

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1155/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/2/12

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene
Subcommittee on Hawker Policy

Minutes of the meeting held on
Tuesday, 14 April 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon Steven HO Chun-yin (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
- Members attending** : Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Public Officers attending** : Agenda item II
Mr Christopher WONG Kwok-bun, JP
Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 1

Miss Vinci CHAN
Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 7

Mr LAM Wing-hong
Assistant Director (Operations)2
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Edward CHAN Yiu-keung
Senior Superintendent (Hawker and Market)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda Item II

Professor NG Mee-kam
Professor and Vice-Chairman
Department of Geography and Resource Management
Chinese University of Hong Kong

Session One

Miss Kate KWOK
Town Planner

Mr NGAN Man-yu
Deputy Spokesperson
Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and
Progress of Hong Kong

Dr LEUNG Chi-yuen
Teaching Fellow
Department of Applied Social Sciences
The Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN
Chief Executive Officer
Designing Hong Kong

Mr Jacky LIM
Commentator

Mr Leslie CHAN
Chairman
Our Bus Terminal

Mr Joshua LI
Vice Chairman
Young Civics

Mr Peter SHIU
Vice Chairman
Liberal Party

Mr YEUNG Cheuk-shun
增加食物中小販熟食比例委員會

Miss LAI Sze-yi
External Secretary
Hong Kong Baptist University Students' Union

Mr WONG Wing-nam
Chairman
Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories
Hawker Associations

Ms LEUNG Fung-lee
Convener
灣仔交加街太原街固定攤位小販權益關注組

Mr NG Kwan-lim
Member
葵芳區私人樓宇居民關注組

Ms LEUNG Man-yi
Member
葵芳區私人樓宇居民聯席

Mr WONG Wing-pun
Chairman
葵芳區私人樓宇居民聯會

Mr Henry CHAN
Representative
小販政策關注組

Mr Leos LEE
Chairman
Community Establishment Power

Mr CHAN Chiu-hang
United Hawkers Development Platform

Mr Louis LO
Research Assistant
The Lion Rock Institute

Miss CHIU Sin-ting
Representative
撐基層墟市聯盟

Mr CHEUNG Chun-ming
Organizer
Tung Chung Community Development Alliance

Ms CHOW Lai-lai
Representative
Tung Chung Handmade

Ms LAM Lin-ying
Representative
推動本地自家製發展小組

Ms LEE Wai-ha
Representative
關注東涌設立墟市居民組

Mr CHAN Fu-hin
Representative
東涌互助墟

Mr TANG Tak-chuen
We are the future campaign

Mr CHAN Tak-lung
Secretary
花園街販商協會

Mr LAU Siu-hang

Ms CHUNG Choi-wan

Ms WONG Wing-chi
Social Worker
Community Development Alliance

Session 2

歐美玉女士
Member
天秀墟檔主關注組

Ms FUNG Sau-ying
Member
天秀墟檔主大聯盟

Ms Evangeline LAU
Registered Social Worker
天水圍發展陣線

Mr KONG Kin-shing
Registered Social Worker
天水圍陣線

Mr WAN Siu-kei

Mr HUI Chi-fung
District Councilor
Central and Western District Council

Mr HON Lai-yin
Convener
屯門社區關注組

Mr NG Chung-tat

梁林娣女士

Ms LI Mei-siu
Chairman
Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene
Department Staff Rights Union

Mr HO Chi-chung

Ms WONG Sau-chi

Ms CHAN Choi-kwai

Ms WONG Sau-fa

Mr TAM Keng-yeung

Miss Bonnie LEUNG
District Developer (HKI)
Civic Party

Mr CHAN Kam-wing
Chairman
油麻地廟街販商商會

Mr LAU Kai-ming
Chairman
渣甸坊販商協會

黃東曉先生
Representative
灣仔大佛口販商協會

Mr WONG Kai
Chairman
利源東西街販商協會

李嘉華女士
Vice Chairman
北角販商協會

張德榮先生
Vice-Chairman
香港報販協會

Clerk in attendance : Ms Debbie YAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)5

Staff in attendance : Ms Shirley TAM
Senior Council Secretary (4)5

Miss Mandy NG
Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Zoe TONG
Legislative Assistant (4)5

Miss Shanice LOK
Clerical Assistant (4)4

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes of meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)769/14-15 – Minutes of meeting held on
2 March 2015)

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2015 were confirmed.

II. Principles for formulation of hawker policy and proposed measures

Meeting with the deputations and the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(4)561/14-15(01) – Administration's paper on
proposals on hawker
management)

Discussion

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration

Admin 3. The Administration was requested to provide the information relating to current registered hawker assistants, including the number and their years being registered, and their background such as the number of dependents in the families.

Action

III. Any other business

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:40 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 June 2015

**Proceedings of the meeting of
the Subcommittee on Hawker Policy
on Tuesday, 14 April 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes of meeting			
000729 – 001016	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes	
Agenda item II – Principles for formulation of hawker policy and proposed measures			
<i>Session I</i>			
001017 – 001201	Chairman	Welcome remarks	
001202 – 001500	Miss Kate KWOK	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● supported the adoption of bottom-up and district-led approach to formulate the hawker policy but the Administration should provide more details in gestating the proposals ● suggested District Councils ("DCs") taking the lead to draw up bottom-up proposals on hawking propositions with the assistance of community planners who could help gauge community views systematically through different studies and workshops. Community planning referred to the process of encouraging residents' participation, bringing parties of different interests together to reach consensus in respect of project planning and implementation. It also focused on building up the trust among the Government, DCs and residents which was of importance 	
001501 – 001654	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong ("DAB")	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● the Administration should adopt a positive approach on the hawker trade and devise supportive measures for hawkers ● supported the issue of new fixed-pitch hawker licences and enhancement of their operating environment, and suggested a reasonable number of such licences be open to registered hawker assistants for priority application ● requested the Administration to provide appropriate assistance to respective districts in setting up open-air hawker bazaars and night markets 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● suggested the Administration making reference to overseas experiences, such as those of Singapore, Bangkok and Taipei, when considering the issue of new "Dai Pai Tong" licences 	
001655 – 002010	Dr LEUNG Chi-yuen	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)766/14-15(01) 	
002011 – 002319	Designing Hong Kong	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)722/14-15(01) ● LC Paper No. CB(4)766/14-15(02) 	
002320 – 002619	Our Bus Terminal	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed support for hawking activities featuring local characteristics ● expressed concern about the night market in Kweilin Street, though popular, was being eradicated with the support of DAB district councillors ● suggested the Administration, instead of following the example of the United States ("US"), drawing from Taiwan's experiences to allow smaller and less costly food trucks (photos shown during meeting) operating in Hong Kong which would be more affordable by small business 	
002620 – 002908	Young Civics	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)816/14-15(04) (Chinese version only) 	
002909 – 003212	Liberal Party	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed support for the Administration's principles and proposed measures set out in the paper and urged it to press ahead their implementation ● expressed concern on local shopping malls and chain stores which were becoming homogenous ● suggested drawing reference from overseas, such 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>as the South Korea, Taiwan and Thailand, in setting up bazaars and night markets with varieties to attract local people and visitors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● considered that young people could start-up businesses with little capital by hawking and in fact many entrepreneurs had been hawkers before 	
003213 – 003512	Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawker Associations ("the Federation")	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)794/14-15(01) (Chinese version only) 	
003513 – 003813	Chairman 增加食物中小販熟食比例委員會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● the Administration had eradicated existing hawkers in Tung Chung with a view to creating a conducive operating environment for shops in LINK under the so-called fair competition ● considered that there was a lot of idling space in Tung Chung which could be used for operating small business activities e.g. three multi-storey carparks being vacant for many years ● requested the Administration, in developing new districts, reserving some public space in the town plans for hawking activities, e.g. in public markets, to address the communities' needs of starting-up and operating small businesses for earning a living 	
003814 – 004202	灣仔交加街太原街固定攤位小販權益關注組	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the Administration giving priority to existing registered assistants in applying for fixed-pitch hawker licences surrendered by their employer hawkers under the five-year Assistance Scheme for Hawkers in Fixed-pitch Hawker Areas ("the Scheme") ● welcomed the Administration's proposal of issuing licences to unlicensed tradesmen including cobblers, watch repairers and locksmiths etc, but urged it to also consider other industries with characteristics reminiscent of local culture and heritage, such as tradesmen of bar tacking, slitting button holes and sewing 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested to preserve existing fixed-pitch stalls to operate as status quo and grant licences to hawkers operated in some existing bazaars, such as Tin Kwong Hui in Aberdeen and 西貢漁民艇仔小販會 	
004203 – 004520	葵芳區私人樓宇居民關注組	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern on the ways in gestating bottom-up proposals and considered that a briefing for 18 DCs' Chairmen and Deputy Chairmen was not enough to consult the community ● suggested the establishment of a specialized committee in each of the districts for hawking activities (such as setting up bazaars and night markets) comprising stakeholders (like hawkers, affected residents, district councillors, representatives of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD")) to provide a platform for working out relevant proposals with consensus ● suggested the revitalization/rebuilding of existing public markets with low occupancy, such as the Wing Fong Street Market in Kwai Fong, for hawking activities 	
004521 – 004754	葵芳區私人樓宇居民聯席	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● suggested the revitalization/rebuilding of existing public markets with low occupancy and the issue of licences to on-street hawkers to operate in public markets to avoid road obstruction ● there was a lack of space in Kwai Fong and Kwai Hing districts for open on-street hawking activities ● suggested the establishment of district communication platforms involving residents, district councillors to bring up the district needs before the Administration implemented relevant policies 	
004755 – 005005	葵芳區私人樓宇居民聯會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● support the development of small businesses; 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● suggested rebuilding old public markets, such as the Wing Fong Street Market, a single storey public market, to enhance its capacity to accommodate more hawking and business activities ● considered that road obstruction caused by shops and hawkers were severe in Kwai Fong which might cause accidents and FEHD should improve its street management 	
005006 – 005324	小販政策關注組	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)794/14-15(02) (Chinese version only) 	
005325 – 005520	Community Establishment Power	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed objection to the Administration's enforcement actions supported by DAB district councillors against the Kweilin Street night market selling cooked-food during the Chinese New Year ("CNY") period and urged for its re-establishment during CNY ● shared the results of a survey which found that 62% of the affected residents supported the operation of the night market in Kweilin Street with improved management on environmental hygiene 	
005521 – 005830	United Hawkers Development Platform	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)586/14-15(01) and ● LC Paper No. CB(4)722/14-15(02) 	
005831 – 010051	The Lion Rock Institute	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)586/14-15(01) and ● LC Paper No. CB(4)722/14-15(02) 	
010052 – 010425	花園街販商協會	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● welcomed the Administration's proposals in the paper ● requested the Administration to relax the control on hawking activities instead of adopting a 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>heavy-handed approach to suppress the hawking trade's development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the Administration to give priority to registered hawker assistants in applying the licences surrendered by their employer hawkers to avoid the former losing their jobs and develop a succession mechanism ● suggested the promotion of hawking activities to visitors through the use of information technology 	
010426 – 010748	We are the future campaign	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern about the night market in Kweilin Street being eradicated with the support of DAB district councillors ● supported the allocation of vacant land for a wide variety of hawking activities ● expressed concern that it was not feasible of allowing food trucks operating in busy districts like Yau Tsim Mong districts 	
010749 – 011043	Mr LAU Siu-hang	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● pointed out the difficulties in finding suitable locations as hawker areas, which should be accessible with visitor flow and with the approval by relevant authorities such as Leisure and Cultural Services Department before commercial activities could be held at the venue ● under FEHD's frequent enforcement actions, many unlicensed hawkers were arrested, and the Legal Aid Department and the Duty Lawyer Service of the Administration did not provide assistance for them ● requested that flexibilities should be given on the date and locations for setting up bazaars, and pointed out that the hawkers might, for the sake of earning a living, choose to operate as unlicensed hawkers instead of in bazaars which only opened on weekends or holidays and were located in remote districts ● suggested the Administration considering the 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>issue of itinerant hawker licenses as the licensees could sell the commodities at locations convenient to customers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● enquired about the ways to gestating bottom-up proposals and pointed out the importance of involving different stakeholders during the process 	
011044 – 011438	Ms CHUNG Choi-wan Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared her experience on hawking ● requested the Administration to issue permit or licence for tradesmen with characteristics reminiscent of local culture and heritage 	
011439 – 011620	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration undertook to consider the ways to strengthen the cooperation with districts and community in gestating bottom-up and district-led proposals on hawking activities.</p>	
011621 – 012846	Chairman Professor NG Mee-kam	<p>Professor NG advised that public space was a kind of resources shared by the community and stressed the importance of making the best use of public space to achieve sustainable development.</p> <p>In determining the use of public spaces, consideration should be given to ensuring social sustainability, allocation of resources, apart from developing a market economy. In fact, reciprocal relationships were important in developing and sustaining hawking activities.</p> <p>She considered that it was essential to develop hawking activities in recognition of their diversified linkages to tourism, arts, history, social assets, cultural inheritance, social capacity-building, innovation processes and job creation.</p> <p>She pointed out that the following types of land could be used for hawking activities through place-making: (a) making use of public markets with low occupancy; (b) closing some streets on weekends only for hawking activities; and (c) using current vacant land.</p> <p>Professor NG suggested that the process of gestating proposals on setting up local bazaars should be led by the Administration and/or DCs involving different stakeholders, including town planners.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Communities' participation in closely monitoring the management of bazaars was essential, e.g. to safeguard any occurrence of subletting. She also suggested the relevant parties to engage urban planners to understand more about place-making and strategies.</p> <p>She agreed that the Subcommittee should discuss further on the ways to strike a balance among retaining local characteristics and offering inexpensive and quality products while ensuring food safety and environmental hygiene in conducting hawking activities.</p>	
012847 – 013049	Mr Jacky LIM	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared the history of hawkers' development in Singapore which also attached importance to hawking activities 	
013050 – 013259	撐基層墟市聯盟	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)586/14-15(03) and ● LC Paper No. CB(4)722/14-15(03) 	
013300 – 013503	Tung Chung Community Development Alliance	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed support for the proposed principles for the formulation of hawker policy ● requested the Administration to consider the inclusion of small-scale food production under its principles/measures for the hawker policy ● suggested drawing experience from overseas, such as (a) in US, where some types of small-scale food productions were allowed to be carried out at home, and (b) in Japan and Taiwan, where food production was done on food cart 	
013504 – 013635	Tung Chung Handmade	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern on the high cost on setting up a food stall ● requested the Administration to issue licences for selling cooked food produced at home or on food trucks 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013636 – 013721	推動本地自家製發展小組	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the Administration to issue licences for selling cooked food produced at home ● suggested the conversion of public markets into off-street food production centres 	
013722 – 013844	關注東涌設立墟市居民組	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● supported the bottom-up approach on the establishment of bazaars but not through DC/Administration ● suggested the establishment of a specialized committee on monitoring the operation of bazaars/hawker areas, comprising affected residents and organizations providing social welfare services 	
013845 – 014100	Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern about some DC members discussing the eradication of hawking activities, such as in Tin Kwong Hui while many grassroots and elderly people engaged in hawking activities before dawn to earn a living 	
014101 – 014237	東涌互助墟	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed the needs of setting up bazaars in Tung Chung for some people to make a living for their families 	
014238 – 014447	Hong Kong Baptist University Students' Union	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)816/14-15(02) (Chinese version only) 	
014448 – 014818	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing The Federation 小販政策關注組	Mr WONG asked the Federation about the rationale of its suggestion on giving priority to registered hawker assistants when issuing new fixed-pitch hawker licences. The Federation replied that many hawker assistants had worked for the elderly hawker licensees for years to earn a living. If their employer hawkers surrendered the licences, the assistants should have the priority to apply and succeed such licences.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr WONG also asked 小販政策關注組 why the Administration should involve hawkers and hawker associations when formulating hawker policy.</p> <p>小販政策關注組 considered that hawker associations or hawkers should be involved in the discussion of hawking policy and activities, especially during the appeal process which might result in licence cancellation, to address hawkers' interests and concerns.</p>	
014819 – 015122	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen The Federation	<p>Mr CHAN expressed concern about the formulation of hawker policy which was under the purview of the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB") and FEHD which were responsible for regulating and controlling hawking activities. He considered that representatives of the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau should attend the Subcommittee meetings to advise members on issues relating to food truck proposals.</p> <p>Mr CHAN stressed that the next step was to develop some successful bazaars/hawker areas by engaging local communities in drawing up proposals with district support. He considered that the major hurdles to prevent the formulation of any proposal probably came from DCs, not to mention the enforcement actions taken by FEHD.</p> <p>He also sought the deputations' views on the ways to gestate bottom-up hawking proposals and the appropriate parties responsible for taking the lead. The Federation responded that hawkers could share their views with the DCs concerned on the suitable locations for hawking activities in respective districts.</p>	
015123 – 015445	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration	<p>Mr CHAN expressed concern that a number of cooked food bazaars were old and dilapidated and needed renewal. He enquired if the Administration would renew them before the issue of new licences and the planned strategy on managing the said bazaars.</p> <p>FHB responded that it was still considering the details in taking forward the conversion of existing public market with low occupancy, for example, off-street cooked food centre. It would try to bring forward concrete proposals to members in due course. The Administration considered districts' propositions at suitable locations important.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr CHAN expressed support for the Administration's proposals on facilitating the trade development. However, he expressed concern that the Administration had, according to his understanding, meanwhile requested relocating the Ma Kok Street Cooked Food Hawker Bazaar, which affected the trade's development.</p>	
015446 – 015753	Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN	<p>Dr CHAN expressed doubts if the Administration was just consolidating the views of Subcommittee members and general public on the development of hawker policy in the paper, including concepts such as formulation from a development perspective, bottom-up and district-led approach without any intention to take them forward. He urged the public to monitor the Administration closely on policy implementation.</p> <p>Dr CHAN expressed concern that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the locations for hawking activities had not been identified. The public was invited to submit concrete proposals in order to focus the discussion; (b) different stakeholders should work together to enhance the trade's development instead of focusing the discussion on their own interests; and (c) FEHD should be driven to change its hawker management and enforcement strategies alongside with the new hawker policy. 	
015754 – 020053	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai	<p>Mr WU remarked that licensing was not a matter of re-distribution of interests among stakeholders and the Subcommittee's deliberation should be focused on running bazaars on specific dates in identified locations of the 18 districts.</p> <p>Mr WU pointed out that hawking might just be a transitional stage in one's career life or business start-ups for gaining experience with little capital. It might also be a means to earn a living during the downturn of life. Indeed, the provision of commodities from hawking activities constituted local features.</p>	
020054 – 020331	Chairman Ms CHUNG Choi-wan	<p>Ms CHUNG shared her recent experience on being convicted and fined for operation of hawking</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		activities.	
020332 – 020444	Chairman	Closing remarks before the break	
Break			
021939 – 022046	Chairman	Opening remarks	
022047 – 022243	天水圍發展陣線	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the establishment of different types of bazaars, including those targeting visitors or selling handcrafts, to address the specific needs of different districts ● expressed that hawking activities could provide cheap commodities for grassroots to resist the Link's hegemony ● the power of Hawker Control Team should be reviewed to avoid any hawkers being arrested and prosecuted on unreasonable grounds 	
022244 – 022250	天秀墟檔主大聯盟	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared the views and experiences of being a hawker ● pointed out that Tin Sau Bazaar had small visitor flow 	
022551 – 022846	天秀墟檔主關注組	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared the views and experiences of being a hawker ● pointed out that hawking activities provided cheap commodities for grassroots and an opportunity for people to communicate with each other 	
022847 – 023154	天水圍陣線	Presentation of views <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the Administration to consider converting existing public markets with low occupancy into off-street food production centres for sales on-street ● suggested the Administration, in considering the 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		initiative of food trucks, reviewed the regimes for issuing relevant licences, including food business licences	
023155 – 023459	Mr WAN Siu-kei	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● supported the food truck proposal and demonstrated some samples of food trucks (photos shown during meeting) ● proposed to make reference to food trucks in Taiwan and Japan some of which cost about \$100,000 instead of about \$700,000 to \$1 million suggested by the Administration 	
023500 – 023758	Mr HUI Chi-fung	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern that the current hawker policy only sought to manage and control hawkers and hawking activities with a view to eradicating them ● the measures implemented for fixed-pitch, such as installation of sprinkler system and fixed fire resisting structures and dismantling of stalls after business closing at night, were impractical to help the trade's development ● urged the Administration to develop the trade from a development perspective, for example, by relaxing the transfer and succession of hawker licences to hawker assistants so as to ensure the continuity of the trade's development ● pointed out that the Central and Western DC had repeatedly urged the Administration with an unanimous consensus to re-issue the surrendered licences under the Scheme but the Administration did not follow suit ● shared Hon Wu Chi-wai's views that the discussion should not just focus on resources distribution, but rather, on developing the trade to preserve local culture and features 	
023759 – 023923	屯門社區關注組	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared the results of a survey that Tuen Mun residents considered that hawking activities could provide cheap commodities, convenient 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>services and delicious local food but they also had concern on food safety</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● suggested FEHD issuing a temporary licence/permit for selling cooked-food at designated hours at night having regard to the need of such cooked-food when most of restaurants had closed at night ● suggested the Administration setting out the acceptable parameters for wooden food carts instead of making reference to overseas in considering the Food Truck proposal ● requested the relaxation of licensing conditions for food factory licences 	
023924 – 024229	Mr NG Chung-tat	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● pointed out that most of the hawking activities were small businesses run by grassroots to earn a living and the tourism element should not be the primary concern ● urged the Administration to have an in-depth understanding on the hawking activities in Hong Kong, and to develop them in a way based on district consensus 	
024230 – 024433	梁林娣女士	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared the views and experience on being a hawker ● pointed out many hawkers might apply for the Government's Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme ("CSSA") if they were forced not to hawk 	
024434 – 024745	Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene Department Staff Rights Union	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)816/14-15(01) (Chinese version only) 	
024746 – 025105	Mr HO Chi-chung	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern that while the hawker policy was being formulated by FHB, the subject should relate to welfare and economic development matters to which responsible Director of Bureaux 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>should be involved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern that the DAB district councillors were reluctant to address to residents' request for facilitating hawking activities in Sheung Shui but to eradicate them ● shared the results of a survey that a large portion of Sheung Shui residents supported the establishment of a night market for selling cooked-food and allowing some hawkers operating under the footbridges in the district through licensing ● considered that the matters of food safety and environmental hygiene of hawking activities could be properly addressed having considered to the examples of Singapore and Japan 	
025106 – 025244	Ms WONG Sau-chi	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared her hawking experience 	
025245 – 025514	Ms CHAN Choi-kwai	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared her hawking experiences ● pointed out that some hawking activities constituted local features of Hong Kong and were supported by many local people ● opined that the Food Truck proposal, which would likely be operated by large consortia, was to eradicate the hawking trade ● pointed out that many hawkers might apply for CSSA if they were forced not to hawk 	
025515 – 025635	Ms WONG Sau-fa	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared her hawking experiences ● pointed out that some hawking activities constituted local features 	
025636 – 025946	Mr TAM Keng-yeung	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared his hawking experience ● considered that the existing hawker policy which 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>had been formulated for decades aiming for eradicating the trade should be reviewed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● pointed out that hawking was common around the world, and the trade also made contributions to economic growth 	
025947 – 030253	油麻地廟街販商商會	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(4)816/14-15(03) (Chinese version only) 	
030254 – 030442	渣甸坊販商協會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern on the arrangement of voluntary surrender of hawker licences which led to many of the hawker assistants immediately losing their jobs and some hawker areas becoming less occupied and quiet ● requested the Administration to re-issue the surrendered licences to hawker assistants ● requested the Administration to review the size of the fixed-pitch and be more lenient in enforcement 	
030443 – 030616	灣仔大佛口販商協會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● supported the review of hawking policy, in particular the Scheme ● suggested the issue of licences to hawker assistants to develop the trade 	
030617 – 030707	利源東西街販商協會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● expressed concern on the arrangement of voluntary surrender of hawker licences which led to many of the working assistants immediately losing their jobs and some hawker areas becoming less occupied and quiet ● requested the Administration to re-issue the surrendered licences to hawker assistants 	
030708 – 030759	北角販商協會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● requested the Administration to re-issue the surrendered licences to hawker assistants ● requested to enlarge the on-street fixed hawker 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>pitches most of which in corresponding hawking areas were 3ft x 4ft to enhance the operating environment of hawkers</p>	
030800 – 030920	香港報販協會	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● shared his experience of being a newspaper hawker ● requested the Administration to allow newspaper hawkers to sell more varieties of goods, such as soft drinks and telephone cards, to offer an ex-gratia payment of \$120,000 for newspaper hawkers who opted for voluntary surrender of their hawker licences to the Government ● requested to re-issue the surrendered licences to hawker assistants or other members of the public interested in running newspaper stalls 	
030921 – 031237	Civic Party	<p>Presentation of views</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● relayed the Civic Party's support on the five proposed measures put forward by the Administration which seemed to start playing a facilitator's role on the trade's development ● requested the Administration to provide assistance to some members of the public who had identified idling land for setting up open-air bazaars ● hoped the whole Government would listen to deputations' views carefully to understand the trade's needs and help the trade's development, which would lead to the development of district economy as well as cultural conservation and development 	
031238 – 031357	Chairman FHB	<p>FHB undertook to take into consideration the deputations' views when formulating the hawker policy. As a next step, the Administration would explore ways to implement the proposed measures set out in the discussion paper, such as the conversion of existing public markets with low occupancy into off-street cooked food centres. It also stressed that the Administration kept an open mind towards district-led proposals on local bazaars.</p>	

<p>031358 – 032136</p>	<p>Professor NG Mee-kam Chairman</p>	<p>Professor NG recommended that the Administration and members might need to deepen their understanding on the concept of place-making which was conducive to hawking, and advised that any idling space used for hawking should be subject to place-making to, for example, enhance its accessibility and visitor flow. However, in taking forward bottom-up proposals, interested members of the public should play a more proactive role and put forward the proposals for the Administration's consideration.</p> <p>Professor NG highlighted the outstanding issues requiring follow-up by the Administration –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the matching of time slots and locations for different types of hawking activities such as food trucks/carts, bazaars and hawker areas; (b) whether the issue of licences/permits was required, the conditions of the licences/permits, the mode of operation, the commodities to be sold, and environmental impacts, etc; (c) the request of allowing small-scale food production which complied with the requirements on food safety and environmental hygiene; and (d) the current hawker control and management through FEHD's enforcement was outdated and should be reviewed. Instead, community surveillance on space usage should be adopted. 	
<p>032137 – 032726</p>	<p>Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration</p>	<p>The Chairman invited the Administration to enhance its transparency through focused discussions with the public.</p> <p>Mr WONG enquired about the information relating to current registered hawker assistants, including the number and their years being registered, and their background such as the number of dependents in the families. The Administration undertook to provide the information afterwards. Mr WONG urged the Administration to communicate with these assistants to understand their views on succeeding the surrendered licences.</p> <p>Mr WONG also asked for the number of fixed-pitch hawker stalls being vacant.</p>	<p>The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 3 of the minutes</p>
<p>032727 – 033234</p>	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman appreciated the undertaking of FHB in respect of reviewing the hawker policy which</p>	

		<p>had long been formulated without a "development" perspective and planning parameters, and its commitment to play a facilitator's role among relevant bureaux and departments ("B/Ds") in taking forward district-led and bottom-up proposals, which was indeed a breakthrough of a long-standing problem of the local community.</p> <p>He highlighted the FHB's view that hawking should be seen as one of the modes of economic transactions, which, in his opinion, could also address the problem of market failure, as well as benefitting many grassroot families.</p> <p>He invited the public to concentrate on the work of gestating bottom-up hawking proposals through the DC platform for FHB's facilitation work under the supervision of the Chief Secretary for the Administration.</p>	
<p>033235 – 033741</p>	<p>Chairman Dr Kenneth CHAN</p>	<p>Dr CHAN echoed with Professor NG that hawking involved the process of place-making which should be based on a "people-oriented" approach, i.e. having regard to the needs and expectations of people in the community.</p> <p>He considered that the next step forward was for the Subcommittee and the Administration to, based on the views and concerns expressed at the meeting, choose some concrete proposals for further study and implementation, with due consideration to some key areas, such as the issues of licensing and re-allocation of resources.</p> <p>He also urged for a change of FEHD's bureaucracy in managing hawkers who, according to his understanding, were requested to obtain permission before taking leaves otherwise they would be subject to "punishment".</p>	
<p>033742 – 035143</p>	<p>Chairman FHB</p>	<p>The Chairman pointed out that DAB had previously conducted surveys on the Kweilin Street's night market and found its operation in 2014 CNY brought about significant nuisances on residents. He remarked that such night market had become intolerable since it expanded its scope from original six stalls to 36 stalls, operating from 8 pm to 6 am the day after with lots of litter uncollected. The affected residents had tried to liaise with the hawkers concerned to see if some improvements could be made for 2015 CNY but in vain and ultimately sought the Administration's assistance.</p>	

He reiterated that DAB supported the development of the hawking trade and might give support to relevant proposals, on condition that such hawking activities would not cause intolerable nuisance to residents. He noted that hawkers themselves were cautious to ensure that their activities would not disturb the residents.

He considered that the Subcommittee had provided a platform to enhance communication among the interested parties. He urged the Administration to take into account the deputations' views expressed at the meeting in fine-tuning the principles and measures of hawker policy

He also urged FHB to improve its preparation of relevant information, such as the number of vacant fixed-pitch hawker stalls which would assist Subcommittee members to ascertain whether the increase of fixed-pitches' size requested by a deputation was feasible, and to discuss with the trade any alternative options according to the hawker policy.

FHB advised that there were about 600 vacant fixed-pitch stalls in the 43 hawker areas as at end of 2014, including those which arose from the Scheme. Discounting those located at staircase discharge points of buildings or emergency vehicular access in hawker areas where it was not appropriate to set up stalls, the number of remaining vacant stalls was about 300. When reviewing the question of whether to issue new fixed-pitch licences, the Administration would take into account the circumstances of individual hawker areas, including their fire safety and environmental hygiene situations, the business environment, comments of relevant departments, as well as the views of the relevant DC and local residents.

The Chairman requested FHB to make it clear its difficulties in facilitating the trade while addressing residents' concerns on food safety and environmental hygiene. He pointed out that DC was an appropriate platform for scrutinizing the hawking proposals. DC members could enhance the communication between the trade and residents such that a consensus could be reached probably via the channels established by the Administration.

FHB stated that it was committed to formulating a hawker policy which could strike an optimal balance between allowing hawking activities and meeting other legitimate concerns such as avoiding nuisance to

		<p>the local community in addition to ensuring food safety, environmental hygiene and public safety. It would explore ways to take forward the proposed measures set out in the discussion paper, including the conversion of some existing public markets with low occupancy into off-street cooked food centre.</p> <p>FHB invited deputations and the public to come up with hawking proposals for discussions at DCs. If suitable sites were identified and support from the relevant District Councils had been obtained, the Bureau stood ready to provide advice on how to measure up to the food safety and environmental hygiene requirements, and to facilitate liaison with the relevant government departments.</p> <p>The Chairman expressed concern that the Food Truck proposal was currently put under the purview of the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau ("CEDB") but, in his opinion, it was related more to hawking activities. He enquired about the scope and estimated cost of a Food Truck. .</p> <p>FHB advised that CEDB was in the course of examining how best to take forward the Food Truck proposal, including overseas experience. FHB undertook to relay the deputations' views on the Food Truck proposal to CEDB and to keep Members informed of developments.</p>	
<p>035144 – 040737</p>	<p>Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Administration</p>	<p>Miss CHAN shared the experience on implementing the Dragon Market in Wong Tai Sin in 2003, during which DCs were invited to screen initiatives of developing local community economy in the 18 districts. However, DCs always encountered difficulties in reaching consensus among the affected residents and other parties on gestating a hawking proposal. She called on the Administration to give the required strength in assisting the DCs to play a good balancing role.</p> <p>FHB replied that it did not underestimate the difficulties in striking a balance among the concerns of different parties and in reaching a consensus on a hawking proposal. District consensus was of utmost importance on putting into effect any proposals. From the practical implementation perspective, the Administration kept an open mind towards proposals for developing the hawker trade, irrespective of where such hawking activities were to be located, so long as food safety and environmental hygiene were not compromised, public passageways were not obstructed and local community support was obtained.</p>	

		<p>It would also seek the views of District Offices on any proposals and their feasibility.</p> <p>Miss CHAN considered that FHB did not take it seriously to facilitate the trade and just resembled the approach adopted in 2003. Even there was a successful bazaar, such as the Dragon Market, the number of its stalls significantly shrank from over 300 stalls to less than a hundred, after the Administration had taken over its management. She pointed out that in contrast, Singapore provided trainings for hawkers to enhance the trade's development.</p> <p>She requested the Administration to –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) first of all, set out a comprehensive plan for policy implementation instead of just inviting bottom-up proposals through DCs; (b) conduct place-making for bazaar areas, for example, by drawing visitor flow to the bazaars; and (c) provide more land for hawking activities, such as in Kowloon East. <p>FHB advised that it would facilitate liaison on concrete bottom-up hawking proposal, including on the land matter.</p> <p>Miss CHAN also requested FHB to set up a district-based committee for stakeholders, including academics, for gestating bottom-up proposals.</p> <p>The Chairman also requested the Administration to reserve space for hawking activities during town planning or urban renewal, which could enhance the social harmony and create employment opportunities. Space under flyover, near MTR exits or bus terminals were good hawking points and related proposals should not have difficulties in gaining district support.</p>	
<p>040738 – 041054</p>	<p>Chairman Professor NG Mee-kam</p>	<p>Professor NG expressed doubts on the general understanding among deputations and government officials a bottom-up approach, involving innovation and capacity building to find suitable locations for hawking activities.</p> <p>Given that some people found it difficult to integrate into a new community upon relocation, she shared the Chairman's view that space should be reserved during town planning for residents and members of public to</p>	

		gather, sell commodities they liked and perform. According to a study for public space to become attractive, there should be at least ten activities. Other factors, such as highly accessible, selling cheap and good commodities and people with good relationships, and so on were conducive to drawing visitor flows. She added that the knowledge and experiences of place-making were useful for the community to build social harmony, and the urban planning professional sector would always be ready to share their expertise with any interested parties.	
Agenda item III –Any other business			
041055 – 041110	Chairman	Conclusion	

Submissions from organizations/individuals not attending the meeting

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission
1.	「十幾對手」自家製生產計劃	● LC Paper No. CB(4)586/14-15(02) (Chinese version only)
2.	土地正義聯盟	● LC Paper No. CB(4)586/14-15(04) (Chinese version only)
3.	西區墟市關注組	● LC Paper No. CB(4)794/14-15(03) (Chinese version only)