

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(4)1226/14-15  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/13

**Panel on Education**

**Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of  
Free Kindergarten Education**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting  
held on Tuesday, 28 April 2015, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

**Member attending** : Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Public Officers attending** : Item III

Mr Kevin YEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Education

Mrs Michelle WONG  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Ms Hera CHUM  
Principal Assistant Secretary  
(Special Education & Kindergarten Education)  
Education Bureau

Item IV

Mr Kevin YEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Education

Mrs Michelle WONG  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Ms Hera CHUM  
Principal Assistant Secretary  
(Special Education & Kindergarten Education)  
Education Bureau

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (4)4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4)4

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)830/14-15 -- Minutes of meeting on 10 February 2015)

The minutes of the meeting held on 10 February 2015 were confirmed.

**II. Matter arising**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)783/14-15(01) -- List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 16 March 2015

LC Paper No. CB(4)783/14-15(02) -- Administration's written response to the issues raised at the meeting on 16 March 2015)

2. Members noted the above papers.

**III. Planning for the provision of kindergarten places, in particular whole-day/long whole-day kindergarten places, and the admission arrangements for kindergartens**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)840/14-15(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration)

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex I**).

4. Members noted the submissions from Council of Non-profit Making Organizations for Pre-primary Education, Hong Kong Society for the Protection of Children and Hong Kong Unison Limited, which were tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued vide LC Paper Nos. CB(4)887/14-15(01), (02) and (03) respectively.

Action            Motion

5.     The Chairman concluded the discussion and proceeded to deal with the motion moved by Dr Helena WONG (at **Annex II**), which was tabled at the meeting. As the relevant matter had been deliberated thoroughly, members agreed that no further debate was required.

6.     Mr Tommy CHEUNG considered that pending any careful study and review, it was not appropriate to come to a conclusion that a significant increase of whole-day ("WD") and long whole-day ("LWD") kindergarten places should be provided, as stated in the motion. He said that he could not support the motion. Dr Helena WONG highlighted that her motion focused on the direction of the review on planning standards.

7.     At the invitation of the Chairman, the Education Bureau ("EDB") advised that –

(a) the Administration would review the existing planning standards; and

(b) from the planning point of view, there was no difference between WD and LWD places when sites were reserved for educational use. The Administration would study the proportion of half-day and WD places.

8.     The Chairman put Dr WONG's motion to vote. Four members voted for the motion and one member voted against. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed. EDB was asked to provide a written response to the motion passed by the Subcommittee.

*(Post-meeting note: EDB's written response to the motion was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1130/14-15(01) on 8 June 2015.)*

**IV. Transition from kindergarten education to primary education**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)840/14-15(02) -- Paper provided by the Administration)

9.     The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex I**).

**V. Any other business**

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:25 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
25 June 2015

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of the  
Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of  
Free Kindergarten Education  
on Tuesday 28 April 2015, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000421 - 000457	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes	
<i>Agenda Item II – Matter arising</i>			
000458 - 000601	Chairman	Members noted the list of follow up actions arising from the discussion of the last meeting and the Administration's written response.	
<i>Agenda Item III - Planning for the provision of kindergarten places, in particular whole-day/long whole-day kindergarten places, and the admission arrangements for kindergartens</i>			
000602 - 000846	Chairman Education Bureau ("EDB")	EDB briefed members on the present situation and the initial views of the Committee on Free Kindergarten Education ("the KG Committee") relating to the planning for the provision of kindergarten ("KG") places and the admission arrangements for KGs, as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)840/14-15(01)].	
000847 - 001411	Chairman EDB	<p>The Chairman enquired about the basis for setting the prevailing standards under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") at 730 half-day ("HD") and 250 whole-day ("WD") places for every 1000 children in the age group of three to five.</p> <p>EDB explained that the prevailing standards had been in use for some years. In the past, some parents might choose not to enrol their children in KGs, whereas at present, there was almost full participation in KG education. The KG Committee had already come to the view that a review of the existing standards was needed.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry about increasing the provision of WD KG places in the light of the population policy to unleash the potential of local labour force, EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) In the 2014-2015 school year, the percentage of students attending WD sessions among total enrolment under all sessions was 31%, which had already exceeded the existing planning standard of 250 WD places for every 1 000 children in the relevant age group.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) The KG Committee was of the view that the existing planning standards should be reviewed to respond to, among others, the need to unleash the potential of local labour force. The Administration had started to look into this matter.</p>	
001412 - 002141	Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	<p>Dr CHAN was concerned that some KGs operating in privately-leased premises might be forced out of operation as they could not afford to pay exorbitant rent. He suggested that the Administration should consider negotiating with private developers so that the premises reserved for educational services in large scale residential development projects would be handed over to the Government for allocation upon completion of the development projects.</p> <p>In this regard, EDB said that Dr CHAN's suggestion required very careful study as it would have implications on the amount of premium payable to the Government by developers. Meanwhile, the Administration would study ways to increase the provision of government-owned KG premises in the long run.</p> <p>On the admission arrangements for nursery classes (K1), Dr CHAN noted that currently, KGs under the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme ("PEVS") were required to use the Certificate of Eligibility for PEVS ("the voucher") as a document for parents to confirm their acceptance of an offer of K1 place so as to prevent the hoarding of more than one place by a student. He enquired about the future admission arrangements, assuming that PEVS would no longer be in place when free KG education was implemented.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) Some special measures had been launched in Tai Po and the North District in 2013 to improve the KG admission procedure. One of the measures was issuing a registration letter to parents and requiring them to register with only one KG within a period specified by EDB. In view of the positive experience in the two districts, improvement measures had been introduced for K1 admission for the 2015-2016 school year, under which all KGs under PEVS would require parents to use the voucher as the document to confirm their acceptance of an offer of K1 place.</p> <p>(b) Upon implementation of free KG education in future, EDB might consider specifying the use of certain document(s) for confirmation of K1 places. Measures would also be put in place to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>avoid parents queuing up for application forms and hoarding of places at any one time.</p>	
002142 - 002944	Mr Steven HO EDB	<p>Mr HO said that some parents still encountered difficulties in obtaining application forms from KGs and securing KG places for their children. He also enquired on the contingency plan, if any, of EDB to deal with the aftermath of the closure of KGs.</p> <p>EDB explained that –</p> <p>(a) The use of the voucher to confirm acceptance of an offer of K1 place starting from the 2015-2016 school year, coupled with other measures including online and unlimited supply of application forms, had largely improved the queuing situation.</p> <p>(b) In the 2014-2015 school year, about 20 KGs closed down and about 30 new KGs came into operation. Based on past experience, sufficient KG places could be found for the students affected by closure of KGs. EDB would provide assistance to the students as appropriate.</p> <p>Referring to paragraph 11 of the Administration's paper, Mr HO sought explanation on why the KG Committee had great reservation about the creation of KG nets under a central allocation system.</p> <p>EDB explained that unlike aided schools which operated mainly on government-owned or rental-free private lands, the operation of KGs in commercial premises would render the planning of KG places in a holistic manner like aided school places not practicable.</p>	
002945 - 003513	Dr Helena WONG EDB Chairman	<p>Dr WONG remarked that to meet the keen demand for WD/long whole-day ("LWD") KG places and unleash the employment potential of women, the Administration should review the HKPSG with a view to significantly increasing the provision of WD/LWD KG places to, say, 730 places per 1 000 children.</p> <p>EDB explained that –</p> <p>(a) HKPSG only set out the planning standards. The actual number of KG places might be higher, as shown in the percentage of students attending WD sessions among total enrolment under all sessions at 31% in the 2014-2015 school year.</p> <p>(b) The KG Committee considered that the Government should factor in the need for</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>increasing WD places in the planning standards. Pending a careful study, the Administration was not in a position to advise on the percentage of WD KG places to be provided.</p>	
003514 - 004510	Deputy Chairman EDB Chairman	<p>Noting that as many as 31% of KG students attended WD sessions, the Deputy Chairman enquired whether EDB had discussed with the Steering Committee on Population Policy on how EDB could assist in unleashing the potential of local labour force, and whether the Administration would significantly increase WD KG places in its review of HKPSG.</p> <p>The Chairman enquired about the principles to be adopted in reviewing the planning standards for KG places, and how the Administration would gauge the genuine demand for HD, WD and LWD KG places.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) HD and WD places catered for different needs of parents. On concerns about insufficient KG places in certain districts, the KG sector had made arrangements to optimize their campus capacities through deployment of their registered classrooms, adjustment of service modes from HD to WD or vice versa to meet the changes in demand.</li> <li>(b) The Administration would commence work on the review of planning standards as soon as possible but it was premature to advise on how far the proportion of WD KG places should be increased. Meanwhile, the Administration would continue to encourage KGs to offer more WD services.</li> <li>(c) In considering whether a family was in need of WD KG service for its children, a distinction should be made between "genuine need" and "preference" for such service.</li> <li>(d) To realize the objective of the population policy to unleash the potential of local labour force, different bureaux would implement appropriate measures under their respective portfolio. Increasing the provision of WD KG places would be one of these measures.</li> </ul>	
004511 - 005325	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che EDB	<p>Mr CHEUNG stressed the need for the Administration to strengthen WD KG services, in particular LWD service. He said that children from families with working parents whose household income was below the median household income in Hong Kong were in genuine need for WD/LWD KG services. EDB should consider obtaining relevant</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>information from the Census and Statistics Department to project the demand for WD/LWD KG places and allocate the necessary resources accordingly.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The space requirement for the provision of WD and LWD KG places was the same, i.e. at 1.8 sq.m. per KG place. It would be for individual KGs to decide whether to operate HD, WD, or LWD services. Past experience had indicated that KGs could flexibly adjust the number of WD and HD places to be offered to meet changing demand.</li> <li>(b) The population policy would be taken into consideration in the review of the planning standards.</li> <li>(c) It might be possible that an increase in the supply of WD services would induce more families to enrol their children in WD KGs, thereby generating a greater demand.</li> </ul>	
005326 - 010047	Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	<p>Dr CHAN concurred with the need to review the planning standards as soon as possible and increase the provision of WD/LWD places. In his view, it was necessary to set a target in the provision of WD/LWD KG places in order to tie in with the policy objective of unleashing the employment potential of women. In addition, the Administration should explore how to increase the provision of government-owned KG premises in the long run.</p> <p>EDB said that parents might make their choice of KGs out of different considerations. The actual KG enrolment in a certain district might not necessarily reflect the demand for places. The year-on-year changes of demand at district level would also cause difficulty in projection. Nevertheless, when reviewing the planning standards, the Administration would make reference to the growing demand for WD KG places.</p>	
010048 - 010513	Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman noted that there was a growing trend among overseas jurisdictions, including member nations of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, to implement KG education on a WD basis. However, the emerging consensus of the KG Committee was that free KG education should cover HD services as basic provision for all eligible children. In this regard, he was concerned whether the Administration would consider putting in place an appropriate mechanism for subsidizing HD as well as WD KG services.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB responded that the KG Committee had made reference to international practices when considering the scope of free KG education. With reference to the practices adopted in neighbouring jurisdictions such as Taiwan, Singapore and South Korea and from an educational point of view, the KG Committee considered that it was appropriate to provide HD service as the basic provision in the implementation of free KG education.</p>	
010514 - 011059	Chairman EDB	<p>The Chairman remarked that the Administration should explore ways to increase WD KG services so as to meet the genuine demand of working parents, especially the grass-root families, and to tie in with the policy objective to unleash the potential of local labour force. Whilst noting the KG Committee's view that KG admission should remain a school-based matter, the Chairman enquired about the assistance that the Administration would provide to parents in case they encountered difficulties in securing KG places in their resident districts.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) To provide greater support for working parents, the KG Committee was of the initial view that children of working parents might be given priority in admission to WD/LWD classes.</p> <p>(b) On the improvements to K1 admission arrangements for the 2015-2016 school year, EDB had also released K1 vacancy information after the centralized registration dates and updated the information at regular intervals so as to assist parents in securing a K1 place for their children. Parents could also seek assistance from the Regional Education Offices. According to past experience, most of the requests for assistance from parents were received within 14 days from the centralized registration dates.</p>	
011100 - 011145	Dr Helena WONG Chairman	<p>Dr WONG submitted to the Chairman the wording of a motion which she intended to move.</p>	
011146 - 011800	Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman referred to the submission from Hong Kong Unison Limited, which was tabled at the meeting, and highlighted that KGs and EDB should provide information in English to facilitate application for admission by non-Chinese speaking parents.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman expressed support for Dr WONG's motion. He considered that the Administration was in a position to regulate the supply of KG premises as it was responsible for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>reserving sites for educational services when planning for new public housing estates or large scale resident development projects. It also conducted school allocation exercises ("SAE").</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <p>(a) Past experience had shown that the present flexible mode of operation of the KG sector could meet the year-on-year changes in demand for places.</p> <p>(b) SAE would be conducted when KG premises were available in public housing estates with regard to the demand for and supply of KG places in the district concerned.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman noted that in the view of the KG Committee, setting numerical target for supply of KG places on a district basis to match projected population might not be warranted. He was concerned about the overall projected demand for KG places in the next few years and whether the principle of vicinity in admission of KG students would be taken into consideration when reviewing the planning standards for provision of KG places.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman noted from the Administration's paper that the actual KG enrolment in Kowloon City in the 2014-2015 school year was 22 873 while the projected population size of those aged three to five residing in that district was only 10 100. He said that the situation of this district was unique as quite a number of KGs (including those not under PEVS) clustered in Kowloon Tong.</p> <p>EDB explained that the KG enrolment in Kowloon City clearly showed that many parents had chosen KGs in districts outside their resident district. Hence, the school net system and the principle of vicinity which were currently adopted in the allocation of primary and secondary school places might not be applicable in the admission arrangements for KGs.</p>	
011801 012242	Chairman Mr Tommy CHEUNG Dr Helena WONG EDB	<p>With the concurrence of the Chairman, Dr WONG moved a motion, the wording of which was tabled at the meeting. Mr CHEUNG stated his objection to the motion.</p> <p>EDB advised that the Administration would review the existing planning standards and study the proportion of HD and WD places.</p> <p>Dr WONG's motion was put to vote and passed.</p>	EDB was asked to provide a written response to the motion passed by the Subcommittee.

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item IV - Transition from kindergarten education to primary education</i>			
012243 - 012417	Chairman EDB	EDB briefed members on the present situation and the initial views of the KG Committee on the transition from KG to primary school, as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)840/14-15(02)].	
012418 - 013053	Deputy Chairman EDB	<p>The Deputy Chairman was concerned about the immense pressure of the prevailing Primary One Admission ("POA") System on KG students seeking admission to primary schools. Noting that in some countries, Primary One ("P1") and P2 levels were part of early childhood education, he opined that the teaching and learning environment at P1 and P2 levels should accommodate the transition and adaptation of KG students progressing to primary schools.</p> <p>EDB explained that from the educational point of view, KG education and primary education were on a continuum. The KG Committee was of the view that some learning outcomes for KG graduates could be set to provide both KG and primary school teachers with some references of what the children were expected to know and do at the end of KG education.</p>	
013054 - 013745	Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	<p>Dr CHAN noted that many parents put undue pressure on their young children to strive for excellence in academic and non-academic activities. He was concerned that this might have infringed upon the right of children.</p> <p>Dr CHAN also expressed his concern about the transition of students with special educational needs and non-Chinese speaking students from KGs to primary schools, as they might encounter greater difficulties in adapting to a new learning environment.</p> <p>EDB agreed that young children should not be subject to undue pressure arising from admission interviews or competition. The teaching and learning mode at KG level should be play-based. According to some primary teachers, they would not expect high academic performance from new P1 students, but would expect them to be able to take care of themselves in school.</p>	
013746 - 014351	Chairman EDB	The Chairman was concerned that some KGs were implementing the primary school curriculum and had arranged intensive training in sports, music and art for their KG students. She considered that the Administration should keep in view the curriculum adopted by KGs and enhance parent education.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The KG Committee had deliberated on various issues related to KG students' transition to primary school.</li> <li>(b) To ensure the delivery of quality education by KGs, an assurance mechanism was in place under which school visits were conducted by officers from EDB. EDB would follow up with the KGs concerned if irregularities were detected.</li> <li>(c) An expert had been engaged to evaluate the quality assurance mechanism. Certain recommended measures to improve the mechanism had been implemented.</li> <li>(d) The Guide to the Pre-primary Curriculum had provided a curriculum framework for KGs. The framework would be suitably updated upon the implementation of free KG education.</li> </ul>	
014352 - 014655	Deputy Chairman	<p>The Deputy Chairman noted that currently, the teacher-to-student ratio at KGs was 1 to 15. However, in primary schools, the class size could range from 25 students for those schools implementing small class teaching to more than 30 students in other schools. He expressed concern that the change in class size and teacher-to-student ratio from KG to primary school might affect effective teacher-student interaction.</p>	
014656 - 015253	Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB Chairman	<p>Referring to the prevailing practice of compiling elaborate personal portfolios when seeking admission to primary schools, Dr CHAN reiterated his concern about the immense pressure on small children. He considered it necessary for the KG Committee to address such concerns in its report.</p> <p>EDB advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The KG Committee was aware that some KGs taught P1 curriculum, which was not desirable. EDB noted that the KG sector had developed the idea that they would draw up some guidelines for reference of the sector.</li> <li>(b) A number of primary schools had advised applicants not to submit personal portfolios when applying for admission.</li> </ul>	
<i>Agenda Item V - Any other business</i>			
015254 - 015554	Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN EDB	Arrangements for the next meeting.	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>In response to Dr CHAN's enquiry, EDB advised that the KG Committee was expected to submit its report in late May/early June this year.</p> <p>The Chairman said that the subject on the tuition fees and miscellaneous fees charged by KGs would be included in the Subcommittee's "List of major subjects to be studied".</p>	

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
25 June 2015

教育事務委員會  
Panel on Education

研究落實免費幼稚園教育小組委員會  
Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of  
Free Kindergarten Education

在 2015 年 4 月 28 日會議上就議程項目  
"規劃幼稚園學額的供應，尤其是全日制 / 長全日制幼稚園學額，以及幼稚園的  
收生安排"通過的議案  
Motion passed under the agenda item "Planning for the provision of kindergarten  
places, in particular whole-day / long whole-day kindergarten places, and the  
admission arrangements for kindergartens" at the meeting on 28 April 2015

**議案措辭**

本小組委員會要求教育局盡快檢討幼稚園學額的規劃指標，以便大幅增加幼稚園全日制及長全日制的學額，以配合人口政策及釋放婦女勞動力的需求。

動議人：黃碧雲議員

**Wording of the Motion**

(Translation)

That this Subcommittee requests the Education Bureau to expeditiously review the planning standard for kindergarten places, so as to significantly increase whole-day and long whole-day kindergarten places to tie in with the population policy and the demand for unleashing the potential of female labour force.

Mover : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan