with 32 European countries (the definition of WD services for European countries was at least 30 hours' services per week).</p>	
034217 - 034526	<p>Deputy Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Clerk EDB</p>	<p>Mr CHEUNG expressed dissatisfaction at the non-attendance of representatives of the KG Committee and indicated that the Subcommittee might wish to follow up the matter by way of a letter.</p> <p>The Clerk informed members of the explanation given by EDB in writing.</p> <p>If LSG was capped at an amount not exceeding the midpoint salaries of KG teachers, Mr CHEUNG asked whether the Administration would provide further subsidies to those KGs employing long-serving teachers whose salary had exceeded the midpoint level.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		EDB said that it was not practicable to give a response as the question was premised on hypothetical assumptions.	
034527 - 034806	Deputy Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN	<p>Dr CHAN expressed dissatisfaction at the non-attendance of representatives of the KG Committee and indicated that the Subcommittee might wish to follow up the matter by way of moving a motion.</p> <p>Dr CHAN said that Members of the Civic Party supported that free KG education should cover HD, WD and LWD KG services. He considered that the budget for free KG education should be equivalent to 1% of Hong Kong's gross domestic product.</p>	
034807 - 035024	Deputy Chairman EDB	In response to the Deputy Chairman, EDB provided further explanation on why the KG Committee had not attended the meeting in response to the Subcommittee's invitation. In addition to the various consultations and meetings held by the KG Committee in the past months, the KG Committee and its Sub-Committees had already scheduled their meetings in the coming week, during which members would be informed of the views of the deputations in a timely manner.	
035025 - 044413	Lunch Break		
<i>Session Three</i>			
044414 - 044823	Chairman	Opening remarks	
044824 - 045136	Chairman Dr YU Wai-bing	Presentation of views	
045137 - 045442	Chairman Mr FAN Chi-lung	Presentation of views	
045443 - 045751	Chairman Hong Kong Christian Service Times Nursery School	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)366/14-15(11)]	
045752 - 045935	Chairman Early Childhood Education Programs Alumni Association, Faculty of Education, The Chinese University of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
045936 - 050243	Chairman Miss LAM Lai-ching	Presentation of views	



<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
050244 - 050540	Chairman Miss HUNG Wai-shan	Presentation of views	
050541 - 050826	Chairman Miss WONG Hoi-ling	Presentation of views	
050827 - 051106	Chairman Miss TSE Tsz-wa	Presentation of views	
051107 - 051414	Chairman Pacific Early Childhood Education Research Association (Hong Kong)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(06)]	
051415 - 051727	Chairman Ms CHAN Hoi-man	Presentation of views	
051728 - 052032	Chairman Caritas Hong Kong – Pre- school Education and Child Care Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(07)]	
052033 - 052343	Chairman OMEP Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14- 15(07)]	
052344 - 052640	Chairman Mr SZE Chun-yuen	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(07)]	
052641 - 052833	Chairman Miss LEUNG Yan	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(08)]	
052834 - 052923	Chairman Miss MA Sze-ching	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(10)]	
052924 - 052947	Chairman Mr LEE Chi-to	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(11)]	
052948 - 053021	Chairman Miss FUNG Hoi-ching	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(12)]	
053022 - 053330	Chairman Miss Ada FUNG Yuen- ting	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(13)]	
053331 - 053620	Chairman Ms Milly KAN Mai-ling	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(14)]	
053621 - 053809	Chairman Ms Penny PANG Pui-sze	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)360/14- 15(08)]	
053810 - 054108	Chairman Tin Shui Wai Children Career Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(08)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
054109 - 054419	Chairman Tin Shui Wai Community Development Network	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14-15(08)]	
054420 - 055042	Chairman EDB	<p>EDB provided its preliminary response as follows –</p> <p><i>Suggestion to adopt a funding mode similar to that for aided primary and secondary schools</i></p> <p>(a) under the subvention mode of aided schools, a standardized threshold would be set for an operating class, which might result in packing of classes when enrolment dropped. This would create pressure for closure of some very small KGs and a knock-on effect on the stability of the KG teaching force in times of student population drop. There was also a need to centralize the allocation of KG places to ensure fairness through the creation of KG school nets. This would in turn affect the sector's overall operating flexibility to cope with the rise and fall of students in different districts;</p> <p><i>WD and LWD KGs</i></p> <p>(b) the Administration recognized that WD and LWD KGs had been providing useful services to single-parent families and working parents. However, from an educational point of view, there was no conclusive evidence that WD and LWD KG services were necessary for meeting the objectives of KG education. How WD/LWD KG services should be subsidized warranted further deliberation; and</p> <p><i>Establishment of a mandatory KG teacher salary scale</i></p> <p>(c) the Administration noted deputations' call for a mandatory salary scale and their strong objection to LSG as the funding mode, as well as KGs' need for supporting staff such as clerks. It would carefully consider the matters after receipt of the KG Committee's report.</p>	
055043 - 055508	Chairman Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman indicated that it was not a question of whether free KG education had to be provided on a WD or LWD basis, but that those families which needed WD/LWD services should be provided with such services. He asked why the Administration was inclined to subsidize HD KGs only.</p> <p>EDB advised it was the KG Committee's emerging consensus that HD KG service was the basic provision to all eligible children. However, the KG Committee</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		also recognized that some families might need WD/LWD KG services.	
055509 - 060002	Chairman Mr TANG Ka-piu EDB	<p>Mr TANG was concerned how the Administration would gauge the genuine demand for HD, WD and LWD KG places, and how parents' needs for such services could be met.</p> <p>EDB explained that the demand for certain service could be based on genuine needs or subjective choice. While genuine needs could be ascertained with reference to some prescribed criteria, it might be difficult to ascertain the subjective choice or preference of parents for the type of KG services.</p>	
060003 - 060452	Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	<p>Noting that the provision of education and care was under the policy purview of EDB and the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") respectively, Dr CHAN urged EDB to take the lead in co-ordinating the provision of education and care services in the implementation of free KG education.</p> <p>EDB clarified that under the existing arrangement, child care service for children under three years of age was under the policy purview of LWB, while the provision of KG education between the age of three and five, whether on a HD, WD or LWD basis, was the policy responsibility of EDB.</p>	
060453 - 060912	Chairman Mr Steven HO EDB	<p>Mr HO considered that the Administration should ensure that under the future funding mode for free KG education, the interest of long-serving KG teachers should not be jeopardized. He also enquired about the demand for WD and LWD KG places.</p> <p>EDB reiterated that as stated in the 2015 Policy Address, the KG Committee/Administration would consider ways to encourage KGs to provide more WD services and the feasibility of providing additional subsidies for families in need. It should also be noted that given its flexibility, the KG sector was often able to respond to the demand for HD, WD or LWD KG places. The Administration would take into consideration the seniority of long-serving KG teachers, as well as other relevant factors, when working out the future funding mode.</p>	
060913 - 061511	Chairman EDB	The Chairman said that to her knowledge, the supply of WD and LWD KG services could not meet the great demand for such services. Hence many children had to enrol in HD KGs. She enquired on the projected proportion of KGs which would be covered under free KG education, and urged EDB to give due consideration to the eligibility criteria for needy families in the provision of free/subsidized WD and LWD KG places.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB reiterated that a distinction should be made between the genuine need of a family for WD or LWD KG service, and the preference or choice of the parents to enrol their children in WD/LWD KGs out of other considerations. Hence the KG Committee/Administration should deliberate and decide to what extent free KG education should cover WD and LWD KGs. The proportion of KG places which would be covered under free KG education could only be ascertained after formulating the way forward in implementing free KG education.</p>	
061512 - 061623	<p>Chairman Dr YU Wai-bing</p>	<p>Dr YU recalled that due emphasis was given to parental choice when PEVS was introduced. With the implementation of free KG education, she was concerned whether the Administration had changed its stance and would determine the needs and choices of parents.</p>	
061624 - 061733	<p>Chairman Hong Kong Christian Service Times Nursery School</p>	<p>Representative of Hong Kong Christian Service Times Nursery School said that if her child could not be admitted to a WD/LWD KG, she would have to quit her job to look after her child attending HD KG. She was concerned that parents in a similar situation would not be considered as having a need for WD/LWD KG services.</p>	
061734 - 061840	<p>Chairman Tin Shui Wai Community Development Network</p>	<p>Representative of Tin Shui Wai Community Development Network commented that the Administration should provide subsidy for both the education and care services of KG students.</p>	
061841 - 062112	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman EDB</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman shared the concern raised by the representative of Hong Kong Christian Service Times Nursery School.</p> <p>EDB advised that the support for WD or LWD KG services would be further deliberated by the KG Committee.</p>	
062113 - 062446	<p>Mr TANG Ka-piu EDB Chairman</p>	<p>Mr TANG said that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) if only attendance at HD KGs was subsidized, many KGs might only operate or switch to HD services. This would lead to the unintended consequence of further reduction in the supply of WD and LWD KG places;</li> <li>(b) the Administration should seriously evaluate the actual demand or need for HD, WD and LWD KG services; and</li> <li>(c) the Administration should provide a timetable on the provision of free or subsidized WD and LWD KG services.</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		EDB reiterated that one of the Administration's longer-term targets was to encourage the provision of more WD KG services.	
062447 - 063713	Break		
<i>Session Four</i>			
063714 - 063936	Chairman	Opening remarks	
063937 - 064254	Chairman Miss LAI Wan- yiu	Presentation of views	
064255 - 064600	Chairman Mr CHENG-wai	Presentation of views	
064601 - 064828	Chairman Miss CHAN Wai-yan	Presentation of views	
064829 - 065129	Chairman Special Educational Needs Rights Association	Presentation of views	
065130 - 065359	Chairman Miss WU Yuen-kwan	Presentation of views	
065400 - 065540	Chairman Ms LEUNG Lai-kit	Presentation of views	
065541 - 065838	Chairman Ms CHEUNG Xiao -ling	Presentation of views	
065839 - 070140	Chairman Ms LI Lan-chu	Presentation of views	
070141 - 070455	Chairman The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)415/14-15(01)]	
070456 - 070800	Chairman Ms Fanny TSANG Min-fan	Presentation of views	
070801 - 071042	Chairman Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance	Presentation of views	
071043 - 071430	Chairman Alliance for Children Development Rights	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14-15(15)]	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
071431 - 071802	Chairman Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres	Presentation of views	
071803 - 072051	Chairman Mr LEUNG WING-shing	Presentation of views	
072052 - 072339	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuet-wah	Presentation of views	
072340 - 072454	Chairman Cheung Sha Wan Childcare Service Concern Group	Presentation of views	
072455 - 072619	Chairman Miss LAM Lai-wah	Presentation of views	
072620 - 072855	Chairman Evangelical Lutheran Church Social Service - Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)34714- 15(16)]	
072856 - 073002	Chairman Miss LAI Wing-hei	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/14- 15(17)]	The deputation undertook to provide further information to the Subcommittee as stated in paragraph 4 of the minutes.
073003 - 073211	Chairman Education Convergence	Presentation of views[LC Paper No. CB(4)372/14- 15(09)]	
073212 - 073520	Chairman Miss WONG Pui-man	Presentation of views	
073521 - 073829	Chairman Mr LAM Kim-cheong	Presentation of views	
073830 - 074139	Chairman Miss LEUNG Wai-yan	Presentation of views	
074140 - 074450	Chairman Miss YEUNG Hoi-man	Presentation of views	
074451 - 074731	Chairman Hong Kong Young Women's Christian Association	Presentation of views	
074732 - 075050	Chairman Mr YIP Chung-him	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
075051 - 075354	Chairman Ms SU Guan-qiang	Presentation of views	
075355 - 075546	Chairman EDB	In response to the views of the deputations, EDB said that measures had been put in place to monitor KGs' collection of miscellaneous fees, and the Administration would consider how the monitoring could be stepped up upon the implementation of free KG education. It was highlighted that the overall provision of KG places was sufficient to meet the demand, though in some districts the supply was close to the demand. Issues about the provision of HD/WD services would be subject to further deliberation by the KG Committee. Meanwhile, the Administration had implemented a basket of measures to improve the KG admission arrangements to facilitate parents in seeking a K1 place for their children.	
075547 - 080051	Chairman Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman said that it was widely recognized internationally that KG education was crucial for the whole person development of children. The issues of poverty, working parents and at-risk groups were also relevant in the provision of free KG education. He asked whether the KG Committee had communicated with grassroot families to understand their needs.</p> <p>EDB said that the KG Committee had been in communication with parent associations in the 18 districts, which should include parents from grassroot families.</p>	
080052 - 080511	Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	<p>Dr CHAN shared some deputations' concern about the remuneration of KG teachers not being commensurate with their qualifications and experience, and that their past experience was often not recognized when they taught in another KG.</p> <p>EDB responded that a consultancy study had been commissioned to study and make recommendations on KG teachers' remuneration. The KG Committee would further deliberate on the issues upon receiving the recommendations from the consultant.</p>	
080512 - 080917	Chairman Mrs Regina IP EDB	<p>Mrs IP enquired –</p> <p>(a) whether the KG Committee's view that free KG education should only cover HD KGs was due to resources constraint; and</p> <p>(b) if there was a proven demand for WD and LWD KG places, whether EDB would seek the requisite resources to provide such free places.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB reiterated that while there was a demand for WD and LWD KG services from some quarters of the community, from an educational point of view, HD KG education would suffice for young children in KGs. Notwithstanding, the KG Committee would consider ways to encourage KGs to offer more WD services and to provide additional subsidies for parents in need.</p>	
080918 - 081443	Chairman EDB	<p>The Chairman sought the Administration's views on the following main concerns raised by deputations –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) regulation over the collection of exorbitant fees by some KGs;</li> <li>(b) the inadequate provision of KG places in certain districts (e.g. the North District); and</li> <li>(c) professional development of KG teachers.</li> </ul> <p>In response, EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the KG Committee and its five Sub-committees had been conducting in-depth studies on various issues regarding KG, including teacher professional development, KG operation and governance;</li> <li>(b) on a territory-wide basis, there were sufficient KG places to meet the demand. However, in certain districts such as the North District, there was keen competition for KG places. EDB had taken measures to enhance the KG admission arrangements in these districts in 2013. Similar arrangements would be extended to all KGs for admission to K1 in the 2015-2016 school year to avoid the hoarding of more than one place by a prospective KG student. Information on the vacancy situation would be updated and disseminated on the Internet and Regional Education Offices for parents' reference; and</li> <li>(c) EDB had stepped up the regulation over various fees charged by KGs.</li> </ul> <p>EDB supplemented that assistance would be rendered to parents who had encountered problems in KG admission or had been charged unreasonable fees by KGs.</p>	
081444 - 081818	Chairman Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman noted that under existing arrangements, rehabilitation services for pre-primary children were provided by SWD through, among others, IP in kindergarten-cum-child care centre operating on a LWD basis. He was concerned about the support for children with special needs attending</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>HD and WD KGs where IP was not available.</p> <p>EDB advised that one of the Sub-committees of the KG Committee was tasked to study ways to cater for student diversity including students with special needs. EDB would continue to work closely with SWD in supporting these children. However, it should be noted that some children with special needs could be more easily identified after the children reached six years of age.</p>	
081819 - 082020	Chairman EDB	<p>The Chairman opined that the KG Committee's report should include recommendations on how to support KG students with special needs.</p> <p>Noting from some deputations that there had been frequent revisions to the edition of KG textbooks, she asked whether consideration would be given to providing textbook subsidies under free KG education.</p> <p>EDB explained that the KG Committee's initial view was that the Government's subsidy under free KG education should cover the school fees that related to the expenses directly attributable to students' learning and school operation. Whether or not textbooks or other items should be subsidized would require further deliberation. Nevertheless, it was necessary to ascertain whether the item referred to by deputations were textbooks or teaching materials. EDB would look into the matter if complaints were received in this regard.</p>	
082021 - 082114	Chairman Deputy Chairman	The Deputy Chairman urged EDB to reflect the deputations' views and concerns to the KG Committee.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Any other business</i>			
082115 - 082140	Chairman	Closing remarks	