

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/PS/1/13

LC Paper No. CB(2)39/15-16
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Panel on Health Services

Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the Development of Chinese Medicine

Minutes of the meeting
held on Tuesday, 21 July 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP (Chairman)
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- Members absent** : Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Public Officers attending** : Items I and II
- Professor Sophia CHAN Siu-chee, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health
- Miss Janice TSE Siu-wa, JP
Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Health) 1
Food and Health Bureau
- Dr Ronald LAM Man-kin
Assistant Director (Traditional Chinese Medicine)
Department of Health
- Mr CHEUNG Yee-kay
Senior Pharmacist (Traditional Chinese Medicine) 5
Department of Health

Hospital Authority

Dr Eric ZIEA Tat-chi
Chief (Chinese Medicine and Integrative Medicine)

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Ms Priscilla LAU
Council Secretary (2) 5

Mrs Fanny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

I. Professional development and remuneration package for the Chinese medicine practitioners ("CMPs")

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1929/14-15(01), CB(2)322/14-15(02) and CB(2)1933/14-15(01)]

1.1. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

2. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to -

- (a) revert to the Subcommittee on the work of the Chinese Medicine Development Committee, e.g. when it would make available a blueprint for the development of Chinese medicine and recommendations on the development of Chinese medicine specialization;
- (b) provide supplementary information on the 18 Chinese Medicine Centres for Training and Research, including their staff establishment (e.g. number of CMPs employed), their training and remuneration package for CMPs; and
- (c) relay some members' concern as to how to facilitate the Chinese medicine graduates from the Mainland universities to take the Chinese Medicine Practitioners Licensing Examination in Hong Kong to the Chinese Medicine Practitioners Board.

3. Members agreed that the Subcommittee should hold a meeting to receive views from deputations on the professional development of CMPs.

Action

II. Arrangements for the formal registration of proprietary Chinese medicines

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1929/14-15(02) and (03)]

4. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

5. The Chairman urged the Administration to allow proprietary Chinese medicines ("pCms") issued with Notice of confirmation of transitional registration of pCms (i.e. "HKP") to freeze their HKP status, so that the HKP holders concerned could re-apply for formal registration again during the freezing period. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration would provide written explanation on why the suggestion might not be feasible from the legal perspective. Members also requested the Administration to provide support and assistance to the HKP holders concerned to help them resolve the difficulties encountered in producing the relevant reports for fulfilling the registration requirements.

Admin

Admin

III. Any other business

6. The Chairman suggested that the Subcommittee should apply for extension of the period of its work so as to complete discussion of various outstanding issues. He said that he would request the Clerk to prepare a paper on the issue for members' consideration.

7. The Chairman said that he would later decide on the date of the next meeting. Members would be informed of the meeting arrangements in due course.

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:43 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
14 October 2015

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the Development of Chinese Medicine
on Tuesday, 21 July 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Professional development and remuneration package for the Chinese medicine practitioners</i>			
000456 - 001513	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks Briefing by the Administration	
001514 - 003529	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration Hospital Authority ("HA")	<p>Mr YIU Siu-wing called on the Administration to consider introducing a qualification framework and an official pay scale for Chinese medicine practitioners ("CMPs") to enhance their professional development and give them clear progression pathways and a better prospect. Mr YIU suggested that a Chinese medicine clinic with integrated Chinese-Western medicine ("ICWM") should be set up and run by the Government, so as to gain more experience of the ICWM approach and prepare for the establishment of a Chinese medicine hospital. This Chinese medicine clinic should be given more resources and provide higher quality of services. It should also be used to provide a basis for the establishment of a formal pay structure for CMPs. He considered that such work should not be deferred to until after the Chinese medicine hospital had been established.</p> <p>The Administration and HA representative advised that -</p> <p>(a) a Chinese Medicine Practice Sub-committee had been formed under the Chinese Medicine Development Committee ("CMDC") to focus on the deliberation on, among others, the personnel training and professional development of CMPs. The Sub-committee comprised representatives from the academia, CMPs and the Chinese medicine sector;</p> <p>(b) CMPs working at the 18 Chinese Medicine Centres for Training and Research ("CMCTRs") were employees of the respective non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") operating these centres. The NGOs would take into account the candidates' profile and experience as well as the prevailing market conditions in deciding on the employment packages for individual CMPs. Currently, the salary of these CMPs ranges from</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>\$19,000 to \$70,000 per month. CMCTRs also provided training for the CMPs working at the respective centres; and</p> <p>(c) HA launched the ICWM Pilot Programme in September 2014 to gain experience of ICWM and operation of Chinese medicine in-patient service.</p>	
003530 - 005721	<p>Chairman Administration Mr YIU Si-wing HA</p>	<p>The Chairman considered that the Administration should take a view on the positioning of Chinese medicine services and whether Chinese medicine should be incorporated into the public healthcare system. He also urged the Administration to request CMDC to come up with a blueprint for the development of Chinese medicine. He considered that CMDC should provide a timetable for its work.</p> <p>Mr YIU Si-wing suggested that Chinese medicine specialties should be created and the relevant specialist qualification accreditation system should be established. In this connection, an examination system should be put in place. The qualification of a CMP should not be simply linked to his/her number of years of service. He further suggested introducing the specialties of internal medicine and gynaecology for CMPs as the first step.</p> <p>The Administration and HA representatives advised that -</p> <p>(a) a working group comprising representatives from the three universities offering Chinese medicine undergraduate degree programmes as well as CMPs had been set up to study the framework and arrangement for specialist training and specialist qualification accreditation system for CMPs, as well as to gauge views from the major stakeholders;</p> <p>(b) CMCTRs were established to promote the development of "evidence-based" Chinese medicine and provide training placements for graduates of local Chinese medicine degree programmes. Under the tripartite collaboration model among HA, NGOs and local universities, the Government provided subsidy to the NGO operators of CMCTRs. The annual subsidy to NGOs had been increased in April 2013 to enhance, among others, the remuneration package for CMPs; and</p> <p>(c) the governing board of each CMCTR comprised representatives from HA, NGOs and local universities to oversee the management and operation of CMCTRs, as well as to keep in view the remuneration package for CMPs.</p>	<p>Admin</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
005722 - 011809	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration Mr Vincent FANG	<p>Mr YIU Si-wing pointed out that many local young people studied Chinese medicine in Mainland China each year. He requested the Administration to consider deferring the timing of holding the Chinese Medicine Practitioners Licensing Examination ("the Licensing Examination"), so that those graduates could take the Licensing Examination in the same year of their graduation. At present, the Licensing Examination once a year had already been held by the time when those graduates finished their graduation examination on the Mainland. As a result, they had to wait for one year to sit for the Licensing Examination in Hong Kong. Mr Vincent FANG suggested increasing the number of sittings of the Licensing Examination each year to two.</p> <p>The Administration explained that the Licensing Examination included the written assessment and the clinical assessment which were normally held in June and August respectively every year. All local and non-local Chinese medicine graduates were required to sit for this unified licensing examination which was held once a year. The Chinese Medicine Practitioners Board ("CMPB") had considered the relevant issues and decided to maintain the existing arrangements for the Licensing Examination. Nevertheless, the Administration would relay Mr YIU's and Mr FANG's views to CMPB.</p> <p>On Mr YIU Si-wing's suggestion of providing guidelines on the identification of Chinese herbal medicines to the Chinese medicine dispensers, the Administration responded that licensed Chinese medicine traders were provided with practising guidelines which set out, among others, the knowledge requirements and duties of Chinese medicine dispensers. Information on the identification of Chinese herbal medicines was regularly provided through the "Chinese Medicine Traders Newsletter" distributed to all licensed Chinese medicine traders and trade associations. In addition, briefings on "easily-confused" Chinese herbal medicines were organised by DH regularly for the traders and practitioners.</p> <p>In response to Mr Vincent FANG's view that the number of lay persons in CMPB should be increased, the Administration advised that according to the Chinese Medicine Ordinance (Cap. 549) ("the Ordinance"), apart from the Chairman, CMPB consisted of 2 public officers, 6 Chinese medicine practitioners, 1 person from the Chinese medicines trade, 1 person from an educational or scientific research institution in Hong Kong and 3 lay persons.</p>	Admin

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		The Chairman considered that the membership of CMDC should be extended to include more representatives of stakeholders, so as to better reflect the views of the trade in the Committee.	
011810 - 011837	Chairman	The Chairman requested the Administration to provide supplementary information as set out in the minutes.	Admin
<i>Agenda item II - Arrangements for the formal registration of proprietary Chinese medicines</i>			
011838 - 012218	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration	
012219 - 015329	Chairman Mr Vincent FANG Administration Mr YIU Si-wing	<p>Mr Vincent FANG expressed concern that there were still over 900 proprietary Chinese medicines ("pCms") issued with Notice of confirmation of transitional registration of pCms (i.e. "HKP") for which the product specification or stability test reports had not yet been submitted by the HKP holders concerned. Mr FANG said he noted that some of these HKP holders were just unwilling to disclose the master formula of their pCm products. In his view, a new category which did not require the provision of the master formula as long as the pCm products concerned had proven safety and efficacy should be created.</p> <p>Mr YIU Si-wing shared Mr FANG's concern and requested the Administration to provide support and assistance to the HKP holders concerned as far as possible to help them resolve the difficulties encountered in producing the relevant reports for fulfilling the registration requirements.</p> <p>The Administration advised that -</p> <p>(a) around 90% of HKP holders had submitted the product specification or stability test reports before the deadline on 30 June 2015. For those remaining 10% of pCms carrying HKP status, about 40% of them were not actively traded in the local market; and the Chinese Medicine Board ("CMB") had issued reminders to their registration holders requiring them to submit the reports within three months from the date of the reminders issued. If HKP holders still had difficulties, they would be given another 14 days to provide sufficient reasons for consideration by CMB. Otherwise, CMB might consider rejecting their application for "Certificate of registration of pCm" (i.e. "HKC"). If HKC application was rejected, the relevant HKP holder still had the right to appeal against the decision in 14 days; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>(b) "Established medicines category" in the existing pCm registration system was provided for the registration of those pCms which was an ancient prescription, a modified ancient prescription or a pharmacopoeia prescription (which had been Pharmacopoeia of the People's Republic of China). In accordance with the Ordinance, pCm manufacturers or traders had to disclose the master formulae of their pCm concerned in the registration. A mechanism was in place to protect the confidentiality of these master formularies of pCms.</p>	
015330 – 021313	<p>Chairman Administration Mr YIU Si-wing</p>	<p>The Chairman expressed concern that the number of pCm products which had failed to meet the deadline of submission of the relevant reports amounted to a few hundred. He gave examples of the difficulties faced by HKP holders in applying for the formal registration for their pCm products, and requested the Administration to reconsider his suggestion of freezing HKP status as raised at the last meeting. He also called on the Administration to set up a dedicated fund to promote the development of pCm industry.</p> <p>At the request of the Chairman, the Administration agreed to provide written explanation as to why the above suggestion might not be feasible from the legal perspective. The Administration also undertook to strengthen communication with HKP holders and provide them necessary support.</p>	<p>Admin</p>
021314 - 021359	<p>Chairman</p>	<p>Meeting arrangements</p> <p>Extension of period of work of the Subcommittee</p>	